## 4.11

**Problem:** Show that if A is a decidable set, then so is its complement. Then, show that if A and B are decidable sets, then so are  $A \cup B$  and  $A \cap B$ .

**Solution:** Let  $f_A$  be the function that computes  $\chi_A$ , and let  $f_B$  be the function that computes  $\chi_B$ .

We define  $g_A$ , which computes  $\mathbb{N} \setminus A$ , by composing  $f_A$  with the partial function that computes 1 if the input is 0 and computes 0 if the input is 1.

To define  $f_{A \cup B}$  and  $f_{A \cap B}$ , we take

$$f_{A \cup B} = f_A + f_B - (f_A)(f_B)$$
  
 $f_{A \cap B} = (f_A)(f_B),$ 

in which we use the multiplication and addition operations composed with fA and fB.

## Extra Problem 1

**Problem:** Give an example of a relation that is not computable.

**Solution:** Let  $\{T_m\}_{m\in\mathbb{N}}$  be a denumeration of the set of all Turing machines with one input. We define the relation  $R\subseteq\mathbb{N}\times\mathbb{N}$  with the membership  $(m,n)\in R$  if and only if  $T_m(n)$  halts.

Since it is not possible to compute the halting problem, we know that the relation R is not computable.

## Extra Problem 2

**Problem:** Suppose R, S, T are relations with  $(a, b) \in T$  if and only if  $(a, b) \in R$  or  $(a, b) \in S$ .

- (a) Prove or disprove: if R and S are computable, then T is computable.
- (b) Prove or disprove: if T and S are computable, then R is computable.

#### Solution:

(a) We can define a computation of T by saying

$$T(a, b) = R(a, b) + S(a, b) - M(S(a, b), R(a, b));$$

which is computable as addition and multiplication are computable.

(b) Consider R as the halting evaluation — that is,  $(a, b) \in R$  if and only if  $T_a(b)$  halts. If we let  $S = \mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N}$ , then

$$T = R \cup S$$
$$= R \cup \mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N}$$
$$= \mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N}.$$

meaning T is computable, S is computable, but R is not computable.

# Extra Problem 3

**Problem:** Prove that if  $R \subseteq \mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N}$  is computable, then so too is  $\mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N} \setminus R$ .

## Extra Problem 4

**Problem:** Show that the relation a|b is primitive recursive.

**Solution:** The relation a|b means there exists k such that ak = b.

So, we know that a|b if and only if

$$((0)(a) = b) \lor ((1)(a) = b) \lor \cdots \lor (ba = b).$$

We then evaluate the product

$$d(a,b) = \prod_{i=0}^{b} (1 \dot{-} E(b \dot{-} M(i,a),0))$$

to find the truth value of the statement.

## Extra Problem 5

**Problem:** Define a function  $\pi(n)$  by  $\pi(n) = 1$  if n is prime and 0 otherwise. Use minimalization to show that  $\pi$  is computable.

**Solution:** From Wilson's Theorem, we know that  $(n-1)! \equiv n-1$  modulo n if and only if n is prime. We start by defining the remainder function

$$\operatorname{rem}(a,b) = \min_{z} ((a \dot{-} bz) \dot{-} b = 0).$$

Since the factorial function is primitive recursive, we thus have

$$\pi(n) = E(\text{rem}(\text{fact}(n-1), n), n-1).$$

Since  $\pi$  is obtained by composition, primitive recursion, and minimalization, we must have that  $\pi$  is recursive (hence computable).

# Extra Problem 7

Problem: Let

$$\pi(n) = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{n prime} \\ 0 & \text{else} \end{cases}.$$

Show that  $\pi$  is primitive recursive.

**Solution:** We know that n is prime if and only if the only k with k > 1 and k|n is k = n.

Take

$$\pi(n) = (1 \dot{-} D(2, n)) (1 \dot{-} D(3, n)) \cdots (1 \dot{-} D(n - 1, n))$$
$$= \prod_{i=2}^{n-1} (1 \dot{-} D(i, n)).$$