Creating Targeted, Interpretable Topic Models with LLM-Generated Text Augmentation

Anna Lieb, Maneesh Arora, Eni Mustafaraj Wellesley College, Wellesley, USA

Keywords: large language models, GPT-4, topic modeling, text augmentation, content analysis

Extended Abstract

Making sense of natural language text at scale is a common challenge in computational social science research, especially for domains in which researchers have access to an abundance of unlabeled data but face a shortage of labeled data. Unsupervised machine learning techniques, such as topic modeling and clustering, are often used to identify latent patterns in unstructured text data in fields such as political science and sociology [12, 9, 11, 5]. These methods overcome common concerns about reproducibility and costliness involved in the labor-intensive process of human qualitative analysis. However, two major limitations of topic models are their interpretability and their practicality for answering targeted, domain-specific social science research questions. In this work, we investigate opportunities for using LLM-generated text augmentation to improve the usefulness of topic modeling output. We use a political science case study to evaluate our results in a domain-specific application.

Related Work. When applying topic modeling methods to the social sciences, researchers must make subjective decisions about how to interpret an output set of keywords [6, 12]. Previous attempts to improve topic model interpretability use a variety of techniques, including incorporating document embeddings from pre-trained language models like BERT [15, 7] and providing semi-supervised keyword seeds [3]. As state-of-the-art large language models (LLMs) achieve increasingly high performance on tasks that require reasoning based on natural language prompts [13], social scientists are also exploring methods for LLM-powered computational content analysis, such as prompting techniques for GPT-3.5 topic generation [14]. These innovations are mostly designed for and evaluated on the same general purpose pattern recognition tasks as traditional topic models, and are not suitable for exploring targeted domain-specific research questions [12, 1]. Their output is driven by the general goal of topic formation, and do not take into consideration underlying social science theories. Semisupervised approaches to topic modeling, like keyword seeding, term weighting, and prior topic-word distributions [3, 4, 18], incorporate some domain-specific insights; however, they place a burden on researchers to derive prior knowledge representations. Additionally, researchers' expectations and biases can impact the reliability of semi-supervised results.

Methods. We propose a procedure for topic modeling using LLM-generated text augmentations, which can add targeted semantic context and real-world knowledge to the latent text. This method can improve researchers' ability to answer domain-specific research questions with topic modeling. It can incorporate social science theory without topic-specific and word-specific priors, which minimizes researcher supervision and improves reliability. In this modified technique, the topic model takes LLM-generated descriptors as input text, rather than taking raw unprocessed input text. This approach is mainly applicable to topic modeling using very short text documents, such as social media posts and single-sentence text data.

10th International Conference on Computational Social Science IC²S² July 17-20, 2024, Philadelphia, USA

Case study. Our approach is motivated by applications in ongoing political science research on critical race theory (CRT) controversies in the United States. CRT controversies emerged in American "culture war" debates starting in September 2020, when conservative political figures criticized anti-racism curricula in K-12 schools and workplace trainings [17]. To better understand the partisan debates over CRT, we conduct content analysis on a dataset of 11,704 online news headlines related to CRT collected from the GDELT (Global Data on Events, Location and Tone) Project database [10]. Specifically, our goal is to identify salient primary actors in news coverage. This can answer political science questions such as: Do news headlines frame CRT as a grassroots issue that emerged among local-level actors like students, parents, and teachers? Or does news coverage instead frame CRT as an issue driven by political elites like legislators, executives, and news pundits? Previous research in political communications suggests that these variations in news media issue framing can significantly influence public attitudes and understandings of the issue [2, 8, 16].

