

Is it the Message or the Messenger?

Examining Movement in Immigration Beliefs*

Hassan Afrouzi
Columbia University

Carolina Arteaga
University of Toronto

Emily Weisburst
UCLA Luskin

November 2022

[\[Link to Main Draft\]](#)

*We thank Jonathan Weisburst for sound editing and Michael Floyd for voice recording. We are also grateful to Marco Tabellini, Pablo Querubin, Tianyi Wang, Eric Merkley, Arthur Blouin, Kristen Cornelson, Sandra Black, Sarah Reber, and Felipe Goncalves for helpful feedback as well as seminar participants at UC Merced, UCLA, the University of Toronto, and the Canadian Economic Association (CEA). We gratefully acknowledge support from ISERP seed grant from Columbia University, SSHRC Institutional Grant and REG from UCLA. The experiment in this study was pre-registered with the American Economic Association with number AEARCTR-0006552. The study procedures were approved by the Institutional Review Boards of Columbia University, University of Toronto, and UCLA. Afrouzi: Columbia Economics, 1022 International Affairs Building, 420 W 118th St, New York, NY, 10027, ha2475@columbia.edu. Arteaga: University of Toronto Economics, carolina.arteaga@utoronto.ca. Weisburst: UCLA Luskin School of Public Affairs, weisburst@ucla.edu.

SUPPLEMENTAL MATERIALS:
Survey and Speech Texts

S1 Survey Questionnaire

This Appendix includes the survey questionnaire. Participants were recruited into the study using the web survey service CloudResearch which aggregates participants from multiple online survey platforms. CloudResearch worked with the research team to target Republican and Democrat participants who were representative of the demographics of each respective party. The survey and research protocols were approved by the Institutional Review Boards (IRB) at UCLA, University of Toronto, and Columbia University.

S1.1 Study Information Sheet

Survey Instructions

Thank you for agreeing to take this survey. It is very important for the success of our research project that you complete the survey until the end, once you have started. This survey should take (on average) about 10 minutes to complete.

The survey requires the ability to listen to audio clips through SoundCloud – please make sure that your browser will be able to do this before you begin.

Why is this study being done?

Researchers at UCLA (Emily Weisburst), the University of Toronto (Carolina Arteaga) and Columbia University (Hassan Afrouzi) are conducting a study about media, politics and perception. Your participation in this research study is voluntary.

What will happen if I take part in this research study?

If you volunteer to participate in this study, the researcher will ask you to do the following: Answer a few questions about your demographics and political/social views and listen to an audio clip of a speech.

Who can participate in the study?

The focus of this study is understanding people's views on social issues for individuals in particular groups. We are seeking participation from English speakers who are eligible to vote in the U.S. and who have certain social/political views.

How long will I be in the research study?

Participation will take a total of about 10 minutes. If you complete the survey, the researchers may contact you to participate in a follow-up survey at a later date.

Are there any potential benefits, risks or discomforts that I can expect from this study?

There are no anticipated benefits. There are no anticipated risks or discomforts.

Will I be paid for participating?

You will receive compensated according to the terms and conditions agreed to when you joined your panel.

What are the features of the lottery payment in the survey?

As part of the study, there will be a lottery where participants can earn up to \$25 in addition to the base compensation for participation. Survey participants do not need to complete the entirety of the survey or remain in the study to be entered into the drawing for \$25. The probability of winning the lottery is approximately 0.01%. If you win the lottery, you will be notified at the conclusion of the survey and will be paid within 2 months. You may need to share additional contact information in order to receive payment.

Will information about me and my participation be kept confidential?

In this study, we will not collect any information that can identify you in our research.

What are my rights if I take part in this study?

- You can choose whether or not you want to be in this study, and you may withdraw your consent and discontinue participation at any time.
- You may refuse to answer any questions that you do not want to answer and still remain in the study.
- Whatever decision you make, there will be no penalty to you, and no loss of benefits to which you were otherwise entitled.

Who can I contact if I have questions about this study?

The research team: If you have any questions, comments or concerns about the research you can talk to one of the researchers. Please contact: Carolina Arteaga at carolina.arteaga@utoronto.ca or Emily Weisburst at weisburst@ucla.edu.

If you have questions about your rights as a research subject, or you have concerns or suggestions and you want to talk to someone other than the researchers, you may contact the UCLA Office of the Human Research Protection Program by phone: (310) 206-2040; by email: participants@research.ucla.edu or by mail: Box 951406, Los Angeles, CA 90095-1406.

Consent (Administered in CloudResearch Recruitment)

Would you like to participate in the study? (Yes/No)

S1.2 Survey

S1.2.1 Demographics

1. Quality Check – Verify that you are not a robot. (Qualtrics Recaptcha)
2. This survey requires the ability to maintain a strong internet connection and the capacity to listen to audio content through SoundCloud. Does your device have this capability?

- (a) Yes
 - (b) No (EXIT SURVEY IF NO)
3. Are you a U.S. Citizen?
- (a) Yes
 - (b) No (EXIT SURVEY IF NO)
4. What is your gender?
- (a) Male
 - (b) Female
 - (c) Other/Prefer Not to Answer
5. How would you describe your ethnicity/race?
- (a) White or Caucasian
 - (b) Black or African American
 - (c) Hispanic or Latino/Latinx
 - (d) Asian or Pacific Islander
 - (e) Other
6. What is your age?
- (a) 18-24 years old
 - (b) 25-34 years old
 - (c) 35-44 years old
 - (d) 45-54 years old
 - (e) 65-74 years old
 - (f) 75 or older
7. Which category best describes your highest level of education?
- (a) Less than High School
 - (b) High School degree / GED
 - (c) Some College
 - (d) College Degree or higher
8. What is your current employment status?
- (a) Full-time employee
 - (b) Part-time employee
 - (c) Self-employed or small business owner
 - (d) Not employed
9. Were you born in the United States?
- (a) Yes
 - (b) No
10. In politics, as of today, do you consider yourself:
- (a) Republican
 - (b) Democrat
 - (c) Independent
 - (d) Other
- (EXIT SURVEY IF RECRUITED AS DEMOCRAT AND CHOSE REPUBLICAN; OR VICE VERSA)
11. Did you vote in the last presidential election?
- (a) Yes
 - (b) No

12. (If Yes) In the last presidential election, you supported:
 - (a) Hillary Clinton
 - (b) Donald Trump
 - (c) Gary Johnson
 - (d) Jill Stein
13. (If No) Even if you did NOT vote, please indicate the candidate that you were most likely to have voted for or who represents your views most closely
 - (a) Hillary Clinton
 - (b) Donald Trump
 - (c) Gary Johnson
 - (d) Jill Stein

S1.2.2 Attention Check

All participants will listen to a 30 second weather forecast audio clip. The weather forecast was from a San Diego local news network and described sunny 70 degree weather through the upcoming weekend. The purposes of this clip are to check the attention of people before randomization. Intervention is a weather forecast from San Diego, CA. Prompt for Audio Clip: "Listen to the following audio clip before proceeding to the rest of the survey."

1. The audio clip came from a news network. What was the main subject of the audio clip? *(Order of options randomized)*
 - (a) Crime Story
 - (b) Baseball Highlights
 - (c) Traffic Report
 - (d) Weather Forecast
 - (e) Stock Market News
 - (f) I don't know or don't remember

(EXIT SURVEY IF WEATHER FORECAST NOT CHOSEN)
2. What type of weather was discussed in the audio clip? *(Order of options randomized)*
 - (a) Tornado
 - (b) Thunderstorms
 - (c) Pleasant Weather (Sunny and Warm)
 - (d) Below Freezing Temperatures
 - (e) I don't know or don't remember

(EXIT SURVEY IF PLEASANT WEATHER NOT CHOSEN)

S1.2.3 Background Views

Next, we are going to ask you a couple of questions about issues and the news.

