Group Project

4/15/2021

Introduction

This project aims to analyze how changes in state minimum wages affect changes in the state unemployment level, and we have built three model to explore this relationship. In the first basic model, we simply regress state's unemployment rate on effective minimum wage in 2020 dollars. In the second model, based on the first basic model, we consider year fixed effect and state fixed effect, and we also introduce three dummy variables for 1980-1990, 1990-2000, and 2000-2010 to check whether or not the results change across the three different periods. In the third model, we build a panel regression model in order to include state fixed effect and time fixed effect. Our analysis indicates that state minimum wages have a positive relationship with state unemployment rate.

Result

Model 1: baseline model

z test of coefficients:

```
# model1:
fm1 <- lm(unemployment_rate ~ Effective.Minimum.Wage.2020.Dollars , data = df)</pre>
summary(fm1)
##
## Call:
## lm(formula = unemployment_rate ~ Effective.Minimum.Wage.2020.Dollars,
##
       data = df)
##
## Residuals:
##
       Min
                10 Median
                                 3Q
                                        Max
  -5.0242 -1.4064 -0.2301 1.1018 11.4566
##
## Coefficients:
##
                                        Estimate Std. Error t value Pr(>|t|)
                                                    0.39721
                                                               2.045
                                                                        0.041 *
## (Intercept)
                                         0.81211
## Effective.Minimum.Wage.2020.Dollars
                                        0.63578
                                                    0.04892
                                                             12.996
                                                                       <2e-16 ***
## Signif. codes:
                   0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.01 '*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
##
## Residual standard error: 2.015 on 1987 degrees of freedom
## Multiple R-squared: 0.07834,
                                     Adjusted R-squared: 0.07787
## F-statistic: 168.9 on 1 and 1987 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16
coeftest(fm1, df = Inf, vcov = vcovHC(fm1, type = "HC1"))
##
```

Interpretation 1

If minimum wage increases by 1 dollar, then unemployment rate would increase by 0.635777% / 63.58 percentage points. (not sure which guys please check it !!!!!!!)

Model2:

base model+year fixed effect

Goal

in order to account of time trend in unemployment rate, we included time dummies in our model

```
#model2: base model+year fixed effect
fm2 <- lm(unemployment_rate ~ Effective.Minimum.Wage.2020.Dollars+</pre>
            dummy9000 + dummy0010 + dummy1018, data = df
summary(fm2)
##
## Call:
## lm(formula = unemployment rate ~ Effective.Minimum.Wage.2020.Dollars +
       dummy9000 + dummy0010 + dummy1018, data = df)
##
##
## Residuals:
##
      Min
                1Q Median
                                3Q
                                       Max
## -4.5149 -1.3392 -0.2112 1.0656 10.5819
##
## Coefficients:
                                       Estimate Std. Error t value Pr(>|t|)
##
                                                   0.44706
                                                             6.920 6.07e-12 ***
## (Intercept)
                                        3.09372
## Effective.Minimum.Wage.2020.Dollars 0.47407
                                                             9.037 < 2e-16 ***
                                                   0.05246
## dummy9000
                                       -1.26096
                                                   0.12764 -9.879 < 2e-16 ***
## dummy0010
                                                   0.12508 -12.406 < 2e-16 ***
                                       -1.55182
                                                   0.12495 -8.877 < 2e-16 ***
                                       -1.10920
## dummy1018
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
## Residual standard error: 1.932 on 1984 degrees of freedom
## Multiple R-squared: 0.1537, Adjusted R-squared: 0.152
## F-statistic: 90.11 on 4 and 1984 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16
coeftest(fm2, df = Inf, vcov = vcovHC(fm2, type = "HC1"))
##
## z test of coefficients:
##
```

```
##
                                       Estimate Std. Error z value Pr(>|z|)
                                                  0.451940
                                                             6.8454 7.625e-12 ***
## (Intercept)
                                       3.093718
## Effective.Minimum.Wage.2020.Dollars 0.474070
                                                  0.053323
                                                             8.8906 < 2.2e-16 ***
## dummy9000
                                                  0.128280 -9.8297 < 2.2e-16 ***
                                      -1.260958
## dummy0010
                                      -1.551821
                                                  0.128975 -12.0320 < 2.2e-16 ***
## dummy1018
                                                           -7.7034 1.325e-14 ***
                                      -1.109199
                                                  0.143988
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
```

interpretation 2

After accounting for time trend, we had a similar finding: if minimum wage increases by 1 dollar, then unemployment rate would increase by 0.474070% / 47.41 percentage points. (not sure which guys please check it !!!!!!!)

