Ordinal and Multinomial Logistic Regression

Andy Grogan-Kaylor

11 Oct 2021

Meta-Background



Figure 1: Tweet About Ordinal Models

Key Concepts and Commands

- Implementations differ; formulas are our friends
- Extensions to logistic model: ordinal and multinomial logit

$$F(y) = \beta_0 + \beta x_1 + \beta x_2 + \dots$$

• Ordinal model

$$y(1, 2, 3, \text{ etc.}) = \beta_0 + \beta x_1 + \beta x_2 + \dots$$

• Multinomial model

$$y(2 \text{ vs. } 1) = \beta_0 + \beta x_1 + \beta x_2 + \dots$$

 $y(3 \text{ vs. } 1) = \beta_0 + \beta x_1 + \beta x_2 + \dots$

- Think about OR's, predicted probabilities, non-linearity
- Different models for different types of ordinal variables

Get The Data (General Social Survey)

- . clear all
- . set maxvar 10000 // increase number of allowable variables
- . use "GSSsmall.DTA", clear
- . keep polviews sex maeduc paeduc age degree coninc
- . save GSSsmall.dta, replace file GSSsmall.dta saved
- . describe // describe the data Contains data from GSSsmall.dta

Observations: Variables:

64,814

11 Oct 2021 10:47

Variable name	Storage type	Display format	Value label	Variable label
age	byte	%8.0g	AGE	age of respondent
paeduc	byte	%8.0g	LABK	highest year school completed, father
maeduc	byte	%8.0g	LABK	highest year school completed, mother
degree	byte	%8.0g	LABL	r's highest degree
sex	byte	%8.0g	SEX	respondents sex
polviews	byte	%8.0g	POLVIEWS	think of self as liberal or conservative
coninc	double	%12.0g	LABIH	family income in constant dollars

Sorted by:

Thinking About Your Data and Data Wrangling

It is always good to think about your data and what the values of different variables represent. In Stata, however, there is very little additional data wrangling to prepare the data. In R, there is considerable data wrangling since we have to employ special commands just to get *variable* and *value* labels, and to ensure that *numeric dependent* variables are recoded as *factors*. In Stata there are no such issues!!!

Descriptive Statistics

. summarize

Variable	Obs	Mean	Std. dev.	Min	Max
age	64,586	46.09936	17.5347	18	89
paeduc	45,837	10.71026	4.342689	0	20
maeduc	53,870	10.85365	3.768792	0	20
degree	64,641	1.35858	1.175289	0	4
sex	64,814	1.558521	.4965673	1	2
polviews coninc	55,328 58,294	4.100528 45028.17	1.382474 36791	1 350.5	7 180386

. tabulate polviews

think of self as liberal or

liberal or conservative	Freq.	Percent	Cum.
extremely liberal liberal	1,682	3.04	3.04
	6,514	11.77	14.81

slightly liberal	7,010	12.67	27.48
moderate	21,370	38.62	66.11
slghtly conservative	8,690	15.71	81.81
conservative	8,230	14.87	96.69
extrmly conservative	1,832	3.31	100.00
Total	55,328	100.00	

The Ordinal Model $(k \ categories)^1$

$$\ln\left(\frac{p(y\leq k)}{p(y>k)}\right) = \beta_0 + \beta_1 x_1 + \dots$$

Ordinal Regression

```
. ologit polviews sex age degree coninc
Iteration 0: log likelihood = -83895.058
              log \ likelihood = -83369.429
Iteration 1:
Iteration 2:
              log likelihood = -83368.485
Iteration 3: log likelihood = -83368.485
```

