

# MANOVA



Instructor: Cheng-Ying Chou

# The Multivariate Analysis of Variance

---

- Introduction
- Review of Univariate One-way Analysis of Variance (1-way ANOVA)
- Multivariate One-way Analysis of Variance (1-way MANOVA)
- Homogeneity of Covariance Matrices
- Summary

# Introduction

---

## □ Example

- Evaluation of four different teaching methods
- 40 pupils in a primary school were randomly assigned to one of four methods.
- After a 12-week period, the scores of the tests on reading comprehension (X1) and analytical ability (X2) were obtained (Shen, 1998)

# Introduction

---

<u>Methods</u>								
<u>I</u>		<u>II</u>		<u>III</u>		<u>IV</u>		
<u>X1</u>	<u>X2</u>	<u>X1</u>	<u>X2</u>	<u>X1</u>	<u>X2</u>	<u>X1</u>	<u>X2</u>	
7	9	43	21	24	14	27	17	
37	16	39	17	30	15	20	13	
44	16	21	9	17	8	25	15	
28	14	32	16	34	15	13	11	
42	16	21	9	32	16	32	17	
23	11	14	6	35	17	4	10	
45	25	24	11	19	11	3	7	
32	15	24	12	6	6	36	19	
37	16	26	12	30	14	28	16	
45	19	26	12	19	10	21	15	
mean	34.0 15.7	27.0	12.5	24.6	12.6	20.9	14.0	

# Introduction

---

## □ Univariate Questions

- Does the score of reading comprehension (or analytical ability) differ among four teaching methods.

## □ Multivariate Questions

- Is there any difference in the effectiveness as measured by **reading comprehension** and **analytical ability** among the four teaching methods?

# Introduction

---

- Dataset: Measurements of Egyptian Skull
  - Univariate Questions:
    - Is there any difference or change in each of the four measurements across time?
  - Multivariate Questions:
    - Is there any difference or change in the four measurements across time?

# Review of Univariate 1-way ANOVA

---

- Consider one treatment factor: such as **teaching methods** or **time period**
- $X_{ij}$ : the measurement of **object  $i$**  in **treatment  $j$** ,  $i = 1, \dots, n_j$ ;  $j = 1, \dots, m$
- The model for one-way ANOVA is  
$$X_{ij} = \mu + \tau_j + \varepsilon_{ij}, \text{ where}$$
  - $\mu$ : overall mean
  - $\tau_j$ : the  $j$ th treatment effect
  - $\varepsilon_{ij}$ : random error  $\sim N(0, \sigma^2)$

# One way ANOVA

---

□  $H_0: \mu_1 = \mu_2 = \cdots = \mu_m = \mu$

□  $H_1: \mu_1 \neq \mu_2 \neq \cdots \neq \mu_m$

$$X_{11}, X_{21}, \cdots, X_{n_1 1} \sim N(\mu_1, \Sigma)$$

$$X_{12}, X_{22}, \cdots, X_{n_2 2} \sim N(\mu_2, \Sigma)$$

$$\vdots \qquad \qquad \qquad \vdots$$

$$X_{1m}, X_{2m}, \cdots, X_{n_m m} \sim N(\mu_m, \Sigma)$$



# Review of Univariate 1-way ANOVA

---

Sums of squares for one-way ANOVA

$$\text{Treatment means: } \bar{X}_{j.} = \sum_{i=1}^{n_j} X_{ij} / n_j$$

$$\text{Overall mean: } \bar{X} = \sum_{j=1}^m \bar{X}_{j.} / m$$

Partition of sums of squares

$$\sum_{j=1}^m \sum_{i=1}^{n_j} (X_{ij} - \bar{X})^2 = \sum_{j=1}^m n_j (\bar{X}_{j.} - \bar{X})^2 + \sum_{j=1}^m \sum_{i=1}^{n_j} (X_{ij} - \bar{X}_{j.})^2$$

$$\begin{aligned} \text{SST (Total)} &= \text{SSB (Between)} + \text{SSW (Within)} \\ n-1 &= (m-1) + (n-m) \end{aligned}$$

$$\text{where } n = \sum_{j=1}^m n_j$$

# Review of Univariate 1-way ANOVA

---

$H_0: \tau_1 = \dots = \tau_m$  vs.  $H_a: \tau_j \neq \tau_{j'}$  for at least one pair  $1 = j \neq j' \leq m$