Model 3:

base model+year fixed effect + state fixed effect ### Goal In this model, we included state dummies because geographic factors might be associated with unemployment rate.

```
#model3: base model+year fixed effect + state fixed effect
fm3 <- lm(unemployment_rate ~ Effective.Minimum.Wage.2020.Dollars+
            factor(stateid) +
            dummy9000 + dummy0010 + dummy1018, data = df)
summary(fm3)
##
## Call:
  lm(formula = unemployment_rate ~ Effective.Minimum.Wage.2020.Dollars +
       factor(stateid) + dummy9000 + dummy0010 + dummy1018, data = df)
##
##
## Residuals:
##
       Min
                                30
                10 Median
                                       Max
  -4.3173 -1.0745 -0.1337 0.8605 8.2412
##
## Coefficients:
##
                                       Estimate Std. Error t value Pr(>|t|)
## (Intercept)
                                        4.74962
                                                   0.49027
                                                             9.688 < 2e-16 ***
## Effective.Minimum.Wage.2020.Dollars
                                                             8.556 < 2e-16 ***
                                        0.43830
                                                   0.05123
## factor(stateid)1
                                        0.04196
                                                   0.37297
                                                             0.112 0.910444
## factor(stateid)2
                                                   0.36724 -2.997 0.002759 **
                                       -1.10070
## factor(stateid)3
                                                   0.36686 -2.057 0.039805 *
                                       -0.75468
## factor(stateid)4
                                       -0.37650
                                                   0.37026 -1.017 0.309353
## factor(stateid)5
                                                            -5.394 7.75e-08 ***
                                       -1.98073
                                                   0.36723
## factor(stateid)6
                                       -2.26807
                                                   0.37130 -6.109 1.21e-09 ***
## factor(stateid)7
                                       -2.22201
                                                   0.36764 -6.044 1.80e-09 ***
## factor(stateid)8
                                                   0.37251
                                                            -0.455 0.649433
                                       -0.16935
## factor(stateid)9
                                       -1.23543
                                                   0.36706 -3.366 0.000778 ***
## factor(stateid)10
                                       -1.18462
                                                   0.36678 -3.230 0.001260 **
## factor(stateid)11
                                       -2.89773
                                                   0.36879 -7.857 6.45e-15 ***
## factor(stateid)12
                                       -1.21282
                                                   0.36678 -3.307 0.000962 ***
## factor(stateid)13
                                       -0.41169
                                                   0.36781
                                                            -1.119 0.263145
## factor(stateid)14
                                       -0.97179
                                                   0.36678 -2.649 0.008127 **
```

```
## factor(stateid)15
                                       -2.59493
                                                    0.36689 -7.073 2.12e-12 ***
## factor(stateid)16
                                       -2.39487
                                                    0.36678 -6.529 8.42e-11 ***
                                                            -0.727 0.467290
## factor(stateid)17
                                       -0.26667
                                                    0.36678
## factor(stateid)18
                                        0.16410
                                                    0.36678
                                                              0.447 0.654630
## factor(stateid)19
                                       -1.74852
                                                    0.36773
                                                             -4.755 2.13e-06 ***
## factor(stateid)20
                                                            -5.525 3.74e-08 ***
                                       -2.02744
                                                    0.36697
## factor(stateid)21
                                       -2.31142
                                                    0.37102
                                                            -6.230 5.71e-10 ***
## factor(stateid)22
                                        0.59139
                                                    0.36716
                                                              1.611 0.107404
## factor(stateid)23
                                       -2.34169
                                                    0.36682
                                                             -6.384 2.16e-10 ***
## factor(stateid)24
                                        0.45641
                                                    0.36678
                                                              1.244 0.213520
## factor(stateid)25
                                       -1.24755
                                                    0.36686
                                                            -3.401 0.000686 ***
## factor(stateid)26
                                                            -3.982 7.09e-05 ***
                                       -1.46072
                                                    0.36683
## factor(stateid)27
                                       -3.67404
                                                    0.36688 -10.014 < 2e-16 ***
## factor(stateid)28
                                       -0.59481
                                                    0.36679
                                                            -1.622 0.105039
## factor(stateid)29
                                       -2.93851
                                                    0.36681
                                                             -8.011 1.95e-15 ***
## factor(stateid)30
                                       -1.27866
                                                    0.36745
                                                             -3.480 0.000513 ***
## factor(stateid)31
                                       -0.52626
                                                    0.36683
                                                            -1.435 0.151558
## factor(stateid)32
                                       -1.05002
                                                    0.36756
                                                            -2.857 0.004326 **
## factor(stateid)33
                                       -1.33348
                                                            -3.636 0.000285 ***
                                                    0.36679
## factor(stateid)34
                                       -3.33333
                                                    0.36678
                                                            -9.088 < 2e-16 ***
## factor(stateid)35
                                       -0.51375
                                                    0.36693
                                                            -1.400 0.161633
## factor(stateid)36
                                       -1.93846
                                                    0.36678
                                                            -5.285 1.40e-07 ***
## factor(stateid)37
                                                            -1.925 0.054358 .
                                       -0.71940
                                                    0.37369
## factor(stateid)38
                                       -0.84626
                                                    0.36682
