Computational Consumer Finance Initiative

Chris Carroll

May 6, 2015

Motivation

- Policy vs Research

Motivation

- Policy vs Research
  - "The world is not optimal"

Motivation

- Policy vs Research
    - "The world is not optimal"
        - Publishable (still) as research (!)
            - despite the 'Voltaire Critique' (1759)

cfpb Consumer Financial Protection Bureau

Motivation

- Policy vs Research
  - "The world is not optimal"
    - Publishable (still) as research (!)
      - despite the 'Voltaire Critique' (1759)
    - Useful to *motivate* why you *might* make policy

Motivation

- Policy vs Research
  - "The world is not optimal"
    - Publishable (still) as research (!)
      - despite the 'Voltaire Critique' (1759)
    - Useful to *motivate* why you *might* make policy
  - "What will world look like if we change something?"

Motivation

- Policy vs Research
    - "The world is not optimal"
        - Publishable (still) as research (!)
            - despite the 'Voltaire Critique' (1759)
        - Useful to *motivate* why you *might* make policy
    - "What will world look like if we change something?"
        - ... is what policymakers need to know

Motivation

- Policy vs Research
  - "The world is not optimal"
    - Publishable (still) as research (!)
      - despite the 'Voltaire Critique' (1759)
    - Useful to *motivate* why you *might* make policy
  - "What will world look like if we change something?"
    - ... is what policymakers need to know
    - Transparent, rigorous, replicable answer:

Motivation

- **Policy vs Research**
  - "The world is not optimal"
    - Publishable (still) as research (!)
      - despite the 'Voltaire Critique' (1759)
    - Useful to *motivate* why you *might* make policy
  - "What will world look like if we change something?"
    - ... is what policymakers need to know
    - Transparent, rigorous, replicable answer:
      - Called a "structural model"

Motivation

- Policy vs Research
    - "The world is not optimal"
        - Publishable (still) as research (!)
            - despite the 'Voltaire Critique' (1759)
        - Useful to *motivate* why you *might* make policy
    - "What will world look like if we change something?"
        - ... is what policymakers need to know
        - Transparent, rigorous, replicable answer:
            - Called a "structural model"

- Neoclassical vs Behavioral Economics:

Motivation

- Policy vs Research
    - "The world is not optimal"
        - Publishable (still) as research (!)
            - despite the 'Voltaire Critique' (1759)
        - Useful to *motivate* why you *might* make policy
    - "What will world look like if we change something?"
        - ... is what policymakers need to know
        - Transparent, rigorous, replicable answer:
            - Called a "structural model"

- Neoclassical vs Behavioral Economics:
    - Neoclassical:

Motivation

- Policy vs Research
    - "The world is not optimal"
        - Publishable (still) as research (!)
            - despite the 'Voltaire Critique' (1759)
        - Useful to *motivate* why you *might* make policy
    - "What will world look like if we change something?"
        - ... is what policymakers need to know
        - Transparent, rigorous, replicable answer:
            - Called a "structural model"

- Neoclassical vs Behavioral Economics:
    - Neoclassical:
        - Rigorous description of optimal

Motivation

- **Policy vs Research**
  - "The world is not optimal"
    - Publishable (still) as research (!)
      - despite the 'Voltaire Critique' (1759)
    - Useful to *motivate* why you *might* make policy
  - "What will world look like if we change something?"
    - ... is what policymakers need to know
    - Transparent, rigorous, replicable answer:
      - Called a "structural model"

- **Neoclassical vs Behavioral Economics:**
  - Neoclassical:
    - Rigorous description of optimal
    - Pretend actual=optimal

Motivation

- Policy vs Research
  - "The world is not optimal"
    - Publishable (still) as research (!)
      - despite the 'Voltaire Critique' (1759)
    - Useful to *motivate* why you *might* make policy
  - "What will world look like if we change something?"
    - ... is what policymakers need to know
    - Transparent, rigorous, replicable answer:
      - Called a "structural model"

- Neoclassical vs Behavioral Economics:
  - Neoclassical:
    - Rigorous description of optimal
    - Pretend actual=optimal
  - Two kinds of behavioral:

Motivation

- Policy vs Research
  - "The world is not optimal"
    - Publishable (still) as research (!)
      - despite the 'Voltaire Critique' (1759)
    - Useful to *motivate* why you *might* make policy
  - "What will world look like if we change something?"
    - ... is what policymakers need to know
    - Transparent, rigorous, replicable answer:
      - Called a "structural model"

- Neoclassical vs Behavioral Economics:
  - Neoclassical:
    - Rigorous description of optimal
    - Pretend actual=optimal
  - Two kinds of behavioral:
    - Less useful: "Optimal choice is rejected!!!"