## One-way ANOVA Table

SOV	df	SS	MS
Between samples	$m-1$	SSB	$MSB = SSB/(m-1)$
Within samples	$n-m$	SSW	$MSW = SSW/(n-m)$
Total	$n-1$	SST	

Reject the null hypothesis if  $F = MSB/MSW > F_{\alpha, m-1, n-m}$

# Review of Univariate 1-way ANOVA

---

## □ Example: Reading Comprehension

- $n=40, n_1=n_2=n_3=n_4=10$ , grand total is 1065
- $SST = 7^2 + \dots + 21^2 - (1065)^2/40 = 4815.375$   
( $df_T=39$ )
- $SSB = (340^2 + \dots + 209^2)/10 - (1065)^2/40$   
 $= 914.075$  ( $df_B=3$ )
- $SSW = 4815.375 - 914.075 = 3901.300$  ( $df_W=36$ )

# R code

---

```
setwd("/Users/cychou/Documents/Work/Teaching/Exploratory Multivariate Data Analysis/Lecture Slides/R_code");
methods<-read.csv("methods.csv",header=T,sep=",");
mod1<-lm(X1~method,data=methods)
anova(mod1)
```

Response: X1

			Df	Sum Sq	Mean Sq	F value	Pr(>F)
method	3	914.1	304.69	2.8116	0.0531	.	
Residuals	36	3901.3	108.37				

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

# Review of Univariate 1-way ANOVA

---

## □ ANOVA Table for Reading Comprehension

□ SOV		df	SS	MS	F
□ Between	3		914.075	304.692	2.81
□ Within	36		3901.300	108.369	
□ Total	39		4815.375		

- Since  $F=2.81 < F_{0.05,3,36} = 2.90$ , fail to reject the null hypothesis of equal teaching effectiveness at the 5% significance level

# Multivariate 1-way ANOVA

---

- Consider one treatment factor: such as teaching methods or time period
- $X_{ijk}$ : the measurement of **variable k** for **object i** in **treatment j**,  $i = 1, \dots, n_j$ ;  $j = 1, \dots, m$ ;  $k = 1, \dots, p$
- The model for one-way MANOVA is

$$X_{ijk} = \mu + \tau_{jk} + \epsilon_{ijk}$$

where  $\mu$ : overall mean

$\tau_{jk}$ : the jth treatment effect

# One way MANOVA

---

□  $H_0$ :

$$\begin{array}{l} \mu_{11} = \mu_{21} = \cdots = \mu_{m1} \\ \mu_{12} = \mu_{22} = \cdots = \mu_{m2} \\ \vdots \quad \quad \quad \vdots \\ \mu_{1p} = \mu_{2p} = \cdots = \mu_{mp} \end{array} \quad \begin{pmatrix} \mu_{11} \\ \mu_{12} \\ \vdots \\ \mu_{1p} \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} \mu_{21} \\ \mu_{22} \\ \vdots \\ \mu_{2p} \end{pmatrix} = \cdots = \begin{pmatrix} \mu_{m1} \\ \mu_{m2} \\ \vdots \\ \mu_{mp} \end{pmatrix}$$

Measured variable k=1 .....p

X1

X2

Treatment j

1

2

.