(Blocks 1 and 2 are randomized; Order of questions within blocks is randomized as well)

Block 1

1. Thinking now about immigrants – that is, people who come from other countries to live in the United States, in your view, should immigration be kept at its present level, increased or decreased?
 - (a) Present level

- (b) Increased
 - (c) Decreased
 - (d) No opinion
2. Thinking now about firearms and guns – in general, do you feel that the laws covering the sale of firearms should be made more strict, less strict or kept as they are now?
 - (a) More strict
 - (b) Less strict
 - (c) Kept as they are now
 - (d) No opinion
 3. Thinking now about abortion – do you think abortions should be legal under any circumstances, legal only under certain circumstances or illegal in all circumstances?
 - (a) Legal under any circumstances
 - (b) Legal only under certain circumstances
 - (c) Illegal in all circumstances
 - (d) No opinion
 4. Thinking now about healthcare – do you think it is the responsibility of the federal government to make sure all Americans have healthcare coverage, or is that not the responsibility of the federal government?
 - (a) Yes, it is the government's responsibility
 - (b) No, it is not the government's responsibility
 - (c) No opinion
 5. Thinking now about taxes – do you consider the amount of federal income tax you have to pay too high, about right or too low?
 - (a) Too high
 - (b) About right
 - (c) Too low
 - (d) No opinion
 6. Which of the following issues is most important to you? *(Position of this question fixed at end of block; Order of answers randomized)*
 - (a) Immigration
 - (b) Taxes
 - (c) Healthcare
 - (d) Abortion
 - (e) Gun Control

Block 2

1. How often do you read or watch the news through the following outlets?
(Matrix Question, order of parts randomized)
(Options: Never; Occasionally; Weekly; Daily)
 - (a) Newspapers (Web or Print)
 - (b) TV
 - (c) Facebook
 - (d) Twitter
2. How often do you read or watch the news through the following outlets?
(Matrix Question, order of parts randomized)

(Options: Never; Occasionally; Weekly; Daily)

- (a) Breitbart News
- (b) Buzzfeed
- (c) Fox News
- (d) MSNBC
- (e) The New York Times

3. Below is a list of some of the most followed figures on social media platforms. Indicate whether you are a fan of each of these public figures.

(Matrix Question, order of parts randomized)

(Options: Yes, a fan; No, not a fan; No Opinion)

- (a) Barack Obama
- (b) Taylor Swift
- (c) Ellen DeGeneres
- (d) Donald Trump
- (e) Kim Kardashian West
- (f) Bill Gates
- (g) LeBron James

S1.2.4 Treatment

Participants are randomized to 1 of 11 different arms. These arms are no audio treatment, 3 President Obama speaker audio clips (Anti-Immigrant, Pro-Immigrant, Turkey Pardon), 3 President Trump speaker audio clips (Anti-Immigrant, Pro-Immigrant, Turkey Pardon), and 4 actor versions of the president speeches on immigration (Anti-Immigrant and Pro-Immigrant for both Trump and Obama). Randomization is stratified by political party (Republican/Democrat) identified by CloudResearch at the recruitment stage.

Introduction for a President Speaker Audio Clip: “The following audio clip is an excerpt of a presidential speech made by President (Donald Trump, Barack Obama). Listen to the audio clip before proceeding to the rest of the survey.”

Introduction for an Actor Speaker Audio Clip: “The following audio clip is an excerpt of a presidential speech read by an actor. Listen to the audio clip before proceeding to the rest of the survey.”

1. (If exposed to an immigration speech) What was the main topic of the audio clip?

(Order of options randomized)

- (a) Immigration
- (b) Healthcare
- (c) Gun Control
- (d) Abortion
- (e) Taxes
- (f) I don't know or don't remember

(EXIT SURVEY IF IMMIGRATION NOT CHOSEN)

2. (If exposed to a turkey pardon speech) Which holiday was discussed in the audio clip?

(Order of options randomized)

- (a) Thanksgiving
- (b) Easter
- (c) Christmas
- (d) New Years
- (e) July 4th
- (f) I don't know or don't remember

(EXIT SURVEY IF THANKSGIVING NOT CHOSEN)

S1.2.5 Post-Treatment Questions

1. At this point in time, which candidate will you most likely support for the next presidential election? (Order of first two options randomized)
 - (a) Democrat candidate (Joe Biden)
 - (b) Republican candidate (Donald Trump)
 - (c) Other or No opinion

The ordering of Block 1 and 2 below was randomized. Question order within each block of questions was also randomized.

Block 1

1. Do you favor or oppose the following proposal?
Significantly expand the construction of walls along the U.S. border with Mexico
 - (a) Strongly Favor
 - (b) Favor
 - (c) Oppose
 - (d) Strongly Oppose
 - (e) No Opinion
2. Do you favor or oppose the following proposal?
Hire significantly more border patrol agents
 - (a) Strongly Favor
 - (b) Favor
 - (c) Oppose
 - (d) Strongly Oppose
 - (e) No Opinion
3. Do you favor or oppose the following proposal?
Require business owners to check the immigration status of workers they hire
 - (a) Strongly Favor
 - (b) Favor
 - (c) Oppose
 - (d) Strongly Oppose
 - (e) No Opinion
4. Do you favor or oppose the following proposal?
Deport all immigrants living in the U.S. illegally back to their home countries
 - (a) Strongly Favor
 - (b) Favor
 - (c) Oppose
 - (d) Strongly Oppose

- (e) No Opinion
- 5. Do you favor or oppose the following proposal?
Deport all immigrants living in the U.S. illegally with a **criminal record** back to their home countries
 - (a) Strongly Favor
 - (b) Favor
 - (c) Oppose
 - (d) Strongly Oppose
 - (e) No Opinion
- 6. Do you favor or oppose the following proposal?
Allow immigrants living in the U.S. illegally to remain in the U.S. and become citizens, but only if they meet certain requirements
 - (a) Strongly Favor
 - (b) Favor
 - (c) Oppose
 - (d) Strongly Oppose
 - (e) No Opinion
- 7. Do you favor or oppose the following proposal?
Allow immigrants who were brought to the U.S. illegally **as children** to remain in the U.S. and become citizens, but only if they meet certain requirements
 - (a) Strongly Favor
 - (b) Favor
 - (c) Oppose
 - (d) Strongly Oppose
 - (e) No Opinion

Block 2

- 1. Do immigrants living in the U.S. illegally commit a large or disproportionate share of violent crimes in the U.S.?
 - (a) Yes
 - (b) No
 - (c) No opinion
- 2. Suppose the U.S. authorities were able to remove almost all immigrants living in the U.S. illegally. What effect do you think this would have on the U.S. economy?
 - (a) Positive
 - (b) Neither positive or negative
 - (c) Negative
 - (d) No opinion
- 3. In your view, should immigration be kept at its present level, increased or decreased?
 - (a) Present level
 - (b) Increased
 - (c) Decreased
 - (d) No opinion
- 4. Overall, in your opinion, do immigrants in the following groups positively or negatively contribute to society in the U.S.?

