Supplementary File for Paper: Two-stage Robust Optimizer for Multi-product Multi-process Resource Allocation in Steel Production Systems

This supplementary presents a comprehensive experimental comparison, detailing the generation of instances and the performance of our algorithm across a spectrum of instances with different scales, under various uncertainty levels.

Table 5 shows the generated range of instance parameters. The nominal customer demand for each product type is randomly generated based on the total machine capacity of an SCC process. The tightness between them is adjusted by a factor τ . Furthermore, a minimum batch size criterion is established, stipulating that the batch size to initiate processing on any machine must be at least 20% of the machine's capacity. This rule ensures a balance between production efficiency and operational feasibility. The remaining parameters for each instance are stochastically determined within predefined intervals, as detailed in Table 5.

Table 5: Generation of instances

| Production process | S = 3 |
|---|---|
| Machine capacity | $C_i \in [6000, 8000]$ |
| Minimum batch size | $\check{L}_{ir} = 20\% C_i$ |
| Initial inventory quantity | $I_{jp}^0 \in [10, 20]$ |
| Maximum inventory capacity | $\hat{I}_j \in [1000, 3000]$ |
| Transportation cost | $c_{ijp} \in [1, 10]$ |
| Fixed activation cost | $f_{ij} \in [100, 200]$ |
| Shortage cost | $\delta_k \in [100, 200]$ |
| Inventory cost | $\mu_k \in [1, 10]$ |
| Tightness factor | $\tau = 1.0$ |
| Normal customer demand | $\sum_{k=1}^{K} \bar{d}_k = \tau \sum_{i=1}^{ \mathbb{M}^1 } C_i$ |
| Demand disturbance parameter | $\varepsilon=10\%$ |
| Normal production yield rate | $\bar{r}_p \in [0.95, 0.99]$ |
| Maximum production yield rate deviation | $\hat{r}_p \in [0.01, 0.05]$ |

Table 6 provides a summary result comparison for a condition of K=20, $|\mathbb{M}^s|=3$, and P=39. All of instances in the table can be optimally solved by CG and OA-CG. Therefore, $^{\#}$ Ins is 20 for each demand disturbance parameter in a group. Tables 7-12 show experimental comparison results for small-scale instances with K=15 and K=20, under varying demand disturbance parameters and uncertainty levels, respectively. The instances can be optimally solved by using both CG and OA-CG. OA-CG demonstrates superior performance in terms of total computation time for the majority of instances. These results substantiate the high efficiency of our proposed algorithm in solving the problem at hand.

1

Table 6: Summary result comparison when $|\mathbb{M}^s| = 3$, K = 20, and P = 39

| | | | | (| CG | | | OA | -CG | | |
|------------|------------|---------------|--------|---------|------------------|---------|--------|------|----------|------|-----------------------|
| Γ_D | Γ_R | ε | #Ins | | Time (s) | | #Ins | | Time (s) | | $\bar{\mathcal{P}}_T$ |
| | | | " IIIS | Min^C | \mathbf{Max}^C | Avg^C | " IIIS | Min | Max | Avg | |
| | | 5% | 20 | 1.00 | 83.71 | 16.25 | 20 | 0.82 | 20.56 | 5.42 | 55.44% |
| | | 6% | 20 | 0.92 | 94.41 | 15.74 | 20 | 1.08 | 35.25 | 6.38 | 44.34% |
| 4 | 10 | 7% | 20 | 0.63 | 78.97 | 12.44 | 20 | 0.98 | 16.30 | 4.98 | 34.64% |
| 4 | 10 | 8% | 20 | 0.67 | 46.51 | 10.45 | 20 | 0.86 | 30.27 | 5.80 | 31.32% |
| | | 9% | 20 | 0.66 | 88.97 | 13.91 | 20 | 0.83 | 25.43 | 5.96 | 35.75% |
| | | 10% | 20 | 0.61 | 103.45 | 12.97 | 20 | 0.95 | 29.14 | 5.86 | 27.85% |
| | | 5% | 20 | 3.23 | 58.39 | 17.80 | 20 | 1.52 | 15.65 | 5.70 | 58.01% |
| | | 6% | 20 | 2.89 | 64.70 | 16.52 | 20 | 1.44 | 14.72 | 4.93 | 59.43% |
| 6 | 15 | 7% | 20 | 1.50 | 60.10 | 16.53 | 20 | 1.45 | 14.83 | 5.35 | 53.92% |
| U | 13 | 8% | 20 | 1.42 | 44.26 | 12.93 | 20 | 1.30 | 11.94 | 5.39 | 41.77% |
| | | 9% | 20 | 1.83 | 40.12 | 11.73 | 20 | 1.39 | 20.91 | 5.30 | 40.19% |
| | | 10% | 20 | 1.73 | 32.23 | 9.27 | 20 | 1.33 | 20.47 | 5.74 | 24.50% |
| | | 5% | 20 | 2.01 | 34.14 | 9.58 | 20 | 1.87 | 16.10 | 4.72 | 40.45% |
| | | 6% | 20 | 1.30 | 27.72 | 8.95 | 20 | 1.44 | 15.36 | 4.94 | 39.02% |
| 8 | 20 | 7% | 20 | 1.09 | 30.25 | 8.90 | 20 | 1.39 | 14.12 | 4.42 | 40.59% |
| o | 20 | 8% | 20 | 1.28 | 25.88 | 7.56 | 20 | 1.29 | 19.98 | 4.69 | 30.23% |
| | | 9% | 20 | 1.14 | 22.19 | 7.40 | 20 | 1.33 | 11.86 | 4.40 | 28.77% |
| | | 10% | 20 | 1.02 | 23.69 | 7.30 | 20 | 1.20 | 12.72 | 4.38 | 17.58% |

Table 13 gives a comparative analysis of the experimental results for large-scale instances with $|\mathbb{M}^s|=4$ under different levels of uncertainty. CG yields suboptimal solutions for many instances, whereas OA-CG successfully identifies optimal solutions for most of them. The great improvement in solving efficiency, as evidenced by the reduced computational time, suggests OA-CG's high robustness and suitability for potential real-world industrial applications.

Table 7: Comparison results when $|\mathbb{M}^s|=3,\,K=15,\,\Gamma_D=4,$ and $\Gamma_R=10$

| | | | C | CG | | | | O _l | A-CG | | | _ |
|---------------|----------|------------|------------|-----------------------|--------|--------|-----------|----------------|-----------------------|--------|--------|-----------------|
| ε | Instance | L^C | U^C | G^C | Tim | ie (s) | L | U | G | Tim | ne (s) | \mathcal{P}_T |
| | | | | | RP | Total | | | | RP | Total | |
| | 1 | 496489.74 | 496489.74 | 0.00% | 20.75 | 30.89 | 496489.7 | 4 496489.74 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.31 | 9.20 | 70.22 |
| | 2 | 549217.66 | 549217.66 | 0.00% | 24.56 | 29.56 | 549217.6 | 6 549217.66 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.69 | 13.77 | 53.43 |
| | 3 | 588608.44 | 588608.44 | 0.00% | 36.07 | 67.82 | 588608.4 | 4 588608.44 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 4.92 | 35.99 | 46.94 |
| | 4 | 560747.32 | 560747.32 | 0.00% | 253.27 | 408.36 | 560747.3 | 2 560747.32 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 62.58 | 258.71 | 36.65 |
| | 5 | 842388.85 | 842388.85 | 0.00% | 28.05 | 29.98 | 842388.8 | 5 842388.85 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 8.27 | 11.67 | 61.06 |
| | 6 | 546418.02 | 546418.02 | 0.00% | 4.59 | 5.09 | 546418.0 | 2 546418.02 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.16 | 3.75 | 26.33 |
| | 7 | 566704.22 | 566704.22 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 11.47 | 18.08 | 566704.2 | 2 566704.22 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.83 | 9.44 | 47.80 |
| | 8 | 960120.11 | 960120.11 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 6.14 | 7.83 | 960120.1 | 1 960120.11 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.45 | 4.37 | 44.15 |
| | 9 | 501193.63 | 501193.63 | 0.00% | 12.44 | 18.61 | 501193.6 | 3 501193.63 | 0.00% | 2.65 | 11.83 | 36.42 |
| 5% | 10 | 501441.35 | 501441.35 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 24.07 | 44.05 | 501441.3 | 5 501441.35 | 0.00% | 3.62 | 28.29 | 35.77 |
| | 11 | 779895.83 | 779895.83 | 0.00% | 15.31 | 17.38 | 779895.8 | 3 779895.83 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 4.98 | 11.05 | 36.43 |
| | 12 | 710819.10 | 710819.92 | 0.00% | 6.66 | 8.16 | 710819.1 | 2 710819.12 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.47 | 4.34 | 46.70 |
| | 13 | 615560.72 | 615560.72 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 5.63 | 6.50 | 615560.7 | 2 615560.72 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.66 | 3.67 | 43.48 |
| | 14 | 557237.81 | 557237.81 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 9.44 | 10.74 | 557237.8 | 557237.81 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 4.83 | 6.42 | 40.21 |
| | 15 | 1008934.05 | 1008934.05 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 1.52 | 1.78 | 1008934.0 | 05 1008934.05 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.16 | 2.42 | -35.7 |
| | 16 | 564437.04 | 564437.04 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 14.20 | 22.11 | 564437.0 | 4 564437.04 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.86 | 13.66 | 38.2 |
| | 17 | 862551.02 | 862551.02 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.94 | 5.69 | 862551.0 | 2 862551.02 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.58 | 4.77 | 16.1 |
| | 18 | 609537.72 | 609537.72 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.55 | 2.95 | 609537.7 | 2 609537.72 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.12 | 3.19 | -7.89 |
| | 19 | 634555.16 | 634555.16 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 9.16 | 11.28 | 634555.1 | 6 634555.16 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 4.29 | 6.24 | 44.7 |
| | 20 | 715173.08 | 715173.08 | 0.00% | 11.33 | 20.36 | 715173.0 | 8 715173.08 | 0.00% | 3.81 | 20.24 | 0.60 |
| | 1 | 513855.16 | 513855.16 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 18.21 | 22.55 | 513855.1 | 6 513855.16 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.53 | 8.00 | 64.5 |
| | 2 | 568858.32 | 568858.32 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 23.87 | 28.66 | 568858.3 | 2 568858.32 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.73 | 12.73 | 55.5 |
| | 3 | 605117.40 | 605117.40 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 39.67 | 68.91 | 605117.4 | 0 605117.40 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 5.30 | 25.73 | 62.6 |
| | 4 | 572152.96 | 572152.96 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 189.59 | 241.11 | 572152.9 | 6 572152.96 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 44.13 | 159.95 | 33.6 |
| | 5 | 871551.99 | 871551.99 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 18.08 | 20.63 | 871551.9 | 9 871551.99 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 6.95 | 8.84 | 57.1 |
| | 6 | 568299.10 | 568299.10 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 5.59 | 6.27 | 568299.1 | 0 568299.10 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.02 | 3.56 | 43.1 |
| | 7 | 588101.57 | 588101.57 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 12.16 | 19.63 | 588101.5 | 7 588101.57 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.89 | 9.83 | 49.9 |
| | 8 | 988357.03 | 988357.03 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 10.28 | 14.11 | 988357.0 | 3 988357.03 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.89 | 7.11 | 49.6 |
| | 9 | 515133.19 | 515133.19 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 13.73 | 21.22 | 515133.1 | 9 515133.19 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.45 | 10.19 | 52.0 |
| 5% | 10 | 525384.34 | 525384.34 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 21.66 | 43.81 | 525384.3 | 4 525384.34 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 4.52 | 36.32 | 17.1 |
| , ,, | 11 | 813413.34 | 813413.34 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 15.88 | 18.27 | 813413.3 | 4 813413.34 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 4.55 | 7.60 | 58.4 |
| | 12 | 732595.82 | 732595.82 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 5.28 | 6.21 | 732595.8 | 2 732595.82 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.55 | 3.64 | 41.3 |
| | 13 | 636642.56 | 636642.56 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 6.61 | 7.38 | 636642.5 | 6 636642.56 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.42 | 4.41 | 40.2 |
| | 14 | 577337.57 | 577337.57 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 10.83 | 12.77 | 577337.5 | 7 577337.57 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.32 | 5.04 | 60.5 |
| | 15 | 1052815.65 | 1052815.65 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 1.48 | 1.70 | 1052815.0 | 65 1052815.65 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 1.75 | 1.97 | -15.6 |
| | 16 | 584090.29 | 584090.29 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 15.36 | 22.95 | 584090.2 | 9 584090.29 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 5.78 | 15.86 | 30.9 |
| | 17 | 889975.66 | 889975.66 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.86 | 5.83 | 889975.6 | 6 889975.66 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.19 | 5.78 | 0.82 |
| | 18 | 642794.60 | 642794.60 | 0.00% | 3.22 | 3.63 | 642794.6 | 642794.60 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.30 | 2.81 | 22.4 |
| | 19 | 656528.10 | 656528.10 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 8.77 | 10.75 | 656528.1 | 0 656528.10 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 4.78 | 8.37 | 22.1 |
| | 20 | 735368.78 | 735368.78 | 0.00% | 11.67 | 22.28 | 735368.7 | 8 735368.78 | 0.00% | 4.10 | 16.57 | 25.6 |
| | 1 | 531226.37 | 531226.37 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 19.92 | 24.95 | 531226.3 | 7 531226.37 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.77 | 13.53 | 45.7 |
| | 2 | 588498.98 | 588498.98 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 26.25 | 30.61 | 588498.9 | 8 588498.98 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.36 | 11.44 | 62.6 |
| | 3 | 621670.75 | 621670.75 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 50.25 | 109.77 | 621628.4 | 3 621670.75 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 6.41 | 56.76 | 48.2 |
| | 4 | 585424.03 | 585424.03 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 177.92 | 233.89 | 585424.0 | 3 585424.03 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 141.33 | 219.50 | 6.15 |
| | 5 | 900715.14 | 900715.14 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 16.42 | 18.45 | 900715.1 | 4 900715.14 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 11.12 | 14.06 | 23.7 |
| | 6 | 590180.18 | 590180.18 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 4.89 | 5.47 | 590180.1 | 8 590180.18 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.56 | 4.33 | 20.9 |
| | 7 | 609498.92 | 609498.92 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 10.19 | 15.73 | 609498.9 | 2 609498.92 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.79 | 9.99 | 36.5 |
| | 8 | 1016593.94 | 1016593.94 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 9.42 | 13.41 | 1016593. | 1016593.94 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.71 | 6.46 | 51.8 |
| | 9 | 529129.73 | 529129.73 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 12.03 | 19.08 | 529129.7 | 3 529129.73 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.30 | 10.28 | 46.0 |
| 1% | 10 | 549754.64 | 549754.64 | 0.00% | 14.64 | 32.53 | 549754.6 | 4 549754.64 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.57 | 23.03 | 29.19 |
| 10 | 11 | 846078.82 | 846078.82 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 11.92 | 14.45 | 846078.8 | 2 846078.82 | 0.00% | 5.53 | 8.36 | 42.1 |
| | 12 | 754372.52 | 754372.52 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 4.69 | 5.48 | 754372.5 | 2 754372.52 | 0.00% | 2.45 | 3.20 | 41.62 |
| | | 657724.41 | 657724.41 | 0.00% | 5.37 | 6.08 | 657724.4 | 1 657724.41 | 0.00% | 2.54 | 3.24 | 46.62 |

| | 14 | 596829.81 | 596829.81 | 0.00% | 9.23 | 10.50 | 596829.81 | 596829.81 | 0.00% | 3.16 | 4.39 | 58.16% |
|------|----|------------|------------|-----------------------|-------|--------|------------|------------|-----------------------|------|-------|---------|
| | 15 | 1097255.86 | 1097255.86 | 0.00% | 0.95 | 1.20 | 1097255.86 | 1097255.86 | 0.00% | 1.39 | 1.66 | -37.77% |
| | 16 | 603743.55 | 603743.55 | 0.00% | 12.70 | 19.49 | 603743.55 | 603743.55 | 0.00% | 3.85 | 12.55 | 35.58% |
| | 17 | 917400.30 | 917400.30 | 0.00% | 3.59 | 5.27 | 917400.30 | 917400.30 | 0.00% | 2.33 | 4.14 | 21.39% |
| | 18 | 676051.47 | 676051.47 | 0.00% | 2.14 | 2.52 | 676051.47 | 676051.47 | 0.00% | 2.09 | 2.50 | 0.72% |
| | 19 | 678502.16 | 678502.16 | 0.00% | 7.39 | 9.26 | 678502.16 | 678502.16 | 0.00% | 2.85 | 5.08 | 45.14% |
| | 20 | 761823.06 | 761823.06 | 0.00% | 9.56 | 15.50 | 761823.06 | 761823.06 | 0.00% | 2.75 | 9.75 | 37.07% |
| | 1 | 548694.86 | 548694.86 | 0.00% | 23.80 | 31.22 | 548694.86 | 548694.86 | 0.00% | 4.31 | 15.43 | 50.59% |
| | 2 | 608139.64 | 608139.64 | 0.00% | 26.14 | 31.52 | 608139.64 | 608139.64 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.81 | 10.99 | 65.14% |
| | 3 | 642230.49 | 642230.49 | 0.00% | 47.36 | 85.43 | 642230.49 | 642230.49 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 5.77 | 56.34 | 34.04% |
| | 4 | 611662.31 | 611662.31 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 85.28 | 163.47 | 611662.31 | 611662.31 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 9.57 | 96.45 | 41.00% |
| | 5 | 930777.43 | 930777.43 | 0.00% | 11.64 | 12.50 | 930777.43 | 930777.43 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 5.54 | 8.30 | 33.60% |
| | 6 | 612151.38 | 612151.38 | 0.00% | 8.47 | 9.91 | 612151.38 | 612151.38 | 0.00% | 2.49 | 3.44 | 65.28% |
| | 7 | 630896.28 | 630896.28 | 0.00% | 9.28 | 14.33 | 630896.28 | 630896.28 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.64 | 8.30 | 42.09% |
| | 8 | 1045108.49 | 1045108.49 | 0.00% | 8.77 | 12.27 | 1045108.49 | 1045108.49 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.62 | 6.57 | 46.46% |
| | 9 | 543126.26 | 543126.26 | 0.00% | 12.02 | 19.12 | 543126.26 | 543126.26 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.44 | 10.28 | 46.25% |
| 8% | 10 | 576018.41 | 576018.41 | 0.00% | 14.28 | 35.29 | 576018.41 | 576018.41 | 0.00% | 3.14 | 20.83 | 40.97% |
| 0 /0 | 11 | 880248.54 | 880248.54 | 0.00% | 9.45 | 11.80 | 880248.54 | 880248.54 | 0.00% | 4.20 | 6.97 | 40.90% |
| | 12 | 776149.21 | 776149.21 | 0.00% | 3.92 | 4.63 | 776149.21 | 776149.21 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 1.84 | 2.73 | 40.97% |
| | 13 | 678806.25 | 678806.25 | 0.00% | 5.09 | 5.69 | 678806.25 | 678806.25 | 0.00% | 2.89 | 3.55 | 37.63% |
| | 14 | 615887.94 | 615887.94 | 0.00% | 7.63 | 8.83 | 615887.94 | 615887.94 | 0.00% | 3.09 | 4.23 | 52.09% |
| | 15 | 1141696.07 | 1141696.07 | 0.00% | 3.41 | 4.20 | 1141696.07 | 1141696.07 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 1.69 | 2.69 | 36.11% |
| | 16 | 623626.14 | 623626.14 | 0.00% | 10.02 | 14.31 | 623626.14 | 623626.14 | 0.00% | 3.31 | 8.28 | 42.11% |
| | 17 | 944824.94 | 944824.94 | 0.00% | 3.33 | 4.64 | 944824.94 | 944824.94 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.09 | 3.81 | 17.94% |
| | 18 | 709308.35 | 709308.35 | 0.00% | 4.59 | 5.55 | 709308.35 | 709308.35 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.42 | 3.58 | 35.49% |
| | 19 | 700478.08 | 700478.08 | 0.00% | 7.19 | 8.84 | 700478.08 | 700478.08 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.88 | 4.69 | 46.97% |
| | 20 | 789065.10 | 789065.10 | 0.00% | 8.86 | 14.54 | 789065.10 | 789065.10 | 0.00% | 2.92 | 10.34 | 28.89% |
| | 1 | 566231.93 | 566231.93 | 0.00% | 21.56 | 25.89 | 566231.93 | 566231.93 | 0.00% | 4.28 | 10.39 | 59.88% |
| | 2 | 627783.27 | 627783.27 | 0.00% | 18.58 | 22.47 | 627783.27 | 627783.27 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.35 | 11.44 | 49.08% |
| | 3 | 662831.93 | 662831.93 | 0.00% | 32.22 | 70.00 | 662831.93 | 662831.93 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 4.83 | 55.93 | 20.10% |
| | 4 | 638456.10 | 638456.10 | 0.00% | 73.05 | 138.03 | 638456.10 | 638456.10 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 6.81 | 77.36 | 43.96% |
| | 5 | 960932.70 | 960932.70 | 0.00% | 10.05 | 11.05 | 960932.70 | 960932.70 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 4.61 | 6.33 | 42.70% |
| | 6 | 634949.24 | 634949.24 | 0.00% | 11.31 | 14.28 | 634949.24 | 634949.24 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.36 | 3.31 | 76.80% |
| | 7 | 652294.41 | 652294.41 | 0.00% | 6.97 | 10.33 | 652294.41 | 652294.41 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.67 | 6.29 | 39.08% |
| | 8 | 1073741.66 | 1073741.66 | 0.00% | 8.39 | 11.58 | 1073741.66 | 1073741.66 | 0.00% | 2.52 | 5.89 | 49.11% |
| | 9 | 557122.79 | 557122.79 | 0.00% | 10.97 | 17.55 | 557122.79 | 557122.79 | 0.00% | 2.36 | 8.59 | 51.03% |
| 9% | 10 | 602282.19 | 602282.19 | 0.00% | 18.01 | 47.53 | 602282.19 | 602282.19 | 0.00% | 3.81 | 32.25 | 32.15% |
| 970 | 11 | 914647.67 | 914647.67 | 0.00% | 8.73 | 10.80 | 914647.67 | 914647.67 | 0.00% | 3.23 | 5.69 | 47.32% |
| | 12 | 797925.91 | 797925.91 | 0.00% | 4.28 | 5.06 | 797925.91 | 797925.91 | 0.00% | 1.97 | 2.72 | 46.30% |
| | 13 | 699888.09 | 699888.09 | 0.00% | 4.77 | 5.39 | 699888.09 | 699888.09 | 0.00% | 2.69 | 3.31 | 38.58% |
| | 14 | 634946.07 | 634946.07 | 0.00% | 7.92 | 9.02 | 634946.07 | 634946.07 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.05 | 4.19 | 53.50% |
| | 15 | 1186370.90 | 1186370.90 | 0.00% | 2.95 | 3.73 | 1186370.90 | 1186370.90 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 1.36 | 2.69 | 27.90% |
| | 16 | 643976.61 | 643976.61 | 0.00% | 13.28 | 21.37 | 643976.61 | 643976.61 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 4.05 | 13.55 | 36.63% |
| | 17 | 975892.67 | 975892.67 | 0.00% | 3.13 | 4.47 | 975892.67 | 975892.67 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.19 | 3.72 | 16.70% |
| | 18 | 742565.23 | 742565.23 | 0.00% | 3.66 | 4.67 | 742565.23 | 742565.23 | 0.00% | 2.29 | 3.52 | 24.67% |
| | 19 | 722454.01 | 722454.01 | 0.00% | 6.73 | 8.73 | 722454.01 | 722454.01 | 0.00% | 2.94 | 5.13 | 41.28% |
| | 20 | 816307.13 | 816307.13 | 0.00% | 9.37 | 14.28 | 816307.13 | 816307.13 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.65 | 9.15 | 35.91% |
| | 1 | 583768.99 | 583768.99 | 0.00% | 23.36 | 33.47 | 583768.99 | 583768.99 | 0.00% | 5.51 | 11.71 | 65.00% |
| | 2 | 647437.18 | 647437.18 | 0.00% | 12.50 | 15.14 | 647437.18 | 647437.18 | 0.00% | 3.61 | 11.99 | 20.84% |
| | 3 | 683433.56 | 683433.56 | 0.00% | 37.14 | 93.27 | 683433.56 | 683433.56 | 0.00% | 5.58 | 52.08 | 44.16% |
| | 4 | 665249.89 | 665249.89 | 0.00% | 64.91 | 164.33 | 665249.89 | 665249.89 | 0.00% | 6.34 | 69.87 | 57.48% |
| | 5 | 991099.46 | 991099.46 | 0.00% | 11.44 | 12.34 | 991099.46 | 991099.46 | 0.00% | 4.84 | 6.55 | 46.96% |
| | 6 | 657747.10 | 657747.10 | 0.00% | 10.36 | 11.86 | 657747.10 | 657747.10 | 0.00% | 3.11 | 5.30 | 55.35% |
| | 7 | 675388.16 | 675388.16 | 0.00% | 9.53 | 13.75 | 675388.16 | 675388.16 | 0.00% | 2.51 | 6.18 | 55.03% |
| | 8 | 1102374.82 | 1102374.82 | 0.00% | 10.09 | 14.11 | 1102374.82 | 1102374.82 | 0.00% | 2.71 | 5.99 | 57.53% |
| | 9 | 571119.32 | 571119.32 | 0.00% | 19.91 | 29.72 | 571119.32 | 571119.32 | 0.00% | 2.50 | 10.19 | 65.72% |
| 10 | 10 | 628747.94 | 628747.94 | 0.00% | 23.03 | 62.47 | 628747.94 | 628747.94 | 0.00% | 3.80 | 36.98 | 40.81% |
| 10% | | | | | | | | | | | | |

