# The bivariate truncated moment problem on quadratic and some higher degree curves

Aljaž Zalar, University of Ljubljana, Slovenia

IWOTA, Lancaster, August 2021



# Classical truncated moment problem

• Let  $\beta = \beta^{(2k)} = (\beta_i)_{i \in \mathbb{Z}^d_+, |i| \le 2k}$  be a *d*-dimensional multisequence of real numbers of degree 2k.

#### Example

For d = 2 and k = 2,  $\beta$  is a 15-parametric sequence

$$\beta = (\beta_{0,0}, \beta_{1,0}, \beta_{0,1}, \beta_{2,0}, \beta_{1,1}, \beta_{0,2}, \beta_{3,0}, \beta_{2,1}, \beta_{1,2}, \beta_{0,3}, \beta_{4,0}, \beta_{3,1}, \beta_{2,2}, \beta_{1,3}, \beta_{0,4}).$$

• The **truncated moment problem (TMP)**: characterize the existence of a positive Borel measure  $\mu$  on  $\mathbb{R}^d$  with support in the closed set K, such that

$$\beta_i = \int_K \underline{x}^i d\mu(\underline{x}) \quad \text{for} \quad i \in \mathbb{Z}_+^d, |i| \le 2k,$$

where  $\underline{x}^i := x_1^{i_1} \cdots x_d^{i_d}$ .

#### Theorem (Richter, 1957; Bayer, Teichmann, 2006)

It suffices to study finitely atomic measures in the TMP.



### Tracial truncated moment problem

• Let  $\beta \equiv \beta^{(2k)} = (\beta_w)_{|w| \le 2k}$  be a d-dimensional multisequence indexed by words w in noncommuting letters  $X_1, X_2, \ldots, X_d$  of length at most 2k such that

$$\beta_{v_1v_2} = \beta_{v_2v_1}$$
 and  $\beta_w = \beta_{w^*}$ ,

for every words  $v_1, v_2, w$  and  $w^*$  is the reverse of w.

• The tracial truncated moment problem (TTMP): characterize the existence of a positive Borel measure  $\mu$  on the set of tuples of real symmetric matrices  $S_n(\mathbb{R})^d$  of some size n, such that

$$\beta_{w} = \int_{S_{n}(\mathbb{R})^{d}} \operatorname{Tr}(w(\underline{A})) d\mu(\underline{A}) \quad \text{for every word } w, |w| \leq 2k,$$

where Tr denotes the normalized trace of a matrix.

### Theorem (Burgdorf, Cafuta, Klep, Povh, 2013)

It suffices to study finitely atomic measures in the TTMP.



# Tracial truncated moment problem

#### Example

For d = 2 and k = 2,  $\beta$  is a 16-parametric sequence

$$\begin{split} \beta &= \left(\beta_{1}, \beta_{X}, \beta_{Y}, \beta_{X^{2}}, \beta_{XY} = \beta_{YX}, \beta_{Y^{2}}, \beta_{X^{3}}, \beta_{X^{2}Y} = \beta_{XYX} = \beta_{YX^{2}}, \right. \\ \beta_{XY^{2}} &= \beta_{YXY} = \beta_{Y^{2}X}, \beta_{Y^{3}}, \beta_{X^{4}}, \beta_{X^{3}Y} = \beta_{X^{2}YX} = \beta_{XYX^{2}} = \beta_{YX^{3}}, \\ \beta_{X^{2}Y^{2}} &= \beta_{XY^{2}X} = \beta_{Y^{2}X^{2}} = \beta_{YX^{2}Y}, \beta_{XYXY} = \beta_{YXYX}, \\ \beta_{XY^{3}} &= \beta_{YXY^{2}} = \beta_{Y^{2}XY} = \beta_{Y^{3}X}, \beta_{Y^{4}} \right), \end{split}$$

#### Remark

If  $\beta_{X^2Y^2} = \beta_{XYXY}$ , then every atom (X, Y) in the measure must satisfy XY = YX, and the problem becomes a classical moment problem.

