ms\_borrador

AJ Perez-Luque; G. Gea-Izquierdo; R. Zamora; FJ. Bonet

2017

# Introduction

Drought is a natural phenomenon occurring when water availability is significantly below-normal levels (Dai 2011). It is one of the most frequent and widespread climatic extremes affecting ecological systems across every climatic zone worldwide (Mishra and Singh 2010, Dai 2011, Ummenhofer and Meehl 2017). Summer drought is a characteristic feature of the Mediterranean climate (Lionello 2012), but an increase in the frequency and severity of drought events have been recorded for the Mediterranean region (Hoerling et al. 2012), particularly for southern Europe (Vicente-Serrano et al. 2014, Spinoni et al. 2015, Stagge et al. 2017) where a trend towards drier summers has been reported for the last three decades (Spinoni et al. 2017a). Climate change projections suggest that extreme events, like droughts, will become more frequent and severe (IPCC 2013, Trenberth et al. 2014), specially in the Mediterranean area (Spinoni et al. 2017b).

Drought causes significant changes in ecosystem productivity and water dynamics that can severely affect forests through changes in plant physiology, phenology and carbon allocation (Allen et al. 2010, Ummenhofer and Meehl 2017). In the last decades the assessment of the drought impacts on ecosystems has gained attention (Allen et al. 2010, Clark et al. 2016), especially considering some studies that suggest an increase in severity, geographic extent and frequency of droughts as a result of climate change (Dai 2011, Trenberth et al. 2014). The response of vegetation to drought has been analyzed at different scales, from global (*e.g*. Allen et al. 2010, Vicente-Serrano et al. 2013, Norman et al. 2016) to local scales (see Martínez-Vilalta and Lloret 2016 for a revision).

Vegetation responses to drought are influenced by other drivers of environmental change (Fischer et al. 2006, Oliver and Morecroft 2014, Franklin et al. 2016, Peñuelas et al. 2017), and some authors states that the impacts of drought on ecosystem must be evaluated in a context of global change considering the interactions with other drivers of environmental change (Archaux and Wolters 2006, Clavero 2011), such us land-use change (Doblas-Miranda et al. 2017). This is specially relevant for areas with a long history of landscape modification as the Mediterranean region where land-use change is a key driver of the global change (Navarro-González et al. 2013, Ameztegui et al. 2016). For instance, Doblas-Miranda et al. (2017) in a recent review, found that land use changes and more especially drought, are crucial factors in the interactions among the drivers of global change for Mediterranean forests.

The impacts of drought are also especially relevant for populations located in the rear edge of their distribution, where climatic conditions often corresponds to the species-limits and the populations are likey to be more sensitive to small variations on climate (Hampe and Petit 2005). The response of rear-edge populations to variations on climate could be useful to estimate the adaptation of the species to predicted climatic changes (Jump et al. 2010). It becomes even more important for relict populations driven by historical land-uses, which can harbour high levels of intraspecific genetic diversity (Valbuena-Carabaña et al. 2010).

Several studies analyzed the drought effects on Mediterranean tree species representing the southermost limit of their distribution (Camarero et al. 2011, Pasho et al. 2011, Sánchez-Salguero et al. 2012, 2017, Linares et al. 2014, Dorado-Liñán et al. 2017b, Caminero et al. 2018), some focused on the resilience to drought of rear-edge populations (*e.g.* Sánchez-Salguero et al. 2013, Herrero 2014). Resilience is the capacity of an ecosystem, community or individual to recover pre-disturbance structure and function after a disturbance (Holling 1973, Lloret et al. 2011, Hodgson et al. 2015). The assessment of forest resilience to climatic disturbances, such as extreme droughts, provides critical information about the capacity of forests to maintain their structure and to continue providing valuable ecosystem services. This is particularly relevant for populations located in their rear-edge of their distribution, especially when they are located in Mediterranean mountains.

Here we assessed the resilience to drought of rear-edge populations of a tree Mediterranean species combining several approaches: remote sensing and tree-ring (Jump et al. 2010).

Remote sensing can be used for studying droughts impacts on ecosystems (Michel Deshayes et al. 2006, Zhang et al. 2013, AghaKouchak et al. 2015, McDowell et al. 2015, Norman et al. 2016). Vegetation indices obtained from satellite, such us EVI (*Enhanced Vegetation Index*) are used as a proxy for assessing vegetation functioning and aboveground net primary production (Huete et al. 2002), and changes in the patterns of these indices are considered as an indicator of the forest response to external environmental factors, such us droughts (*e.g.* Vicente-Serrano et al. 2013, Vicca et al. 2016). Drought impacts on vegetation using remote sensing have been analyzed at different scales (Vicente-Serrano et al. 2013, Assal et al. 2016) and for Mediterranean area there were studies covering all region (Gouveia et al. 2017) and others focused on local scales (Lloret et al. 2007, Vicente-Serrano 2007, Zribi et al. 2016).

Tree-ring width is a widely used proxy for tree vitality (Fritts 1976, Dobbertin 2005, Bhuyan et al. 2017a) and the analysis of annual-tree ring widths can be used to study changes in growth as response to drought at the individiual tree-scale (Gazol et al. 2018). Several studies combined the use of satellite information with dendroecological data to assess the effect of droughts on vegetation (Dorman et al. 2013, Vicente-Serrano et al. 2013, Sangüesa-Barreda et al. 2014, Coulthard et al. 2017); and recently, Gazol et al. (2018) evaluated the resilience of several forests in Spain combining information derived from remote sensing and tree-ring data.

In this work we used remote sensing information and dendroecological methods to evaluate the drought impacts in both canopy greenness (as a proxy to primary growth) and tree-radial growth of a Mediterranean tree species (*Quercus pyrenaica* Willd.) located in Sierra Nevada, considered a rear-edge of their distribution. We are also interested in assessing resilience of these forest to several extreme drought episodes. We hypothesized that, relict populations driven by historical land-use at their climatic (either altitudinal or latitudinal) rear-edge are particularly vulnerable to climate change, and hence they will show low-values of resilience after several extreme droughts. Specifically, the aims of this work were: (*i*) To quantify how two recent extreme drought events influenced primary and secondary growth of *Q. pyreancia* forests in their rear edge; (*ii*) to analyze the resilience of these forests to successive extreme drought events, both in recent times and in the long-term using time-series of radial growth; (*iii*) and to explore differences in the resilience metrics between populations located in contrasting ecological conditions within the rear edge of the distribution of this species. In addition, within the region of study we were interested to assess whether the effect of aspect and microclimatic conditions expressed in northern and southern populations of Pyrenean oak forests differ in their resistance, resilience and recovery to extreme drought events.

# Materials and methods

## Species and study site

Pyrenean oak (*Quercus pyrenaica* Willd.) forests extend through south-western France and the Iberian Peninsula reaching its southern limit in northern Morocco (Franco 1990). In the Iberian Peninsula these forests live on siliceous soils, or soils poor in basic ions (Vilches de la Serna 2014) under meso-supramediterranean and mesotemperate areas and subhumid, humid and hyperhumid ombroclimate (Rivas-Martínez et al. 2002). *Q. pyrenaica* requires over 650 mm of annual precipitation and a summer minimal precipitation between 100 and 200 mm (Martínez-Parras and Molero-Mesa 1982, García and Jiménez 2009), with summer rainfall being a key factor in the distribution of the species (Gavilan et al. 2007, Río et al. 2007).

This species reaches its southernmost European limit in Sierra Nevada, a high-mountain range located in southern Spain (37°N, 3°W) with elevations of between 860 m and 3482 m *a.s.l.*. The climate is Mediterranean, characterized by cold winters and hot summers, with pronounced summer drought (July-August). There are eight oak patches (2400 Has) identified (Figure 1) in this mountain range, ranging between 1100 and 2000 m *a.s.l.* and often associated to major river valleys. Sierra Nevada is considered a glacial refugia for deciduous *Quercus* species (Brewer et al. 2002, Olalde et al. 2002, Rodríguez-Sánchez et al. 2010) and these populations are considered as a rear edge of the habitat distribution, which is important in determining habitat responses to expected climate change (Hampe and Petit 2005).

The populations of Pyrenean oak forests at Sierra Nevada are considered relict forests (Melendo and Valle 2000, Vivero et al. 2000), undergoing intensive anthropic use in history (Camacho-Olmedo et al. 2002, Valbuena-Carabaña et al. 2010, Valbuena-Carabaña and Gil 2017). In fact, conservation status of this species for southern Spain is “Vulnerable” (Vivero et al. 2000). The relict presence of this species in Sierra Nevada is related both to its genetic resilience and high intraspecific genetic diversity (Valbuena-Carabaña et al. 2010). However, they are also expected to suffer the impact of climate change, due to their greater hydric requirements compared to other more drought-tolerant Mediterranean evergreen oak and pine species. Thus, simulations of the climate change effects on this habitat forecast a reduction in suitable habitats for Sierra Nevada (Benito et al. 2011).

## Drought episodes

During the second half of the XX century, several extreme drought episodes were recorded for the Iberian Peninsula (*e.g*. 1994-1995, 1999, 2005, 2012) (Vicente-Serrano et al. 2014, Guerreiro et al. 2017).The 2005 and 2012 drought events have been documented as two of the worst drought years in the last decades for the southern Iberian Peninsula (García-Herrera et al. 2007, Trigo et al. 2013, Gouveia and Trigo 2014 Gouveia et al. (2015), Guerreiro et al. 2017, Páscoa et al. 2017) and they were charecterized as extreme drought in our climatic data (Appendices S1-S3). We focused on these two drought events because limitations about temporal availability of high-spatial resolution remote sensing information (MODIS started on 2000; see below). Nevertheless, for radial growth-time series, older drought events were also analyzed to contextualize results obtained in 2005 and 2012 drought events. The identification of a drought event were done using the Standardized Precipitation-Evapotranspiration Index (SPEI) (Vicente-Serrano et al. 2010) following similar procedure as proposed by Spinioni (see Appendix S3)

## Greenness data

Vegetation indices derived from remote sensing information have been widely used to derive descriptors of ecosystem functioning (*e.g* Alcaraz-Segura et al. 2009) and they are linked with primary productivity (Ruimy et al. n.d.). Here, vegetation greenness of *Q. pyrenaica* was characterized by means of the *Enhanced Vegetation Index* (EVI), derived from MOD13Q1 product of the *Moderate Resolution Imaging Spectroradiometer* (MODIS) sensor (Didan 2015). MODIS EVI Data (Collection 6) were obtanied using Google Earth Engine platform for the period 2000 - 2016. EVI data consits of 16-day maximun value composite images (23 per year) of the EVI value with a spatial resolution of 250 m x 250 m. We selected the pixels covering the distribution of *Q. pyrenaica* forests in Sierra Nevada (*n* = 928 pixels). Then, a data filtering was applied to select EVI valid values. For this purpose, complementary information accompanying the EVI data was used (VI Usefulness Indices and quality flags). Values affected by high content of aerosols, clouds, snow and shadows, were filtered out following recommendations of Reyes-Díez et al. (2015) for mountain regions (Reyes-Díez et al. 2015).