(Matrix Question, order of parts randomized)

(Options: Positive contribution; Neutral contribution; Negative contribution, No opinion)

- (a) Immigrants **working legally** in the U.S.
 - (b) Immigrants **not working legally** in the U.S.
 - (c) Immigrants from **English-speaking** countries
 - (d) Immigrants from **Spanish-speaking** countries
 - (e) **Dreamers:** undocumented immigrants brought to the U.S. by their parents at a young age.
5. Overall, in your opinion, how positive or negative is the contribution of immigrants to the United States?
- (Order of “positive or negative” randomized in question text above)*
- (Participants choose a scale value from a slider, ranges from -100 to 100, 100 is positive)*

Block 3

(Block 3 presented after Block 1 and 2. Only shown to arms that heard one of the audio clips - excludes no audio group. Order of questions within this block is fixed).

1. The audio segment you just heard was taken from a presidential speech. Which president do you think gave the speech?
- Options randomized*
- (a) Donald Trump
 - (b) Barack Obama
 - (c) George W. Bush
 - (d) Bill Clinton
 - (e) Other
2. The audio segment you just heard was taken from a presidential speech made by either President Donald Trump or President Barack Obama. How likely do you think it is that the audio clip came from a speech made by President Barack Obama (Donald Trump)?
- (Question text randomizes whether participants are asked about the likelihood of Trump or Obama as the speaker)*
- (Participants choose a scale value from a slider, ranges from 0 to 100, 100 is confidence in president indicated in the question)*
3. (If participant was in a treatment arm with an immigration speech) In your opinion, how anti-immigrant (pro-immigrant) was the audio segment you just heard?
- (Question text randomizes whether participants are asked about the clip being anti-immigrant or pro-immigrant)*
- (Participants choose a scale value from a slider, ranges from 0 to 100, 100 is either anti-immigrant or pro-immigrant depending on question wording above)*

S1.2.6 Charity Choice and Lottery

The survey will immediately determine the lottery winner for questions below using the Random ID generated by Qualtrics. The lottery probability will be 0.006%. All participants who passed the demographic screener questions were entered in the lottery - regardless of whether they finished the survey or satisfied the quality checks for inclusion in the sample.

“By taking this survey, you will be entered into a cash lottery. The probability of winning the

lottery is approximately 0.01% and the prize is up to \$25.

You will be notified at the end of the survey if you won the lottery. If you win, you may be asked for additional information for purposes of payment. Lottery payments will be made within 2 months. Survey participants do not need to complete the entirety of the survey or remain in the study to be entered into the lottery.”

1. If you win the lottery, you can choose a prize of \$25 dollars or can donate a portion of this amount to one of the charities below. If you donate some of this amount, the donation will be doubled before it is donated to the charity. Select which charity you would prefer for this donation.

(Order of options randomized)

- (a) The **American Civil Liberties Union (ACLU) Immigrants’ Rights Project** is dedicated to expanding and enforcing the civil liberties and civil rights of immigrants and to combating public and private discrimination against them. Using targeted impact litigation, advocacy, and public outreach, the ACLU protects the rights and liberties of immigrants. For more information go to: <https://www.aclu.org/issues/immigrants-rights>
 - (b) The **Federation for American Immigration Reform (FAIR)** seeks to reduce overall immigration to a more normal level. Reducing legal immigration levels from well over one million presently to 300,000 a year over a sustained period will allow America to manage growth, address environmental concerns, and maintain a high quality of life. For more information go to: <https://www.fairus.org/>
 - (c) I prefer not to donate to either charity
2. (If a charity is chosen) How much of the \$25 prize would you like to donate?
(Participants choose a scale value from a slider, ranges from 0 to 25, displays quantities that the person gets and the charity gets on scale)
3. (If a charity is chosen) If you win the lottery, would you be interested in sharing a post about your donation on social media?
 - (a) Yes
 - (b) No

Survey Exit Message

(If Lost Lottery) “Thank you for taking the time to complete this survey. Your response has been recorded.”

(If Won Lottery) “Congratulations! You won the lottery prize. We will submit payment through a valid PayPal account. Please enter your PayPal email account below to receive payment.

Thank you for taking the time to complete this survey. Your response has been recorded.

Please enter your PayPal email address to receive payment: (ENTER PAYPAL EMAIL).”

S2 Speech Treatments

This section includes the full text of the audio excerpts used as treatments in the experiment as well as the original speeches that the excerpts were derived from. We also include links to the audio treatments used in the experiment as well as video versions of the original speeches.

S2.1 President Trump: Full Immigration Speech

Below is the text of the full speech on immigration given by President Trump on 1/19/2019. The speech was given as part of a public effort to end a government shutdown related to immigration policy negotiations. In the speech, Trump offers to provide protection for children who came to the U.S. illegally (through the Deferred Action for Childhood Arrivals or DACA program) as part of an exchange for additional funding for border security. The sentences are numbered so that it is easier to see how the excerpted segments used in the experiment were constructed.

Video of Speech:

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=_FqmGcERGrq

[1] Just a short time ago, I had the honor of presiding over the swearing in of five new great American citizens. [2] It was a beautiful ceremony and a moving reminder of our nation's proud history of welcoming legal immigrants from all over the world into our national family. [3] I told them that the beauty and majesty of citizenship is that it draws no distinctions of race or class or faith or gender or background. [4] All Americans whether first generation or tenth generation are bound together in love and loyalty, friendship and affection. [5] We're all equal. [6] We are one team and one people proudly saluting one great American flag.

[7] We believe in a safe and lawful system of immigration, one that upholds our laws, our traditions and our most cherished values. [8] Unfortunately, our immigration system has been badly broken for a very long time. [9] Over the decades many presidents and many lawmakers have come and gone, and no real progress has been made on immigration. [10] We are now living with the consequences – and they are tragic – brought about by decades of political stalemate, partisan gridlock, and national neglect.

[11] There is a humanitarian and security crisis on our southern border that requires urgent action. [12] Thousands of children are being exploited by ruthless "coyotes" and vicious cartels and gangs. [13] One in three women is sexually assaulted on the dangerous journey north. [14] In fact, many loving mothers give their young daughters birth control pills for the long journey up to the United States because they know they may be raped or sexually accosted or assaulted. [15] Nearly 50 migrants a day are being referred for urgent medical care. [16] Vast quantities of lethal narcotics are flooding through our border and into our communities, including meth, cocaine, heroin and fentanyl.

[17] Drugs kill 78,000 Americans a year and cost our society in excess of \$700 billion. [18] Heroin alone kills 300 Americans a week; 90 percent of which comes across our southern border. [19] We can stop heroin.

[20] Illegal immigration reduces wages and strains public services. [21] The lack of border control provides a gateway, and a very wide and open gateway, for criminals and gang members to enter the United States, including the criminal aliens who murdered a brave California police officer only a day after Christmas. [22] I've gotten to know and love angel moms, dads and family who lost loved ones to people illegally in our country.

[23] I want this to end; it's got to end now. [24] These are not talking points. [25] These are the heartbreaking realities that are hurting innocent, precious human beings every single day on both sides of the border. [26] As a candidate for president, I promised I would fix this crisis, and I intend to keep that promise one way or the other. [27] Our immigration system should be the subject of pride, not a source of shame, as it is all over the world.

[28] Our immigration system should be the envy of the world, not a symbol of disunity and dysfunction. [29] The good news is these problems can all be solved, but only if we have the political courage to do what is just and what is right. [30] Both sides in Washington must simply come together, listen to each other, put down their armor, build trust, reach across the aisle and find solutions.

