

1. Suppose  $\mathbf{y} = \mathbf{X}\boldsymbol{\beta} + \boldsymbol{\varepsilon}$ , where  $\boldsymbol{\varepsilon} \sim \mathcal{N}(\mathbf{0}, \sigma^2 \mathbf{I})$  for some unknown  $\sigma^2 > 0$ . Let  $\hat{\mathbf{y}} = \mathbf{P}_\mathbf{X} \mathbf{y}$ . By the results on multivariate normal distributions from slide set 1 (“Preliminaries”), we have

$$\mathbf{y} \sim \mathcal{N}(\mathbf{X}\boldsymbol{\beta}, \sigma^2 \mathbf{I}).$$

- (a) Notice that we want to find the distribution of a linear transformation of  $\mathbf{y}$ :

$$\begin{bmatrix} \hat{\mathbf{y}} \\ \mathbf{y} - \hat{\mathbf{y}} \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{P}_\mathbf{X} \mathbf{y} \\ \mathbf{y} - \mathbf{P}_\mathbf{X} \mathbf{y} \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{P}_\mathbf{X} \\ \mathbf{I} - \mathbf{P}_\mathbf{X} \end{bmatrix} \mathbf{y}. \quad (1)$$

Together, slides 13–14 of the first slide set (“Preliminaries”) imply that a linear transformation, say  $\mathbf{A}\mathbf{x} + \mathbf{b}$ , of a normal random variable  $\mathbf{x}$  is also normal:

$$\mathbf{x} \sim \mathcal{N}(\boldsymbol{\mu}, \boldsymbol{\Sigma}) \implies \mathbf{A}\mathbf{x} + \mathbf{b} \sim \mathcal{N}(\mathbf{A}\boldsymbol{\mu} + \mathbf{b}, \mathbf{A}\boldsymbol{\Sigma}\mathbf{A}').$$

The mean of the linear transformation in (1), since  $\mathbf{P}_\mathbf{X} \mathbf{X} = \mathbf{X}$ , is

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbb{E} \left( \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{P}_\mathbf{X} \\ \mathbf{I} - \mathbf{P}_\mathbf{X} \end{bmatrix} \mathbf{y} \right) &= \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{P}_\mathbf{X} \\ \mathbf{I} - \mathbf{P}_\mathbf{X} \end{bmatrix} \mathbb{E}(\mathbf{y}) \\ &= \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{P}_\mathbf{X} \\ \mathbf{I} - \mathbf{P}_\mathbf{X} \end{bmatrix} \mathbf{X}\boldsymbol{\beta} \\ &= \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{P}_\mathbf{X} \mathbf{X}\boldsymbol{\beta} \\ (\mathbf{I} - \mathbf{P}_\mathbf{X}) \mathbf{X}\boldsymbol{\beta} \end{bmatrix} \\ &= \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{P}_\mathbf{X} \mathbf{X}\boldsymbol{\beta} \\ \mathbf{I} \mathbf{X}\boldsymbol{\beta} - \mathbf{P}_\mathbf{X} \mathbf{X}\boldsymbol{\beta} \end{bmatrix} \\ &= \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{X}\boldsymbol{\beta} \\ \mathbf{X}\boldsymbol{\beta} - \mathbf{X}\boldsymbol{\beta} \end{bmatrix} \\ &= \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{X}\boldsymbol{\beta} \\ \mathbf{0} \end{bmatrix}. \end{aligned}$$

