

3.2.12	When to submit supporting evidence – specific examples	828
3.2.13	Late offer of a replacement for a deceased witness – admitted	828
3.2.14	Hearing the party without their attorney	828
3.3	Right to be heard	828
3.3.1	General	828
3.3.2	Parties' right to comment	829
3.3.3	Parties' responsibilities	830
3.3.4	Improper reasons for rejection of evidence offered	830
3.3.5	Witnesses at oral proceedings despite not confirming attendance in advance	831
3.3.6	No violation where evidence irrelevant to the outcome of the case	832
3.3.7	No violation of right to be heard where evidence of limited probative value	832
3.3.8	Violation of the right to defend a case	832
3.3.9	Direct and indirect evidence of the state of the art	832
3.3.10	Third-party observations	833
3.3.11	Failure of a party to attend oral proceedings	833
4.	Evaluation of evidence	833
4.1.	Principle of free evaluation of evidence	833
4.2.	Probative value of evidence on a case-by-case basis	834
4.2.1	Ranking of means of evidence	834
4.2.2	Witness testimony and written statements	835
a)	Credibility of allegedly linked witnesses	835
b)	Evaluation of evidence by the department of first instance – review	836
c)	Events long past	838
d)	Contradictory or consistent testimony	839
e)	Witness testimony and national proceedings	841
f)	Obligation to raise objections under R. 106 EPC	841
4.2.3	Test and experimental evidence	842
a)	Test methodology and probative value	842
b)	Evaluation of tests cited to prove that problem solved (Art. 56 EPC)	843
c)	Evaluation – other tests	844
4.2.4	Archives and internet publications	845
4.2.5	Other written evidence	846
4.3.	Standard of proof	848
4.3.1	General – "Balance of probabilities"	848
4.3.2	Public prior use	849
a)	Both parties have access to the evidence: balance of probabilities	849
b)	Evidence within the sphere of the opponent: beyond any reasonable doubt	851
c)	Miscellaneous – evaluation in the case law	853
4.3.3	Posters and ephemeral presentations	855
4.3.4	Public availability of prior art documents	858
a)	Commercial brochures	858
b)	Convincing the board and discussion on the standard of proof	859
c)	Archives and internet publications	860
4.3.5	Claiming a valid priority	860
4.3.6	Abusive conduct	862