[31] It is time to reclaim our future from the extreme voices who fear compromise and demand open borders, which means drugs pouring in, human trafficking and a lot of crime. [32] That is why I am here today, to break the logjam and provide Congress with a path forward to end the government shutdown and solve the crisis on the southern border. [33] If we are successful in this effort, we will then have the best chance in a very long time at real bipartisan immigration reform. [34] And it won't stop here. [35] It will keep going until we do it all. [36] The proposal I will outline today is based, first and foremost, on input from our border agents and Homeland Security professionals – and professionals they are; they know what they're doing.

[37] It is a compassionate response to the ongoing tragedy on our southern border. [38] In recent weeks we have met with large numbers of Democrat lawmakers to hear their ideas and suggestions. [39] By incorporating the priorities of rank and file Democrats in our plan, we hope they will offer their enthusiastic support. [40] And I think many will.

[41] This is a common-sense compromise both parties should embrace.

[42] The radical left can never control our borders. [43] I will never let it happen. [44] Walls are not immoral. [45] In fact, they are the opposite of immoral, because they will save many lives and stop drugs from pouring into our country. [46] Our plan includes the following: \$800 million in urgent humanitarian assistance; \$805 million for drug detection technology to help secure our ports of entry. [47] An additional 2,750 border agents and law enforcement professionals, 75 new immigration judge teams to reduce the court backlog of - believe it or not - almost 900,000 cases. [48] However, the whole concept of having lengthy trials, for anyone who sets one foot in our country unlawfully, must be changed by Congress.

[49] It is unsustainable. [50] It is ridiculous. [51] Few places in the world would even consider such an impossible nightmare. [52] Our plan includes critical measures to protect migrant children from exploitation and abuse.

[53] This includes a new system to allow Central American minors to apply for asylum in their home countries, and reform to promote family reunification for unaccompanied children, thousands of whom wind up on our border doorstep. [54] To physically secure our border, the plan includes \$5.7 billion for a strategic deployment of physical barriers, or a wall. [55] This is not a 2,000 mile concrete structure from sea to sea. [56] These are steel barriers in high priority locations.

[57] Much of the border is already protected by natural barriers, such as mountains and water. [58] We already have many miles of barrier, including 115 miles that we are currently building or under contract. [59] It will be done quickly. [60] Our request will add another 230 miles this year in the areas our border agents most urgently need.

[61] It will have an unbelievable impact. [62] If we build a powerful and fully designed see-

through steel barrier on our southern border, the crime rate and drug problem in our country would be quickly and greatly reduced. [63] Some say it could be cut in half. [64] Because these criminals, drug smugglers, gangs and traffickers do not stop at our border. [65] They permeate throughout our country and they end up in some places where you'd least expect them; they go all over our country.

[66] A steel barrier will help us stop illegal immigration, while safely directing commerce to our lawful ports of entry. [67] Many of these security ideas have been proposed by Democrats themselves, and all of them have been supported by Democrats in the past, including a physical barrier wall or fence.

[68] Furthermore, in order to build the trust and goodwill necessary to begin real immigration reform, there are two more elements to my plan.

[69] Number one is three years of legislative relief for 700,000 DACA recipients brought here unlawfully by their parents at a young age many years ago. [70] This extension will give them access to work permits, social security numbers, and protection from deportation, most importantly.

[71] Secondly, our proposal provides a three-year extension of temporary protected status or TPS. [72] This means that 300,000 immigrants whose protected status is facing expiration will now have three more years of certainty, so that Congress can work on a larger immigration deal, which everybody wants – Republicans and Democrats. [73] And our farmers and vineyards won't be affected because lawful and regulated entry into our country will be easy and consistent. [74] That is our plan. Border security, DACA, TPS, and many other things – straightforward, fair, reasonable, and common sense, with lots of compromise.

[75] Senate Majority Leader Mitch McConnell has pledged to bring this bill to a vote this week in the United States Senate. [76] Our proposal is not intended to solve all of our immigration challenges.

[77] This plan solves the immediate crisis – and it is a horrible crisis. It is a humanitarian crisis like we rarely see in our country. [78] And it provides humanitarian relief, delivers real border security and immediately reopens our federal government.

[79] If we are successful in this effort, then we can start the border project of remaking our immigration system for the 21st century. [80] Once the government is open and we have made a down payment on border security, and immigration reform starts to happen, I plan to convene weekly bipartisan meetings at the White House so we can do a finished product, a great product, a product that we can all be proud of, having to do with that elusive immigration problem.

[81] Whatever we do. I can promise you this: I will never forget that my first duty and ultimate loyalty is to you, the American people. [82] Any reforms we make to our immigration system will be designed to improve your lives, make your communities safer, and make our nation more prosperous and secure for generations to come.

[83] Thank you, and God bless America. Thank you.

S2.2 President Trump: Excerpted Anti-Immigrant Speech

Below is the text of the anti-immigrant excerpt of the speech given by President Trump on 1/19/2019. The clip was edited for both length and content. Sentence numbering refers to the original location of the sentence in the original speech. Some sentence and words are cut from the original speech. Some sentences are re-ordered to improve the flow of the excerpted speech.

Audio Clip - Trump:

<https://soundcloud.com/user-64352422/audio-clip-president-trump-1/s-Q4ige>

Audio Clip - Actor Version:

<https://soundcloud.com/user-64352422/audio-clip-president-speech-2/s-07qtl>

[7] We believe in a safe and lawful system of immigration, one that upholds our laws, our traditions and our most cherished values. [8] Unfortunately, our immigration system has been badly broken for a very long time. [9] Over the decades many presidents and many lawmakers have come and gone, and no real progress has been made on immigration. [10] We are now living with the consequences – and they are tragic – brought about by decades of political stalemate, partisan gridlock, and national neglect.

[20] Illegal immigration reduces wages and strains public services. [21] The lack of border control provides a gateway, and a very wide and open gateway, for criminals and gang members to enter the United States.

[23] I want this to end; it's got to end now. [24] These are not talking points. [25] These are the heartbreaking realities that are hurting innocent, precious human beings every single day on both sides of the border.

[29] The good news is these problems can all be solved, but only if we have the political courage to do what is just and what is right. [30] Both sides in Washington must simply come together, listen to each other, put down their armor, build trust, reach across the aisle and find solutions.

[36] The proposal I will outline today is based, first and foremost, on input from our border agents and Homeland Security professionals – and professionals they are; they know what they're doing. [46] Our plan includes the following: \$805 million for drug detection technology to help secure our ports of entry. [47] An additional 2,750 border agents and law enforcement professionals, 75 new immigration judge teams to reduce the court backlog of - believe it or not - almost 900,000 cases.

[41] This is a common-sense compromise both parties should embrace. [33] If we are successful in this effort, we will then have the best chance in a very long time at real bipartisan immigration reform.

[82] Any reforms we make to our immigration system will be designed to improve your lives, make your communities safer, and make our nation more prosperous and secure for generations to come. [83] Thank you, and God bless America. Thank you.

S2.3 President Trump: Excerpted Pro-Immigrant Speech

Below is the text of the pro-immigrant excerpt of the speech given by President Trump on 1/19/2019. The clip was edited for both length and content. Sentence numbering refers to the original location of the sentence in the original speech. Some sentence and words are cut from the original speech. Some sentences are re-ordered to improve the flow of the excerpted speech.