The variance of (1), since  $\mathbf{P}_X$  is symmetric and idempotent, is

$$\begin{aligned}
\text{Var} \left( \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{P}_X \\ \mathbf{I} - \mathbf{P}_X \end{bmatrix} \mathbf{y} \right) &= \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{P}_X \\ \mathbf{I} - \mathbf{P}_X \end{bmatrix} \text{Var}(\mathbf{y}) \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{P}_X \\ \mathbf{I} - \mathbf{P}_X \end{bmatrix}' \\
&= \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{P}_X \\ \mathbf{I} - \mathbf{P}_X \end{bmatrix} \text{Var}(\mathbf{y}) [\mathbf{P}_X', (\mathbf{I} - \mathbf{P}_X)'] \\
&= \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{P}_X \\ \mathbf{I} - \mathbf{P}_X \end{bmatrix} \sigma^2 \mathbf{I} [\mathbf{P}_X', (\mathbf{I} - \mathbf{P}_X)'] \\
&= \sigma^2 \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{P}_X \\ \mathbf{I} - \mathbf{P}_X \end{bmatrix} [\mathbf{P}_X', (\mathbf{I} - \mathbf{P}_X)'] \\
&= \sigma^2 \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{P}_X \mathbf{P}_X' & \mathbf{P}_X (\mathbf{I} - \mathbf{P}_X)' \\ (\mathbf{I} - \mathbf{P}_X) \mathbf{P}_X' & (\mathbf{I} - \mathbf{P}_X) (\mathbf{I} - \mathbf{P}_X)' \end{bmatrix} \\
&= \sigma^2 \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{P}_X \mathbf{P}_X' & \mathbf{P}_X (\mathbf{I}' - \mathbf{P}_X') \\ (\mathbf{I} - \mathbf{P}_X) \mathbf{P}_X' & (\mathbf{I} - \mathbf{P}_X) (\mathbf{I}' - \mathbf{P}_X') \end{bmatrix} \\
&= \sigma^2 \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{P}_X \mathbf{P}_X & \mathbf{P}_X (\mathbf{I} - \mathbf{P}_X) \\ (\mathbf{I} - \mathbf{P}_X) \mathbf{P}_X & (\mathbf{I} - \mathbf{P}_X) (\mathbf{I} - \mathbf{P}_X) \end{bmatrix} \\
&= \sigma^2 \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{P}_X \mathbf{P}_X & \mathbf{P}_X \mathbf{I} - \mathbf{P}_X \mathbf{P}_X \\ \mathbf{I} \mathbf{P}_X - \mathbf{P}_X \mathbf{P}_X & \mathbf{I} \mathbf{I} - \mathbf{I} \mathbf{P}_X - \mathbf{P}_X \mathbf{I} + \mathbf{P}_X \mathbf{P}_X \end{bmatrix} \\
&= \sigma^2 \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{P}_X & \mathbf{P}_X - \mathbf{P}_X \\ \mathbf{P}_X - \mathbf{P}_X & \mathbf{I} - \mathbf{P}_X - \mathbf{P}_X + \mathbf{P}_X \end{bmatrix} \\
&= \sigma^2 \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{P}_X & \mathbf{0} \\ \mathbf{0} & \mathbf{I} - \mathbf{P}_X \end{bmatrix}.
\end{aligned}$$

As a linear transformation of a multivariate normal random variable, it follows that

$$\begin{bmatrix} \hat{\mathbf{y}} \\ \mathbf{y} - \hat{\mathbf{y}} \end{bmatrix} \sim \mathcal{N} \left( \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{X}\boldsymbol{\beta} \\ \mathbf{0} \end{bmatrix}, \sigma^2 \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{P}_X & \mathbf{0} \\ \mathbf{0} & \mathbf{I} - \mathbf{P}_X \end{bmatrix} \right).$$

Comments: it is important to notice that the expected values of  $\mathbf{y}$  and  $\hat{\mathbf{y}}$  depend on the parameter  $\boldsymbol{\beta}$  and not the estimate  $\hat{\boldsymbol{\beta}}$ , which is a random variable. Similarly, the variances do not depend on the estimate  $\hat{\sigma}^2$ . Additionally, some students did not give the covariances or only stated that they were zero without any derivation (the distribution of a multivariate normal random variable is not fully specified without the covariances).