To explore the effect of drought on greenness, the EVI standardized anomaly () was computed pixel-by-pixel, since it minimizes biases in the evaluation of anomalies, providing more information about the magnitude of the anomalies (Samanta et al. 2012, Gao et al. 2016). For each pixel, an annual EVI value was obtained by averaging EVI valid values. Then, the standardized anomaly was computed as:

where is the EVI standardized anomaly for year ; the annual mean value of EVI for year ; the average of the annual EVI values for the period of reference 2000-2016 (all except year); and the standard deviation for the reference period. Each pixel was categorized according the EVI standardized anomalies as “greening” (EVI standardized anomalies greater than + 1), “browning” (EVI standardized anomalies less than - 1) or “no changes” (EVI standardized anomalies between − 1 and + 1) (Samanta et al. 2010, 2012).

As a surrogate of mean annual primary production, annual mean EVI () value was computed for each pixel for the period 2000 - 2016. was chosen since it is highly stable under the use of any filter (Reyes-Díez et al. 2015) and because it showed high significant correlations with annual (r = 0.81) and seasonal EVI values ( = 0.76 and = 0.88). For exploratory purposes, temporal trends of were explored at a pixel scale. The nonparametric Mann–Kendall test (Kendall, 1975; Mann, 1945) was applied using the trend package in R (Pohlert 2017). The alpha level for the test was set to 0.05.

## Field sampling and dendrochronological methods

### Tree sampling

Tree sampling was carried during autumn of 2016. Trees were sampled at two locations in contrasting slopes of Sierra Nevada: San Juan (SJ), xeric site located at northern aspect; and Cáñar (CA), humid but warm site located at southern aspect (Figure 1; Table 1). For the southern site two elevations were sampled: CA-Low and CA-High. All the sites were oak monospecific and representatives of two of the three population clusters identified for the species in this mountain range (Pérez-Luque et al. 2015a). In each site between 15 and 20 dominant trees were randomly selected. Two cores of 5 mm of diameter were taken from each tree at breast heigth (1.3 m) using an increment borer. Diameter at breast height (DBH) and total height were measured using a girth tape and a Vertex IV ultrasonic hypsometer (Haglöf, Sweden) respectively. Stand competition of target trees was assessed by recording distance, azimuth, DBH, species and total height of all neighboring living trees with DBH > 7.5 cm within a circular plot of 10 m radius. Several competition indices were calculated: the distance independent indices *density* (), and *basal area* (BA, ); and the distance dependent index size ratio proportional to distance (*srd*) as . Then, non-parametric Kruskal-Wallis rank sum tests (Sokal and Rohlf 1995) were used to analyse differences between sites for height, DBH and competition indices. When significant differences were observed, we run multiple comparisons using the Dunn’s-test (Dunn 1964) with Bonferroni adjustment to correct significance values. These analysis were performed uisng the PMCMR package in R (Pohlert 2014).

### Dendroecological analyses

Tree cores were air dried, glued onto wooden mounts and sanded. Annual radial growth (ring width, RW) was measured with a LINTAB measuring device (Rinntech, Heidelberg, Germany) coupled to a stereomicroscope, with an accuracy of 0.001 mm. Individual ring series were first visually and statistically cross-dated with TSAP software (Rinntech, Heidelberg, Germany), using the statistics Gleichläufigkeit (GLK), t-value and the crossdating index (CDI). Cross-dating validation was finally done using COFECHA software (Holmes 1983).

The growth trends were analyzed at different time scales. To study the response of growth to the inter-annual variability of climate (short-term response), pre-whitened residual chronologies (RWI) were used. They were calculated from ratios between raw growth measurements and individual cubic splines with a 50 % frequency cutoff at 30 years (Fritts 1976). Tree-ring width series were standardized and detrended using the dplR (Bunn 2008, 2010) package. Residual site chronologies were obtained computing the biweight robust mean of all prewhitened growth indices for the trees of the same site (Cook and Kairukstis 1990). The statistical quality of each chronology was checked via the expressed population signal. A threshold value of EPS > 0.85 was used to determine the cutoff year of the time span that could be considered reliable (Wigley et al. 1984).

The long-term growth response was analyzed using basal area increment (hereafter BAI, ). Theoretically, BAI represents a more accurate indicator of growth than ring-width, since it removes variation in growth attributable to increasing stem circumference after 30-40 years of juvenile increasing growth (Biondi and Qeadan 2008). Raw ring-widths and measured DBH were used to compute BAI by subtracting twice the annual ring width from the annual diameter, starting from the measured diameter outside the bark (Piovesa et al. 2008). We used the following equation:

where is the radius of the tree and is the year of tree-ring formation. For each individual tree, a mean BAI serie was calculated. Then, mean site BAI chronologies were obtained by averaging individual tree BAI time series.

Both RWI and BAI chronologies were compared to different climatic indices to analyse the low and the high-frequency response to climate of trees. Statistical descriptive parameters, including the mean, standard deviation, first-order autocorrelation of raw series, the mean sensitivity (a measure of the year-to-year variability) and the mean correlation between individual series of residual ring-width indices, were also calculated for each site chronology (Fritts 1976).

### Climate and growth

Climate data were obtained from the European Daily High-Resolution Observational Gridded Dataset (E-OBS v16) (Haylock et al. 2008). Monthly precipitation and minimum and maximum temperatures were obtained at a 0.25 x 0.25 º resolution for the 1950-2016 period. We selected grid cells covering each sampled sites. Data were downloaded and preprocessed using the climate4R bundle (<http://www.meteo.unican.es/en/climate4R>) (Cofiño et al. 2018, Frías et al. 2018). The Standardized Precipitation-Evapotranspiration Index (SPEI), a multiscalar drought index that incorporates both precipitation and temperature (Vicente-Serrano et al. 2010, Beguería et al. 2014), was also used to characterize the drought conditions for the period 1961-2014. SPEI values with a temporal scale of 6 months and a spatial resolution of 1.1 km, were obtanied from the Drought indices dataset (<http://monitordesequia.csic.es/>), a high resolution database of drought indices for Spain (Vicente-Serrano et al. 2017).

Relationships between residual site chronologies and climatic variables were assessed ussing bootstrapped Pearson’s correlations estimated using the treeclim package (Zang and Biondi 2015). The bootstrapped confidence intervals were used to estimate significance (p < 0.05) of the correlation coefficients.

### Disturbance analyses

Disturbance chronologies were built using tree-ring width to identify abrupt and sustained increases (release events from competition) or decreases (supressions) in radial growth (Nowacki and Abrams 1997) as indirect estimates of possible disturbance events (e.g. logging) in the past. By using a temporal window of reasonable length this method is intended to filter out the response to short-term changes in temperature and precipitation and minimizes the long-term growth trends (Nowacki and Abrams 1997, Fraver and White 2005).

Growth changes (GC) were calculated for the individual tree-ring series using a 10-year running window as either positive (PGC) or negative (NGC) growth changes:

where is preceding 10-year median and is subsequent 10-year median. Medians were used since they are more robust estimator of central tendency than means (Rubino and McCarthy 2004, Camarero et al. 2011). Site disturbance chronologies were constructed by averaging the individual disturbances series annually. To separate growth peaks produced by disturbance events and expressing stand-wise disturbances from those by climate, we considered a threshold of 50 % of GC and more than 50% of the individual trees displaying the same growth changes was considered a stand-wise disturbance.

In addition, the forest history of San Juan and Cáñar sites was inferred from a detailed analysis of historical land-use changes. For this purpose, an exhaustive review of historical documents was done to compile information about socio-economical activities affecting forest: land-uses, forest managment actions, mining, wildfires, etc. Several documentary sources were reviewed: historical documents and maps (*e.g.* Catastro 1753, Cultura 1943, M. 1990); detailed mining reports (*e.g.* A. 1858); official information about recent wildfires events (Regional Ministry for the Environment of the Government of Andalusia) and forest management practices (F.J. et al. 2016); livestock farming (*e.g.* “Caracterización de fuentes de información para la reconstrucción histórica de la vegetación. un caso de estudio en sierra nevada” 2014); and other studies reviewing the socioeconomic dynamics of forest of Sierra Nevada at different scales (“Estudio de cambios de la biodiversidad a través de talleres de participación ciudadana” 2014, Y. et al. 2015, Moreno-LLorca et al. 2016).

## Resilience

To evaluate the effects of drougth events on greeennes and tree growth (BAI) resilience indices proposed by Lloret et al. (2011) were used: resilience (*Rs*), resistance (*Rt*), and recovery (*Rc*). The resistance index (*Rt*) quantifies the severity of the impact of the disturbance in the year it occurred. It is estimated as the ratio between the performance during and before the disturbance (drought) event:

Resistance (*Rt*) = Drought / Predrought

The Recovery index (*Rc*) is the ability to recover from disturbance relative to its severity, and it is estimated as the ratio between performance after and during disturbance:

Recovery (*Rc*) = Postdrought / Drought

The Resilience index (*Rs*) is the capacity to reach pre-disturbance performance levels, and it is estimated as the ratio between the performance after and before disturbance:

Resilience (*Rs*) = Postdrought / Predrought

The values of these indices were computed for tree growth (BAI) and greenness (EVI mean) during each drought event. 2005 and 2012 were considered as single drought events. The predrought and postdrought values of each target variable (*i.e.*: BAI or EVI) were computed as the mean value during a period of three years before and after the drougth event respectively. A period of three years was chosen because we found similar results comparing periods of two, three and four years (Appendix S6) and this length was used in other studies (*e.g.* Gazol et al. 2017). To put in context the resilience observed for 2005 and 2012 drought events, resilience metrics for BAI data were additionally computed for the most severe drought events since 1900 (Appendix S3).

## Statistical analysis

For each of the three resilience indices studied, robust two-way ANOVAs were used to test for differences between drought events (2005 and 2012) and the two studied oak populations (northern and southern aspects). These tests were used because original and log-transformed data did not follow the assumptions of normality and homogeneity of variance (Wilcox 2012). Robust measures of central tendency (M-estimator based on Huber’s Psi) were used since they were close to the mean value in all cases (Wilcox 2012). When running the robust ANOVA test, data were boostrapped 3000 times and trimmed automatically to control the potential influence of outliers (Field et al. 2012, Wilcox 2012). Post-hoc differences were assessed pairwise using a similar boostrap test. All the robust ANOVA and post-hoc tests were carried out using the WRS2 (Mair et al. 2017) and rcompanion (Mangiafico 2017) R packages. The level of significance was set to 0.05 and adjusted for multiple comparisons. All analyses were carried out in R software (R Core Team 2017) using several packages (see Supplementary S?)

# Results

## Time trends in vegetation greenness

The analysis of greenness time trends showed that 78.9 % of the pixels of *Quercus pyrenaica* forests experienced an EVI positive trend for the 2000-2016 period. During the 2005 the lowest values of EVI standardized anomalies were recorded, particularly for northern populations (Figure 2). In fact, a “browning” episode () was observed for *Q. pyrenaica* forests during this drought event, yet no changes in greenness were observed in response to the 2012 drought (Appendix S4).

