THE OXFORD HANDBOOK OF

EARLY CHRISTIAN STUDIES

Edited by

SUSAN ASHBROOK HARVEY

and

DAVID G. HUNTER

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Great Clarendon Street, Oxford OX2 6DP

Oxford University Press is a department of the University of Oxford.
It furthers the University's objective of excellence in research, scholarship,
and education by publishing worldwide in

Oxford New York

Auckland Cape Town Dar es Salaam Hong Kong Karachi
Kuala Lumpur Madrid Melbourne Mexico City Nairobi
New Delhi Shanghai Taipei Toronto

With offices in

Argentina Austria Brazil Chile Czech Republic France Greece
Guatemala Hungary Italy Japan Poland Portugal Singapore
South Korea Switzerland Thailand Turkey Ukraine Vietnam

Oxford is a registered trade mark of Oxford University Press
in the UK and in certain other countries

Published in the United States
by Oxford University Press Inc., New York

First published 2008

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

Data available

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Data available

Typeset by SPI Publisher Services, Pondicherry, India
Printed in Great Britain
on acid-free paper by
CPI Antony Rowe, Chippenham, Wiltshire

ISBN 978-0-19-927156-6

1 3 5 7 9 10 8 6 4 2

CHAPTER 40

PILGRIMAGE

GEORGIA FRANK

Early Christian pilgrimage involved a journey to a place in order to gain access to sacred power, whether manifested in living persons, demarcated spaces, or specific objects. Movement toward the sacred site, as well as ritualized movements once at the destination (such as processions, ascents, descents, and circumambulations), shaped pilgrimage. Neither distance nor duration defined these practices so much as the destination's ability to draw visitors from a broader region than a local site might attract.[1] Places associated with the Bible drew large numbers of pilgrims from throughout the Empire. Yet, local martyrs' shrines and pilgrimage centres with international appeal drew visitors to Italy, Asia Minor, Syria, and Egypt.

The nature and origins of Christian pilgrimage are difficult to pinpoint. Greek and Latin lack a single term for what we call 'pilgrimage'. Nor is 'pilgrim' a native category; that is to say, ancient Christians did not identify themselves as 'pilgrim' or some equivalent term. Its Latin cognate, *peregrinatio*, means to travel or reside abroad (s.v. 'peregrinatio', *Oxford Latin Dictionary*, 1335*b*), but lacks the sense of purpose that pilgrimage connotes. Whereas the pilgrim, as we define her, is drawn toward the next sacred destination, the *peregrinus* longs for home (G. Clark 2004: 151). Instead, ancient Christians spoke of voyaging *orationis causa* ('for the sake of prayer'), to pray (*euchesthai*, *proseuchesthai*), to venerate (*proskunein*) the holy places. Their motivations were varied, as pilgrims sought prayer, healing, guidance, intercession, oracles, and visual encounters (Maraval 2004: 137–51). This element of blessings and benefits also sets pilgrims apart from other types of religious travellers, such as itinerant teachers, envoys, prophets, and healers. Like pilgrims, itinerant preachers and healers displace themselves, but with the aim of disseminating benefit rather than acquiring it.

Travel to sacred centres was common in Mediterranean religions. Jewish pilgrimage festivals of Passover, Pentecost, and Tabernacles drew large crowds to Jerusalem until the Temple's destruction in 70 CE (Wilken 1992: 105–8). Outside Palestine, Jews travelled to synagogues (Alexandria) and regional Jewish temples (Elephantine and Heliopolis in Egypt; Kerkeslager 1998). Egyptian temples still bear the traces of pilgrims who scraped walls for sand to carry away with them (Frankfurter 1998*b*: 51). Oracles and healing centres displayed various plaques and offerings left by pilgrims honouring the gods. Such votive offerings and inscriptions bore witness to previous supplicants' gratitude for healing and other interventions (Montserrat 1998).

Early Christians maintained many of these practices. They gathered at the burial places of martyrs for prayers and held funerary banquets there. By the late second century, Palestinian places associated with biblical events drew some Christian leaders from Asia Minor (Hunt 1999). The earliest surviving Christian inscription (*c.* 170/80) records one Abercius's voyage to Rome (Mitchell 2007). Whether these early travellers were 'pilgrims' remains debated. More certain is that the legalization of Christianity in 312 marked a watershed for Christian pilgrimage. The emperor Constantine and his mother promoted Christian holy places by erecting martyria at sites associated with Jesus's life, death, and resurrection. Within a century, a growing network of hostels, hospices, and monasteries emerged to serve pilgrims' needs. In addition, many traditional healing centres attracted Christians, who eventually rededicated the shrines to Christian saints. Menouthis in the Nile Delta was home to an Isis temple that promised healing and fertility, as well as a healing centre dedicated to the physician saints John and Cyrus (Montserrat 1998). At Mamre, a site associated with Abraham's hospitality to angelic visitors, the annual summer fair drew Palestinians, Phoenicians, and Arabians, as well as Jews, pagans, and Christians (Sozomen, *Hist. eccl.* 2. 4. 2–6; see Maraval 2004: 275; Lander 2004). Competition among sanctuaries could be quite intense. At Thecla's centre in Seleucia, pilgrims heard stories about Thecla's powers to out-heal, out-fight, and even out-live the patron heroes and deities at nearby shrines (Davis 2001: 75–9).