### Classical truncated moment matrix

The moment matrix (mm) M(k) associated with a commutative sequence  $\beta$  with the rows and columns indexed by monomials  $X^i$ ,  $|i| \leq k$ , in degree-lexicographic order, is defined by

$$M(k)=(\beta_{i+j})_{i,j\in\mathbb{Z}^d_+,|i|,|j|\leq k}.$$

#### Example

$$d=1, k=4: M(4) = \begin{matrix} 1 & X & X^2 & X^3 & X^4 \\ 1 & X & \beta_0 & \beta_1 & \beta_2 & \beta_3 & \beta_4 \\ X & \beta_1 & \beta_2 & \beta_3 & \beta_4 & \beta_5 \\ \beta_2 & \beta_3 & \beta_4 & \beta_5 & \beta_6 \\ X^3 & \beta_4 & \beta_5 & \beta_6 & \beta_7 \\ X^4 & \beta_5 & \beta_6 & \beta_7 & \beta_8 \end{matrix}$$

### Tracial truncated moment matrix

The tracial moment matrix  $M_{\rm tr}(k)$  associated with a tracial sequence  $\beta$  with the rows and columns indexed by words w in nc letters  $X_1,\ldots,X_d$ ,  $|w|\leq k$ , in degree-lexicographic order, is defined by

$$M_{\rm tr}(k) = (\beta_{W_1^* W_2})_{W_1, W_2}.$$



### Properties of the classical moment matrix

• To every polynomial  $p:=\sum_{i\in\mathbb{Z}^d_+,|i|\leq k}a_i\underline{x}^i\in\mathbb{R}[\underline{x}]_k$ , we associate the vector

$$p(\underline{X}) = \sum_{i \in \mathbb{Z}_+^d, |i| \le k} a_i \underline{X}^i$$

from the column space C(M(k)) of the matrix M(k).

• M(k) is recursively generated (rg) if:

$$p, q, pq \in \mathbb{R}[\underline{x}]_k$$
 and  $p(\underline{X}) = \mathbf{0}$ , then  $(pq)(\underline{X}) = \mathbf{0}$ .

M(k) satisfies the variety condition if

$$\operatorname{rank} M(k) \leq \operatorname{card} \Big( \bigcap_{\substack{g \in \mathbb{R}[\underline{X}] \leq k, \\ g(X) = \mathbf{0} \text{ in } M(k)}} \Big\{ \underline{x} \in \mathbb{R}^d \colon g(\underline{x}) = 0 \Big\} \Big).$$

#### Proposition

Assume that  $\beta$  has a representing measure  $\mu$ . Then:

- M(k) is psd, rg and satisfies the variety condition.
- The support supp  $\mu$  is a subset of  $\mathcal{Z}_p := \{\underline{x} \in \mathbb{R}^d : p(\underline{x}) = 0\}$  if and only if  $p(\underline{X}) = \mathbf{0}$ .

### Properties of the tracial moment matrix

• To every nc polynomial  $p := \sum_{|w| < k} a_w w$ , we associate the vector

$$p(\underline{X}) = \sum_{|w| \le k} a_i w(\underline{X})$$

from the column space  $C(M_{tr}(k))$  of the matrix  $M_{tr}(k)$ .

• The matrix  $M_{tr}(k)$  is recursively generated (rg) if:

$$p, q, pq \in \mathbb{R}\langle \underline{X} \rangle_k$$
 and  $p(\underline{X}) = \mathbf{0}$ , then  $(pq)(\underline{X}) = \mathbf{0}$ .

#### Proposition

Assume that  $\beta$  has a representing measure  $\mu$ . Then:

- $M_{\rm tr}(k)$  is psd and rg.
- The support supp  $\mu$  is a subset of  $\mathcal{Z}_p^{\text{nc}} := \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} \left\{ \underline{X} \in S_n(\mathbb{R})^d : p(\underline{X}) = 0 \right\}$  if and only if  $p(\underline{X}) = \mathbf{0}$ .



