Initial Post

The project failure that best demonstrates the need for ITPM is the Birmingham City Council's (BCC) Oracle system integration. In April 2022, BCC launched a new Oracle-based system intended to modernise its financial and human resources operations. However, the implementation faced significant challenges, leading to severe operational disruptions with 8000 reported issues in its first six months online as well as a major financial impact, causing the costs to rise fivefold. Customisation overload, lack of staff involvement and inadequate testing were some of the main reasons for the project to fail (Mayor, 2024).

IT projects trying to customise a product according to a business' processes and not vice versa is something which can be observed in several companies. Over customisation can lead to high maintenance costs as well as difficulties with future software updates because the product is far away from how it was rolled out by the software vendor (Qasem Ali et al., 2021).

On the other hand, lack of staff involvement, or lack of stakeholder involvement in general is specifically addressed when using an agile project approach. Agile methods use iterations, often called sprints, whereby goals for each sprint are defined which are aligned with stakeholders. Furthermore, agile methods use short feedback loops to make sure the product development team is on the right path. It certainly is not free from errors, which was shown in a study conducted for a bank in Indonesia by Indra et al. (2021). Their study highlights four main challenges in agile IT projects within the specific company: team, process, organisational, and communication issues. Communication problems were found to be the most significant, with the top challenges being a lack of customer/stakeholder commitment, unclear high-level requirements early on, and frequent changes to requirements. To tackle these, the authors recommend offering training, coaching, and mentoring to improve skills, clearly define stakeholder roles, and foster a culture of collaboration and adaptability.

Word count: 316

References:
Mayor, R. (2024) Thousands of IT issues reported at troubled council. Available at: https://www.bbc.com/news/articles/c3g01g2vq39o (Accessed: 29 January 2025).

Qasem Ali, A., Md Sultan, A., Abd Ghani, A., & Zulzalil, H. (2021) 'An Empirical Investigation of Software Customization and Its Impact on the Quality of Software as a Service: Perspectives from Software Professionals', *Applied Sciences*, 11(4), pp. 1677. Available at: https://doi.org/10.3390/app11041677.

Indra, M. R., Raharjo, T., Hardian B. & Wahbi A. (2021), 'Challenges in Agile IT Project: A Case Study of Banking Company', *2021 International Conference on Advanced Computer Science and Information Systems (ICACSIS)*. Depok, Indonesia, 23-25 October. IEEE. 1-6. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1109/ICACSIS53237.2021.9631352.

Peer Response 1

Gesine, thank you for sharing your valuable insights on the NHS National Programme for IT (NPfIT) and the prime example of the need for effective IT Project Management (ITPM). The project's failure highlights several critical lessons which could be addressed through different project methodologies.

Firstly, poor stakeholder involvement was a major issue in the example you provided. The primary end users were not adequately consulted, leading to resistance and low adoption rates. This underscores the necessity of aligning the development of IT solutions with user needs through effective requirement engineering. Short feedback loops in requirement engineering are critical and are an integral part of agile methodologies (López et al., 2021). Furthermore, development teams can quickly adapt to feedback and shift their focus early in the product-building phase.

As this project, with an estimated cost of £10 billion, was extremely large, there would be a need for a scalable methodology since multiple agile development teams need to cooperate and contribute to build the desired product. Beecham et al. (2021) have found that the Scaled Agile Framework (SAFe) and Disciplined Agile Delivery (DAD) can potentially eliminate or mitigate traditional as well as Global Software Development (GSD) risks.

Word count: 195

References
López, L., Bagnato, A., Antonin Ahbervé, and Franch, X. (2021) 'QFL: Data-Driven Feedback Loop to Manage Quality in Agile Development', *2021 IEEE/ACM 43rd International Conference on Software Engineering: Software Engineering in Society (ICSE-SEIS)*. Madrid, Spain, 25-28 May. IEEE. 58-66. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1109/icse-seis52602.2021.00015

Beecham, S., Clear, T., Lal, R., and Noll, J. (2021) 'Do scaling agile frameworks address global software development risks? An empirical study', *Journal of Systems and Software*, 171, pp. 110823. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jss.2020.110823

Peer Response 2

Nelson and Mustafa, your analysis of the Emerge2 project and its parallels with the FBI's Virtual Case File (VCF) system provides a compelling case for the critical role of IT project management (ITPM) in large-scale government initiatives. Both examples highlight how the absence of robust ITPM frameworks can lead to significant project failures, particularly in complex, multi-stakeholder environments.