.

m

$$Y_{11} = \begin{pmatrix} Y_{111} \\ Y_{211} \\ \vdots \\ Y_{n_1 11} \end{pmatrix} \quad \dots \quad Y_{1p} = \begin{pmatrix} Y_{11p} \\ Y_{21p} \\ \vdots \\ Y_{n_1 1p} \end{pmatrix}$$

$$\vdots \quad \ddots \quad \vdots$$

$$Y_{m1} = \begin{pmatrix} Y_{11p} \\ Y_{21p} \\ \vdots \\ Y_{n_1 1p} \end{pmatrix} \quad \dots \quad Y_{mp} = \begin{pmatrix} Y_{1mp} \\ Y_{2mp} \\ \vdots \\ Y_{n_m mp} \end{pmatrix}$$

Teaching methods  
I, II, III, IV



# Multivariate 1-way ANOVA

---

The overall mean for variable k

$$\bar{X}_k = \sum_{j=1}^m \sum_{i=1}^{n_j} X_{ijk} / n$$

The treatment mean for treatment j of variable k

$$\bar{X}_{jk} = \sum_{i=1}^{n_j} X_{ijk} / n_j$$

Total sums of squares and cross-products

$$t_{kk} = \sum_{j=1}^m \sum_{i=1}^{n_j} (X_{ijk} - \bar{X}_k)^2, \text{ dfT} = n-1$$

$$t_{kk'} = \sum_{j=1}^m \sum_{i=1}^{n_j} (X_{ijk} - \bar{X}_k)(X_{ijk'} - \bar{X}_{k'}), \text{ dfT} = n-1$$

# Multivariate 1-way ANOVA

---

Within-sample sums of squares and cross-products

$$w_{kk} = \sum_{j=1}^m \sum_{i=1}^{n_j} (X_{ijk} - \bar{X}_{jk})^2, dfW = n-m$$

$$w_{kk'} = \sum_{j=1}^m \sum_{i=1}^{n_j} (X_{ijk} - \bar{X}_{jk})(X_{ijk'} - \bar{X}_{jk'}), dfW = n-m$$

Between-sample sums of squares and cross-products

$$b_{kk} = t_{kk} - w_{kk}, dfB = m-1, \text{ and}$$

$$b_{kk'} = t_{kk'} - w_{kk'}, dfB = m-1$$

# Multivariate 1-way ANOVA

Total sums of squares and cross-products matrix

$$\mathbf{T} = \begin{pmatrix} t_{11} & t_{12} & \dots & t_{1p} \\ t_{12} & t_{22} & \dots & t_{2p} \\ \dots & \dots & \dots & \dots \\ t_{1p} & t_{2p} & \dots & t_{pp} \end{pmatrix}, \text{dfT} = n - 1$$

$$t_{kk'} = \sum_{j=1}^m \sum_{i=1}^{n_j} (X_{ijk} - \bar{X}_k)(X_{ijk'} - \bar{X}_{k'})$$

Within-sample sums of squares and cross-products matrix

$$\mathbf{W} = \begin{pmatrix} w_{11} & w_{12} & \dots & w_{1p} \\ w_{12} & w_{22} & \dots & w_{2p} \\ \dots & \dots & \dots & \dots \\ w_{1p} & w_{2p} & \dots & w_{pp} \end{pmatrix}, \text{dfW} = n - m$$

$$w_{kk'} = \sum_{j=1}^m \sum_{i=1}^{n_j} (X_{ijk} - \bar{X}_{jk})(X_{ijk'} - \bar{X}_{jk'})$$

Between-sample sums of squares and cross-products matrix

$$\mathbf{B} = \mathbf{T} - \mathbf{W}, \text{dfB} = m - 1$$

# Multivariate 1-way ANOVA

## □ The Wilks' lambda statistic

$$\Lambda = |\mathbf{W}| / |\mathbf{T}| = \frac{|\mathbf{W}|}{|\mathbf{W} + \mathbf{B}|},$$

where

$|\mathbf{W}|$  is the determinant of  $\mathbf{W}$  and  $|\mathbf{T}|$  is the determinant of  $\mathbf{T}$ .

$$0 \leq \Lambda \leq 1$$

Small sample distribution

$$F = \frac{1 - \Lambda^{1/t}}{\Lambda^{1/t}} \frac{df_2}{df_1} \sim F_{df_1, df_2}, \text{ where } df_1 = p(m-1), df_2 = wt - (df_1/2) + 1,$$

$w = n - 1 - [(p - m + 2)/2]$ , and

$$t = \sqrt{(df_1^2 - 4) / [p^2 + (m - 1)^2 - 5]},$$

when  $df_1 = 2$ , set  $t = 1$ .

