

# SI231 - Matrix Computations, Fall 2020-21

## Homework Set #3

Prof. Yue Qiu and Prof. Ziping Zhao

**Name:** aaa **Major:** Master in CS

**Student No.:** 2018123456 **E-mail:** aaa@shanghaitech.edu.cn

---

### Acknowledgements:

- 1) Deadline: **2020-11-01 23:59:00**
  - 2) Submit your homework at **Gradescope**. Entry Code: **MY3XBJ**. Homework #3 contains two parts, the theoretical part and the programming part.
  - 3) About the theoretical part:
    - (a) Submit your homework in **Homework 3** in gradescope. Make sure that you have correctly select pages for each problem. If not, you probably will get 0 point.
    - (b) Your homework should be uploaded in the **PDF** format, and the naming format of the file is not specified.
    - (c) You need to use  $\text{\LaTeX}$  in principle.
    - (d) Use the given template and give your solution in English. Solution in Chinese is not allowed.
  - 4) About the programming part:
    - (a) Submit your codes in **Homework 3 Programming part** in gradescope.
    - (b) Detailed requirements see in Problem 2 and Problem 3.
  - 5) **No late submission is allowed.**
-

## I. UNDERSTANDING PROJECTION

**Problem 1. (5 points  $\times$  3)**

Suppose that  $\mathbf{P} \in \mathbb{R}^{n \times n}$  is a projector onto a subspace  $\mathcal{U}$  along its orthogonal complement  $\mathcal{U}^\perp$ , then it is called the **orthogonal projector** onto  $\mathcal{U}$ .

- 1) Prove that an orthogonal projector must be singular if it is not an identity matrix.
- 2) What is the orthogonal projector onto  $\mathcal{U}^\perp$  along the subspace  $\mathcal{U}$ ?
- 3) Let  $\mathcal{U}$  and  $\mathcal{W}$  be two subspaces of a vector space  $\mathcal{V}$ , and denote  $\mathbf{P}_\mathcal{U}$  and  $\mathbf{P}_\mathcal{W}$  as the corresponding orthogonal projectors, respectively. Prove that  $\mathbf{P}_\mathcal{U}\mathbf{P}_\mathcal{W} = 0$  if and only if  $\mathcal{U} \perp \mathcal{W}$ .

**Solution.**

- 1) Proof: suppose a basis of  $\mathcal{U}$  is  $\vec{v}_1, \vec{v}_2, \dots, \vec{v}_m$ . and we can turn the basis  $\vec{v}_i$  into an orthonormal basis  $\vec{u}_i$ , using the Gram-Schmidt algorithm. Then orthogonal projector will be:  $P = \sum \vec{u}_i \vec{u}_i^T$ , Note that this is an  $m \times m$  matrix.
- 2) Consider a subspace  $\mathcal{U}$  of  $\mathbb{R}^n$  with basis  $\vec{v}_1, \vec{v}_2, \dots, \vec{v}_m$ . Let

$$A = \begin{bmatrix} \vec{v}_1 & \vec{v}_2 & \dots & \vec{v}_m \end{bmatrix}$$

Then the matrix of the orthogonal projection onto  $V$  is

$$A (A^T A)^{-1} A^T$$

We are not required to find an orthonormal basis of  $V$  here. If the vectors  $\vec{v}_1 \dots \vec{v}_m$  happen to be orthonormal, then  $A^T A = I_m$  and the formula simplifies to  $AA^T$ . (See Theorem 5.3.10.)

## II. LEAST SQUARE (LS) PROGRAMMING.

### Problem 2. (10 points + 10 points + 5 points)

Write programs to solve the least square problem with specified methods, any programming language is suitable.

$$\mathbf{x} = \arg \min_{\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^n} f(\mathbf{x}), \quad f(\mathbf{x}) = \|\mathbf{y} - \mathbf{A}\mathbf{x}\|_2^2$$

where  $\mathbf{A} \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times n}$  is a matrix representing the predefined data set with  $m$  data samples of  $n$  dimensions ( $m=1000$ ,  $n=210$ ), and  $\mathbf{y} \in \mathbb{R}^m$  represents the labels. The data samples are provided in the "data.txt" file, and the labels are provided in the "label.txt" file, you are supposed to load the data before solving the problem.

- 1) Solve the LS with gradient decent method.

The gradient descent method for solving problem updates  $\mathbf{x}$  as

$$\mathbf{x} = \mathbf{x} - \gamma \cdot \nabla_{\mathbf{x}} f(\mathbf{x}),$$

where  $\gamma$  is the step size of the gradient decent methods. We suggest that you can set  $\gamma = 1e - 5$ .

