

Daniel M. Hodes, Esq., State Bar No. 101773  
Carlos X. Colorado, State Bar No. 231031  
Benjamin T. Ikuta, Esq., State Bar No. 260878  
HODES, MILMAN, LLP  
9210 Irvine Center Drive  
Irvine, California 92618  
Telephone: (949) 640-8222  
Facsimile: (949) 336-8114  
Liaison Counsel and Co-Lead-Counsel for Plaintiffs

Dane Levy, Esq., State Bar No. 210473  
LEVY LAW FIRM  
4500 E. Pacific Coast Highway, Suite 150  
Long Beach, CA 90804  
Telephone: 562.270.7810  
Facsimile: 562.293.2843  
Attorneys for Plaintiff ALEJANDRINA AVILA

**SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA**  
**IN AND FOR THE COUNTY OF ORANGE**

Coordination Proceeding  
Special Title (CRC 3.550(b))

Children's Dental Group Cases

Subject Case:

***Avila v. Jacks, et al., Case No. 30-2016-00894723-CU-MM-CJC***

JUDICIAL COUNCIL COORDINATION  
NO: JCCP 4917  
[Hon. Glenda Sanders, Judge – Dept. CX 101]

**PLAINTIFFS' OPPOSITION TO CDG  
DEFENDANTS' MOTION *IN LIMINE* NO. 1 – TO  
PRECLUDE "VARIATION OR DEVIANCE FROM  
PLEADINGS"**

**DATE: March 30, 2020**  
**TIME: 9:00 p.m.**  
**DEPT: CX101**

Master Complaint Filed: February 8, 2018  
1st Bellwether Trial Date: January 11, 2021

Hearing Date: September 4, 2020  
Hearing Time: 1:30 p.m.  
Dept.: CX101

1 **I. DEFENDANTS’ MOTION IS FATALLY DEFECTIVE ABSENT PROPER NOTICE**  
2 **OF WHAT EVIDENCE IS SOUGHT TO BE EXCLUDED.**

3 At the outset, Defendant’s notice of motion is procedurally defective because nowhere  
4 therein do Defendants identify any specific evidence proffered by Plaintiffs constitutes an  
5 impermissible “variation or deviance.”

6 By law, a notice of motion must be in writing, and must state when and the grounds upon  
7 which it will be made, and identify the papers upon which it is based. C.C.P. § 1010. “A notice of  
8 motion must state in the opening paragraph the nature of the order being sought and the grounds  
9 for issuance of the order.” Cal. Rules of Court (“C.R.C.”) Rule 3.1110(a). *People v. American*  
10 *Surety Ins. Co.* (1999) 75 Cal.App.4th 719, 726. As a result of constitutionally-safeguarded  
11 principles of due process, a court cannot grant relief not sought in, and/or different from, the relief  
12 stated in the notice of motion. *American Surety Ins. Co., supra*, 75 Cal.App.4th at 726; *Luri v.*  
13 *Greenwald* (2003) 107 Cal.App.4th 1119, 1124.

14 To the extent that Defendants identify the evidence they seek to exclude, it is admissible:

15 *First*, the CDG website is relevant to Plaintiff’s Cause of Action no. 4 for false  
16 misrepresentation and therefore may not be excluded;

17 *Second*, insurance fraud and fraudulent billing practices are relevant to the allegations that  
18 defendants defrauded plaintiffs because the motive for both the fraudulent billing and unnecessary  
19 treatment was the same—to put defendants’ interests above Plaintiffs’;

20 *Third*, the alleged violations of patient privacy and indistinct and Plaintiff is unable to  
21 respond to this generic category, therefore the motion should be denied (see *See, Kelly v. New West*  
22 *Fed. Savings* (1996) 49 Cal.App.4th 659, 671.); and

23 *Fourth*, the use of restraint devices is relevant to defendants’ desire to overtreat patients.

24 **II. EVIDENCE PROFFERED BY PLAINTIFS RELEVANT FOR ONE PURPOSE**  
25 **CANNOT BE EXCLUDED IF IT IS ALSO RELEVANT FOR ANY OTHER**  
26 **PURPOSES.**

27 Apart from the foregoing fatal procedural deficiencies under *Kelly, supra*, of Defendants’  
28 “noticeless” motion, the motion would also impermissibly and overbroadly exclude in advance  
29 whole categories of prospective evidence simply on the speculative defense premise that some  
nonspecific, unidentified evidence might not be relevant if offered to prove an element of an

1 unpleaded claim.