Motivation

- Policy vs Research
  - "The world is not optimal"
    - Publishable (still) as research (!)
      - despite the 'Voltaire Critique' (1759)
    - Useful to *motivate* why you *might* make policy
  - "What will world look like if we change something?"
    - ... is what policymakers need to know
    - Transparent, rigorous, replicable answer:
      - Called a "structural model"

- Neoclassical vs Behavioral Economics:
  - Neoclassical:
    - Rigorous description of optimal
    - Pretend actual=optimal
  - Two kinds of behavioral:
    - Less useful: "Optimal choice is rejected!!!"
    - More useful: "*Systematic* deviations from optimal"

Optimality

- Neoclassical, "useful" behavioral ...

Optimality

- Neoclassical, "useful" behavioral ...
  - ... require calculation of the optimal choice

cfpb Consumer Financial Protection Bureau

Optimality

- Neoclassical, "useful" behavioral ...
    - ... require calculation of the optimal choice
    - ... both imply that moving toward optimal is good!

cfpb Consumer Financial Protection Bureau

Sensitive and Pre-Decisional. Not For Public Disclosure

Optimality

- Neoclassical, "useful" behavioral ...
  - □ ... require calculation of the optimal choice
  - □ ... both imply that moving toward optimal is good!
- Unfortunately, solving optimal choice models is v. hard

Optimality

- Neoclassical, "useful" behavioral ...
  - ... require calculation of the optimal choice
  - ... both imply that moving toward optimal is good!
- Unfortunately, solving optimal choice models is v. hard
  - Even for PhD economists who are experts in CF

Optimality

- Neoclassical, "useful" behavioral ...
    - ... require calculation of the optimal choice
    - ... both imply that moving toward optimal is good!

- Unfortunately, solving optimal choice models is v. hard
    - Even for PhD economists who are experts in CF
        - Notorious examples (not in slides)

Optimality

- Neoclassical, "useful" behavioral ...
  - □ ... require calculation of the optimal choice
  - □ ... both imply that moving toward optimal is good!

- Unfortunately, solving optimal choice models is v. hard
  - □ Even for PhD economists who are experts in CF
    - – Notorious examples (not in slides)

- Current situation: like econometrics in 1950s, 60s

Optimality

- Neoclassical, "useful" behavioral ...
    - ... require calculation of the optimal choice
    - ... both imply that moving toward optimal is good!

- Unfortunately, solving optimal choice models is v. hard
    - Even for PhD economists who are experts in CF
        - Notorious examples (not in slides)

- Current situation: like econometrics in 1950s, 60s
    - Lots of abstract "in principle" knowledge, theorems

Optimality

- Neoclassical, "useful" behavioral ...
  - □ ... require calculation of the optimal choice
  - □ ... both imply that moving toward optimal is good!

- Unfortunately, solving optimal choice models is v. hard
  - □ Even for PhD economists who are experts in CF
    - − Notorious examples (not in slides)

- Current situation: like econometrics in 1950s, 60s
  - □ Lots of abstract "in principle" knowledge, theorems
  - □ But actual applications are hand-crafted

Optimality

- Neoclassical, "useful" behavioral ...
    - ... require calculation of the optimal choice
    - ... both imply that moving toward optimal is good!

- Unfortunately, solving optimal choice models is v. hard
    - Even for PhD economists who are experts in CF
        - Notorious examples (not in slides)

- Current situation: like econometrics in 1950s, 60s
    - Lots of abstract "in principle" knowledge, theorems
    - But actual applications are hand-crafted

- Solving these models should be like doing a regression

cfpb Consumer Financial Protection Bureau

Optimality

- Neoclassical, "useful" behavioral ...
    - ... require calculation of the optimal choice
    - ... both imply that moving toward optimal is good!
- Unfortunately, solving optimal choice models is v. hard
    - Even for PhD economists who are experts in CF
        - Notorious examples (not in slides)
- Current situation: like econometrics in 1950s, 60s
    - Lots of abstract "in principle" knowledge, theorems
    - But actual applications are hand-crafted
- Solving these models should be like doing a regression
    - Shouldn't require years of human capital investment

Optimality

- Neoclassical, "useful" behavioral ...
    - □ ... require calculation of the optimal choice
    - □ ... both imply that moving toward optimal is good!

- Unfortunately, solving optimal choice models is v. hard
    - □ Even for PhD economists who are experts in CF
        - – Notorious examples (not in slides)

- Current situation: like econometrics in 1950s, 60s
    - □ Lots of abstract "in principle" knowledge, theorems
    - □ But actual applications are hand-crafted

- Solving these models should be like doing a regression
    - □ Shouldn't require years of human capital investment
        - – in things that are *not* economics

cfpb Consumer Financial Protection Bureau

Optimality

- Neoclassical, "useful" behavioral ...
  - □ ... require calculation of the optimal choice
  - □ ... both imply that moving toward optimal is good!
- Unfortunately, solving optimal choice models is v. hard
  - □ Even for PhD economists who are experts in CF
    - − Notorious examples (not in slides)
- Current situation: like econometrics in 1950s, 60s
  - □ Lots of abstract "in principle" knowledge, theorems
  - □ But actual applications are hand-crafted
- Solving these models should be like doing a regression
  - □ Shouldn't require years of human capital investment
    - − in things that are *not* economics
- CFPB: 21st century government agency!