### Truncated Hamburger moment problem (THMP)

### Theorem (Curto & Fialkow, 1991)

For  $k \in \mathbb{N}$  and  $\beta = (\beta_0, \dots, \beta_{2k})$  with  $\beta_0 > 0$ , the following statements are equivalent:

- **1** There exists a rm for  $\beta$  supported on  $K = \mathbb{R}$ .
- ② There exists a (rank M(k))-atomic rm for  $\beta$  supported on  $K = \mathbb{R}$ .
- One of the following holds:
  - $M(k) \succ 0$ .
  - $M(k) \succeq 0$  and rank  $M(k) = \operatorname{rank} M(k-1)$ .

# Truncated Hamburger moment problem (THMP)

#### Theorem (Curto & Fialkow, 1991)

For  $k \in \mathbb{N}$  and  $\beta = (\beta_0, \dots, \beta_{2k})$  with  $\beta_0 > 0$ , the following statements are equivalent:

- **①** There exists a rm for  $\beta$  supported on  $K = \mathbb{R}$ .
- ② There exists a (rank M(k))-atomic rm for  $\beta$  supported on  $K = \mathbb{R}$ .
- One of the following holds:
  - $M(k) \succ 0$ .
  - $M(k) \succeq 0$  and rank  $M(k) = \operatorname{rank} M(k-1)$ .

#### Remark

The tracial THMP in one variable coincides with the classical THMP.

# Bivariate TMP for quadratic varieties

### Theorem (Curto & Fialkow, 1996-2015)

Let

$$\beta = \beta^{(2k)} = (\beta_{i,j})_{i,j \in \mathbb{Z}_+, i+j \le 2k}$$

be a bisequence of real numbers of degree 2k such that the moment matrix satisfies

$$p(X, Y) = \mathbf{0},$$

where p is a quadratic polynomial.

After applying an affine linear transformation p can be assumed to be one of the polynomials xy, xy - 1,  $y^2 - y$ ,  $x^2 + y^2 - 1$ ,  $y - x^2$ .

#### Then:

- **1** There exists a rm for  $\beta$ .
- $\bigcirc$  M(k) is psd, rg and satisfies the variety condition.

### Flat extension theorem (FET)

The proof of the previous theorem is based on the following theorem.

### Theorem (Curto, Fialkow, 1998)

Let M(k) be a moment matrix, which has a psd extensions M(k+d) and M(k+d+1) for some  $d \in \mathbb{N}$  such that

$$\operatorname{rank} M(k+d) = \operatorname{rank} M(k+d+1).$$

Then  $\beta$  has a (rank M(k + d))-atomic rm.

### Flat extension theorem (FET)

The proof of the previous theorem is based on the following theorem.

### Theorem (Curto, Fialkow, 1998)

Let M(k) be a moment matrix, which has a psd extensions M(k+d) and M(k+d+1) for some  $d \in \mathbb{N}$  such that

$$\operatorname{rank} M(k+d) = \operatorname{rank} M(k+d+1).$$

Then  $\beta$  has a (rank M(k + d))-atomic rm.

The tracial version of this theorem is the following.

### Theorem (Burgdorf, Klep, 2012)

Let  $M_{tr}(k)$  be a tracial moment matrix, which has a psd extensions  $M_{tr}(k+d)$  and  $M_{tr}(k+d+1)$  for some  $d \in \mathbb{N}$  such that

$$\operatorname{rank} M_{\operatorname{tr}}(k+d) = \operatorname{rank} M_{\operatorname{tr}}(k+d+1).$$

Then  $\beta$  has a rm with atoms of size at most rank  $M_{tr}(k + d)$ .



### Bivariate TTMP for quadratic varieties

#### Possible column relations:

after applying an appropriate affine linear transformation.

$$XY + YX = \mathbf{0}$$
 or  $X^2 + Y^2 = 1$  or  $Y^2 - X^2 = 1$  or  $Y^2 = 1$ .