We performed topic modeling with LLM-generated text augmentations on our headlines dataset to identify categories of actors that appear in the headlines. First, we used GPT-4 to generate brief descriptions of the primary actor in each news headline. This is a key step that incorporates our research goal (to identify salient primary actors) without explicitly referencing actors or keywords that we expect in the output topics. Examples of LLM-generated text augmentations are shown in Table 1. Based on qualitative review of a sample of actor descriptions, we found that GPT-4 generated actor descriptions were accurate, provided timely real-world information, and offered relevant details about each actor's role in the context of the headline. However, the performance of GPT-4 may vary across applications, and future work could more thoroughly evaluate the quality of text augmentations.

Next, we used BERTopic to generate topics [7], using the LLM-generated actor descriptions as input documents. As a baseline for comparison, we also trained a BERTopic model using the original raw headline text as input documents. Based on our interpretation of representative keywords and documents output by BERTopic, we assigned labels to each topic in the two topic models. The augmented topic modeling output and our qualitative interpretations are displayed in Table 2, and the baseline results are displated in Table 3. Some similar topics are grouped together for ease of interpretation.

Results. We find that unsupervised topic modeling using GPT-4 blurbs (rather than unprocessed text) creates highly interpretable categories that can be used to investigate domain-specific research questions with minimal human guidance. Whereas the baseline model identifies general themes like racism, legislation, and education, the LLM-augmented model identifies specific actors like governors, legislators, teachers, and parents. Although the baseline output mentions some of these actors, they are not cleanly grouped; for example, the largest topic places school boards, a supreme court justice, parents, and teachers all into the same topic grouping (See Table 3). This type of output is less useful for targeted analysis of salient actors that appear in news coverage. Overall, this research demonstrates that LLM-generated text can augment short documents with semantic context, real-world information, and domain-specific thematic targets. Our proposed procedure for incorporating LLM-generated text augmentations in topic models can expand the utility of existing unsupervised techniques while also maintaining interpretability and reproducibility.

¹We used the following prompt to extract actor information from each headline: What type of actor is the primary actor in this headline? Briefly describe the primary actor. If the headline doesn't reference an actor, say so. You don't need to include the headline in your response.

References

- [1] Christian Baden, Christian Pipal, Martijn Schoonvelde, and Mariken AC G van der Velden. Three gaps in computational text analysis methods for social sciences: A research agenda. *Communication Methods and Measures*, 16(1):1–18, 2022.
- [2] Dennis Chong and James N. Druckman. Framing theory. *Annual Review of Political Science*, 10(1):103–126, 2007.
- [3] Shusei Eshima, Kosuke Imai, and Tomoya Sasaki. Keyword-assisted topic models. *American Journal of Political Science*, 2020.
- [4] Angela Fan, Finale Doshi-Velez, and Luke Miratrix. Assessing topic model relevance: Evaluation and informative priors. *Statistical Analysis and Data Mining: The ASA Data Science Journal*, 12(3):210–222, 2019.
- [5] Justin Grimmer. A bayesian hierarchical topic model for political texts: Measuring expressed agendas in senate press releases. *Political Analysis*, 18(1):1–35, 2010.
- [6] Justin Grimmer and Brandon M Stewart. Text as data: The promise and pitfalls of automatic content analysis methods for political texts. *Political analysis*, 21(3):267–297, 2013.
- [7] Maarten Grootendorst. BERTopic: Neural topic modeling with a class-based TF-IDF procedure. *arXiv preprint arXiv:2203.05794*, 2022.
- [8] Shanto Iyengar. *Is anyone responsible?: How television frames political issues*. University of Chicago Press, 1994.
- [9] Kamran Kowsari, Kiana Jafari Meimandi, Mojtaba Heidarysafa, Sanjana Mendu, Laura Barnes, and Donald Brown. Text classification algorithms: A survey. *Information*, 10(4):150, 2019.
- [10] Kalev Leetaru and Philip A Schrodt. GDELT: Global data on events, location, and tone, 1979–2012. *ISA Annual Convention*, pages 1–49, 2013.
- [11] Ana Macanovic. Text mining for social science—the state and the future of computational text analysis in sociology. *Social Science Research*, 108:102784, 2022.
- [12] Laura K. Nelson. Computational grounded theory: A methodological framework. *Sociological Methods & Research*, 49(1):3–42, 2020.
- [13] OpenAI, Josh Achiam, Steven Adler, Sandhini Agarwal, Lama Ahmad, Ilge Akkaya, Florencia Leoni Aleman, Diogo Almeida, Janko Altenschmidt, Sam Altman, Shyamal Anadkat, (...), and Barret Zoph. GPT-4 technical report, 2023.
- [14] Chau Minh Pham, Alexander Hoyle, Simeng Sun, and Mohit Iyyer. TopicGPT: A prompt-based topic modeling framework. *arXiv preprint arXiv:2311.01449*, 2023.
- [15] Suzanna Sia, Ayush Dalmia, and Sabrina J Mielke. Tired of topic models? clusters of pretrained word embeddings make for fast and good topics too! *arXiv preprint arXiv:2004.14914*, 2020.

