## Title:

Rebuttal to Frank et al 2016

## Authors:

NAFC1Montevecchi WA2  
Robert D3  
Davoren GK4  
Rose G5?

## Affiliations:

1. Northwest Atlantic Fisheries Centre, Fisheries and Oceans Canada, St. John's, NL, Canada
2. Cognitive and Behavioural Ecology Programme, Departments of Biology and Psychology, Memorial University of Newfoundland, St. John’s, NL, Canada
3. Institut des sciences de la mer, Université du Québec à Rimouski, Rimouski, QC, Canada
4. Department of Biological Sciences, University of Manitoba, Winnipeg, MB, Canada
5. CFER?

## Abstract

## Introduction

Forage fish play a crucial role in many ecosystems, acting as a conduit of energy between lower trophic levels and large vertebrate predators. Forage fish are small shoaling species that characteristically have rapid growth, short life expectancies, and population responses tightly linked to environmental control. These characteristics lead this group of species to exhibit boom and bust dynamics, i.e. their abundances change rapidly and substantially and undergo phases of extremely high and extremely low abundances (Schwartzlose et al. 1999, Chavez et al. 2003, Alheit et al. 2009, Pikitch et al. 2012).

Capelin is the focal forage species in ecosystems of the northern Atlantic Ocean (Templeman 1948, Jangaard 1974, Vilhjálmsson 1994, Carscadden et al. 2001). The three most important capelin populations in the North Atlantic are in the Barents Sea, off Iceland, and off Newfoundland and Labrador (Canada). The Barents Sea capelin stock underwent three collapses during the last 4 decades, during the mid- to late 1980s, mid-1990s, and mid-2000s. The size of the stock fluctuated between 3 - 7 million tonnes during the boom and around 200 thousand tonnes during the bust phases. There is general agreement that ecosystem changes were the driving forces behind these dynamics (Gjøsæter et al. 2009). The Icelandic capelin stock underwent similar dynamics, with three bust phases in the last 4 decades, in the early 1980s, in the early 1990s, and during most of the 2000s. The size of the stock was around 1.5 - 2 million tonnes during the boom and between 100 and 500 thousand tonnes during the bust phases (ICES 2017).The first two cases were due to a combination of poor recruitment and the stock being easily available to the fishing fleet, while the last case was likely associated to a climate-related shift in distribution (Pálsson et al. 2012, Carscadden et al. 2013).

Fisheries and Oceans Canada is responsible for the assessment of the Newfoundland and Labrador capelin stock; it has concluded that there was an order of magnitude decline in the stock in the early 1990s, and that capelin abundance declined to less than 1% of historic levels in 2010 (DFO 1994, Miller 1994, 1997, DFO 2008, 2010, 2013, 2015). The size of the stock fluctuated between 2 - 6 million tonnes prior to 1991, and between 25 and 900 thousand tonnes during the ensuing period (DFO 2015).This decline was concomitant with drastic changes in the ecosystem during the late 1980s and early 1990s (Hutchings & Myers 1994, Gomes et al. 1995, Lilly et al. 2000, Rice 2002, Koen-Alonso et al. 2010, Hammill et al. 2011, Pedersen et al. 2017), including major changes in the biology and ecology of capelin (Carscadden & Nakashima 1997, Carscadden et al. 2001, Nakashima & Wheeler 2002, DFO 2010). The collapse was identified as an important signal contributing to a regime shift that occurred in the early 1990s (Buren et al. 2014, Pedersen et al. 2017). Several aspects of the stock’s dynamics, such as recruitment, growth, and mortality of pre-spawners have been linked to bottom-up processes (Frank & Leggett 1981, Leggett et al. 1984, Dalley et al. 2002, Buren et al. 2014, Obradovich et al. 2014, Murphy et al. 2018).

Frank et al. (2016) concluded that the capelin stock off Newfoundland and Labrador did not collapse. To reach this conclusion they analyzed several aspects of the biology of capelin (i.e. distribution and demography), some aspects of the surveys carried out by Fisheries and Oceans Canada, and the response of components of the ecosystem to the large scale changes that occurred during the early 1990s. These authors postulated that the reported collapse was not real and proposed two hypotheses to interpret why the surveys have failed to detect large fish aggregations; 1) capelin changed its migratory patterns while the timing of the survey has remained constant leading to a spatio-temporal mismatch between the survey and the stock, and 2) the capelin stock has become less migratory remaining in inshore waters, and therefore undetected by the offshore surveys.