### Bivariate TTMP for quadratic varieties

#### Possible column relations:

after applying an appropriate affine linear transformation.

$$XY + YX = \mathbf{0}$$
 or  $X^2 + Y^2 = 1$  or  $Y^2 - X^2 = 1$  or  $Y^2 = 1$ .

#### • Analysis of flat extensions:

- Flat extension  $M_{tr}(k + 1)$  of a psd, rg  $M_{tr}(k)$  mostly does not exist.
- Analyzing further extensions  $M_{\rm tr}(k+2), M_{\rm tr}(k+3), \ldots$  is too demanding due to too many parameters.

### Bivariate TTMP for quadratic varieties

#### Possible column relations:

after applying an appropriate affine linear transformation.

$$XY + YX = \mathbf{0}$$
 or  $X^2 + Y^2 = 1$  or  $Y^2 - X^2 = 1$  or  $Y^2 = 1$ .

#### Analysis of flat extensions:

- Flat extension  $M_{tr}(k+1)$  of a psd, rg  $M_{tr}(k)$  mostly does not exist.
- Analyzing further extensions  $M_{tr}(k+2), M_{tr}(k+3), \dots$  is too demanding due to too many parameters.

#### • Another approach:

- First bound the size and the form of possible nc atoms.
- Decompose

$$M_{\rm tr}(2) = M_{\rm cm}(2) + M_{\rm nc}(2),$$

where  $M_{\rm cm}(2)$  comes from *some* size 1 atoms and  $M_{\rm nc}(2)$  comes from all irreducible atoms of size more than 1 and *some* size 1 atoms, for which you know admit a measure.



# Tracial TMP for $M_{tr}(2)$ with relation $X^2 + Y^2 = 1$

The bound on the size of the atoms is 2. Moreover, irreducible size 2 atoms are of the form

Here we used that  $X^2$  and Y commute and use that  $X^2 + Y^2 = I$ .

# Tracial TMP for $M_{tr}(2)$ with relation $X^2 + Y^2 = 1$

The bound on the size of the atoms is 2. Moreover, irreducible size 2 atoms are of the form

Here we used that  $X^2$  and Y commute and use that  $X^2 + Y^2 = I$ .

It follows that

$$M_{cm}(2) = \begin{pmatrix} ? & \beta_{X} & \beta_{Y} & ? & ? & ? \\ \beta_{X} & ? & ? & \beta_{X^{3}} & \beta_{X^{2}Y} & \beta_{X^{2}Y} \\ \beta_{Y} & ? & ? & \beta_{X^{2}Y} & \beta_{X} - \beta_{X^{3}} & \beta_{X} - \beta_{X^{3}} \\ ? & \beta_{X^{3}} & \beta_{X^{2}Y} & ? & ? & ? \\ ? & \beta_{X^{2}Y} & \beta_{X} - \beta_{X^{3}} & ? & ? & ? \\ ? & \beta_{X^{2}Y} & \beta_{X} - \beta_{X^{3}} & ? & ? & ? \\ ? & \beta_{X^{2}Y} & \beta_{X} - \beta_{X^{3}} & ? & ? & ? \\ 0 & ? & ? & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & ? & ? & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ ? & 0 & 0 & ? & ? & ? \\ ? & 0 & 0 & ? & ? & ? \\ ? & 0 & 0 & ? & ? & ? \\ ? & 0 & 0 & ? & ? & ? \\ \end{cases}.$$

# Tracial TMP for $M_{tr}(2)$ with relation $X^2 + Y^2 = 1$

$$L(a,b,c,d,e) := \begin{pmatrix} a & \beta_X & \beta_Y & b & c & c \\ \beta_X & b & c & \beta_{X^3} & \beta_{X^2Y} & \beta_{X^2Y} \\ \beta_Y & c & a-b & \beta_{X^2Y} & \beta_X-\beta_{X^3} & \beta_X-\beta_{X^3} \\ b & \beta_{X^3} & \beta_{X^2Y} & d & e & e \\ c & \beta_{X^2Y} & \beta_X-\beta_{X^3} & e & b-d & b-d \\ c & \beta_{X^2Y} & \beta_X-\beta_{X^3} & e & b-d & b-d \end{pmatrix}.$$