Audio Clip - Trump:

<https://soundcloud.com/user-64352422/audio-clip-president-trump-3/s-4arX3>

Audio Clip - Actor Version:

<https://soundcloud.com/user-64352422/audio-clip-president-speech-3/s-Qs54f>

[1] Just a short time ago, I had the honor of presiding over the swearing in of five new great American citizens. [2] It was a beautiful ceremony and a moving reminder of our nation's proud

history of welcoming immigrants from all over the world into our national family. [3] I told them that the beauty and majesty of citizenship is that it draws no distinctions of race or class or faith or gender or background. [4] All Americans whether first generation or tenth generation are bound together in love and loyalty, friendship and affection. [5] We're all equal. [6] We are one team and one people proudly saluting one great American flag.

[8] Unfortunately, our immigration system has been badly broken for a very long time. [9] Over the decades many presidents and many lawmakers have come and gone, and no real progress has been made on immigration.

[29] The good news is these problems can all be solved, but only if we have the political courage to do what is just and what is right. [30] Both sides in Washington must simply come together, listen to each other, put down their armor, build trust, reach across the aisle and find solutions.

[68] In order to build the trust and goodwill necessary to begin real immigration reform, there are two elements to my plan. [69] Number one is three years of legislative relief for 700,000 DACA recipients brought here unlawfully by their parents at a young age many years ago. [70] This extension will give them access to work permits, social security numbers, and protection from deportation, most importantly. [71] Secondly, our proposal provides a three-year extension of temporary protected status or TPS. [72] This means that 300,000 immigrants whose protected status is facing expiration will now have three more years of certainty, so that Congress can work on a larger immigration deal, which everybody wants – Republicans and Democrats. [73] And our farmers and vineyards won't be affected because lawful and regulated entry into our country will be easy and consistent.

[41] This is a common-sense compromise both parties should embrace. [33] If we are successful in this effort, we will then have the best chance in a very long time at real bipartisan immigration reform.

[82] Any reforms we make to our immigration system will be designed to improve your lives, make your communities safer, and make our nation more prosperous and secure for generations to come. [83] Thank you, and God bless America. Thank you.

S2.4 President Trump: Full Turkey Pardon Speech

Below is the full text of the turkey pardon speech given by President Trump in his first year of office on 11/21/2017. This speech was edited down for length for the experiment. The sentences are numbered so that the reader can easily see which segments were excerpted in the speech used in our experiment.

Video of Speech:

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=iiOb8fxZQG4>

[1] Well, thank you all for being here, and welcome to the White House. [2] A very special place. [3] On behalf of Melania, Barron, and the entire Trump family, I want to wish you and all Americans a very happy and blessed Thanksgiving. [4] And I hear that beautiful turkey. (Laughter.)

[5] We are here today to continue a wonderful American tradition. [6] Today, in the spirit of Thanksgiving, I will grant a presidential pardon to a turkey. (Laughter.)

[7] I'm especially pleased that we're joined for this great occasion by Carl Wittenburg, Chairman of the National Turkey Federation, along with his wife, Sharlene, and sons, Nate and Wyatt. [8] It was 70 years ago that the National Turkey Federation first presented the National Thanksgiving Turkey to President Harry Truman — who, I might add, did not grant the pardon. [9] He refused. [10] He was a tough cookie. (Laughter.) [11] Today, I'm going to be a much nicer President.

[12] Over the past 10 months, Melania and I have had the pleasure of welcoming many, many special visitors to the great White House. [13] We've hosted dozens of incredible world leaders, members of Congress, and, along the way, a few very strange birds. [14] But we have yet to receive any visitors quite like our magnificent guest of honor today — Drumstick. [15] Hi, Drumstick. [16] Oh, Drumstick, I think, is going to be very happy.

[17] I'm pleased to report that, unlike millions of other turkeys at this time of the year, Drumstick has a very, very bright future ahead of him. [18] Drumstick was raised on Carl and Sharlene's turkey farm in Douglas County, Minnesota, with the help of five young women from the Douglas County 4-H chapter who are here with us today. [19] And I want to say, great work. [20] Where are they? [21] Please stand. [22] Great job you've done. (Applause.) [23] 4-H. [24] That's great. [25] Thank you.

[26] Upon being pardoned, Drumstick and his friend, Wishbone, will live out their days at "Gobbler's Rest" — beautiful place. [27] It's custom-built; it's an enclosure on the campus of Virginia Tech. [28] Tremendous school. [29] There, they'll join Tater and Tot, the two turkeys pardoned last year by President Obama.

[30] As many of you know, I have been very active in overturning a number of executive actions by my predecessor. [31] However, I have been informed by the White House Counsel's Office that Tater and Tot's pardons cannot, under any circumstances, be revoked. [32] So we're not going to revoke them. [33] So, Tater and Tot, you can rest easy.

[34] I'd also like to thank the National Turkey Federation for bringing along two other turkeys from Jandl's Turkey Farm in Orefield, Pennsylvania — the great state of Pennsylvania. [35] We're donating these turkeys to Martha's Table, a truly fantastic charity right here in Washington D.C., which provides warm meals to people in need. [36] They do a fantastic job.

[37] Before we get to the pardon, I would like to take a moment to extend our very heartfelt

special message: Thanks. [38] Thanks, folks — to the finest and bravest people in the entire world, our great men and women in uniform: the military, law enforcement, first responders. [39] These are incredible people. [40] So, thank you.

[41] Many of you are always — and you know your loved ones — and you're far away, and you spend so much time away. [42] This Thanksgiving, I want each of you to know that we're forever grateful for the incredible job and for the incredible sacrifices that you and your families make in defense of our nation, our freedom, and our truly great American flag. [43] I'd also like to express my thanks to the wonderful citizens of our country — the people who care for our communities, raise America's children, uphold our laws and our values, and make this amazing land into our national home.

[44] As we gather together with our families on Thanksgiving and give thanks for our many blessings, we are reminded of the national family to which we all belong as citizens of this incredible country.

[45] This Thursday, as we give thanks for our cherished loved ones, let us also renew our bonds of trust, loyalty, and affection between our fellow citizens as members of a proud national family of Americans.

[46] And now I think Drumstick and Wishbone would be very thankful if we would just get around to the pardon. [47] They say, "Enough talk, please pardon us." [48] So I want to thank everybody for being here today and wish everybody a very, very happy Thanksgiving — very special people a very special country.

[49] Thank you very much. [50] Thank you. (Applause.)

S2.5 President Trump: Excerpted Turkey Pardon

Below is the excerpted text of the turkey pardon speech given by President Trump on 11/21/2017 that was used in the experiment. The sentences are numbered so that the reader can easily see which segments were cut from the original speech.

Audio Clip:

<https://soundcloud.com/user-64352422/audio-clip-president-trump-speech/s-KQh7i1QouBN>

[1] Well, thank you all for being here, and welcome to the White House. [2] A very special place. [3] I want to wish you and all Americans a very happy and blessed Thanksgiving. [4] And I hear that beautiful turkey. (Laughter.)

[5] We are here today to continue a wonderful American tradition. [6] Today, in the spirit of Thanksgiving, I will grant a presidential pardon to a turkey. (Laughter.)

[7] I'm especially pleased that we're joined for this great occasion by Carl Wittenburg, Chairman of the National Turkey Federation, along with his wife, Sharlene, and sons, Nate and Wyatt. [8] It was 70 years ago that the National Turkey Federation first presented the National Thanksgiving Turkey to President Harry Truman — who, I might add, did not grant the pardon. [9] He refused. [10] He was a tough cookie. (Laughter.) [11] Today, I'm going to be a much nicer President.

