2/24/2020 XML tutorial: Problems with DTD



NOTE: These slides have not been updated since 2003. They have been superseded by the book

An Introduction to XML and Web Technologies Addison-Wesley, and the accompanying online material. Please see http://www.brics.dk/ixwt/for more information.

Anders Møller and Michael Schwartzbach, February 2006





THE XML REVOLUTION - TECHNOLOGIES FOR THE FUTURE WEB



## **Problems with DTD**

Top 15 reasons for avoiding DTD:

- 1. **not itself using XML syntax** (the SGML heritage can be very unintuitive + if using XML, DTDs could potentially themselves be syntax checked with a "meta DTD")
- 2. mixed into the XML 1.0 spec (would be much less confusing if specified separately + even non-validating processors must look at the DTD)
- 3. no constraints on character data (if character data is allowed, any character data is allowed)
- 4. too simple attribute value models (enumerations are clearly insufficient)
- 5. **cannot mix character data and regexp content models** (and the content models are generally hard to use for complex requirements)
- 6. **no support for Namespaces** (of course, XML 1.0 was defined before Namespaces)
- 7. **very limited support for modularity and reuse** (the entity mechanism is too low-level)
- 8. no support for schema evolution, extension, or inheritance of declarations (difficult to write, maintain, and read large DTDs, and to define families of related schemas)
- 9. limited white-space control (xml:space is rarely used)

- 10. **no embedded, structured self-documentation** (<!-- comments --> are not enough)
- 11. **content and attribute declarations cannot depend on attributes or element context** (*many* XML languages use that, but their DTDs have to "allow too much")
- 12. too simple ID attribute mechanism (no points-to requirements, uniqueness scope, etc.)
- 13. **only defaults for attributes, not for elements** (but that would often be convenient)
- 14. cannot specify "any element" or "any attribute" (useful for partial specifications and during schema development)
- 15. defaults cannot be specified separate from the declarations (would be convenient to have defaults in separate modules)



COPYRIGHT © 2000-2003 ANDERS MØLLER & MICHAEL I. SCHWARTZBACH

