

Introducing the Computational Economics “Algorithmic Repository and toolKit” econ-ark.org

Presentation by Chris Carroll
Federal Reserve Board

Sep, 2016

What Is It?

State-of-the-art set of tools for:

What Is It?

State-of-the-art set of tools for:

- 1 Solving dynamic stochastic optimization problems

What Is It?

State-of-the-art set of tools for:

- 1 Solving dynamic stochastic optimization problems
 - Particularly adapted for Bellman problems with 'kinks' and quirks

What Is It?

State-of-the-art set of tools for:

- ① Solving dynamic stochastic optimization problems
 - Particularly adapted for Bellman problems with 'kinks' and quirks
- ② Simulating behavior of populations of agents

What Is It?

State-of-the-art set of tools for:

- ① Solving dynamic stochastic optimization problems
 - Particularly adapted for Bellman problems with 'kinks' and quirks
- ② Simulating behavior of populations of agents
 - A Market

What Is It?

State-of-the-art set of tools for:

- ① Solving dynamic stochastic optimization problems
 - Particularly adapted for Bellman problems with 'kinks' and quirks
- ② Simulating behavior of populations of agents
 - A Market
 - A Small Open Economy

What Is It?

State-of-the-art set of tools for:

- ① Solving dynamic stochastic optimization problems
 - Particularly adapted for Bellman problems with 'kinks' and quirks
- ② Simulating behavior of populations of agents
 - A Market
 - A Small Open Economy
 - General Equilibrium

What Is It Good For?

- Heterogeneous Agent Macro Models

What Is It Good For?

- Heterogeneous Agent Macro Models
 - Original name: **H**eterogeneous **A**gent **R**esources and tool**K**it

What Is It Good For?

- Heterogeneous Agent Macro Models
 - Original name: **H**eterogeneous **A**gent **R**esources and tool**K**it
 - HARK!

What Is It Good For?

- Heterogeneous Agent Macro Models
 - Original name: **H**eterogeneous **A**gent **R**esources and tool**K**it
 - HARK!
- Structural Micro Models (e.g., labor, health)

What Is It Good For?

- Heterogeneous Agent Macro Models
 - Original name: **H**eterogeneous **A**gent **R**esources and tool**K**it
 - HARK!
- Structural Micro Models (e.g., labor, health)
- IO models with optimizing consumers and firms

What Is It Good For?

- Heterogeneous Agent Macro Models
 - Original name: **H**eterogeneous **A**gent **R**esources and tool**K**it
 - HARK!
- Structural Micro Models (e.g., labor, health)
- IO models with optimizing consumers and firms
- **N**ot **O**nly **A**bout **H**eterogeneous stuff ...

What Is It Good For?

- Heterogeneous Agent Macro Models
 - Original name: **H**eterogeneous **A**gent **R**esources and tool**K**it
 - HARK!
- Structural Micro Models (e.g., labor, health)
- IO models with optimizing consumers and firms
- **N**ot **O**nly **A**bout **H**eterogeneous stuff ...
- ... **A**lgorithmic **R**esources and tool**K**it

What Is It Good For?

- Heterogeneous Agent Macro Models
 - Original name: **H**eterogeneous **A**gent **R**esources and tool**K**it
 - HARK!
- Structural Micro Models (e.g., labor, health)
- IO models with optimizing consumers and firms
- **N**ot **O**nly **A**bout **H**eterogeneous stuff ...
- ... **A**lgorithmic **R**esources and tool**K**it
- :-)

What Is It Good For?

- Heterogeneous Agent Macro Models
 - Original name: **H**eterogeneous **A**gent **R**esources and tool**K**it
 - HARK!
- Structural Micro Models (e.g., labor, health)
- IO models with optimizing consumers and firms
- **N**ot **O**nly **A**bout **H**eterogeneous stuff ...
- ... **A**lgorithmic **R**esources and tool**K**it
- :-)
 - Unlike Noah's, our ARK can hold more than two of each kind!

What Is It Good For?

- Heterogeneous Agent Macro Models
 - Original name: **H**eterogeneous **A**gent **R**esources and tool**K**it
 - HARK!
- Structural Micro Models (e.g., labor, health)
- IO models with optimizing consumers and firms
- **N**ot **O**nly **A**bout **H**eterogeneous stuff ...
- ... **A**lgorithmic **R**esources and tool**K**it
- :-)
 - Unlike Noah's, our ARK can hold more than two of each kind!
 - Ultimate goal: Get examples on the ARK of all types of animal (model)

Where Is It?

econ-ark.org is the project's home

- 1 Get a GitHub account. Then, options to access are

Where Is It?

econ-ark.org is the project's home

- 1 Get a GitHub account. Then, options to access are
 - Install GitHub Desktop App

Where Is It?

econ-ark.org is the project's home

- 1 Get a GitHub account. Then, options to access are
 - Install GitHub Desktop App
 - Install 'git' command-line tool (if you're hard-core)

Where Is It?