2 However, to the extent some of this vague, unspecified evidence targeted by this motion as  
3 allegedly related to an unpleaded claim, is otherwise competent evidence to prove other claims  
4 well-pleaded by Plaintiffs against these Defendants. For example, among these are Plaintiffs’  
5 punitive damages claims built upon evidence of acts and omissions of the Defendants evincing  
6 malice, oppression or fraud. The Court cannot simply preemptively exclude wholesale categories  
7 of evidence on the pretense that they may hypothetically support unpleaded claims, i.e., throw the  
8 “baby out with the bathwater.” This follows because our Supreme Court has firmly held that “[a]ll  
9 relevant evidence is admissible, unless a specific statutory or constitutional provision bars its  
10 admission. (Evid.C. § 351; Cal.Const., Art. I, §24.) If evidence is relevant and admissible for  
11 one purpose, but inadmissible if considered for another purpose, *the trial court must admit it but,*  
12 *upon request, limit its proper scope and so instruct the jury.* (Evid.C. § 355.) *People v. Bryant*  
(2014) 60 Cal.4th 335, 405 [emphasis supplied].

13 Consequently, wholesale exclusion of any and all vaguely referenced “evidence of unpleaded  
14 claims” to the extent it would necessarily also preclude crucial punitive damages evidence, is also  
15 contrary to law and untenable. *Bryant, supra*, at 405; Evid.C. § 355.

16 The same is true of all other relevant evidence offered by Plaintiffs to prove one or more  
17 elements of their pleaded claims, even though such evidence might not be relevant if solely offered  
18 to prove an unpleaded claim.

19 Because of Defendants’ lack of any proper notice of the scope of exclusion, and vagueness  
20 and imprecision of the clearly overbroad prophylactic exclusions sought herein, Plaintiffs and the  
21 Court cannot meaningfully ascertain what specific evidence is sought to be precluded preemptively  
22 that is specifically relevant to prove one or more elements of the existing well-pleaded claims (as  
23 well as to rebut Defendants defenses thereto).

### 24 **III. CONCLUSION.**

25 Consequently, and for these reasons as well, this procedurally deficient and poorly-taken  
26 motion must therefore be denied.

27 Dated: August 17, 2020

HODES MILMAN, LLP

28 By: /s/ Carlos X. Colorado  
29 Carlos X. Colorado, Esq.  
Plaintiffs’ Co-Liaison Counsel

- 1
- 2
- 3
- 4
- 5
- 6
- 7
- 8
- 9
- 10
- 11
- 12
- 13
- 14
- 15
- 16
- 17
- 18
- 19
- 20
- 21
- 22
- 23
- 24
- 25
- 26
- 27
- 28
- 29

Special Title:  
*CHILDREN'S DENTAL GROUP CASES*

Judicial Council Coordination No JCCP 4917  
Orange County Superior Court, Civil Complex Center

STATE OF CALIFORNIA, COUNTY OF ORANGE

I am over the age of 18, employed in the County of Orange, State of California, and not a party to the within action. My business address is 9210 Irvine Center Drive, Irvine, California 92618.

On August 17, 2020, the document(s) entitled: PLAINTIFFS’ OPPOSITION TO CDG DEFENDANTS’ MOTION IN LIMINE NO. 1 – TO PRECLUDE “VARIATION OR DEVIANCE FROM PLEADINGS” was served on the interested parties in this action by placing true copies thereof to be delivered/addressed as follows:

**[SEE ATTACHED SERVICE LIST]**

- ☒ BY ELECTRONIC SERVICE ONLY VIA THE CASE ANYWHERE SYSTEM: I transmitted a true copy of the above entitled documents(s) to the Case Anywhere for service and notification on all parties as registered pursuant to the Case Management Order.
- ☒ STATE: I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the above is true and correct. Executed on August 17, 2020 at Irvine, California.

/s/ Brenda K. Miller  
Brenda K. Miller

**CHILDREN'S DENTAL GROUP CASES – JCCP 4917**

**SERVICE LIST**

**Brian P. Kamel & Associates**

Brian Kamel, Esq.

([bkamel@kamellawfirm.com](mailto:bkamel@kamellawfirm.com))

Yee Lam, Esq. ([ylam@kamellawfirm.com](mailto:ylam@kamellawfirm.com))

12400 Wilshire Boulevard

Suite 1150

Los Angeles, CA 90025

Phone: (310) 857-1333

*Representing:* James Kidong Cho,  
D.D.S.