40.1 Pilgrims' Writings

Several pilgrims' letters and diaries survive from the fourth through the sixth centuries, including many by and about female pilgrims (Talbot 2002). These records vary in style and length, from schematic lists of place names to detailed reminiscences. Together, they offer many insights into pilgrims' experiences, practices,

and motivations. Known as a movement of storytellers, Christianity would eventually become a movement of travel writers, especially among visitors to the Holy Land. One of the earliest records of Holy Land pilgrimage is an itinerary by an unnamed pilgrim from Bordeaux (*c.* 333). Once regarded as a record of travel and topography, the narrative texture of this seemingly rudimentary list of stopping places and distances has received renewed attention among recent interpreters. Whereas some note how the author's portrayal of Jews reflects Christian imperial ideology (Jacobs 2004), others have observed the disproportionate number of holy places associated with female reproduction, sexuality, and children, prompting speculation that the author was a woman (Douglass 1999). Although the author's identity and gender remain unresolved, scholars have renewed interest in this itinerary's subtle web of telling erasures (Elsner 2000).

A half century later, a pilgrim who was probably named Egeria travelled from Gaul and spent three years (during the 380s or 390s) in Egypt, Palestine, Syria, and Asia Minor.[2] Although portions of her travel account are missing, a seventh-century monk's praise fills some gaps in the itinerary. Written as a letter to her 'sisters' back home in Gaul, this diary is among the earliest extant writings by a Christian woman. Compared to the Bordeaux pilgrim's strict diet of resting places, distances, biblical names, and monuments, Egeria offers a heartier spread. The splendours of late fourth-century church architecture (19. 2) do not escape her attention; nor does she overlook the monks and clergy who aided her along the way. Whether marked by a sumptuous church or a simple stone (e.g. 3. 6, 4. 4), no site failed to impress her. In part, her satisfaction with each holy place derived from hearing the relevant passage from scripture read aloud to her at the very site (*ipso loco*), a convergence she happily noted (4. 3, 10. 7). Readings were typically accompanied by an 'offering', a eucharist. She notes at which sites she received a 'blessing' (*eulogia*) from her host, typically local fruit, but occasionally a copy of a sacred text. In addition to visiting places mentioned in the Old Testament and those associated with events from the gospels, Egeria also describes her travels to remote monasteries in Syria and healing centres such as that of Saint Thecla in Isauria. The second half of Egeria's travel diary provides key glimpses into architectural and liturgical developments at Jerusalem.

Beyond Jerusalem and the biblical holy places, pilgrims to wonder-working ascetics have been the topic of recent studies. Specifically, collections of monastic biography have been reinterpreted as travel writing. The *Historia monachorum in Aegypto* traces the group's journey in the 390s from Lycopolis in Upper Egypt to monasteries in the Nile Delta. Although the travelogue rarely mentions holy places associated with the Bible, its author exoticizes Egyptian monks as spectacles of the biblical past (Frank 2000). In addition, Palladius, bishop of Helenopolis, composed a travelogue in the form of monastic biographies, in a collection (*c.* 420) known today as the *Lausiac History*. Both travelogues reveal how pilgrims sought out the biblical past beyond the holy places.

Perhaps the most detailed of ancient pilgrims' writings from antiquity is a diary by a traveller from Piacenza in Italy. His record of a trip undertaken around 570 describes basilicas, healing hot springs, and various sacred ingestibles, such as dew collected or grapes and dates grown near holy places. Such attention to the material splendours of the holy places, however, cannot hide his quotidian travails, including squabbles with Samaritan merchants, the death of a countryman (presumably a travel companion), and delays due to illness. The patterned devotions typical of Egeria's visits—biblical reading, offering, and blessing—contrast with the variety of devotional practices for this sixth-century pilgrim, who drank from a saint's skull (sect. 20), reclined on each of the benches placed at Gethsemane (sect. 17), pressed an ear to a crack in the rock where Abraham bound Isaac (sect. 19; cf. sect. 22), and held wood from Christ's cross in his hand and kissed it (sect. 20). He notes how he saw implements used in Christ's interrogation and torture, including finger impressions left by the Saviour on the column where he was scourged and footprints in the floor of Pilate's praetorium. Not only has the appearance of the Holy Land changed, as a result of more churches and more relics to venerate. The Piacenza pilgrim also reflects a transformed sensibility toward the land, which, like soft putty, can retain the physical traces of biblical events more permanently. What was once perceived as an adamantine site of biblical events for Egeria, now became more pliant as biblical events left sunken, permanent impressions. The land becomes a repository of memory, now more generative, as the Piacenza pilgrim notes its bounty: souvenirs and substances, including seven pints of water taken from a spring at the tomb of Rachel, five pints of solidified manna received at a Sinai monastery, dirt loaded into Christ's tomb then dispensed in small amounts to pilgrims, 'measures' taken of Christ's footprints. By these objects, the Holy Land both marks and metes out the past.

Another important witness to pilgrimage was the biblical scholar Jerome. In a letter eulogizing his cherished friend, Paula (*Ep.* 108), Jerome described her visits to holy places in Judea as well as to monasteries in Egypt. The power of holy places to evoke biblical episodes led to some visionary experiences for her. He and Paula also composed letters inviting other aristocratic Roman women to come to the Holy Land (e.g. *Ep.* 46). Gerontius's fifth-century sacred biography of Melania the Younger also devoted a significant portion of that *Life* to recounting Melania's travels to monasteries in Egypt and then to holy sites. In Syria, Theodoret, bishop of Cyrrhus, did not overlook pilgrimage in his biographical vignettes of departed and living monastics. According to Theodoret, the holy man Peter the Galatian set out to see the holy places where Christ suffered and to worship God there (*H. rel.* 9. 2; cf. 6. 8). When two Syrian holy women, Marana and Cyra, set out for Jerusalem, they fasted during the entire journey to Jerusalem and throughout their devotions at the holy places. They also fasted during a round-trip journey to the shrine of St Thecla in Isauria (29. 7). Although many famous ascetics never

journeyed to Jerusalem (Jerome, *Ep.* 58. 2–3), hagiographers regarded such journeys as milestones in saintliness.