## Radial growth trends

Likely as a consequence of their different management origin (*i.e.* land-use legacy), the trees of the southern population were older than northern ones, particularly for the high elevation site (CA-High) which had bigger and taller trees than the other sites (Tables 1, 2). Competition was similar among sites but plot basal area was greatest in CA-High (Table 1). Yet the basal area increment (BAI) growth in the highest plot in altitude (CA-High) was the greatest (Figure 4). In addition, trees from this location showed a positive growth trend since the late 1970s (Figure 4), which was not found for any of the other two locations. For southern population differences in growth were observed, with CA-Low site showing lower values than CA-High but similar to growth values of the northern population (SJ) (Figure 4; Appendix S7).

For 2005 and 2012 we found a greater reduction of RWI for northern site (SJ) but weaker for southern sites (CA-High and CA-Low). Yet, the lowest pointer year (*i.e.* the lowest growth) since 1950 was 1995 in all chronologies (Figure 5).

## Resilience of greenness and radial tree-growth to drought events

*Q. pyrenaica* forest showed significantly lower resistance values (*Rt*) to the 2005 drought event than to that in 2012 for greenness and for radial growth (Table 3; Figure 3). The 2005 drought reduced greenees and growth more than that of 2012 (Tables S1 and S2). Resistance values to drought for greenness and tree-growth varied between sites (Table 3). Southern populations showed significantly higher values of resistance than northern ones (Tables S1 and S2). It was particularly important for the 2005 drought event where the growth was reduced to 44.5 % respect to that of the preceding period (Figure 3).

Recovery (*Rc*) of greenness and growth were significantly different bewteen drought events and sites (Tables 3). In the 3-year period after the 2005 drought, greenness achieved was 112 % (Rc = 1.12) and after 2012 was 105.7 % (Rc = 1.057) (Table S1). An opposite pattern was found for tree-growth, with significantly lower values of recovery after the 2005 drought, staying at levels of *Rc* < 1 (Figure 3, Table S2). Northern populations showed significantly higher values of recovery than southern sites for greenness and tree-growth (Table S2). For southern populations, no significant differences were found for recovery of greenness after the 2005 and 2012 drought event (p = 0.2453; Figure 3; Table S1). Recovery values for tree-growth of southern populations were below or close to 1 (Figure 3, Table S2).

Significantly higher values of resilience (*Rs*) were observed for the 2012 drought event than for the 2005 in both variables (greenness and tree-growth) (Tables S1-S2; Figure 3). Resilience values varied significantly between sites for greenness, but not for tree-growth (Table 3). Southern populations showed higher resilience values (*Rs*) than the northern ones (Tables S1-S2). For greenness, the differences of resilience between sites were not significant for the 2005 drought event (p = 0.036; Figure 3). For tree-growth, opposites resilience values were found for the interaction between sites and drought event: higher values of resilience for northern populations than southern ones (CA-High and CA-Low) during the 2012 drought event but opposite pattern during the 2005 (Tab

The exploration of resilience metrics of tree-growth for other severe droughts, revealed a positive relation between resilience (*Rs*) and drought severity ( = 0.336) (Appendix S6). A similar pattern was found for recovery (*Rc*; = 0.438) but negative for resistance (*Rt*, = 0.155). Resilience values of tree-growth for 2005 was the lowest of the drought events analyzed (Appendix S5) even not being the most severe drought events.

## Climate and tree-growth

Tree-growth exhibited a significant greater response to water availability than to temperatures, as it can be expected for a Mediterranean site and a species located closer to its xeric/dry distribution limit (rear-edge). Cumulative precipitation of the hydrological year was the climatic variable with the highest relationship with growth and influenced similarly and positively the tree-growth for both northern and southern populations (Figure 6a). Precipitation of previous december was also positively correlated with tree growth in the northern population and in the highest location of the southern population. Hydrological, Spring and Summer SPEI showed a strong positive correlation with tree-growth (Figure 6b), specially for the northern population (r > 0.6). Relationships with temperatures were lower than those with moisture variables. Yet there were differences between northern and southern populations: spring maximum temperature was the most significant limitation for the tree-growth of the southern population at both elevations while maximum temperatures of the previous August were the only negative significant for the northern one (Figures 6c and 6d). Remarkably minimum and maximum temperatures of current September positively influenced the tree-growth only in the northern population. No positive relationship with temperature was found for southern trees.

## Forest disturbances

The analysis of growth changes revealed differences in forest history between sites (Figures 7 and 8). Northern site (SJ) showed two release events ( > 50 %) detected at stand-wise scale (occurring in more than 50 % of sampled trees): the first during the 1940 decade and the second in the period 1994-2001. These periods alternate with periods of supression. Southern sites (CA-High and CA-Low) showed some weak suppression episodes, but not in the last 50 years.

# Discussion

## Oaks show high resilience in response to recent drought events

Our findings show that recent severe drought events, such as 2005 and 2012, provoked a reduction in greenness and especially in the growth of *Q. pyrenaica*. During the 2005 drought, one of the worst drought events recorded in the Iberian Peninsula (García-Herrera et al. 2007), we found a browning of the *Q. pyrenaica* forests, but no changes in EVI standardized anomalies were recorded for 2012, which can be explained because 2012 drought event was a winter-drought (Trigo et al. 2013). Tree-growth was also affected by drought as evidenced by the reduction in detrended tree-rings (RWI) during the most severe drought events (Figure 5). This common signal observed in our study sites is consistent with several works reporting tree-growth reductions for Mediterranean tree species during severe droughts, particularly for 2005 (*e.g.* Sánchez-Salguero et al. 2013, Camarero et al. 2018, Gazol et al. 2018).

Although 2005 and 2012 were two severe droughts recorded for the south of the Iberian Peninsula (García-Herrera et al. 2007, Trigo et al. 2013, Vicente-Serrano et al. 2014) (Appendix S3), we found a positive trend for vegetation greenness of the forests of *Q. pyrenaica* located in their rear edge. Our result agrees with those obtained by previous works using other remote sensing vegetation indices (Pérez-Luque et al. 2015b, Alcaraz-Segura et al. 2016), which suggests an increase in primary productivity during the last years for rear-edge populations of this species.

For tree-growth, a similar positive trend was observed in the last decades, particularly for the southern high-elevation site (CA-High, Figure 4). This result differs from those previous reported for *Q. pyrenaica* along their distribution range (Gea-Izquierdo et al. 2013, Gea-Izquierdo and Cañellas 2014). Gea-Izquierdo and Cañellas (2014) found a general decline in the growth of this species since the 1970s, particularly sharp for populations located in their dry-edge. This decline trend in growth have also been oberved for other tree species located in their rear-edges (*e.g.* Sánchez-Salguero et al. 2012, 2017, Dorado-Liñán et al. 2017a). Furthermore, growth projections have forecasted a decrease in productivity for *Q. pyrenaica* that would increase vulnerability of this species to climate warming at the dry edges locations (Gea-Izquierdo et al. 2013). However, our results for similar locations have revealed a recovery in tree-growth for the last years (Figure 4).

Aunque los valores de resiliencia (*Rs*) para el greenness y el tree-growth fueron inferiores o muy cercanos a 1, observamos en ambas variables, una mayor resiliencia tras la sequía de 2012 (Figure 3). La sequía de 2012, que fue mas severa e intensa que la registrada en 2005 (Appendix S3), ocurrió durante el invierno de 2012 (Trigo et al. 2013), lo cual puede explicar un menor efecto, sobre todo en el greenness de *Q. pyrenaica*. Por otro lado, al analizar la resiliencia del tree-growth para otros eventos de sequía, observamos como estas poblaciones muestran altos valores de resiliencia. Como muestrasn nuestros resultados, los mayores valores de resiliencia fueron registrados para dos de los eventos mas severos de sequía (1995 y 1999), con valores de resiliencia por encima de 1.2 en ambos eventos (Appendix S5).

Desde una perspectiva a largo plazo, nuestros resultados muestran que las poblaciones de *Q. pyrenaica* en Sierra Nevada, aún habiendo sufrido varios eventos de sequía severa, presentan altos valores de Recovery y de Resiliencia. Las poblaciones situadas en su rear edge viven en estrechos márgenes ambientales y pequeños variaciones en las condiciones ambientales pueden provocar que las restricciones ambientales sean mas severas (Hampe and Petit 2005). Así, frecuentemente se asume una alta vulnerabilidad a la sequía de las poblaciones situadas en su dry rear-edge (Martínez-Vilalta 2018), tal y como se ha visto para *Q.pyrenaica* (Gea-Izquierdo and Cañellas 2014) y para otras especies (citas). Sin embargo, algunos estudios están demostrando que esto no es siempre así (ver por ejemplo Cavin and Jump 2017, Granda et al. 2017), tal y como sugieren nuestros resultados, con altos valores de resiliencia para poblaciones de *Q. pyrenaica* situadas en su rear-edge.

Algunos autores han apuntando que cuando se estudian poblaciones del rear-edge, hay que poner atención a la forma en la que se define la marginalidad, esto es, si se define atendiendo a criterios geográficos, climáticos, o según otros factores ecológicos (Martínez-Vilalta 2018). En este sentido, los altos valores de resiliencia a los eventos de sequía que hemos observado, podrían sugerir que las poblaciones de *Q. pyrenaica* en Sierra Nevada están situados en un rear-edge geográfico, pero no climático. Esta idea se vería reforzada por el hecho de que Sierra Nevada is considered a glacial refugia for deciduous *Quercus* species (Brewer et al. 2002, Olalde et al. 2002, Rodríguez-Sánchez et al. 2010); además las poblaciones de *Q. pyrenaica* en Sierra Nevada presentan una alta resiliencia genética (Valbuena-Carabaña and Gil 2013, 2017).

## Site environment shapes differential sensitivity to climate and drought of rear-edge oak populations

Despite similar value of competence in our study sites, we obtained higher values of growth for the highest elevation site (CA-High, Figure 4).

El sitio del norte, ()

Tanto en el greenness como en el growth, encotramos direfencias para el greenness y el crecimiento entre las poblaciones situadas al norte y al sur.

Our results showed differences for greenness and tree-growth between northern and southern oak populations ().

Esta tendencia es importante sobre todo en las poblaciones situadas mas al sur, en donde observamos: menor br Encontramos diferencias entre poblaciones. Asi por ejemplo en las situadas mas al sur, vemos que las anomalias de EVI son menos negativas para el 2005; También vemos tendencias positivas en el BAI…

No obstante tambiéh habría que considerar que algunos trabajos apuntan a que la vulnerabilidad dentro del rear edge es mas sitio dependiente (dorado).

