



Ohio Department of Transportation
Official Bid Tabulation
Jerry Wray, Director

Project No. 180331
PID 101261
WAY-SR 57-02.20
Federal
Type: FOUR LANE RESURFACING
Letting Date: 5/17/2018
Completion Date: 11/16/2018

Contract Awarded To: NORTHSTAR ASPHALT INC
Award Amount: \$1,905,745.60
Engineer's Estimate: \$1,765,000.00

Bidder 1

NORTHSTAR ASPHALT INC
P O BOX 2646
Stark
NORTH CANTON, OH 44720
Bid \$1,905,745.60

Bidder 3

KARVO COMPANIES INC
4524 HUDSON DR

STOW, OH 44224-1702
Bid \$2,008,382.76

Bidder 2

CHAGRIN VALLEY PAVING INC
17290 MUNN RD
Geauga
CHAGRIN FALLS, OH 44023
Bid \$1,962,882.93

Bidder 4

KOKOSING CONSTRUCTION COMPANY INC
886 MC KINLEY AVE
Franklin
COLUMBUS, OH 43222
Bid \$2,283,361.70

Ref #1	202E23000	PAVEMENT REMOVED, (5068 SY)	
	Awd	\$8.75	\$44,345.00
	2	\$2.00	\$10,136.00
	3	\$8.40	\$42,571.20
	4	\$4.00	\$20,272.00
Ref #2	202E32000	CURB REMOVED, (260 FT)	
	Awd	\$11.00	\$2,860.00
	2	\$10.00	\$2,600.00
	3	\$15.00	\$3,900.00
	4	\$12.85	\$3,341.00
Ref #3	203E10000	EXCAVATION (6.5" DEPTH), (915 CY)	
	Awd	\$10.00	\$9,150.00
	2	\$20.00	\$18,300.00
	3	\$48.00	\$43,920.00
	4	\$20.00	\$18,300.00
Ref #4	204E10000	SUBGRADE COMPACTION, (5068 SY)	
	Awd	\$3.50	\$17,738.00
	2	\$0.50	\$2,534.00
	3	\$1.25	\$6,335.00
	4	\$4.00	\$20,272.00
Ref #5	608E52000	CURB RAMP, (741 SF)	
	Awd	\$22.00	\$16,302.00
	2	\$25.00	\$18,525.00
	3	\$34.00	\$25,194.00
	4	\$18.50	\$13,708.50
Ref #6	623E39500	MONUMENT BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE, (3 EACH)	
	Awd	\$350.00	\$1,050.00
	2	\$750.00	\$2,250.00
	3	\$450.00	\$1,350.00
	4	\$400.00	\$1,200.00
Ref #100	202E30000	WALK REMOVED, (741 SF)	
	Awd	\$6.00	\$4,446.00
	2	\$5.00	\$3,705.00
	3	\$3.65	\$2,704.65
	4	\$5.00	\$3,705.00

Section 1 - ROADWAY - Totals

Awd	\$95,891.00
2	\$58,050.00
3	\$125,974.85
4	\$80,798.50

Ref #7	611E98630	CATCH BASIN ADJUSTED TO GRADE, (36 EACH)	
	Awd	\$350.00	\$12,600.00
	2	\$1,250.00	\$45,000.00
	3	\$1,000.00	\$36,000.00
	4	\$250.00	\$9,000.00
Ref #8	611E99654	MANHOLE ADJUSTED TO GRADE, (35 EACH)	
	Awd	\$790.00	\$27,650.00
	2	\$900.00	\$31,500.00
	3	\$1,150.00	\$40,250.00
	4	\$975.00	\$34,125.00