Despite the appeal of pilgrimage for hagiographers, long-distance travel to holy places drew criticism. Jerome, for instance, defended Jerusalem from the taint of Jesus' crucifixion (*Ep.* 46. 6). Yet elsewhere, he advised Paulinus of Nola to stay away from this urban centre, better suited to buffoons, actors, and prostitutes than to an upright monk (*Ep.* 54. 4). Likewise, bishops such as Gregory of Nyssa and Athanasius of Alexandria warned local monks against pilgrimage. In a famous letter, Gregory of Nyssa (*Ep.* 2) advised monks to avoid pilgrimage. He listed several objections: visiting the holy places was not enjoined in the gospels, and travel conditions might compromise a proper separation of the sexes. His most forceful critique of pilgrimage, however, regarded the theological implications of travel. To seek God at a distant place, he warned, confines God to that place. Rather than travel to God, Gregory advised, a virtuous life at home might draw God to the soul.[3] Gregory was not the first to speak of God's journey or a soul's journey as an alternative to physical pilgrimage. Athanasius saw the dangers of pilgrimage in the homecoming. Nostalgia for the holy places, he advised virgins, could be redirected into ascetic pursuits at home (Brakke 1995: 292–302). He recognized pilgrimage's transformative effects, but also reminded the women of the need to return to the routine of ascetic life in the home.

Whereas modern scholars once regarded these criticisms as direct evidence of dangerous travel conditions, more recent studies have explored these criticisms in light of church leaders' efforts to preserve ecclesiastical control and uphold theological agendas (e.g. Walker 1990; Bitton-Ashkelony 2005). These studies of criticisms and prohibitions consider spiritual alternatives proposed by church leaders. For instance, in a letter addressed to female ascetics who had returned from a Jerusalem pilgrimage, Athanasius did not prohibit pilgrimage. Instead, he exhorted the returning female pilgrims to find more stable and respectable devotional practices in the home. As David Brakke and Susanna Elm have noted, Athanasius's ambivalence regarding pilgrimage and the display of martyrs' bodies was part of a larger theological and political effort to consolidate his episcopal authority among various ascetics and heterodox groups (Elm 1987; Brakke 1998).

If pilgrimage had a downside, it is not apparent from pilgrims' diaries. Cyril, bishop of Jerusalem, underscored the value of seeing and touching the holy places to candidates for baptism, some of whom came to Jerusalem as pilgrims (Walker 1990). Yet bishops outside Jerusalem struggled to privilege holy places closer to home. It is also important to note bishops' roles not only in contesting pilgrimage, but also in transforming it. Recently, Maribel Dietz (2004) has proposed that Holy Land pilgrimage grew out of efforts to curb religious wandering. Thus, promoting Holy Land pilgrimage and other locus-centred travel served the interests of religious leaders who feared that decentralized wandering threatened episcopal authority. Thus theological critiques of pilgrimage may be reread in the context

of travellers' desire for autonomy and 'freedom of experience' (Dietz 2004: 133), as well as economic concerns that wandering mendicant monks may be competing with local bishops for wealthy, lay patronage (Caner 2002).

Protest turned to prohibition, as the Council of Chalcedon in 451 imposed strict limits on monastic wandering. By the sixth century, monks and nuns in some eastern and western churches were forbidden to travel to the Holy Land and other areas, to avoid coming into contact with doctrinal opponents. Overall, however, some bishops recognized the value of pilgrimage for promoting and consolidating regional religious identity. Theodoret, for instance, stressed Marana and Cyra's extraordinary fasts on the road, to demonstrate their resemblance to Moses, but also to avert criticisms of moral laxity often levied against pilgrims. One also detects an apologia for pilgrimage in his description of Peter the Galatian's adoration for the holy places. This holy man, Theodoret noted, longed to see the holy places. By calling attention to Peter's ability to recognize holy places as repositories of Christ's *absence* more than pockets of divine *presence*, the bishop promoted his native Syria as another holy land, populated by ascetics. Regional pride alone, however, cannot account for the promotion of or ambivalence toward holy places. As recent scholars have demonstrated, competition among pilgrimage centres also prompted some bishops to seek consolidation.

Such prohibitions, it seems, had little impact on pilgrimage centres, which continued to produce a variety of writings that would draw even more pilgrims. By the fifth century, saints' lives and miracle collections enticed would-be pilgrims to seek out living saints or their physical remains. Tales of miraculous healings and other wonders reveal the success of some pilgrimage centres, as well as their growing international appeal.

Thus, in recent decades the parameters of 'pilgrims' literature' have broadened considerably, beyond pilgrims' diaries or their guidebooks, to consider how critics and shrines, hagiographers and travellers, fuelled the imagination of would-be pilgrims. In addition to the literary aspects of pilgrimage, its material culture remains an important area of study.

40.2 Material Culture of Pilgrimage

The material culture of pilgrimage includes the large-scale building projects that housed and attracted pilgrims as well as the minute souvenirs they brought home.[4] Whereas saints' lives and pilgrims' diaries offer momentary 'snapshots' of pilgrimage centres, archaeology reveals the transformation of those centres over several centuries. At the Wondrous Mountain, a pilgrimage complex built between 541 and