**Callahan & Blaine**

Laura Morris, Esq. ([lmorris@callahan-law.com](mailto:lmorris@callahan-law.com))

3 Hutton Center Drive, 9th Floor

Santa Ana, CA 92707

Phone: (714) 241-4444

Fax: (714) 241-4445

*Representing:* Plaintiffs

**Carroll, Kelly, Trotter & Franzen**

Sandra Carlson, Esq.

([scarlson@cktfmlaw.com](mailto:scarlson@cktfmlaw.com))

Paul Cook, Esq. ([pscook@cktfmlaw.com](mailto:pscook@cktfmlaw.com))

Callan Franklin, Esq.

([cwfranklin@cktfmlaw.com](mailto:cwfranklin@cktfmlaw.com))

Patrick Goethals ([pigoethals@cktfmlaw.com](mailto:pigoethals@cktfmlaw.com))

Gabriel Irwin, Esq. ([gmirwin@cktfmlaw.com](mailto:gmirwin@cktfmlaw.com))

John Kelly, Esq. ([jckelly@cktfmlaw.com](mailto:jckelly@cktfmlaw.com))

Joe Looney, Esq. ([jjlooney@cktfmlaw.com](mailto:jjlooney@cktfmlaw.com))

Mercedes Sequoia, Esq.

([mcsequoia@cktfmlaw.com](mailto:mcsequoia@cktfmlaw.com))

111 West Ocean Boulevard, 14th Floor

PO Box 22636

Long Beach, CA 90802

Phone: (562) 432-5855

Fax: (562) 432-8785

*Representing:* J&G Dental Advisors,  
LLC  
Jerry Minsky, D.D.S.,  
Dental Corp.  
Marsha Jacks  
Samuel H. Gruenbaum  
Scott Jacks, D.D.S.,  
Inc. d/b/a Children's  
Dental Group  
Sierra Pacific Dental  
Consultants, LLC

**Cifarelli Law Firm**

Thomas Cifarelli, Esq. ([tomc@cifarellilaw.com](mailto:tomc@cifarellilaw.com))

7700 Irvine Center Drive, Suite 150

Irvine, CA 92618

Phone: (949) 502-8600

Fax: (949) 502-8603

*Representing:* Plaintiffs

**David Weiss Law**

Melissa Corona, Esq. ([coronam@djwlaw.com](mailto:coronam@djwlaw.com))

Katie Shaller, Esq. ([shallerk@djwlaw.com](mailto:shallerk@djwlaw.com))

Iris Vasquez, Esq. ([vasquezi@djwlaw.com](mailto:vasquezi@djwlaw.com))

David Weiss, Esq. ([weisss@djwlaw.com](mailto:weisss@djwlaw.com))

11340 West Olympic Boulevard

Suite 100

Los Angeles, CA 90064

Phone: (310) 575-9566

*Representing:* Avishan Kolahdouz  
Nasiri, D.M.D.  
David M. Diaz, D.D.S.  
Yazan Mazan Kasey,  
D.D.S.

**Dickson & Dickson**

Robert Dickson, Esq.

*Representing:* Plaintiffs

(rdickson@hartkinglaw.com)  
4 Hutton Centre Drive, Suite 900  
Santa Ana, CA 92707  
Phone: (714) 619-7076

**Ford Walker Haggerty & Behar LLP**

William Haggerty, Esq. ([bill@fwhb.com](mailto:bill@fwhb.com))  
One World Trade Center, 27th Floor  
Long Beach, CA 90831  
Phone: (562) 983-2500  
Fax: (562) 983-2555

*Representing:* Jerry Minsky, D.D.S.

**Hodes Milman, LLP**

Jacob Brender, Esq.  
([jbrender@hodesmilman.com](mailto:jbrender@hodesmilman.com))  
Carlos Colorado, Esq.  
([ccolorado@hodesmilman.com](mailto:ccolorado@hodesmilman.com))

Daniel Hodes, Esq.  
([dhodes@hodesmilman.com](mailto:dhodes@hodesmilman.com))

*Representing:* Plaintiffs

Benjamin Ikuta, Esq.  
([bikuta@hodesmilman.com](mailto:bikuta@hodesmilman.com))  
9210 Irvine Center Drive  
Irvine, CA 92618  
Phone: (949) 640-8222  
Fax: (949) 640-8294