| 11 | 950826.68 | 950826.68 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 13.06 | 15.94 | 950826.68 | 950826.68 | 0.00% | 3.72 | 6.33 | 60.29% |
|----|------------|------------|-----------------------|-------|-------|------------|------------|-----------------------|------|-------|--------|
| 12 | 819702.61 | 819702.61 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 6.50 | 7.48 | 819702.61 | 819702.61 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.16 | 2.91 | 61.17% |
| 13 | 720985.56 | 720985.56 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 8.31 | 9.10 | 720985.56 | 720985.56 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.78 | 3.44 | 62.21% |
| 14 | 654160.13 | 654160.13 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 12.83 | 14.41 | 654160.13 | 654160.13 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.02 | 4.24 | 70.59% |
| 15 | 1233612.50 | 1233612.50 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.78 | 4.77 | 1233612.50 | 1233612.50 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 1.39 | 2.14 | 55.13% |
| 16 | 664327.47 | 664327.47 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 18.86 | 31.31 | 664327.47 | 664327.47 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.36 | 10.28 | 67.16% |
| 17 | 1007169.85 | 1007169.85 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 4.34 | 6.17 | 1007169.85 | 1007169.85 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.02 | 3.39 | 45.05% |
| 18 | 775822.11 | 775822.11 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 5.78 | 7.23 | 775822.11 | 775822.11 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.51 | 3.63 | 49.79% |
| 19 | 744429.93 | 744429.93 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 10.05 | 12.66 | 744429.93 | 744429.93 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.76 | 5.77 | 54.45% |
| 20 | 843549.16 | 843549.16 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 9.86 | 15.64 | 843549.16 | 843549.16 | 0.00% | 2.54 | 8.93 | 42.91% |

Table 8: Comparison results when $|\mathbb{M}^s|=3,\,K=15,\,\Gamma_D=6,$ and $\Gamma_R=15$

| | Instance _ | | C | CG | | | OA-CG | | | | | |
|------|------------|------------|------------|-----------------------|--------|--------|------------|------------|-----------------------|-------|--------|-----------------|
| ε | Instance | L^{C} | U^C | G^C | Tim | e (s) | | U | G | Tin | ne (s) | \mathcal{P}_T |
| | | <i>L</i> | | <i>G</i> | RP | Total | | | | RP | Total | |
| | 1 | 569796.21 | 569796.21 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 18.75 | 27.03 | 569749.74 | 569796.21 | 0.00% | 4.56 | 12.10 | 55.23 |
| | 2 | 640935.42 | 640935.42 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 15.37 | 23.00 | 640935.42 | 640935.42 | 0.00% | 3.64 | 11.67 | 49.25 |
| | 3 | 680538.28 | 680538.28 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 100.41 | 169.67 | 680538.28 | 680538.28 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 15.41 | 67.55 | 60.19 |
| | 4 | 640067.75 | 640067.75 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 95.83 | 162.06 | 640067.75 | 640067.75 | 0.00% | 6.94 | 45.61 | 71.86 |
| | 5 | 983568.94 | 983568.94 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 31.74 | 33.77 | 983568.94 | 983568.94 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 8.03 | 10.06 | 70.20 |
| | 6 | 632262.78 | 632262.78 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 11.13 | 13.86 | 632262.78 | 632262.78 | 0.00% | 3.23 | 5.79 | 58.21 |
| | 7 | 631590.58 | 631590.58 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 16.95 | 35.61 | 631590.58 | 631590.58 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.59 | 28.32 | 20.47 |
| | 8 | 977102.64 | 977102.64 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 6.66 | 7.72 | 977021.71 | 977102.64 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.30 | 5.38 | 30.29 |
| | 9 | 544647.95 | 544647.95 | 0.00% | 15.97 | 24.89 | 544647.95 | 544647.95 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.66 | 13.55 | 45.58 |
| 5% | 10 | 577578.78 | 577578.78 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 17.61 | 35.94 | 577578.78 | 577578.78 | 0.00% | 4.38 | 30.60 | 14.85 |
| ,- | 11 | 901788.00 | 901788.00 | 0.00% | 16.09 | 21.81 | 901788.00 | 901788.00 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.94 | 9.62 | 55.88 |
| | 12 | 769445.65 | 769445.65 | 0.00% | 7.38 | 9.16 | 769445.65 | 769445.65 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.57 | 5.73 | 37.44 |
| | 13 | 682168.98 | 682168.98 | 0.00% | 13.56 | 14.75 | 682168.98 | 682168.98 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 5.41 | 8.41 | 43.02 |
| | 14 | 620968.66 | 620968.66 | 0.00% | 14.86 | 16.99 | 620968.66 | 620968.66 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.42 | 5.98 | 64.80 |
| | 15 | 1128381.57 | 1128381.57 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 5.91 | 6.89 | 1128381.57 | 1128381.57 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.49 | 3.61 | 47.58 |
| | 16 | 661698.19 | 661698.19 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 24.27 | 45.06 | 661698.19 | 661698.19 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 4.08 | 21.13 | 53.12 |
| | 17 | 961359.29 | 961359.29 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 6.61 | 10.81 | 961359.29 | 961359.29 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.95 | 11.39 | -5.33 |
| | 18 | 685161.07 | 685161.07 | 0.00% | 6.46 | 7.96 | 685161.07 | 685161.07 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.99 | 4.63 | 41.80 |
| | 19 | 718632.07 | 718632.07 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 9.13 | 11.23 | 718632.07 | 718632.07 | 0.00% | 3.19 | 5.59 | 50.20 |
| | 20 | 817913.78 | 817913.78 | 0.00% | 11.51 | 25.84 | 817913.78 | 817913.78 | 0.00% | 3.30 | 19.79 | 23.42 |
| | 1 | 594862.07 | 594862.07 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 24.78 | 35.14 | 594812.45 | 594862.07 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 4.52 | 14.47 | 58.82 |
| | 2 | 668122.95 | 668122.95 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 22.70 | 31.78 | 668122.95 | 668122.95 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.61 | 12.25 | 61.46 |
| | 3 | 711583.31 | 711583.31 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 78.13 | 153.47 | 711583.31 | 711583.31 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 12.03 | 94.86 | 38.19 |
| | 4 | 676886.48 | 676886.48 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 68.96 | 129.59 | 676886.48 | 676886.48 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 8.11 | 104.23 | 19.57 |
| | 5 | 1027003.85 | 1027084.95 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 28.92 | 30.32 | 1027084.95 | 1027084.95 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 16.16 | 19.40 | 36.02 |
| | 6 | 663347.55 | 663347.55 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 14.09 | 17.69 | 663347.55 | 663347.55 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.57 | 7.28 | 58.81 |
| | 7 | 659426.47 | 659426.47 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 18.50 | 36.95 | 659426.47 | 659426.47 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.70 | 30.48 | 17.52 |
| | 8 | 1007548.18 | 1007548.18 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 6.81 | 7.92 | 1007548.18 | 1007548.18 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.25 | 4.33 | 45.36 |
| | 9 | 562230.30 | 562230.30 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 34.89 | 47.14 | 562230.30 | 562230.30 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.88 | 11.76 | 75.06 |
| % | 10 | 609117.53 | 609117.53 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 18.56 | 40.21 | 609117.53 | 609117.53 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 4.19 | 37.19 | 7.50 |
| ,,,, | 11 | 945303.25 | 945303.25 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 15.52 | 20.78 | 945303.25 | 945303.25 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 5.11 | 11.28 | 45.71 |
| | 12 | 798322.15 | 798322.15 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 7.42 | 9.13 | 798322.15 | 798322.15 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.43 | 4.37 | 52.17 |
| | 13 | 710503.38 | 710503.38 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 10.98 | 12.11 | 710503.38 | 710503.38 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 4.41 | 5.70 | 52.90 |
| | 14 | 645806.07 | 645806.07 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 15.89 | 18.56 | 645806.07 | 645806.07 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.77 | 6.59 | 64.48 |
| | 15 | 1182885.71 | 1182885.71 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.86 | 3.39 | 1182858.47 | 1182885.71 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 1.83 | 2.81 | 17.08 |
| | 16 | 691011.11 | 691011.11 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 29.88 | 60.38 | 691011.11 | 691011.11 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 4.27 | 32.41 | 46.32 |
| | 17 | 1002209.10 | 1002209.10 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 6.06 | 9.64 | 1002209.10 | 1002209.10 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.70 | 7.36 | 23.67 |
| | 18 | 725910.90 | 725910.90 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 4.83 | 6.06 | 725910.90 | 725910.90 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.01 | 4.54 | 25.09 |
| | 19 | 749249.27 | 749249.27 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 8.16 | 10.16 | 749249.27 | 749249.27 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.97 | 6.72 | 33.84 |
| | 20 | 853657.06 | 853657.06 | 0.00% | 10.85 | 22.91 | 853657.06 | 853657.06 | 0.00% | 3.09 | 16.76 | 26.83 |
| | 1 | 619933.05 | 619933.05 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 23.31 | 32.47 | 619875.16 | 619933.05 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 4.41 | 10.55 | 67.50 |
| | 2 | 695310.48 | 695310.48 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 22.63 | 33.31 | 695310.48 | 695310.48 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.75 | 10.73 | 67.78 |
| | 3 | 742773.94 | 742773.94 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 76.53 | 168.35 | 742768.37 | 742773.94 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 9.30 | 106.41 | 36.79 |
| | 4 | 714789.17 | 714789.17 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 52.08 | 100.03 | 714789.17 | 714789.17 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 6.11 | 46.11 | 53.90 |
| | 5 | 1070532.37 | 1070634.37 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 24.11 | 26.28 | 1070634.37 | 1070634.37 | 0.00% | 10.50 | 12.18 | 53.64 |
| | 6 | 694432.32 | 694432.32 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 14.72 | 19.49 | 694432.32 | 694432.32 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.62 | 7.62 | 60.88 |
| | 7 | 690024.48 | 690024.48 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 24.45 | 62.59 | 690024.48 | 690024.48 | 0.00% | 3.75 | 39.79 | 36.42 |
| | 8 | 1038152.80 | 1038152.80 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 6.83 | 7.81 | 1038152.80 | 1038152.80 | 0.00% | 2.58 | 3.43 | 56.04 |
| | 9 | 579901.84 | 579901.84 | 0.00% | 26.44 | 35.23 | 579901.84 | 579901.84 | 0.00% | 2.44 | 10.09 | 71.36 |
| % | 10 | 640656.28 | 640656.28 | 0.00% | 23.50 | 72.50 | 640656.28 | 640656.28 | 0.00% | 3.34 | 41.22 | 43.15 |
| 10 | 11 | 988649.24 | 988649.24 | 0.00% | 15.52 | 20.12 | 988649.24 | 988649.24 | 0.00% | 3.69 | 7.51 | 62.67 |
| | 12 | 827287.49 | 827287.49 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 5.14 | 6.05 | 827287.49 | 827287.49 | 0.00% | 2.02 | 2.80 | 53.70 |
| | 13 | 739088.86 | 739088.86 | 0.00% | 7.88 | 8.81 | 739088.86 | 739088.86 | 0.00% | 3.80 | 4.66 | 47.11 |