- 2) Solve the LS by the method of normal equation with Cholesky decomposition and forward/backward substitution.
- 3) Compare two methods above.
  - (a) Basing on the true running results from the program, count the number of "flops";
  - (b) Compare gradient norm and loss  $f(\mathbf{x})$  for results  $\mathbf{x} = \mathbf{x}_{\text{LS}}$  of above two algorithms.

**Notation\*:** "flop": one flop means one floating point operation, i.e., one addition, subtraction, multiplication, or division of two floating-point numbers, in this problem each floating points operation  $+$ ,  $-$ ,  $\times$ ,  $\div$ ,  $\sqrt{\cdot}$  counts as one "flop".

#### Hint for gradient decent programming:

- 1) **Step size selection:** to ensure the convergence of the method,  $\gamma$  is supposed to be selected properly (large step size may accelerate the convergence rate but also may lead to instability, A sufficiently small compensation always ensures that the algorithm converges).
- 2) **Terminal condition:** the gradient decent is an iteration algorithm that need a terminal condition. In this problem, the algorithm can stop when the gradient of the loss function  $f(\mathbf{x})$  at current  $\mathbf{x}$  is small enough.

#### Remarks:

- The solution of the two methods should be printed in files named "sol1.txt" and "sol2.txt" and submitted in gradescope. The format should be same as the input file (210 rows plain text, each rows is a dimension of the final solution).
- Make sure that your codes are executable and are consistent with your solutions.

**Solution.** Please insert your solution here ...

### III. UNDERSTANDING THE QR FACTORIZATION

**Problem 3 [Understanding the Gram-Schmidt algorithm.].** (5 points + 7 points + 6 points + 7 points)

1) Consider the subspace  $\mathcal{S}$  spanned by  $\{\mathbf{a}_1, \dots, \mathbf{a}_4\}$ , where

$$\mathbf{a}_1 = \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 2 \\ 3 \\ 4 \end{bmatrix}, \quad \mathbf{a}_2 = \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 3 \\ 4 \\ 5 \end{bmatrix}, \quad \mathbf{a}_3 = \begin{bmatrix} 3 \\ 4 \\ 5 \\ 6 \end{bmatrix}, \quad \mathbf{a}_4 = \begin{bmatrix} 3 \\ 5 \\ 7 \\ 11 \end{bmatrix}.$$

Use the **classical** Gram-Schmidt algorithm (See Algorithm 1), find a set of orthonormal basis  $\{\mathbf{q}_i\}$  for  $\mathcal{S}$  by hand (derivation is expected). Do not use decimals in your answers, fraction and  $n$ -th roots of numbers are accepted. Verify the orthonormality of the found basis.

---

**Algorithm 1:** Classical Gram-Schmidt algorithm

---

**Input :** A collection of linearly independent vectors  $\mathbf{a}_1, \dots, \mathbf{a}_n$ .

1 **Initialization:**  $\tilde{\mathbf{q}}_1 = \mathbf{a}_1, \mathbf{q}_1 = \tilde{\mathbf{q}}_1 / \|\tilde{\mathbf{q}}_1\|_2$

2 **for**  $i = 2, \dots, n$  **do**

3      $\tilde{\mathbf{q}}_i = \mathbf{a}_i - \sum_{j=1}^{i-1} (\mathbf{q}_j^T \mathbf{a}_i) \mathbf{q}_j$

4      $\mathbf{q}_i = \tilde{\mathbf{q}}_i / \|\tilde{\mathbf{q}}_i\|_2$

5 **end**

**Output:**  $\mathbf{q}_1, \dots, \mathbf{q}_n$

---

2) Orthogonal projection of vector  $\mathbf{a}$  onto a nonzero vector  $\mathbf{b}$  is defined as

$$\text{proj}_{\mathbf{b}}(\mathbf{a}) = \frac{\langle \mathbf{a}, \mathbf{b} \rangle}{\langle \mathbf{b}, \mathbf{b} \rangle} \mathbf{b},$$

where  $\langle \cdot, \cdot \rangle$  denotes the inner product of vectors. And for subspace  $\mathcal{M}$  with orthonormal basis  $\{\mathbf{u}_1, \dots, \mathbf{u}_k\}$ , the orthogonal projector onto subspace  $\mathcal{M}$  is given by

$$\mathbf{P} = \mathbf{U}\mathbf{U}^T, \quad \mathbf{U} = [\mathbf{u}_1 | \dots | \mathbf{u}_k].$$

In the context of **projection of vector** and **projection onto subspace** respectively, can you give another two understandings of the classical Gram-Schmidt algorithm?