Number of obs = 50,049Ordered logistic regression LR chi2(4) = 1053.15

Prob > chi2 = 0.0000

Log likelihood = -83368.485Pseudo R2 = 0.0063

polviews	Coefficient	Std. err.	z	P> z	[95% conf.	interval]
sex	129234	.0162348	-7.96	0.000	1610536	0974144
age	.0116653	.0004737	24.63	0.000	.0107369	.0125937
degree	1062661	.0076242	-13.94	0.000	1212093	091323
coninc	3.99e-06	2.42e-07	16.52	0.000	3.52e-06	4.46e-06
/cut1	-3.116098	.0440989			-3.202531	-3.029666
/cut2	-1.389623	.0379027			-1.463911	-1.315335
/cut3	5941761	.0372164			6671188	5212333
/cut4	1.050951	.037438			.9775742	1.124329
/cut5	1.916652	.03824			1.841703	1.991601
/cut6	3.826484	.0447146			3.738845	3.914123

Many commands for regression of categorical dependent variables in R do not provide p values, and an extra step has to be taken to get p values. This is not a problem in Stata!

Exponentiating Coefficients: e^{β}

```
. ologit polviews sex age degree coninc, or
Iteration 0: log likelihood = -83895.058
              log \ likelihood = -83369.429
Iteration 1:
Iteration 2:
              log likelihood = -83368.485
Iteration 3: log likelihood = -83368.485
Ordered logistic regression
                                                      Number of obs = 50,049
                                                      LR chi2(4) = 1053.15
                                                                   = 0.0000
                                                      Prob > chi2
Log likelihood = -83368.485
                                                      Pseudo R2
                                                                   = 0.0063
   polviews
              Odds ratio Std. err.
                                              P>|z|
                                                         [95% conf. interval]
```

¹Per Stata documentation.

sex	.8787683	.0142666	-7.96	0.000	.8512464	.90718
age	1.011734	.0004792	24.63	0.000	1.010795	1.012673
degree	.8991853	.0068555	-13.94	0.000	.8858486	.9127228
coninc	1.000004	2.42e-07	16.52	0.000	1.000004	1.000004
, , ,	0.110000	0.4.4.0.0.0			0.000504	2 22222
/cut1	-3.116098	.0440989			-3.202531	-3.029666
/cut2	-1.389623	.0379027			-1.463911	-1.315335
/cut3	5941761	.0372164			6671188	5212333
/cut4	1.050951	.037438			.9775742	1.124329
/cut5	1.916652	.03824			1.841703	1.991601
/cut6	3.826484	.0447146			3.738845	3.914123

Note: Estimates are transformed only in the first equation to odds ratios.

The Proportional Odds Assumption And The Brant Test

. brant

Brant Test of Parallel Regression Assumption

Variable	chi2	p>chi2	df
All	1456.60	0.000	20
sex age degree coninc	108.03 120.63 835.27 67.79	0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000	5 5 5 5

A significant test statistic provides evidence that the parallel regression assumption has been violated.

The Multinomial Model

$$\ln\left(\frac{P(y=y_2)}{P(y=y_1)}\right) = \ln\left(\frac{P(y=\text{something else})}{P(y=\text{something})}\right)$$

$$= \beta_0 + \beta_1 x_1 + \dots$$

$$\ln\left(\frac{P(y=y_3)}{P(y=y_1)}\right) = \ln\left(\frac{P(y=\text{something else altogether})}{P(y=\text{something})}\right)$$

