

1. (10 points) Let $\Omega = \{\omega_1, \dots, \omega_N\}$ be a finite sample space and suppose $\mathbb{P}(\{\omega\}) > 0$ for all $\omega \in \Omega$. Consider X a real-valued random variable on (Ω, \mathbb{P}) and $f: \mathbb{R} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ a function. Prove that X and $Y = f(X)$ are independent if and only if $f(X)$ is a constant random variable.

Hint: Examine the conditional probability $\mathbb{P}(Y = y|X = x)$ when $y = f(x)$. Also, remember that an event with probability 0 or 1 is always independent from all other events.

Note: You can choose to prove a more general result: remove the condition $\mathbb{P}(\{\omega\}) > 0$ for all ω . The equivalent condition for $X \perp\!\!\!\perp f(X)$ becomes “there exists $c \in \mathbb{R}$ such that $\mathbb{P}(f(X) = c) = 1$ ”, i.e., $f(X)$ is *almost surely* constant.

2. (10 points) Let $X \sim \text{Geometric}(p)$ and $Y \sim \text{Geometric}(q)$ be two independent random variables, where $0 < p, q < 1$.

Note: We use the convention (in the notes) that the geometric distribution is supported on $\{1, 2, 3, \dots\}$. See https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Geometric_distribution for the other convention where the distribution is supported on $\{0, 1, 2, \dots\}$.

- (a) (4 points) Compute $\mathbb{P}(X > Y)$.
(b) (6 points) Assume $p = q$. For $k \in \{1, 2, \dots\}$, derive an explicit expression for

$$\mathbb{P}(X \geq kY).$$

Hint: Decompose the event based on the different values Y can take.

1. Prove \Rightarrow

Assume X and Y are independent.

$$\therefore P(Y=y | X=x) = P(Y=y) \quad (\text{by independence})$$

$$= P(f(X)=y) \quad (\because Y=f(X) \text{ given}) \quad \text{--- (1)}$$

$$\text{However, } P(Y=y | X=x) = P(Y=f(x) | X=x) = 1 \quad \text{--- (2)}$$

This is because since we know $X=x$ and $Y=f(x)$ by definition, the conditional probability that $P(Y=f(x) | X=x)$ is certain.

$$\therefore \text{From (1) and (2), } P(f(X)=y) = 1$$

Thus, $f(X)$ is almost surely constant. (as wanted)

Prove \Leftarrow

Assume $f(X)$ is a constant random variable.

$$\therefore \exists c \in \mathbb{R} \text{ such that } f(X) = c.$$

$$\therefore P(f(X)=c) = 1$$

$$\text{Consider } P(X=x | Y=y) = P(X=x | f(X)=c) \quad (\because Y=f(X) \text{ is a constant random variable})$$

Since $P(f(X)=c) = 1$, the conditional probability $P(X=x | f(X)=c)$ is just $P(X=x)$

$$\therefore P(X=x | f(X)=c) = P(X=x)$$

$\therefore X$ and $Y=f(X)$ are independent (as wanted)

2. (a)

$$\begin{aligned}
 P(X > Y) &= \sum_{x=2}^{\infty} \sum_{y=1}^{x-1} (1-p)^{x-1} p (1-q)^{y-1} q \quad (\text{Since } X \text{ and } Y \text{ are independent, we can just multiply two pmf}) \\
 &= pq \sum_{x=2}^{\infty} (1-p)^{x-1} \sum_{y=1}^{x-1} (1-q)^{y-1} \quad (pq \text{ is constant}) \\
 &= pq \sum_{x=2}^{\infty} (1-p)^{x-1} \frac{(1)(1-(1-q)^{x-1})}{1-(1-q)} \quad (\text{Geometric sum}) \\
 &= pq \sum_{x=2}^{\infty} (1-p)^{x-1} \frac{1-(1-q)^{x-1}}{q} \\
 &= \frac{pq}{q} \sum_{x=2}^{\infty} (1-p)^{x-1} (1-(1-q)^{x-1}) \quad (1/q \text{ is constant}) \\
 &= p \sum_{x=2}^{\infty} (1-p)^{x-1} (1-(1-q)^{x-1}) \\
 &= p \sum_{x=2}^{\infty} (1-p)^{x-1} - \sum_{x=2}^{\infty} (1-p)^{x-1} (1-q)^{x-1} \\
 &= p \left(\frac{1-p}{1-(1-p)} - \frac{(1-p)(1-q)}{1-(1-p)(1-q)} \right) \quad (\text{Geometric sum}) \\
 &= 1-p - \frac{p(1-p)(1-q)}{1-1+p+q-pq} \\
 &= \frac{\cancel{1+q-pq} - \cancel{p^2} - \cancel{pq} + \cancel{p^2q} - \cancel{p} + \cancel{p(1-q)} - \cancel{p^2q}}{p+q-pq} \\
 &= \frac{q-pq}{p+q-pq}
 \end{aligned}$$

For $k \in \{1, 2, \dots\}$

$$\begin{aligned}
 \text{(b)} \quad P(X \geq kY) &= \sum_{i=1}^{\infty} P(Y=i) P(X \geq ki | Y=i) \quad (\text{decompose based on different } Y\text{-values}) \\
 &= \sum_{i=1}^{\infty} P(Y=i) P(X \geq ki) \quad (\text{because } X \text{ and } Y \text{ are independent}) \\
 &= \sum_{i=1}^{\infty} P(Y=i) P(X > ki-1) \\
 &= \sum_{i=1}^{\infty} (1-q)^{i-1} q (1-p)^{ki-1} \quad (\text{tail probability of geometric distribution}) \\
 &= \sum_{i=1}^{\infty} (1-p)^i p (1-p)^{-1} (1-p)^{ki} (1-p)^{-1} \quad (\because q=p) \\
 &= \frac{p}{(1-p)^2} \sum_{i=1}^{\infty} (1-p)^{(k+1)i}
 \end{aligned}$$

$$= \frac{p}{(1-p)^2} \cdot \frac{(1-p)^{k+1}}{1 - (1-p)^{k+1}}$$

$$= \frac{p (1-p)^{k-1}}{1 - (1-p)^{k+1}}$$