| | 14 | 670643.47 | 670643.47 | 0.00% | 12.70 | 14.86 | 670643.47 | 670643.47 | 0.00% | 3.45 | 5.41 | 63.6 |
|----|----|------------|------------|-----------------------|-------|--------|------------|------------|-----------------------|-------|-------|-------|
| | 15 | 1238509.64 | 1238509.64 | 0.00% | 2.25 | 2.75 | 1238443.52 | 1238509.64 | 0.00% | 1.26 | 2.01 | 26.9 |
| | 16 | 720434.37 | 720434.37 | 0.00% | 20.94 | 39.01 | 720434.37 | 720434.37 | 0.00% | 3.03 | 11.75 | 69.8 |
| | 17 | 1043762.48 | 1043762.48 | 0.00% | 4.69 | 8.83 | 1043762.48 | 1043762.48 | 0.00% | 1.97 | 6.09 | 30.9 |
| | 18 | 766676.68 | 766676.68 | 0.00% | 3.34 | 4.20 | 766676.68 | 766676.68 | 0.00% | 1.84 | 2.31 | 44.9 |
| | 19 | 779971.38 | 779971.38 | 0.00% | 7.78 | 9.66 | 779971.38 | 779971.38 | 0.00% | 2.65 | 5.58 | 42.1 |
| | 20 | 889538.73 | 889538.73 | 0.00% | 9.36 | 20.36 | 889538.73 | 889538.73 | 0.00% | 4.04 | 28.22 | -38.6 |
| | 1 | 646571.06 | 646571.06 | 0.00% | 24.72 | 35.86 | 646571.06 | 646571.06 | 0.00% | 4.64 | 11.89 | 66.8 |
| | 2 | 722498.01 | 722498.01 | 0.00% | 17.84 | 26.35 | 722498.01 | 722498.01 | 0.00% | 3.31 | 9.78 | 62.8 |
| | 3 | 772941.93 | 772941.93 | 0.00% | 63.80 | 200.29 | 772941.93 | 772941.93 | 0.00% | 9.05 | 83.36 | 58.3 |
| | 4 | 752967.21 | 752967.21 | 0.00% | 45.75 | 100.00 | 752967.21 | 752967.21 | 0.00% | 5.81 | 59.19 | 40.8 |
| | 5 | 1114189.46 | 1114250.80 | 0.00% | 20.39 | 22.66 | 1114250.80 | 1114250.80 | 0.00% | 10.75 | 13.41 | 40.8 |
| | 6 | 725517.08 | 725517.08 | 0.00% | 18.01 | 23.47 | 725517.08 | 725517.08 | 0.00% | 3.72 | 8.38 | 64.3 |
| | 7 | 718196.92 | 718196.92 | 0.00% | 17.60 | 40.82 | 718196.92 | 718196.92 | 0.00% | 4.11 | 24.19 | 40.7 |
| | 8 | 1068994.83 | 1068994.83 | 0.00% | 7.17 | 8.01 | 1068994.83 | 1068994.83 | 0.00% | 2.58 | 3.52 | 56.0 |
| | 9 | 597573.37 | 597573.37 | 0.00% | 30.19 | 41.66 | 597573.37 | 597573.37 | 0.00% | 2.84 | 12.85 | 69.1 |
| | 10 | 672195.03 | 672195.03 | 0.00% | 21.59 | 64.56 | 672195.03 | 672195.03 | 0.00% | 3.74 | 37.08 | 42.5 |
| 8% | 11 | 1032071.91 | 1032071.91 | 0.00% | 12.59 | 15.42 | 1032071.91 | 1032071.91 | 0.00% | 3.53 | 6.08 | 60.5 |
| | 12 | 856252.82 | 856252.82 | 0.00% | 4.25 | 5.30 | 856252.82 | 856252.82 | 0.00% | 2.04 | 2.92 | 44.9 |
| | 13 | 767976.12 | 767976.12 | 0.00% | 7.95 | 8.91 | 767976.12 | 767976.12 | 0.00% | 3.28 | 4.08 | 54.2 |
| | 14 | 707570.12 | 707570.12 | 0.00% | 10.91 | 12.62 | 707570.12 | 707570.12 | 0.00% | 3.50 | 5.55 | 56.0 |
| | 15 | 1294831.55 | 1294831.55 | 0.00% | 1.88 | 2.30 | 1294831.55 | 1294831.55 | 0.00% | 1.01 | 1.47 | 36.1 |
| | | 748302.27 | 748302.27 | 0.00% | | 28.78 | 748302.27 | 748302.27 | 0.00% | | | 44.1 |
| | 16 | | | | 15.50 | | | | | 3.11 | 16.08 | 9.1 |
| | 17 | 1085315.86 | 1085315.86 | 0.00% | 3.98 | 7.16 | 1085315.86 | 1085315.86 | 0.00% | 2.39 | 6.50 | |
| | 18 | 807511.13 | 807511.13 | 0.00% | 3.20 | 3.98 | 807511.13 | 807511.13 | 0.00% | 2.41 | 3.62 | 9.0 |
| | 19 | 810693.48 | 810693.48 | 0.00% | 3.09 | 3.69 | 810693.48 | 810693.48 | 0.00% | 2.06 | 3.56 | 3.3 |
| | 20 | 925420.40 | 925420.40 | 0.00% | 8.41 | 17.14 | 925420.40 | 925420.40 | 0.00% | 2.85 | 12.40 | 27.0 |
| | 1 | 675275.91 | 675275.91 | 0.00% | 15.27 | 19.61 | 675275.91 | 675275.91 | 0.00% | 3.55 | 6.25 | 68. |
| | 2 | 749685.54 | 749685.54 | 0.00% | 11.66 | 16.45 | 749685.54 | 749685.54 | 0.00% | 3.80 | 8.56 | 47. |
| | 3 | 802967.97 | 802967.97 | 0.00% | 38.14 | 111.58 | 802967.97 | 802967.97 | 0.00% | 7.97 | 80.80 | 27.5 |
| | 4 | 791145.24 | 791145.24 | 0.00% | 49.62 | 102.06 | 791145.24 | 791145.24 | 0.00% | 5.98 | 46.46 | 54.4 |
| | 5 | 1157937.93 | 1157990.50 | 0.00% | 18.08 | 20.08 | 1157990.50 | 1157990.50 | 0.00% | 5.86 | 8.47 | 57.8 |
| | 6 | 763981.56 | 763981.56 | 0.00% | 10.20 | 12.38 | 763981.56 | 763981.56 | 0.00% | 2.90 | 4.53 | 63. |
| | 7 | 747966.81 | 747966.81 | 0.00% | 12.89 | 23.88 | 747966.81 | 747966.81 | 0.00% | 3.95 | 12.20 | 48.9 |
| | 8 | 1099836.85 | 1099836.85 | 0.00% | 5.39 | 5.86 | 1099836.85 | 1099836.85 | 0.00% | 2.55 | 2.97 | 49. |
| | 9 | 615244.91 | 615244.91 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 24.92 | 38.33 | 615244.91 | 615244.91 | 0.00% | 2.80 | 9.73 | 74. |
| 9% | 10 | 705715.08 | 705715.08 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 27.47 | 84.36 | 705715.08 | 705715.08 | 0.00% | 3.94 | 48.96 | 41.9 |
| | 11 | 1075494.57 | 1075494.57 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 11.78 | 14.13 | 1075494.57 | 1075494.57 | 0.00% | 4.46 | 6.42 | 54.5 |
| | 12 | 885578.04 | 885578.04 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 4.48 | 5.28 | 885578.04 | 885578.04 | 0.00% | 2.11 | 3.69 | 30.1 |
| | 13 | 796892.83 | 796892.83 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 9.16 | 10.08 | 796892.83 | 796892.83 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.73 | 4.73 | 53.0 |
| | 14 | 737231.88 | 737231.88 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 15.03 | 18.42 | 737205.23 | 737231.88 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.92 | 7.22 | 60.8 |
| | 15 | 1351524.21 | 1351524.21 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 1.81 | 2.72 | 1351524.21 | 1351524.21 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 0.97 | 1.89 | 30.4 |
| | 16 | 779567.46 | 779567.46 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 22.70 | 41.77 | 779567.46 | 779567.46 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 6.41 | 28.96 | 30.0 |
| | 17 | 1126869.24 | 1126869.24 | 0.00% | 6.22 | 9.13 | 1126869.24 | 1126869.24 | 0.00% | 2.09 | 6.56 | 28. |
| | 18 | 848345.57 | 848345.57 | 0.00% | 4.61 | 5.47 | 848345.57 | 848345.57 | 0.00% | 1.92 | 2.42 | 55.0 |
| | 19 | 842806.52 | 842806.52 | 0.00% | 5.20 | 6.03 | 842806.52 | 842806.52 | 0.00% | 2.88 | 3.72 | 38 |
| | 20 | 961151.07 | 961151.07 | 0.00% | 11.59 | 26.14 | 961151.07 | 961151.07 | 0.00% | 2.72 | 19.84 | 24.0 |
| | 1 | 703980.76 | 703980.76 | 0.00% | 17.66 | 21.51 | 703980.76 | 703980.76 | 0.00% | 3.92 | 7.99 | 62.8 |
| | 2 | 776950.21 | 776950.21 | 0.00% | 13.19 | 16.81 | 776950.21 | 776950.21 | 0.00% | 3.29 | 7.60 | 54.8 |
| | 3 | 833493.72 | 833493.72 | 0.00% | 39.68 | 110.00 | 833493.72 | 833493.72 | 0.00% | 7.37 | 59.30 | 46.1 |
| | 4 | 829323.27 | 829323.27 | 0.00% | 44.56 | 93.33 | 829323.27 | 829323.27 | 0.00% | 6.34 | 58.18 | 37.0 |
| | 5 | 1201686.40 | 1201738.89 | 0.00% | 13.33 | 15.47 | 1201738.89 | 1201738.89 | 0.00% | 5.23 | 7.48 | 51.0 |
| | 6 | 808530.46 | 808530.46 | 0.00% | 9.10 | 11.02 | 808530.46 | 808530.46 | 0.00% | 2.23 | 3.62 | 67.1 |
| | 7 | 779246.50 | 779246.50 | 0.00% | 10.08 | 21.11 | 779246.50 | 779246.50 | 0.00% | 3.48 | 11.56 | 45.2 |
| | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | 8 | 1132996.87 | 1132996.87 | 0.00% | 3.83 | 4.25 | 1132996.87 | 1132996.87 | 0.00% | 4.05 | 5.13 | -20. |
| | 9 | 632916.45 | 632916.45 | 0.00% | 25.19 | 36.42 | 632916.45 | 632916.45 | 0.00% | 2.75 | 10.19 | 72.0 |
| | 10 | 740250.45 | 740250.45 | 0.00% | 16.14 | 32.50 | 740250.45 | 740250.45 | 0.00% | 3.92 | 22.88 | 29.6 |

| 11 | 1118921.31 | 1118921.31 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 11.11 | 12.94 | 1118921.31 | 1118921.31 | 0.00% | 3.55 | 5.00 | 61.36% |
|----|------------|------------|-----------------------|-------|-------|------------|------------|-----------------------|------|-------|--------|
| 12 | 914999.18 | 914999.18 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.24 | 4.00 | 914999.18 | 914999.18 | 0.00% | 1.81 | 2.22 | 44.58% |
| 13 | 825875.13 | 825875.13 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 7.88 | 8.63 | 825875.13 | 825875.13 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.13 | 3.72 | 56.87% |
| 14 | 772556.56 | 772556.56 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 9.16 | 11.04 | 772556.56 | 772556.56 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.04 | 4.73 | 57.13% |
| 15 | 1410771.70 | 1410771.70 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 1.74 | 2.75 | 1410771.70 | 1410771.70 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 1.50 | 2.61 | 5.34% |
| 16 | 811068.14 | 811068.14 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 26.67 | 65.50 | 811068.14 | 811068.14 | 0.00% | 4.63 | 31.66 | 51.66% |
| 17 | 1168422.61 | 1168422.61 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 4.05 | 5.77 | 1168422.61 | 1168422.61 | 0.00% | 1.75 | 2.88 | 50.06% |
| 18 | 889180.02 | 889180.02 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.24 | 3.80 | 889180.02 | 889180.02 | 0.00% | 1.90 | 2.61 | 31.35% |
| 19 | 875356.36 | 875356.36 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 6.27 | 7.88 | 875356.36 | 875356.36 | 0.00% | 2.49 | 3.74 | 52.57% |
| 20 | 997032.74 | 997032.74 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 15.11 | 38.80 | 997032.74 | 997032.74 | 0.00% | 3.38 | 21.27 | 45.17% |

Table 9: Comparison results when $|\mathbb{M}^s|=3,\,K=15,\,\Gamma_D=8,$ and $\Gamma_R=20$

| | | | C | G | | | | OA | -CG | | | |
|----|----------|-------------|-------------------------|-------------|-------|--------|------------|------------|-------|------|--------|-----------------|
| ε | Instance | L^{C} | U^C | G^C | Tin | ne (s) | | 7.7 | C | Tin | ne (s) | \mathcal{P}_T |
| | | L° | U° | G° | RP | Total | L | U | G | RP | Total | - |
| | 1 | 632093.35 | 632093.35 | 0.00% | 22.17 | 39.39 | 632093.35 | 632093.35 | 0.00% | 3.88 | 16.44 | 58.27% |
| | 2 | 703307.42 | 703307.42 | 0.00% | 10.38 | 13.48 | 703307.42 | 703307.42 | 0.00% | 2.90 | 4.96 | 63.18% |
| | 3 | 766607.07 | 766607.07 | 0.00% | 47.03 | 205.16 | 766607.07 | 766607.07 | 0.00% | 9.45 | 202.64 | 1.23% |
| | 4 | 730402.91 | 730402.91 | 0.00% | 18.89 | 45.51 | 730402.91 | 730402.91 | 0.00% | 4.39 | 31.89 | 29.92% |
| | 5 | 1087521.25 | 1087521.25 | 0.00% | 9.11 | 10.31 | 1087521.25 | 1087521.25 | 0.00% | 5.45 | 6.69 | 35.18% |
| | 6 | 691261.51 | 691261.51 | 0.00% | 11.51 | 15.55 | 691261.51 | 691261.51 | 0.00% | 3.19 | 6.70 | 56.87% |
| | 7 | 675992.48 | 675992.48 | 0.00% | 8.25 | 15.63 | 675992.48 | 675992.48 | 0.00% | 2.22 | 9.59 | 38.61% |
| | 8 | 993994.06 | 993994.06 | 0.00% | 3.11 | 3.50 | 993994.06 | 993994.06 | 0.00% | 2.56 | 2.99 | 14.68% |
| | 9 | 574246.39 | 574246.39 | 0.00% | 11.69 | 18.52 | 574246.39 | 574246.39 | 0.00% | 2.36 | 12.75 | 31.13% |
| | 10 | 627110.16 | 627110.16 | 0.00% | 10.84 | 35.89 | 627110.16 | 627110.16 | 0.00% | 1.55 | 11.83 | 67.03% |
| 5% | 11 | 983791.69 | 983791.69 | 0.00% | 9.52 | 17.96 | 983791.69 | 983791.69 | 0.00% | 3.89 | 13.67 | 23.87% |
| | 12 | 805465.50 | 805465.50 | 0.00% | 3.14 | 4.77 | 805465.50 | 805465.50 | 0.00% | 1.57 | 3.49 | 26.81% |
| | 13 | 742056.57 | 742056.57 | 0.00% | 14.13 | 16.39 | 742056.57 | 742056.57 | 0.00% | 4.02 | 7.85 | 52.14% |
| | 14 | 662581.21 | 662581.21 | 0.00% | 13.08 | 14.61 | 662581.21 | 662581.21 | 0.00% | 3.53 | 5.30 | 63.72% |
| | 15 | 1206078.44 | 1206078.44 | 0.00% | 0.87 | 1.39 | 1206078.44 | 1206078.44 | 0.00% | 0.86 | 1.35 | 3.10% |
| | 16 | 715396.45 | 715396.45 | 0.00% | 13.86 | 30.28 | 715396.45 | 715396.45 | 0.00% | 3.35 | 21.88 | 27.75% |
| | 17 | 1024215.41 | 1024215.41 | 0.00% | 2.20 | 5.81 | 1024215.41 | 1024215.41 | 0.00% | 1.30 | 5.25 | 9.74% |
| | 18 | 733132.48 | 733132.48 | 0.00% | 1.14 | 1.59 | 733132.48 | 733132.48 | 0.00% | 1.10 | 1.97 | -23.73% |
| | 19 | 762999.21 | 762999.21 | 0.00% | 4.59 | 5.86 | 762999.21 | 762999.21 | 0.00% | 2.03 | 3.33 | 43.18% |
| | 20 | 891891.36 | 891891.36 | 0.00% | 6.48 | 38.03 | 891891.36 | 891891.36 | 0.00% | 2.83 | 36.22 | 4.76% |
| | 1 | 664693.04 | 664706.54 | 0.00% | 20.33 | 40.16 | 664706.54 | 664706.54 | 0.00% | 4.33 | 23.92 | 40.44% |
| | 2 | 737251.31 | 737277.84 | 0.00% | 10.49 | 15.47 | 737277.84 | 737277.84 | 0.00% | 3.33 | 12.24 | 20.91% |
| | 3 | 803304.28 | 803304.28 | 0.00% | 48.17 | 246.05 | 803304.28 | 803304.28 | 0.00% | 9.80 | 174.14 | 29.22% |
| | 4 | 777411.22 | 777411.22 | 0.00% | 16.34 | 42.16 | 777411.22 | 777411.22 | 0.00% | 3.95 | 20.56 | 51.24% |
| | 5 | 1137855.77 | 1137855.77 | 0.00% | 7.33 | 8.47 | 1137855.77 | 1137855.77 | 0.00% | 3.67 | 5.25 | 38.00% |
| | 6 | 727028.47 | 727028.47 | 0.00% | 15.16 | 21.00 | 727028.47 | 727028.47 | 0.00% | 3.11 | 6.61 | 68.53% |
| | 7 | 708830.31 | 708830.31 | 0.00% | 9.47 | 26.39 | 708830.31 | 708830.31 | 0.00% | 2.90 | 15.61 | 40.87% |
| | 8 | 1030626.00 | 1030626.00 | 0.00% | 2.63 | 3.05 | 1030626.00 | 1030626.00 | 0.00% | 1.89 | 2.26 | 25.80% |
| | 9 | 595618.95 | 595618.95 | 0.00% | 11.44 | 18.69 | 595618.95 | 595618.95 | 0.00% | 2.51 | 7.90 | 57.71% |
| | 10 | 665308.72 | 665308.72 | 0.00% | 6.85 | 18.57 | 665308.72 | 665308.72 | 0.00% | 2.26 | 11.13 | 40.06% |
| 6% | 11 | 1034795.77 | 1034795.77 | 0.00% | 10.28 | 19.50 | 1034795.77 | 1034795.77 | 0.00% | 3.70 | 9.35 | 52.08% |
| | 12 | 838120.98 | 838120.98 | 0.00% | 4.09 | 5.63 | 838120.98 | 838120.98 | 0.00% | 1.81 | 3.87 | 31.16% |
| | 13 | 777329.04 | 777329.04 | 0.00% | 9.50 | 10.88 | 777288.25 | 777329.04 | 0.00% | 3.32 | 4.55 | 58.16% |
| | 13 | 695246.75 | | 0.00% | 13.36 | 14.80 | 695246.75 | 695246.75 | 0.00% | 2.83 | 3.94 | 73.37% |
| | 15 | 1270479.65 | 695246.75 1270479.65 | 0.00% | 0.73 | 1.16 | 1270479.65 | 1270479.65 | 0.00% | 0.87 | 1.30 | -12.72% |
| | 16 | 749089.08 | 749089.08 | 0.00% | 16.02 | 35.38 | 749089.08 | 749089.08 | 0.00% | 3.99 | 18.17 | 48.63% |
| | 17 | 1072530.73 | 1072530.73 | 0.00% | 2.53 | 6.88 | 1072530.73 | 1072530.73 | 0.00% | 1.68 | 5.27 | 23.40% |
| | 18 | 779702.39 | 779702.39 | 0.00% | 2.33 | 3.80 | 779702.39 | 779702.39 | 0.00% | | 2.69 | 29.16% |
| | 19 | 799058.07 | 799058.07 | 0.00% | 5.72 | 7.05 | 799058.07 | 799058.07 | 0.00% | 1.66 | | |
| | | | | | | | | | 0.00% | 1.98 | 3.06 | 56.56% |
| | 20 | 933653.08 | 933653.08 | 0.00% | 7.16 | 42.66 | 933653.08 | 933653.08 | | 3.00 | 27.42 | 35.73% |
| | 1 | 699880.47 | 699880.47 | 0.00% | 19.25 | 33.85 | 699880.47 | 699880.47 | 0.00% | 3.88 | 19.23 | 43.17% |
| | 2 | 771510.18 | 771543.81 | 0.00% | 9.56 | 14.47 | 771543.81 | 771543.81 | 0.00% | 2.54 | 9.86 | 31.84% |
| | 3 | 840035.23 | 840035.23 | 0.00% | 53.11 | 261.25 | 840035.23 | 840035.23 | 0.00% | 8.24 | 99.03 | 62.09% |
| | 4 | 824835.22 | 824835.22 | 0.00% | 15.98 | 48.37 | 824835.22 | 824835.22 | 0.00% | 4.41 | 41.91 | 13.36% |
| | 5 | 1189989.05 | 1190021.68 | 0.00% | 7.50 | 9.28 | 1190021.68 | 1190021.68 | 0.00% | 5.31 | 8.85 | 4.69% |
| | 6 | 762795.43 | 762795.43 | 0.00% | 10.91 | 15.39 | 762795.43 | 762795.43 | 0.00% | 3.79 | 8.15 | 47.03% |
| | 7 | 741788.50 | 741788.50 | 0.00% | 8.52 | 24.25 | 741788.50 | 741788.50 | 0.00% | 2.58 | 21.53 | 11.22% |
| | 8 | 1067316.09 | 1067316.09 | 0.00% | 2.91 | 3.39 | 1067316.09 | 1067316.09 | 0.00% | 2.21 | 2.64 | 22.24% |
| | 9 | 617095.33 | 617095.33 | 0.00% | 12.13 | 20.41 | 617095.33 | 617095.33 | 0.00% | 2.46 | 13.55 | 33.61% |
| 7% | 10 | 703527.85 | 703578.82 | 0.00% | 6.39 | 20.32 | 703527.85 | 703527.85 | 0.00% | 1.89 | 13.96 | 31.26% |
| | 11 | 1088555.47 | 1088555.47 | 0.00% | 8.69 | 15.95 | 1088555.47 | 1088555.47 | 0.00% | 3.96 | 11.06 | 30.66% |
| | 12 | 870776.45 | 870776.45 | 0.00% | 2.02 | 2.55 | 870767.31 | 870776.45 | 0.00% | 2.31 | 3.01 | -18.31% |
| | 13 | 812855.07 | 812855.07 | 0.00% | 8.37 | 9.95 | 812855.07 | 812855.07 | 0.00% | 3.66 | 5.41 | 45.64% |