### Diferencias entre sitios

Llama la atención que en el rear-edge de la distribución de la especie, en el sitio mas meridional dentro de este rear edge, y en la parte mas alta (estas parcelas están en el treeline de la especie en SN (en torno a 1900)), es donde encontramos mayores crecimientos. Parece que los robles estuvieran mejor en esta zona. Algunas reflexiones sobre esto:

* Quizá están creciendo donde les están dejando (menor impacto antrópico en las zonas mas altas, al menos en los últimos años??)
* ¿Diferentes niveles de compentencia?. Parece que la competencia es similar en los tres sitios: no diferencias sig. para valores de Stand density ySize ratio proportional to distance (ver table 1).
* ¿Diferencias entre suelos?? En principio no. (“Taxonomic and functional diversity of a quercus pyrenaica willd. rhizospheric microbiome in the mediterranean mountains” 2017) en un trabajo sobre microbiota del suelo, explora diferencias en un gradiente altitudinal en Cáñar. Analiza 3 sitios: por encima del treline (XZF, el piornal), low altitudinal oak forest (LAF, en la zona baja del robledal) and high altitudinal oak forest (HAF). En su trabajo, LAF está mucho mas bajo, pero HAF está cerca de las parcelas caHigh. Restulados:
  + tipo de suelo: LAF es Sandy-loam, HAF es loam
  + HAF tuvo los valores mayores de disponibilidad hídrica (% available water tabla s1 en (“Taxonomic and functional diversity of a quercus pyrenaica willd. rhizospheric microbiome in the mediterranean mountains” 2017)) –> Esto es importante, creo
  + Los tres sitios eran pobres en materia orgánica, pero el HAF dobló los valores de los otros dos sitios
  + No diferencias en contenido de N, C/N ratio similares en HAF, y LAF
* ¿Menor estrés hídrico en zonas mas altas? Puede ser que tengamos menor estrés hídrico en esta zona?? Este robledal, está en la cara sur de SN, y en una ladera con bastante insolación. Algunos trabajos antiguos (de fitosociólogos) hablan de que su presencia aquí se debe a que reciben un aporte extra de humedad procedente de las brisas del mediterráneo, para suplir el mínimo de humedad que necesitan en verano. Quizá también tendríamos que incluir el papel de las acequias. La zona caHigh tiene una acequia muy cerca (y por encima) de donde muestreamos (recordad el roble mas grande, y el mas alto, esta justo en una acequia). No se si es interesante que lo comentemos.

En un estudio a escala continental, (Bhuyan et al. 2017a) encontraron que para la misma especie (estudiaron 850 sites: Fagus sylvatica, Abies alba, Picea abies, Larix decidua, Pinus cembra, P sylvestris, P nigra, Quercus petraea y Q robur) los stands situados a mayores elevaciones fueron menos sensibles a la sequía que los situados a elevaciones inferiores (stands were less drought sensitive at higher elevations compared to lower elevations). The effect of elevation was seen clearly in the case of several species where high elevation sites showed greater drought resistance compared to stands at lower elevation in the same climate zone.

### OTRA COSA

In fact, several authors have raise the need to consider land use y drought de forma conjunta en las environmental y forest management …. (ver Peñuelas et al 2017 y tb Doblas Miranda )

Environmental and forest management policies should take into account all these characteristics of Mediterranean forests and the social, environmental and climatic conditions that are projected for the coming years and decades.

#### Climate and tree relationship

Frase de resultados que tenemos que poner en discussion: Precipitation of previous december was also positively correlated with tree growth in the northern population and in the highest location of the southern population. Hydrological, Spring and Summer SPEI showed a strong positive correlation with tree-growth (Figure 7b), specially for the northern population (r > 0.6), … **which can be interpreted as higher sensitivity to drought of a drier site (Gea-Izquierdo and Cañellas 2014)**.

Moisture availability has been reported as the most limiting factor driving radial growth of *Q. pyrenaica* along their distribution range in Iberian Peninsula (Gea-Izquierdo and Cañellas 2014). We found a singnificant positive relation between precipitacion (hydrological year and previous December) and tree-growth (Figure 6a). Our results are consistent with previous studies highlighting the influence of precipitation on tree-ring growth (Gea-Izquierdo and Cañellas 2014, Gea-Izquierdo et al. 2014, González-González et al. 2014, Leal et al. 2015, Camisón et al. 2016, García-González and Souto-Herrero 2017, Roig et al. n.d.)

Para *Q. pyrenaica* moisture availability was reported to be the most limiting factor driving radial growth in Iberian Q. pyrenaica populations (Gea-Izquierdo and Cañellas 2014) (Prec hidrológica y SPEI) (ver también Gea-Izquierdo et al. 2015 European Journal of Forest Research). Lo que hemos obtenido aqui (analizando solo el rear edge) también van en esa línea.

### ¿Que factor es mas limitante para el crecimiento en el rear-edge de Q. pyrenaica?

Aquí pueder ser interesante comentar algo de el peso de las variables climáticas en el crecimiento para poblaciones situadas en el borde de distribución (pesa mas la temperatura o la disponibilidad de agua?).

Para *Q. pyrenaica* moisture availability was reported to be the most limiting factor driving radial growth in Iberian Q. pyrenaica populations (Gea-Izquierdo and Cañellas 2014) (Prec hidrológica y SPEI) (ver también Gea-Izquierdo et al. 2015 European Journal of Forest Research). Lo que hemos obtenido aqui (analizando solo el rear edge) también van en esa línea.

Podríamos complementarlo con lo que le pasa a otras especies en su borde de distribución: por ejemplo en Baza, Herrero et al. 2013, encontraron para Pinus nigra y sylvestris que la temperatura tenía mas peso que la disponibilidad de agua). O también ver algunos de los trabajos de Camarero et al 2013 para el P. nigra en su borde de distribución u otros similares (el de Sanchez-Salguero et al. 2013, 2015) …

* Vicente-Serrano:
  + We found that some forests from cold and humid areas respond to shorter drought time-scales than forests from dry areas, which usually respond to longer time-scales
  + Growth and responses to drought are modulated by site conditions such as soil type, specific functional traits and the intensity of competition among neighbouring trees (Orwig & Abrams, 1997; McDowell et al., 2008; Linares et al., 2010; Pasho et al., 2011).
  + Our findings provide evidence that the patterns of growth response to drought do not follow a general geographical structure and that these patterns are driven by the biogeographical, topographic and climatic conditions of each site, showing that forests located in different continents have the same pattern of response to drought time-scales.

#### Disturbance

Estos periodos se relacionan bien con eventos antrópicos: mineria (el primero de ellos) y actividades forestales el segundo (esta frase de la minería y demás la dejamos para la discusión??).

duda –> las proyecciones de crecimiento que hiciste (Gea-Izquierdo et al. 2013) sugerían un declive en el crecimiento. Nosotros estamos obteniendo algo diferente no? DUDA

## historia forestal de ambos sitios

Incluimos lo que conocemos de la historia forestal de los sitios?? Me explico, tenemos datos de manejo y uso antrópico de las dos zonas que proceden de varias fuentes. En resumen, mas o menos, tenemos:

* Minería: datos de minería, que afectan sobre todo a la población de SJ (los tenemos localizados temporalmente)
* Actuaciones forestales: Tenemos una bd con actuaciones forestales, y he contactado con varios de los responsables de proyectos de actuaciones forestales en ambas zonas, y tenemos con bastante detalle la información sobre actuaciones forestales (al menos espacial y temporalmente)
* Incendios, Carboneo, Ganadería, etc –> Tenemos información menos estructurada sobre estos ámbitos, procedentes de varias fuentes, que tienen una incertidumbre mayor espacial y temporalmente.

Todo esto lo comento, porque quizá podemos utilizar dicha información para la discussión, o a lo mejor mete mas ruido (¿que opináis?)

Por otro lado, sabemos que estos robledales han estado sometido a muchos ciclos de coppiccing, lo que podrían haber reducido su diversidad genética, y por tanto su resiliencia. Pero varios trabajos (Valbuena-Carabaña and Gil 2013, 2017) han encontrado que esta especie en su límite de distribución sur, muestra unos altos niveles de resiliencia (en este caso genética).

## MAs cosas diferentes

Otras especies: rear edge

Evaluar el crecimiento en el rear edge de F. sylvatica <https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s10342-016-0982-7?wt_mc=Internal.Event.1.SEM.ArticleAuthorOnlineFirst>

¿Que limita al crecimiento en el borde sur de su distribucion? –> Ver esto <http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/j.1365-2486.2006.01250.x/abstract>

Pinus sylvestris (Baza) (Matias et al 2017) Radial growth was maximal at medium altitude and treeline of the southernmost populations. Temperature was the main factor controlling growth variability along the gradients, although the timing and strength of climatic variables affecting growth shifted with latitude and altitude.

<http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/gcb.13627/full>

Idea –> algunos autores comentan que puede existir una alteración en el balance competitivo entre especies en mixed stands. Por ejemplo en Montseny, borde equatorial para F. sylvatica, se está viendo que el F. sylvatica está siendo reemplazado por Q. ilex. … En SN, el artículo de B. Benito (Climatic Change) habla del remplazo que existirá de Q. pyrenaica por Q. ilex, sin embargo, estamos viendo que los crecimientos son muy grandes y que Q. pyrenaica tiene mucha resiliencia –> entonces que pasa con las predicciones de dichos modelos ???

### Esto viene del apartado Radial growth trends and climate

* Aqui me comentó GGI que distribuyera esto bien entre results y discussion Los tres sitios mostraron una reducción en los valores de BAI durante las sequías de 1995 y 2005, y menos evidente para el año 2012 (Figure 5). La población del norte (SJ) mostró una gran liberación en torno a 1945 fruto quizá de cortas asociadas a la actividad minera de la zona. Asimismo, esta población mostró un marcado descenso en BAI durante el periodo 1986 - 1999.

### Otras

.. ver (Vicente-Serrano et al. 2013) impacto de las sequías en diferentes zonas (i.e montañas)

# Otras notas:

* To guide sustainable forest management, forest researchers are asked to provide concrete answers about forest resilience in response to expected climatic trends, and extreme climatic events (Lindner et al., 2014) <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S030147971400379X?via%3Dihub>
* Proyeccciones de crecimeinto de para *Q. pyrenaica* sugieren un declive en el crecimiento en las proximas decadas a lo largo de su rango de distribución en la P. Iberica, en diferentes escenarios climáticos (Gea-Izquierdo et al. 2013): Predictions suggest that QUPY productivity would decline in the next decades all along its distributional range in the Iberian Peninsula for all the climate scenarios studied. Este declive debería ser mas dramático en las baja altitudes de las zonas mas calientes del sur de su distribución

–> vulnerabilidad local (related to rear-edge) La tendencia de reducción drástica sugerida por el modelo para el dry-edge de la distribución de la especie podría expresar una aumentada vulnerabilidad de los árboles al incremento del estrés hídrico forzado por un clima mas cálido (Gea-Izquierdo et al. 2013).