                                                             -2.307 0.021158 *
## factor(stateid)39
                                       -1.13818
                                                    0.36949 -3.080 0.002096 **
## factor(stateid)40
                                       -0.62051
                                                    0.36678 -1.692 0.090852 .
## factor(stateid)41
                                       -3.48169
                                                    0.36687
                                                            -9.490 < 2e-16 ***
## factor(stateid)42
                                       -0.73333
                                                    0.36678
                                                            -1.999 0.045709 *
## factor(stateid)43
                                                            -2.915 0.003596 **
                                       -1.06923
                                                    0.36678
## factor(stateid)44
                                       -2.29487
                                                    0.36678
                                                            -6.257 4.83e-10 ***
## factor(stateid)45
                                       -3.13885
                                                    0.37056
                                                             -8.470 < 2e-16 ***
## factor(stateid)46
                                       -2.49231
                                                    0.36678
                                                            -6.795 1.44e-11 ***
## factor(stateid)47
                                       -0.83789
                                                    0.37303
                                                            -2.246 0.024805 *
## factor(stateid)48
                                                    0.36694
                                                              2.714 0.006704 **
                                        0.99592
## factor(stateid)49
                                       -1.64075
                                                    0.36681
                                                             -4.473 8.16e-06 ***
## factor(stateid)50
                                                   0.36678 -5.635 2.01e-08 ***
                                       -2.06667
## dummy9000
                                       -1.28863
                                                    0.10889 -11.834 < 2e-16 ***
## dummy0010
                                       -1.57340
                                                    0.10603 -14.839
                                                                    < 2e-16 ***
## dummy1018
                                       -1.10071
                                                    0.10491 -10.492
                                                                    < 2e-16 ***
##
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
##
## Residual standard error: 1.62 on 1934 degrees of freedom
## Multiple R-squared: 0.4205, Adjusted R-squared: 0.4043
## F-statistic: 25.99 on 54 and 1934 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16
coeftest(fm3, df = Inf, vcov = vcovHC(fm3, type = "HC1"))
##
## z test of coefficients:
##
##
                                        Estimate Std. Error
                                                              z value Pr(>|z|)
## (Intercept)
                                        4.749621
                                                    0.560728
                                                               8.4705 < 2.2e-16 ***
## Effective.Minimum.Wage.2020.Dollars
                                        0.438300
                                                    0.057798
                                                               7.5834 3.367e-14 ***
## factor(stateid)1
                                        0.041956
                                                    0.372261
                                                               0.1127 0.910263
```

```
## factor(stateid)2
                                        -1.100704
                                                    0.420029
                                                               -2.6205 0.008779 **
## factor(stateid)3
                                        -0.754681
                                                               -1.9197
                                                                        0.054893 .
                                                    0.393119
## factor(stateid)4
                                        -0.376496
                                                    0.480763
                                                               -0.7831
                                                                        0.433556
                                                               -4.7813 1.742e-06 ***
## factor(stateid)5
                                        -1.980732
                                                    0.414267
## factor(stateid)6
                                        -2.268065
                                                    0.444992
                                                               -5.0969 3.453e-07 ***
## factor(stateid)7
                                                    0.411108
                                                               -5.4049 6.483e-08 ***
                                        -2.222010
                                                               -0.3886 0.697558
## factor(stateid)8
                                        -0.169350
                                                    0.435773
## factor(stateid)9
                                        -1.235432
                                                    0.444371
                                                               -2.7802
                                                                        0.005433 **
## factor(stateid)10
                                        -1.184615
                                                    0.422237
                                                               -2.8056
                                                                        0.005023 **
## factor(stateid)11
                                        -2.897731
                                                    0.413050
                                                               -7.0155 2.292e-12 ***
## factor(stateid)12
                                        -1.212821
                                                    0.396827
                                                               -3.0563
                                                                        0.002241 **
## factor(stateid)13
                                                               -0.9673
                                                                        0.333380
                                        -0.411695
                                                    0.425600
## factor(stateid)14
                                        -0.971795
                                                    0.459882
                                                               -2.1131
                                                                        0.034589 *
                                                               -6.9333 4.110e-12 ***
## factor(stateid)15
                                        -2.594932
                                                    0.374269
## factor(stateid)16
                                                               -6.3908 1.650e-10 ***
                                        -2.394872
                                                    0.374736
## factor(stateid)17
                                        -0.266667
                                                    0.412499
                                                               -0.6465
                                                                       0.517977
## factor(stateid)18
                                         0.164103
                                                    0.423860
                                                                0.3872 0.698636