- [16] Andreas R.T. Schuck Sophie Lecheler, Mario Keer and Regula Hänggli. The effects of repetitive news framing on political opinions over time. *Communication Monographs*, 82(3):339–358, 2015.
- [17] Benjamin Wallace-Wells. How a conservative activist invented the conflict over critical race theory. The New Yorker, June 2021.
- [18] Justin Wood, Patrick Tan, Wei Wang, and Corey Arnold. Source-lda: Enhancing probabilistic topic models using prior knowledge sources. In 2017 IEEE 33rd International Conference on Data Engineering (ICDE), pages 411–422. IEEE, 2017.

Figures and Tables

Original headline text	GPT-4 primary actor description
KBJ and CRT	The primary actor in the headline "KBJ and CRT"
	refers to Ketanji Brown Jackson (KBJ), who is a Jus-
	tice on the Supreme Court of the United States. She
	is a legal professional and a public figure, serving in
	the highest court in the United States.
DeSantis Bans CRT From K-12	The primary actor in the headline is DeSantis, refer-
Classrooms Despite Absence	ring to Ron DeSantis, the Governor of Florida. He
From Curriculum	is a political figure and a member of the Republican
	Party, known for his conservative policies and actions
	within the state of Florida.
Tennessee House Passes Bill for	The primary actor in this headline is the "Tennessee
Black History to be Taught In	House." The Tennessee House refers to the lower
Fifth Through Eighth Grade	chamber of the Tennessee General Assembly, which
Despite State Ban on Critical	is the state legislature of Tennessee. This body is re-
Race Theory Concepts	sponsible for making and passing state laws. In this
	context, the Tennessee House is acting in its legisla-
	tive capacity to pass a bill related to educational cur-
	riculum requirements.
Critical race theory battles are	The headline does not explicitly reference a specific
waged without enough	actor. It discusses "critical race theory battles" in a
information	general sense, implying that the primary actors could
	be individuals or groups engaged in debates or con-
	flicts over critical race theory, but it does not specify
	who these actors are.
Critical Race Theory Seeks To	The primary actor in the headline is "Critical Race
Tell A More Accurate Story,	Theory." Critical Race Theory is not a person but an
Supporters Say	academic and legal framework that examines society
	and culture as they relate to categorizations of race,
	law, and power. It seeks to understand how racism is
	embedded within social structures and legal systems.

Table 1: **Sample text augmentations using GPT-4 description.** GPT-4 was prompted to generate a brief description of the primary actor in each news headline. The actor descriptions provide additional real-world context and semantic information that is specifically relevant to our research questions.