Negative trends over recent years and the greater response to moisture availability found at warmer and drier low elevations in the south suggest vulnerability to warming at the local low elevation dry edge of the species’s range (e.g. QUPY9). Otros estudios en la zona Mediterranea reportaron un descenso similar en la productividad con un incremento en la vulterabilidad a la sequía ()

Muchos trabajos han analizado la respuesta de la vegetación a las sequías (eg. Allen et al. (2010); Vicente-Serrano et al. (2013); Martínez-Vilalta and Lloret (2016); Norman et al. (2016)), y algunos de ellos han mostrado el efecto de las sequías en especies Mediterráneas (ver por ejemplo Pasho et al. <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S016819231100253X#fig0020>; Camarero et al. (2011) combina uso y sequía; añadir alguno mas de GGI). Algunos Some of these species represent southernmost populations in the Mediterranean ambit, which explains their vulnerability to the warmer conditions (Andreu et al., 2007; Sánchez-Salguero et al., 2016).

Case studies that focus on multiple scales - including local scales - and also valuables (Dale et al. 2018 Frontiers) –> Se necesitan casos de estudio que se enfoquen en escalas multiples (incluyendo las locales) y que combinen varias metodologías (Jump et al. …)

1. rear edge

* además (Vulnerabilidad de los bosques a los eventos climáticos extremos …):
* Existen evidencias que sugieren que muchos bosques son vulnerables a eventos climáticos extremos … (Zhang) y esto puede ser especialmente relevante para especies situadas en el rear edge (completar) …

# 4) Punto fuerte metodológico (VALID)

La vegetación es un reflejo de las condiciones ambientales, y los efectos de la sequía en la vegetación se pueden ver tanto con información de satélite (hablar del browning), como con información mas de campo (hablar aquí de lo del BAI).

Nuestros resultados

La combinación de metodologías que hemos empleado para evaluar la resiliencia de la vegetación frente a los eventos de sequía

La vegetación es un reflejo de las condiciones ambientales, y los efectos de la sequía en la vegetación se pueden ver tanto con información de satélite, como con información mas de campo (hablar aquí de lo del BAI).

Los efectos de la sequía sobre la vegetación pueden observarse usando información procedente de diferentes aproximaciones metodológicas (see Norman et al. 2016 for a review).

[información procedente de remote sensing (RS)(Zhang et al. 2013, AghaKouchak et al. 2015), información dendrochronologica (),

o combinando estas y otras metodologías (see Norman et al. 2016 for a review)

respuesta de

The effects of drought on vegetation can be observed using information from several methodological approaches (see Norman et al. 2016 for a review). Several works revealed the utility of remote-sensing or dendrochronology to quantify the dorught impacts on vegetation at different spatial and temporal scales ().

Exiten trabajos que han utilizado remote-sensing o la dendrochronology para analizar los efectos de las sequías sobre la vegetación a diferentes escalas espaciales y temporales ( ). Asimismo, algunos otros trabajos han utilizado conjuntamente estas dos metodologias, y han visto que existe de forma general una relació a positive relationship between vegetation indices derived from remote sensing and annual tree growth (Vicente-Serrano et al. 2016, Bhuyan et al. 2017b),

In general, a positive relationship between NDVI in the growing season and RWI was seen for many forests in our study.

Positive relationship between inter-annual NDVI variability and annual tree growth (Vicente-Serrano et al. 2016)

Esta relación positiva también la encuentra

* Hablan de incorporar ademas de RS, el conocimiento ecológico (los principios ecológicos) para comprender las consecuencias de las disturbances analizadas con RS, y sobre todo para predecir futuro. (McDowell et al <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S1360138514002726>)

Nuestro trabajo muestra una combinación de métodos

Finalmente, destacamos la aproximación metodológica que hemos llevado a cabo.

La vegetación es un reflejo de las condiciones ambientales, y los efectos de la sequía se pueden ver tanto con información de satélite (hablar del browning), como con información mas de campo (hablar aquí de lo del BAI).

# Relaciones RWI-RS

* Algunos trabajos han analizado la relación ente RWI y remote sensing (Vicente-Serrano et al. 2013); [(Bhuyan et al. Remote Sensing 9(6):526)]; [Vicente Serrano et al. <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S003442571630373X>] …

## Trabajos RWI-RS

# Diferencias que hemos detectado usando RS y RWI (en resiliencias)

* Relacionar con datos de Gazol et al. 2018

# Jusfiticación de uso de ambos métodos

Se trata de expresar la idea de mezcla de aproximacioes: remote-sensing con dendro. Aunque existen algunos trabajos que utilizado RWI y remote sensing nuestra aproximación es importante, sobre todo para estudiar poblaciones que están en su límite de distribución (rear-edge) (Jump et al. 2010). De hecho, Jump et al. (2010) recomienda el uso de una aprox combinda de dendro, remote sensing y ground-based assessment para analizar los efectos del cambio global en las poblaciones situadas en el rear edge.

Sin embargo el estudio de las poblaciones situadas en su rear edge requiere de una aproximación combinada donde se estudie la respuesta de las poblaciones al cambio climático y su resiliencia utiliznado diferentes aproximaciones metodológicas, por ejemplo combinando dendro y remote sensing (Jump et al. 2010).

## De forma genérica y para el rear-edge

* Los estudios sobre poblaciones localizadas en el rear-edge de su distribución requieren de aproximaciones multidisciplinares…
* Nosotros aqui utilizamos la combinación de técnicas de remote sensing con dendro para analizar la vulnerabilidad de poblaciones de Q. pyrenaica situadas en su reaar edge frente a los eventos de sequía.

Para rear edge poblations es recomendable utilizar aproximaciones combinadas (Jump 2009) donde además de los datos de satélite, se utilicen datos groun based assessment (como por ejemplo la dendro), ya que éstos últimos, además de ser componentes esenciales del forest monitoring, son necesarios para estimar … (ver esto y completar)

## Sensibilidades diferentes de cada metodología

* Cada metodología muestra distinta sensibilidad
  + Gazol et al. (2018) analizaron la resiliencia a la sequia de 1986, 1994-1995, 1999 y 2005, usando RS y TR. Encontraron que los datos de TR son mas sensibles para la resiliencia del bosque a la sequía que los datos de RS
* La utilización de datos de tree-ring nos permite contextualizar los resultados obtenidos con remote sensing, ya que los datos de tree-ring reflejan anomalías en el crecimiento de los árboles (inducidas por clima o por disturbances) durante décadas o siglos (**???**)

## end VALID

* El uso de análisis combinados además nos permite distinguir la varibilidad en el crecimiento del bosque inducida por clima de aquella impulsada por otros procesos ecológicos a nivel de comunidad (**???**). Combined analyses may also allow climate-induced variability in forest growth to be disentangled from that driven by community-level ecological processes.

Aunque el NDVI o similar ha sido utilizado para monitorizar la respuesta de bosques frente a sequía, su escala espacial limita su uso para estudiar cambios en poblacioens situadas en su rear edge.

Whilst lower resolution data, whether from remote sensing or ground-based monitoring, can inform on widespread regional changes in forest condition, these data are often not adequate for monitoring changes occurring at equatorial range margins owing to their complex distribution and/or topographical variability. In such regions, targeted collection of high-resolution data is necessary in order to identify currently occurring changes and predict the magnitude and spatial distribution of future decline. (Jump et al. 2010)

comentario de GGI

Gracias Antonio. Desde luego que debes resaltar a lo largo del artículo la combinación de sensores y dendro como fortaleza de tu trabajo al analizar el tema de resiliencia desde dos escalas espacio-temporales complementarias. Y eso independientemente que lo diga o no Alistair Jump (que las citas vienen bien, y seguro que el trabajo es bueno), combinar ambas escalas/datos es beneficioso no sólo en poblaciones rear-edge, sino en general. Es decir, desde mi punto de vista, aunque decidas no centrarte tanto en el aspecto metodológico como sugieren Regino y Curro, eso no quiere decir que este punto no lo presentes de forma explícita en tu trabajo (en abstract debe aparecer, luego en intro, discusión y tal vez una frase en conclusiones) como uno de los elementos fuertes (un término medio, vamos). Creo que ya hemos discutido esto cuando hemos hablado. No es el primer trabajo que lo hace, como bien señalas, pero tampoco hay que pensar que no tiene valor, pues no hay tantos trabajos que combinen ambas aproximaciones (habrá cada vez más de hecho). Así que ánimo que queda poco y el trabajo puede quedar interesante si somos capaces de escribir e interpretar bien los resultados que nos has enviado.

### Estudios que utilizan RS y TR

* Wu et al. 2017.
  + En un estudio sobre el efecto de la sequía sobre el crecimiento en bosques, grass y shrub del hemisferio norte, encontraron que los bosques (Deep-rooted forest) exhibit a drought legacy response with reduced growth during up to 4 years despues de un evento extremo de sequía.
  + Además vieron que los bosques mostraron una stronger drought resilience in forest (i.e. smaller growth reduction after severe drought) (Gazol el al. 2017; Wu et al. 2017).
  + Esto se puede deber a que acceden a reservas de agua mas profundas (los pastos y los matorrales no pueden acceder a ese agua)

### 

Nosotros hemos obtenido una relación entre la severidad de la sequía y la resiliencia mostrada por los robledales en su rear edge. (ver gráfica )

Gazol et al. (2018) encontró La resiliencia está relacionada con la severidad de la sequía y con la composición del bosque

Rt-NDVI and Rt-TR were positively related with drought intensity

### Muchos estudios han evaluado la resiliencia de los bosques a un evento de sequía, pero pocos lo han hecho a

## 

Gazol et al. (2018) Resistencia a la sequía mayor en la zona norte de españa que en las zonas secas del sur

Qpyr \* Valores de Rt-TR aumentaron a lo largo del tiempo, sin embargo Rt-NDVI dismiuyó con el tiempo \* Valores Rc-NDVI tendencia positiva

## References

A., M. 1858. Memoria sobre los criaderos de biubmineral de sierra nevada en el término municipal de güejar-sierra, provincia de granada. Boletín del Ministerio de Fomento XXVIII:371–377.

AghaKouchak, A., A. Farahmand, F. S. Melton, J. Teixeira, M. C. Anderson, B. D. Wardlow, and C. R. Hain. 2015. Remote sensing of drought: Progress, challenges and opportunities. Reviews of Geophysics 53:452–480.

Alcaraz-Segura, D., J. Cabello, J. M. Paruelo, and M. Delibes. 2009. Use of descriptors of ecosystem functioning for monitoring a national park network: A remote sensing approach. Environmental Management 43:38–48.

Alcaraz-Segura, D., A. Reyes, and J. Cabello. 2016. Changes in vegetation productivity according to teledetection. Pages 142–145 *in* Z. R., P.-L. A.J., B. F.J., B.-A. J.M., and A. R., editors. Global change impacts in sierra nevada: Challenges for conservation. Consejería de Medio Ambiente y Ordenación del Territorio. Junta de Andalucía.