3) Consider the subspace  $\mathcal{S}$  spanned by  $\{\mathbf{a}_1, \mathbf{a}_2, \mathbf{a}_3\}$ ,

$$\mathbf{a}_1 = \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ \epsilon \\ \epsilon \end{bmatrix}, \quad \mathbf{a}_2 = \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ \epsilon \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}, \quad \mathbf{a}_3 = \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 0 \\ \epsilon \end{bmatrix},$$

where  $\epsilon$  is a small real number such that  $1 + k\epsilon^2 = 1$  ( $k \in \mathbb{N}^+$ ). First complete the pseudo algorithm in Algorithm 2. Then use the **classical** Gram-Schmidt algorithm and the **modified** Gram-Schmidt algorithm respectively, find two sets of basis for  $\mathcal{S}$  by hand (derivation is expected). Are the two sets of basis the same? If not, which one is the desired orthonormal basis? Report what you have found.

---

**Algorithm 2:** Modified Gram-Schmidt algorithm
 

---

**Input :** A collection of linearly independent vectors  $\mathbf{a}_1, \dots, \mathbf{a}_n$ .

1 **Initilization:**

2 *Complete your algorithm here...*

**Output:**  $\mathbf{q}_1, \dots, \mathbf{q}_n$

---

4) **Programming part:** In this part, you are required to code both the **classical Gram-Schmidt** and the **modified Gram-Schmidt** algorithms. For  $\epsilon = 1\text{e}-4$  and  $\epsilon = 1\text{e}-9$  in sub-problem 2), give the outputs of two algorithms and calculate  $\|\mathbf{Q}^T \mathbf{Q} - \mathbf{I}\|_F$ , where  $\mathbf{Q} = [\mathbf{q}_1, \mathbf{q}_2, \mathbf{q}_3]$ .

**Remarks:**

- Coding languages are restricted, but do not use built-in function such as `qr`.
- When handing in your homework in gradescope, package all your codes into `your_student_id+hw3_code.zip` and upload. In the package, you also need to include a file named `README.txt/md` to clearly identify the function of each file.
- Make sure that your codes can run and are consistent with your solutions.

**Solution.** Please insert your solution here ...

#### IV. SOLVING LS VIA QR FACTORIZATION AND NORMAL EQUATION

**Problem 4** [Understanding the influence of the condition number to the solution.]. (4 points + 5 points + 4 points + 4 points + 3 points points)

Consider such two LS problems:

$$\begin{aligned} \min_{\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^n} \|\mathbf{Ax} - \mathbf{b}\|_2^2 \\ \min_{\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^n} \|(\mathbf{A} + \delta\mathbf{A})\mathbf{x} - (\mathbf{b} + \delta\mathbf{b})\|_2^2 \end{aligned} \quad (1)$$

with  $\mathbf{A} \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times n}$ . For  $\mathbf{b} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 3/2 & 3 & 6 \end{bmatrix}^T$  and  $\delta\mathbf{b} = \begin{bmatrix} 1/10 & 0 & 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix}^T$ ,

1) Computing solution to the problem (1) via QR decomposition when

$$\mathbf{A} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 2 & 3 \\ 2 & 3 & 5 \\ 3 & 4 & 7 \\ 4 & 5 & 11 \end{bmatrix}.$$

2) For a full-rank matrix  $\mathbf{A}$ , consider the equation  $\mathbf{Ax} = \mathbf{b}$ , after adding some noise  $\delta\mathbf{b}$  to  $\mathbf{b}$ , we have  $\mathbf{A}(\mathbf{x} + \delta\mathbf{x}) = \mathbf{b} + \delta\mathbf{b}$ , and then proof

$$\frac{1}{\|\mathbf{A}\| \|\mathbf{A}^\dagger\|} \frac{\|\delta\mathbf{b}\|}{\|\mathbf{b}\|} \leq \frac{\|\delta\mathbf{x}\|}{\|\mathbf{x}\|} \leq \|\mathbf{A}\| \|\mathbf{A}^\dagger\| \frac{\|\delta\mathbf{b}\|}{\|\mathbf{b}\|},$$

and give it a plain interpretation.