591 around the column of Symeon the Younger, pilgrims partnered with masons from Isauria to build the inns, a church, and service buildings at the complex (Mango 1991). A single complex might include several pilgrim destinations, such as the Holy Sepulchre in Jerusalem, which included an atrium, a five-aisled basilica, to permit large groups to move about, and an ample porticoed court where the rock of Calvary was displayed, with a rotunda at the site of the resurrection (Ousterhout 1990*b*). The movement from the atrium to the Anastasis Rotunda allowed the steady flow of pilgrim traffic. It is also possible to gauge the success of a pilgrimage destination by its expansion. At Abu Mina in Egypt, a complex dedicated to the martyr saint Menas, early fifth-century pilgrims would have encountered a small church, to which was added stairs to provide easier access to the underground tomb (Grossmann 1998: 283–7). Like many other pilgrimage centres, Abu Mina was also equipped with a baptistery for pilgrims who wished to undergo initiation at the holy site (Stevens 2000). Further expansions, including a larger basilica and baptistery, along with greater accommodations, reflect the growing needs of pilgrims. Qal'at Sim'an, the Syrian pilgrimage centre built following the death of Symeon Stylites the Elder in 459, reveals much about the management of pilgrim traffic. The martyrium there did not follow the east–west orientation typical of many churches. Instead, it was aligned with the approach of pilgrims from the nearby village to the south. Its inscribed arches also guided pilgrims' movement through increasingly sacred holy places. Pilgrims approached the cruciform martyrium through a sacred way marked off by a series of paired arches and a triple arch at the threshold of the martyrium. For women, the journey ended here, whereas male pilgrims entered the church, the eastern branch of which was slightly askew, perhaps to maximize the sunlight on the saint's annual feast-day (Sodini 2001: 254–5). At several pilgrim churches, the saint's relics were kept separate from the altar, housed in a crypt with two sets of stairs, to allow easier access for pilgrims. If relics remained off limits to pilgrims, some shrines found alternate means of access. The crypt of Saint John in Ephesus, for instance, allowed pilgrims to collect holy dust that was said to emanate from the crypt on the saint's feast-day.

Gifts to the saints, or *ex voto* offerings, were presented by pilgrims, in keeping with a practice found at traditional healing centres. Some pilgrims left precious objects, such as jewellery or animals. The Piacenza pilgrim describes the bracelets, rings, tiaras, plaited girdles, belts, emperors' crowns of gold and precious stones deposited at the Holy Sepulchre (sect. 18). Exotic birds roamed the Thecla complex in Seleucia (*Miracles of St Thecla*, 24), to the delight of children there. Small crosses or decorated plaques made of wood or metal typically depicted the saint or simply the body part healed, such as eyes, feet, or hands. Some bore inscribed messages, such as 'in thanksgiving', 'in fulfilment of a vow', 'Lord, help', or simply the word, *euprosdekta* ('may they be acceptable').[5] Eventually, icons of the saint served as

votive offerings, a practice that further restricted pilgrims' physical contact with relics (Hahn 1997: 1090–92).[6]

Beyond votives and souvenirs, the material culture of pilgrimage includes objects consumed at the shrine. Saints' festivals were a time of intense pilgrim traffic for many shrines. In Egypt, papyri include ledgers from one shrine complex listing the various wines, meats, lentils, and special breads ordered for festival days. Unlike the white seamless garment worn by Muslim men on the hajj to Mecca, Christian pilgrims in late antiquity did not don special garments. Yet some carried various travel-size objects. Some forty-seven miniature codices with Christian contents survive. These tiny books would have been read by pilgrims, but also served as amulets for the traveller's protection (Gamble 1995: 237–41; cf. Egeria, *Diary*, 23. 5–6).

Besides what they consumed and inscribed, pilgrims carried many items home. Egeria mentioned various *eulogiai*, or 'blessings', received when departing from the holy places. In addition to offering visitors fruits and vegetables grown locally, monks also sent pilgrims home with manuscripts, including a copy of Jesus' legendary correspondence with the Syrian royal convert, King Abgar of Edessa, that Egeria received (*Diary*, 19. 19). Pilgrims' souvenirs often carried healing or protective properties far from the shrine they commemorated. According to one Syrian hagiographer, workshops in Rome displayed images of the pillar saint Symeon the Elder (Theodoret, *H. rel.* 26. 11). And in one Alexandrian neighbourhood, roughly a 5-days' walk from Abu Mina, modern archaeologists have unearthed some 150 objects depicting St Menas (Haas 1997: 189–206).

Small flasks, known as *ampullae*, were available at the holy places for pilgrims to collect and transport sacred substances.[7] At the church of St Stephen outside Jerusalem, oil or water could be poured into reliquaries equipped with funnels. After the liquid came in contact with the relics, it was collected in a basin beneath the reliquary and then distributed to pilgrims (Donceel-Voûte 1995: 191–2). Holy men such as Symeon the Stylite dispensed a paste, or *hnana*, made out of water and perhaps oil mixed with the dust from a holy place (Syr. *V. Sym. Styl.* 33, 38, trans. Doran: 120, 123). Most *ampullae* date from about 600. Mass-produced from unglazed clay, although occasionally available in more luxurious materials, such as silver, these flasks held small amounts of dirt, water, or oil that had come in contact with the holy place. A typical *ampulla* bore a symbol or image of the saint or the biblical figure remembered at the site. Words from the ritual there or distinctive architectural feature might also adorn these souvenirs.

In addition to *ampullae*, pilgrims collected tokens (*sphragidia*) at holy places, small earthen objects stamped with an impression (Vikan 1982; Sodini 1993). Inscribed spoons were also available to 'raise a blessing' from a saint's tomb, such as a spoon from Egypt with the words *phage mana* (eat manna) with connections

to the tomb of John the Evangelist in Ephesus (Papaconstantinou 2001: 351). In Palestine, pilgrims to Solomon's tomb benefited from the healing properties of mandrake grown there. Some *eulogiai* bear the image of that tubular root (Rahmani 1999). Although little is known about their exact place of manufacture or their distribution, their decoration sheds light on pilgrims' perceptions of healing.[8]

Pilgrims sought access to the saints' powers by other means. They wrote their requests for the saint's protection on small tickets (Papini 1998; Papaconstantinou 2001: 336–7; Frankfurter 2000). The pleas for assistance in business, love, pregnancy, future travel, and various ailments were submitted in the form of two answers, one positive and one negative. Thus pilgrims to the shrine of St Collouthus at Antinoë would submit both the positive and the negative answers. After submitting both questions to the shrine attendant, one of the paired tickets was returned as the saint's response.