Allen, C. D., A. K. Macalady, H. Chenchouni, D. Bachelet, N. McDowell, M. Vennetier, T. Kitzberger, A. Rigling, D. D. Breshears, E. (Ted) Hogg, P. Gonzalez, R. Fensham, Z. Zhang, J. Castro, N. Demidova, J.-H. Lim, G. Allard, S. W. Running, A. Semerci, and N. Cobb. 2010. A global overview of drought and heat-induced tree mortality reveals emerging climate change risks for forests. Forest Ecology and Management 259:660–684.

Ameztegui, A., L. Coll, L. Brotons, and J. M. Ninot. 2016. Land-use legacies rather than climate change are driving the recent upward shift of the mountain tree line in the pyrenees. Global Ecology and Biogeography 25:263–273.

Archaux, F., and V. Wolters. 2006. Impact of summer drought on forest biodiversity: What do we know? Annals of Forest Science 63:645–652.

Assal, T. J., P. J. Anderson, and J. Sibold. 2016. Spatial and temporal trends of drought effects in a heterogeneous semi-arid forest ecosystem. Forest Ecology and Management 365:137–151.

Beguería, S., S. M. Vicente-Serrano, F. Reig, and B. Latorre. 2014. Standardized precipitation evapotranspiration index (spei) revisited: Parameter fitting, evapotranspiration models, tools, datasets and drought monitoring. International Journal of Climatology 34:3001–3023.

Benito, B., J. Lorite, and J. Peñas. 2011. Simulating potential effects of climatic warming on altitudinal patterns of key species in mediterranean-alpine ecosystems. Climatic Change 108:471–483.

Bhuyan, U., C. Zang, and A. Menzel. 2017a. Different responses of multispecies tree ring growth to various drought indices across europe. Dendrochronologia 44:1–8.

Bhuyan, U., C. Zang, S. M. Vicente-Serrano, and A. Menzel. 2017b. Exploring relationships among tree-ring growth, climate variability, and seasonal leaf activity on varying timescales and spatial resolutions. Remote Sensing 9:526.

Biondi, F., and F. Qeadan. 2008. A theory-driven approach to tree-ring standardization: Defining the biological trend from expected basal area increment. Tree-Ring Research 64:81–96.

Brewer, S., R. Cheddadi, J. de Beaulieu, and M. Reille. 2002. The spread of deciduous quercus throughout europe since the last glacial period. Forest Ecology and Management 156:27–48.

Bunn, A. G. 2008. A dendrochronology program library in r (dplR). Dendrochronologia 26:115–124.

Bunn, A. G. 2010. Statistical and visual crossdating in r using the dplR library. Dendrochronologia 28:251–258.

Camacho-Olmedo, M., P. García-Martínez, Y. Jiménez-Olivencia, J. Menor-Toribio, and A. Paniza-Cabrera. 2002. Dinámica evolutiva del paisaje vegetal de la alta alpujarra granadina en la segunda mitad del s. xx. Cuadernos Geográficos 32:25–42.

Camarero, J. J., C. Bigler, J. C. Linares, and E. Gil-Pelegrín. 2011. Synergistic effects of past historical logging and drought on the decline of pyrenean silver fir forests. Forest Ecology and Management 262:759–769.

Camarero, J., A. Gazol, G. Sangüesa-Barreda, A. Cantero, R. Sánchez-Salguero, A. Sánchez-Miranda, E. Granda, X. Serra-Maluquer, and R. Ibáñez. 2018. Forest growth responses to drought at short- and long-term scales in spain: Squeezing the stress memory from tree rings. Frontiers in Ecology and Evolution 6:9.

Caminero, L., M. Génova, J. J. Camarero, and R. Sánchez-Salguero. 2018. Growth responses to climate and drought at the southernmost european limit of mediterranean pinus pinaster forests. Dendrochronologia 48:20–29.

Camisón, Á., F. Silla, and J. J. Camarero. 2016. Influences of the atmospheric patterns on unstable climate-growth associations of western mediterranean forests. Dendrochronologia 40:130–142.

Caracterización de fuentes de información para la reconstrucción histórica de la vegetación. un caso de estudio en sierra nevada. 2014. *in* XII congreso nacional de medio ambiente (conama 2014).

Catastro. 1753. Respuestas generales del catastro del marqués de la ensenada. Ministerio de Cultura. PARES (Portal de Archivos Españoles), Ministerio de Cultura, Madrid.

Cavin, L., and A. S. Jump. 2017. Highest drought sensitivity and lowest resistance to growth suppression are found in the range core of the tree fagus sylvatica l. not the equatorial range edge. Global Change Biology 23:362–379.

Clark, J. S., L. Iverson, C. W. Woodall, C. D. Allen, D. M. Bell, D. C. Bragg, A. W. D’Amato, F. W. Davis, M. H. Hersh, I. Ibanez, S. T. Jackson, S. Matthews, N. Pederson, M. Peters, M. W. Schwartz, K. M. Waring, and N. E. Zimmermann. 2016. The impacts of increasing drought on forest dynamics, structure, and biodiversity in the united states. Global Change Biology 22:2329–2352.

Clavero, D. A. B., Miguel AND Villero. 2011. Climate change or land use dynamics: Do we know what climate change indicators indicate? PLOS ONE 6:1–8.

Cofiño, A., J. Bedia, M. Iturbide, M. Vega, S. Herrera, J. Fernández, M. Frías, R. Manzanas, and J. Gutiérrez. 2018. The ecoms user data gateway: Towards seasonal forecast data provision and research reproducibility in the era of climate services. Climate Services.

Cook, E., and L. Kairukstis. 1990. Methods of dendrochronology: Applications in the environmental sciences. Springer, Doredrecht.

Coulthard, B. L., R. Touchan, K. J. Anchukaitis, D. M. Meko, and F. Sivrikaya. 2017. Tree growth and vegetation activity at the ecosystem-scale in the eastern mediterranean. Environmental Research Letters 12:084008.

Cultura, M. de. 1943. Plano de repoblación arbórea de las cumbres de sierra nevada. proyecto de cabecera del río genil (sierra nevada, granada). datos relativos a la repoblación forestal y prolongación de ferrocarril (1944). Archivo General de la Administración, Fondo Ministerio de Obras Públicas.

Dai, A. 2011. Drought under global warming: A review. Wiley Interdisciplinary Reviews: Climate Change 2:45–65.

Didan, K. 2015. MOD13Q1 MODIS/Terra Vegetation Indices 16-Day L3 Global 250m SIN Grid V006. NASA EOSDIS Land Processes DAAC.

Dobbertin, M. 2005. Tree growth as indicator of tree vitality and of tree reaction to environmental stress: A review. European Journal of Forest Research 124:319–333.

Doblas-Miranda, E., R. Alonso, X. Arnan, V. Bermejo, L. Brotons, J. de las Heras, M. Estiarte, J. Hódar, P. Llorens, F. Lloret, F. López-Serrano, J. Martínez-Vilalta, D. Moya, J. Penuelas, J. Pino, A. Rodrigo, N. Roura-Pascual, F. Valladares, M. Vilà, R. Zamora, and J. Retana. 2017. A review of the combination among global change factors in forests, shrublands and pastures of the mediterranean region: Beyond drought effects. Global and Planetary Change 148:42–54.

Dorado-Liñán, I., I. Cañellas, M. Valbuena-Carabaña, L. Gil, and G. Gea-Izquierdo. 2017a. Coexistence in the mediterranean-temperate transitional border: Multi-century dynamics of a mixed old-growth forest under global change. Dendrochronologia 44:48–57.

Dorado-Liñán, I., E. Zorita, E. Martínez-Sancho, G. Gea-Izquierdo, A. D. Filippo, E. Gutiérrez, T. Levanic, G. Piovesan, G. Vacchiano, C. Zang, T. Zlatanov, and A. Menzel. 2017b. Large-scale atmospheric circulation enhances the mediterranean east-west tree growth contrast at rear-edge deciduous forests. Agricultural and Forest Meteorology 239:86–95.

Dorman, M., T. Svoray, A. Perevolotsky, and D. Sarris. 2013. Forest performance during two consecutive drought periods: Diverging long-term trends and short-term responses along a climatic gradient. Forest Ecology and Management 310:1–9.

Dunn, O. 1964. Multiple comparisons using rank sums. Technometrics 6:241–252.

Estudio de cambios de la biodiversidad a través de talleres de participación ciudadana. 2014. *in* XII congreso nacional de medio ambiente (conama 2014). Madrid, Spain.

F.J., B., A. R., and N. J. 2016. History of sierra nevada forest management: Implications for adaptation to global change. Pages 153–156 *in* Z. R., P.-L. A.J., B. F.J., B.-A. J.M., and A. R., editors. Global change impacts in sierra nevada: Challenges for conservation. Consejería de Medio Ambiente y Ordenación del Territorio. Junta de Andalucía.

Field, A., J. Miles, and Z. Field. 2012. Discovering statistics using r. Page 1426. SAGE.

Fischer, J., D. B. Lindenmayer, and A. D. Manning. 2006. Biodiversity, ecosystem function, and resilience: Ten guiding principles for commodity production landscapes. Frontiers in Ecology and the Environment 4:80–86.

Franco, A. 1990. Quercus l. Pages 15–36 *in* A. Castroviejo, M. Laínz, G. López-González, P. Montserrat, F. Muñoz-Garmendia, J. Paiva, and L. Villar, editors. Flora ibérica. Real Jardín Botánico, CSIC, Madrid.

Franklin, J., J. M. Serra-Diaz, A. D. Syphard, and H. M. Regan. 2016. Global change and terrestrial plant community dynamics. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences 113:3725–3734.

Fraver, S., and A. S. White. 2005. Identifying growth releases in dendrochronological studies of forest disturbance. Canadian Journal of Forest Research 35:1648–1656.

Fritts, H. C. 1976. Tree rings and climate. Academic Press, London.

Frías, M., M. Iturbide, R. Manzanas, J. Bedia, J. Fernández, S. Herrera, A. Cofiño, and J. Gutiérrez. 2018. An r package to visualize and communicate uncertainty in seasonal climate prediction. Environmental Modelling & Software 99:101–110.

Gao, Q., W. Zhu, M. W. Schwartz, H. Ganjurjav, Y. Wan, X. Qin, X. Ma, M. A. Williamson, and Y. Li. 2016. Climatic change controls productivity variation in global grasslands. Scientific Reports:26958.

García, I., and P. Jiménez. 2009. 9230 robledales de quercus pyrenaica y robledales de quercus robur y quercus pyrenaica del noroeste ibérico. Pages 1–66 *in* VV.AA., editor. Bases ecológicas preliminares para la conservación de los tipos de hábitat de interés comunitario en españa. Ministerio de Medio Ambiente, y Medio Rural y Marino, Madrid.

García-González, I., and M. Souto-Herrero. 2017. Earlywood vessel area of quercus pyrenaica willd. is a powerful indicator of soil water excess at growth resumption. European Journal of Forest Research 136:329–344.

García-Herrera, R., E. Hernández, D. Barriopedro, D. Paredes, R. M. Trigo, I. F. Trigo, and M. A. Mendes. 2007. The Outstanding 2004/05 Drought in the Iberian Peninsula: Associated Atmospheric Circulation. Journal of Hydrometeorology 8:483–498.