# Multivariate 1-way ANOVA

## □ The Wilk's lambda statistic

Special Cases:

(1) When  $df_B=2$  and  $p$  is arbitrary

$$F = \frac{\sqrt{\Lambda}}{1 - \sqrt{\Lambda}} \frac{df_E - p + 1}{p} \sim F_{2p, 2(df_E - p + 1)}$$

(2) When  $p=2$  and  $df_B$  is arbitrary

$$F = \frac{\sqrt{\Lambda}}{1 - \sqrt{\Lambda}} \frac{df_E - 1}{df_B} \sim F_{2df_B, 2(df_E - 1)}$$

Large sample approximation

$$\chi^2 = -[df_E - (p - df_B + 1)/2] \ln \Lambda \sim \chi_{pdf_B}^2$$

# Transformation of Wilks' to Exact Upper Tail F tests

Parameters P, dfT	Statistic having F-distribution	Degrees of freedom
Any p, dfB=1	$\frac{1-\Lambda}{\Lambda} \frac{dfW - p + 1}{p}$	P, dfW-p+1
Any p, dfB=2	$\frac{1-\sqrt{\Lambda}}{\sqrt{\Lambda}} \frac{dfW - p + 1}{p}$	2p, 2(dfW-p+1)
p=1, any dfB	$\frac{1-\Lambda}{\Lambda} \frac{dfW}{dfB}$	dfB, dfW
p=2, any dfB	$\frac{1-\sqrt{\Lambda}}{\sqrt{\Lambda}} \frac{dfW - 1}{dfB}$	2dfB, 2(dfW-1)

# Multivariate 1-way ANOVA

---

## □ The Roy's largest eigenvalue

Let  $\lambda_1 \geq \lambda_2 \geq \dots \geq \lambda_p \geq 0$  of eigenvalues of  $\mathbf{W}^{-1}\mathbf{B}$ ,

the Wilk's lambda can be expressed as

$$\Lambda = \prod_{i=1}^p \frac{1}{1 + \lambda_i}$$

The Roy's largest eigenvalue is  $\lambda_1$

Roy's largest root test  $\theta = \frac{\lambda_1}{1 + \lambda_1}$

The distribution of  $\lambda_1$

$(df_2 / df_1) \lambda_1 \sim F_{df_1, df_2}$ , where

$df_1 = d$ ,  $df_2 = n - m - d - 1$ ,  $d = \max(p, m-1)$ .

$$d = \max(p, df_B)$$

# Multivariate 1-way ANOVA

## □ The Pillai's trace statistic

The Pillai's statistic  $V$  is given as

$$V = \sum_{i=1}^p \frac{\lambda_i}{1 + \lambda_i}$$

The distribution of  $V$

$(n - m - p + s)V / [d(s - V)] \sim F_{df_1, df_2}$ , where

$df_1 = sd$ ,  $df_2 = s(n - m - p - s)$ ,

$s = \min(p, m-1)$ , and  $d = \max(p, m-1)$ .



# Multivariate 1-way ANOVA

## □ The Lawes-Hotelling statistic

The Lawley-Hotelling statistic  $U$  is given as

$$U = \sum_{i=1}^p \lambda_i$$

The distribution of  $U$

$df_2 U / s df_1 \sim F_{df_1, df_2}$ , where

$df_1 = s(2A + s + 1)$ ,  $df_2 = 2(sB + 1)$ ,

$A = (|m - p - 1| - 1)/2$ , and  $B = (n - m - p - 1)/2$ .