| | 14 | 736652.39 | 736652.39 | 0.00% | 5.66 | 6.11 | 736652.39 | 736652.39 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.91 | 3.41 | 44.21% |
|------|----------|-------------------------|-------------------------|-------|--------------|---------------|-------------------------|------------|-----------------------|--------------|--------------|-------------------|
| | 15 | 1334952.40 | 1334952.40 | 0.00% | 0.70 | 1.22 | 1334952.40 | 1334952.40 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 0.74 | 1.25 | -2.54% |
| | 16 | 784547.63 | 784547.63 | 0.00% | 15.88 | 39.94 | 784547.63 | 784547.63 | 0.00% | 4.41 | 32.13 | 19.55% |
| | 17 | 1121191.44 | 1121191.44 | 0.00% | 2.05 | 3.78 | 1121191.44 | 1121191.44 | 0.00% | 1.24 | 3.19 | 15.60% |
| | 18 | 828234.81 | 828234.81 | 0.00% | 2.14 | 2.91 | 828234.81 | 828234.81 | 0.00% | 1.27 | 2.23 | 23.15% |
| | 19 | 835116.94 | 835116.94 | 0.00% | 6.05 | 8.20 | 835116.94 | 835116.94 | 0.00% | 3.08 | 3.87 | 52.78% |
| | 20 | 975414.81 | 975414.81 | 0.00% | 5.86 | 30.69 | 975414.81 | 975414.81 | 0.00% | 2.29 | 30.95 | -0.85% |
| | 1 | 735156.39 | 735156.39 | 0.00% | 21.91 | 41.38 | 735156.39 | 735156.39 | 0.00% | 5.43 | 29.31 | 29.17% |
| | 2 | 805844.56 | 805888.82 | 0.00% | 8.55 | 12.98 | 805888.82 | 805888.82 | 0.00% | 2.11 | 9.54 | 26.48% |
| | 3 | 878610.82 | 878610.82 | 0.00% | 49.64 | 299.41 | 878610.82 | 878610.82 | 0.00% | 7.22 | 170.75 | 42.97% |
| | 4 | 872889.43 | 872889.43 | 0.00% | 15.19 | 57.67 | 872889.43 | 872889.43 | 0.00% | 4.28 | 51.93 | 9.95% |
| | 5 | 1243068.06 | 1243168.06 | 0.00% | 7.88 | 9.60 | 1243168.06 | 1243168.06 | 0.00% | 4.63 | 7.90 | 17.68% |
| | 6 | 804764.55 | 804764.55 | 0.00% | 12.89 | 18.69 | 804764.55 | 804764.55 | 0.00% | 3.64 | 7.72 | 58.67% |
| | 7 | 775907.48 | 775907.48 | 0.00% | 10.75 | 27.47 | 775907.48 | 775907.48 | 0.00% | 4.09 | 23.43 | 14.70% |
| | 8 | 1104222.12 | 1104222,12 | 0.00% | 2.63 | 2.97 | 1104222.12 | 1104222.12 | 0.00% | 2.33 | 2.81 | 5.39% |
| | 9 | 638571.72 | 638571.72 | 0.00% | 11.46 | 20.41 | 638571.72 | 638571.72 | 0.00% | 2.89 | 16.91 | 17.13% |
| | 10 | 745273.11 | 745273.11 | 0.00% | 5.76 | 14.47 | 745273.11 | 745273.11 | 0.00% | 1.75 | 13.37 | 7.56% |
| 8% | 11 | 1144330.91 | 1144330.91 | 0.00% | 5.72 | 10.33 | 1144330.91 | 1144330.91 | 0.00% | 3.85 | 9.66 | 6.48% |
| | 12 | 903944.69 | 903944.69 | 0.00% | 1.44 | 2.00 | 903944.69 | 903944.69 | 0.00% | 1.61 | 2.31 | -15.62% |
| | 13 | 848421.88 | 848421.88 | 0.00% | 7.53 | 8.89 | 848421.88 | 848421.88 | 0.00% | 3.70 | 5.63 | 36.72% |
| | 14 | 777624.00 | 777624.00 | 0.00% | 7.77 | 8.58 | 777624.00 | 777624.00 | 0.00% | 10.92 | 12.55 | -46.30% |
| | 15 | 1399499.53 | 1399499.53 | 0.00% | 1.77 | 2.95 | 1399499.53 | 1399499.53 | 0.00% | 0.99 | 2.47 | 16.42% |
| | 16 | 823963.72 | 823963.72 | 0.00% | 14.75 | 42.99 | 823963.72 | 823963.72 | 0.00% | 4.34 | 41.87 | 2.59% |
| | 17 | 1169852.15 | 1169852.15 | 0.00% | 1.45 | 3.00 | 1169852.15 | 1169852.15 | 0.00% | 1.11 | 2.94 | 2.17% |
| | 18 | 876771.66 | 876771.66 | 0.00% | 1.12 | 1.56 | 876771.66 | 876771.66 | 0.00% | 0.94 | 1.59 | -1.92% |
| | 19 | 871970.87 | 871970.87 | 0.00% | 3.81 | 4.52 | 871970.87 | 871970.87 | 0.00% | 2.36 | 3.22 | 28.66% |
| | 20 | 1019301.78 | 1019301.78 | 0.00% | 4.20 | 35.39 | 1019301.78 | 1019301.78 | 0.00% | 3.09 | 32.71 | 7.57% |
| | 1 | 769863.04 | 769863.04 | 0.00% | 18.28 | 42.75 | 769863.04 | 769863.04 | 0.00% | 4.59 | 22.31 | 47.82% |
| | 2 | 840178.94 | 840233.83 | 0.00% | 9.30 | 13.34 | 840233.83 | 840233.83 | 0.00% | 2.39 | 6.52 | 51.14% |
| | 3 | 917530.89 | 917530.89 | 0.00% | 37.85 | 157.03 | 917530.89 | 917530.89 | 0.00% | 7.89 | 107.88 | 31.30% |
| | 4 | 921131.81 | 921131.81 | 0.00% | 15.95 | 65.94 | 921131.81 | 921131.81 | 0.00% | 3.75 | 38.17 | 42.11% |
| | 5 | 1296342.50 | 1296342.50 | 0.00% | 13.96 | 18.45 | 1296342.50 | 1296342.50 | 0.00% | 3.91 | 7.16 | 61.22% |
| | 6 | 854249.58 | 854249.58 | 0.00% | 12.19 | 18.09 | 854249.58 | 854249.58 | 0.00% | 2.97 | 6.36 | 64.86% |
| | 7 | 810381.64 | 810381.64 | 0.00% | 14.06 | 41.36 | 810381.64 | 810381.64 | 0.00% | 4.45 | 25.81 | 37.60% |
| | 8 | 1141128.15 | 1141128.15 | 0.00% | 3.22 | 3.61 | 1141128.15 | 1141128.15 | 0.00% | 1.96 | 2.34 | 35.22% |
| | 9 | 660048.10 | 660048.10 | 0.00% | 11.67 | 19.08 | 660048.10 | 660048.10 | 0.00% | 3.52 | 17.23 | 9.70% |
| | 10 | 793424.60 | 793424.60 | 0.00% | 7.41 | 25.17 | 793424.60 | 793424.60 | 0.00% | 3.77 | 38.91 | -54.54% |
| 9% | | | 1200106.35 | 0.00% | | | | 1200106.35 | | | | -34.34% 43.03% |
| | 11 12 | 1200106.35 937122.07 | 937122.07 | 0.00% | 8.59 1.56 | 15.03 2.05 | 1200106.35 937122.07 | 937122.07 | 0.00% 0.00% | 3.47 1.33 | 8.56 1.81 | 11.49% |
| | 13 | 883988.70 | | | 8.27 | 9.74 | 883988.70 | | 0.00% | 3.16 | | 53.70% |
| | 13 | | 883988.70 818501.96 | 0.00% | | | | 883988.70 | | | 4.51 | 44.59% |
| | 15 | 818501.96 | | 0.00% | 9.59 | 11.15 2.74 | 818501.96 | 818501.96 | 0.00% | 4.94 | 6.18 | |
| | | 1459621.85 | 1459621.85 859882.30 | 0.00% | 1.56 | | 1459558.75 | 1459621.85 | 0.00% | 1.25 | 2.33 | 14.88% |
| | 16 | 859882.30 | | 0.00% | 15.75 | 59.42 | 859882.30 | 859882.30 | 0.00% | 4.16 | 40.23 | 32.29% |
| | 17 | 1218512.86 | 1218512.86 | 0.00% | 1.50 | 2.73 | 1218512.86 | 1218512.86 | 0.00% | 1.44 | 2.67 | 2.23% |
| | 18 | 925331.04 | 925331.04 | 0.00% | 1.17 | 1.60 | 925331.04 | 925331.04 | 0.00% | 0.92 | 1.30 | 18.62% |
| | 19 | 909759.10 | 909759.10 | 0.00% | 4.98 | 7.22 | 909683.27 | 909759.10 | 0.00% | 2.57 | 3.79 | 47.53% |
| | 20 | 1063401.89 | 1063401.89 | 0.00% | 4.83 | 40.22 | 1063401.89 | 1063401.89 | 0.00% | 3.27 | 43.24 | -7.49% |
| | 1 | 807256.35 | 807256.35 | 0.00% | 16.81 | 38.22 | 807256.35 | 807256.35 | 0.00% | 4.38 | 17.86 | 53.26% |
| | 2 | 874578.84 | 874578.84 | 0.00% | 10.22 | 14.94 | 874578.84 | 874578.84 | 0.00% | 2.27 | 5.53 | 62.99% |
| | 3 | 956722.40 | 956730.99 | 0.00% | 34.69 | 195.61 | 956730.99 | 956730.99 | 0.00% | 7.70 | 100.59 | 48.58% |
| | 4 | 969378.66 | 969378.66 | 0.00% | 12.59 | 62.97 | 969378.66 | 969378.66 | 0.00% | 3.79 | 40.49 | 35.69% |
| | 5 | 1349536.40 | 1349536.40 | 0.00% | 10.50 | 14.95 | 1349536.40 | 1349536.40 | 0.00% | 3.80 | 7.35 | 50.86% |
| | 6 | 904138.73 | 904138.73 | 0.00% | 7.58 | 10.48 | 904138.73 | 904138.73 | 0.00% | 2.56 | 3.97 | 62.18% |
| | 7 | 843822.85 | 843822.85 | 0.00% | 11.25 | 32.11 | 843814.06 | 843822.85 | 0.00% | 2.85 | 15.74 | 50.98% |
| | 8 | 1178034.17 | 1178034.17 | 0.00% | 2.53 | 2.94 | 1178034.17 | 1178034.17 | 0.00% | 1.85 | 2.19 | 25.33% |
| | 9 | 681524.49 | 681524.49 | 0.00% | 13.92 | 23.11 | 681524.49 | 681524.49 | 0.00% | 3.17 | 14.66 | 36.57% |
| 10% | 10 | 836571.96 | 836571.96 | 0.00% | 10.19 | 51.30 | 836571.96 | 836571.96 | 0.00% | 2.65 | 21.86 | 57.40% |
| 1070 | | | | | | | | | | | | |

| 11 | 1256749.75 | 1256749.75 | 0.00% | 9.16 | 17.75 | 1256749.75 | 1256749.75 | 0.00% | 3.59 | 11.03 | 37.86% |
|----|------------|------------|-------|------|-------|------------|------------|-------|------|-------|---------|
| 12 | 970299.44 | 970299.44 | 0.00% | 1.63 | 2.05 | 970299.44 | 970299.44 | 0.00% | 1.15 | 1.51 | 26.09% |
| 13 | 919555.51 | 919555.51 | 0.00% | 7.47 | 8.91 | 919555.51 | 919555.51 | 0.00% | 3.08 | 4.37 | 50.90% |
| 14 | 859454.79 | 859454.79 | 0.00% | 6.47 | 7.83 | 859454.79 | 859454.79 | 0.00% | 3.64 | 5.01 | 36.09% |
| 15 | 1515207.78 | 1515207.78 | 0.00% | 1.58 | 3.44 | 1515061.26 | 1515207.78 | 0.00% | 1.32 | 2.96 | 13.94% |
| 16 | 894929.13 | 894929.13 | 0.00% | 7.92 | 21.42 | 894929.13 | 894929.13 | 0.00% | 3.00 | 15.22 | 28.93% |
| 17 | 1268329.71 | 1268329.71 | 0.00% | 1.38 | 3.88 | 1268329.71 | 1268329.71 | 0.00% | 1.45 | 3.59 | 7.28% |
| 18 | 973890.41 | 973890.41 | 0.00% | 1.42 | 1.89 | 973890.41 | 973890.41 | 0.00% | 0.95 | 1.37 | 27.53% |
| 19 | 948167.11 | 948187.49 | 0.00% | 4.72 | 5.88 | 948187.49 | 948187.49 | 0.00% | 2.15 | 4.43 | 24.54% |
| 20 | 1107444.42 | 1107502.01 | 0.00% | 4.40 | 37.77 | 1107502.01 | 1107502.01 | 0.00% | 3.17 | 46.54 | -23.25% |

Table 10: Comparison results when $|\mathbb{M}^s|=3,\,K=20,\,\Gamma_D=4,$ and $\Gamma_R=10$

| | Instance | | | G | | | | OA- | CG | | | |
|-----|----------|------------|------------|-------|-------|-------|------------|------------|-----------------------|-------|-------|-----------------|
| ε | Instance | L^C | U^C | G^C | | e (s) | L | U | G | | e (s) | \mathcal{P}_T |
| | | | | | RP | Total | | | | RP | Total | |
| | 1 | 721274.47 | 721274.47 | 0.00% | 14.95 | 17.64 | 721274.47 | 721274.47 | 0.00% | 3.42 | 5.52 | 68.72 |
| | 2 | 777358.67 | 777358.67 | 0.00% | 14.58 | 17.50 | 777358.67 | 777358.67 | 0.00% | 2.91 | 4.93 | 71.86 |
| | 3 | 660255.03 | 660255.03 | 0.00% | 38.75 | 41.39 | 660255.03 | 660255.03 | 0.00% | 6.55 | 9.31 | 77.50 |
| | 4 | 717360.88 | 717360.88 | 0.00% | 10.95 | 15.83 | 717360.88 | 717360.88 | 0.00% | 4.99 | 15.14 | 4.32 |
| | 5 | 1044880.25 | 1044880.25 | 0.00% | 0.77 | 1.00 | 1044880.25 | 1044880.25 | 0.00% | 0.64 | 0.82 | 17.60 |
| | 6 | 750712.28 | 750712.28 | 0.00% | 5.28 | 5.74 | 750712.28 | 750712.28 | 0.00% | 2.58 | 2.93 | 49.01 |
| | 7 | 690410.87 | 690410.87 | 0.00% | 5.59 | 8.03 | 690410.87 | 690410.87 | 0.00% | 1.77 | 3.29 | 59.10 |
| | 8 | 1188675.26 | 1188675.26 | 0.00% | 2.69 | 2.84 | 1188675.26 | 1188675.26 | 0.00% | 2.22 | 2.34 | 17.65 |
| | 9 | 1066771.30 | 1066771.30 | 0.00% | 16.23 | 27.37 | 1066771.30 | 1066771.30 | 0.00% | 3.66 | 10.52 | 61.57 |
| % | 10 | 526429.28 | 526429.28 | 0.00% | 7.19 | 7.98 | 526426.28 | 526429.28 | 0.00% | 2.85 | 3.31 | 58.49 |
| | 11 | 784067.97 | 784067.97 | 0.00% | 81.89 | 83.71 | 784067.97 | 784067.97 | 0.00% | 18.65 | 20.56 | 75.4 |
| | 12 | 607588.62 | 607588.62 | 0.00% | 11.02 | 14.17 | 607575.43 | 607588.62 | 0.00% | 2.58 | 4.56 | 67.83 |
| | 13 | 640452.44 | 640452.44 | 0.00% | 28.85 | 30.16 | 640452.44 | 640452.44 | 0.00% | 2.30 | 3.10 | 89.72 |
| | 14 | 748577.11 | 748577.11 | 0.00% | 7.31 | 8.30 | 748577.11 | 748577.11 | 0.00% | 2.30 | 2.99 | 63.98 |
| | 15 | 771370.64 | 771370.64 | 0.00% | 6.74 | 8.92 | 771370.64 | 771370.64 | 0.00% | 2.11 | 3.63 | 59.35 |
| | 16 | 989095.35 | 989095.35 | 0.00% | 4.97 | 7.33 | 989095.35 | 989095.35 | 0.00% | 1.30 | 2.83 | 61.42 |
| | 17 | 653028.31 | 653028.31 | 0.00% | 6.94 | 7.95 | 653028.31 | 653028.31 | 0.00% | 2.35 | 3.07 | 61.45 |
| | 18 | 1321736.50 | 1321736.50 | 0.00% | 6.99 | 8.96 | 1321736.50 | 1321736.50 | 0.00% | 1.97 | 3.44 | 61.61 |
| | 19 | 1019891.47 | 1019891.47 | 0.00% | 3.86 | 6.78 | 1019891.47 | 1019891.47 | 0.00% | 1.95 | 4.15 | 38.77 |
| | 20 | 689273.46 | 689280.86 | 0.00% | 2.80 | 3.34 | 689273.46 | 689273.46 | 0.00% | 1.35 | 1.89 | 43.42 |
| | 1 | 741296.40 | 741296.40 | 0.00% | 17.39 | 20.23 | 741296.40 | 741296.40 | 0.00% | 3.55 | 5.73 | 71.67 |
| | 2 | 802776.72 | 802776.72 | 0.00% | 15.88 | 19.89 | 802776.72 | 802776.72 | 0.00% | 3.44 | 6.36 | 68.02 |
| | 3 | 686570.21 | 686570.21 | 0.00% | 48.80 | 51.70 | 686570.21 | 686570.21 | 0.00% | 7.31 | 11.64 | 77.48 |
| | 4 | 740005.36 | 740005.36 | 0.00% | 10.50 | 15.35 | 740005.36 | 740005.36 | 0.00% | 5.14 | 14.13 | 7.92 |
| | 5 | 1076894.70 | 1076894.70 | 0.00% | 0.70 | 0.92 | 1076894.70 | 1076894.70 | 0.00% | 0.87 | 1.08 | -16.5 |
| | 6 | 784314.38 | 784314.38 | 0.00% | 4.35 | 4.75 | 784314.38 | 784314.38 | 0.00% | 2.31 | 2.62 | 44.79 |
| | 7 | 721570.68 | 721570.68 | 0.00% | 4.59 | 6.03 | 721570.68 | 721570.68 | 0.00% | 1.69 | 3.39 | 43.7 |
| | 8 | 1220614.33 | 1220614.33 | 0.00% | 3.52 | 3.69 | 1220614.33 | 1220614.33 | 0.00% | 2.38 | 2.50 | 32.14 |
| | 9 | 1107380.11 | 1107413.91 | 0.00% | 11.16 | 15.70 | 1107413.91 | 1107413.91 | 0.00% | 3.50 | 8.66 | 44.80 |
| % | 10 | 550086.85 | 550086.85 | 0.00% | 11.92 | 14.17 | 550086.85 | 550086.85 | 0.00% | 2.66 | 3.28 | 76.84 |
| | 11 | 804452.72 | 804452.72 | 0.00% | 92.97 | 94.41 | 804452.72 | 804452.72 | 0.00% | 33.31 | 35.25 | 62.60 |
| | 12 | 624702.15 | 624702.15 | 0.00% | 9.53 | 12.01 | 624702.15 | 624702.15 | 0.00% | 2.55 | 6.13 | 49.0 |
| | 13 | 656505.34 | 656505.34 | 0.00% | 15.52 | 16.48 | 656505.34 | 656505.34 | 0.00% | 2.64 | 3.59 | 78.22 |
| | 14 | 772995.84 | 772995.84 | 0.00% | 5.00 | 5.81 | 772995.84 | 772995.84 | 0.00% | 2.27 | 3.08 | 47.08 |
| | 15 | 799310.12 | 799310.12 | 0.00% | 5.89 | 8.58 | 799310.12 | 799310.12 | 0.00% | 1.88 | 3.50 | 59.19 |
| | 16 | 1023843.91 | 1023843.91 | 0.00% | 3.67 | 5.26 | 1023843.91 | 1023843.91 | 0.00% | 1.10 | 2.72 | 48.29 |
| | 17 | 681679.66 | 681679.66 | 0.00% | 5.58 | 6.35 | 681679.66 | 681679.66 | 0.00% | 2.38 | 4.19 | 33.90 |
| | 18 | 1356660.49 | 1356660.49 | 0.00% | 5.25 | 6.77 | 1356660.49 | 1356660.49 | 0.00% | 2.27 | 4.06 | 39.93 |
| | 19 | 1053407.75 | 1053407.75 | 0.00% | 2.81 | 5.05 | 1053407.75 | 1053407.75 | 0.00% | 1.80 | 4.10 | 18.79 |
| | 20 | 709716.97 | 709716.97 | 0.00% | 1.38 | 1.59 | 709716.97 | 709716.97 | 0.00% | 1.39 | 1.61 | -1.07 |
| | 1 | 761391.76 | 761391.76 | 0.00% | 14.81 | 17.25 | 761391.76 | 761391.76 | 0.00% | 4.81 | 7.00 | 59.43 |
| | 2 | 828194.77 | 828194.77 | 0.00% | 13.27 | 17.14 | 828194.77 | 828194.77 | 0.00% | 3.28 | 6.92 | 59.65 |
| | 3 | 712885.39 | 712885.39 | 0.00% | 31.34 | 34.48 | 712885.39 | 712885.39 | 0.00% | 7.52 | 10.27 | 70.23 |
| | 4 | 762649.83 | 762649.83 | 0.00% | 7.17 | 10.75 | 762649.83 | 762649.83 | 0.00% | 4.16 | 9.89 | 7.99 |
| | 5 | 1108909.15 | 1108909.15 | 0.00% | 0.44 | 0.63 | 1108909.15 | 1108909.15 | 0.00% | 0.78 | 0.98 | -56.3 |
| | 6 | 817916.49 | 817916.49 | 0.00% | 3.56 | 3.86 | 817916.49 | 817916.49 | 0.00% | 2.04 | 2.36 | 38.92 |
| | 7 | 749718.58 | 749718.58 | 0.00% | 3.06 | 4.05 | 749718.58 | 749718.58 | 0.00% | 1.48 | 2.42 | 40.19 |
| | 8 | 1252553.40 | 1252553.40 | 0.00% | 2.47 | 2.59 | 1252553.40 | 1252553.40 | 0.00% | 2.50 | 2.77 | -6.7 |
| | 9 | 1148056.52 | 1148056.52 | 0.00% | 7.00 | 10.63 | 1148056.52 | 1148056.52 | 0.00% | 2.05 | 5.65 | 46.87 |
| % | 10 | 575711.56 | 575711.56 | 0.00% | 7.75 | 9.47 | 575711.56 | 575711.56 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.41 | 3.36 | 64.51 |
| , . | 11 | 824837.47 | 824837.47 | 0.00% | 77.28 | 78.97 | 824837.47 | 824837.47 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 14.33 | 16.30 | 79.30 |
| | 12 | 642328.91 | 642328.91 | 0.00% | 6.69 | 8.99 | 642328.91 | 642328.91 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.57 | 5.73 | 36.26 |
| | 13 | 672558.25 | 672558.25 | 0.00% | 13.20 | 14.12 | 672558.25 | 672558.25 | 0.00% | 2.36 | 3.26 | 76.9 |

