

ORDER SHEET.
IN THE ISLAMABAD HIGH COURT, ISLAMABAD.
JUDICIAL DEPARTMENT

W.P No.4561 of 2021

M/s Islamabad Electric Supply Company Limited
VS
Federal Board of Revenue through its Additional Commissioner Inland
Revenue etc.

S. No. of order/ proceedings	Date of order/ proceedings	Order with signature of Judge and that of parties or counsel where necessary.
------------------------------------	----------------------------------	--

**23.12.2021. M/s Muhammad Asif Khan and Ashraf Ali
Awan, Advocates for the petitioner.**

This is 5th petition on the subject filed under Article 199 of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973 through which the petitioner has sought *inter alia* direction to respondent No.2 to decide its pending appeal and stay application and in the meanwhile restraining respondent No.1 from initiating the recovery proceedings in pursuance of recovery notice dated 24.07.2020 for the tax year 2019.

2. Learned counsel for the petitioner submitted that the impugned notice is illegal, arbitrary and against the law. It was further contended that initiation of recovery proceedings during the pendency of petitioner's appeal is against its fundamental rights guaranteed under the Constitution. It was

further contended that it is trite law that unless there is adjudication by one independent forum, no recovery proceedings can be initiated against the assessee. In this behalf learned counsel placed reliance on the case titled "*M/s Pak Saudi Fertilizers Ltd. Vs. Federation of Pakistan and others*" (2002 PTD 679), "*Z.N. Exporters (Pvt.) Ltd Vs. Collector of Sales Tax*" (2003 PTD 1746), "*Brothers Engineering (Pvt.) Ltd Vs. Appellate Tribunal Sales Tax*" (2003 PTD 1836). Learned counsel further contended that delay in decision of the appeal is not on part of the petitioner, therefore, impugned recovery notice dated 24.07.2020 may be suspended and recovery proceedings be stopped till the final decision of the appeal and stay application by respondent No.2.

3. The submissions made by the learned counsel for the petitioner have substance. In this behalf the Hon'ble Supreme Court of Pakistan in case titled "*Mehram Ali Vs. Federation of Pakistan etc.*" (PLD 1998 SC 1445) has specifically held that there should be adjudication of grievance by an independent Tribunal and even Lahore High Court in numerous judgments has held that an assessee

is entitled to adjudication in respect of his disputed tax liabilities by at least one independent forum outside hierarchy of the respondent department.

4. In view of the above, the instant Writ Petition is disposed of with direction to respondent No.2 to hear and decide the appeal and stay application within a period of Sixty days and till then no coercive measures shall be adopted against the petitioner by respondent No.1.

(AAMER FAROOQ)
JUDGE

NIQAB M