- (b) Again using the fact that  $\mathbf{P}_X$  is symmetric and idempotent, we see that  $\hat{\mathbf{y}}'\hat{\mathbf{y}}$  is a quadratic form:

$$\begin{aligned}
\hat{\mathbf{y}}'\hat{\mathbf{y}} &= [\mathbf{P}_X \mathbf{y}]' \mathbf{P}_X \mathbf{y} \\
&= \mathbf{y}' \mathbf{P}_X' \mathbf{P}_X \mathbf{y} \\
&= \mathbf{y}' \mathbf{P}_X \mathbf{P}_X \mathbf{y} \\
&= \mathbf{y}' \mathbf{P}_X \mathbf{y},
\end{aligned}$$

where  $\mathbf{y} \sim \mathcal{N}(\mathbf{X}\boldsymbol{\beta}, \sigma^2 \mathbf{I})$ . Recall the results about quadratic forms in the first slide set (“Preliminaries”) on slide 18. To apply these, want to find a symmetric matrix  $\mathbf{A}$  such that  $\mathbf{A}\boldsymbol{\Sigma}$  is idempotent for  $\boldsymbol{\Sigma} \equiv \text{Var}(\mathbf{y})$ . We can’t use  $\mathbf{P}_X$  as our  $\mathbf{A}$  matrix because the  $\sigma^2$  doesn’t cancel:

$$\mathbf{P}_X \text{Var}(\mathbf{y}) = \mathbf{P}_X \sigma^2 \mathbf{I} = \sigma^2 \mathbf{P}_X.$$

Instead using  $\mathbf{A} = \frac{\mathbf{P}_X}{\sigma^2}$ , which is symmetric, gives

$$\mathbf{A}\Sigma = \mathbf{A} \text{Var}(\mathbf{y}) = \frac{\mathbf{P}_X}{\sigma^2} \sigma^2 \mathbf{I} = \mathbf{P}_X,$$

which we know is idempotent.

It is easy to verify that  $\Sigma = \sigma^2 \mathbf{I}$  is positive definite since  $\sigma^2 > 0$  (see homework 1 solutions). We can use the result of problem 2(b) to determine the rank of  $\mathbf{A}$ :

$$\text{rank}(\mathbf{A}) = \text{rank}(\mathbf{P}_X/\sigma^2) = \text{rank}(\mathbf{P}_X) = \text{rank}(\mathbf{X}).$$

Then,

$$\frac{1}{\sigma^2} \hat{\mathbf{y}}' \hat{\mathbf{y}} = \mathbf{y}' \frac{\mathbf{P}_X}{\sigma^2} \mathbf{y} \sim \chi_{\text{rank}(\mathbf{X})}^2([\mathbf{X}\beta]' \mathbf{A} \mathbf{X} \beta / 2),$$

where the noncentrality parameter simplifies to

$$\begin{aligned} [\mathbf{X}\beta]' \mathbf{A} \mathbf{X} \beta / 2 &= [\mathbf{X}\beta]' \frac{\mathbf{P}_X}{\sigma^2} \mathbf{X} \beta \frac{1}{2} \\ &= \frac{1}{2\sigma^2} \beta' \mathbf{X}' \mathbf{P}_X \mathbf{X} \beta \\ &= \frac{1}{2\sigma^2} \beta' \mathbf{X}' \mathbf{X} \beta. \end{aligned}$$

Therefore, we end up with a scaled non-central chi-square random variable on  $\text{rank}(\mathbf{X})$  degrees of freedom:

$$\hat{\mathbf{y}}' \hat{\mathbf{y}} \sim \sigma^2 \chi_{\text{rank}(\mathbf{X})}^2 \left( \frac{\beta' \mathbf{X}' \mathbf{X} \beta}{2\sigma^2} \right).$$

Comments: some students used results that apply to the sum of squared *independent* normal random variables with variance one (e.g., the result on slide 15 of set 1; this assumes  $\mathbf{A} = \Sigma = \mathbf{I}$ ). Others tried to find the distribution of the quadratic form  $\hat{\mathbf{y}}' \frac{\mathbf{I}}{\sigma^2} \hat{\mathbf{y}}$  rather than simplifying to  $\mathbf{y}' \frac{\mathbf{P}_X}{\sigma^2} \mathbf{y}$ ; unfortunately this doesn't work because  $\text{Var}(\hat{\mathbf{y}}) = \sigma^2 \mathbf{P}_X$  may not be positive definite.