| | 14 | 797588.09 | 797588.09 | 0.00% | 4.80 | 5.44 | 797588.09 | 797588.09 | 0.00% | 2.20 | 2.86 | 47.44% |
|------|----|------------|------------|-----------------------|-------|-------|------------|------------|-------|-------|-------|---------|
| | 15 | 828117.69 | 828117.69 | 0.00% | 6.39 | 9.86 | 828117.69 | 828117.69 | 0.00% | 2.22 | 4.53 | 54.02% |
| | 16 | 1057723.40 | 1057723.40 | 0.00% | 2.20 | 3.73 | 1057723.40 | 1057723.40 | 0.00% | 1.38 | 2.92 | 21.69% |
| | 17 | 710331.01 | 710331.01 | 0.00% | 4.78 | 5.53 | 710331.01 | 710331.01 | 0.00% | 2.53 | 3.17 | 42.72% |
| | 18 | 1391584.48 | 1391584.48 | 0.00% | 5.00 | 6.59 | 1391584.48 | 1391584.48 | 0.00% | 2.23 | 3.62 | 45.03% |
| | 19 | 1085771.50 | 1085771.50 | 0.00% | 1.89 | 3.37 | 1085771.50 | 1085771.50 | 0.00% | 1.67 | 3.94 | -16.66% |
| | 20 | 731167.98 | 731167.98 | 0.00% | 1.11 | 1.35 | 731167.98 | 731167.98 | 0.00% | 1.36 | 1.60 | -18.66% |
| | 1 | 781490.26 | 781490.26 | 0.00% | 16.88 | 19.39 | 781490.26 | 781490.26 | 0.00% | 5.16 | 7.25 | 62.60% |
| | 2 | 853612.81 | 853612.81 | 0.00% | 12.56 | 16.25 | 853612.81 | 853612.81 | 0.00% | 3.67 | 7.24 | 55.48% |
| | 3 | 739200.57 | 739200.57 | 0.00% | 28.19 | 31.30 | 739200.57 | 739200.57 | 0.00% | 5.59 | 8.45 | 72.99% |
| | | | 785294.30 | | | | | | | | | |
| | 4 | 785294.30 | | 0.00% | 7.47 | 10.67 | 785294.30 | 785294.30 | 0.00% | 4.56 | 11.14 | -4.36% |
| | 5 | 1140923.60 | 1140923.60 | 0.00% | 0.45 | 0.67 | 1140923.60 | 1140923.60 | 0.00% | 0.66 | 0.86 | -28.27% |
| | 6 | 851844.16 | 851844.16 | 0.00% | 3.05 | 3.34 | 851844.16 | 851844.16 | 0.00% | 2.20 | 2.48 | 25.81% |
| | 7 | 781111.47 | 781111.47 | 0.00% | 2.61 | 3.69 | 781111.47 | 781111.47 | 0.00% | 1.59 | 2.62 | 28.86% |
| | 8 | 1285100.44 | 1285100.44 | 0.00% | 2.44 | 2.59 | 1285100.44 | 1285100.44 | 0.00% | 2.53 | 2.69 | -3.70% |
| | 9 | 1188707.85 | 1188707.85 | 0.00% | 6.67 | 10.23 | 1188707.85 | 1188707.85 | 0.00% | 1.92 | 5.34 | 47.79% |
| 8% | 10 | 601336.28 | 601336.28 | 0.00% | 7.84 | 9.56 | 601336.28 | 601336.28 | 0.00% | 2.14 | 3.20 | 66.51% |
| | 11 | 845246.35 | 845246.35 | 0.00% | 44.59 | 46.51 | 845246.35 | 845246.35 | 0.00% | 28.97 | 30.27 | 34.93% |
| | 12 | 660159.66 | 660159.66 | 0.00% | 7.70 | 9.95 | 660159.58 | 660169.96 | 0.00% | 2.42 | 5.94 | 40.38% |
| | 13 | 688611.15 | 688611.15 | 0.00% | 9.33 | 10.33 | 688611.15 | 688611.15 | 0.00% | 2.67 | 3.70 | 64.17% |
| | 14 | 823307.66 | 823307.66 | 0.00% | 4.56 | 5.30 | 823307.66 | 823307.66 | 0.00% | 2.11 | 2.90 | 45.19% |
| | 15 | 856368.30 | 856368.30 | 0.00% | 4.33 | 6.62 | 856368.30 | 856368.30 | 0.00% | 1.92 | 5.53 | 16.47% |
| | 16 | 1089368.81 | 1089368.81 | 0.00% | 2.25 | 4.05 | 1089368.81 | 1089368.81 | 0.00% | 1.22 | 3.06 | 24.35% |
| | 17 | 738982.35 | 738982.35 | 0.00% | 4.74 | 5.41 | 738982.35 | 738982.35 | 0.00% | 2.26 | 3.62 | 33.10% |
| | 18 | 1426508.47 | 1426508.47 | 0.00% | 5.28 | 6.89 | 1426508.47 | 1426508.47 | 0.00% | 2.19 | 3.95 | 42.63% |
| | 19 | 1115058.65 | 1115058.65 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.31 | 4.84 | 1115058.65 | 1115058.65 | 0.00% | 1.57 | 4.23 | 12.74% |
| | 20 | 752618.98 | 752618.98 | 0.00% | 1.13 | 1.36 | 752618.98 | 752618.98 | 0.00% | 1.26 | 1.51 | -11.32% |
| | 1 | 801588.77 | 801588.77 | 0.00% | 29.23 | 32.08 | 801588.77 | 801588.77 | 0.00% | 10.76 | 12.73 | 60.31% |
| | 2 | 880681.63 | 880681.63 | 0.00% | 7.27 | 8.55 | 880681.63 | 880681.63 | 0.00% | 3.52 | 9.80 | -14.62% |
| | 3 | 765515.75 | 765515.75 | 0.00% | 29.72 | 33.11 | 765515.75 | 765515.75 | 0.00% | 7.37 | 9.43 | 71.51% |
| | 4 | 807938.77 | 807938.77 | 0.00% | 8.83 | 12.78 | 807938.77 | 807938.77 | 0.00% | 4.09 | 10.70 | 16.27% |
| | 5 | 1172938.05 | 1172938.05 | 0.00% | 0.50 | 0.66 | 1172938.05 | 1172938.05 | 0.00% | 0.66 | 0.83 | -26.41% |
| | 6 | 886505.61 | 886505.61 | 0.00% | 3.84 | 4.20 | 886505.61 | 886505.61 | 0.00% | 2.17 | 2.50 | 40.56% |
| | 7 | 812504.36 | 812504.36 | 0.00% | 3.23 | 4.48 | 812504.36 | 812504.36 | 0.00% | 1.48 | 3.17 | 29.24% |
| | 8 | 1319412.48 | 1319412.48 | 0.00% | 2.24 | 2.36 | 1319412.48 | 1319412.48 | 0.00% | 2.14 | 2.30 | 2.63% |
| | 9 | 1229373.97 | 1229373.97 | 0.00% | 10.89 | 15.10 | 1229373.97 | 1229373.97 | 0.00% | 1.81 | 5.57 | 63.08% |
| 0.01 | 10 | 627808.43 | 627808.43 | 0.00% | 11.06 | 13.11 | 627808.43 | 627808.43 | 0.00% | 2.63 | 5.55 | 57.67% |
| 9% | 11 | 865660.42 | 865660.42 | 0.00% | 86.81 | 88.97 | 865660.42 | 865660.42 | 0.00% | 24.05 | 25.43 | 71.41% |
| | 12 | 677990.41 | 677990.41 | 0.00% | 10.92 | 14.27 | 677990.41 | 677990.41 | 0.00% | 2.47 | 5.61 | 60.65% |
| | 13 | 704664.06 | 704664.06 | 0.00% | 12.35 | 13.33 | 704664.06 | 704664.06 | 0.00% | 2.77 | 3.66 | 72.57% |
| | 14 | 849252.06 | 849252.06 | 0.00% | 5.25 | 6.08 | 849252.06 | 849252.06 | 0.00% | 2.16 | 3.00 | 50.63% |
| | 15 | 879133.87 | 879134.59 | 0.00% | 4.87 | 6.39 | 879134.59 | 879134.59 | 0.00% | 2.03 | 4.55 | 28.82% |
| | 16 | 1121014.22 | 1121014.22 | 0.00% | 2.30 | 3.98 | 1121014.22 | 1121014.22 | 0.00% | 1.05 | 2.75 | 31.01% |
| | 17 | 767636.36 | 767636.36 | 0.00% | 5.39 | 6.13 | 767636.36 | 767636.36 | 0.00% | 2.07 | 2.96 | 51.76% |
| | 18 | 1461432.46 | 1461432.46 | 0.00% | 5.88 | 7.66 | 1461432.46 | 1461432.46 | 0.00% | 2.26 | 4.10 | 46.42% |
| | 19 | 1144345.80 | 1144345.80 | 0.00% | 1.95 | 3.53 | 1144345.80 | 1144345.80 | 0.00% | 1.25 | 2.85 | 19.41% |
| | 20 | 774069.99 | 774069.99 | 0.00% | 1.20 | 1.49 | 774069.99 | 774069.99 | 0.00% | 1.49 | 1.75 | -17.98% |
| | 1 | | | | 15.69 | | 821687.27 | | 0.00% | | | 63.11% |
| | | 821687.27 | 821687.27 | 0.00% | | 17.90 | | 821687.27 | | 4.34 | 6.60 | |
| | 2 | 908468.27 | 908468.27 | 0.00% | 9.45 | 11.20 | 908468.27 | 908468.27 | 0.00% | 3.33 | 6.94 | 38.06% |
| | 3 | 791830.93 | 791830.93 | 0.00% | 23.50 | 26.58 | 791830.93 | 791830.93 | 0.00% | 8.50 | 11.58 | 56.44% |
| | 4 | 830586.72 | 830586.72 | 0.00% | 7.28 | 10.50 | 830586.72 | 830586.72 | 0.00% | 2.87 | 7.51 | 28.45% |
| | 5 | 1204952.50 | 1204952.50 | 0.00% | 0.42 | 0.61 | 1204952.50 | 1204952.50 | 0.00% | 0.73 | 0.95 | -56.32% |
| | 6 | 921167.06 | 921167.06 | 0.00% | 3.33 | 3.69 | 921167.06 | 921167.06 | 0.00% | 2.00 | 2.37 | 35.61% |
| | 7 | 843897.25 | 843897.25 | 0.00% | 2.81 | 3.97 | 843897.25 | 843897.25 | 0.00% | 1.41 | 3.03 | 23.56% |
| | 8 | 1353727.56 | 1353727.56 | 0.00% | 1.67 | 1.84 | 1353724.53 | 1353727.56 | 0.00% | 2.19 | 2.36 | -27.96% |
| | 9 | 1270047.24 | 1270047.24 | 0.00% | 7.72 | 12.38 | 1270047.24 | 1270047.24 | 0.00% | 1.85 | 6.46 | 47.82% |
| 10% | 10 | 657468.47 | 657468.47 | 0.00% | 8.37 | 10.11 | 657468.47 | 657468.47 | 0.00% | 2.86 | 5.70 | 43.56% |
| | | | | | | | | | | | | |

| 11 | 886150.82 | 886150.82 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 102.10 | 103.45 | 886150.82 | 886150.82 | 0.00% | 27.84 | 29.14 | 71.83% |
|----|------------|------------|-----------------------|--------|--------|------------|------------|-----------------------|-------|-------|---------|
| 12 | 695821.15 | 695821.15 | 0.00% | 9.99 | 13.89 | 695821.15 | 695821.15 | 0.00% | 3.83 | 8.60 | 38.13% |
| 13 | 720716.96 | 720716.96 | 0.00% | 11.90 | 13.50 | 720716.96 | 720716.96 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.10 | 4.60 | 65.95% |
| 14 | 875196.46 | 875196.46 | 0.00% | 4.88 | 5.59 | 875196.46 | 875196.46 | 0.00% | 2.17 | 2.95 | 47.20% |
| 15 | 899369.84 | 899427.65 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 5.30 | 8.72 | 899369.84 | 899369.84 | 0.00% | 2.03 | 5.67 | 34.94% |
| 16 | 1152723.02 | 1152723.02 | 0.00% | 1.28 | 2.13 | 1152723.02 | 1152723.02 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 0.81 | 1.75 | 17.65% |
| 17 | 796674.62 | 796674.62 | 0.00% | 3.12 | 3.48 | 796674.62 | 796674.62 | 0.00% | 2.05 | 2.52 | 27.79% |
| 18 | 1496356.45 | 1496356.45 | 0.00% | 4.16 | 5.70 | 1496356.45 | 1496356.45 | 0.00% | 2.27 | 3.85 | 32.55% |
| 19 | 1173632.96 | 1173632.96 | 0.00% | 1.70 | 2.91 | 1173632.96 | 1173632.96 | 0.00% | 1.54 | 2.83 | 2.48% |
| 20 | 795521.00 | 795521.00 | 0.00% | 1.06 | 1.31 | 795521.00 | 795521.00 | 0.00% | 1.50 | 1.75 | -33.74% |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |

Table 11: Comparison results when $|\mathbb{M}^s|=3,\,K=20,\,\Gamma_D=6,$ and $\Gamma_R=15$

| | | | CC | <u> </u> | | | | OA- | CG | | | |
|------|----------|------------|------------|-----------------------|-------|-------|------------|------------|-----------------------|-------|-------|-----------------|
| ε | Instance | L^C | U^C | G^C | Tim | e (s) | L | U | G | Tim | e (s) | \mathcal{P}_T |
| | | <i>L</i> | | <u> </u> | RP | Total | | | | RP | Total | |
| | 1 | 828271.98 | 828271.98 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 19.36 | 21.58 | 828271.98 | 828271.98 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 4.03 | 6.34 | 70.629 |
| | 2 | 905310.00 | 905356.87 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 8.49 | 10.02 | 905356.87 | 905356.87 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.18 | 6.43 | 35.869 |
| | 3 | 755504.35 | 755504.35 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 42.85 | 47.24 | 755451.09 | 755504.35 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 10.82 | 15.65 | 66.86 |
| | 4 | 804142.21 | 804142.21 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 35.08 | 53.36 | 804142.21 | 804142.21 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 6.14 | 13.45 | 74.80 |
| | 5 | 1084732.32 | 1084732.32 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.61 | 3.80 | 1084732.32 | 1084732.32 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 1.36 | 1.52 | 60.069 |
| | 6 | 897614.36 | 897614.36 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 6.78 | 7.70 | 897614.36 | 897614.36 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.55 | 3.69 | 52.14 |
| | 7 | 768832.54 | 768832.54 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 4.06 | 6.33 | 768821.90 | 768832.54 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 1.88 | 3.49 | 44.85 |
| | 8 | 1256227.05 | 1256227.05 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.92 | 4.09 | 1256227.05 | 1256227.05 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.66 | 2.81 | 31.27 |
| | 9 | 1169648.39 | 1169648.39 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 9.81 | 14.38 | 1169648.39 | 1169648.39 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.15 | 5.34 | 62.85 |
| 5% | 10 | 624512.09 | 624512.09 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 14.19 | 18.05 | 624512.09 | 624512.09 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.56 | 6.28 | 65.19 |
| 5 70 | 11 | 897153.78 | 897153.78 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 27.98 | 29.64 | 897153.78 | 897153.78 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 10.11 | 11.28 | 61.94 |
| | 12 | 667484.63 | 667484.63 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 11.50 | 14.91 | 667484.63 | 667484.63 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.32 | 5.70 | 61.76 |
| | 13 | 713458.10 | 713458.10 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 57.27 | 58.39 | 713458.10 | 713458.10 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.06 | 3.84 | 93.42 |
| | 14 | 839974.11 | 839974.11 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 6.44 | 7.55 | 839974.11 | 839974.11 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.50 | 3.81 | 49.47 |
| | 15 | 841962.05 | 841962.05 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 9.78 | 14.40 | 841962.05 | 841962.05 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.31 | 4.43 | 69.22 |
| | 16 | 1072967.89 | 1072967.89 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 1.78 | 3.23 | 1072967.89 | 1072967.89 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 1.11 | 2.16 | 33.24 |
| | 17 | 759207.83 | 759207.83 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 10.48 | 12.24 | 759207.83 | 759207.83 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.76 | 4.80 | 60.81 |
| | 18 | 1365198.50 | 1365198.50 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 10.61 | 13.44 | 1365198.50 | 1365198.50 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.54 | 5.18 | 61.47 |
| | 19 | 1099896.47 | 1099896.47 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 4.83 | 9.91 | 1099836.80 | 1099896.47 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 1.52 | 5.41 | 45.44 |
| | 20 | 754275.45 | 754275.45 | 0.00% | 4.87 | 5.70 | 754275.45 | 754275.45 | 0.00% | 1.70 | 2.34 | 58.93 |
| | 1 | 858600.66 | 858600.66 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 14.19 | 15.91 | 858600.66 | 858600.66 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.71 | 5.18 | 67.46 |
| | 2 | 943491.47 | 943491.47 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 13.80 | 16.22 | 943491.47 | 943491.47 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.30 | 6.18 | 61.92 |
| | 3 | 789950.65 | 789950.65 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 52.17 | 56.78 | 789950.65 | 789950.65 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 11.44 | 14.72 | 74.07 |
| | 4 | 836122.03 | 836140.73 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 17.56 | 22.03 | 836140.73 | 836140.73 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 5.65 | 10.06 | 54.35 |
| | 5 | 1122990.11 | 1122990.11 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.69 | 2.89 | 1122990.11 | 1122990.11 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 1.27 | 1.44 | 50.16 |
| | 6 | 940786.17 | 940786.17 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 6.42 | 7.30 | 940770.13 | 940786.17 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.19 | 2.78 | 61.85 |
| | 7 | 807239.76 | 807239.76 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.17 | 4.64 | 807239.76 | 807239.76 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 1.34 | 2.30 | 50.54 |
| | 8 | 1297038.93 | 1297038.93 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.62 | 3.80 | 1297038.93 | 1297038.93 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.59 | 2.73 | 28.01 |
| | 9 | 1217281.30 | 1217281.30 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 10.13 | 15.67 | 1217281.30 | 1217281.30 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.00 | 5.69 | 63.70 |
| 6% | 10 | 662036.23 | 662050.45 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 10.58 | 13.06 | 662050.45 | 662050.45 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.50 | 5.00 | 61.73 |
| 070 | 11 | 926559.66 | 926559.66 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 19.60 | 21.23 | 926559.66 | 926559.66 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.64 | 4.70 | 77.85 |
| | 12 | 690502.39 | 690502.39 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 14.83 | 19.84 | 690502.39 | 690502.39 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.64 | 5.44 | 72.60 |
| | 13 | 736150.88 | 736150.88 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 63.59 | 64.70 | 736150.88 | 736150.88 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.98 | 3.60 | 94.43 |
| | 14 | 871404.98 | 871404.98 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 6.94 | 8.01 | 871404.98 | 871404.98 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 1.99 | 2.68 | 66.62 |
| | 15 | 882227.00 | 882227.00 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 8.86 | 13.39 | 882227.00 | 882227.00 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.13 | 5.44 | 59.34 |
| | 16 | 1113010.55 | 1113010.55 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 1.50 | 3.08 | 1113010.55 | 1113010.55 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 1.13 | 2.19 | 28.95 |
| | 17 | 794734.65 | 794734.65 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 10.60 | 12.64 | 794734.65 | 794734.65 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.95 | 4.17 | 67.00 |
| | 18 | 1405423.57 | 1405423.57 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 11.50 | 14.80 | 1405423.57 | 1405423.57 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.58 | 4.94 | 66.64 |
| | 19 | 1137330.30 | 1137330.30 | 0.00% | 4.19 | 9.46 | 1137330.30 | 1137330.30 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 1.91 | 7.22 | 23.65 |
| | 20 | 782707.46 | 782707.46 | 0.00% | 4.39 | 5.05 | 782707.46 | 782707.46 | 0.00% | 1.59 | 2.14 | 57.67 |
| | 1 | 890353.60 | 890353.60 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 19.99 | 22.05 | 890353.60 | 890353.60 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.93 | 5.53 | 74.90 |
| | 2 | 982203.98 | 982203.98 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 7.59 | 8.89 | 982203.98 | 982203.98 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.13 | 6.29 | 29.31 |
| | 3 | 824396.95 | 824396.95 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 54.70 | 60.10 | 824396.95 | 824396.95 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 6.25 | 9.80 | 83.69 |
| | 4 | 868788.44 | 868788.44 | 0.00% | 21.53 | 30.14 | 868788.44 | 868788.44 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 5.73 | 12.10 | 59.85 |
| | 5 | 1161423.47 | 1161423.47 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.36 | 2.59 | 1161423.47 | 1161423.47 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 1.18 | 1.57 | 39.32 |
| | 6 | 984072.40 | 984072.40 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 5.92 | 6.87 | 984072.40 | 984072.40 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.28 | 2.92 | 57.56 |
| | 7 | 845657.62 | 845657.62 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.33 | 4.82 | 845657.62 | 845657.62 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 1.09 | 2.17 | 54.91 |
| | 8 | 1337940.27 | 1337940.27 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.77 | 3.95 | 1337940.27 | 1337940.27 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.80 | 2.94 | 25.68 |
| | 9 | 1264914.20 | 1264914.20 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 9.67 | 14.72 | 1264914.20 | 1264914.20 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 1.83 | 5.61 | 61.90 |
| 7% | 10 | 690320.29 | 690320.29 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 12.26 | 16.22 | 690320.29 | 690320.29 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.99 | 5.97 | 63.20 |
| , 10 | 11 | 955979.81 | 955979.81 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 21.61 | 23.38 | 955979.81 | 955979.81 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 4.56 | 5.89 | 74.80 |
| | 12 | 713520.16 | 713520.16 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 16.16 | 20.53 | 713520.16 | 713520.16 | 0.00% | 2.39 | 5.23 | 74.52 |
| | 13 | 758843.66 | 758843.66 | 0.00% | 50.35 | 51.25 | 758843.66 | 758843.66 | 0.00% | 2.52 | 3.33 | 93.50 |