## factor(stateid)19
                                        -1.748521
                                                    0.419799
                                                               -4.1651 3.112e-05 ***
                                                               -5.2183 1.806e-07 ***
## factor(stateid)20
                                        -2.027441
                                                    0.388528
## factor(stateid)21
                                        -2.311418
                                                    0.456794
                                                               -5.0601 4.191e-07 ***
## factor(stateid)22
                                         0.591391
                                                    0.544318
                                                                1.0865 0.277266
## factor(stateid)23
                                                    0.383969
                                                               -6.0987 1.070e-09 ***
                                        -2.341695
## factor(stateid)24
                                                                1.0980
                                         0.456410
                                                    0.415669
                                                                        0.272199
## factor(stateid)25
                                                               -3.0895
                                        -1.247551
                                                    0.403800
                                                                        0.002005 **
## factor(stateid)26
                                        -1.460717
                                                    0.371465
                                                               -3.9323 8.413e-05 ***
## factor(stateid)27
                                        -3.674041
                                                    0.355222 -10.3429 < 2.2e-16 ***
## factor(stateid)28
                                        -0.594813
                                                    0.497975
                                                               -1.1945
                                                                       0.232297
## factor(stateid)29
                                        -2.938506
                                                    0.412152
                                                               -7.1297 1.006e-12 ***
## factor(stateid)30
                                                               -2.9384
                                                                       0.003299 **
                                        -1.278662
                                                    0.435161
## factor(stateid)31
                                        -0.526260
                                                    0.360812
                                                               -1.4585
                                                                        0.144691
## factor(stateid)32
                                        -1.050020
                                                    0.413483
                                                               -2.5394
                                                                        0.011103 *
## factor(stateid)33
                                        -1.333479
                                                    0.461949
                                                               -2.8866
                                                                        0.003894 **
## factor(stateid)34
                                        -3.333333
                                                    0.347510
                                                               -9.5921 < 2.2e-16 ***
                                                               -1.1783
## factor(stateid)35
                                        -0.513751
                                                    0.436003
                                                                        0.238670
## factor(stateid)36
                                        -1.938462
                                                    0.381339
                                                               -5.0833 3.709e-07 ***
## factor(stateid)37
                                                               -1.6029
                                                                       0.108965
                                        -0.719402
                                                    0.448824
## factor(stateid)38
                                        -0.846261
                                                    0.401878
                                                               -2.1058
                                                                       0.035225 *
## factor(stateid)39
                                        -1.138181
                                                    0.514562
                                                               -2.2119
                                                                        0.026971 *
## factor(stateid)40
                                        -0.620513
                                                    0.457486
                                                               -1.3564
                                                                        0.174987
## factor(stateid)41
                                                    0.347946 -10.0064 < 2.2e-16 ***
                                        -3.481692
                                        -0.733333
                                                               -1.7060
## factor(stateid)42
                                                    0.429864
                                                                        0.088014 .
## factor(stateid)43
                                        -1.069231
                                                    0.387644
                                                               -2.7583 0.005811 **
## factor(stateid)44
                                        -2.294872
                                                    0.381870
                                                               -6.0096 1.860e-09 ***
## factor(stateid)45
                                        -3.138854
                                                    0.396822
                                                              -7.9100 2.574e-15 ***
## factor(stateid)46
                                        -2.492308
                                                    0.378075
                                                               -6.5921 4.337e-11 ***
## factor(stateid)47
                                                               -1.9374
                                                                        0.052701 .
                                        -0.837889
                                                    0.432489
## factor(stateid)48
                                         0.995923
                                                    0.534524
                                                                1.8632 0.062435 .
## factor(stateid)49
                                        -1.640754
                                                    0.413909
                                                               -3.9641 7.369e-05 ***
## factor(stateid)50
                                        -2.066667
                                                    0.374645
                                                               -5.5163 3.461e-08 ***
## dummy9000
                                        -1.288626
                                                    0.105734 -12.1875 < 2.2e-16 ***
## dummy0010
                                                    0.108817 -14.4591 < 2.2e-16 ***
                                        -1.573402
## dummy1018
                                        -1.100710
                                                    0.119991 -9.1732 < 2.2e-16 ***
##
  ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
```

