What's in a Proof?

Alex Vondrak

Cal Poly Pomona

November 14, 2012



An Anecdote



The Reason

Theorem a: 2 + 2 = 4.

The Reason

```
Theorem a: 2 + 2 = 4.
```

```
Proof.
trivial.
Qed.
```

Coa



- An interactive theorem prover started in 1984
- Provides a formal language and environment for mathematical definitions, algorithms, theorems, and machine-checked proofs
- Language based on a derivative of the calculus of constructions (CoC)

Example

```
Theorem two_and_two_make_four: 2 + 2 = 4.
Proof.
  trivial.
```

Qed.

Coq



- An interactive theorem prover started in 1984
- Provides a formal language and environment for mathematical definitions, algorithms, theorems, and machine-checked proofs
- Language based on a derivative of the calculus of constructions (CoC)

Example

```
Theorem two_and_two_make_four: 2 + 2 = 4.
Proof.
   auto 1.
```

Proof Automation

Rough Algorithm

```
auto n =
  if no more subgoals then
     success
  if n == 0 then
     failure
  foreach term in | hypotheses \cup hints |:
     try
        apply term.
       foreach subgoal generated:
          auto (n - 1) on that subgoal
```

- Tries to unify the goal with the conclusion of the type of "term"
- Returns subgoals—premises of the type of "term"

Example (At the Coq Top-Level)

Coq < Example ex: (1=2
$$\rightarrow$$
 2=1) \rightarrow (2=1 \rightarrow 1=2) \rightarrow 1=2. 1 subgoal

$$(1 = 2 \rightarrow 2 = 1) \rightarrow (2 = 1 \rightarrow 1 = 2) \rightarrow 1 = 2$$

ex <

- Tries to unify the goal with the conclusion of the type of "term"
- Returns subgoals—premises of the type of "term"

Example (At the Coq Top-Level)

$$(1 = 2 \rightarrow 2 = 1) \rightarrow (2 = 1 \rightarrow 1 = 2) \rightarrow 1 = 2$$

ex < intros.

1 subgoal

$$H : 1 = 2 \rightarrow 2 = 1$$

 $H0 : 2 = 1 \rightarrow 1 = 2$

$$1 = 2$$

- Tries to unify the goal with the conclusion of the type of "term"
- Returns subgoals—premises of the type of "term"

Example (At the Coq Top-Level)

- Tries to unify the goal with the conclusion of the type of "term"
- Returns subgoals—premises of the type of "term"

Example (At the Coq Top-Level)

Hints and Hypotheses

```
Coq < Theorem two_and_two_make_four: 2 + 2 = 4.
1 subgoal
   2 + 2 = 4
two and two make four < Print Hint.
Applicable Hints:
[...]
In the database core:
  apply mult_n_0(0) apply mult_n_Sm(0) apply plus_n_0(0)
  apply eq_refl(0) apply plus_n_Sm(0)
  apply eq_add_S; trivial(1) apply eq_sym; trivial(1)
 apply f_equal (A:=nat)(1) apply f_equal2 mult(2)
  apply f_equal2 (A1:=nat) (A2:=nat)(2)
[...]
```

Hints and Hypotheses

Which Hint?

```
two and two make four < Proof.
two and two make four < info trivial.
 == apply eq_refl.
Proof completed.
two_and_two_make_four < Qed.
info trivial.
two and two make four is defined
Coq <
```