2. For problem 2 and 4, please see the solution of exam 1 in 2016.  
Available at: <https://dnett.github.io/S510/exam1sol2016.pdf>.

3. (a) Simplify  $\hat{\beta} = (\mathbf{X}'\mathbf{X})^{-1}\mathbf{X}'\mathbf{y}$ .

$$\mathbf{X} = [\mathbf{1}, \mathbf{x}] \text{ and } \mathbf{X}' = \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{1}' \\ \mathbf{x}' \end{bmatrix}, \text{ then}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \hat{\beta} &= (\hat{\beta}_0, \hat{\beta}_1)' \\ &= (\mathbf{X}'\mathbf{X})^{-1}\mathbf{X}'\mathbf{y} \\ &= \left( \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{1}' \\ \mathbf{x}' \end{bmatrix} [\mathbf{1}, \mathbf{x}] \right)^{-1} \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{1}' \\ \mathbf{x}' \end{bmatrix} \mathbf{y} \\ &= \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{1}'\mathbf{1} & \mathbf{1}'\mathbf{x} \\ \mathbf{x}'\mathbf{1} & \mathbf{x}'\mathbf{x} \end{bmatrix}^{-1} \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{1}'\mathbf{y} \\ \mathbf{x}'\mathbf{y} \end{bmatrix} \\ &= \begin{bmatrix} n & \sum_{i=1}^n x_i \\ \sum_{i=1}^n x_i & \sum_{i=1}^n x_i^2 \end{bmatrix}^{-1} \begin{bmatrix} \sum_{i=1}^n y_i \\ \sum_{i=1}^n x_i y_i \end{bmatrix} \\ &= \frac{1}{n \sum_{i=1}^n x_i^2 - (\sum_{i=1}^n x_i)^2} \begin{bmatrix} \sum_{i=1}^n x_i^2 & -\sum_{i=1}^n x_i \\ -\sum_{i=1}^n x_i & n \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} \sum_{i=1}^n y_i \\ \sum_{i=1}^n x_i y_i \end{bmatrix} \\ &= \frac{1}{n \sum_{i=1}^n x_i^2 - (\sum_{i=1}^n x_i)^2} \begin{bmatrix} \sum_{i=1}^n x_i^2 \sum_{i=1}^n y_i - \sum_{i=1}^n x_i \sum_{i=1}^n x_i y_i \\ -\sum_{i=1}^n x_i \sum_{i=1}^n y_i + n \sum_{i=1}^n x_i y_i \end{bmatrix} \end{aligned}$$

Therefore,

$$\begin{aligned} \hat{\beta}_0 &= \frac{\sum_{i=1}^n x_i^2 \sum_{i=1}^n y_i - \sum_{i=1}^n x_i \sum_{i=1}^n x_i y_i}{n \sum_{i=1}^n x_i^2 - (\sum_{i=1}^n x_i)^2} \\ \hat{\beta}_1 &= \frac{-\sum_{i=1}^n x_i \sum_{i=1}^n y_i + n \sum_{i=1}^n x_i y_i}{n \sum_{i=1}^n x_i^2 - (\sum_{i=1}^n x_i)^2} \end{aligned}$$

(b) Find a matrix  $\mathbf{B}$  so that  $\mathbf{X}\mathbf{B}^{-1} = \mathbf{W} = [\mathbf{1}, \mathbf{x} - \bar{x}\mathbf{1}]$ .

Notice that  $\mathbf{B}$  is a  $2 \times 2$  matrix,

$$\underset{n \times 2}{\mathbf{X}} \underset{2 \times 2}{\mathbf{B}}^{-1} = \underset{n \times 2}{\mathbf{W}} \iff \mathbf{X} = \mathbf{W}\mathbf{B} \text{ for non-singular } \mathbf{B}$$

$$\text{Take } \mathbf{B} = \begin{bmatrix} b_{11} & b_{12} \\ b_{21} & b_{22} \end{bmatrix}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbf{X} = \mathbf{W}\mathbf{B} &\iff [\mathbf{1}, \mathbf{x}] = [\mathbf{1}, \mathbf{x} - \bar{x}\mathbf{1}] \begin{bmatrix} b_{11} & b_{12} \\ b_{21} & b_{22} \end{bmatrix} \\ &\iff \begin{cases} \mathbf{1} = b_{11}\mathbf{1} + b_{21}(\mathbf{x} - \bar{x}\mathbf{1}) \\ \mathbf{x} = b_{12}\mathbf{1} + b_{22}(\mathbf{x} - \bar{x}\mathbf{1}) \end{cases} \\ &\iff \begin{cases} b_{11} - b_{21}\bar{x} = 1 \\ b_{21} = 0 \\ b_{12} - b_{22}\bar{x} = 0 \\ b_{22} = 1 \end{cases} \\ &\iff \begin{cases} b_{11} = 1 \\ b_{21} = 0 \\ b_{12} = \bar{x} \\ b_{22} = 1 \end{cases} \end{aligned}$$

$$\text{Therefore } \mathbf{B} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & \bar{x} \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} \text{ and } \mathbf{B}^{-1} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & -\bar{x} \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix}.$$

(c) Derive expressions for the least squares estimators of  $\alpha_0$  and  $\alpha_1$  using  $\hat{\alpha} = (\mathbf{W}'\mathbf{W})^{-1}\mathbf{W}'\mathbf{y}$ .

$$\begin{aligned}
\hat{\alpha} &= (\hat{\alpha}_0, \hat{\alpha}_1)' \\
&= (\mathbf{W}'\mathbf{W})^{-1}\mathbf{W}'\mathbf{y} \\
&= \left( \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{1}' \\ \mathbf{x}' - \bar{x}.\mathbf{1}' \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{1}, & \mathbf{x} - \bar{x}.\mathbf{1} \end{bmatrix} \right)^{-1} \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{1}' \\ \mathbf{x}' - \bar{x}.\mathbf{1}' \end{bmatrix} \mathbf{y} \\
&= \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{1}'\mathbf{1} & \mathbf{1}'(\mathbf{x} - \bar{x}.\mathbf{1}) \\ (\mathbf{x}' - \bar{x}.\mathbf{1}')\mathbf{1} & (\mathbf{x}' - \bar{x}.\mathbf{1}')(\mathbf{x} - \bar{x}.\mathbf{1}) \end{bmatrix}^{-1} \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{1}'\mathbf{y} \\ \mathbf{x}'\mathbf{y} - \bar{x}.\mathbf{1}'\mathbf{y} \end{bmatrix} \\
&= \begin{bmatrix} n & \sum_{i=1}^n x_i - n\bar{x}. \\ \sum_{i=1}^n x_i - n\bar{x}. & \sum_{i=1}^n x_i^2 - n\bar{x}^2. \end{bmatrix}^{-1} \begin{bmatrix} \sum_{i=1}^n y_i \\ \sum_{i=1}^n x_i y_i - \bar{x}.\sum_{i=1}^n y_i \end{bmatrix} \\
&= \begin{bmatrix} n & 0 \\ 0 & \sum_{i=1}^n x_i^2 - n\bar{x}^2. \end{bmatrix}^{-1} \begin{bmatrix} \sum_{i=1}^n y_i \\ \sum_{i=1}^n (x_i - \bar{x}.)y_i \end{bmatrix} \\
&= \begin{bmatrix} \frac{1}{n} & 0 \\ 0 & \frac{1}{\sum_{i=1}^n x_i^2 - n\bar{x}^2.} \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} \sum_{i=1}^n y_i \\ \sum_{i=1}^n (x_i - \bar{x}.)y_i \end{bmatrix} \\
&= \begin{bmatrix} \frac{\sum_{i=1}^n y_i}{n} \\ \frac{\sum_{i=1}^n (x_i - \bar{x}.)y_i}{\sum_{i=1}^n x_i^2 - n\bar{x}^2.} \end{bmatrix}
\end{aligned}$$