interpretation 3

After accounting for time and state dummies, we had a similar finding: if minimum wage increases by 1 dollar, then unemployment rate would increase by 0.43830% / 43.83 percentage points. (not sure which guys please check it !!!!!!!)

Model 4

base model+year fixed effect + year · effective + state fixed effect + state · effective

Goal

In this model, we aim to explore the association between minimum wage and unemployment rate across year periods

```
#model4: base model+year fixed effect + year*effective + state fixed effect + state*effective
fm4 <- lm(unemployment_rate ~ Effective.Minimum.Wage.2020.Dollars+</pre>
            Effective.Minimum.Wage.2020.Dollars*dummy9000+
            Effective.Minimum.Wage.2020.Dollars*dummy0010+
            Effective.Minimum.Wage.2020.Dollars*dummy1018+
            factor(stateid) +
            dummy9000 + dummy0010 + dummy1018, data = df)
summary(fm4)
##
## Call:
## lm(formula = unemployment_rate ~ Effective.Minimum.Wage.2020.Dollars +
       Effective.Minimum.Wage.2020.Dollars * dummy9000 + Effective.Minimum.Wage.2020.Dollars *
##
##
       dummy0010 + Effective.Minimum.Wage.2020.Dollars * dummy1018 +
       factor(stateid) + dummy9000 + dummy0010 + dummy1018, data = df)
##
##
## Residuals:
##
       Min
                1Q Median
                                30
                                       Max
  -3.9360 -1.0802 -0.1665 0.8350 8.1006
##
## Coefficients:
##
                                                  Estimate Std. Error t value
## (Intercept)
                                                              0.73142
                                                   0.92084
                                                                       1.259
                                                              0.08178 10.854
## Effective.Minimum.Wage.2020.Dollars
                                                   0.88765
## dummy9000
                                                   6.84603
                                                              1.24012
                                                                        5.520
## dummy0010
                                                              0.94717
                                                                        2.226
                                                   2.10827
## dummy1018
                                                   6.32142
                                                              1.02850
                                                                        6.146
## factor(stateid)1
                                                              0.36710
                                                   0.15767
                                                                        0.429
## factor(stateid)2
                                                  -0.99386
                                                              0.36146 - 2.750
## factor(stateid)3
                                                  -0.71486
                                                              0.36067
                                                                       -1.982
## factor(stateid)4
                                                  -0.18389
                                                              0.36641
                                                                       -0.502
## factor(stateid)5
                                                  -1.87932
                                                              0.36142
                                                                       -5.200
## factor(stateid)6
                                                  -2.08732
                                                              0.36733
                                                                       -5.682
## factor(stateid)7
                                                  -2.15718
                                                              0.36207 -5.958
## factor(stateid)8
                                                   0.20005
                                                              0.36943
                                                                       0.542
## factor(stateid)9
                                                  -1.17686
                                                              0.36103 -3.260
## factor(stateid)10
                                                  -1.18462
                                                              0.36053 -3.286
## factor(stateid)11
                                                  -2.74243
                                                              0.36340 -7.547
```

```
## factor(stateid)12
                                                   -1.21282
                                                               0.36053 -3.364
## factor(stateid)13
                                                   -0.30616
                                                               0.36233
                                                                        -0.845
                                                                        -2.695
## factor(stateid)14
                                                   -0.97179
                                                               0.36053
## factor(stateid)15
                                                   -2.53157
                                                               0.36091
                                                                        -7.014
## factor(stateid)16
                                                   -2.39487
                                                               0.36053
                                                                        -6.643
## factor(stateid)17
                                                   -0.26667
                                                               0.36053
                                                                        -0.740
## factor(stateid)18
                                                    0.16410
                                                               0.36053
                                                                          0.455
## factor(stateid)19
                                                   -1.68374
                                                               0.36197
                                                                        -4.652
## factor(stateid)20
                                                   -1.94901
                                                               0.36096
                                                                         -5.399
## factor(stateid)21
                                                   -2.10949
                                                               0.36698
                                                                        -5.748
## factor(stateid)22
                                                    0.67534
                                                               0.36123
                                                                          1.870
## factor(stateid)23
                                                   -2.31856
                                                               0.36058
                                                                        -6.430
## factor(stateid)24
                                                    0.45641
                                                               0.36053
                                                                          1.266
## factor(stateid)25
                                                                        -3.390
                                                   -1.22272
                                                               0.36066
## factor(stateid)26
                                                               0.36068
                                                                        -3.914
                                                   -1.41169
## factor(stateid)27
                                                   -3.60459
                                                               0.36083
                                                                         -9.990
## factor(stateid)28
                                                   -0.59528
                                                               0.36055
                                                                        -1.651
## factor(stateid)29
                                                   -2.94159
                                                               0.36056
                                                                        -8.158
## factor(stateid)30
                                                   -1.14525
                                                               0.36160
                                                                        -3.167
## factor(stateid)31
                                                   -0.49978
                                                               0.36061
                                                                        -1.386
## factor(stateid)32
                                                   -0.94088
                                                               0.36192
                                                                        -2.600
## factor(stateid)33
                                                   -1.33389
                                                               0.36055