#### Theorem (Bhardway, Z., 2018)

 $\beta$  admits a measure if and only if there exist  $a,b,c,d,e\in\mathbb{R}$  such that

- $L(a, b, c, d, e) \succeq 0$ ,  $M_{tr}(2) L(a, b, c, d, e) \succeq 0$ ,
- $(M_{tr}(2) L(a, b, c, d, e))_{\{1,X,Y,XY\}} \succ 0$ ,
- L(a, b, c, d, e) is rg and satisfies the variety condition.

#### Remark

Using this theorem examples where  $M_{\rm tr}(2)$  being psd and rg does not imply the existence of a measure can be obtained.



# Tracial TMP for $M_{\rm tr}(k)$ with two quadratic relations

#### Possible column relations:

after applying an appropriate affine linear transformation.

• 
$$XY + YX = 0$$

• 
$$X^2 + Y^2 = 1$$
 or  $Y^2 - X^2 = 1$  or  $Y^2 = 1$  or  $Y^2 = X^2$ .

- Analysis of flat extensions: still too demanding
- Another approach:
  - The bound on the size of the atoms is 2 and irreducible size 2 atoms are of the form

$$X = \left( egin{array}{cc} 0 & \alpha \\ \alpha & 0 \end{array} 
ight), \quad Y = \left( egin{array}{cc} \mu & 0 \\ 0 & -\mu \end{array} 
ight), \qquad {
m where} \ \alpha, \mu \in \mathbb{R}.$$

• It suffices to study the restriction due to column relations

$$M(k)|_{\{\vec{X},Y\vec{X}'\}} = \begin{array}{cc} \vec{X} & Y\vec{X}' \\ \vec{X} & A & B \\ Y\vec{X}' & B & C \end{array},$$

where 
$$\vec{X} := (1, X, ..., X^k), \ Y\vec{X}' := (Y, YX, ..., YX^{k-1}), \ \vec{X} = (Y, YX, ..., YX^{k-1}), \ \vec{X} = (X, X, ..., X^k)$$

# Tracial TMP for $M_{\rm tr}(k)$ with two quadratic relations

Since there are only 4 possible size 1 atoms (( $\pm 1, 0$ ), (0,  $\pm 1$ )), the best candidate for  $M_{\rm cm}(k)$  is

$$M_{\rm cm}(k) = |\beta_X| \cdot M(k)^{({\rm sign}(\beta_X)1,0)} + |\beta_Y| \cdot M(k)^{(0,{\rm sign}(\beta_Y)1)},$$

where  $M(k)^{(x,y)}$  stands for the mm generated by  $(x,y) \in \mathbb{R}^2$ , and

$$M_{\rm nc}(k)|_{\{\vec{X},Y\vec{X}'\}} = \begin{array}{cc} \vec{X} & Y\vec{X}' \\ \vec{X} & (A_1 & \mathbf{0}) \\ Y\vec{X}' & (\mathbf{0} & C_1) \end{array}$$

Solving the TMP  $M_{\rm nc}(k)|_{\{\vec{X}, Y\vec{X}'\}}$  is in fact the classical TMP on  $\mathbb R$  or [-1,1]. If the atoms  $x_1,\ldots,x_m$  represent  $A_1$ , then  $M_{\rm nc}(k)|_{\{\vec{X},Y\vec{X}'\}}$  is represented by:

• if 
$$X^2 + Y^2 = 1$$
:  $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & x_i \\ x_i & 0 \end{pmatrix}$ ,  $\begin{pmatrix} \sqrt{1 - x_i^2} & 0 \\ 0 & -\sqrt{1 - x_i^2} \end{pmatrix}$ ,

Similarly for the other three cases.