Once studied by art historians as evidence for the appearance of holy places and iconography of saints, these souvenirs, amulets, and votives also reveal much about pilgrims' access to the power of holy places. Closely related to magical practices, these objects could extend the pilgrim's access to a saint's healing power well beyond the sanctuary. Thus, while some later votives, such as icons, represent a trend toward curtailing pilgrims' tactile contact with relics (Hahn 1997: 1090–2), souvenirs reveal the exportation of that power to domestic spheres (Vikan 1982).

40.3 Approaches to Pilgrimage

Much research approaches pilgrimage typologically, focusing on the type of destination. Although early studies of pilgrimage tended to concentrate on Holy Land sites associated with the Bible, more recent work has called attention to the role of pilgrimage in shaping local and regional traditions (e.g. Maraval 2004; Markus 1994; Frankfurter 1998*b*). As Robert Markus (1994) has demonstrated, local martyria in a post-persecution age redefined the relation to the sacred past, and thereby laid the groundwork for the rise of biblical holy places. Such typologies have illuminated the rich dialectic between local, regional, and international shrines, and the roles of bishops, shrine personnel, and pilgrims in shaping those relations.

The transformative effects of ritual have been the focus of many cross-cultural studies of pilgrimage, in large part due to the work of anthropologists Victor and Edith Turner (1978). The Turners focused on pilgrimage as a rite of passage, which involves separating from home at the outset of the journey, followed by a liminal stage characterized by freedom from social structure and a sense of bonding with

fellow travellers, or *communitas*, carried through the duration of the journey and the encounter with the sacred destination. The homecoming, or reaggregation, marked the third phase, as pilgrims return to social structures and class divisions. It is difficult to apply such theories to early Christian pilgrims' accounts, since pilgrims tell us so little about their journey to the destination or their travel companions. Yet, the Turners' model has opened historians of Christianity to a broader understanding of journey that includes the homecoming and impact of the pilgrim on those who stayed home. *Communitas*, for instance, may offer some insight into the appeal (and condemnation) of itinerant monastics and the so-called transvestite saints, who abandoned the structures of household and even monastery to pursue a period of wandering. Recent analyses of Athanasius's letter to the female ascetics who returned from Jerusalem also suggest the value of this transformative model for understanding the virgins' nostalgia for the holy places (Frank 2000: 108–11). Early Christian pilgrimage also helps us see some limitations of the model. For instance, is *communitas* or a similar transformation possible for all pilgrims if centres restrict or forbid women's access to the holiest places?

A third approach to pilgrimage emphasizes the function of pilgrimage in satisfying some need(s). Two questions are central to this approach: 'Why do people go on pilgrimages?' and 'What does pilgrimage *do*?' Pilgrimages serve individual needs, such as the stated desire to pray, for relief from ailments, for prophecy, to gain a blessing, and so on. Drawing on recent work in the sociology of tourism, Blake Leyerle (1996) has noted the overlap between how ancient pilgrims and modern tourists seek contact with something authentic. Pilgrims' descriptions of experiences at the shrine also reveal the role of pilgrimage in reshaping perceptions of biblical time (Baldovin 1987; Papaconstantinou 1996: 156–7), not as a distant past, but as a present reality effected by pilgrims' ritual. In the 1980s and 1990s, scholars began to focus more on the role of pilgrimage centres in shaping larger group and regional identities. Thus, David Frankfurter has called attention to pilgrimage as a means for engaging religious communities in Christianization of the sacred landscape (1998*a*, *b*). He calls attention to the persistence of indigenous pilgrimage centres and Christian strategies for continuing those practices.

The literary nature of pilgrims' writings has been the subject of several studies (e.g. Leyerle 1996; Elsner 2000; Frank 2000; Jacobs 2004). Once read as transparent eyewitness reports about travel conditions, holy places, roads, liturgy, and architecture, pilgrims' descriptions can also reveal much about pilgrims' religious imagination and audiences' expectations. Part of a larger 'linguistic turn' in early Christian studies,[9] the poetics of pilgrims' writings has been the subject of recent studies, which call attention to the work that these rhetorical tropes perform and how they represent the distant 'other'. More focused attention on the authors' role in crafting these travel accounts has uncovered parallels to other genres, including exotic travel writing, miracle collections, biography, and apocalyptic. Thus, what was once regarded as a retrospective genre, describing past events, can also be read

as more prospective in effect, as these writings shaped audiences' perceptions of monasticism, the biblical past, Jews, and travel (Frank 2000; Jacobs 2004).

More focused attention on pilgrims' storytelling techniques and tropes has revealed the affinities between pilgrimage and other aspects of piety. Specifically, scholars have noted common ideals and practices in the cult of saints (Hahn 1997), icon veneration (Vikan 2003), monasticism (Frank 2000), and liturgy (Baldovin 1987). Beyond piety, pilgrimage and pilgrims' writings have been recognized as vehicles for the Christianization of space (Frankfurter 1998*a*), time (Markus 1994; Hunt 1982), imperial rule (Jacobs 2004) and elites (Hunt 1982). More work remains to be done on the relationships between pilgrims' writings and apocalyptic narratives to uncover the relationships between patterns of earthly and other-worldly travel. As scholars explore the legacy of cosmic travel for monasticism (Copeland 2004; Connolly 1999) and for perceptions of post-mortem states (Graf 2004), how pilgrimage practices and writings shaped these devotions merits closer investigation.

