

# Instructor Medical Rights and Tissue Ownership Resources

Project | Module Title

Created by:

## Description

Students read excerpts on the legality of tissue ownership. Students first independently form arguments as a pre-class exercise or work in groups to build an argument on whether or not people should be compensated for tissues that lead to financial or societal gain in science. Students then take part in a structured debate explaining their view and critically analyzing the opposing view.

## Learning Goals

1. Students will understand the rights and regulations surrounding tissue ownership.
2. Students will appreciate the effects of tissue rights and regulations on societal structures.

## Learning Objectives

1. Students will be able to explain tissue ownership rights.
2. Students will be able to predict consequences of pollution on variable human populations.

## Suggested Courses

Anatomy and Physiology, Introduction to Biology, Cell Biology, Developmental Biology

### Scientific Processing Skills:

Reviewing Prior Research, Communicating Outcomes and Scientific Content

### Pedagogical Approaches:

Brainstorming, Collaborative Work, Reflective Writing, Debate and Critical Analysis

### Bloom's Cognitive Levels:

Synthesis/Evaluation/Creation

### Principles of how people learn:

Focuses Students on Materials to be Learned, Leverages Differences Among Learners, Requires Students to do the Bulk of the Work

### Vision and Change Competencies:

Ability to understand the relationship between science and society

### Core Biological Concepts Covered:

Types of Cells, Tissues and Donation, Human Health and Wellness

## Additional Resources

"The Immortal Life of Henrietta Lacks" by Rebecca Skloot, ISBN: 9781400052189

Allen, M. J., Powers, M. L., Gronowski, K. S., & Gronowski, A. M. (2010). Human Tissue Ownership and Use in Research: What Laboratorians and Researchers Should Know. *Clinical Chemistry*, 56(11), 1675–1682.

<https://doi.org/10.1373/clinchem.2010.150672>

Petrini, C. (2012). Ethical and legal considerations regarding the ownership and commercial use of human biological materials and their derivatives. *Journal of Blood Medicine*, 3, 87–96. <https://doi.org/10.2147/jbm.s36134>

# Instructor Resources

## Medical Rights and Tissue Ownership Project | Module Title

Created by:

### Adaptations

The introductory slides can be given as proposed, or immediately before the start of the debate.

Students may respond to each of the preparation questions listed within their handout as a pre-class assignment, or if the instructor prefers to make this a two class-period assignment, they may spend the first class period answering the questions individually or in groups. The following class-period they would then participate in the semi-structured debate.

If It fits within your curriculum, this debate ties in very well with "The Immortal Life of Henrietta Lacks". The whole text can be assigned across the period of the semester.

Alternatively, instructors may assign "The Afterward" from the book which explicitly details laws and rights related to tissue ownership and related back to Henrietta Lack's personal story and the effect her experience had on her family.

### Implementation Guide

<b>Class period prior to scheduled debate</b>	~10 minute introduction
<b>Pre-class assignment</b>	Complete the assigned reading and form arguments using guided questions on student activity
<b>In-class debate</b>	~40 minutes ~25 minutes arguing chosen side ~15 minutes arguing opposing side as an exercise in debate skills
<b>Closing Remarks</b>	~10 minutes Assign any desired post-debate assignment (see below suggestions) and complete any necessary discussion remaining from the debate

### Student Assessment

#### Options:

1. Students may provide answers to the pre-class preparation questions for a grade.
2. Students may write a summary of their stance and defend their views for a post-course grade.
3. Participation point can be awarded for adequate involvement in argument formation and debate.

# Student Handout

## Medical Rights and Tissue Ownership

Name :

Date :

### Notes:

Read the following article before coming to class:

Charo, R. A. (2006). Body of research—ownership and use of human tissue. *New England journal of medicine*, 355(15), 1517-1519.

**As you are reading, consider the following questions. I recommend you write down your thoughts to the right, in the notes section. We will be holding a debate in class based on your stance on the ownership of human tissues. You will be asked to pick a side, and defend it as a group. Having well prepared notes with organized thoughts will be helpful while forming your argument.**

**When answering the questions, think about your view as well as how someone with an alternative view would argue your point. Make sure that you are prepared to address rebuttals from your classmates. While you are thinking, pretend that I have a viewpoint that is opposite of yours. Convince me!**

1. Do you believe that individuals should hold the ownership rights of tissues that are extracted from their bodies?
2. How does this change based on the circumstance in which the tissues were taken?
  - a. Consider the use of informed consent
  - b. Severity of procedure (biopsy of cancerous mass vs. Tonsil removal)
3. Should people be compensated for their contributions and tissue extractions when used to advance science?
  - a. If yes, why and how should they be compensated?
  - b. If no, what are your reasons?
4. Consider alternative circumstances. For example, you can freeze a child's umbilical cord for possible use in the future. Who owns that tissue and can decide how to use it: the parents, the child, or the physicians/researchers? What about in the case of sperm and egg storage? What about embryonic tissues implanted within a maternal source or following possible extraction? Who owns those tissues?
5. You can choose to be an organ donor at the time of receiving your driver's license. At that time, you are likely not a legal adult. Do you own your organs at this point? How is this similar or different from your view on number four.
6. Should families be compensated in circumstances in which tissues are extracted or donated following the death of a loved one in place of compensation to the patient?
7. How do you address the need for donor anonymity and protection?
8. Overall consider your views on ownership, compensation, the limits of compensation (who receives it, how much, and in what form). Defend your reasoning.