| | 14 | 905354.12 | 905354.12 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 6.58 | 7.61 | 905354.12 | 905354.12 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.44 | 3.88 | 49.07% |
|-----|--------|------------|------------|-----------------------|-------|-------|------------|------------|-----------------------|------|-------|-----------------|
| | 15 | 919788.26 | 919788.26 | 0.00% | 11.85 | 21.13 | 919788.26 | 919788.26 | 0.00% | 3.72 | 14.83 | 29.81% |
| | 16 | 1153055.98 | 1153055.98 | 0.00% | 0.72 | 1.50 | 1153055.98 | 1153055.98 | 0.00% | 0.82 | 1.45 | 3.47% |
| | 17 | 830261.47 | 830261.47 | 0.00% | 7.55 | 8.89 | 830261.47 | 830261.47 | 0.00% | 2.87 | 4.31 | 51.52% |
| | 18 | 1445308.23 | 1445308.23 | 0.00% | 7.70 | 10.25 | 1445308.23 | 1445308.23 | 0.00% | 2.55 | 5.29 | 48.44% |
| | 19 | 1174764.14 | 1174764.14 | 0.00% | 4.25 | 10.92 | 1174760.64 | 1174764.14 | 0.00% | 1.28 | 5.61 | 48.64% |
| | 20 | 811139.47 | 811139.47 | 0.00% | 4.19 | 4.89 | 811139.47 | 811139.47 | 0.00% | 1.65 | 2.24 | 54.23% |
| | 1 | 922260.81 | 922260.81 | 0.00% | 10.88 | 12.42 | 922260.81 | 922260.81 | 0.00% | 3.63 | 5.22 | 57.95% |
| | 2 | 1020922.38 | 1020922.38 | 0.00% | 6.25 | 7.19 | 1020922.38 | 1020922.38 | 0.00% | 3.58 | 6.99 | 2.81% |
| | 3 | 859114.23 | 859114.23 | 0.00% | 36.55 | 44.26 | 859114.23 | 859114.23 | 0.00% | 6.53 | 11.94 | 73.03% |
| | 4 | 901436.14 | 901436.14 | 0.00% | 20.12 | 33.76 | 901436.14 | 901436.14 | 0.00% | 5.44 | 9.66 | 71.40% |
| | 5 | 1199856.83 | 1199856.83 | 0.00% | 2.22 | 2.41 | 1199856.83 | 1199856.83 | 0.00% | 1.11 | 1.30 | 46.16% |
| | 6 | 1027465.31 | 1027465.31 | 0.00% | 3.66 | 4.03 | 1027465.31 | 1027465.31 | 0.00% | 2.11 | 2.45 | 39.22% |
| | 7 | 884075.47 | 884075.47 | 0.00% | 2.11 | 3.55 | 884075.47 | 884075.47 | 0.00% | 1.08 | 2.19 | 38.45% |
| | 8 | 1378841.60 | 1378841.60 | 0.00% | 3.47 | 3.63 | 1378841.60 | 1378841.60 | 0.00% | 2.53 | 2.66 | 26.80% |
| | 9 | 1312547.11 | 1312547.11 | 0.00% | 6.42 | 9.97 | 1312547.11 | 1312547.11 | 0.00% | 1.59 | 3.87 | 61.15% |
| | 10 | 715094.90 | 715094.90 | 0.00% | 10.09 | 12.89 | 715094.90 | 715094.90 | 0.00% | 2.53 | 5.04 | 60.88% |
| 8% | 11 | 985399.96 | 985399.96 | 0.00% | 26.23 | 27.66 | 985399.96 | 985399.96 | 0.00% | 6.73 | 8.05 | 70.90% |
| | 12 | 735862.45 | 735862.45 | 0.00% | 10.75 | 14.13 | 735862.45 | 735862.45 | 0.00% | 4.14 | 8.20 | 41.93% |
| | 13 | 781616.92 | 781616.92 | 0.00% | 33.88 | 34.74 | 781616.92 | 781616.92 | 0.00% | 2.77 | 4.17 | 87.99% |
| | 14 | 940574.54 | 940574.54 | 0.00% | 4.64 | 5.47 | 940574.54 | 940574.54 | 0.00% | 2.23 | 3.49 | 36.12% |
| | 15 | 947928.26 | 947928.26 | 0.00% | 6.59 | 10.06 | 947928.26 | 947928.26 | 0.00% | 3.04 | 9.62 | 4.41% |
| | 16 | 1193549.95 | 1193549.95 | 0.00% | 0.80 | 1.42 | 1193549.95 | 1193549.95 | 0.00% | 0.86 | 1.54 | -8.44% |
| | 17 | 865788.29 | 865788.29 | 0.00% | 7.61 | 9.13 | 865788.29 | 865788.29 | 0.00% | 2.94 | 4.45 | 51.22% |
| | 18 | 1488899.82 | 1488899.82 | 0.00% | 7.11 | 9.67 | 1488899.82 | 1488899.82 | 0.00% | 2.52 | 6.33 | 34.57% |
| | 19 | 1212197.97 | 1212197.97 | 0.00% | 4.14 | 7.09 | 1212197.97 | 1212197.97 | 0.00% | 1.46 | 8.27 | -16.62% |
| | 20 | 839571.48 | 839571.48 | 0.00% | 4.47 | 5.16 | 839571.48 | 839571.48 | 0.00% | 1.75 | 2.30 | 55.50% |
| | 1 | 954168.02 | 954168.02 | 0.00% | 14.05 | 15.89 | 954168.02 | 954168.02 | 0.00% | 3.64 | 5.26 | 66.87% |
| | 2 | 1059640.78 | 1059640.78 | 0.00% | 7.45 | 8.53 | 1059640.78 | 1059640.78 | 0.00% | 2.95 | 3.98 | 53.32% |
| | 3 | 893859.49 | 893859.49 | 0.00% | 31.58 | 40.12 | 893859.49 | 893859.49 | 0.00% | 6.27 | 11.30 | 71.84% |
| | 4 | 934083.84 | 934083.84 | 0.00% | 22.64 | 33.95 | 934083.84 | 934083.84 | 0.00% | 6.02 | 20.91 | 38.41% |
| | 5 | 1238290.18 | 1238290.18 | 0.00% | 2.30 | 2.49 | 1238290.18 | 1238290.18 | 0.00% | 1.19 | 1.39 | 44.05% |
| | 6 | 1071816.05 | 1071816.05 | 0.00% | 3.67 | 4.02 | 1071816.05 | 1071816.05 | 0.00% | 2.00 | 2.33 | 41.99% |
| | 7 | 922554.25 | 922554.25 | 0.00% | 1.69 | 2.72 | 922493.33 | 922554.25 | 0.00% | 0.97 | 2.05 | 24.66% |
| | 8 | 1419746.68 | 1419746.68 | 0.00% | 2.42 | 2.55 | 1419746.68 | 1419746.68 | 0.00% | 2.73 | 2.89 | -13.47% |
| | 9 | 1360180.01 | 1360180.01 | 0.00% | 5.38 | 8.11 | 1360180.01 | 1360180.01 | 0.00% | 1.58 | 4.25 | 47.54% |
| | 10 | 739869.50 | 739869.50 | 0.00% | 6.83 | 8.53 | 739869.50 | 739869.50 | 0.00% | 2.67 | 4.33 | 49.27% |
| 9% | 11 | 1015607.91 | 1015607.91 | 0.00% | 14.38 | 15.64 | 1015607.91 | 1015607.91 | 0.00% | 4.94 | 6.12 | 60.86% |
| | 12 | 757944.96 | 757944.96 | 0.00% | 9.59 | 11.97 | 757944.96 | 757944.96 | 0.00% | 3.92 | 8.12 | 32.11% |
| | 13 | 804431.51 | 804431.51 | 0.00% | 36.80 | 37.66 | 804431.51 | 804431.51 | 0.00% | 2.79 | 4.20 | 88.85% |
| | 14 | 976064.45 | 976064.45 | 0.00% | 5.00 | 5.78 | 976064.45 | 976064.45 | 0.00% | 2.21 | 3.49 | 39.62% |
| | 15 | 976068.27 | 976068.27 | 0.00% | 6.05 | 8.81 | 976068.27 | 976068.27 | 0.00% | 1.85 | 4.94 | 43.94% |
| | 16 | 1234451.74 | 1234451.74 | 0.00% | 0.77 | 1.83 | 1234451.74 | 1234451.74 | 0.00% | 0.89 | 1.96 | -7.00% |
| | 17 | 901391.84 | 901391.84 | 0.00% | 6.39 | 7.27 | 901391.84 | 901391.84 | 0.00% | 2.47 | 3.37 | 53.61% |
| | 18 | 1533087.10 | 1533087.10 | 0.00% | 6.03 | 8.28 | 1533087.10 | 1533087.10 | 0.00% | 2.91 | 6.97 | 15.82% |
| | 19 | 1249631.80 | 1249631.80 | 0.00% | 3.30 | 5.87 | 1249631.80 | 1249631.80 | 0.00% | 1.24 | 5.55 | 5.57% |
| | 20 | 869288.89 | 869288.89 | 0.00% | 4.02 | 4.63 | 869288.89 | 869288.89 | 0.00% | 1.99 | 2.50 | 45.88% |
| | 1 | 986075.23 | 986075.23 | 0.00% | 12.00 | 13.52 | 986075.23 | 986075.23 | 0.00% | 3.26 | 4.86 | 64.07% |
| | 2 | 1098368.11 | 1098368.11 | 0.00% | 6.09 | 7.03 | 1098368.11 | 1098368.11 | 0.00% | 2.99 | 3.94 | 44.00% |
| | 3 | 928604.75 | 928604.75 | 0.00% | 23.52 | 32.23 | 928604.75 | 928604.75 | 0.00% | 5.55 | 13.02 | 59.62% |
| | 4 | 966713.03 | 966731.54 | 0.00% | 14.38 | 22.63 | 966731.54 | 966731.54 | 0.00% | 6.11 | 20.47 | 9.52% |
| | 5 | 1276723.54 | 1276723.54 | 0.00% | 1.58 | 1.80 | 1276723.54 | 1276723.54 | 0.00% | 1.13 | 1.33 | 26.00% |
| | 6 | 1116395.39 | 1116395.39 | 0.00% | 3.11 | 3.42 | 1116395.39 | 1116395.39 | 0.00% | 2.06 | 2.36 | 31.01% |
| | 7 | 961122.49 | 961122.49 | 0.00% | 1.31 | | 961122.49 | 961122.49 | 0.00% | 1.07 | 2.83 | -16.89% |
| | | | | | | 2.42 | | | | | | |
| | 8 9 | 1460670.33 | 1460670.33 | 0.00% | 2.47 | 2.63 | 1460670.33 | 1460670.33 | 0.00% | 2.67 | 2.80 | -6.55% 6.17% |
| | | 1407812.92 | 1407812.92 | 0.00% | 5.19 | 7.31 | 1407812.92 | 1407812.92 | 0.00% | 2.29 | 7.76 | -6.17% |
| 10% | 10 | 762778.66 | 762778.66 | 0.00% | 6.05 | 7.66 | 762756.79 | 762778.66 | 0.00% | 2.74 | 4.46 | 41.80% |
| | | | | | | | | | | | | |

| 11 | 1046981.75 | 1046981.75 | 0.00% | 12.92 | 14.16 | 1046981.75 | 1046981.75 | 0.00% | 4.28 | 5.57 | 60.68% |
|----|------------|------------|-------|-------|-------|------------|------------|-------|------|------|---------|
| 12 | 783172.26 | 783172.26 | 0.00% | 6.92 | 9.14 | 783172.26 | 783172.26 | 0.00% | 4.22 | 8.86 | 3.02% |
| 13 | 827360.59 | 827360.59 | 0.00% | 20.70 | 22.03 | 827360.59 | 827360.59 | 0.00% | 2.78 | 5.16 | 76.60% |
| 14 | 1011579.30 | 1011579.30 | 0.00% | 5.97 | 7.23 | 1011579.30 | 1011579.30 | 0.00% | 2.37 | 3.70 | 48.82% |
| 15 | 1004208.28 | 1004208.28 | 0.00% | 4.83 | 8.21 | 1004208.28 | 1004208.28 | 0.00% | 1.92 | 5.14 | 37.34% |
| 16 | 1275747.10 | 1275747.10 | 0.00% | 0.70 | 1.73 | 1275747.10 | 1275747.10 | 0.00% | 0.85 | 1.93 | -11.14% |
| 17 | 937565.32 | 937565.32 | 0.00% | 3.35 | 3.81 | 937565.32 | 937565.32 | 0.00% | 2.56 | 4.38 | -14.74% |
| 18 | 1578906.78 | 1578906.78 | 0.00% | 5.84 | 8.16 | 1578906.78 | 1578906.78 | 0.00% | 4.06 | 7.87 | 3.45% |
| 19 | 1287065.64 | 1287065.64 | 0.00% | 3.19 | 5.53 | 1287065.64 | 1287065.64 | 0.00% | 1.08 | 5.51 | 0.33% |
| 20 | 903069.24 | 903069.24 | 0.00% | 4.16 | 4.70 | 903069.24 | 903069.24 | 0.00% | 1.90 | 2.86 | 39.23% |

Table 12: Comparison results when $|\mathbb{M}^s|=3,\,K=20,\,\Gamma_D=8,$ and $\Gamma_R=20$

| | | | CC | 3 | | | | OA- | CG | | | |
|---------------|----------|-------------------------|-------------------------|-----------------------|---------------|----------------|-------------------------|-------------------------|-----------------------|--------------|---------------|------------------|
| ε | Instance | L^{C} | U^C | G^C | Tim | e (s) | T | U | G | Tim | e (s) | \mathcal{P}_T |
| | | L° | U | G | RP | Total | L | U | G | RP | Total | |
| | 1 | 918170.76 | 918170.76 | 0.00% | 6.31 | 7.25 | 918170.76 | 918170.76 | 0.00% | 3.31 | 4.17 | 42.48% |
| | 2 | 1001517.29 | 1001517.29 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.81 | 5.37 | 1001517.29 | 1001517.29 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.11 | 3.59 | 33.11% |
| | 3 | 834593.06 | 834593.06 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 29.22 | 34.14 | 834593.06 | 834593.06 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 13.66 | 16.10 | 52.85% |
| | 4 | 878113.72 | 878113.72 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 13.33 | 22.79 | 878113.72 | 878113.72 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 4.14 | 11.55 | 49.34% |
| | 5 | 1107092.99 | 1107092.99 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.14 | 2.53 | 1107092.99 | 1107092.99 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 1.72 | 1.87 | 25.96% |
| | 6 | 988638.46 | 988638.46 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.50 | 3.25 | 988638.46 | 988638.46 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 1.45 | 2.09 | 35.63% |
| | 7 | 814054.85 | 814054.85 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 0.92 | 2.01 | 814054.85 | 814054.85 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 1.00 | 2.00 | 0.65% |
| | 8 | 1309291.80 | 1309291.80 | 0.00% | 4.75 | 4.92 | 1309291.80 | 1309291.80 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.61 | 3.75 | 23.85% |
| | 9 | 1224233.60 | 1224233.60 | 0.00% | 2.97 | 4.66 | 1224233.60 | 1224233.60 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 1.28 | 3.31 | 28.95% |
| 5% | 10 | 694099.72 | 694099.72 | 0.00% | 5.64 | 7.80 | 694099.72 | 694099.72 | 0.00% | 2.00 | 3.63 | 53.51% |
| | 11 | 985283.45 | 985283.45 | 0.00% | 10.38 | 11.16 | 985283.45 | 985283.45 | 0.00% | 3.55 | 4.66 | 58.25% |
| | 12 | 711473.20 | 711473.20 | 0.00% | 10.81 | 14.58 | 711473.20 | 711473.20 | 0.00% | 2.86 | 7.33 | 49.73% |
| | 13 | 767561.17 | 767561.17 | 0.00% | 26.63 | 28.05 | 767561.17 | 767561.17 | 0.00% | 3.20 | 4.89 | 82.56% |
| | 14 | 903624.52 | 903624.52 | 0.00% | 3.08 | 3.50 | 903624.52 | 903624.52 | 0.00% | 1.72 | 2.17 | 38.00% |
| | 15 | 900626.81 | 900626.81 | 0.00% | 5.45 | 12.56 | 900626.81 | 900626.81 | 0.00% | 2.83 | 8.20 | 34.72% |
| | 16 | 1106317.80 | 1106317.80 | 0.00% | 1.03 | 3.42 | 1106317.80 | 1106317.80 | 0.00% | 1.25 | 3.18 | 6.95% |
| | 17 | 842196.94 | 842196.94 | 0.00% | 6.77 | 7.92 | 842196.94 | 842196.94 | 0.00% | 2.50 | 3.25 | 58.97% |
| | 18 | 1388622.34 | 1388622.34 | 0.00% | 4.70 | 6.39 | 1388622.34 | 1388622.34 | 0.00% | 2.47 | 3.88 | 39.33% |
| | 19 | 1135168.76 | 1135168.76 | 0.00% | 2.11 | 4.10 | 1135149.96 | 1135168.76 | 0.00% | 1.27 | 2.73 | 33.24% |
| | 20 | 795710.67 | 795710.67 | 0.00% | 4.56 | 5.24 | 795710.67 | 795710.67 | 0.00% | 1.59 | 2.05 | 60.92% |
| | 1 | 956916.11 | 956916.11 | 0.00% | 5.31 | 5.87 | 956916.11 | 956916.11 | 0.00% | 3.04 | 3.58 | 39.02% |
| | 2 | 1049312.55 | 1049312.55 | 0.00% | 3.55 | 5.50 | 1049312.55 | 1049312.55 | 0.00% | 1.58 | 3.37 | 38.70% |
| | 3 | 875530.17 | 875530.17 | 0.00% | 24.74 | 27.72 | 875530.17 | 875530.17 | 0.00% | 12.96 | 15.36 | 44.58% |
| | 4 | 917799.86 | 917799.86 | 0.00% | 14.87 | 26.14 | 917799.86 | 917799.86 | 0.00% | 3.69 | 15.25 | 41.65% |
| | 5 | 1148986.29 | 1148986.29 | 0.00% | 2.78 | 3.16 | 1148986.29 | 1148986.29 | 0.00% | 1.61 | 1.77 | 44.01% |
| | 6 | 1039430.17 | 1039430.17 | 0.00% | 2.00 | 2.92 | 1039430.17 | 1039430.17 | 0.00% | 1.30 | 1.98 | 32.08% |
| | 7 | 856632.89 | 856632.89 | 0.00% | 1.31 | 2.91 | 856632.89 | 856632.89 | 0.00% | 0.98 | 2.08 | 28.50% |
| | 8 | 1355292.46 | 1355292.46 | 0.00% | 5.23 | 5.41 | 1355292.46 | 1355292.46 | 0.00% | 3.41 | 3.55 | 34.41% |
| | 9 | 1278137.56 | 1278137.56 725242.88 | 0.00% | 2.73 | 4.81 | 1278137.56 | 1278137.56 | 0.00% | 1.17 | 3.51 | 27.06% |
| 6% | 10 11 | 725242.88 | | 0.00% 0.00% | 5.22 | 6.66 | 725242.88 | 725242.88 1021129.69 | 0.00% | 1.86 | 3.03 | 54.49% |
| | 12 | 1021129.69 736411.53 | 1021129.69 736411.53 | 0.00% | 9.56 11.98 | 10.53 16.28 | 1021129.69 736411.53 | 736411.53 | 0.00% 0.00% | 3.36 4.34 | 4.64 10.09 | 55.92% 38.00% |
| | 13 | 796010.93 | 796010.93 | 0.00% | 16.84 | 18.56 | 796010.93 | 796010.93 | 0.00% | 2.99 | 5.14 | 72.29% |
| | 14 | 943823.64 | 943823.64 | 0.00% | 2.45 | 3.00 | 943823.64 | 943823.64 | 0.00% | 2.25 | 2.74 | 8.77% |
| | 15 | 932780.13 | 932781.12 | 0.00% | 4.73 | 12.22 | 932781.12 | 932781.12 | 0.00% | 2.27 | 8.44 | 30.92% |
| | 16 | 1149885.46 | 1149885.46 | 0.00% | 0.56 | 1.30 | 1149885.46 | 1149885.46 | 0.00% | 0.81 | 1.44 | -10.72% |
| | 17 | 883509.43 | 883509.43 | 0.00% | 6.56 | 7.75 | 883509.43 | 883509.43 | 0.00% | 2.64 | 3.65 | 52.88% |
| | 18 | 1437089.18 | 1437089.18 | 0.00% | 6.42 | 9.19 | 1437089.18 | 1437089.18 | 0.00% | 2.42 | 4.61 | 49.85% |
| | 19 | 1177926.69 | 1177926.69 | 0.00% | 2.56 | 4.28 | 1177907.88 | 1177926.69 | 0.00% | 1.13 | 2.71 | 36.81% |
| | 20 | 829025.22 | 829025.22 | 0.00% | 4.25 | 4.81 | 829025.22 | 829025.22 | 0.00% | 1.30 | 1.87 | 61.22% |
| | 1 | 996427.22 | 996427.22 | 0.00% | 7.48 | 8.23 | 996427.22 | 996427.22 | 0.00% | 3.06 | 3.60 | 56.34% |
| | 2 | 1097203.72 | 1097203.72 | 0.00% | 6.97 | 12.17 | 1097203,72 | 1097203.72 | 0.00% | 1.72 | 4.09 | 66.36% |
| | 3 | 916467.29 | 916467.29 | 0.00% | 26.44 | 30.25 | 916467.29 | 916467.29 | 0.00% | 10.39 | 14.12 | 53.31% |
| | 4 | 957486.01 | 957486.01 | 0.00% | 15.34 | 29.09 | 957486.01 | 957486.01 | 0.00% | 3.99 | 13.52 | 53.54% |
| | 5 | 1190879.59 | 1190879.59 | 0.00% | 3.02 | 3.47 | 1190879.59 | 1190879.59 | 0.00% | 1.69 | 1.83 | 47.25% |
| | 6 | 1091033.04 | 1091033.04 | 0.00% | 1.88 | 2.34 | 1091033.04 | 1091033.04 | 0.00% | 1.06 | 1.39 | 40.83% |
| | 7 | 899210.93 | 899210.93 | 0.00% | 1.70 | 3.30 | 899210.93 | 899210.93 | 0.00% | 1.08 | 2.24 | 32.10% |
| | 8 | 1401922.09 | 1401922.09 | 0.00% | 3.64 | 3.78 | 1401922.09 | 1401922.09 | 0.00% | 2.76 | 3.02 | 20.26% |
| | 9 | 1332041.52 | 1332041.52 | 0.00% | 2.72 | 4.64 | 1332041.52 | 1332041.52 | 0.00% | 1.27 | 3.45 | 25.57% |
| 201 | 10 | 755636.96 | 755636.96 | 0.00% | 5.72 | 7.65 | 755636.96 | 755636.96 | 0.00% | 2.19 | 3.72 | 51.37% |
| 7% | 11 | 1060801.58 | 1060801.58 | 0.00% | 7.94 | 8.91 | 1060801.58 | 1060801.58 | 0.00% | 2.71 | 3.89 | 56.38% |
| | 12 | 760887.96 | 760887.96 | 0.00% | 9.58 | 12.00 | 760887.96 | 760887.96 | 0.00% | 4.22 | 6.89 | 42.59% |
| | 13 | 824714.30 | 824714.30 | 0.00% | 14.42 | 15.81 | 824714.30 | 824714.30 | 0.00% | 3.17 | 4.30 | 72.82% |
| | | | | | | | | | | | | |