While the category 'pilgrim' *sensu stricto* remains unresolved,[10] the study of travel to religious destinations has broadened our understanding of how Christians encountered space, matter, and time in their devotions. Pilgrimage remains a valuable category for examining transformations in Christians' embodied engagement with the material world.

Notes

1. Ewa Wipszycka (1995: 429–31) limits the term 'pilgrimage' to long-distance journeys to sacred sites. Yet she also admits that neither pilgrims nor preachers at the holy places explicitly made such distinctions or called attention to the effects of long-distance travel on their perceptions of holy places.
2. On Egeria, see Maraval's 1982 critical edition, as well as Devos (1967); Hunt (2001); Leyerle (1996); Sivan (1988); Starowieyeski (1979).
3. Cf. Porphyry, *V. Plot.* 10. 37–8 (LCL i. 34).
4. This section expands on a portion of my Frank (2007).
5. Theodoret, *Graecarum affectionum curatio*, 8. 64; cf. Mango, (1986: 240–5); cf. Maguire *et al.* (1989: 25, 132).
6. On similar developments in the 'clericalization' of the eucharist, see Caseau (2002).
7. On *ampullae*: Vikan (1982, 1990); Hahn (1990), Maguire *et al.* (1989: 25, 200–1, 209–10).
8. The provenance of these tokens and *ampullae* remains a matter for further study. Many tokens were presumably manufactured at or near the holy places they commemorated (e.g. Rahmani 1999). Yet nothing rules out the possibility that tokens from famous shrines may also have appealed to armchair pilgrims who never visited the site. Whether the production of pilgrims' souvenirs related to major shrines could have been as decentralized as pilgrimage itself is a matter worth pursuing. Pilgrims showed little concern for verifying the 'authenticity' of a souvenir. Further research

on the origins and uses of pilgrims' souvenirs can shed light on these matters relevant to pilgrims' notions of authenticity and its material culture.

9. A helpful and clear overview is now available in E. A. Clark (2004: esp. 165–76).
10. Wipszycka's (1995: 429–32) efforts to distinguish pilgrims *proprement dits* from local visitors has no basis in the writings of long-distance pilgrims or sermons delivered at pilgrimage centres.

Suggested Reading

An important anthology of pilgrims' writings remains the critical edition by P. Geyer and O. Cuntz, *Itineraria et Alia Geographica*, CCSL 175–6 (Turnhout: Brepols, 1965). Egeria's *Diary* is also available in Pierre Maraval (ed. and trans.), *Égérie, Journal de Voyage*, SC 296 (Paris: Éditions du Cerf, 1982). Useful English translations are John Wilkinson, *Egeria's Travels to the Holy Land*, rev. edn. (Jerusalem: Ariel; Warminster: Aris & Phillips, 1981) and Wilkinson (2002). For criticisms of pilgrimage, see Athanasius, *Lettre à des vierges qui étaient allées prier à Jérusalem*, ed. and trans. J. Lebon in 'Athanasiana Syriaca: Une lettre attribuée à saint Athanase d'Alexandrie', *Mus.* 41 (1928: 169–215); and trans. David Brakke in *Athanasius and the Politics of Asceticism*, OECS (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1995: 292–302). Gregory of Nyssa's letters on pilgrimage appear in Pierre Maraval's critical edn., *Grégoire de Nysse, Lettres*, SC 363 (Paris: Éditions du Cerf, 1990); English translations available in *Select Writings and Letters of Gregory, Bishop of Nyssa*, NPNF^2 (Grand Rapids, Mich.: Eerdmans, 1988: 5). On pilgrimage to people, see the anonymous *Historia monachorum in Aegypto*. Greek ed. by A.-J. Festugière (1961; repr. 1971; as Subsidia Hagiographica, 34; Subsidia Hagiographica, 53). The English translation by Norman Russell (1980) appears as *Lives of the Desert Fathers*, CS 34 (Kalamazoo, Mich.: Cistercian Publications). Also important is Palladius's *Lausiac History* (Palladius, *Historia Lausiaca*), ed. Cuthbert Butler (1904) and *The Lausiac History of Palladius*, TaS 6, 2 vols. (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press). Eng. trans.: R. T. Meyer (1964), *Palladius: The Lausiac History*, ACW 34 (New York: Newman Press).

Secondary works have comprised important monographs in the 1980s and valuable collections in the 1990s. The most comprehensive study of late antique pilgrimage remains Maraval (2004). Among the best English-language studies are Hunt (1982), as well as essay collections edited by Ousterhout (1990*a*) and Frankfurter (1998*a*), also Elsner and Rutherford (2005). For archaeological studies, see the fine collection edited by Engemann and Dassmann (1995).

Bibliography

Baldovin, J. F. (1987), *The Urban Character of Christian Worship: The Origins, Development, and Meaning of Stational Liturgy*, OrChrAn 228 (Rome: Pontificium Institutum Orientalium Studiorum).

BITTON-ASHKELONY, B. (2005), *Encountering the Sacred: The Debate on Christian Pilgrimage in Late Antiquity*, Transformation of the Classical Heritage, 38 (Berkeley: University of California Press).

BOUSTAN, R. S., and REED, A. Y. (2004) (eds.), *Heavenly Realms and Earthly Realities in Late Antique Religions* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press).

BRAKKE, D. (1998), '"Outside the Places, Within the Truth": Athanasius of Alexandria on the Localization of the Holy', in Frankfurter (1998*a*), 445–81.

CANER, D. (2002), *Wandering, Begging Monks: Spiritual Authority and the Promotion of Monasticism in Late Antiquity*, Transformation of the Classical Heritage, 33 (Berkeley: University of California Press).

CASEAU, B. (2002), 'L'abandon de la communion dans la main (IV^{e}–XII^{e} siècles)', *Travaux et mémoires*, 14: 79–94.