# Introduction

		<u>Methods</u>									
		<u>I</u>		<u>II</u>		<u>III</u>		<u>IV</u>			
		<u>X1</u>	<u>X2</u>	<u>X1</u>	<u>X2</u>	<u>X1</u>	<u>X2</u>	<u>X1</u>	<u>X2</u>		
		7	9	43	21	24	14	27	17		
		37	16	39	17	30	15	20	13		
		44	16	21	9	17	8	25	15		
		28	14	32	16	34	15	13	11		
		42	16	21	9	32	16	32	17		
		23	11	14	6	35	17	4	10		
		45	25	24	11	19	11	3	7		
		32	15	24	12	6	6	36	19		
		37	16	26	12	30	14	28	16		
		45	19	26	12	19	10	21	15		
Sum		340	157	270	125	246	126	209	140	1065	548
mean		34.0	15.7	27.0	12.5	24.6	12.6	20.9	14.0		

$$\bar{X}_1 = \begin{pmatrix} 34.0 \\ 15.7 \end{pmatrix}, \bar{X}_2 = \begin{pmatrix} 27.0 \\ 12.5 \end{pmatrix}, \bar{X}_3 = \begin{pmatrix} 24.6 \\ 12.6 \end{pmatrix}, \bar{X}_4 = \begin{pmatrix} 20.9 \\ 14.0 \end{pmatrix}$$

# Multivariate 1-way ANOVA

## □ Example: Teaching Methods

Total sum of squares and cross-products

$$t_{11} = 7^2 + 37^2 + \dots + 21^2 - (1065)^2 / 40 = 4815.375$$

$$t_{12} = 7 \times 9 + 37 \times 16 + \dots + 21 \times 15 - (1065)(548) / 40 = 1536.500$$

$$t_{22} = 9^2 + 16^2 + \dots + 15^2 - (548)^2 / 40 = 654.400$$

$$\mathbf{T} = \begin{pmatrix} 4815.375 & 1536.500 \\ & 654.400 \end{pmatrix}, \text{ dfT}=39$$

# Multivariate 1-way ANOVA

## □ Example: Teaching Methods

Between-sample sum of squares and cross-products

$$b_{11} = (340^2 + 270^2 + \dots + 209^2) / 10 - (1065)^2 / 40 = 914.075$$

$$b_{12} = (340 \times 157 + 270 \times 125 + \dots + 209 \times 140) / 10 - (1065)(548) / 40 = 148.100$$

$$b_{22} = (157^2 + 125^2 + \dots + 140^2) / 10 - (548)^2 / 40 = 67.40$$

$$\mathbf{B} = \begin{pmatrix} 914.075 & 148.10 \\ & 67.40 \end{pmatrix}, \text{dfB}=3.$$

$$\mathbf{W} = \mathbf{T} - \mathbf{B} = \begin{pmatrix} 3901.300 & 1388.400 \\ & 587.000 \end{pmatrix}, \text{dfW}=36$$

# Teaching methods

## # ANOVA

```
setwd("/Users/cychou/Documents  
/Work/Teaching/Exploratory  
Multivariate Data  
Analysis/Lecture  
Slides/R_code");  
methods<-  
read.csv("methods.csv",header=  
T,sep=",");  
methods$method<-  
as.factor(methods$method)  
mod1<-  
lm(X1~method,data=methods)  
anova(mod1)
```

## # MANOVA

```
install.packages("dplyr")  
library(dplyr)  
  
combined<-  
cbind(methods$X1,methods$X2)  
mod2<-manova(combined~method,  
data=methods)  
summary(mod2, test="Pillai")  
summary(mod2, test="Wilks")  
summary(mod2, test="Roy")  
summary(mod2,  
test="Hotelling-Lawley")
```