#### Theorem (Bhardwaj, Z., 2021)

 $M_{\rm tr}(k)$  admits a nc measure  $\Leftrightarrow M_{\rm nc}(k)$  is psd and rg.

#### Question

The bivariate tracial TMP with two quadratic column relations can be reduced to the use of the univariate classical TMP.

Is the same true for the bivariate classical TMP with one quadratic column relation?

```
Given by p(x, y) = 0 where p(x, y) is one of xy, xy - 1, y^2 - y, x^2 + y^2 - 1, y - x^2.
```

If the answer to (1) is yes, can this technique by applied to cubic/higher degree column relations?

#### Question

The bivariate tracial TMP with two quadratic column relations can be reduced to the use of the univariate classical TMP.

- Is the same true for the bivariate classical TMP with one quadratic column relation?
  - Given by p(x, y) = 0 where p(x, y) is one of xy, xy 1,  $y^2 y$ ,  $x^2 + y^2 1$ ,  $y x^2$ .
- If the answer to (1) is yes, can this technique by applied to cubic/higher degree column relations?

The answer to both questions above is yes.

- $p(x, y) \in \{xy, y^2 y, y x^2\} \dots$  reduction to the TMP for  $\mathbb{R}$ .
  - $p(x, y) = xy 1 \dots$  reduction to the TMP for  $\mathbb{R} \setminus \{0\}$ , where negative moment are also known.
  - $p(x, y) = x^2 + y^2 1 \dots$  reduction to the trigonometric TMP.



2		
<i>p</i> ( <i>x</i> , <i>y</i> )	reduces to the TMP of degree	with gaps at degrees
$y-x^3$	$6k$ for $K = \mathbb{R}$	6 <i>k</i> – 1
$y^{2} - x^{3}$	$6k$ for $K = \mathbb{R}$	1
$x^{2}y - 1$	$(-4k,2k)$ for $K=\mathbb{R}\setminus\{0\}$	-4k + 1
$y-x^4$	$8k$ for $K = \mathbb{R}$	8k - 5, 8k - 2, 8k - 1
$y^3 - x^4$	$8k$ for $K = \mathbb{R}$	1,2,5
$x^{3}y - 1$	$(-6k,2k)$ for $K=\mathbb{R}\setminus\{0\}$	-6k+1, -6k+2, -6k+5

All problems above are psd matrix completion problems with one additional constraint in case the completion is only singular:

- for  $K = \mathbb{R}$ : the last column is in the span of the others.
- for  $K = \mathbb{R} \setminus \{0\}$ : the last and first column must be in the span of the others.

2		
<i>p</i> ( <i>x</i> , <i>y</i> )	reduces to the TMP of degree	with gaps at degrees
$y-x^3$	$6k$ for $K = \mathbb{R}$	6 <i>k</i> – 1
$y^2-x^3$	$6k$ for $K = \mathbb{R}$	1
$x^2y - 1$	$(-4k,2k)$ for $K=\mathbb{R}\setminus\{0\}$	-4k + 1
$y-x^4$	$8k$ for $K = \mathbb{R}$	8k - 5, 8k - 2, 8k - 1
$y^3 - x^4$	$8k$ for $K = \mathbb{R}$	1,2,5
$x^{3}y - 1$	$(-6k,2k)$ for $K=\mathbb{R}\setminus\{0\}$	-6k+1, -6k+2, -6k+5

All problems above are psd matrix completion problems with one additional constraint in case the completion is only singular:

- for  $K = \mathbb{R}$ : the last column is in the span of the others.
- for  $K = \mathbb{R} \setminus \{0\}$ : the last and first column must be in the span of the others.

Also  $p(x, y) = y(y - \alpha_1)(y - \alpha_2)$  reduces to the TMP for  $\mathbb R$  by decomposing

$$M(k) = M_1(k) + M_2(k) + M_3(k),$$

where each  $M_i(k)$  corresponds to one line.



Thank you for your attention!