### **Harp seal population trends and diet**

Frank et al. (2016) argue that the absence of an obvious response in northwest Atlantic harp seals supports their contention that the capelin stocks off NL did not collapse. One of their arguments is that a large number of starving harp seals were observed following the collapse of capelin in the Barents Sea (Haug & Nilssen 1995) while there were no reports of similar sightings in the NW Atlantic. However, there are significant differences between the two situations. In the Barents Sea, the collapse of capelin during the mid-1980s happened at a time when the stock of other important forage fish, herring, was severely depleted (Hamre 1994). The Barents Sea herring stock collapsed in 1969, and did not see any signs of recovery until the late 1980s, and therefore the effects of the capelin collapse were amplified and reached several taxa such as seals, seabirds and Atlantic cod (*Gadus morhua*) (Hamre 1994). Barents Sea capelin also declined between 1992 and 1993 without a similar ‘invasion’ of starving seals. This was likely due to the availability of alternate prey (herring and polar cod, *Boreogadus saida*) for the seals (Nilssen et al. 1998). As Frank et al. (2016) indicate, ‘starving’ harp seals were not reported in Newfoundland waters during the early 1990s, when capelin biomass declined. During this period, however, alternate prey, particularly *B. saida* and herring were still available (Lilly et al. 1994, Bourne et al. 2015) and were consumed by harp seals (Stenson 2012). Also, total consumption of capelin declined during the 1990s due primarily to the significant decline in the Atlantic cod (Carscadden et al. 2001). Therefore, it is possible that this may have caused an increase in relative abundance of capelin available to harp seals.

While the harp seals did not show catastrophic mortalities, they have been impacted by the decline in capelin. Since the 1980s, pregnancy rates of harp seals have declined while inter-annual variability has increased, ranging from ~20% to 75% over the past 3 decades (Stenson et al. 2014, Stenson et al. 2016). Also, beginning in 1987, harp seals have shown indications of late term abortions. Stenson et al. (2016) found that while the general decline in fecundity is a reflection of density-dependent processes associated with increased population size, including the late term abortion rates into their model allowed them to explain the large inter-annual variability. Changes in the abortion rates, in turn, are influenced by ice cover in late January and capelin biomass. Buren et al. (2014) showed that capelin abundance is correlated with ice conditions suggesting that late January ice conditions also reflect changes in environmental conditions that influence a number of prey species. Abundance of Northwest Atlantic harp seals has been relatively stable for the past decade. While, as pointed out by Frank et al. (2016), higher catches in the Canadian commercial hunt between 1996 and 2008, contributed to reductions in the rate of population growth, these lower pregnancy rates have also had a major impact on the population dynamics of this population (Hammill et al. 2015).

Bourne C, Mowbray F, Squires B, Croft J (2015) An assessment framework and review of Newfoundland east and south coast Atlantic herring (*Clupea harengus*) stocks to the spring of 2013. Canadian Science Advisory Secretariat (CSAS) Research Document 2015/029

Buren AD, Koen-Alonso M, Pepin P, Mowbray F, Nakashima BS, Stenson GB, Ollerhead N, Montevecchi WA (2014) Bottom-up regulation of capelin, a keystone forage species. PLoS ONE 9:e87589

Carscadden JE, Frank KT, Leggett WC (2001) Ecosystem changes and the effects on capelin (*Mallotus villosus*), a major forage species. Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences 58:73-85

Frank KT, Petrie B, Boyce D, Leggett WC (2016) Anomalous ecosystem dynamics following the apparent collapse of a keystone forage species. Marine Ecology Progress Series 553:185-202

Hammill MO, Stenson GB, Doniol-Valcroze T, Mosnier A (2015) Conservation of northwest Atlantic harp seals: Past success, future uncertainty? Biological Conservation 192:181-191

Hamre J (1994) Biodiversity and exploitation of the main fish stocks in the Norwegian - Barents Sea ecosystem. Biodiversity & Conservation 3:473-492

Haug T, Nilssen K (1995) Ecological implications of harp seals *Phoca groenlandica* invasions in northern Norway. In: Schytte Blix A, Walløe L, Ulltang Ø (eds) Whales, seals, fish and man. Elsevier Science

Lilly GR, Hop H, Stansbury DE, Bishop CA (1994) Distribution and abundance of polar cod (*Boreogadus saida*) off southern Labrador and eastern Newfoundland. ICES CM 0:6

Nilssen KT, Haug T, Øritsland T, Lindblom L, Kjellqwist SA (1998) Invasions of harp seals Phoca groenlandica Erxleben to coastal waters of nor way in 1995: Ecological and demographic implications. Sarsia 83:337-345

Stenson GB (2012) Estimating consumption of prey by harp seals (*Pagophilus groenlandicus*) in NAFO Divisions 2J3KL. Canadian Science Advisory Secretariat (CSAS) Research Document 2012/156

Stenson GB, Buren AD, Koen-Alonso M (2016) The impact of changing climate and abundance on reproduction in an ice-dependent species, the Northwest Atlantic harp seal, Pagophilus groenlandicus. ICES Journal of Marine Science: Journal du Conseil 73:250-262

Stenson GB, Wakeham D, Buren AD, Koen-Alonso M (2014) Density-dependent and density-independent factors influencing reproductive rates in Northwest Atlantic harp seals, *Pagophilus groenlandicus*. DFO Canadian Science Advisory Secretariat Research Document 2014/058