**Konell Ruggiero LLP**

Jerome Konell, Esq.  
([jerry@konellruggiero.com](mailto:jerry@konellruggiero.com))  
Cheryl Ruggiero, Esq.  
([cheryl@konellruggiero.com](mailto:cheryl@konellruggiero.com))  
401 Wilshire Blvd., 12th Floor  
Santa Monica, CA 90401  
Phone: (213) 583-1360

*Representing:* Plaintiffs

**Lane Powell PC**

Paul George, Esq. ([georgep@lanepowell.com](mailto:georgep@lanepowell.com))  
601 S.W. Second Avenue, Suite 2100  
Portland, OR 97204  
Phone: (503) 778-2100  
Fax: (503) 778-2200

*Representing:* Marsha Jacks  
Samuel Gruenbaum

**Law Office of Mitchell B. Hannah**

Hallie Hannah, Esq. ([hallie@hannahlaw.com](mailto:hallie@hannahlaw.com))  
Mitchell Hannah, Esq.  
([mhannah@hannahlaw.com](mailto:mhannah@hannahlaw.com))

*Representing:* Plaintiffs

100 Pacifica, Suite 370  
Irvine, CA 92618  
Phone: (949) 477-9020  
Fax: (949) 477-9080

**Law Offices of Edwin J. Zinman DDS, JD,  
Inc.**

Edwin Zinman, Esq.  
([staff@toothattorney.com](mailto:staff@toothattorney.com))  
220 Bush Street, Suite 422  
San Francisco, CA 94104  
Phone: (415) 391-5353

*Representing:* Plaintiffs

**Law Offices of Geraldine G. Ly**

Geraldine Ly, Esq. ([geraldinely@mac.com](mailto:geraldinely@mac.com))  
2677 North Main Street, Suite 225  
Santa Ana, CA 92705  
Phone: (714) 442-9998

*Representing: Plaintiffs*

**Law Offices of James R. Moriarty**

James Moriarty, Esq. ([jim@moriarty.com](mailto:jim@moriarty.com))  
4119 Montrose Boulevard, Suite 250  
Houston, TX 77006  
Phone: (713) 528-0700

*Representing: Plaintiffs*

**Law Offices of John S. Roth**

John Roth, Esq. ([john@rothlawoffice.com](mailto:john@rothlawoffice.com))  
2901 West Coast Highway, Suite 200  
Newport Beach, CA 92663  
Phone: (949) 646-1818  
Fax: (949) 646-2323

*Representing: Plaintiffs*

**Law Offices of Nicholas R. Braico, P.C.**

Nicholas Braico, Esq. ([braicolaw@gmail.com](mailto:braicolaw@gmail.com))  
25283 Cabot Road, Suite 112  
Laguna Hills, CA 92653  
Phone: (949) 916-3105

*Representing: Plaintiffs*

**Law Offices of Paul W. Ralph**

Paul Ralph, Esq. ([pwr@ocinjuryattorney.com](mailto:pwr@ocinjuryattorney.com))  
500 North State College Boulevard, Suite 1100  
Orange, CA 92868  
Phone: (714) 919-4415  
Fax: (714) 919-4315

*Representing: Plaintiffs*

**Law Offices of Steven D. Hillyard**

Steven Hillyard, Esq.  
([rpacheco@sdhlawoffices.com](mailto:rpacheco@sdhlawoffices.com))  
280 Newport Center Drive Suite 260  
Newport Beach, CA 92660  
Phone: (949) 502-5215

*Representing: Plaintiffs*

**Law Offices of Timothy J. Swift**

Timothy Swift, Esq. ([tim@timswiftlaw.com](mailto:tim@timswiftlaw.com))  
4 Park Plaza, Suite 500  
Irvine, CA 92614  
Phone: (714) 541-4331

*Representing: Plaintiffs*

**Ledezma Law Group**

Jorge Ledezma, Esq. ([jorge@ledezmalaw.com](mailto:jorge@ledezmalaw.com))  
1851 East First Street, Suite 850  
Santa Ana, CA 92705  
Phone: (657) 210-2050

*Representing: Plaintiffs*

**Leone + Associates**

Fernando Leone, Esq. ([avlg@sbcglobal.net](mailto:avlg@sbcglobal.net))  
207 North Broadway, Suite F  
Santa Ana, CA 92701  
Phone: (714) 836-4439

*Representing: Plaintiffs*

**Lewis Brisbois Bisgaard & Smith LLP**

Denise Isfeld, Esq.  
([denise.isfeld@lewisbrisbois.com](mailto:denise.isfeld@lewisbrisbois.com))  
George Nowotny, Esq.

