

Additional comments on Pumping Lemma:

See the comments on Slide 26.

Step 3 of Pumping Lemma: You can choose any generic string "w"

Step 4: You have to consider all possible choices of x,y and z and then find a contradiction in Step 6. (i.e., for every choice of Step 4, you need to show Step 6 for the proof to be complete.

Consider the solution below, which has many HOLES in the arguments.

II)c) $L = \{ww^R \mid w \text{ is any string over } \{a,b\}^*\}$
Assume L is a regular language
Choose $w = ab^{m-2}b^{m-1}a$ where $|w|=m$

Conditions:
 $w = xyz$
 $|xy| \leq m$
 $|y| \geq 1$

Choose
 $x = a$
 $y = b^{m-1}$
 $z = b^{m-2}a$

OK. However, not a good choice

This is one choice.
X can also be "abbb..b" and
y can be "b...b".
You have to prove this case too

For all $i \geq 0$: $xy^iz \in L$
 $i = 0$: $xz = ab^{m-2}a$
If m is even, the pattern will not match ww^R ,
as the number of b's will be odd.
m could be even or odd.
You cannot assume.

For $i = 0$, after pumping
the result is not a string followed by its
reverse, therefore the string is not in L
and the language is not regular.
Even if your proof is correct, you still have to prove the
other choices for x, y mentioned above

A better choice would have been $w = a^m b a^m$

You will then force x and y to be within the first "m" number of a's.

Step 4, Step 5, Step 6 (consider $i=0$) should be very similar Example 1.

Another pitfall would be to choose $w = a^{200} b a^{200}$. You will then be choosing a fixed length string which in fact is regular.