3) Computing the solutions to the two LS problems via the normal equation  $\mathbf{A}^T \mathbf{Ax}_{LS} = \mathbf{A}^T \mathbf{b}$  when

$$\mathbf{A} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 2 & 2 \\ 2 & 2 & 2 \\ 3 & 3 & 3 \\ 1 & 1 & 0 \end{bmatrix}.$$

4) Computing the solutions to the two LS problems via the normal equation  $\mathbf{A}^T \mathbf{Ax}_{LS} = \mathbf{A}^T \mathbf{b}$  when

$$\mathbf{A} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 1 & 2 & 4 \\ 1 & 3 & 9 \\ 1 & 4 & 16 \end{bmatrix}.$$

5) Compare the 2-norm condition number  $\|\mathbf{A}\| \|\mathbf{A}^\dagger\|$  for  $\mathbf{A}$  in 3) and 4) and the influence on the solution to problem (1) resulted by the additional noise  $\delta\mathbf{b}$ .

**Hint:** Show the influence on the solution by  $\frac{\|\delta\mathbf{x}\|}{\|\mathbf{x}\|}$ .

**Remarks:** You can use MATLAB for some matrix computations (deviation is expected) in 3), 4), 5). Do not use decimals in your answers, fraction and  $n$ -th roots of numbers are accepted.

**Solution.** Please insert your solution here ...

## V. UNDERDETERMINED SYSTEM

**Problem 5 [Solving Underdetermined System by QR]. (10 points + 5 points)**

Consider the following underdetermined system  $\mathbf{Ax} = \mathbf{b}$  with  $\mathbf{A} \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times n}$  and  $m < n$ . Let

$$\mathbf{A} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 2 & 2 & 0 \\ 0 & -2 & 2 & 1 \\ 2 & 5 & 6 & 1 \end{bmatrix}, \mathbf{b} = \begin{bmatrix} b_1 \\ b_2 \\ b_3 \end{bmatrix},$$

- 1) Use Householder reflection to give the full QR decomposition of tall  $\mathbf{A}^T$ , i.e.,  $\mathbf{A}^T = \mathbf{QR}$  with  $\mathbf{Q}$  being a square matrix with orthonormal columns.
- 2) Give one possible solution via QR decomposition of  $\mathbf{A}^T$ , write down your solution using  $\mathbf{b}$ .

**Solution.** Please insert your solution here ...

## VI. SOLVING LS VIA PROJECTION

**Problem 6.** (Bonus question, 6 points + 4 points)

Consider the Least Square (LS) problem:

$$\min_{\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^n} \|\mathbf{A}\mathbf{x} - \mathbf{y}\|_2^2 \quad (2)$$

where  $\mathbf{A} \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times n}$  ( $m > n$ ) may not be full rank. Denote

$$X_{\text{LS}} = \{\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^n | \mathbf{A}^T \mathbf{A} \mathbf{x} = \mathbf{A}^T \mathbf{y}\}$$

as the set of all solutions to (2), and

$$\mathbf{x}_{\text{LS}} = \mathbf{A}^\dagger \mathbf{y}$$

where  $\mathbf{A}^\dagger \in \mathbb{R}^{n \times m}$  is the *pseudo inverse* of  $\mathbf{A}$  satisfies the following properties:

- 1)  $\mathbf{A} \mathbf{A}^\dagger \mathbf{A} = \mathbf{A}$ .
- 2)  $\mathbf{A}^\dagger \mathbf{A} \mathbf{A}^\dagger = \mathbf{A}^\dagger$ .
- 3)  $(\mathbf{A} \mathbf{A}^\dagger)^T = \mathbf{A} \mathbf{A}^\dagger$ .
- 4)  $(\mathbf{A}^\dagger \mathbf{A})^T = \mathbf{A}^\dagger \mathbf{A}$ .

Answer the following questions:

- 1) Prove that  $\mathbf{x}_{\text{LS}}$  is a solution to (2) and is of minimum 2-norm in  $X_{\text{LS}}$ , that is

$$\mathbf{x}_{\text{LS}} = \min\{\|\mathbf{x}\|_2^2 | \mathbf{x} \in X_{\text{LS}}\}.$$

**Hint.** Notice that the orthogonal projection onto  $\mathcal{N}(A)$  is given by

$$\mathbf{\Pi}_{\mathcal{N}(A)} = \mathbf{I} - \mathbf{A}^\dagger \mathbf{A}$$

- 2) Prove that  $X_{\text{LS}} = \{\mathbf{x}_{\text{LS}}\}$  if and only if  $\text{rank}(\mathbf{A}) = n$ .

**Solution.** Please insert your solution here ...