Section 2 - DRAINAGE - Totals

Awd	\$40,250.00
2	\$76,500.00
3	\$76,250.00
4	\$43,125.00

Ref #9	251E01042	PARTIAL DEPTH PAVEMENT REPAIR (ASPHALT CONCRETE BA, (400 CY)	
	Awd	\$230.00	\$92,000.00
	2	\$230.00	\$92,000.00
	3	\$238.00	\$95,200.00
	4	\$245.00	\$98,000.00
Ref #10	253E02000	PAVEMENT REPAIR, (50 CY)	
	Awd	\$230.00	\$11,500.00
	2	\$230.00	\$11,500.00
	3	\$220.00	\$11,000.00
	4	\$375.00	\$18,750.00
Ref #11	254E01000	PAVEMENT PLANING, ASPHALT CONCRETE (3.25"), (53374 SY)	
	Awd	\$1.70	\$90,735.80
	2	\$3.00	\$160,122.00
	3	\$2.10	\$112,085.40
	4	\$1.50	\$80,061.00
Ref #12	254E01600	PATCHING PLANED SURFACE, (534 SY)	
	Awd	\$2.00	\$1,068.00
	2	\$5.00	\$2,670.00
	3	\$1.00	\$534.00
	4	\$1.00	\$534.00
Ref #13	255E10161	FULL DEPTH PAVEMENT REMOVAL AND RIGID REPLACEMENT,, (1500 SY)	
	Awd	\$110.00	\$165,000.00
	2	\$150.00	\$225,000.00
	3	\$138.00	\$207,000.00
	4	\$133.00	\$199,500.00
Ref #14	255E20000	FULL DEPTH PAVEMENT SAWING, (18186 FT)	
	Awd	\$2.00	\$36,372.00
	2	\$1.50	\$27,279.00
	3	\$1.38	\$25,096.68
	4	\$1.60	\$29,097.60
Ref #15	301E46001	ASPHALT CONCRETE BASE, PG64-22, AS PER PLAN, (1126 CY)	
	Awd	\$141.00	\$158,766.00
	2	\$130.00	\$146,380.00
	3	\$125.00	\$140,750.00
	4	\$165.00	\$185,790.00
Ref #16	304E20000	AGGREGATE BASE (3" DEPTH), (422 CY)	
	Awd	\$25.00	\$10,550.00
	2	\$53.00	\$22,366.00
	3	\$100.00	\$42,200.00
	4	\$20.00	\$8,440.00
Ref #17	407E13900	TACK COAT, 702.13, (1502 GAL)	
	Awd	\$2.50	\$3,755.00
	2	\$2.00	\$3,004.00
	3	\$1.75	\$2,628.50
	4	\$2.60	\$3,905.20

Ref #18	407E20000	NON-TRACKING TACK COAT (@0.05 GAL/SY), (2668 GAL)	
	Awd	\$3.30	\$8,804.40
	2	\$2.00	\$5,336.00
	3	\$2.10	\$5,602.80
	4	\$2.50	\$6,670.00
Ref #19	407E20000	NON-TRACKING TACK COAT (@0.09 GAL/SY), (3302 GAL)	
	Awd	\$3.30	\$10,896.60
	2	\$2.00	\$6,604.00
	3	\$2.10	\$6,934.20
	4	\$2.50	\$8,255.00
Ref #20	442E10000	ASPHALT CONCRETE SURFACE COURSE, 12.5 MM, TYPE A (, (2224 CY)	
	Awd	\$168.00	\$373,632.00
	2	\$148.00	\$329,152.00
	3	\$163.00	\$362,512.00
	4	\$210.00	\$467,040.00
Ref #21	442E20201	ASPHALT CONCRETE INTERMEDIATE COURSE, 19 MM, TYPE , (2595 CY)	
	Awd	\$129.00	\$334,755.00
	2	\$130.00	\$337,350.00
	3	\$127.00	\$329,565.00
	4	\$190.00	\$493,050.00
Ref #22	609E26000	CURB, TYPE 6, (480 FT)	
	Awd	\$45.00	\$21,600.00
	2	\$40.00	\$19,200.00
	3	\$19.00	\$9,120.00
	4	\$22.75	\$10,920.00

Section 3 - PAVEMENT - Totals

Awd	\$1,319,434.80
2	\$1,387,963.00
3	\$1,350,228.58
4	\$1,610,012.80

Ref #23	638E10800	VALVE BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE, (85 EACH)	
	Awd	\$620.00	\$52,700.00
	2	\$750.00	\$63,750.00
	3	\$725.00	\$61,625.00
	4	\$800.00	\$68,000.00

Section 4 - WATER WORK - Totals

Awd	\$52,700.00
2	\$63,750.00
3	\$61,625.00
4	\$68,000.00

Ref #24	642E00300	CENTER LINE, TYPE 1, (4.44 MILE)	
	Awd	\$300.00	\$1,332.00
	2	\$862.00	\$3,827.28
	3	\$862.00	\$3,827.28
	4	\$780.00	\$3,463.20