| | 14 | 984022.76 | 984022.76 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.80 | 3.28 | 984022.76 | 984022.76 | 0.00% | 1.89 | 2.32 | 29.39% |
|------|----|------------|------------|-----------------------|-------|-------|------------|------------|-----------------------|------|-------|----------|
| | 15 | 965395.40 | 965395.40 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.91 | 6.75 | 965395.40 | 965395.40 | 0.00% | 1.86 | 5.42 | 19.69% |
| | 16 | 1193595.52 | 1193595.52 | 0.00% | 0.45 | 1.09 | 1193595.52 | 1193595.52 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 0.89 | 1.50 | -37.29% |
| | 17 | 925266.62 | 925266.62 | 0.00% | 8.34 | 9.89 | 925266.62 | 925266.62 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.41 | 4.53 | 54.16% |
| | 18 | 1490581.51 | 1490581.51 | 0.00% | 5.78 | 8.45 | 1490581.51 | 1490581.51 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.28 | 4.25 | 49.75% |
| | 19 | 1220684.61 | 1220684.61 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 2.02 | 3.55 | 1220665.80 | 1220684.61 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 1.20 | 2.74 | 22.86% |
| | 20 | 862933.34 | 862933.34 | 0.00% | 2.84 | 3.40 | 862933.34 | 862933.34 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 1.08 | 1.55 | 54.61% |
| | 1 | 1035938.33 | 1035938.33 | 0.00% | 6.80 | 7.50 | 1035938.33 | 1035938.33 | 0.00% | 3.34 | 4.75 | 36.67% |
| | 2 | 1145146.20 | 1145146.20 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 5.99 | 9.75 | 1145146.20 | 1145146.20 | 0.00% | 2.17 | 4.88 | 49.98% |
| | 3 | 957407.92 | 957407.92 | 0.00% | 22.71 | 25.88 | 957407.92 | 957407.92 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 9.88 | 12.80 | 50.54% |
| | 4 | 997172.15 | 997172.15 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 10.48 | 19.86 | 997172.15 | 997172.15 | 0.00% | 4.10 | 19.98 | -0.60% |
| | 5 | 1232772.89 | 1232772.89 | 0.00% | 2.38 | 2.75 | 1232772.89 | 1232772.89 | 0.00% | 1.78 | 1.94 | 29.56% |
| | 6 | 1143590.28 | 1143590.28 | 0.00% | 1.13 | 1.55 | 1143590.28 | 1143590.28 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 0.91 | 1.29 | 16.88% |
| | 7 | 941788.97 | 941788.97 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 1.05 | 2.24 | 941788.97 | 941788.97 | 0.00% | 1.10 | 2.10 | 6.22% |
| | 8 | 1448612.97 | 1448612.97 | 0.00% | 3.19 | 3.35 | 1448612.97 | 1448612.97 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.10 | 3.38 | -0.99% |
| | 9 | 1385945.48 | 1385945.48 | 0.00% | 2.30 | 3.89 | 1385945.48 | 1385945.48 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 1.27 | 3.55 | 8.79% |
| 9.07 | 10 | 787382.99 | 787382.99 | 0.00% | 4.80 | 6.53 | 787382.99 | 787382.99 | 0.00% | 2.17 | 3.69 | 43.51% |
| 8% | 11 | 1100475.59 | 1100475.59 | 0.00% | 6.59 | 7.47 | 1100475.59 | 1100475.59 | 0.00% | 2.50 | 3.57 | 52.28% |
| | 12 | 786890.16 | 786890.16 | 0.00% | 7.59 | 9.31 | 786890.16 | 786890.16 | 0.00% | 4.30 | 7.27 | 21.93% |
| | 13 | 854147.54 | 854147.54 | 0.00% | 12.88 | 14.42 | 854147.54 | 854147.54 | 0.00% | 3.40 | 4.39 | 69.57% |
| | 14 | 1027046.04 | 1027046.04 | 0.00% | 2.44 | 2.95 | 1027046.04 | 1027046.04 | 0.00% | 1.92 | 2.32 | 21.57% |
| | 15 | 1004554.19 | 1004554.19 | 0.00% | 3.02 | 9.14 | 1004554.19 | 1004554.19 | 0.00% | 1.48 | 3.67 | 59.82% |
| | 16 | 1238025.96 | 1238025.96 | 0.00% | 0.51 | 1.28 | 1238025.96 | 1238025.96 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 0.97 | 1.52 | -18.36% |
| | 17 | 968475.42 | 968475.42 | 0.00% | 6.45 | 7.59 | 968475.42 | 968475.42 | 0.00% | 2.54 | 4.70 | 38.14% |
| | 18 | 1545838.50 | 1545838.50 | 0.00% | 6.27 | 9.25 | 1545769.49 | 1545838.50 | 0.00% | 2.04 | 4.28 | 53.72% |
| | 19 | 1263442.54 | 1263442.54 | 0.00% | 0.89 | 1.81 | 1263423.73 | 1263442.54 | 0.00% | 0.88 | 1.63 | 10.21% |
| | 20 | 900341.83 | 900341.83 | 0.00% | 3.56 | 4.59 | 900341.83 | 900341.83 | 0.00% | 1.27 | 2.06 | 55.16% |
| | 1 | 1075449.43 | 1075449.43 | 0.00% | 6.06 | 6.67 | 1075449.43 | 1075449.43 | 0.00% | 2.80 | 3.69 | 44.76% |
| | 2 | 1193089.64 | 1193089.64 | 0.00% | 6.00 | 10.42 | 1193089.64 | 1193089.64 | 0.00% | 2.03 | 4.86 | 53.37% |
| | 3 | 998362.17 | 998362.17 | 0.00% | 15.73 | 19.00 | 998362.17 | 998362.17 | 0.00% | 7.87 | 11.86 | 37.58% |
| | 4 | 1036858.30 | 1036858.30 | 0.00% | 11.86 | 22.19 | 1036858.30 | 1036858.30 | 0.00% | 3.62 | 11.45 | 48.38% |
| | 5 | 1282010.10 | 1282010.10 | 0.00% | 2.13 | 2.31 | 1282010.10 | 1282010.10 | 0.00% | 2.75 | 3.09 | -33.74% |
| | 6 | 1196392.58 | 1196392.58 | 0.00% | 1.39 | 1.83 | 1196392.58 | 1196392.58 | 0.00% | 0.97 | 1.33 | 27.34% |
| | 7 | 984367.00 | 984367.00 | 0.00% | 1.55 | 3.63 | 984367.00 | 984367.00 | 0.00% | 1.28 | 3.08 | 15.09% |
| | 8 | 1495744.01 | 1495744.01 | 0.00% | 2.56 | 2.74 | 1495744.01 | 1495744.01 | 0.00% | 2.47 | 2.63 | 4.06% |
| | 9 | 1439849.45 | 1439849.45 | 0.00% | 1.97 | 3.64 | 1439849.45 | 1439849.45 | 0.00% | 1.16 | 2.71 | 25.65% |
| 0.07 | 10 | 819252.55 | 819252.55 | 0.00% | 4.11 | 6.11 | 819252.55 | 819252.55 | 0.00% | 2.05 | 3.42 | 44.03% |
| 9% | 11 | 1140150.98 | 1140150.98 | 0.00% | 6.69 | 7.57 | 1140150.98 | 1140150.98 | 0.00% | 2.26 | 3.53 | 53.38% |
| | 12 | 814568.19 | 814568.19 | 0.00% | 8.75 | 10.34 | 814568.19 | 814568.19 | 0.00% | 4.33 | 7.49 | 27.61% |
| | 13 | 883858.92 | 883858.92 | 0.00% | 13.98 | 15.50 | 883858.92 | 883858.92 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 3.13 | 4.39 | 71.65% |
| | 14 | 1070674.05 | 1070674.05 | 0.00% | 2.61 | 3.09 | 1070674.05 | 1070674.05 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 1.79 | 2.18 | 29.67% |
| | 15 | 1046219.72 | 1046219.72 | 0.00% | 2.05 | 4.61 | 1046219.72 | 1046219.72 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 1.31 | 3.46 | 25.02% |
| | 16 | 1282709.38 | 1282709.38 | 0.00% | 0.50 | 1.14 | 1282709.38 | 1282709.38 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 0.88 | 1.42 | -24.63% |
| | 17 | 1011985.04 | 1011985.04 | 0.00% | 5.94 | 6.92 | 1011985.04 | 1011985.04 | 0.00% | 2.50 | 3.37 | 51.29% |
| | 18 | 1605219.95 | 1605219.95 | 0.00% | 5.63 | 8.86 | 1605219.95 | 1605219.95 | 0.00% | 1.89 | 5.23 | 40.98% |
| | 19 | 1306228.35 | 1306228.35 | 0.00% | 1.06 | 1.92 | 1306181.65 | 1306228.35 | 0.00% | 1.02 | 1.77 | 8.01% |
| | 20 | 940807.73 | 940807.73 | 0.00% | 4.84 | 9.48 | 940807.73 | 940807.73 | 0.00% | 2.42 | 7.03 | 25.83% |
| - | 1 | 1115071.29 | 1115071.29 | 0.00% | 8.19 | 8.87 | 1115071.29 | 1115071.29 | 0.00% | 3.16 | 4.14 | 53.35% |
| | 2 | 1241044.71 | 1241044.71 | 0.00% | 4.95 | 8.76 | 1241044.71 | 1241044.71 | 0.00% | 1.87 | 4.82 | 44.96% |
| | 3 | 1039317.25 | 1039317.25 | 0.00% | 14.23 | 17.34 | 1039317.25 | 1039317.25 | 0.00% | 7.57 | 9.95 | 42.65% |
| | 4 | 1076544.44 | 1076544.44 | 0.00% | 12.51 | 23.69 | 1076544.44 | 1076544.44 | 0.00% | 3.72 | 12.72 | 46.29% |
| | 5 | 1334938.27 | 1334938.27 | 0.00% | 0.81 | 1.02 | 1334938.27 | 1335070.27 | 0.00% | 1.72 | 2.11 | -107.68% |
| | 6 | 1249204.59 | 1249204.59 | 0.00% | 1.16 | 1.53 | 1249204.59 | 1249204.59 | 0.00% | 0.87 | 1.20 | 21.62% |
| | 7 | 1027179.50 | 1027179.50 | 0.00% | 1.55 | 3.70 | 1027179.50 | 1027179.50 | 0.00% | 1.18 | 2.78 | 24.98% |
| | 8 | 1543069.51 | 1543069.51 | 0.00% | 3.25 | 3.42 | 1543069.51 | 1543069.51 | 0.00% | 2.56 | 2.74 | 20.05% |
| | 9 | 1493753.41 | 1493753.41 | 0.00% | 2.06 | 3.73 | 1493753.41 | 1493753.41 | 0.00% | 1.27 | 3.53 | 5.33% |
| | 10 | 851391.60 | 851391.60 | 0.00% | 2.84 | 3.84 | 851391.60 | 851391.60 | 0.00% | 1.64 | 2.55 | 33.63% |
| 10% | | | | | | | | | | | | |

| 11 | 1179887.56 | 1179887.56 | 0.00% | 6.06 | 6.86 | 1179887.56 | 1179887.56 | 0.00% | 2.50 | 3.46 | 49.61% |
|----|------------|------------|-----------------------|-------|-------|------------|------------|-------|------|------|----------|
| 12 | 845141.53 | 845141.53 | 0.00% | 7.23 | 8.84 | 845141.53 | 845141.53 | 0.00% | 2.97 | 5.14 | 41.84% |
| 13 | 913577.83 | 913577.83 | 0.00% | 13.05 | 15.36 | 913577.83 | 913577.83 | 0.00% | 3.19 | 4.82 | 68.63% |
| 14 | 1114827.55 | 1114827.55 | 0.00% | 2.09 | 2.45 | 1114827.55 | 1114827.55 | 0.00% | 1.64 | 1.99 | 19.00% |
| 15 | 1091033.78 | 1091137.78 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 1.83 | 4.75 | 1091137.78 | 1091137.78 | 0.00% | 1.28 | 3.58 | 24.68% |
| 16 | 1328917.55 | 1329010.60 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 0.47 | 1.11 | 1329010.29 | 1329010.60 | 0.00% | 1.25 | 2.24 | -101.62% |
| 17 | 1055710.84 | 1055710.84 | 0.00% | 5.45 | 6.47 | 1055710.84 | 1055710.84 | 0.00% | 2.12 | 2.95 | 54.44% |
| 18 | 1662748.10 | 1662748.10 | 0.00% | 8.89 | 15.80 | 1662748.10 | 1662748.10 | 0.00% | 2.81 | 9.23 | 41.55% |
| 19 | 1349171.59 | 1349171.59 | 0.00% | 1.27 | 2.08 | 1349171.59 | 1349171.59 | 0.00% | 1.08 | 3.44 | -65.32% |
| 20 | 974691.01 | 974691.01 | 0.00% | 3.70 | 6.41 | 974691.01 | 974691.01 | 0.00% | 1.90 | 4.26 | 33.56% |