[13] We've hosted dozens of incredible world leaders, members of Congress, and, along the way, a few very strange birds. [14] But we have yet to receive any visitors quite like our magnificent guest of honor today — Drumstick. [15] Hi, Drumstick. [16] Oh, Drumstick, I think, is going to be very happy.

[26] Upon being pardoned, Drumstick and his friend, Wishbone, will live out their days at “Gobbler’s Rest” — beautiful place. [27] It’s custom-built; it’s an enclosure on the campus of Virginia Tech.

[46] And now I think Drumstick and Wishbone would be very thankful if we would just get around to the pardon. [47] They say, “Enough talk, please pardon us.” [48] So I want to thank everybody for being here today and wish everybody a very, very happy Thanksgiving — very special people a very special country.

[49] Thank you very much. [50] Thank you. (Applause.)

S2.6 President Obama: Full Immigration Speech

Below is the full text of the immigration speech given by President Obama on 11/20/2014. The speech introduced new executive actions for immigration reform. These included the Deferred Action for Childhood Arrivals program to provide protections for individuals living in the U.S. who entered the country without documentation as children. The speech also included plans to increase funding for border security in tandem with the new reform.

Video of Speech:

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=6Q_Xk66gsRU

[1] My fellow Americans, tonight, I'd like to talk with you about immigration.

[2] For more than 200 years, our tradition of welcoming immigrants from around the world has given us a tremendous advantage over other nations. [3] It's kept us youthful, dynamic, and entrepreneurial. [4] It has shaped our character as a people with limitless possibilities – people not trapped by our past, but able to remake ourselves as we choose.

[5] But today, our immigration system is broken, and everybody knows it. [6] Families who enter our country the right way and play by the rules watch others flout the rules. [7] Business owners who offer their workers good wages and benefits see the competition exploit undocumented immigrants by paying them far less. [8] All of us take offense to anyone who reaps the rewards of living in America without taking on the responsibilities of living in America. [9] And undocumented immigrants who desperately want to embrace those responsibilities see little option but to remain in the shadows, or risk their families being torn apart.

[10] It's been this way for decades. And for decades, we haven't done much about it.

[11] When I took office, I committed to fixing this broken immigration system. [12] And I began by doing what I could to secure our borders. [13] Today, we have more agents and technology deployed to secure our southern border than at any time in our history. [14] And over the past six years, illegal border crossings have been cut by more than half. [15] Although this summer, there was a brief spike in unaccompanied children being apprehended at our border, the number of such children is now actually lower than it's been in nearly two years. [16] Overall, the number of people trying to cross our border illegally is at its lowest level since the 1970s. [17] Those are the facts.

[18] Meanwhile, I worked with Congress on a comprehensive fix, and last year, 68 Democrats, Republicans, and Independents came together to pass a bipartisan bill in the Senate. [19] It wasn't perfect. [20] It was a compromise, but it reflected common sense. [21] It would have doubled the number of border patrol agents, while giving undocumented immigrants a pathway to citizenship if they paid a fine, started paying their taxes, and went to the back of the line. [22] And independent experts said that it would help grow our economy and shrink our deficits.

[23] Had the House of Representatives allowed that kind of a bill a simple yes-or-no vote, it would have passed with support from both parties, and today it would be the law. [24] But for a year and a half now, Republican leaders in the House have refused to allow that simple vote. [25] Now, I continue to believe that the best way to solve this problem is by working together to pass that kind of common sense law. [26] But until that happens, there are actions I have the legal authority to take as President – the same kinds of actions taken by Democratic and Republican Presidents before me – that will help make our immigration system more fair and more just.

[27] Tonight, I am announcing those actions. [28] First, we'll build on our progress at the

border with additional resources for our law enforcement personnel so that they can stem the flow of illegal crossings, and speed the return of those who do cross over.

[29] Second, I will make it easier and faster for high-skilled immigrants, graduates, and entrepreneurs to stay and contribute to our economy, as so many business leaders have proposed.

[30] Third, we'll take steps to deal responsibly with the millions of undocumented immigrants who already live in our country. [31] I want to say more about this third issue, because it generates the most passion and controversy. [32] Even as we are a nation of immigrants, we are also a nation of laws. [33] Undocumented workers broke our immigration laws, and I believe that they must be held accountable – especially those who may be dangerous. [34] That's why, over the past six years, deportations of criminals are up 80 percent. [35] And that's why we're going to keep focusing enforcement resources on actual threats to our security. [36] Felons, not families. [37] Criminals, not children. [38] Gang members, not a mother who's working hard to provide for her kids. [39] We'll prioritize, just like law enforcement does every day.

[40] But even as we focus on deporting criminals, the fact is, millions of immigrants – in every state, of every race and nationality – will still live here illegally. [41] And let's be honest – tracking down, rounding up, and deporting millions of people isn't realistic. [42] Anyone who suggests otherwise isn't being straight with you. [43] It's also not who we are as Americans. [44] After all, most of these immigrants have been here a long time. [45] They work hard, often in tough, low-paying jobs. [46] They support their families. [47] They worship at our churches. [48] Many of their kids are American-born or spent most of their lives here, and their hopes, dreams, and patriotism are just like ours.

[49] As my predecessor, President Bush, once put it: "They are a part of American life."

[50] Now here's the thing: we expect people who live in this country to play by the rules. [51] We expect that those who cut the line will not be unfairly rewarded. [52] So we're going to offer the following deal: If you've been in America for more than five years; if you have children who are American citizens or legal residents; if you register, pass a criminal background check, and you're willing to pay your fair share of taxes – you'll be able to apply to stay in this country temporarily, without fear of deportation. [53] You can come out of the shadows and get right with the law.

[54] That's what this deal is. [55] Now let's be clear about what it isn't. [56] This deal does not apply to anyone who has come to this country recently. It does not apply to anyone who might come to America illegally in the future. [57] It does not grant citizenship, or the right to stay here permanently, or offer the same benefits that citizens receive – only Congress can do that. [58] All we're saying is we're not going to deport you.

[59] I know some of the critics of this action call it amnesty. [60] Well, it's not. [61] Amnesty is the immigration system we have today – millions of people who live here without paying their taxes or playing by the rules, while politicians use the issue to scare people and whip up votes at election time. [62] That's the real amnesty – leaving this broken system the way it is.

[63] Mass amnesty would be unfair. [64] Mass deportation would be both impossible and contrary to our character. [65] What I'm describing is accountability – a commonsense, middle ground approach: If you meet the criteria, you can come out of the shadows and get right with the law. [66] If you're a criminal, you'll be deported. [67] If you plan to enter the U.S. illegally, your chances of getting caught and sent back just went up.

[68] The actions I'm taking are not only lawful, they're the kinds of actions taken by every single Republican President and every single Democratic President for the past half century.

[69] And to those Members of Congress who question my authority to make our immigration system work better, or question the wisdom of me acting where Congress has failed, I have one answer: Pass a bill. [70] I want to work with both parties to pass a more permanent legislative solution. [71] And the day I sign that bill into law, the actions I take will no longer be necessary. [72] Meanwhile, don't let a disagreement over a single issue be a dealbreaker on every issue. [73] That's not how our democracy works, and Congress certainly shouldn't shut down our government again just because we disagree on this. [74] Americans are tired of gridlock. [75] What our country needs from us right now is a common purpose – a higher purpose.