The objective of this paper is to assess the relative empirical support for the hypotheses of stock collapse (DFO 2015) vs non-collapse (Frank et al. 2016).

ADB: Hannah, I am not happy with the last sentence, but I feel like I am running in circles. Can you have a crack at this, please? Thanks!

## References

Alheit J, Roy C, Kifani S (2009) Decadal-scale variability in populations. In: Checkley D, Alheit J, Oozeki Y, Roy C (eds) Climate Change and Small Pelagic Fish. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, UK

Buren AD, Koen-Alonso M, Pepin P, Mowbray F, Nakashima BS, Stenson GB, Ollerhead N, Montevecchi WA (2014) Bottom-up regulation of capelin, a keystone forage species. PLoS ONE 9:e87589

Carscadden JE, Frank KT, Leggett WC (2001) Ecosystem changes and the effects on capelin (*Mallotus villosus*), a major forage species. Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences 58:73-85

Carscadden JE, Gjøsæter H, Vilhjálmsson H (2013) A comparison of recent changes in distribution of capelin (*Mallotus villosus)* in the Barents Sea, around Iceland and in the Northwest Atlantic. Progress in Oceanography

Carscadden JE, Nakashima BS (1997) Abundance and changes in distribution, biology and behavior of capelin in response to cooler water of the 1990s. Forage fishes in marine ecosystems Proceedings of the International Symposium on the Role of Forage Fishes in Marine Ecosystems Alaska Sea Grant College Program Rep No AK-SG-97-01. University of Alaska Fairbanks, Fairbanks, Alaska

Chavez FP, Ryan J, Lluch-Cota SE, Ñiquen MC (2003) From anchovies to sardines and back: multidecadal change in the Pacific Ocean. Science 299:217-221

Dalley EL, Anderson JT, deYoung B (2002) Atmospheric forcing, larval drift, and recruitment of capelin ( Mallotus villosus ). ICES Journal of Marine Science 59:929-941

DFO (1994) Report on the status of pelagic fishes (capelin off Newfoundland and in the Gulf of St. Lawrence, and herring off the East, Southeast and South coasts off Newfoundland). DFO Atlantic Fisheries Stock Status Report 1994/3

DFO (2008) Assessment of capelin in SA2+Div. 3KL in 2008. DFO Canadian Science Advisory Secretariat Science Advisory Report 2008/054

DFO (2010) Assessment of Capelin in SA 2 + Div. 3KL in 2010. DFO Canadian Science Advisory Secretariat Science Advisory Report 2010/090

DFO (2013) Assessment of capelin in SA2 + Div. 3KL in 2013. DFO Canadian Science Advisory Secretariat Science Advisory Report 2013/11

DFO (2015) Assessment of capelin in Subarea 2 and Divisions 3KL in 2015. DFO Canadian Science Advisory Secretariat Science Advisory Report 2015/036

Frank KT, Leggett WC (1981) Wind regulation of emergence times and early larval survival in capelin (*Mallotus villosus*). Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences 38:215-223

Frank KT, Petrie B, Boyce D, Leggett WC (2016) Anomalous ecosystem dynamics following the apparent collapse of a keystone forage species. Marine Ecology Progress Series 553:185-202

Gjøsæter H, Bogstad B, Tjelmeland S (2009) Ecosystem effects of the three capelin stock collapses in the Barents Sea. Marine Biology Research 5:40-53

Gomes MdC, Haedrich RL, Villagarcia MG (1995) Spatial and temporal changes in the groundfish assemblages on the north-east Newfoundland/Labrador Shelf, north-west Atlantic, 1978-1991. Fisheries Oceanography 4:85-101

Hammill MO, Stenson GB, Doniol-Valcroze T, Mosnier A (2011) Northwest Atlantic harp seals population trends, 1952-2012. DFO Canadian Science Advisory Secretariat Research Document 2011/099

Hutchings JA, Myers RA (1994) What can be learned from the collapse of a renewable resource? Atlantic cod, *Gadus morhua*, of Newfoundland and Labrador. Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences 51:2126-2146

ICES (2017) Report of the North Western Working Group (NWWG). Copenhagen, Denmark

Jangaard PM (1974) The capelin (*Mallotus villosus*): biology, distribution, exploitation, utilization, and composition. Bulletin of the Fisheries Research Board of Canada 186:1-70

Koen-Alonso M, Pepin P, Mowbray F (2010) Exploring the role of environmental and anthropogenic drivers in the trajectories of core fish species of the Newfoundland-Labrador marine community.