$$= \beta_0 + \beta_1 x_1 + \dots$$

Estimation

. mlogit polviews i.sex age degree coninc

Iteration 0: log likelihood = -83895.058

Iteration 1: log likelihood = -82700.548

Iteration 2: log likelihood = -82694.595

Iteration 3: log likelihood = -82694.594

Multinomial logistic regression

Number of obs = 50,049

LR chi2(24) = 2400.93

Prob > chi2 = 0.0000

Log likelihood = -82694.594

Pseudo R2 = 0.0143

	Coefficient	Std. err.	Z	P> z	[95% conf.	interval]
extremely_liberal						
sex						
female	2153043	.0534275	-4.03	0.000	3200202	1105883
age	0051601	.0015774	-3.27	0.001	0082517	0020685
degree	.3607061	.0234865	15.36	0.000	.3146735	.4067387
coninc	-6.68e-06	8.90e-07	-7.51	0.000	-8.43e-06	-4.94e-06
_cons	-2.40105	.0904486	-26.55	0.000	-2.578326	-2.223774
liberal						
sex	0770040	0200111	0.55	0 011	4260022	0477054
female	0770042	.0302144	-2.55	0.011	1362233	0177851
age	0077271	.0009041	-8.55	0.000	0094991	0059551
degree	.3615385	.0134905	26.80	0.000	.3350977	.3879794
coninc	-2.36e-06	4.59e-07	-5.14	0.000	-3.26e-06	-1.46e-06
_cons	-1.195919	.0513843	-23.27	0.000	-1.29663	-1.095207
slightly_liberal						
sex	1016610	0000053	2 40	0.000	1500000	0444000
female	1016619	.0292053	-3.48		1589032	0444206
age	0099768	.0008799	-11.34	0.000	0117014	0082521
degree	.2358701	.0134562	17.53	0.000	.2094964	.2622438
coninc	-1.94e-07	4.37e-07	-0.44	0.658	-1.05e-06	6.63e-07
_cons	90455	.0494119	-18.31	0.000	-1.001396	8077044
moderate	(base outco					
moderate	(base outco	ome <i>)</i>				
slghtly_conservative	(base outco	ome <i>)</i>				
slghtly_conservative sex						
slghtly_conservative	2630355	.0270206	-9.73	0.000	315995	210076
slghtly_conservative sex female age	2630355 .0012542	.0270206	1.58	0.114	0003026	.002811
slghtly_conservative sex female age degree	2630355 .0012542 .1963805	.0270206 .0007943 .012493	1.58 15.72	0.114 0.000	0003026 .1718947	.002811 .2208663
slghtly_conservative sex female age	2630355 .0012542	.0270206	1.58 15.72 8.79	0.114	0003026	.002811
slghtly_conservative sex female age degree	2630355 .0012542 .1963805	.0270206 .0007943 .012493	1.58 15.72	0.114 0.000	0003026 .1718947	.002811 .2208663
slghtly_conservative sex female age degree coninc _cons conservative	2630355 .0012542 .1963805 3.39e-06	.0270206 .0007943 .012493 3.86e-07	1.58 15.72 8.79	0.114 0.000 0.000	0003026 .1718947 2.63e-06	.002811 .2208663 4.15e-06
slghtly_conservative sex female age degree coninc _cons conservative sex	2630355 .0012542 .1963805 3.39e-06 -1.221032	.0270206 .0007943 .012493 3.86e-07 .0467118	1.58 15.72 8.79 -26.14	0.114 0.000 0.000 0.000	0003026 .1718947 2.63e-06 -1.312585	.002811 .2208663 4.15e-06 -1.129479
slghtly_conservative sex female age degree coninc _cons conservative	2630355 .0012542 .1963805 3.39e-06 -1.221032	.0270206 .0007943 .012493 3.86e-07 .0467118	1.58 15.72 8.79 -26.14	0.114 0.000 0.000 0.000	0003026 .1718947 2.63e-06 -1.312585	.002811 .2208663 4.15e-06 -1.129479
slghtly_conservative sex female age degree coninc _cons conservative sex female age	2630355 .0012542 .1963805 3.39e-06 -1.221032 2625249 .0128524	.0270206 .0007943 .012493 3.86e-07 .0467118	1.58 15.72 8.79 -26.14 -9.41 16.05	0.114 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000	0003026 .1718947 2.63e-06 -1.312585 3172073 .0112825	.002811 .2208663 4.15e-06 -1.129479 2078426 .0144224
slghtly_conservative sex female age degree coninc _cons conservative sex female age degree degree	2630355 .0012542 .1963805 3.39e-06 -1.221032 2625249 .0128524 .152561	.0270206 .0007943 .012493 3.86e-07 .0467118 .0278997 .000801 .0129671	1.58 15.72 8.79 -26.14 -9.41 16.05 11.77	0.114 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000	0003026 .1718947 2.63e-06 -1.312585 3172073 .0112825 .127146	.002811 .2208663 4.15e-06 -1.129479 2078426 .0144224 .177976