Table 13: Comparison results when $|\mathbb{M}^s|=4$

| | | | | | CG | | | | (| OA-CG | | | - <u>-</u> | _ | |
|------------|------------|----------|-------------------------------|-------------------------------|-----------------------|--------------------|--------------------|-------------------------|-------------------------|-----------------------|------------------|------------------|------------------|-----------------|--------------------|
| Γ_D | Γ_R | Instance | L^C | U^C | G^C | | ne (s) | L | U | G | | ne (s) | \mathcal{P}_T | \mathcal{P}_G | \mathcal{P}_F |
| | | 1 | 595310.61 | 595310.61 | 0.00% | RP 2260.77 | Total 2356.74 | 595310.61 | 595310.61 | 0.00% | RP 270.53 | Total 315.47 | 86.61% | | 0.00% |
| | | 2 | 746287.18 | 746287.18 | 0.00% | 1315.90 | 1435.75 | 746287.18 | 746287.18 | 0.00% | 98.64 | 191.53 | 86.66% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 3 | 621274.01 | 621274.01 | 0.00% | 1814.16 | 2075.95 | 621274.01 | 621274.01 | 0.00% | 129.40 | 524.37 | 74.74% | _ | 0.00% |
| | | 4 | 826032.85 | 826032.85 | 0.00% | 547.30 | 696.49 | 826032.85 | 826032.85 | 0.00% | 337.26 | 506.20 | 27.32% | _ | 0.00% |
| | | 5 | 720894.59 | 720923.32 | 0.00% | 160.89 | 184.17 | 720923.32 | 720923.32 | 0.00% | 74.84 | 114.74 | 37.70% | _ | 0.00% |
| | | 6 | 1081879.72 | 1081879.72 | 0.00% | 437.64 | 487.03 | 1081879.72 | 1081879.72 | 0.00% | 79.75 | 126.02 | 74.13% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 7 | 696092.17 | 696092.17 | 0.00% | 2294.31 | 2333.31 | 696092.17 | 696092.17 | 0.00% | 907.58 | 926.72 | 60.28% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 8 | 689664.55 | 689664.55 | 0.00% | 1112.39 | 1170.58 | 689664.55 | 689664.55 | 0.00% | 104.64 | 179.21 | 84.69% | = | 0.00% |
| | | 9 | 857046.18 | 857090.61 | 0.00% | 245.72 | 356.46 | 857046.18 | 857090.61 | 0.00% | 24.05 | 132.24 | 62.90% | - | 0.00% |
| 4 | 10 | 10 | 866085.65 | 866085.65 | 0.00% | 152.53 | 187.20 | 866085.65 | 866085.65 | 0.00% | 31.38 | 63.97 | 65.83% | - | 0.00% |
| 7 | 10 | 11 | 588378.35 | 588378.35 | 0.00% | 985.52 | 1310.25 | 588358.17 | 588378.35 | 0.00% | 78.20 | 273.38 | 79.14% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 12 | 800504.08 | 800504.08 | 0.00% | 1508.72 | 1529.89 | 800504.08 | 800504.08 | 0.00% | 642.98 | 742.23 | 51.48% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 13 | 844454.43 | 844454.43 | 0.00% | 419.06 | 534.73 | 844454.43 | 844454.43 | 0.00% | 94.04 | 387.19 | 27.59% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 14 | 715190.98 | 715190.98 | 0.00% | 480.67 | 639.03 | 715190.98 | 715190.98 | 0.00% | 66.18 | 329.46 | 48.44% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 15 | 772098.18 | 772098.18 | 0.00% | 262.36 | 416.20 | 772098.18 | 772098.18 | 0.00% | 56.80 | 279.49 | 32.85% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 16 | 667069.80 | 667069.80 | 0.00% | 526.13 | 1114.81 | 667069.80 | 667069.80 | 0.00% | 52.76 | 766.84 | 31.21% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 17 | 769166.54 | 769166.54 | 0.00% | 1081.95 | 1157.77 | 769166.54 | 769166.54 | 0.00% | 60.91 | 138.42 | 88.04% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 18 | 764927.80 | 764927.80 | 0.00% | 62.22 | 78.03 | 764927.80 | 764927.80 | 0.00% | 14.62 | 29.53 | 62.16% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 19 | 582048.05 | 582048.05 | 0.00% | 2431.33 | 5040.56 | 582048.05 | 582048.05 | 0.00% | 264.06 | 1342.00 | 73.38% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 20 | 1102896.15 | 1102896.15 | 0.00% | 48.20 | 69.16 | 1102896.15 | 1102896.15 | 0.00% | 12.60 | 35.05 | 49.31% | 100.00# | 0.00% |
| | | 1 2 | 615489.64 802309.15 | 654901.29 802309.15 | 6.02% | 7173.62 | 7200.00 | 643090.99 802309.15 | 643090.99 802309.15 | 0.00% 0.00% | 536.85 129.25 | 753.58 448.94 | 89.53% | 100.00% | 1.80% |
| | | 3 | 647569.72 | 671721.61 | 0.00% 3.60% | 6185.14 7175.42 | 6659.51 7200.00 | 671721.61 | 671721.61 | 0.00% | 2289.07 | 2803.85 | 93.26% 61.06% | 100.00% | 0.00% |
| | | 4 | 906766.86 | 906766.86 | 0.00% | 2207.14 | 2943.12 | 906766.86 | 906766.86 | 0.00% | 339.40 | 633.89 | 78.46% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 5 | 775549.07 | 775549.07 | 0.00% | 632.75 | 773.06 | 775549.07 | 775549.07 | 0.00% | 197.97 | 496.11 | 35.83% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 6 | 1157498.17 | 1157498.17 | 0.00% | 699.05 | 724.58 | 1157498.17 | 1157498.17 | 0.00% | 152.14 | 177.33 | 75.53% | _ | 0.00% |
| | | 7 | 743236.60 | 743236.60 | 0.00% | 4182.17 | 4242.55 | 743236.60 | 743236.60 | 0.00% | 254.44 | 287.59 | 93.22% | _ | 0.00% |
| | | 8 | 744603.72 | 744603.72 | 0.00% | 2330.36 | 2474.78 | 744603.72 | 744603.72 | 0.00% | 202.67 | 330.37 | 86.65% | _ | 0.00% |
| | | 9 | 945166.54 | 945166.54 | 0.00% | 162.72 | 208.78 | 945166.54 | 945166.54 | 0.00% | 24.12 | 128.52 | 38.44% | _ | 0.00% |
| | | 10 | 940529.22 | 940529.22 | 0.00% | 122.70 | 148.81 | 940529.22 | 940529.22 | 0.00% | 20.92 | 56.23 | 62.21% | - | 0.00% |
| 4 | 15 | 11 | 617112.52 | 617112.52 | 0.00% | 2925.25 | 3226.34 | 617060.98 | 617112.52 | 0.00% | 181.42 | 486.65 | 84.92% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 12 | 868167.22 | 868167.22 | 0.00% | 3199.11 | 3270.87 | 868167.22 | 868167.22 | 0.00% | 471.34 | 525.61 | 83.93% | = | 0.00% |
| | | 13 | 913894.46 | 913917.92 | 0.00% | 886.41 | 1339.77 | 913917.92 | 913917.92 | 0.00% | 60.08 | 338.22 | 74.76% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 14 | 769213.84 | 769260.12 | 0.00% | 1598.59 | 1759.19 | 769260.12 | 769260.12 | 0.00% | 146.70 | 244.91 | 86.08% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 15 | 823814.61 | 823814.61 | 0.00% | 1632.36 | 1935.83 | 823814.61 | 823814.61 | 0.00% | 109.08 | 317.32 | 83.61% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 16 | 719750.56 | 719750.56 | 0.00% | 1355.11 | 2812.95 | 719750.56 | 719750.56 | 0.00% | 98.28 | 1253.65 | 55.43% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 17 | 820156.57 | 820195.62 | 0.00% | 3941.72 | 4134.87 | 820195.62 | 820195.62 | 0.00% | 160.37 | 481.62 | 88.35% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 18 | 818156.35 | 818156.35 | 0.00% | 39.19 | 46.01 | 818156.35 | 818156.35 | 0.00% | 21.80 | 25.02 | 45.63% | = | 0.00% |
| | | 19 | 631975.74 | 632007.29 | 0.00% | 3517.61 | 5090.34 | 632007.29 | 632007.29 | 0.00% | 252.54 | 1513.60 | 70.27% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 20 | 1172363.11 | 1172363.11 | 0.00% | 177.74 | 244.91 | 1172363.11 | 1172363.11 | 0.00% | 22.50 | 87.41 | 64.31% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 1 | 684354.69 | 717891.62 | 4.67% | 7184.22 | 7200.00 | 704961.57 | 704961.57 | 0.00% | 3811.95 | 4214.18 | 41.47% | 100.00% | 1.80% |
| | | 2 | 870576.75 | 880137.97 | 1.09% | 6991.00 | 7200.00 | 877359.76 | 877359.76 | 0.00% | 993.75 | 1441.00 | 79.99% | 100.00% | 0.32% |
| | | 3 | 688161.74 | 744280.11 | 7.54% | 7194.38 | 7200.00 | 725351.10 | 725351.10 | 0.00% | 3807.23 | 4371.25 | 39.29% | 100.00% | 2.54% |
| | | 4 | 1014365.62 | 1014365.62 | 0.00% | 5090.92 | 5884.98 | 1014365.62 865000.26 | 1014365.62 | 0.00% | 499.08 | 1480.86 | 74.84% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 5 6 | 865000.26 1302455.56 | 865000.26 1302455.56 | 0.00% 0.00% | 810.41 729.28 | 907.39 775.01 | 1302455.56 | 865000.26 1302455.56 | 0.00% 0.00% | 419.24 83.37 | 623.99 107.16 | 31.23% 86.17% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 7 | 760095.38 | | 11.53% | 7199.24 | | | 815654.90 | 0.00% | 547.13 | 590.24 | 91.80% | 100.00% | 0.00% |
| | | 8 | 830346.16 | 859143.37 830607.16 | 0.03% | 7170.39 | 7200.00 7200.00 | 815633.88 830607.16 | 830607.16 | 0.00% | 621.61 | 683.27 | 90.51% | 100.00% | 5.06% 0.00% |
| | | 9 | 1041192.55 | 1041192.55 | 0.03% | 294.11 | 390.48 | 1041192.55 | 1041192.55 | 0.00% | 44.36 | 122.47 | 68.64% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 10 | 1009760.17 | 1009760.17 | 0.00% | 866.95 | 903.53 | 1009760.17 | 1009760.17 | 0.00% | 79.24 | 210.82 | 76.67% | = | 0.00% |
| 6 | 15 | 11 | 664913.70 | 665163.60 | 0.04% | 6381.44 | 7200.00 | 664913.70 | 664913.70 | 0.00% | 302.50 | 1148.66 | 84.05% | 100.00% | 0.04% |
| | | 12 | 933431.43 | 984155.88 | 5.15% | 7176.08 | 7200.00 | 955821.86 | 955821.86 | 0.00% | 1776.66 | 1922.96 | 73.29% | 100.00% | 2.88% |
| | | 13 | 1008513.87 | 1008513.87 | 0.00% | 884.36 | 1085.88 | 1008513.87 | 1008513.87 | 0.00% | 98.27 | 350.99 | 67.68% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 14 | 843383.73 | 843383.73 | 0.00% | 4575.75 | 4850.03 | 843383.73 | 843383.73 | 0.00% | 294.07 | 402.33 | 91.70% | _ | 0.00% |
| | | 15 | 875643.72 | 884079.96 | 0.95% | 6801.69 | 7200.00 | 884079.96 | 884079.96 | 0.00% | 1088.92 | 1977.62 | 72.53% | 100.00% | 0.00% |
| | | 16 | 790442.31 | 790442.31 | 0.00% | 2602.63 | 6117.03 | 790442.31 | 790442.31 | 0.00% | 176.48 | 3558.31 | 41.83% | _ | 0.00% |
| | | 17 | 897655.90 | 905970.59 | 0.92% | 7106.97 | 7200.00 | 905970.59 | 905970.59 | 0.00% | 405.92 | 699.56 | 90.28% | 100.00% | 0.00% |
| | | 18 | 904010.15 | 904010.15 | 0.00% | 87.02 | 97.31 | 904010.15 | 904010.15 | 0.00% | 21.75 | 33.19 | 65.89% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 19 | 696339.05 | 700756.48 | 0.63% | 5547.38 | 7200.00 | 700756.48 | 700756.48 | 0.00% | 432.92 | 3482.50 | 51.63% | 100.00% | 0.00% |
| | | 20 | 1251470.12 | 1251470.12 | 0.00% | 911.05 | 1007.83 | 1251470.12 | 1251470.12 | 0.00% | 225.25 | 322.19 | 68.03% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 1 | 705406.17 | 712028.13 | 0.93% | 7183.16 | 7200.00 | 712028.13 | 712028.13 | 0.00% | 1498.18 | 1536.77 | 78.66% | 100.00% | 0.00% |
| | | 2 | 893809.71 | 893809.71 | 0.00% | 3042.31 | 3141.63 | 893809.71 | 893809.71 | 0.00% | 112.27 | 176.63 | 94.38% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 3 | 695476.45 | 749524.29 | 7.21% | 7197.80 | 7200.00 | 727913.21 | 727913.21 | 0.00% | 3365.19 | 3642.79 | 49.41% | 100.00% | 2.88% |
| | | 4 | 1028605.32 | 1028605.32 | 0.00% | 805.42 | 979.52 | 1028605.32 | 1028605.32 | 0.00% | 223.44 | 372.03 | 62.02% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 5 | 879065.78 | 879065.78 | 0.00% | 235.13 | 275.98 | 879065.78 | 879065.78 | 0.00% | 142.57 | 204.06 | 26.06% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 6 | 1333015.79 | 1333015.79 | 0.00% | 165.38 | 217.25 | 1333015.79 | 1333015.79 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 28.48 | 85.31 | 60.73% | = | 0.00% |
| | | 7 | 826726.85 | 826726.85 | 0.00% | 2905.17 | 2920.35 | 826726.85 | 826726.85 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 1603.28 | 1618.23 | 44.59% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 8 | 834755.50 | 834755.50 | 0.00% | 3747.16 | 3778.81 | 834755.50 | 834755.50 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 852.53 | 886.93 | 76.53% | = | 0.00% |
| | | 9 | 1027236.15 | 1027236.15 | 0.00% | 239.67 | 317.28 | 1027236.15 | 1027236.15 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 17.75 | 91.72 | 71.09% | - | 0.00% |
| 8 | 10 | 10 | 994789.84 | 994789.84 | 0.00% | 1345.53 | 1391.31 | 994789.84 | 994789.84 | 0.00% | 152.66 | 199.14 | 85.69% | = | 0.00% |
| Ü | 20 | 11 | 676521.87 | 676521.87 | 0.00% | 5157.75 | 5794.72 | 676521.87 | 676521.87 | 0.00% | 295.29 | 555.28 | 90.42% | - | 0.00% |
| | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |

| | | 12 | 964498.20 | 964564.93 | 0.00% | 5130.12 | 5261.81 | 964564.93 | 964564.93 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 641.55 | 779.69 | 85.18% | = | 0.00% |
|----|----|----|------------|------------|-------|---------|---------|------------|------------|-----------------------|---------|---------|--------|---------|-------|
| | | 13 | 1013888.74 | 1013978.46 | 0.00% | 300.36 | 515.89 | 1013978.46 | 1013978.46 | 0.00% | 90.28 | 168.17 | 67.40% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 14 | 859640.18 | 859640.18 | 0.00% | 702.75 | 787.81 | 859640.18 | 859640.18 | 0.00% | 123.42 | 215.03 | 72.71% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 15 | 884174.77 | 884174.77 | 0.00% | 3534.84 | 3746.51 | 884174.77 | 884174.77 | 0.00% | 122.34 | 376.42 | 89.95% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 16 | 790705.03 | 790705.03 | 0.00% | 1004.81 | 1658.23 | 790669.86 | 790705.03 | 0.00% | 115.42 | 553.49 | 66.62% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 17 | 930020.14 | 930048.54 | 0.00% | 2486.02 | 2606.71 | 930020.14 | 930020.14 | 0.00% | 256.74 | 467.55 | 82.06% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 18 | 911592.17 | 911592.17 | 0.00% | 75.36 | 80.61 | 911592.17 | 911592.17 | 0.00% | 39.14 | 47.83 | 40.66% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 19 | 715179.68 | 718299.82 | 0.43% | 5204.22 | 7200.00 | 715373.68 | 715373.68 | 0.00% | 86.18 | 1967.07 | 72.68% | 100.00% | 0.41% |
| | | 20 | 1247167.07 | 1247167.07 | 0.00% | 344.33 | 358.17 | 1247167.07 | 1247167.07 | 0.00% | 62.12 | 76.36 | 78.68% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 1 | 755309.73 | 765070.26 | 1.28% | 7192.81 | 7200.00 | 763133.08 | 763133.08 | 0.00% | 2949.95 | 3038.64 | 57.80% | 100.00% | 0.25% |
| | | 2 | 954108.87 | 954108.87 | 0.00% | 2795.94 | 2930.94 | 954108.87 | 954108.87 | 0.00% | 160.28 | 322.58 | 88.99% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 3 | 739167.15 | 798121.82 | 7.39% | 7198.08 | 7200.00 | 775041.98 | 775041.98 | 0.00% | 2184.71 | 2328.42 | 67.66% | 100.00% | 2.89% |
| | | 4 | 1097436.27 | 1097436.27 | 0.00% | 1206.03 | 1382.44 | 1097436.27 | 1097436.27 | 0.00% | 220.22 | 518.67 | 62.48% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 5 | 933582.21 | 933582.21 | 0.00% | 662.63 | 709.58 | 933582.21 | 933582.21 | 0.00% | 168.73 | 271.63 | 61.72% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 6 | 1416378.80 | 1416378.80 | 0.00% | 286.47 | 327.81 | 1416378.80 | 1416378.80 | 0.00% | 27.18 | 85.78 | 73.83% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 7 | 881796.55 | 881796.55 | 0.00% | 2543.69 | 2553.64 | 881796.55 | 881796.55 | 0.00% | 2060.48 | 2072.61 | 18.84% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 8 | 905199.84 | 905199.84 | 0.00% | 2695.72 | 2720.69 | 905199.84 | 905199.84 | 0.00% | 666.65 | 710.77 | 73.88% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 9 | 1093605.55 | 1093605.55 | 0.00% | 177.19 | 229.31 | 1093605.55 | 1093605.55 | 0.00% | 24.74 | 192.92 | 15.87% | - | 0.00% |
| 10 | 10 | 10 | 1049161.82 | 1049161.82 | 0.00% | 1259.95 | 1331.80 | 1049161.82 | 1049161.82 | 0.00% | 175.99 | 356.17 | 73.26% | - | 0.00% |
| 10 | 10 | 11 | 715000.43 | 715000.43 | 0.00% | 3576.92 | 3730.70 | 715000.43 | 715000.43 | 0.00% | 458.19 | 579.91 | 84.46% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 12 | 1034564.55 | 1034564.55 | 0.00% | 4825.83 | 4954.75 | 1034564.55 | 1034564.55 | 0.00% | 563.82 | 639.96 | 87.08% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 13 | 1080852.81 | 1080852.81 | 0.00% | 131.39 | 196.28 | 1080852.81 | 1080852.81 | 0.00% | 34.17 | 135.22 | 31.11% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 14 | 912917.34 | 912917.34 | 0.00% | 1293.41 | 1347.08 | 912917.34 | 912917.34 | 0.00% | 237.03 | 311.83 | 76.85% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 15 | 927512.84 | 927512.84 | 0.00% | 2260.62 | 2379.05 | 927512.84 | 927512.84 | 0.00% | 192.20 | 556.23 | 76.62% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 16 | 840587.16 | 840587.16 | 0.00% | 432.13 | 808.73 | 840587.16 | 840587.16 | 0.00% | 67.94 | 743.20 | 8.10% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 17 | 1001976.45 | 1001976.45 | 0.00% | 2149.03 | 2205.46 | 1001976.45 | 1001976.45 | 0.00% | 1179.41 | 1236.33 | 43.94% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 18 | 958713.68 | 958713.68 | 0.00% | 82.67 | 87.92 | 958713.68 | 958713.68 | 0.00% | 20.83 | 33.38 | 62.04% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 19 | 773778.70 | 773778.70 | 0.00% | 2743.03 | 4246.25 | 773778.70 | 773778.70 | 0.00% | 95.84 | 1887.31 | 55.55% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 20 | 1315441.76 | 1315441.76 | 0.00% | 323.09 | 354.94 | 1315441.76 | 1315441.76 | 0.00% | 57.11 | 78.56 | 77.87% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 1 | 959738.58 | 959848.58 | 0.01% | 7182.33 | 7200.00 | 959848.58 | 959848.58 | 0.00% | 349.69 | 387.11 | 94.62% | 100.00% | 0.00% |
| | | 2 | 1155235.60 | 1155235.60 | 0.00% | 1966.39 | 2423.99 | 1155235.60 | 1155235.60 | 0.00% | 42.92 | 317.22 | 86.91% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 3 | 934790.99 | 948175.70 | 1.41% | 7185.12 | 7200.00 | 948175.70 | 948175.70 | 0.00% | 1982.25 | 2061.38 | 71.37% | 100.00% | 0.00% |
| | | 4 | 1316736.71 | 1316736.71 | 0.00% | 739.36 | 1015.14 | 1316736.71 | 1316736.71 | 0.00% | 130.87 | 349.74 | 65.55% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 5 | 1124693.36 | 1124693.36 | 0.00% | 640.83 | 701.67 | 1124693.36 | 1124693.36 | 0.00% | 91.83 | 154.75 | 77.95% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 6 | 1650632.47 | 1650632.47 | 0.00% | 140.56 | 206.23 | 1650632.47 | 1650632.47 | 0.00% | 18.73 | 68.04 | 67.01% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 7 | 1063359.59 | 1063428.53 | 0.00% | 825.48 | 842.30 | 1063411.39 | 1063428.53 | 0.00% | 111.98 | 130.16 | 84.55% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 8 | 1117882.82 | 1117882.82 | 0.00% | 346.84 | 389.91 | 1117882.82 | 1117882.82 | 0.00% | 44.11 | 74.79 | 80.82% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 9 | 1320581.14 | 1320581.14 | 0.00% | 297.44 | 384.01 | 1320581.14 | 1320581.14 | 0.00% | 76.06 | 274.53 | 28.51% | - | 0.00% |
| 20 | 10 | 10 | 1270287.25 | 1270287.25 | 0.00% | 233.89 | 270.61 | 1270287.25 | 1270287.25 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 118.73 | 152.85 | 43.52% | - | 0.00% |
| 20 | 10 | 11 | 875051.12 | 875127.31 | 0.00% | 460.25 | 565.08 | 875127.31 | 875127.31 | $\boldsymbol{0.00\%}$ | 60.87 | 191.23 | 66.16% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 12 | 1265990.97 | 1265990.97 | 0.00% | 1313.63 | 1357.92 | 1265990.97 | 1265990.97 | 0.00% | 88.91 | 111.10 | 91.82% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 13 | 1233454.07 | 1233454.07 | 0.00% | 145.89 | 194.55 | 1233454.07 | 1233454.07 | 0.00% | 66.32 | 131.36 | 32.48% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 14 | 1127236.57 | 1127236.57 | 0.00% | 1771.72 | 1875.16 | 1127236.57 | 1127236.57 | 0.00% | 55.22 | 163.38 | 91.29% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 15 | 1089614.03 | 1089614.03 | 0.00% | 1834.50 | 2041.95 | 1089614.03 | 1089614.03 | 0.00% | 17.94 | 132.36 | 93.52% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 16 | 987660.57 | 987670.90 | 0.00% | 803.37 | 1619.72 | 987660.60 | 987660.60 | 0.00% | 57.60 | 529.43 | 67.31% | = | 0.00% |
| | | 17 | 1266466.68 | 1266466.68 | 0.00% | 940.13 | 1015.58 | 1266466.68 | 1266466.68 | 0.00% | 63.73 | 111.53 | 89.02% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 18 | 1103887.28 | 1103887.28 | 0.00% | 303.72 | 377.39 | 1103887.28 | 1103887.28 | 0.00% | 47.41 | 131.78 | 65.08% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 19 | 969563.12 | 969563.12 | 0.00% | 857.35 | 2330.97 | 969563.12 | 969563.12 | 0.00% | 50.50 | 1210.18 | 48.08% | - | 0.00% |
| | | 20 | 1549807.58 | 1549807.58 | 0.00% | 116.63 | 162.72 | 1549807.58 | 1549807.58 | 0.00% | 9.58 | 45.86 | 71.82% | - | 0.00% |
| | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |