

Q1

Please explain why the proof of theorem 2 in paper reading 2-2 is incorrect.

from lemma

$$g(S_n) \geq \left(1 - \prod_{i=1}^n \left(1 - \frac{c(S_i)^2}{B^2}\right)\right) p(s^*)$$

According to termination rule

$$r(S_n) = \sum_{i=1}^n s_i \geq B$$

$\therefore 1 - \prod_{i=1}^n \left(1 - \frac{c(S_i)^2}{B^2}\right)$ achieves its

minimum value of $1 - \prod_{i=1}^n \left(1 - \left(\frac{1}{n}\right)^2\right)$ when

$$c(S_1) = c(S_2) = \dots = c(S_n) = c(S_n)/n$$

\therefore we have

$$\prod_{i=1}^n \left(1 - \frac{c(S_i)^2}{B^2}\right) \leq \prod_{i=1}^n \left(1 - \left(\frac{1}{n}\right)^2\right)$$

$$= \left(1 - \left(\frac{1}{n}\right)^2\right)^n$$

$$= \left(\left(1 + \frac{1}{n}\right) \left(1 - \frac{1}{n}\right) \right)^n$$

$$\geq \left(1 - \frac{1}{n}\right)^{2n}$$

Thus $1 - \left(1 - \frac{1}{n}\right)^{2n}$ is not the minimum value, we cannot get guaranteed ratio of $\frac{1}{2} \left(1 - \frac{1}{e^2}\right)$ for BM^2A problem.

2) In paper, '2-r', the theoretical analysis is incorrect, why experimental results are still good i.e. outperform previously known algorithms? Give your review on theoretical analysis and computer experiments.

- According to total performance images, performance of PCME is better than random, MaxDegree & greedy algorithm. As random & maxdegree are heuristic based, their performance is unstable. approximation ratio of greedy algorithm is

$$\frac{1}{2} \left(1 - \frac{1}{e}\right) \text{ also}$$

$$1 - \left(1 - \left(\frac{1}{n}\right)^2\right)^n \leq 1 - \left(1 - \frac{1}{n}\right)^n \leq 1 - \frac{1}{e}$$

experimental result show the results of ~~PMCE~~ PMCE are very close, even better than that of greedy algorithm.

Q3. Why profit function is not monotone?

→ $B(x) = \hat{x} \cdot J(s) - \hat{y} \cdot |s|$. Here \hat{x} & \hat{y} are

arbitrary constant number. When $\hat{y} \neq 0$, $\hat{x} \cdot J(s)$ is monotone nondecreasing function & $\hat{y} \cdot |s|$ is monotone increasing func.

∴ $B(x)$ is not a monotone func being a difference of non-decreasing & ~~decr~~ increasing. The monotone property is required, if the function is monotone non-decreasing submodular function under the cardinality constraint, greedy heuristic method is guaranteed to bound of $(1 - \frac{1}{e}) \cdot |s| = p$. i.e. a approximate

Solution for $k = p$ the approximate

solution for $k = p+1$ is determined by adding to s . a j^* such that $Z(s \cup \{j^*\})$

$= \max_{j \notin s} Z(s \cup \{j\})$ & $Z(s \cup \{j^*\}) \geq Z(s)$

Q4: Mover strategy can be applied to more than two players.

Q5

In noncooperative algorithms, we calculate Nash equilibria, however, it is NP hard.
∴ we need to relax the condition of Nash equilibria, get an approximate Nash equilibria, in order to reduce the computational cost to low level.