Ref #25	642E00390	CHANNELIZING LINE, 8", (921 FT)	
	Awd	\$0.55	\$506.55
	2	\$0.50	\$460.50
	3	\$0.50	\$460.50
	4	\$0.55	\$506.55
Ref #26	642E00500	STOP LINE, TYPE 1, (331 FT)	
	Awd	\$2.50	\$827.50
	2	\$3.75	\$1,241.25
	3	\$3.75	\$1,241.25
	4	\$3.85	\$1,274.35
Ref #27	642E00600	CROSSWALK LINE, TYPE 1, (702 FT)	
	Awd	\$2.00	\$1,404.00
	2	\$2.00	\$1,404.00
	3	\$2.00	\$1,404.00
	4	\$2.15	\$1,509.30
Ref #28	642E00700	TRANSVERSE/DIAGONAL LINE, TYPE 1, (175 FT)	
	Awd	\$2.25	\$393.75
	2	\$3.00	\$525.00
	3	\$3.00	\$525.00
	4	\$3.00	\$525.00
Ref #29	642E00900	ISLAND MARKING, TYPE 1, (150 SF)	
	Awd	\$2.25	\$337.50
	2	\$2.50	\$375.00
	3	\$2.50	\$375.00
	4	\$3.00	\$450.00
Ref #30	642E01000	RAILROAD SYMBOL MARKING, TYPE 1, (7 EACH)	
	Awd	\$250.00	\$1,750.00
	2	\$350.00	\$2,450.00
	3	\$350.00	\$2,450.00
	4	\$325.00	\$2,275.00
Ref #31	642E01300	LANE ARROW, TYPE 1, (49 EACH)	
	Awd	\$45.00	\$2,205.00
	2	\$75.00	\$3,675.00
	3	\$75.00	\$3,675.00
	4	\$45.00	\$2,205.00
Ref #32	646E10010	EDGE LINE, 6", (0.02 MILE)	
	Awd	\$2,930.00	\$58.60
	2	\$5,565.00	\$111.30
	3	\$5,565.00	\$111.30
	4	\$31,850.00	\$637.00
Ref #33	646E10200	CENTER LINE, (0.22 MILE)	
	Awd	\$4,535.00	\$997.70
	2	\$8,300.00	\$1,826.00
	3	\$8,300.00	\$1,826.00
	4	\$32,240.00	\$7,092.80
Ref #34	646E10300	CHANNELIZING LINE, 8", (255 FT)	
	Awd	\$1.25	\$318.75
	2	\$1.70	\$433.50
	3	\$1.70	\$433.50
	4	\$1.90	\$484.50

Ref #35	646E10400	STOP LINE, (96 FT)	
	Awd	\$9.15	\$878.40
	2	\$13.30	\$1,276.80
	3	\$13.30	\$1,276.80
	4	\$10.00	\$960.00
Ref #36	646E10500	CROSSWALK LINE, (1080 FT)	
	Awd	\$5.30	\$5,724.00
	2	\$6.35	\$6,858.00
	3	\$6.35	\$6,858.00
	4	\$4.70	\$5,076.00
Ref #37	646E10600	TRANSVERSE/DIAGONAL LINE, (175 FT)	
	Awd	\$7.25	\$1,268.75
	2	\$9.40	\$1,645.00
	3	\$9.40	\$1,645.00
	4	\$7.00	\$1,225.00
Ref #38	646E10800	ISLAND MARKING, (150 SF)	
	Awd	\$4.14	\$621.00
	2	\$6.70	\$1,005.00
	3	\$6.70	\$1,005.00
	4	\$5.00	\$750.00
Ref #39	646E20000	RAILROAD SYMBOL MARKING, (1 EACH)	
	Awd	\$500.00	\$500.00
	2	\$740.00	\$740.00
	3	\$740.00	\$740.00
	4	\$600.00	\$600.00
Ref #40	646E20300	LANE ARROW, (6 EACH)	
	Awd	\$150.00	\$900.00
	2	\$195.00	\$1,170.00
	3	\$195.00	\$1,170.00
	4	\$176.00	\$1,056.00

Section 5 - TRAFFIC CONTROL - Totals

Awd	\$20,023.50
2	\$29,023.63
3	\$29,023.63
4	\$30,089.70

Ref #41	632E26501	DETECTOR LOOP, AS PER PLAN, (36 EACH)	
	Awd	\$1,150.00	\$41,400.00
	2	\$1,150.00	\$41,400.00
	3	\$1,150.00	\$41,400.00
	4	\$1,150.00	\$41,400.00