econ-ark.org is the project's home

- 1 Get a GitHub account. Then, options to access are
 - Install GitHub Desktop App
 - Install 'git' command-line tool (if you're hard-core)
- 2 HARK is a “public repo”

Where Is It?

econ-ark.org is the project's home

- ① Get a GitHub account. Then, options to access are
 - Install GitHub Desktop App
 - Install 'git' command-line tool (if you're hard-core)
- ② HARK is a “public repo”
 - Contains all existing code (as of now)

Where Is It?

econ-ark.org is the project's home

- 1 Get a GitHub account. Then, options to access are
 - Install GitHub Desktop App
 - Install 'git' command-line tool (if you're hard-core)
- 2 HARK is a “public repo”
 - Contains all existing code (as of now)
- 3 `HARK/Documentation/NARK.pdf`

Where Is It?

econ-ark.org is the project's home

- ① Get a GitHub account. Then, options to access are
 - Install GitHub Desktop App
 - Install 'git' command-line tool (if you're hard-core)
- ② HARK is a “public repo”
 - Contains all existing code (as of now)
- ③ HARK/Documentation/NARK.pdf
 - Describes variable naming conventions for easy workflow:

Where Is It?

econ-ark.org is the project's home

- ① Get a GitHub account. Then, options to access are
 - Install GitHub Desktop App
 - Install 'git' command-line tool (if you're hard-core)
- ② HARK is a “public repo”
 - Contains all existing code (as of now)
- ③ HARK/Documentation/NARK.pdf
 - Describes variable naming conventions for easy workflow:
 - \LaTeX object definitions correspond to HARK definitions

Where Is It?

econ-ark.org is the project's home

- ① Get a GitHub account. Then, options to access are
 - Install GitHub Desktop App
 - Install 'git' command-line tool (if you're hard-core)
- ② HARK is a “public repo”
 - Contains all existing code (as of now)
- ③ HARK/Documentation/NARK.pdf
 - Describes variable naming conventions for easy workflow:
 - \LaTeX object definitions correspond to HARK definitions
- ④ Instructions for cloning are in the README.txt

Where Is It?

econ-ark.org is the project's home

- 1 Get a GitHub account. Then, options to access are
 - Install GitHub Desktop App
 - Install 'git' command-line tool (if you're hard-core)
- 2 HARK is a “public repo”
 - Contains all existing code (as of now)
- 3 HARK/Documentation/NARK.pdf
 - Describes variable naming conventions for easy workflow:
 - \LaTeX object definitions correspond to HARK definitions
- 4 Instructions for cloning are in the README.txt
- 5 You get the whole codebase under the Apache 2.0 license

Where Is It?

econ-ark.org is the project's home

- ① Get a GitHub account. Then, options to access are
 - Install GitHub Desktop App
 - Install 'git' command-line tool (if you're hard-core)
- ② HARK is a “public repo”
 - Contains all existing code (as of now)
- ③ HARK/Documentation/NARK.pdf
 - Describes variable naming conventions for easy workflow:
 - \LaTeX object definitions correspond to HARK definitions
- ④ Instructions for cloning are in the README.txt
- ⑤ You get the whole codebase under the Apache 2.0 license
 - Basically, no limitations on use

Where Is It?

econ-ark.org is the project's home

- ① Get a GitHub account. Then, options to access are
 - Install GitHub Desktop App
 - Install 'git' command-line tool (if you're hard-core)
- ② HARK is a “public repo”
 - Contains all existing code (as of now)
- ③ HARK/Documentation/NARK.pdf
 - Describes variable naming conventions for easy workflow:
 - \LaTeX object definitions correspond to HARK definitions
- ④ Instructions for cloning are in the README.txt
- ⑤ You get the whole codebase under the Apache 2.0 license
 - Basically, no limitations on use
 - But, please credit us, and participate in discussions

Who Has Produced It?

Name	TLA	Affiliation
<i>Christopher D Carroll</i>	CDC	JHU, CFPB
<i>David C Low</i>	DCL	CFPB
<i>Nathan M Palmer</i>	NMP	OFR
<i>Matthew N White</i>	MNW	UDel, CFPB
<i>Alex Kaufman</i>	AMK	CFPB → ? (Alcatraz?)
<i>Jiaxiong Yao</i>	JXY	JHU → IMF

Nothing herein may be interpreted as reflecting opinions of

- CFPB - United States Consumer Financial Protection Bureau
- JHU - Johns Hopkins University
- IMF - International Monetary Fund
- OFR - Office of Financial Research, U.S. Treasury
- UDel - University of Delaware

Major credit goes to CFPB - a 21st Century Regulator!

- Hired CDC as Chief Economist with this as a key priority

Major credit goes to CFPB - a 21st Century Regulator!

- Hired CDC as Chief Economist with this as a key priority
- Hired NMP as intern to get started

Major credit goes to CFPB - a 21st Century Regulator!

- Hired CDC as Chief Economist with this as a key priority
- Hired NMP as intern to get started
- Hired MNW as Visiting Scholar to work on it

Major credit goes to CFPB - a 21st Century Regulator!