# Multivariate 1-way ANOVA

## □ Example: Teaching Methods

The Wilk's lambda statistic:

$$|\mathbf{T}| = 730349.15, \text{ and } |\mathbf{E}| = 362408.54$$

$$\Lambda = \frac{|\mathbf{E}|}{|\mathbf{T}|} = \frac{362408.54}{730349.15} = 0.458542$$

$$p = 2$$

$$F = \frac{1 - \sqrt{0.458542}}{\sqrt{0.458542}} \frac{40 - 4 - 1}{4 - 1} = 5.5622$$

$$> F_{0.01, 6, 70} = 3.07$$

$$df_1 = 2df_B = 2(4 - 1) = 6$$

$$df_2 = 2(df_W - 1) = 2(40 - 4 - 1) = 70$$

> summary(mod2, test="Wilks")

	Df	Wilks	approx F	num Df	den Df	Pr(>F)
method	3	0.45854	5.5622	6	70	9.248e-05 ***
Residuals	36					

# Multivariate 1-way ANOVA

## □ Example: Teaching Methods

The Roy's largest eigenvalue:

The two eigenvalues of  $\mathbf{W}^{-1}\mathbf{B}$  are 0.9569463 and 0.11440143 and  $d=\max(p,m-1)=\max(2,4-1)=3$

$$F = \frac{(40-4-3-1)0.9569463}{3}$$

$$= 10.20742$$

$$> F_{0.05,3,32} = 2.90$$

Reject the null hypothesis of equal effectiveness among four teaching methods at the 5% significance level.

```
> summary(mod2, test="Roy")
```

	Df	Roy	approx	F num	Df den	Df	Pr(>F)
method	3	0.95695	11.483	3	36		1.98e-05 ***
Residuals	36						

# Multivariate 1-way ANOVA

---

## □ Example: Egyptian Skull

### Mean Vectors

Sample	X1	X2	X3	X4
Early predynastic	131.37	133.60	99.17	50.53
Late predynastic	132.37	132.70	99.07	50.23
12th and 13th dynasties	134.47	133.80	96.03	50.57
Ptolemaic period	135.50	132.30	94.53	51.97
Roman period	136.17	130.33	93.50	51.37



# Multivariate 1-way ANOVA

## □ Example: Egyptian Skull

Total sums of squares and cross-products

$$\mathbf{T} = \begin{pmatrix} 3563.89 & -222.81 & -615.16 & 426.73 \\ & 3635.16 & 1046.28 & 346.47 \\ & & 4309.27 & -16.40 \\ & & & 1533.33 \end{pmatrix}$$

dfT=149

Within-sample sums of squares and cross-products

$$\mathbf{W} = \begin{pmatrix} 3061.07 & 5.33 & 11.47 & 291.30 \\ & 3405.27 & 754.00 & 412.53 \\ & & 3505.97 & 164.33 \\ & & & 1472.13 \end{pmatrix}$$

dfW=145

# Egyptian skull MANOVA

---

```
install.packages("HSAUR")
library(HSAUR) # load the library, must be installed
before
data("skulls", package = "HSAUR") # load into the
workspace
skulls # see the content of the data.frame
help(skulls)
summary(skulls)
#write.csv(skulls, file = "skulls.csv", row.names=FALSE)
Y<-cbind(skulls$mb, skulls$bh, skulls$bl, skulls$nh);
X<-skulls$epoch;
fit<-manova(Y~X, data=skulls)
summary(fit, test="Pillai")
summary(fit, test="Wilks")
summary(fit, test="Roy")
summary(fit, test="Hotelling-Lawley")
```

# Multivariate 1-way ANOVA

## □ Example: Egyptian Skull

Pillai's trace statistic  $V=0.3533$

$$d=\max(p,m-1)=\max(4,5-1)=4$$

$$s=\min(p,m-1)=\min(4,5-1)=4$$

$$df_1 = sd=4 \times 4=16$$

$$df_2 = s(n-m-p+s)=4(150-5-4+4)=580$$

$$F=(n-m-p+s)V/[d(s-V)]$$

$$=(150-5-4+4)0.3533/[4(4-0.3533)]$$

$$=3.51 > F_{0.05,16,580} = 1.42$$

Reject the null hypothesis of equal mean measurements over time.