slghtly_conservative sex female age degree coninc _cons conservative sex female age	2630355 .0012542 .1963805 3.39e-06 -1.221032 2625249 .0128524	.0270206 .0007943 .012493 3.86e-07 .0467118 .0278997 .000801 .0129671 3.97e-07	1.58 15.72 8.79 -26.14 -9.41 16.05 11.77 9.75	0.114 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000	0003026 .1718947 2.63e-06 -1.312585 3172073 .0112825 .127146 3.09e-06	.002811 .2208663 4.15e-06 -1.129479 2078426 .0144224 .177976 4.65e-06
slghtly_conservative sex female age degree coninc _cons conservative sex female age degree degree	2630355 .0012542 .1963805 3.39e-06 -1.221032 2625249 .0128524 .152561	.0270206 .0007943 .012493 3.86e-07 .0467118 .0278997 .000801 .0129671	1.58 15.72 8.79 -26.14 -9.41 16.05 11.77	0.114 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000	0003026 .1718947 2.63e-06 -1.312585 3172073 .0112825 .127146	.002811 .2208663 4.15e-06 -1.129479 2078426 .0144224 .177976
slghtly_conservative	2630355 .0012542 .1963805 3.39e-06 -1.221032 2625249 .0128524 .152561 3.87e-06	.0270206 .0007943 .012493 3.86e-07 .0467118 .0278997 .000801 .0129671 3.97e-07	1.58 15.72 8.79 -26.14 -9.41 16.05 11.77 9.75	0.114 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000	0003026 .1718947 2.63e-06 -1.312585 3172073 .0112825 .127146 3.09e-06	.002811 .2208663 4.15e-06 -1.129479 2078426 .0144224 .177976 4.65e-06
slghtly_conservative sex female age degree coninc _cons conservative sex female age degree coninc _cons extrmly_conservative sex	2630355 .0012542 .1963805 3.39e-06 -1.221032 2625249 .0128524 .152561 3.87e-06 -1.813802	.0270206 .0007943 .012493 3.86e-07 .0467118 .0278997 .000801 .0129671 3.97e-07 .0496044	1.58 15.72 8.79 -26.14 -9.41 16.05 11.77 9.75 -36.57	0.114 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000	0003026 .1718947 2.63e-06 -1.312585 3172073 .0112825 .127146 3.09e-06 -1.911025	.002811 .2208663 4.15e-06 -1.129479 2078426 .0144224 .177976 4.65e-06 -1.716579
slghtly_conservative	2630355 .0012542 .1963805 3.39e-06 -1.221032 2625249 .0128524 .152561 3.87e-06 -1.813802	.0270206 .0007943 .012493 3.86e-07 .0467118 .0278997 .000801 .0129671 3.97e-07 .0496044	1.58 15.72 8.79 -26.14 -9.41 16.05 11.77 9.75 -36.57	0.114 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000	0003026 .1718947 2.63e-06 -1.312585 3172073 .0112825 .127146 3.09e-06 -1.911025	.002811 .2208663 4.15e-06 -1.129479 2078426 .0144224 .177976 4.65e-06 -1.716579
slghtly_conservative	2630355 .0012542 .1963805 3.39e-06 -1.221032 2625249 .0128524 .152561 3.87e-06 -1.813802 3790287 .0150308	.0270206 .0007943 .012493 3.86e-07 .0467118 .0278997 .000801 .0129671 3.97e-07 .0496044 .0530006 .0014834	1.58 15.72 8.79 -26.14 -9.41 16.05 11.77 9.75 -36.57	0.114 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000	0003026 .1718947 2.63e-06 -1.312585 3172073 .0112825 .127146 3.09e-06 -1.911025 482908 .0121235	.002811 .2208663 4.15e-06 -1.129479 2078426 .0144224 .177976 4.65e-06 -1.716579 2751493 .0179381
slghtly_conservative	2630355 .0012542 .1963805 3.39e-06 -1.221032 2625249 .0128524 .152561 3.87e-06 -1.813802 3790287 .0150308 .004062	.0270206 .0007943 .012493 3.86e-07 .0467118 .0278997 .000801 .0129671 3.97e-07 .0496044 .0530006 .0014834 .0262081	1.58 15.72 8.79 -26.14 -9.41 16.05 11.77 9.75 -36.57 -7.15 10.13 0.15	0.114 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000	0003026 .1718947 2.63e-06 -1.312585 3172073 .0112825 .127146 3.09e-06 -1.911025 482908 .0121235 0473049	.002811 .2208663 4.15e-06 -1.129479 2078426 .0144224 .177976 4.65e-06 -1.716579 2751493 .0179381 .055429
slghtly_conservative	2630355 .0012542 .1963805 3.39e-06 -1.221032 2625249 .0128524 .152561 3.87e-06 -1.813802 3790287 .0150308	.0270206 .0007943 .012493 3.86e-07 .0467118 .0278997 .000801 .0129671 3.97e-07 .0496044 .0530006 .0014834	1.58 15.72 8.79 -26.14 -9.41 16.05 11.77 9.75 -36.57	0.114 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000	0003026 .1718947 2.63e-06 -1.312585 3172073 .0112825 .127146 3.09e-06 -1.911025 482908 .0121235	.002811 .2208663 4.15e-06 -1.129479 2078426 .0144224 .177976 4.65e-06 -1.716579 2751493 .0179381