Gavilan, R. G., D. S. Mata, B. Vilches, and G. Entrocassi. 2007. Modeling current distribution of spanish quercus pyrenaica forests using climatic parameters. Phytocoenologia 37:561–581.

Gazol, A., J. J. Camarero, W. R. L. Anderegg, and S. M. Vicente-Serrano. 2017. Impacts of droughts on the growth resilience of northern hemisphere forests. Global Ecology and Biogeography 26:166–176.

Gazol, A., J. J. Camarero, S. M. Vicente-Serrano, R. Sánchez-Salguero, E. Gutiérrez, M. de Luis, G. Sangüesa-Barreda, K. Novak, V. Rozas, P. A. Tíscar, J. C. Linares, N. Martín-Hernández, E. Martínez del Castillo, M. Ribas, I. García-González, F. Silla, A. Camisón, M. Génova, J. M. Olano, L. A. Longares, A. Hevia, M. Tomás-Burguera, and J. D. Galván. 2018. Forest resilience to drought varies across biomes. Global Change Biology:1–16.

Gea-Izquierdo, G., and I. Cañellas. 2014. Local climate forces instability in long-term productivity of a mediterranean oak along climatic gradients. Ecosystems 17:228–241.

Gea-Izquierdo, G., L. Fernández-de-Uña, and I. Cañellas. 2013. Growth projections reveal local vulnerability of mediterranean oaks with rising temperatures. Forest Ecology and Management 305:282–293.

Gea-Izquierdo, G., B. Viguera, M. Cabrera, and I. Cañellas. 2014. Drought induced decline could portend widespread pine mortality at the xeric ecotone in managed mediterranean pine-oak woodlands. Forest Ecology and Management 320:70–82.

González-González, B. D., V. Rozas, and I. García-González. 2014. Earlywood vessels of the sub-mediterranean oak quercus pyrenaica have greater plasticity and sensitivity than those of the temperate q. petraea at the atlantic–Mediterranean boundary. Trees 28:237–252.

Gouveia, C. M., and R. M. Trigo. 2014. The 2005 and 2012 major drought events in Iberia: monitoring vegetation dynamics and crop yields using satellite data. Page 15179 *in* EGU general assembly conference abstracts.

Gouveia, C. M., P. Ramos, A. Russo, and R. M. Trigo. 2015. Drought trends in the Iberian Peninsula over the last 112 years. Page 12680 *in* EGU general assembly conference abstracts.

Gouveia, C., R. Trigo, S. Beguería, and S. Vicente-Serrano. 2017. Drought impacts on vegetation activity in the mediterranean region: An assessment using remote sensing data and multi-scale drought indicators. Global and Planetary Change 151:15–27.

Granda, E., A. Q. Alla, N. A. Laskurain, J. Loidi, A. Sánchez-Lorenzo, and J. J. Camarero. 2017. Coexisting oak species, including rear-edge populations, buffer climate stress through xylem adjustments. Tree Physiology.

Guerreiro, S. B., C. Kilsby, and H. J. Fowler. 2017. Assessing the threat of future megadrought in iberia. International Journal of Climatology 37:5024–5034.

Hampe, A., and R. J. Petit. 2005. Conserving biodiversity under climate change: The rear edge matters. Ecology Letters 8:461–467.

Haylock, M. R., N. Hofstra, A. M. G. Klein Tank, E. J. Klok, P. D. Jones, and M. New. 2008. A european daily high-resolution gridded data set of surface temperature and precipitation for 1950–2006. Journal of Geophysical Research 113:D20119.

Herrero, R., Asier AND Zamora. 2014. Plant responses to extreme climatic events: A field test of resilience capacity at the southern range edge. PLOS ONE 9:e87842.

Hodgson, D., J. L. McDonald, and D. J. Hosken. 2015. What do you mean, “resilient”? Trends in Ecology & Evolution 30:503–506.

Hoerling, M., J. Eischeid, J. Perlwitz, X. Quan, T. Zhang, and P. Pegion. 2012. On the increased frequency of mediterranean drought. Journal of Climate 25:2146–2161.

Holling, C. S. 1973. Resilience and stability of ecological systems. Annual Review of Ecology and Systematics 4:1–23.

Holmes, R. L. 1983. Computer-assisted quality control in tree-ring dating and measurement. Tree-Ring Bulletin 43:69–78.

Huete, A., K. Didan, T. Miura, E. Rodriguez, X. Gao, and L. Ferreira. 2002. Overview of the radiometric and biophysical performance of the {modis} vegetation indices. Remote Sensing of Environment 83:195–213.

IPCC. 2013. Climate change 2013: The physical science basis. contribution of working group i to the fifth assessment report of the intergovernmental panel on climate change. Page 1535. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, United Kingdom; New York, NY, USA.

Jump, A. S., L. Cavin, and P. D. Hunter. 2010. Monitoring and managing responses to climate change at the retreating range edge of forest trees. Journal of Environmental Monitoring 12:1791–1798.

Leal, S., F. Campelo, A. L. Luz, M. F. Carneiro, and J. A. Santos. 2015. Potential of oak tree-ring chronologies from southern portugal for climate reconstructions. Dendrochronologia 35:4–13.

Linares, J. C., K. Senhadji, A. Herrero, and J. A. Hódar. 2014. Growth patterns at the southern range edge of scots pine: Disentangling the effects of drought and defoliation by the pine processionary caterpillar. Forest Ecology and Management 315:129–137.

Lionello, P., editor. 2012. Page 502. Elsevier, Oxford.

Lloret, F., E. G. Keeling, and A. Sala. 2011. Components of tree resilience: Effects of successive low-growth episodes in old ponderosa pine forests. Oikos 120:1909–1920.

Lloret, F., A. Lobo, H. Estevan, P. Maisongrande, J. Vayreda, and J. Terradas. 2007. Woody plant richness and ndvi response to drought events in catalonian (northeastern spain) forests. Ecology 88:2270–2279.

M., T. 1990. Las minas de la estrella. Pages 226–236 *in* T. M., editor. La aventura de sierra-nevada 1717-1915. Editorial Universidad de Granada.

Mair, P., F. Schoenbrodt, and R. Wilcox. 2017. WRS2: Wilcox robust estimation and testing.

Mangiafico, S. 2017. Rcompanion: Functions to support extension education program evaluation.

Martínez-Parras, J. M., and J. Molero-Mesa. 1982. Ecología y fitosociología de quercus pyrenaica willd. en la provincia bética. los melojares béticos y sus etapas de sustitución. Lazaroa 4:91–104.

Martínez-Vilalta, J. 2018. The rear window: Structural and functional plasticity in tree responses to climate change inferred from growth rings. Tree Physiology.

Martínez-Vilalta, J., and F. Lloret. 2016. Drought-induced vegetation shifts in terrestrial ecosystems: The key role of regeneration dynamics. Global and Planetary Change 144:94–108.

McDowell, N. G., N. C. Coops, P. S. Beck, J. Q. Chambers, C. Gangodagamage, J. A. Hicke, C.-y. Huang, R. Kennedy, D. J. Krofcheck, M. Litvak, A. J. Meddens, J. Muss, R. Negrón-Juarez, C. Peng, A. M. Schwantes, J. J. Swenson, L. J. Vernon, A. P. Williams, C. Xu, M. Zhao, S. W. Running, and C. D. Allen. 2015. Global satellite monitoring of climate-induced vegetation disturbances. Trends in Plant Science 20:114–123.

Melendo, M., and F. Valle. 2000. Estudio comparativo de los melojares nevadenses. Pages 463–479 *in* J. Chacón and J. Rosúa, editors. I conferencia internacional sierra nevada. Universidad de Granada, Granada.

Michel Deshayes, Dominique Guyon, Hervé Jeanjean, Nicolas Stach, Anne Jolly, and Olivier Hagolle. 2006. The contribution of remote sensing to the assessment of drought effects in forest ecosystems. Ann. For. Sci. 63:579–595.

Mishra, A. K., and V. P. Singh. 2010. A review of drought concepts. Journal of Hydrology 391:202–216.

Moreno-LLorca, R., P.-L. A.J., B. F.J., and Z. R. 2016. Historical analysis of socio-ecological changes in the municipality of cáñar (alpujarra, sierra nevada) over the last 5 centuries. Pages 59–62 *in* Z. R., P.-L. A.J., B. F.J., B.-A. J.M., and A. R., editors. Global change impacts in sierra nevada: Challenges for conservation. Consejería de Medio Ambiente y Ordenación del Territorio. Junta de Andalucía.

Navarro-González, I., A. J. Pérez-Luque, F. J. Bonet, and R. Zamora. 2013. The weight of the past: Land-use legacies and recolonization of pine plantations by oak trees. Ecological Applications 23:1267–1276.

Norman, S. P., F. H. Koch, and W. W. Hargrove. 2016. Review of broad-scale drought monitoring of forests: Toward an integrated data mining approach. Forest Ecology and Management 380:346–358.

Nowacki, G. J., and M. D. Abrams. 1997. Radial-growth averaging criteria for reconstructing disturbance histories from presettlement-origing oaks. Ecological Monographs 67:225–249.

Olalde, M., A. Herrán, S. Espinel, and P. G. Goicoechea. 2002. White oaks phylogeography in the iberian peninsula. Forest Ecology and Management 156:89–102.

Oliver, T. H., and M. D. Morecroft. 2014. Interactions between climate change and land use change on biodiversity: Attribution problems, risks, and opportunities. Wiley Interdisciplinary Reviews: Climate Change 5:317–335.

Pasho, E., J. J. Camarero, M. de Luis, and S. M. Vicente-Serrano. 2011. Impacts of drought at different time scales on forest growth across a wide climatic gradient in north-eastern spain. Agricultural and Forest Meteorology 151:1800–1811.

Páscoa, P., C. Gouveia, A. Russo, and R. Trigo. 2017. Drought trends in the iberian peninsula over the last 112 years. Advances in Meteorology:ID4653126.

Peñuelas, J., J. Sardans, I. Filella, M. Estiarte, J. Llusià, R. Ogaya, J. Carnicer, M. Bartrons, A. Rivas-Ubach, O. Grau, G. Peguero, O. Margalef, S. Pla-Rabés, C. Stefanescu, D. Asensio, C. Preece, L. Liu, A. Verger, A. Barbeta, A. Achotegui-Castells, A. Gargallo-Garriga, D. Sperlich, G. Farré-Armengol, M. Fernández-Martínez, D. Liu, C. Zhang, I. Urbina, M. Camino-Serrano, M. Vives-Ingla, D. B. Stocker, M. Balzarolo, R. Guerrieri, M. Peaucelle, S. Marañón-Jiménez, K. Bórnez-Mejías, Z. Mu, A. Descals, A. Castellanos, and J. Terradas. 2017. Forests 8.

Pérez-Luque, A. J., R. Zamora, F. J. Bonet, and R. Pérez-Pérez. 2015a. Dataset of migrame project (global change, altitudinal range shift and colonization of degraded habitats in mediterranean mountains). PhytoKeys 56:61–81.