CLARK, E. A. (2004), *History, Theory, Text: Historians and the Linguistic Turn* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press).

CLARK, G. (2004), 'Pilgrims and Foreigners: Augustine on Travelling Home', in Ellis and Kidner (2004), 149–58.

CONNOLLY, D. K. (1999), 'Imagined Pilgrimage in the Itinerary Maps of Matthew Paris', *Art Bulletin*, 81: 612–22.

COPELAND, K. B. (2004), 'The Earthly Monastery and the Transformation of the Heavenly City in Late Antique Egypt', in Boustan and Reed (2004), 142–58.

DAGRON, G. (1978), *Vie et Miracles de Sainte Thècle*, Subsidia Hagiographica, 62 (Brussels: Société des Bollandistes).

DAVIS, S. J. (2001), *The Cult of St. Thecla: A Tradition of Women's Piety in Late Antiquity*, OECS (Oxford: Oxford University Press).

DEVOS, P. (1967), 'La date du voyage d'Égérie', *AnBoll* 85: 165–94.

DIETZ, M. (2004), 'Itinerant Spirituality and the Late Antique Origins of Christian Pilgrimage', in Ellis and Kidner (2004), 125–34.

DONCEEL-VOÛTE, P. (1995), 'Le rôle des reliquaires dans les pèlerinages', in Engemann and Dassmann (1995), i: 184–205.

DORAN, R. (1992) (ed. and trans.), *The Lives of Symeon Stylites*, CS 112 (Kalamazoo, Mich.: Cistercion Publications).

DOUGLASS, L. (1999), 'A New Look at the *Itinerarium Burdigalense*', *JECS* 4: 313–34.

ELLIS, L., and KIDNER, F. L. (2004) (eds.), *Travel, Communication and Geography in Late Antiquity: Sacred and Profane* (Aldershot: Ashgate).

ELM, S. (1987), 'Perceptions of Jerusalem Pilgrimage as Reflected in Two Early Sources on Female Pilgrimage (3rd and 4th centuries, A.D)', *StPatr* 20: 219–23.

—— (1994), *'Virgins of God': The Making of Asceticism in Late Antiquity* (Oxford: Oxford University Press).

ELSNER, J. (2000), 'The *Itinerarium Burdigalense*: Politics and Salvation in the Geography of Constantine's Empire', *JRS* 90: 181–95.

—— and RUTHERFORD, I. (2005) (eds.), *Pilgrimage in Graeco-Roman and Early Christian Antiquity: Seeing the Gods* (Oxford: Oxford University Press).

ENGEMANN J., and DASSMANN, E. (1995) (eds.), *Akten des XII. Internationalen Kongresses für christliche Archäologie, (Bonn 22–28 September 1991)*; *JAC*, Ergänzungsbände, 20, 1–2 (Münster: Aschendorffsche Verlagsbuchhandlung).

FRANK, G. (2000), *The Memory of the Eyes: Pilgrimage to Living Saints in Christian Late Antiquity*, Transformations of the Classical Heritage, 30 (Berkeley: University of California Press).

—— (2007), 'From Antioch to Arles: Lay Devotion in Context', in A. Cassidy and F. Norris (eds.), *The Cambridge History of Christianity*, ii: *Constantine to c.* 600 (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press), 531–47.

FRANKFURTER, D. (1998*a*) (ed.), *Pilgrimage and Holy Space in Late Antique Egypt*, Religions in the Graeco-Roman World, 134 (Leiden: E. J. Brill).

—— (1998*b*), *Religion in Roman Egypt: Assimilation and Resistance* (Princeton: Princeton University Press).

—— (2000), 'Christian Oracle Shrines', in R. Valantasis (ed.), *Religions of Late Antiquity in Practice* (Princeton: Princeton University Press), 469–72.

GAMBLE, H. Y. (1995), *Books and Readers in the Early Church: A History of Early Christian Texts* (New Haven: Yale University Press).

GERONTIUS, *Vita Melaniae Iunoris*. Text: D. Gorce, *Vie de Sainte Mélanie*, SC 90 (Paris: Éditions du Cerf, 1962). Eng. trans.: E. A. Clark, *The Life of Melania the Younger*, Studies in Women and Religion, 14 (Lewiston, NY: Edwin Mellen, 1984).

GRAF, F. (2004), 'The Bridge and the Ladder: Narrow Passages in Late Antique Visions', in Boustan and Reed (2004), 19–33.

GROSSMANN, P. (1998), 'The Pilgrimage Center of Abū Mīnā', in Frankfurter (1998), 281–302.

HAAS, C. (1997), *Alexandria in Late Antiquity* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press).

HAHN, C. (1990), 'Loca Sancta Souvenirs: Sealing the Pilgrim's Experience', in Ousterhout (1990), 85–96.

—— (1997), 'Seeing and Believing: The Construction of Sanctity in Early-Medieval Saints' Shrines', *Speculum*, 72: 1079–1106.

HUNT, E. D. (1982), *Holy Land Pilgrimage in the Later Roman Empire (AD 312–460)* (Oxford: Clarendon Press).

—— (1999), 'Were There Christian Pilgrims before Constantine?', in J. Stopford (ed.), *Pilgrimage Explored* (Woodbridge, Suffolk: York Medieval Press), 25–40.

—— (2001), 'The Date of *Itinerarium Egeriae*', *StPatr* 38: 410–16.

JACOBS, A. S. (2004), *Remains of the Jews: The Holy Land and Christian Empire in Late Antiquity*, Divinations: Rereading Late Ancient Religion (Stanford, Calif.: Stanford University Press).

KERKESLAGER, A. (1998), 'Jewish Pilgrimage and Jewish Identity in Hellenistic and Early Roman Egypt', in Frankfurter (1998*a*), 99–225.