Primary actor	# of docs	KeyBERT representation
interpretation	in topic	•
CRT ideology	2128	examines society, political, activists, groups, debate,
(itself)		concept, opposing, topic
School	664	school boards, school districts, school district, public
administration		schools, superintendent, overseeing public
Teachers	271	teachers, educators, employed educators, new teach-
		ers, educational roles
	167	educators, teachers, teachers professors, educators
		working, responsible educating
	121	teachers union, teachers role, federation teachers,
		unions organizations
Governors	201	governor, mississippi governor, governor political,
		lieutenant governor, state executive
	197	florida governor, governor desantis, ron desantis
	144	glenn youngkin, youngkin politician, governor glenn,
		virginia governor
Legislators	383	proposed legislation, legislature, legislative action,
		state legislature, legislators
	137	senator, states senator, senators elected, senate senate
Parents	538	group parents, parents, black father, individuals chil-
		dren, father individual
News media	486	fox news, news channel, cable news, msnbc, tucker
		carlson, news coverage, political commentator, tele-
		vision host
Republicans	442	republican party, gop, political party, republicans
Joe Biden	278	joe biden, biden administration, president joe, politi-
		cal figure, president
Florida	220	florida education, florida state, florida school
Military	173	military officer, military advisor, general milley, joint
		chiefs, chairman, secretary defense
Attorneys general	116	montana attorney, attorney general, attorney, missouri
		attorney, indiana attorney, overseeing state
Southern Baptists	111	baptist convention, southern baptists, baptist organi-
27		zation, convention sbc
No assignment	2795	Outlier documents
	2132	Rule-based exclusion from model (contains "does not
		reference" or "does not explicitly reference")

Table 2: **BERTopic results and interpretations using GPT-4 generated article descriptions.** The model considered unigrams and bigrams, with minimum topic size = 100 documents. BERTopic produced 19 topics that were interpretable and identified specific primary actors. A representative subset of the 10 KeyBERT words are shown.

Topic	# of docs	KeyBERT representation
interpretation	in topic	· ·
Misc. educational	2723	school board, school district, public schools, brown
and political actors		jackson, schools, parents, curriculum, teachers
Racial conflict	1394	racial, racism, racist, controversy, white people, de-
& controversy		bate, critics, diversity, fox news, discussion
State-specific	221	textbooks florida, florida classrooms, florida schools,
coverage		schools desantis, florida desantis, desantis proposes
(FL, TX, SD, VA)	192	texas legislature, texas schools, texas lawmakers, ban-
		ning texas, approval texas, texas bill, texas public
	149	florida bans, bans classrooms, florida education,
		florida news, florida classrooms, taught florida
	117	dakota bans, dakota legislature, dakota noem, dakota
		lawmakers, dakota gov, dakota colleges, gov kristi,
	100	glenn youngkin, youngkin campaign, gov youngkin,
		youngkin bans, youngkin virginia
Values in the	658	america classrooms, racism, ethnic studies, fight
classroom		schools, american schools, civics education
Passing policies	351	bills banning, bills ban, bill senate, mississippi senate,
		transparency bill, anti bill, ban teaching
	172	bans schools, schools banning, bans teaching, black
		students, teachers protest
Parents	381	black parents, parents protest, parents fight, parents
		rally, parents push, parents concerned, black mother
Republicans &	192	gop reps, gop attacks, biden proposal, issue gop, gop,
Democrats		gop lawmakers, back biden, biden, reps push
	110	biden education, schools biden, biden pushing, biden
		fight, biden administration, biden democrats
Teachers	266	pledge teach, teachers pledging, sign pledge, new
		teachers, teach controversial
Military	208	professor defends, academy professor, defends teach-
		ing, military academies, air force, cadets, force officer
Protest & elections	134	board races, school board, condemning racism, board
		candidates, meeting debate, board meeting, dismay
		students, questions school
	97	letter criticism, racist, letters opposing, issue letter
Southern Baptists	117	southern baptists, baptist convention, baptist leaders
No assignment	4122	Outlier documents

Table 3: **BERTopic results and interpretations using raw article titles.** The model considered unigrams and bigrams, with minimum topic size = 90 documents. BERTopic produced 18 topics that were less interpretable than the GPT-4 augmented results in Table 2. A representative subset of the 10 KeyBERT words are shown.