Pérez-Luque, A., R. Pérez-Pérez, F. Bonet-García, and P. Magaña. 2015b. An ontological system based on modis images to assess ecosystem functioning of natura 2000 habitats: A case study for quercus pyrenaica forests. International Journal of Applied Earth Observation and Geoinformation 37:142–151.

Piovesa, G., F. Biondi, A. D. Filippo, A. Alessandrini, and M. Maugeri. 2008. Drought-driven growth reduction in old beech (fagus sylvatica l.) forests of the central apennines, italy. Global Change Biology 14:1265–1281.

Pohlert, T. 2014. The pairwise multiple comparison of mean ranks package (pmcmr).

Pohlert, T. 2017. Trend: Non-parametric trend tests and change-point detection.

R Core Team. 2017. R: A language and environment for statistical computing. R Foundation for Statistical Computing, Vienna, Austria.

Reyes-Díez, A., D. Alcaraz-Segura, and J. Cabello-Piñar. 2015. Implicaciones del filtrado de calidad del índice de vegetación evi para el seguimiento funcional de ecosistemas. Revista de Teledeteccion 2015:11–29.

Rivas-Martínez, S., T. Díaz, F. Fernández-González, J. Izco, J. Loidi, and M. Lousã. 2002. Vascular plant communities of spain and portugal. addenda to the syntaxonomical checklist of 2001. part ii. Itinera Geobotanica 15:5–922.

Río, S. del, L. Herrero, and Á. Penas. 2007. Bioclimatic analysis of the quercus pyrenaica forests in spain. Phytocoenologia 37:541–560.

Rodríguez-Sánchez, F., A. Hampe, P. Jordano, and J. Arroyo. 2010. Past tree range dynamics in the iberian peninsula inferred through phylogeography and palaeodistribution modelling: A review. Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology 162:507–521.

Roig, F. A., D. Barriopedro, R. García-Herrera, D. Patón-Dominguez, and S. Monge. (n.d.). North atlantic oscillation signatures in western iberian tree-rings. Geografiska Annaler: Series A, Physical Geography 91:141–157.

Rubino, D., and B. McCarthy. 2004. Comparative analysis of dendroecological methods used to assess disturbance events. Dendrochronologia 21:97–115.

Ruimy, A., B. Saugier, and G. Dedieu. (n.d.). Methodology for the estimation of terrestrial net primary production from remotely sensed data. Journal of Geophysical Research: Atmospheres 99:5263–5283.

Samanta, A., S. Ganguly, H. Hashimoto, S. Devadiga, E. Vermote, Y. Knyazikhin, R. R. Nemani, and R. B. Myneni. 2010. Amazon forests did not green-up during the 2005 drought. Geophysical Research Letters 37:L05401.

Samanta, A., S. Ganguly, E. Vermote, R. R. Nemani, and R. B. Myneni. 2012. Interpretation of variations in modis-measured greenness levels of amazon forests during 2000 to 2009. Environmental Research Letters 7:024018.

Sangüesa-Barreda, G., J. J. Camarero, A. García-Martín, R. Hernández, and J. de la Riva. 2014. Remote-sensing and tree-ring based characterization of forest defoliation and growth loss due to the mediterranean pine processionary moth. Forest Ecology and Management 320:171–181.

Sánchez-Salguero, R., J. J. Camarero, M. Dobbertin, Á. Fernández-Cancio, A. Vilà-Cabrera, R. D. Manzanedo, M. A. Zavala, and R. M. Navarro-Cerrillo. 2013. Contrasting vulnerability and resilience to drought-induced decline of densely planted vs. natural rear-edge pinus nigra forests. Forest Ecology and Management 310:956–967.

Sánchez-Salguero, R., J. J. Camarero, E. Gutiérrez, F. González Rouco, A. Gazol, G. Sangüesa-Barreda, L. Andreu-Hayles, J. C. Linares, and K. Seftigen. 2017. Assessing forest vulnerability to climate warming using a process-based model of tree growth: Bad prospects for rear-edges. Global Change Biology 23:2705–2719.

Sánchez-Salguero, R., R. M. Navarro-Cerrillo, T. W. Swetnam, and M. A. Zavala. 2012. Is drought the main decline factor at the rear edge of europe? The case of southern iberian pine plantations. Forest Ecology and Management 271:158–169.

Sokal, R., and F. Rohlf. 1995. Biometry: The principles and practice of statistics in biological research. Page 887. Freeman, New York.

Spinoni, J., G. Naumann, and J. V. Vogt. 2017a. Pan-european seasonal trends and recent changes of drought frequency and severity. Global and Planetary Change 148:113–130.

Spinoni, J., G. Naumann, J. V. Vogt, and P. Barbosa. 2015. The biggest drought events in europe from 1950 to 2012. Journal of Hydrology: Regional Studies 3:509–524.

Spinoni, J., J. V. Vogt, G. Naumann, P. Barbosa, and A. Dosio. 2017b. Will drought events become more frequent and severe in europe? International Journal of Climatology.

Stagge, J. H., D. G. Kingston, L. M. Tallaksen, and D. M. Hannah. 2017. Observed drought indices show increasing divergence across Europe. Scientific Reports 7:14045.

Taxonomic and functional diversity of a quercus pyrenaica willd. rhizospheric microbiome in the mediterranean mountains. 2017. Forests 8:390.

Trenberth, K. E., A. Dai, G. van der Schrier, P. D. Jones, J. Barichivich, K. R. Briffa, and J. Sheffield. 2014. Global warming and changes in drought. Nature Climate Change 4:17–22.

Trigo, R. M., J. A. Añel, D. Barriopedro, R. García-Herrera, L. Gimeno, R. Castillo, M. R. Allen, and A. Massey. 2013. The record Winter drought of 2011-12 in the Iberian Peninsula [in "Explaining Extreme Events of 2012 from a Climate Perspective. [Peterson, T. C., M. P. Hoerling, P.A. Stott and S. Herring, Eds.] 94:S41–S45.

Ummenhofer, C. C., and G. A. Meehl. 2017. Extreme weather and climate events with ecological relevance: A review. Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London B: Biological Sciences 372.

Valbuena-Carabaña, M., and L. Gil. 2013. Genetic resilience in a historically profited root sprouting oak (quercus pyrenaica willd.) at its southern boundary. Tree Genetics & Genomes 9:1129–1142.

Valbuena-Carabaña, M., and L. Gil. 2017. Centenary coppicing maintains high levels of genetic diversity in a root resprouting oak (quercus pyrenaica willd.). Tree Genetics & Genomes 13:28.

Valbuena-Carabaña, M., U. L. de Heredia, P. Fuentes-Utrilla, I. González-Doncel, and L. Gil. 2010. Historical and recent changes in the spanish forests: A socio-economic process. Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology 162:492–506.

Vicca, S., M. Balzarolo, I. Filella, A. Granier, M. Herbst, A. Knohl, B. Longdoz, M. Mund, Z. Nagy, K. Pintér, S. Rambal, J. Verbesselt, A. Verger, A. Zeileis, C. Zhang, and J. Peñuelas. 2016. Remotely-sensed detection of effects of extreme droughts on gross primary production. Scientific Reports 6:28269.

Vicente-Serrano, S. M. 2007. Evaluating the impact of drought using remote sensing in a mediterranean, semi-arid region. Natural Hazards 40:173–208.

Vicente-Serrano, S. M., S. Beguería, and J. I. López-Moreno. 2010. A multiscalar drought index sensitive to global warming: The standardized precipitation evapotranspiration index. Journal of Climate 23:1696–1718.

Vicente-Serrano, S. M., J. J. Camarero, J. M. Olano, N. Martín-Hernández, M. Peña-Gallardo, M. Tomás-Burguera, A. Gazol, C. Azorin-Molina, U. Bhuyan, and A. E. Kenawy. 2016. Diverse relationships between forest growth and the normalized difference vegetation index at a global scale. Remote Sensing of Environment 187:14–29.

Vicente-Serrano, S. M., C. Gouveia, J. J. Camarero, S. Beguería, R. Trigo, J. I. López-Moreno, C. Azorín-Molina, E. Pasho, J. Lorenzo-Lacruz, J. Revuelto, E. Morán-Tejeda, and A. Sanchez-Lorenzo. 2013. Response of vegetation to drought time-scales across global land biomes. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A 110:52–57.

Vicente-Serrano, S. M., J. I. López-Moreno, S. Beguería, J. Lorenzo-Lacruz, A. Sanchez-Lorenzo, J. M. García-Ruiz, C. Azorín-Molina, E. Morán-Tejeda, J. Revuelto, R. Trigo, F. Coelho, and F. Espejo. 2014. Evidence of increasing drought severity caused by temperature rise in southern Europe. Environmental Research Letters 9:044001.

Vicente-Serrano, S. M., M. Tomas-Burguera, S. Beguería, F. Reig, B. Latorre, M. Peña-Gallardo, M. Y. Luna, A. Morata, and J. C. González-Hidalgo. 2017. A high resolution dataset of drought indices for spain. Data 2.

Vilches de la Serna, B. 2014. Comprehensive study of “quercus pyrenaica” willd. forests at iberian peninsula: Indicator species, bioclimatic, and syntaxonomical characteristics. PhD thesis, Complutense University of Madrid, Madrid.

Vivero, J., J. Prados, and J. Hernández-Bermejo. 2000. Quercus pyrenaica willd. Pages 303–306 *in* G. Blanca, B. Cabezudo, J. Hernández-Bermejo, C. Herrera, J. Muñoz, and B. Valdés, editors. Libro rojo de la flora silvestre amenzada de andalucía. ii. especies vulnerables. Consejería de Medio Ambiente, Junta de Andalucía, Sevilla.

Wigley, T. M. L., K. R. Briffa, and P. D. Jones. 1984. On the average value of correlated time series, with applications in dendroclimatology and hydrometeorology. Journal of Climate and Applied Meteorology 23:201–213.

Wilcox, R. 2012. Introduction to robust estimation and hypothesis testing (third edition). Page 608. Third Edition. Academic Press.

Y., J.-O., P. L., and C. A. 2015. Medio siglo en la evolución de los paisajes naturales y agrarios de sierra nevada (españa). Boletín de la Asociación de Geógrafos Españoles 68:205–232.

Zang, C., and F. Biondi. 2015. Treeclim: An r package for the numerical calibration of proxy-climate relationships. Ecography 38:431–436.

Zhang, Y., C. Peng, W. Li, X. Fang, T. Zhang, Q. Zhu, H. Chen, and P. Zhao. 2013. Monitoring and estimating drought-induced impacts on forest structure, growth, function, and ecosystem services using remote-sensing data: Recent progress and future challenges. Environmental Reviews 21:103–115.

Zribi, M., G. Dridi, R. Amri, and Z. Chabaane. 2016. Analysis of the effects of drought on vegetation cover in a mediterranean region through the use of spot-vgt and terra-modis long time series. Remote Sensing 8:992.