[76] Most Americans support the types of reforms I've talked about tonight. [77] But I understand the disagreements held by many of you at home. [78] Millions of us, myself included, go back generations in this country, with ancestors who put in the painstaking work to become citizens. [79] So we don't like the notion that anyone might get a free pass to American citizenship. [80] I know that some worry immigration will change the very fabric of who we are, or take our jobs, or stick it to middle-class families at a time when they already feel like they've gotten the raw end of the deal for over a decade. [81] I hear these concerns. [82] But that's not what these steps would do. [83] Our history and the facts show that immigrants are a net plus for our economy and our society. [84] And I believe it's important that all of us have this debate without impugning each other's character.

[85] Because for all the back-and-forth of Washington, we have to remember that this debate is about something bigger. [86] It's about who we are as a country, and who we want to be for future generations. [87] Are we a nation that tolerates the hypocrisy of a system where workers who pick our fruit and make our beds never have a chance to get right with the law? [88] Or are we a nation that gives them a chance to make amends, take responsibility, and give their kids a better future? [89] Are we a nation that accepts the cruelty of ripping children from their parents' arms? Or are we a nation that values families, and works to keep them together? [90] Are we a nation that educates the world's best and brightest in our universities, only to send them home to create businesses in countries that compete against us? [91] Or are we a nation that encourages them to stay and create jobs, businesses, and industries right here in America? [92] That's what this debate is all about. [93] We need more than politics as usual when it comes to immigration; we need reasoned, thoughtful, compassionate debate that focuses on our hopes, not our fears. [94] I know the politics of this issue are tough. [95] But let me tell you why I have come to feel so strongly about it. [96] Over the past few years, I have seen the determination of immigrant fathers who worked two or three jobs, without taking a dime from the government, and at risk at any moment of losing it all, just to build a better life for their kids. [97] I've seen the heartbreak and anxiety of children whose mothers might be taken away from them just because they didn't have the right papers. [98] I've seen the courage of students who, except for the circumstances of their birth, are as American as Malia or Sasha; students who bravely come out as undocumented in hopes they could make a difference in a country they love. [99] These people – our neighbors, our classmates, our friends – they did not come here in search of a free ride or an easy life. [100] They came to work, and study, and serve in our military, and above all, contribute to America's success. [101] Tomorrow, I'll travel to Las Vegas and meet with some of these students, including a young woman named Astrid Silva. [102] Astrid was brought to America when she was four years old. [103] Her only possessions were a cross, her doll, and the frilly dress she had on. [104] When she started school, she didn't speak any English. [105] She caught up to the other kids by reading newspapers and watching PBS, and became a good

student. [106] Her father worked in landscaping. [107] Her mother cleaned other people's homes. [108] They wouldn't let Astrid apply to a technology magnet school for fear the paperwork would out her as an undocumented immigrant – so she applied behind their back and got in. [109] Still, she mostly lived in the shadows – until her grandmother, who visited every year from Mexico, passed away, and she couldn't travel to the funeral without risk of being found out and deported. [110] It was around that time she decided to begin advocating for herself and others like her, and today, Astrid Silva is a college student working on her third degree. [111] Are we a nation that kicks out a striving, hopeful immigrant like Astrid – or are we a nation that finds a way to welcome her in? [112] Scripture tells us that we shall not oppress a stranger, for we know the heart of a stranger – we were strangers once, too. [113] My fellow Americans, we are and always will be a nation of immigrants. [114] We were strangers once, too. [115] And whether our forebears were strangers who crossed the Atlantic, or the Pacific, or the Rio Grande, we are here only because this country welcomed them in, and taught them that to be an American is about something more than what we look like, or what our last names are, or how we worship. [116] What makes us Americans is our shared commitment to an ideal – that all of us are created equal, and all of us have the chance to make of our lives what we will. [117] That's the country our parents and grandparents and generations before them built for us. [118] That's the tradition we must uphold. [119] That's the legacy we must leave for those who are yet to come.

[120] Thank you, God bless you, and God bless this country we love.

S2.7 President Obama: Excerpted Anti-Immigrant Speech

Below is the text of the anti-immigrant excerpt of the speech given by President Obama on 11/20/2014. The clip was edited for both length and content. Sentence numbering refers to the original location of the sentence in the original speech. Some sentence and words are cut from the original speech. Some sentences are re-ordered to improve the flow of the excerpted speech.

Audio Clip - Obama:

<https://soundcloud.com/user-64352422/audio-clip-president-obama-1/s-2Wpco>

Audio Clip - Actor Version:

<https://soundcloud.com/user-64352422/audio-clip-president-speech/s-18HG9>

[5] Today, our immigration system is broken, and everybody knows it. [6] Families who enter our country the right way and play by the rules watch others flout the rules. [7] Business owners who offer their workers good wages and benefits see the competition exploit undocumented immigrants by paying them far less. [8] All of us take offense to anyone who reaps the rewards of living in America without taking on the responsibilities of living in America.

[78] Millions of us, myself included, go back generations in this country, with ancestors who put in the painstaking work to become citizens. [79] So we don't like the notion that anyone might get a free pass to American citizenship. [80] I know that some worry immigration will change the very fabric of who we are, or take our jobs, or stick it to middle-class families at a time when they already feel like they've gotten the raw end of the deal for over a decade. [81] I hear these concerns.

[10] It's been this way for decades. And for decades, we haven't done much about it. [11] When I took office, I committed to fixing this broken immigration system. [12] And I began by doing what I could to secure our borders. [13] Today, we have more agents and technology deployed to secure our southern border than at any time in our history. [14] And over the past six

years, illegal border crossings have been cut by more than half.

[28] We'll build on our progress at the border with additional resources for our law enforcement personnel so that they can stem the flow of illegal crossings, and speed the return of those who do cross over. [32] Even as we are a nation of immigrants, we are also a nation of laws. [33] Undocumented workers broke our immigration laws, and I believe that they must be held accountable – especially those who may be dangerous. [34] That's why, over the past six years, deportations of criminals are up 80 percent. [35] And that's why we're going to keep focusing enforcement resources on actual threats to our security.

[50] Now here's the thing: we expect people who live in this country to play by the rules. [51] We expect that those who cut the line will not be unfairly rewarded. [66] If you're a criminal, you'll be deported. [67] If you plan to enter the U.S. illegally, your chances of getting caught and sent back just went up.

[25] Now, I continue to believe that the best way to solve this problem is by working together to pass that kind of common sense law. [70] I want to work with both parties to pass a more permanent legislative solution.

[85] Because for all the back-and-forth of Washington, we have to remember that this debate is about something bigger. [86] It's about who we are as a country, and who we want to be for future generations. [120] Thank you, God bless you, and God bless this country we love.

S2.8 President Obama: Excerpted Pro-Immigrant Speech

Below is the text of the pro-immigrant excerpt of the speech given by President Obama on 11/20/2014. The clip was edited for both length and content. Sentence numbering refers to the original location of the sentence in the original speech. Some sentence and words are cut from the original speech. Some sentences are re-ordered to improve the flow of the excerpted speech.

Audio Clip - Obama:

<https://soundcloud.com/user-64352422/audio-clip-president-obama-2/s-5C1R6>

Audio Clip - Actor Version:

<https://soundcloud.com/user-64352422/audio-clip-president-speech-1/s-igrkj>

[2] For more than 200 years, our tradition of welcoming immigrants from around the world has given us a tremendous advantage over other nations. [3] It's kept us youthful, dynamic, and entrepreneurial. [4] It has shaped our character as a people with limitless possibilities – people not trapped by our past, but able to remake ourselves as we choose.

[5] But today, our immigration system is broken, and everybody knows it. [10] It's been this way for decades. And for decades, we haven't done much about it. [11] When I took office, I committed to fixing this broken immigration system. [93] We need more than politics as usual when it comes to immigration; we need reasoned, thoughtful, compassionate debate that focuses on our hopes, not our fears.

