## Word2Vec vs DBnary: Augmenting METEOR using Vector Representations or Lexical Resources? Additional materials

Christophe Servan<sup>1,2</sup>, Alexandre Bérard<sup>1</sup>, Zied Elloumi<sup>1,3</sup>, Hervé Blanchon<sup>1</sup> & Laurent Besacier<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup>LIG – Univ. Grenoble Alpes Domaine Universitaire 38401 St Martin d'Hères, France <sup>2</sup>SYSTRAN 5 Rue Feydeau 75002 Paris, France <sup>3</sup>LNE
29 Avenue Roger Hennequin
78190 Trappes, France

firstname.lastname @imaq.fr

firstname.lastname @systran.fr

firstname.lastname
 @lne.fr

## **Additional results**

Tables 1, 3 and 2 presents some additional results to our parper (Servan et al., 2016).

| Language pairs             | fr–en     |   | de-en     |   | ru–en     |                    | Average   |                   |
|----------------------------|-----------|---|-----------|---|-----------|--------------------|-----------|-------------------|
| Metric                     | Threshold | au  | Threshold | au                                      | Threshold | au                 | Threshold | au                |
| METEOR Baseline            | _         | $0.406 \pm 0.015$   | _         | $0.334 \pm 0.014$                       | _         | $0.329 \pm 0.010$  | _         | $0.356 \pm 0.013$ |
| METEOR DBnary              | _         | $0.408 \pm 0.013$   | _         | $0.334 \pm 0.014$                       | _         | $0.328 \pm 0.010$  | _         | $0.357 \pm 0.012$ |
| METEOR Vector              | 0.80      | $0.407 \pm 0.014$   | 0.80      | $0.332 \pm 0.014$                       | 0.80      | $0.328 \pm 0.010$  | 0.80      | $0.356 \pm 0.013$ |
| METEOR Baseline $+$ Vector | 0.80      | $0.407 \pm 0.013$   | 0.80      | $0.343 \pm 0.014$                       | 0.80      | $0.332 \pm 0.012$  | 0.80      | $0.361 \pm 0.013$ |
| $METEOR\ DBnary + Vector$  | 0.80      | $0.407 \pm 0.013$   | 0.80      | $0.337 \pm 0.013$                       | 0.80      | $0.338 \pm 0.013$  | 0.80      | $0.361 \pm 0.012$ |
| METEOR Vector              | 0.89      | $0.\overline{4}1\overline{1}\pm\overline{0}.\overline{0}15$ | 0.78      | $0.\overline{333} \pm 0.\overline{013}$ |           | $-0.328 \pm 0.010$ | 0.82      | $-0.357\pm0.013$  |
| METEOR Baseline $+$ Vector | 0.73      | $0.412 \pm 0.013$   | 0.80      | $0.343 \pm 0.014$                       | 0.88      | $0.333 \pm 0.011$  | 0.80      | $0.363 \pm 0.013$ |
| $METEOR\ DBnary + Vector$  | 0.73      | $0.413 \pm 0.013$   | 0.79      | $0.338 \pm 0.013$                       | 0.80      | $0.338 \pm 0.010$  | 0.77      | $0.363 \pm 0.012$ |
| Language pairs             | en-fr     |   | en-de     |   | en-ru     |                    | Average   |                   |
| Metric                     | Threshold | au  | Threshold | au                                      | Threshold | au                 | Threshold | au                |
| METEOR Baseline            | _         | $0.280 \pm 0.013$   | _         | $0.238 \pm 0.010$                       | _         | $0.427 \pm 0.013$  | _         | $0.315\pm0.012$   |
| METEOR DBnary              | _         | $0.284 \pm 0.013$   | _         | $0.239 \pm 0.010$                       | _         | $0.435 \pm 0.012$  | -         | $0.319\pm0.012$   |
| METEOR Vector              | 0.80      | $0.290\pm0.012$   | 0.80      | $0.241\pm0.009$                         | 0.80      | $0.436 \pm 0.012$  | 0.80      | $0.322 \pm 0.011$ |
| METEOR Baseline $+$ Vector | 0.80      | $0.288 \pm 0.011$   | 0.80      | $0.241\pm0.009$                         | 0.80      | $0.440 \pm 0.012$  | 0.80      | $0.323 \pm 0.011$ |
| $METEOR\ DBnary + Vector$  | 0.80      | $0.289 \pm 0.011$   | 0.80      | $0.242 \pm 0.011$                       | 0.80      | $0.439 \pm 0.011$  | 0.80      | $0.323 \pm 0.011$ |
| METEOR Vector              | 0.72      | $0.\overline{295} \pm 0.0\overline{12}$                     | 0.79      | $0.241 \pm 0.009$                       | 0.72      | $0.439 \pm 0.013$  | 0.74      | $0.325 \pm 0.011$ |
| METEOR Baseline $+$ Vector | 0.86      | $0.296 \pm 0.012$   | 0.79      | $0.242 \pm 0.010$                       | 0.79      | $0.445 \pm 0.011$  | 0.81      | $0.328 \pm 0.011$ |
| $METEOR\ DBnary + Vector$  | 0.88      | $0.294\pm0.012$   | 0.75      | $0.245 \pm 0.010$                       | 0.79      | $0.443 \pm 0.012$  | 0.81      | $0.327\pm0.011$   |