> summary(fit, test="Pillai")

	Df	Pillai	approx F	num Df	den Df	Pr(>F)
X	4	0.35331	3.512	16	580	4.675e
Residuals	145					

# Multivariate 1-way ANOVA

## □ Example: Egyptian Skull

Lawley-Hotelling statistic  $U=0.4818$

$$s=\min(p,m-1)=\min(4,5-1)=4$$

$$A=(|m-p-1|-1)/2=(|5-4-1|-1)/2=-0.5$$

$$B=(n-m-p-1)/2=(150-5-4-1)/2=70$$

$$df_1 = s(2A+s+1) = 4(-1+4+1) = 16$$

$$df_2 = 2(sB+1)=2(4 \times 70+1)=562$$

$$F=df_2 U/df_1$$

$$=562 \times 0.4818 / 16$$

$$=4.23 > F_{0.05,16,562} = 1.423$$

Reject the null hypothesis of equal mean measurements over time.

```
> summary(fit, test="Hotelling-Lawley")
```

	Df	Hotelling-Lawley	approx F	num	Df	den	Df	Pr(>F)
X	4	0.48182	4.231	16	562	8.278e-08		***
Residuals	145							

In a classical experiment carried out from 1918 to 1934, apple trees of different rootstocks were compared. The data for eight trees from each of six rootstocks are given in rootstock.dat. The variables are

- $y_1$  = trunk girth at 4 years (mm x 100)
- $y_2$  = extension growth at 4 years (m)
- $y_3$  = trunk girth at 15 years (mm x 100)
- $y_4$  = weight of tree above ground at 15 years (lb x 1000)

**Table 6.2** Rootstock Data

Rootstock	$y_1$	$y_2$	$y_3$	$y_4$
1	1.11	2.569	3.58	.760
1	1.19	2.928	3.75	.821
1	1.09	2.865	3.93	.928
1	1.25	3.844	3.94	1.009
1	1.11	3.027	3.60	.766
1	1.08	2.336	3.51	.726
1	1.11	3.211	3.98	1.209
1	1.16	3.037	3.62	.750
2	1.05	2.074	4.09	1.036
2	1.17	2.885	4.06	1.094
2	1.11	3.378	4.87	1.635
2	1.25	3.906	4.98	1.517
2	1.17	2.782	4.38	1.197
2	1.15	3.018	4.65	1.244
2	1.17	3.383	4.69	1.495
2	1.19	3.447	4.40	1.026

---

The matrices  $\mathbf{H}$ ,  $\mathbf{E}$ , and  $\mathbf{E} + \mathbf{H}$  are given by

$$\mathbf{H} = \begin{pmatrix} .074 & .537 & .332 & .208 \\ .537 & 4.200 & 2.355 & 1.637 \\ .332 & 2.355 & 6.114 & 3.781 \\ .208 & 1.637 & 3.781 & 2.493 \end{pmatrix},$$

$$\mathbf{E} = \begin{pmatrix} .320 & 1.697 & .554 & .217 \\ 1.697 & 12.143 & 4.364 & 2.110 \\ .554 & 4.364 & 4.291 & 2.482 \\ .217 & 2.110 & 2.482 & 1.723 \end{pmatrix},$$

$$\mathbf{E} + \mathbf{H} = \begin{pmatrix} .394 & 2.234 & .886 & .426 \\ 2.234 & 16.342 & 6.719 & 3.747 \\ .886 & 6.719 & 10.405 & 6.263 \\ .426 & 3.747 & 6.263 & 4.216 \end{pmatrix}.$$

Wilks' statistic



Pillai's statistic





# Lawley-Hotelling statistic





Roy's test statistic