Section 6 - TRAFFIC SURVEILLANCE - Totals

Awd	\$41,400.00
2	\$41,400.00
3	\$41,400.00
4	\$41,400.00

Ref #42	614E11110	LAW ENFORCEMENT OFFICER WITH PATROL CAR FOR ASSIST, (120 HOUR)	
	Awd	\$65.00	\$7,800.00
	2	\$75.00	\$9,000.00
	3	\$65.00	\$7,800.00
	4	\$60.00	\$7,200.00
Ref #43	614E12350	WORK ZONE IMPACT ATTENUATOR, (4 EACH)	
	Awd	\$1,100.00	\$4,400.00
	2	\$1,100.00	\$4,400.00
	3	\$1,100.00	\$4,400.00
	4	\$1,100.00	\$4,400.00
Ref #44	614E13000	ASPHALT CONCRETE FOR MAINTAINING TRAFFIC, (55 CY)	
	Awd	\$180.00	\$9,900.00
	2	\$200.00	\$11,000.00
	3	\$180.00	\$9,900.00
	4	\$100.00	\$5,500.00
Ref #45	614E13310	BARRIER REFLECTOR, TYPE 1 (BIDIRECTIONAL), (30 EACH)	
	Awd	\$5.00	\$150.00
	2	\$5.00	\$150.00
	3	\$5.00	\$150.00
	4	\$5.00	\$150.00
Ref #46	614E13312	BARRIER REFLECTOR, TYPE 2 (BIDIRECTIONAL), (24 EACH)	
	Awd	\$7.00	\$168.00
	2	\$7.00	\$168.00
	3	\$5.00	\$120.00
	4	\$5.00	\$120.00
Ref #47	614E13360	OBJECT MARKER, TWO WAY (BIDIRECTIONAL), (20 EACH)	
	Awd	\$12.00	\$240.00
	2	\$12.00	\$240.00
	3	\$10.00	\$200.00
	4	\$10.00	\$200.00
Ref #48	614E18601	PORTABLE CHANGEABLE MESSAGE SIGN, AS PER PLAN, (10 SNMT)	
	Awd	\$900.00	\$9,000.00
	2	\$900.00	\$9,000.00
	3	\$900.00	\$9,000.00
	4	\$600.00	\$6,000.00
Ref #49	614E21200	WORK ZONE CENTER LINE, CLASS I, 740.06, TYPE I, (0.42 MILE)	
	Awd	\$6,500.00	\$2,730.00
	2	\$6,500.00	\$2,730.00
	3	\$7,400.00	\$3,108.00
	4	\$7,400.00	\$3,108.00
Ref #50	614E21550	WORK ZONE CENTER LINE, CLASS III, 642 PAINT, (13.32 MILE)	
	Awd	\$775.00	\$10,323.00
	2	\$775.00	\$10,323.00
	3	\$775.00	\$10,323.00
	4	\$775.00	\$10,323.00
Ref #51	614E22210	WORK ZONE EDGE LINE, CLASS I, 6", 740.06, TYPE I, (0.32 MILE)	
	Awd	\$3,250.00	\$1,040.00
	2	\$3,250.00	\$1,040.00
	3	\$5,600.00	\$1,792.00
	4	\$5,600.00	\$1,792.00

Ref #52	614E23680	WORK ZONE CHANNELIZING LINE, CLASS III, 8", 642 PA, (3528 FT)	
	Awd	\$0.35	\$1,234.80
	2	\$0.35	\$1,234.80
	3	\$0.35	\$1,234.80
	4	\$0.35	\$1,234.80
Ref #53	614E26400	WORK ZONE STOP LINE, CLASS I, 740.06, TYPE I, (118 FT)	
	Awd	\$8.50	\$1,003.00
	2	\$8.50	\$1,003.00
	3	\$2.80	\$330.40
	4	\$2.80	\$330.40
Ref #54	614E26610	WORK ZONE STOP LINE, CLASS III, 642 PAINT, (1281 FT)	
	Awd	\$2.50	\$3,202.50
	2	\$2.50	\$3,202.50
	3	\$2.50	\$3,202.50
	4	\$2.50	\$3,202.50
Ref #55	616E10000	WATER, (3 MGAL)	
	Awd	\$100.00	\$300.00
	2	\$50.00	\$150.00
	3	\$5.00	\$15.00
	4	\$5.00	\$15.00
Ref #56	622E41000	PORTABLE BARRIER, 32", (360 FT)	
	Awd	\$16.00	\$5,760.00
	2	\$16.00	\$5,760.00
	3	\$16.00	\$5,760.00
	4	\$16.00	\$5,760.00
Ref #57	622E41020	PORTABLE BARRIER, 32", BRIDGE MOUNTED (UNANCHORED), (130 FT)	
	Awd	\$18.00	\$2,340.00
	2	\$18.00	\$2,340.00
	3	\$18.00	\$2,340.00
	4	\$18.00	\$2,340.00