                                                                        -3.700
## factor(stateid)34
                                                   -3.33333
                                                               0.36053
                                                                        -9.246
## factor(stateid)35
                                                   -0.47742
                                                               0.36079
                                                                        -1.323
## factor(stateid)36
                                                   -1.93846
                                                               0.36053
                                                                        -5.377
## factor(stateid)37
                                                   -0.36404
                                                               0.37100
                                                                        -0.981
## factor(stateid)38
                                                   -0.84719
                                                               0.36062
                                                                        -2.349
## factor(stateid)39
                                                   -0.97241
                                                               0.36444
                                                                        -2.668
## factor(stateid)40
                                                   -0.62051
                                                               0.36053
                                                                        -1.721
## factor(stateid)41
                                                   -3.41726
                                                               0.36079
                                                                        -9.472
## factor(stateid)42
                                                   -0.73333
                                                               0.36053
                                                                        -2.034
## factor(stateid)43
                                                   -1.06923
                                                               0.36053
                                                                        -2.966
## factor(stateid)44
                                                   -2.29487
                                                               0.36053
                                                                        -6.365
## factor(stateid)45
                                                   -2.93464
                                                               0.36644
                                                                        -8.009
## factor(stateid)46
                                                   -2.49231
                                                               0.36053
                                                                        -6.913
## factor(stateid)47
                                                   -0.56437
                                                               0.37079
                                                                        -1.522
## factor(stateid)48
                                                    1.05599
                                                               0.36084
                                                                          2.926
## factor(stateid)49
                                                   -1.64156
                                                               0.36060
                                                                        -4.552
## factor(stateid)50
                                                   -2.06667
                                                               0.36053
                                                                        -5.732
## Effective.Minimum.Wage.2020.Dollars:dummy9000 -1.02579
                                                               0.15849
                                                                        -6.472
## Effective.Minimum.Wage.2020.Dollars:dummy0010 -0.43942
                                                                        -3.758
                                                               0.11692
## Effective.Minimum.Wage.2020.Dollars:dummy1018 -0.87522
                                                               0.12046
                                                                        -7.266
                                                   Pr(>|t|)
   (Intercept)
                                                   0.208190
## Effective.Minimum.Wage.2020.Dollars
                                                    < 2e-16 ***
## dummy9000
                                                   3.84e-08 ***
## dummy0010
                                                   0.026138 *
## dummy1018
                                                   9.61e-10 ***
## factor(stateid)1
                                                   0.667613
## factor(stateid)2
                                                   0.006024 **
## factor(stateid)3
                                                   0.047619 *
## factor(stateid)4
                                                   0.615814
## factor(stateid)5
                                                   2.21e-07 ***
## factor(stateid)6
                                                   1.53e-08 ***
```

```
## factor(stateid)7
                                                  3.03e-09 ***
## factor(stateid)8
                                                  0.588213
## factor(stateid)9
                                                  0.001134 **
                                                  0.001035 **
## factor(stateid)10
## factor(stateid)11
                                                  6.84e-14 ***
## factor(stateid)12
                                                  0.000783 ***
## factor(stateid)13
                                                  0.398224
## factor(stateid)14
                                                  0.007091 **
## factor(stateid)15
                                                  3.18e-12 ***
## factor(stateid)16
                                                  4.00e-11 ***
## factor(stateid)17
                                                  0.459605
## factor(stateid)18
                                                  0.649041
## factor(stateid)19
                                                  3.52e-06 ***
## factor(stateid)20
                                                  7.51e-08 ***
## factor(stateid)21
                                                  1.05e-08 ***
## factor(stateid)22
                                                  0.061699 .
## factor(stateid)23
                                                  1.60e-10 ***
## factor(stateid)24
                                                  0.205690
## factor(stateid)25
                                                  0.000713 ***
## factor(stateid)26
                                                  9.39e-05 ***
## factor(stateid)27
                                                   < 2e-16 ***
## factor(stateid)28
                                                  0.098901 .
## factor(stateid)29
                                                  6.05e-16 ***
## factor(stateid)30
                                                  0.001563 **
## factor(stateid)31
                                                  0.165936
## factor(stateid)32
                                                  0.009402 **
## factor(stateid)33
                                                  0.000222 ***
## factor(stateid)34
                                                   < 2e-16 ***
## factor(stateid)35
                                                  0.185903
## factor(stateid)36
                                                  8.51e-08 ***
## factor(stateid)37
                                                  0.326605
## factor(stateid)38
                                                  0.018911 *
## factor(stateid)39
                                                  0.007690 **
## factor(stateid)40
                                                  0.085393 .
## factor(stateid)41
                                                   < 2e-16 ***
## factor(stateid)42
                                                  0.042085 *
## factor(stateid)43
                                                  0.003057 **
## factor(stateid)44
                                                  2.43e-10 ***
## factor(stateid)45
                                                  1.99e-15 ***
## factor(stateid)46
                                                  6.43e-12 ***
## factor(stateid)47
                                                  0.128160
## factor(stateid)48
                                                  0.003468 **
## factor(stateid)49
                                                  5.64e-06 ***
                                                  1.15e-08 ***
## factor(stateid)50
## Effective.Minimum.Wage.2020.Dollars:dummy9000 1.22e-10 ***
## Effective.Minimum.Wage.2020.Dollars:dummy0010 0.000176 ***
## Effective.Minimum.Wage.2020.Dollars:dummy1018 5.37e-13 ***
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
## Residual standard error: 1.592 on 1931 degrees of freedom
## Multiple R-squared: 0.4409, Adjusted R-squared: 0.4244
## F-statistic: 26.72 on 57 and 1931 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16
```