[52] So we're going to offer the following deal: If you've been in America for more than five years; if you have children who are American citizens or legal residents; if you register, pass a criminal background check, and you're willing to pay your fair share of taxes – you'll be able to apply to stay in this country temporarily, without fear of deportation. [53] You can come out of the shadows and get right with the law. [54] That's what this deal is.

[30] We'll take steps to deal responsibly with the millions of undocumented immigrants who already live in our country. [44] After all, most of these immigrants have been here a long time.

[45] They work hard, often in tough, low-paying jobs. [46] They support their families. [47] They worship at our churches. [48] Many of their kids are American-born or spent most of their lives here, and their hopes, dreams, and patriotism are just like ours.

[25] Now, I continue to believe that the best way to solve this problem is by working together to pass that kind of common sense law. [70] I want to work with both parties to pass a more permanent legislative solution.

[85] Because for all the back-and-forth of Washington, we have to remember that this debate is about something bigger. [86] It's about who we are as a country, and who we want to be for future generations. [120] Thank you, God bless you, and God bless this country we love.

S2.9 President Obama: Full Turkey Pardon Speech

Below is the full text of the turkey pardon speech given by President Obama in his first year of office on 11/25/2009. This speech was edited down for length for the experiment. The sentences are numbered so that the reader can easily see which segments were excerpted in the speech used in our experiment.

Video of Speech:

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=7gQyOMPWnGY>

[1] Happy Thanksgiving, everybody. [2] Welcome to the White House. [3] On behalf of Sasha and Malia and myself, we're thrilled to see you. [4] I want to thank Walter Pelletier, chairman of the National Turkey Federation, and Joel Brandenberger, its president, for donating this year's turkey. [5] His name is "Courage," and he traveled here from Goldsboro, North Carolina, where he was raised under Walter's own precious care. [6] (Turkey gobbles.) There you go. (Laughter.)

[7] Now, the National Turkey Federation has been bringing its finest turkeys to the White House for more than 50 years. [8] I'm told Presidents Eisenhower and Johnson actually ate their turkeys. [9] You can't fault them for that; that's a good-looking bird. (Laughter.) [10] President Kennedy was even given a turkey with a sign around its neck that said, "Good Eatin', Mr. President." [11] But he showed mercy and he said, "Let's keep him going." [12] And 20 years ago this Thanksgiving, the first President Bush issued the first official presidential pardon for a turkey.

[13] Today, I am pleased to announce that thanks to the interventions of Malia and Sasha – because I was planning to eat this sucker – (laughter) – "Courage" will also be spared this terrible and delicious fate. [14] Later today, he'll head to Disneyland, where he'll be grand marshal of tomorrow's parade. [15] And just in case "Courage" can't fulfill his responsibilities, Walter brought along another turkey, "Carolina," as an alternate, the stand-in.

[16] Now, later this afternoon, Michelle, Malia, Sasha and I will take two of their less fortunate brethren to Martha's Table, an organization that does extraordinary work to help folks here in D.C. who need it the most. [16] And I want to thank Jaiindl's Turkey Farm in Orefield, Pennsylvania, for donating those dressed birds for dinner. [17] So today, all told, I believe it's fair to say that we have saved or created four turkeys. (Laughter.)

[18] You know, there are certain days that remind me of why I ran for this office. [19] And then there are moments like this – (laughter) – where I pardon a turkey and send it to Disneyland. (Laughter.) [20] But every single day, I am thankful for the extraordinary responsibility that the American people have placed in me. [21] I am humbled by the privilege that it is to serve them, and the tremendous honor it is to serve as Commander-in-Chief of the finest military in the world – and I want to wish a Happy Thanksgiving to every service member at home or in harm's way. [21] We're proud of you and we are thinking of you and we're praying for you.

[22] When my family and I sit around the table tomorrow, just like millions of other families across America, we'll take time to give our thanks for many blessings. [23] But we'll also remember this is a time when so many members of our American family are hurting. [24] There's no question this has been a tough year for America. [25] We're at war. [26] Our economy is emerging from an extraordinary recession into recovery. [27] But there's a long way to go and a lot of work to do.

[28] In more tranquil times, it's easy to notice our many blessings. [29] It's even easier to take them for granted. [30] But in times like these, they resonate a bit more powerfully. [31] When

President Lincoln set aside the National Day of Thanksgiving for the first time – to celebrate America’s “fruitful fields,” “healthful skies,” and the “strength and vigor” of the American people – it was in the midst of the Civil War, just when the future of our very union was most in doubt. [32] So think about that. [33] When times were darkest, President Lincoln understood that our American blessings shined brighter than ever.

[34] This is an era of new perils and new hardships. [35] But we are, as ever, a people of endless compassion, boundless ingenuity, limitless strength. [36] We’re the heirs to a hard-earned history and stewards of a land of God-given beauty. [37] We are Americans. [38] And for all this, we give our humble thanks – to our predecessors, to one another, and to God.

[39] So on this quintessentially American holiday, as we give thanks for what we’ve got, let’s also give back to those who are less fortunate. [40] As we give thanks for our loved ones, let us remember those who can’t be with us. [41] And as we give thanks for our security, let’s in turn thank those who’ve sacrificed to make it possible, wherever they may be.

[42] Now, [before this turkey gets too nervous that Bo will escape and screw up this pardon – (laughter) – or before I change my mind, I hereby pardon “Courage” so that he can live out the rest of his days in peace and tranquility in Disneyland.

[43] And to every American, I want to wish you, on behalf of myself, Malia, Sasha, and Michelle, the happiest of Thanksgivings. [44] Thank you very much, everybody. (Applause.)

S2.10 President Obama: Excerpted Turkey Pardon

Below is the excerpted text of the turkey pardon speech given by President Obama on 11/25/2009 that was used in the experiment. The sentences are numbered so that the reader can easily see which segments were cut from the original speech.

Audio Clip:

<https://soundcloud.com/user-64352422/audio-clip-president-obama-speech/s-yrwpD8dEvZh>

[1] Happy Thanksgiving, everybody. [2] Welcome to the White House. [4] I want to thank Walter Pelletier, chairman of the National Turkey Federation, and Joel Brandenberger, its president, for donating this year’s turkey. [5] His name is “Courage,” and he traveled here from Goldsboro, North Carolina, where he was raised under Walter’s own precious care.

[7] Now, the National Turkey Federation has been bringing its finest turkeys to the White House for more than 50 years. [8] I’m told Presidents Eisenhower and Johnson actually ate their turkeys. [9] You can’t fault them for that; that’s a good-looking bird. (Laughter.) [10] President Kennedy was even given a turkey with a sign around its neck that said, “Good Eatin’, Mr. President.” [11] But he showed mercy and he said, “Let’s keep him going.” [12] And 20 years ago this Thanksgiving, the first President Bush issued the first official presidential pardon for a turkey.

[13] “Courage” will also be spared this terrible and delicious fate. [14] Later today, he’ll head to Disneyland, where he’ll be grand marshal of tomorrow’s parade. [15] And just in case “Courage” can’t fulfill his responsibilities, Walter brought along another turkey, “Carolina,” as an alternate, the stand-in.

[42] I hereby pardon “Courage” so that he can live out the rest of his days in peace and tranquility in Disneyland.

[43] And to every American, I want to wish you the happiest of Thanksgivings. [44] Thank you very much, everybody. (Applause.)