Exponentiating Coefficients

polviews	RRR	Std. err.	z	P> z	[95% conf.	interval]
extremely_liberal						
female	.8062961	.0430784	-4.03	0.000	.7261343	.8953073
age	.9948532	.0015693	-3.27	0.001	.9917823	.9979336
degree	1.434342	.0336876	15.36	0.000	1.369812	1.501912

.9999933	8.90e-07	-7.51	0.000	.9999916	.9999951
.0906228	.0081967	-26.55	0.000	.075901	.1082
.925886	.0279751	-2.55	0.011	.8726477	.9823721
.9923027	.0008971	-8.55	0.000	.9905458	.9940626
1.435536	.0193661	26.80	0.000	1.398077	1.473999
.9999976	4.59e-07	-5.14	0.000	.9999967	.9999985
.3024259	.01554	-23.27	0.000	.2734517	.3344702
.9033349	.0263822	-3.48	0.000	.8530789	.9565515
.9900729	.0008712	-11.34	0.000	.9883668	.9917818
1.26601	.0170357	17.53	0.000	1.233057	1.299843
.9999998		-0.44	0.658	.9999989	1.000001
.404724	.0199982	-18.31	0.000	.3673664	.4458805
(base outco	ome)				
.7687146	.0207712	-9.73	0.000	.7290631	.8105226
1.001255	.0007953	1.58	0.114	.9996975	1.002815
1.21699	.0152038	15.72	0.000	1.187553	1.247157
1.000003	3.86e-07	8.79	0.000	1.000003	1.000004
.2949256	.0137765	-26.14	0.000	.2691234	.3232017
.7691072	.0214578	-9.41	0.000	.7281798	.8123349
1.012935	.0008114	16.05	0.000	1.011346	1.014527
1.164814	.0151042	11.77	0.000	1.135583	1.194797
1.000004	3.97e-07	9.75	0.000	1.000003	1.000005
.1630332	.0080872	-36.57	0.000	.1479287	.1796798
.684526	.0362803	-7.15	0.000	.6169866	.7594587
	0015050	10.13	0.000	1.012197	1.0181
1.015144	.0015058				
1.015144 1.00407	.0263148	0.15	0.877	.9537966	1.056994
					1.056994 1.000002
	.925886 .9923027 1.435536 .9999976 .3024259 .9033349 .9900729 1.26601 .9999998 .404724 (base outcomes of the control of the	.0906228 .0081967 .925886 .0279751 .9923027 .0008971 1.435536 .0193661 .9999976 4.59e-07 .3024259 .01554 .9033349 .0263822 .9900729 .0008712 1.26601 .0170357 .9999998 4.37e-07 .404724 .0199982 (base outcome) .7687146 .0207712 1.001255 .0007953 1.21699 .0152038 1.000003 3.86e-07 .2949256 .0137765 .7691072 .0214578 1.012935 .0008114 1.164814 .0151042 1.000004 3.97e-07 .1630332 .0080872	.0906228 .0081967 -26.55 .925886 .0279751 -2.55 .9923027 .0008971 -8.55 1.435536 .0193661 26.80 .9999976 4.59e-07 -5.14 .3024259 .01554 -23.27 .9033349 .0263822 -3.48 .9900729 .0008712 -11.34 1.26601 .0170357 17.53 .9999998 4.37e-07 -0.44 .404724 .0199982 -18.31 (base outcome) .7687146 .0207712 -9.73 1.001255 .0007953 1.58 1.21699 .0152038 15.72 1.00003 3.86e-07 8.79 .2949256 .0137765 -26.14 .7691072 .0214578 -9.41 1.012935 .0008114 16.05 1.164814 .0151042 11.77 1.000004 3.97e-07 9.75 .1630332 .0080872 -36.57	.0906228 .0081967 -26.55 0.000 .925886 .0279751 -2.55 0.011 .9923027 .0008971 -8.55 0.000 1.435536 .0193661 26.80 0.000 .9999976 4.59e-07 -5.14 0.000 .3024259 .01554 -23.27 0.000 .9033349 .0263822 -3.48 0.000 .9900729 .0008712 -11.34 0.000 1.26601 .0170357 17.53 0.000 .9999998 4.37e-07 -0.44 0.658 .404724 .0199982 -18.31 0.000 (base outcome) .7687146 .0207712 -9.73 0.000 1.01255 .0007953 1.58 0.114 1.21699 .0152038 15.72 0.000 1.00003 3.86e-07 8.79 0.000 .2949256 .0137765 -26.14 0.000 .7691072 .0214578 -9.41 0.000 1.012935 .0008114 16.05 0.000 1.164814 .0151042 11.77 0.000 1.000004 3.97e-07 9.75 0.000 .1630332 .0080872 -36.57 0.000	.0906228 .0081967 -26.55 0.000 .075901 .925886 .0279751 -2.55 0.011 .8726477 .9923027 .0008971 -8.55 0.000 .9905458 1.435536 .0193661 26.80 0.000 1.398077 .9999976 4.59e-07 -5.14 0.000 .9999967 .3024259 .01554 -23.27 0.000 .2734517 .9033349 .0263822 -3.48 0.000 .8530789 .9900729 .0008712 -11.34 0.000 .9883668 1.26601 .0170357 17.53 0.000 1.233057 .9999998 4.37e-07 -0.44 0.658 .9999989 .404724 .0199982 -18.31 0.000 .3673664 (base outcome) .7687146 .0207712 -9.73 0.000 .7290631 1.001255 .0007953 1.58 0.114 .9996975 1.21699 .0152038 15.72 0.000 1.187553 1.000003 3.86e-07 8.79 0.000 1.000003 .2949256 .0137765 -26.14 0.000 .2691234 .7691072 .0214578 -9.41 0.000 .7281798 1.012935 .0008114 16.05 0.000 1.011346 1.164814 .0151042 11.77 0.000 1.135583 1.000004 3.97e-07 9.75 0.000 1.000003 .1630332 .0080872 -36.57 0.000 .1479287

Note: _cons estimates baseline relative risk for each outcome.

Predicted Probabilities

. margins sex, predict(outcome(1)) // predicted probabilities by sex; y = 1
Predictive margins
Number of obs = 50,049

Model VCE: OIM

Expression: Pr(polviews==extremely_liberal), predict(outcome(1))

	Margin	Delta-method std. err.	z	P> z	[95% conf.	interval]
sex						
male	.0325114	.001187	27.39	0.000	.0301849	.0348378
female	.0295928	.0010205	29.00	0.000	.0275927	.031593