Table 1: Correlation score at segment level between several METEOR configurations and human judgements (WMT14 framework). Scores obtained with the *Vector* module are presented firstly with the default threshold (0.80) and secondly with the oracle threshold (under the dashed line).

| Models:      | monolingual<br>(baseline) | bilingual         | pseudo-bilingual<br>with POS | pseudo-bilingual<br>with lemmas | monolingual<br>(lemmas) | bilingual<br>(lemmas) |
|--------------|---------------------------|-------------------|------------------------------|---------------------------------|-------------------------|-----------------------|
| To English   | $0.356 \pm 0.013$         | $0.354\pm0.013$   | $0.355 \pm 0.013$            | $0.354 \pm 0.013$               | $0.357 \pm 0.012$       | $0.357 \pm 0.012$     |
| From English | $0.322 \pm 0.011$         | $0.322 \pm 0.011$ | $0.320 \pm 0.011$            | $0.325 {\pm} 0.011$             | $0.324 \pm 0.011$       | $0.319\pm0.010$       |

Table 2: Average correlation score at segment level for *METEOR Vector* with several training configurations of word embeddings with the default threshold (0.80).

## Acknowledgements

This work was supported by the KEHATH project funded by the French National Agency for Research (ANR) under the grant number ANR-14-CE24-0016-03.

## References

Christophe Servan, Alexandre Bérard, Zied Elloumi, Hervé Blanchon, and Laurent Besacier. 2016. Word2vec vs dbnary: Augmenting meteor using vector representations or lexical resources? In the proceedings of the 26th International Conference on Computational Linguistics (COLING 2016), Osaka, Japan, December.

| Language pairs               | fr–en     |                   | de-en     |                   | ru-en     |                   | Average   |                   |
|------------------------------|-----------|-------------------|-----------|-------------------|-----------|-------------------|-----------|-------------------|
| Metric                       | Threshold | au                | Threshold | au                | Threshold | au                | Threshold | au                |
| monolingual (baseline)       | 0.80      | $0.407 \pm 0.014$ | 0.80      | $0.332 \pm 0.014$ | 0.80      | $0.328 \pm 0.010$ | 0.80      | $0.356\pm0.013$   |
| bilingual                    | 0.80      | $0.404 \pm 0.014$ | 0.80      | $0.330 \pm 0.014$ | 0.80      | $0.328 \pm 0.011$ | 0.80      | $0.354 \pm 0.013$ |
| pseudo-bilingual with POS    | 0.80      | $0.409 \pm 0.015$ | 0.80      | $0.333 \pm 0.014$ | 0.80      | $0.322 \pm 0.011$ | 0.80      | $0.355 \pm 0.013$ |
| pseudo-bilingual with lemmas | 0.80      | $0.410 \pm 0.014$ | 0.80      | $0.330 \pm 0.015$ | 0.80      | $0.322 \pm 0.010$ | 0.80      | $0.354 \pm 0.013$ |
| monolingual (lemmas)         | 0.80      | $0.406 \pm 0.013$ | 0.80      | $0.332 \pm 0.014$ | 0.80      | $0.333 \pm 0.010$ | 0.80      | $0.357 \pm 0.012$ |
| bilingual (lemmas)           | 0.80      | $0.409 \pm 0.013$ | 0.80      | $0.333 \pm 0.014$ | 0.80      | $0.329 \pm 0.009$ | 0.80      | $0.356 \pm 0.012$ |
| Language pairs               | en-fr     |                   | en-de     |                   | en-ru     |                   | Average   |                   |
| Metric                       | Threshold | au                | Threshold | au                | Threshold | au                | Threshold | au                |
| monolingual (baseline)       | 0.80      | $0.290 \pm 0.012$ | 0.80      | $0.241 \pm 0.009$ | 0.80      | $0.436 \pm 0.012$ | 0.80      | $0.322 \pm 0.011$ |
| bilingual                    | 0.80      | $0.289 \pm 0.012$ | 0.80      | $0.241 \pm 0.010$ | 0.80      | $0.435 \pm 0.012$ | 0.80      | $0.322 \pm 0.011$ |
| pseudo-bilingual with POS    | 0.80      | $0.284 \pm 0.012$ | 0.80      | $0.241 \pm 0.010$ | 0.80      | $0.434 \pm 0.012$ | 0.80      | $0.320\pm0.011$   |
| pseudo-bilingual with lemmas | 0.80      | $0.285 \pm 0.012$ | 0.80      | $0.244 \pm 0.009$ | 0.80      | $0.445 \pm 0.013$ | 0.80      | $0.325 \pm 0.011$ |
| monolingual (lemmas)         | 0.80      | $0.292 \pm 0.011$ | 0.80      | $0.243 \pm 0.009$ | 0.80      | $0.438 \pm 0.013$ | 0.80      | $0.324 \pm 0.011$ |
| bilingual (lemmas)           | 0.80      | $0.285 \pm 0.011$ | 0.80      | $0.239 \pm 0.011$ | 0.80      | $0.431 \pm 0.011$ | 0.80      | $0.319\pm0.010$   |

Table 3: Detail of the correlation score at segment level of the *METEOR Vector* with several training configuration of word embeddings with the default threshold. The last column correponds to the results show in the Table 2