Section 7 - MAINTENANCE OF TRAFFIC - Totals

Awd	\$59,591.30
2	\$61,741.30
3	\$59,675.70
4	\$51,675.70

Ref #58	202E11301	PORTIONS OF STRUCTURE REMOVED, AS PER PLAN, (4 CY)	
	Awd	\$1,500.00	\$6,000.00
	2	\$1,500.00	\$6,000.00
	3	\$1,500.00	\$6,000.00
	4	\$1,500.00	\$6,000.00
Ref #59	202E98200	REMOVAL MISC.: JOINT SEAL, (88 FT)	
	Awd	\$10.00	\$880.00
	2	\$10.00	\$880.00
	3	\$10.00	\$880.00
	4	\$10.00	\$880.00
Ref #60	511E53012	CLASS QC2 CONCRETE, MISC.: APPROACH SLAB REPAIR, (3 CY)	
	Awd	\$385.00	\$1,155.00
	2	\$385.00	\$1,155.00
	3	\$385.00	\$1,155.00
	4	\$385.00	\$1,155.00

Ref #61	511E53012	CLASS QC2 CONCRETE, MISC.: BACKWALL REPAIR, (1 CY)	
	Awd	\$900.00	\$900.00
	2	\$900.00	\$900.00
	3	\$900.00	\$900.00
	4	\$900.00	\$900.00
Ref #62	512E73501	TREATING CONCRETE BRIDGE DECKS WITH GRAVITY FED RE, (11 SY)	
	Awd	\$75.00	\$825.00
	2	\$75.00	\$825.00
	3	\$75.00	\$825.00
	4	\$75.00	\$825.00
Ref #63	516E31000	JOINT SEALER, (88 FT)	
	Awd	\$25.00	\$2,200.00
	2	\$25.00	\$2,200.00
	3	\$25.00	\$2,200.00
	4	\$25.00	\$2,200.00
Ref #64	519E11100	PATCHING CONCRETE STRUCTURE, (157 SF)	
	Awd	\$35.00	\$5,495.00
	2	\$35.00	\$5,495.00
	3	\$35.00	\$5,495.00
	4	\$35.00	\$5,495.00

Section 8 - STRUCTURE OVER 20 FOOT SPAN (WAY-57-0432 - Totals

Awd	\$17,455.00
2	\$17,455.00
3	\$17,455.00
4	\$17,455.00

Ref #65	100E00300	PREMIUM ON RAILROADS' PROTECTIVE PUBLIC LIABILITY , (LUMP SUM)	
	Awd	\$2,500.00	\$2,500.00
	2	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00
	3	\$7,500.00	\$7,500.00
	4	\$7,500.00	\$7,500.00
Ref #66	103E05000	PREMIUM FOR CONTRACT PERFORMANCE BOND AND FOR PAYM, (LUMP SUM)	
	Awd	\$7,500.00	\$7,500.00
	2	\$13,500.00	\$13,500.00
	3	\$22,000.00	\$22,000.00
	4	\$9,500.00	\$9,500.00
Ref #67	614E11000	MAINTAINING TRAFFIC, (LUMP SUM)	
	Awd	\$165,000.00	\$165,000.00
	2	\$125,000.00	\$125,000.00
	3	\$135,000.00	\$135,000.00
	4	\$211,055.00	\$211,055.00
Ref #68	619E16010	FIELD OFFICE, TYPE B, (5 MNTH)	
	Awd	\$750.00	\$3,750.00
	2	\$1,500.00	\$7,500.00
	3	\$1,750.00	\$8,750.00
	4	\$2,350.00	\$11,750.00
Ref #69	623E10000	CONSTRUCTION LAYOUT STAKES AND SURVEYING, (LUMP SUM)	
	Awd	\$5,250.00	\$5,250.00
	2	\$1,000.00	\$1,000.00
	3	\$1,500.00	\$1,500.00
	4	\$1,000.00	\$1,000.00

Ref #70	624E10000	MOBILIZATION, (LUMP SUM)	
	Awd	\$75,000.00	\$75,000.00
	2	\$75,000.00	\$75,000.00
	3	\$72,000.00	\$72,000.00
	4	\$100,000.00	\$100,000.00

Section 9 - INCIDENTALS - Totals

Awd	\$259,000.00
2	\$227,000.00
3	\$246,750.00
4	\$340,805.00