coeftest(fm4, df = Inf, vcov = vcovHC(fm4, type = "HC1")) ## z test of coefficients: ## ## Estimate Std. Error z value (Intercept) 0.920837 0.711423 1.2944 ## Effective.Minimum.Wage.2020.Dollars 0.887652 0.079669 11.1418 dummy9000 6.846031 0.966889 7.0805 ## dummy0010 2.108273 0.846503 2.4906 ## dummy1018 6.321420 1.077115 5.8688 ## factor(stateid)1 0.157665 0.367728 0.4288 ## factor(stateid)2 -0.993860 0.413144 -2.4056## factor(stateid)3 -0.714861 0.390972 -1.8284## factor(stateid)4 0.470584 -0.3908 -0.183893## factor(stateid)5 -1.879318 0.409576 -4.5884## factor(stateid)6 -2.087320 0.446938 -4.6703## factor(stateid)7 -2.1571790.397721 -5.4238 ## factor(stateid)8 0.200051 0.421300 0.4748 ## factor(stateid)9 -1.176862 0.440441 -2.6720-2.8071 ## factor(stateid)10 -1.1846150.422007 ## factor(stateid)11 -2.7424290.415575 -6.5991## factor(stateid)12 -1.212821 0.401464 -3.0210## factor(stateid)13 -0.306163 0.426341 -0.7181## factor(stateid)14 -0.9717950.454735 -2.1371## factor(stateid)15 -2.5315740.374283 -6.7638## factor(stateid)16 -2.3948720.378127 -6.3335## factor(stateid)17 -0.2666670.415724 -0.6415## factor(stateid)18 0.164103 0.436652 0.3758 ## factor(stateid)19 -1.683740-4.11600.409072 ## factor(stateid)20 -1.949010 0.375920 -5.1846## factor(stateid)21 -4.7604 -2.109487 0.443136 ## factor(stateid)22 0.675336 0.529903 1.2745 ## factor(stateid)23 -2.318562 0.383713 -6.0424## factor(stateid)24 0.456410 0.422206 1.0810 ## factor(stateid)25 -1.222717 0.400807 -3.0506## factor(stateid)26 -1.4116870.372256 -3.7922## factor(stateid)27 -3.6045910.354722 - 10.1617## factor(stateid)28 -0.5952760.494848 -1.2029## factor(stateid)29 -2.9415850.409657 -7.1806## factor(stateid)30 -1.1452510.426490 -2.6853## factor(stateid)31 -0.4997770.363579 -1.3746## factor(stateid)32 -0.940883 0.397273 -2.3684## factor(stateid)33 -1.3338880.457156 -2.9178## factor(stateid)34 -3.333333 0.354285 -9.4086## factor(stateid)35 -0.477418 0.432641 -1.1035## factor(stateid)36 -4.9550 -1.938462 0.391215 ## factor(stateid)37 -0.364036 0.433574 -0.8396 ## factor(stateid)38 -0.847193 0.396907 -2.1345## factor(stateid)39 -0.972406 0.504031 -1.9293-1.3627 ## factor(stateid)40 -0.620513 0.455360 ## factor(stateid)41 -3.417265 0.345271 -9.8973