Leggett WC, Frank KT, Carscadden JE (1984) Meteorological and hydrographic regulation of year-class strength in capelin (*Mallotus villosus*). Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences 41:1193-1201

Lilly GR, Parsons DG, Kulka DW (2000) Was the increase in shrimp biomass on the northeast Newfoundland shelf a consequence of a release in predation pressure from cod? Journal of Northwest Atlantic Fishery Science 27:45-61

Miller DS (1994) Results from an acoustic survey for capelin (*Mallotus villosus*) in NAFO Divisions 2J3KL in the autumn of 1993. Capelin in SA2 + Div 3KL DFO Atlantic Fisheries Research Document 94/18

Miller DS (1997) Results from an acoustic survey for capelin (*Mallotus villosus*) in NAFO Divisions 3KL in the spring of 1996. Capelin in SA2 + Div 3KL DFO Atlantic Fisheries Research Document 97/29

Murphy HM, Pepin P, Robert D (2018) Re-visiting the drivers of capelin recruitment in Newfoundland since 1991. Fisheries Research 200:1-10

Nakashima BS, Wheeler JP (2002) Capelin (*Mallotus villosus*) spawning behaviour in Newfoundland waters - the interaction between beach and demersal spawning. ICES Journal of Marine Science 59:909-916

Obradovich SG, Carruthers EH, Rose GA (2014) Bottom-up limits to Newfoundland capelin (Mallotus villosus) rebuilding: the euphausiid hypothesis. ICES Journal of Marine Science 71:775-783

Pálsson ÓK, Gislason A, Guðfinnsson HG, Gunnarsson B, Ólafsdóttir SR, Petursdottir H, Sveinbjörnsson S, Thorisson K, Valdimarsson H (2012) Ecosystem structure in the Iceland Sea and recent changes to the capelin (Mallotus villosus) population. ICES Journal of Marine Science 69:1242-1254

Pedersen EJ, Thompson PL, Ball RA, Fortin M-J, Gouhier TC, Link H, Moritz C, Nenzen H, Stanley RRE, Taranu ZE, Gonzalez A, Guichard F, Pepin P (2017) Signatures of the collapse and incipient recovery of an overexploited marine ecosystem. Royal Society Open Science 4

Pikitch EK, Boersma PD, Boyd IL, Conover DO, Cury PM, Essington TE, Heppell SS, Houde ED, Mangel M, Pauly D, Plagányi E, Sainsbury KJ, Steneck RS (2012) Little fish: big impact: managing a crucial link in ocean food webs. Lenfest Ocean Program, Washington, DC

Rice J (2002) Changes to the large marine ecosystem of the Newfoundland-Labrador shelf. In: Sherman K, Skjoldal HR (eds) Large marine ecosystems of the North Atlantic. Elsevier Science B.V.

Schwartzlose RA, Alheit J, Bakun A, Baumgartner TR, Cloete R, Crawford RJM, Fletcher WJ, Green-Ruiz Y, Hagen E, Kawasaki T, Lluch-Belda D, Lluch-Cota SE, MacCall AD, Matsuura Y, Névarez-Martínez MO, Parrish RH, Roy C, Serra R, Shust KV, Ward MN, Zuzunaga JZ (1999) Worldwide large-scale fluctuations of sardine and anchovy populations. South African Journal of Marine Science 21:289-347

Templeman W (1948) The life history of the caplin (*Mallotus villosus* O. F. Müller) in Newfoundland waters. Bulletin of the Newfoundland Government Laboratory 17:1-151

Vilhjálmsson H (1994) The Icelandic capelin stock. Rit Fiskideildar 13:1-281