(d) Multiply  $\hat{\alpha}$  from part (c) by  $\mathbf{B}^{-1}$  from part (b) to obtain expressions for  $\hat{\beta}_0$  and  $\hat{\beta}_1$ .

$$\begin{aligned}
(\hat{\beta}_0, \hat{\beta}_1)' &= \mathbf{B}^{-1}\hat{\alpha} \\
&= \begin{bmatrix} 1 & -\bar{x}. \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} \frac{\sum_{i=1}^n y_i}{n} \\ \frac{\sum_{i=1}^n (x_i - \bar{x}.)y_i}{\sum_{i=1}^n x_i^2 - n\bar{x}^2.} \end{bmatrix} \\
&= \begin{bmatrix} \bar{y}. - \bar{x}.\frac{\sum_{i=1}^n (x_i - \bar{x}.)y_i}{\sum_{i=1}^n x_i^2 - n\bar{x}^2.} \\ \frac{\sum_{i=1}^n (x_i - \bar{x}.)y_i}{\sum_{i=1}^n x_i^2 - n\bar{x}^2.} \end{bmatrix}
\end{aligned}$$

(e) Show that your answer to part (a) matches your answer to part (d).

Notice that  $\sum_{i=1}^n y_i = n\bar{y}$ . and  $\sum_{i=1}^n x_i = n\bar{x}$ .

$$\begin{aligned}
\text{In part (d), } \hat{\beta}_0 &= \bar{y} - \bar{x} \cdot \frac{\sum_{i=1}^n (x_i - \bar{x})y_i}{\sum_{i=1}^n x_i^2 - n\bar{x}^2} \\
&= \frac{\bar{y} \cdot (\sum_{i=1}^n x_i^2 - n\bar{x}^2) - \bar{x} \cdot (\sum_{i=1}^n x_i y_i - \bar{x} \cdot \sum_{i=1}^n y_i)}{\sum_{i=1}^n x_i^2 - n\bar{x}^2} \\
&= \frac{\frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^n x_i^2 \sum_{i=1}^n y_i - \bar{x}^2 \sum_{i=1}^n y_i - \frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^n x_i \sum_{i=1}^n x_i y_i + \bar{x}^2 \sum_{i=1}^n y_i}{\sum_{i=1}^n x_i^2 - \frac{1}{n} (\sum_{i=1}^n x_i)^2} \\
&= \frac{\sum_{i=1}^n x_i^2 \sum_{i=1}^n y_i - \sum_{i=1}^n x_i \sum_{i=1}^n x_i y_i}{n \sum_{i=1}^n x_i^2 - (\sum_{i=1}^n x_i)^2} = \hat{\beta}_0 \text{ in part (a).}
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
\text{In part (d), } \hat{\beta}_1 &= \frac{\sum_{i=1}^n (x_i - \bar{x})y_i}{\sum_{i=1}^n x_i^2 - n\bar{x}^2} \\
&= \frac{\sum_{i=1}^n x_i y_i - \frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^n x_i \sum_{i=1}^n y_i}{\sum_{i=1}^n x_i^2 - \frac{1}{n} (\sum_{i=1}^n x_i)^2} \\
&= \frac{-\sum_{i=1}^n x_i \sum_{i=1}^n y_i + n \sum_{i=1}^n x_i y_i}{n \sum_{i=1}^n x_i^2 - (\sum_{i=1}^n x_i)^2} = \hat{\beta}_1 \text{ in part (a).}
\end{aligned}$$