One aspect worth emphasising is the importance of stakeholder alignment and change management in such projects. As Mustafa pointed out, engaging end-users and decision-makers early and continuously could have mitigated some of the issues faced by Emerge2 and VCF. However, beyond engagement, there needs to be a structured approach to managing stakeholder expectations and ensuring that their input translates into actionable project adjustments. This is where ITPM methodologies, such as Agile or hybrid frameworks, could have been crucial. For instance, iterative development and regular feedback loops might have allowed both projects to adapt to evolving requirements and technical challenges (Bianchi et al., 2021)

Another critical factor is risk management. Both Emerge2 and VCF suffered from underestimating the complexity of integrating legacy systems and aligning diverse organisational priorities. A phased rollout, as Mustafa suggested, could have reduced risks by allowing the team to test and refine the system on a smaller scale before full deployment. This approach aligns with ITPM best practices, which advocate for incremental progress and continuous evaluation to identify and address risks early (Banta Viorel Costin and Dorian, 2019).

Word count: 229

References

Bianchi, M. J., Conforto, E. C., Rebentisch, E., Amaral, D. C., Rezende, S. O., and Padua, R. de. (2021) 'Recommendation of Project Management Practices: A Contribution to Hybrid Models', *IEEE Transactions on Engineering Management*, 69(6), pp. 1–14. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1109/tem.2021.3101179

Banta Viorel Costin, and Dorian, C. (2019) 'Global rollouts - risks and factors that affect ERP solutions in Romania - A case study in the sales and distribution area', *2019 23rd International Conference on System Theory, Control and Computing (ICSTCC)*. Sinaia, Romania, 09-11 October. IEEE. 391-396. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1109/icstcc.2019.8885535

Summary Post

Thank you, Gesine, for your thoughtful response to my initial post regarding the Birmingham City Council's (BCC) Oracle system integration failure. Your arguments about the limitations of agile methodologies in large-scale projects and the need for a balanced approach to IT project management (ITPM) are well-taken. Indeed, while agile methods excel in fostering stakeholder engagement and adaptability, they may not suffice for complex, large-scale implementations like BCC's, where strategic alignment and robust risk management are of utmost importance.

This discussion has highlighted several critical lessons for ITPM. First, over-customisation of software, as seen in BCC's case, can lead to unsustainable maintenance costs and compatibility issues, reinforcing the need for businesses to adapt their processes to the software rather than the other way around (Qasem Ali et al., 2021). Second, inadequate testing and poor risk management, as noted by Kerzner (2017), can derail even the most well-intentioned projects. Finally, the importance of aligning IT projects with organisational strategy, as emphasised by McManus (2012), cannot be overstated.

Gesine's suggestion of a hybrid approach, combining the flexibility of agile methodologies with the structured planning of traditional project management, offers a compelling solution to mitigate the challenges faced in projects like BCC's. This balanced approach could help address issues such as stakeholder disengagement, unclear requirements, and frequent changes, which were identified as key challenges in agile IT projects by Indra et al. (2021).

In conclusion, the BCC case serves as a stark reminder of the complexities inherent in IT projects and the need for a nuanced, context-specific approach to ITPM. By learning from such failures and adopting a balanced methodology, organisations can better navigate the challenges of large-scale IT implementations and achieve their strategic objectives.

Word count: 281

References
Qasem Ali, A., Md Sultan, A., Abd Ghani, A., and Zulzalil, H. (2021) 'An Empirical Investigation of Software Customization and Its Impact on the Quality of Software as a Service: Perspectives from Software Professionals', *Applied Sciences*, 11(4), pp. 1677. Available at: https://doi.org/10.3390/app11041677.

Kerzner, H. (2017) *Project Management: A Systems Approach to Planning, Scheduling, and Controlling*. 12th edn. Hoboken: Wiley. Available at: https://www.wiley.com/en-be/Project+Management%3A+A+Systems+Approach+to+Planning%2C+Scheduling%2C+and+Controlling%2C+12th+Edition-p-9781119165361 (Accessed: 12 February 2025).

McManus, J. (2012) *Risk Management in Software Development Projects*. Routledge. Available at: https://doi.org/10.4324/9780080498089

Indra, M. R., Raharjo, T., Hardian B. & Wahbi A. (2021), 'Challenges in Agile IT Project: A Case Study of Banking Company', *2021 International Conference on Advanced Computer Science and Information Systems (ICACSIS)*. Depok, Indonesia, 23-25 October. IEEE. 1-6. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1109/ICACSIS53237.2021.9631352.