-0.733333

-1.069231

0.428672

0.398608 -2.6824

-1.7107

factor(stateid)42

factor(stateid)43

```
## factor(stateid)44
                                                   -2.294872
                                                               0.384891 -5.9624
## factor(stateid)45
                                                   -2.934640
                                                               0.383014 -7.6620
## factor(stateid)46
                                                  -2.492308
                                                               0.374968 -6.6467
## factor(stateid)47
                                                   -0.564368
                                                               0.419628
                                                                         -1.3449
## factor(stateid)48
                                                   1.055985
                                                               0.530993
                                                                          1.9887
## factor(stateid)49
                                                               0.412107
                                                  -1.641561
                                                                         -3.9833
## factor(stateid)50
                                                   -2.066667
                                                               0.385785
                                                                         -5.3570
## Effective.Minimum.Wage.2020.Dollars:dummy9000 -1.025792
                                                               0.125011
                                                                         -8.2056
## Effective.Minimum.Wage.2020.Dollars:dummy0010 -0.439424
                                                               0.108488
                                                                         -4.0504
## Effective.Minimum.Wage.2020.Dollars:dummy1018 -0.875224
                                                               0.127473 -6.8659
                                                   Pr(>|z|)
                                                  0.1955415
## (Intercept)
## Effective.Minimum.Wage.2020.Dollars
                                                   < 2.2e-16 ***
## dummy9000
                                                   1.437e-12 ***
## dummy0010
                                                  0.0127539 *
## dummy1018
                                                   4.388e-09 ***
## factor(stateid)1
                                                  0.6681009
## factor(stateid)2
                                                  0.0161459 *
## factor(stateid)3
                                                  0.0674870
## factor(stateid)4
                                                  0.6959630
## factor(stateid)5
                                                  4.465e-06 ***
## factor(stateid)6
                                                   3.008e-06 ***
## factor(stateid)7
                                                  5.833e-08 ***
## factor(stateid)8
                                                   0.6348989
## factor(stateid)9
                                                  0.0075399 **
## factor(stateid)10
                                                   0.0049990 **
## factor(stateid)11
                                                   4.136e-11 ***
## factor(stateid)12
                                                  0.0025194 **
## factor(stateid)13
                                                  0.4726846
## factor(stateid)14
                                                  0.0325932 *
## factor(stateid)15
                                                   1.344e-11 ***
## factor(stateid)16
                                                  2.396e-10 ***
## factor(stateid)17
                                                  0.5212300
                                                  0.7070509
## factor(stateid)18
## factor(stateid)19
                                                  3.855e-05 ***
## factor(stateid)20
                                                  2.164e-07 ***
## factor(stateid)21
                                                  1.933e-06 ***
## factor(stateid)22
                                                  0.2025030
## factor(stateid)23
                                                   1.518e-09 ***
## factor(stateid)24
                                                  0.2796913
## factor(stateid)25
                                                  0.0022836 **
## factor(stateid)26
                                                  0.0001493 ***
## factor(stateid)27
                                                   < 2.2e-16 ***
## factor(stateid)28
                                                  0.2289969
## factor(stateid)29
                                                   6.940e-13 ***
## factor(stateid)30
                                                  0.0072466 **
## factor(stateid)31
                                                   0.1692544
## factor(stateid)32
                                                  0.0178674 *
## factor(stateid)33
                                                  0.0035251 **
## factor(stateid)34
                                                   < 2.2e-16 ***
## factor(stateid)35
                                                  0.2698109
## factor(stateid)36
                                                  7.234e-07 ***
## factor(stateid)37
                                                  0.4011229
## factor(stateid)38
                                                  0.0328028 *
```

```
## factor(stateid)39
                                                 0.0536987 .
## factor(stateid)40
                                                 0.1729810
## factor(stateid)41
                                                 < 2.2e-16 ***
## factor(stateid)42
                                                 0.0871351 .
## factor(stateid)43
                                                 0.0073093 **
## factor(stateid)44
                                                 2.486e-09 ***
## factor(stateid)45
                                                 1.831e-14 ***
## factor(stateid)46
                                                 2.997e-11 ***
## factor(stateid)47
                                                 0.1786497
## factor(stateid)48
                                                 0.0467343 *
## factor(stateid)49
                                                 6.796e-05 ***
## factor(stateid)50
                                                 8.460e-08 ***
## Effective.Minimum.Wage.2020.Dollars:dummy9000 2.294e-16 ***
## Effective.Minimum.Wage.2020.Dollars:dummy0010 5.112e-05 ***
## Effective.Minimum.Wage.2020.Dollars:dummy1018 6.606e-12 ***
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
```

Interpretation 4

we found that minimum wage was associated with increased unemployment rate, and we found that compared to baseline time periord (1980-1990) if minimum wage increases by 1 dollar, then unemployment rate would decrease by -102.5792 percentage points (1990-2000), -43.9424 percentage points (2000-2010), -87. 5224 percentage points for (2010-2018). (not sure which % or percentage points guys please check it !!!!!!!)