*Representing: Renee Pourtemour,  
D.D.S.*

([george.nowotny@lewisbrisbois.com](mailto:george.nowotny@lewisbrisbois.com))  
Kathleen Walker, Esq.  
([kathleen.walker@lewisbrisbois.com](mailto:kathleen.walker@lewisbrisbois.com))  
633 West Fifth Street, Suite 4000  
Los Angeles, CA 90071  
Phone: (213) 250-1800  
Fax: (213) 250-7900

**London Fischer LLP**

Nicholas Davila, Esq.  
([ndavila@londonfischer.com](mailto:ndavila@londonfischer.com))  
Richard Endress, Esq.  
([rendres@londonfischer.com](mailto:rendres@londonfischer.com))  
Grant Mullen, Esq.  
([gmullen@londonfischer.com](mailto:gmullen@londonfischer.com))  
2505 McCabe Way, Suite 100  
Irvine, CA 92614  
Phone: (949) 252-0550  
Fax: (949) 252-0553

*Representing:* CRH California Water,  
Inc.

**Munoz & Associates**

Edward Munoz, Esq.  
([munozlaw@sbcglobal.net](mailto:munozlaw@sbcglobal.net))  
600 West Santa Ana Boulevard, Suite 910  
Santa Ana, CA 92701  
Phone: (714) 954-0225

*Representing:* Plaintiffs

**Napolin Law Firm, LLP**

Catherine Lombardo, Esq.  
([catherine@napolinlaw.com](mailto:catherine@napolinlaw.com))  
Alexander Napolin, Esq.  
([alexander@napolinlaw.com](mailto:alexander@napolinlaw.com))  
433 Arrow Highway  
P.O. Box 2001  
Claremont, CA 91711  
Phone: (909) 325-6032  
Fax: (909) 614-7373

*Representing:* Plaintiffs

*Representing:* Allison Olex, D.D.S.  
Avishan Kolahdouz  
Nasiri, D.M.D.  
David M. Diaz, D.D.S.  
Elaine Lam, D.D.S.  
Joanne Gabot-  
Heyman, D.D.S.  
Maria Lima, D.D.S.  
Pamela Abraham,  
D.D.S.  
Trinh Pham, D.D.S.  
Yazan Mazan Kasey,  
D.D.S.

**O'Melveny & Myers LLP**

Sabrina Strong, Esq. ([sstrong@omm.com](mailto:sstrong@omm.com))  
Michael Yoder, Esq. ([myoder@omm.com](mailto:myoder@omm.com))  
400 South Hope Street, 18th Floor  
Los Angeles, CA 90071  
Phone: (213) 430-6000  
Fax: (213) 430-6407

**O'Melveny & Myers LLP**

Amy Laurendeau, Esq.  
([alaurendeau@omm.com](mailto:alaurendeau@omm.com))  
Ashton Massey, Esq. ([amassey@omm.com](mailto:amassey@omm.com))  
610 Newport Center Drive, 17th Floor

*Representing:* Allison Olex, D.D.S.  
Avishan Kolahdouz  
Nasiri, D.M.D.  
David M. Diaz, D.D.S.  
Elaine Lam, D.D.S.



Newport Beach, CA 92660  
Phone: (949) 823-6900  
Fax: (949) 823-6994

Joanne Gabot-  
Heyman, D.D.S.  
Maria Lima, D.D.S.  
Pamela Abraham,  
D.D.S.  
Trinh Pham, D.D.S.  
Yazan Mazan Kasey,  
D.D.S.

**Poliquin & DeGrave LLP**

Elizabeth Flatley, Esq.  
([eflatley@pdattorneys.com](mailto:eflatley@pdattorneys.com))  
Mark Poliquin, Esq.  
([mpoliquin@pdattorneys.com](mailto:mpoliquin@pdattorneys.com))  
22972 Mill Creek Drive  
Laguna Hills, CA 92653  
Phone: (949) 716-8230  
Fax: (949) 716-4750

*Representing:* Anne Hoang, D.D.S.  
Benjamin Sapir,  
D.D.S.  
Caroline Hu, D.D.S.  
Hisako Seigemartin,  
D.D.S.  
Namie Kon, D.D.S.

**Ray & Gourde, LLP**

Nicholas Aloia, Esq. ([nicholas@raygourde.com](mailto:nicholas@raygourde.com))  
Burdick Ray, Esq. ([burdick@raygourde.com](mailto:burdick@raygourde.com))  
111 Pacifica, Suite 120  
Irvine, CA 92618  
Phone: (949) 825-6520

*Representing:* Irina Tarnavsky,  
D.D.S.  
Lisa Nguyen, D.D.S.