LANDER, S. (2004), 'The Word Made Flesh: Case Studies of Confluence and Conflict in the Shrines of the Terebinths of Mamre (Palestine) and the Maccabean Martyrs (Syria)', paper presented at the AAR, San Antonio, Texas.

LEYERLE, B. (1996), 'Landscape as Cartography in Early Christian Pilgrimage Narratives', *JAAR* 64: 119–43.

MAGUIRE, H. P., DAUTERMAN, E., and DUNCAN-FLOWERS, M. J. (1989) (eds.), *Art and Holy Powers in the Early Christian House* (Urbana, Ill.: University of Illinois Press).

MANGO, M. M. (1986), *Silver from Early Byzantium: The Kaper Koraon and Related Treasures* (Baltimore: Wallers Art Gallery).

—— (1991), 'Wondrous Mountain', in *Oxford Dictionary of Byzantium* (Oxford: Oxford University Press), iii. 2204.

MARAVAL, P. (2004), *Lieux saints et pèlerinages d'Orient: Histoire et géographie des origines à la conquête arabe*, 2nd edn. (Paris: Éditions du Cerf; 1st edn. 1985).

MARKUS, R. A. (1994), 'How on Earth Could Places Become Holy? Origins of the Christian Idea of Holy Places', *JECS* 2: 257–71.

MITCHELL, M. M. (2007), 'Looking for Abercius: Re-Imagining Contexts of Interpretation of the "Earliest Christian Inscription"', in L. Brink and D. Green (eds.), *Commemorating the Dead* (Berlin: de Gruyter), 303–35.

MONTSERRAT, D. (1998), 'Pilgrimage to the Shrine of SS. Cyrus and John at Menouthis in Late Antiquity', in Frankfurter (1998), 257–79.

OUSTERHOUT, R. (1990*a*) (ed.), *The Blessings of Pilgrimage*, Illinois Byzantine Studies, 1 (Urbana, Ill.: University of Illinois Press).

—— (1990*b*), 'Loca Sancta and the Architectural Response to Pilgrimage', in Ousterhout (1990*a*), 108–24.

PAPACONSTANTINOU, A. (1996), 'La liturgie stationnale à Oxyrhynchos dans la première moitié du 6e siècle: réédition et commentaire du *P.Oxy.* XI 1357', *Revue des Études Byzantines*, 54: 135–59.

—— (2001), *Le Culte des saints en Égypte des Byzantins aux Abbassides: L'apport des inscriptions et des papyrus grecs et coptes* (Paris: CNRS Editions).

PAPINI, L. (1998), 'Fragments of the Sortes Sanctorum from the Shrine of St. Colluthus', in Frankfurter (1998), 393–401.

PIACENZA PILGRIM, *Ps.-Antonini Placentini Itinerarium*. Text: in P. Geyer and O. Cuntz (eds.), *Itineraria et Alia Geographica*, CCSL 175–6 (Turnhout: Brepols, 1965), 175: 129–53. Eng. trans. in Wilkinson (2002).

RAHMANI, L. Y. (1999), 'The Byzantine Solomon *Eulogia* Tokens in the British Museum', *Israel Exploration Journal*, 49: 92–104.

SIVAN, H. (1988), 'Who Was Egeria? Piety and Pilgrimage in the Age of Gratian', *HTR* 81: 59–72.

SMITH, J. Z. (1987), *To Take Place: Toward Theory in Ritual* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press).

SODINI, J.-P. (1993), 'Nouvelles eulogies de Syméon', in C. Jolivet-Lévy *et al.* (eds.), *Les saints et leur sanctuaire: textes, images et monuments* (Paris: Publications de la Sorbonne), 25–33.

—— (2001), 'La hiérarchisation des espaces à Qal'at Sem'an', in M. Kaplan (ed.), *Le sacré et son inscription dans l'espace à Byzance et en Occident: Études comparées*, Byzantina Sorbonensia, 18 (Paris: Publications de la Sorbonne), 251–62.

STAROWIEYESKI, M. (1979), 'Bibliografia Egeriana', *Aug* 19: 297–318.

STEVENS, S. T. (2000), 'Excavations of an Early Christian Pilgrimage Complex at Bir Ftouha (Carthage)', *DOP* 54: 271–4.

TALBOT, A.-M. (2002), 'Female Pilgrimage in Late Antiquity and the Byzantine Era', *Acta Byzantina Fennica*, NS 1: 73–88.

TURNER, V., and TURNER, E. (1978), *Image and Pilgrimage in Christian Culture* (New York: Columbia University Press).

VIKAN, G. (1982), *Byzantine Pilgrimage Art* (Washington D.C.: Dumbarton Oaks).

—— (1990), 'Pilgrims in Magi's Clothing: The Impact of Mimesis on Early Byzantine Pilgrimage Art', in Ousterhout (1990), 97–107; repr. in Vikan (2003).

—— (2003), *Sacred Images and Sacred Power in Byzantium*, Variorum Collected Studies Series, 778 (Aldershot: Ashgate).

WALKER, P. W. L. (1990), *Holy City, Holy Places? Christian Attitudes to Jerusalem and the Holy Land in the Fourth Century* (Oxford: Clarendon Press).

WILKEN, R. L. (1992), *The Land Called Holy: Palestine in Christian History and Thought* (New Haven: Yale University Press).

WILKINSON, J. (2002) (ed.), *Jerusalem Pilgrims before the Crusades*, rev. edn. (Warminster: Aris & Phillips; 1st edn. 1977).

WIPSZYCKA, E. (1995), 'Les pèlerinages chrétiens dans l'antiquité tardive: Problemes de definition et de repères temporels', *Byzantinoslavica*, 56: 429–38.