Who Has Figured This Out?

- Open-source software development world

Who Has Figured This Out?

- Open-source software development world
- Open source successes:

cfpb Consumer Financial Protection Bureau

Sensitive and Pre-Decisional. Not For Public Disclosure

Who Has Figured This Out?

- Open-source software development world
- Open source successes:
  - Linux

Who Has Figured This Out?

- Open-source software development world
- Open source successes:
  - Linux
  - LaTeX

cfpb Consumer Financial Protection Bureau

Sensitive and Pre-Decisional. Not For Public Disclosure

Who Has Figured This Out?

- Open-source software development world
- Open source successes:
  - Linux
  - LaTeX
  - Successful programming languages

cfpb Consumer Financial Protection Bureau

Sensitive and Pre-Decisional. Not For Public Disclosure

Lessons from the Professionals

- Open-source infrastructure:

Lessons from the Professionals

- Open-source infrastructure:
  - Repositories: store, share, checkpoint code automatically

Lessons from the Professionals

- Open-source infrastructure:
    - Repositories: store, share, checkpoint code automatically
    - Transparency, reproducibility via documentation

Lessons from the Professionals

- Open-source infrastructure:
    - Repositories: store, share, checkpoint code automatically
    - Transparency, reproducibility via documentation
    - Share ideas, code, math together: notebooks and gists

Lessons from the Professionals

- Open-source infrastructure:
  - Repositories: store, share, checkpoint code automatically
  - Transparency, reproducibility via documentation
  - Share ideas, code, math together: notebooks and gists
    - Reproducible academic research

Version 1.0

Heterogeneous Agents Computing toolKit (HACK) will be rolled out at a conference later this year:

- Well-documented, well tested tools

cfpb Consumer Financial Protection Bureau

Sensitive and Pre-Decisional. Not For Public Disclosure

Version 1.0

Heterogeneous Agents Computing toolKit (HACK) will be rolled out at a conference later this year:

- Well-documented, well tested tools
- Examples using these tools to solve canonical models

Version 1.0

Heterogeneous Agents Computing toolKit (HACK) will be rolled out at a conference later this year:

- Well-documented, well tested tools
- Examples using these tools to solve canonical models
  - Portfolio Choice

Version 1.0

Heterogeneous Agents Computing toolKit (HACK) will be rolled out at a conference later this year:

- Well-documented, well tested tools
- Examples using these tools to solve canonical models
    - Portfolio Choice
    - Life cycle model with stochastic income, liq constrs

Version 1.0

Heterogeneous Agents Computing toolKit (HACK) will be rolled out at a conference later this year:

- Well-documented, well tested tools
- Examples using these tools to solve canonical models
  - Portfolio Choice
  - Life cycle model with stochastic income, liq constrs
  - Indirect inference of RRA, time preference

Version 1.0

Heterogeneous Agents Computing toolKit (HACK) will be rolled out at a conference later this year:

- Well-documented, well tested tools
- Examples using these tools to solve canonical models
    - Portfolio Choice
    - Life cycle model with stochastic income, liq constrs
    - Indirect inference of RRA, time preference
    - Krusell-Smith

Version 1.0

Heterogeneous Agents Computing toolKit (HACK) will be rolled out at a conference later this year:

- Well-documented, well tested tools
- Examples using these tools to solve canonical models
  - Portfolio Choice
  - Life cycle model with stochastic income, liq constrs
  - Indirect inference of RRA, time preference
  - Krusell-Smith
  - Campbell-Cocco

Version 1.0

Heterogeneous Agents Computing toolKit (HACK) will be rolled out at a conference later this year:

- Well-documented, well tested tools
- Examples using these tools to solve canonical models
  - □ Portfolio Choice
  - □ Life cycle model with stochastic income, liq constrs
  - □ Indirect inference of RRA, time preference
  - □ Krusell-Smith
  - □ Campbell-Cocco
  - □ Carroll, Slacalek, Tokuoka, White

Needs Critical Mass

- Encouraging collaboration is the next crucial step

Needs Critical Mass

- Encouraging collaboration is the next crucial step
  - Problem sets

cfpb Consumer Financial Protection Bureau

Needs Critical Mass

- Encouraging collaboration is the next crucial step
  - Problem sets
  - Graduate student prizes

cfpb Consumer Financial Protection Bureau

Sensitive and Pre-Decisional. Not For Public Disclosure

Needs Critical Mass

- Encouraging collaboration is the next crucial step
  - Problem sets
  - Graduate student prizes
  - Performance plans

Needs Critical Mass

- Encouraging collaboration is the next crucial step
  - Problem sets
  - Graduate student prizes
  - Performance plans

- Your suggestions?

References

Voltaire. *Candide, ou L'Optimisme, Traduit de L'Allemand de Mr. le Docteur Ralph*. Sirène, Paris, 1759.