**Resnick & Louis, P.C.**

Carol Knoblow, Esq.  
([cknoblow@rlattorneys.com](mailto:cknoblow@rlattorneys.com))  
James McDermed, Esq.  
([jmcdermed@rlattorneys.com](mailto:jmcdermed@rlattorneys.com))  
9891 Irvine Center Drive, Suite 200  
Irvine, CA 92618  
Phone: (714) 709-4400  
Fax: (602) 456-6256

*Representing:* CRH California Water,  
Inc.

**Taylor DeMarco LLP**

Bora Song, Esq. ([bsong@taylordemarco.com](mailto:bsong@taylordemarco.com))  
N. Denise Taylor, Esq.  
([dtaylor@taylordemarco.com](mailto:dtaylor@taylordemarco.com))  
Sage Zermeno-Romero, Esq.  
([szermenoromero@taylordemarco.com](mailto:szermenoromero@taylordemarco.com))  
1000 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 600  
Los Angeles, CA 90017  
Phone: (213) 687-1600

*Representing:* Allison Olex, D.D.S.  
Elaine Lam, D.D.S.  
Joanne Gabot-  
Heyman, D.D.S.  
Pamela Abraham,  
D.M.D.  
Trinh Pham, D.D.S.

**The Dominguez Firm**

Martin Kanarek, Esq.  
([martin.kanarek@dominguezfirm.com](mailto:martin.kanarek@dominguezfirm.com))  
One Park Plaza  
3250 Wilshire Blvd. Suite 2200  
Los Angeles, CA 90010  
Phone: (213) 388-7788  
Fax: (213) 388-9540

*Representing:* Plaintiffs

**The Goldman Law Firm**

Kevin Kelly, Esq. ([kkelly@goldmanlawfirm.net](mailto:kkelly@goldmanlawfirm.net))  
55 Main Street

*Representing:* The Dentists Insurance  
Company

Tiburon, CA 94920  
Phone: (415) 435-5500

**The Levy Law Firm**

Dane Levy, Esq. ([dlevylaw@msn.com](mailto:dlevylaw@msn.com))  
4500 East Pacific Coast Highway, Suite 150  
Long Beach, CA 90804  
Phone: (562) 270-7810  
Fax: (562) 293-2843

*Representing: Plaintiffs*

**The Skiver Law Firm**

Ryan Skiver, Esq. ([rskiver@skiverlawfirm.com](mailto:rskiver@skiverlawfirm.com))  
3200 North Hayden Road, Suite 220  
Scottsdale, AZ 85251  
Phone: (480) 626-1667  
Fax: (480) 482-7285

*Representing: Plaintiffs*

**Umberg Zipser LLP**

Carole Reagan, Esq.  
([creagan@umbergzipser.com](mailto:creagan@umbergzipser.com))  
Adina Stowell, Esq.  
([astowell@umbergzipser.com](mailto:astowell@umbergzipser.com))  
Thomas Umberg, Esq.  
([tumberg@umbergzipser.com](mailto:tumberg@umbergzipser.com))  
Dean Zipser, Esq.  
([dzipser@umbergzipser.com](mailto:dzipser@umbergzipser.com))  
1920 Main Street, Suite 750  
Irvine, CA 92614  
Phone: (949) 679-0052  
Fax: (949) 679-0461

*Representing: Marsha Jacks  
Samuel Gruenbaum*

**Wilson, Elser, Moskowitz, Edelman &  
Dicker LLP**

Steven Parminter, Esq.  
([steven.parminter@wilsonelser.com](mailto:steven.parminter@wilsonelser.com))  
Ashan Peiris, Esq.  
([ashan.peiris@wilsonelser.com](mailto:ashan.peiris@wilsonelser.com))  
555 South Flower Street, 29th Floor  
Los Angeles, CA 90071  
Phone: (213) 443-5100  
Fax: (213) 443-5101

*Representing: Culligan International  
Company*

**Zukor & Nelson**

Marilyn Nelson, Esq.  
([marilynhnelson@gmail.com](mailto:marilynhnelson@gmail.com))  
Abram Zukor, Esq.  
([zukorandnelson@gmail.com](mailto:zukorandnelson@gmail.com))  
9401 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 1250  
Beverly Hills, CA 90212  
Phone: (310) 274-0846

*Representing: Plaintiffs*