- Hired CDC as Chief Economist with this as a key priority
- Hired NMP as intern to get started
- Hired MNW as Visiting Scholar to work on it
- Hired DCL as new economist last year

Major credit goes to CFPB - a 21st Century Regulator!

- Hired CDC as Chief Economist with this as a key priority
- Hired NMP as intern to get started
- Hired MNW as Visiting Scholar to work on it
- Hired DCL as new economist last year
- Hired AMK as RA

Organization Going Forward

Standard Github tools, esp:

- Issue Tracker: If You See Something, Say Something

Topic Czars

Organization Going Forward

Standard Github tools, esp:

- Issue Tracker: If You See Something, Say Something

Topic Czars

- Gatekeeper for Contributions

Organization Going Forward

Standard Github tools, esp:

- Issue Tracker: If You See Something, Say Something

Topic Czars

- Gatekeeper for Contributions
- Responsible for Setting Out Tests A Module Should Pass

Organization Going Forward

Standard Github tools, esp:

- Issue Tracker: If You See Something, Say Something

Topic Czars

- Gatekeeper for Contributions
- Responsible for Setting Out Tests A Module Should Pass
 - e.g. Special Cases With Analytical Solutions

Organization Going Forward

Standard Github tools, esp:

- Issue Tracker: If You See Something, Say Something

Topic Czars

- Gatekeeper for Contributions
- Responsible for Setting Out Tests A Module Should Pass
 - e.g. Special Cases With Analytical Solutions
 - Metrics for “closeness” to “true” solution

Organization Going Forward

Standard Github tools, esp:

- Issue Tracker: If You See Something, Say Something

Topic Czars

- Gatekeeper for Contributions
- Responsible for Setting Out Tests A Module Should Pass
 - e.g. Special Cases With Analytical Solutions
 - Metrics for “closeness” to “true” solution

Organization Going Forward

Standard Github tools, esp:

- Issue Tracker: If You See Something, Say Something

Topic Czars

- Gatekeeper for Contributions
- Responsible for Setting Out Tests A Module Should Pass
 - e.g. Special Cases With Analytical Solutions
 - Metrics for “closeness” to “true” solution

Name	Topic	Affiliation
Serguei Maliar	Interpolation	Stanford
Lilia Maliar	Interpolation	Stanford

We're Seeking Volunteers for Czars

Organization Going Forward

Standard Github tools, esp:

- Issue Tracker: If You See Something, Say Something

Topic Czars

- Gatekeeper for Contributions
- Responsible for Setting Out Tests A Module Should Pass
 - e.g. Special Cases With Analytical Solutions
 - Metrics for “closeness” to “true” solution

Name	Topic	Affiliation
Serguei Maliar	Interpolation	Stanford
Lilia Maliar	Interpolation	Stanford

We're Seeking Volunteers for Czars

info@econ-ark.org	-	General Purpose Questions
czars@econ-ark.org	-	Volunteer to be a Czar
ideas@econ-ark.org	-	Ideas for Improvement

Timeline

When	What	Lessons
2006-2013	SolvingMicroDSOPs	Surprisingly popular
2014-12	IMF-CFPB Workshop	Lots of enthusiasm
2015-12	CFPB-IMF Workshop	Not HARK, ARK!
		Testing, Replication, Feedback
2016-06	CEF Toulouse	Discuss CEF sponsorship
2016-08	IMF Macro Modeling	Armenia is Near Mt Ararat

- The version at <http://econ-ark.org> is our “public beta”

Timeline

When	What	Lessons
2006-2013	SolvingMicroDSOPs	Surprisingly popular
2014-12	IMF-CFPB Workshop	Lots of enthusiasm
2015-12	CFPB-IMF Workshop	Not HARK, ARK!
		Testing, Replication, Feedback
2016-06	CEF Toulouse	Discuss CEF sponsorship
2016-08	IMF Macro Modeling	Armenia is Near Mt Ararat

- The version at <http://econ-ark.org> is our “public beta”
- So far as we know, everything works

Timeline

When	What	Lessons
2006-2013	SolvingMicroDSOPs	Surprisingly popular
2014-12	IMF-CFPB Workshop	Lots of enthusiasm
2015-12	CFPB-IMF Workshop	Not HARK, ARK! Testing, Replication, Feedback
2016-06	CEF Toulouse	Discuss CEF sponsorship
2016-08	IMF Macro Modeling	Armenia is Near Mt Ararat

- The version at <http://econ-ark.org> is our “public beta”
- So far as we know, everything works
- First non-beta: Built-in tests for *everything*

Timeline

When	What	Lessons
2006-2013	SolvingMicroDSOPs	Surprisingly popular
2014-12	IMF-CFPB Workshop	Lots of enthusiasm
2015-12	CFPB-IMF Workshop	Not HARK, ARK!
		Testing, Replication, Feedback
2016-06	CEF Toulouse	Discuss CEF sponsorship
2016-08	IMF Macro Modeling	Armenia is Near Mt Ararat

- The version at <http://econ-ark.org> is our “public beta”
- So far as we know, everything works
- First non-beta: Built-in tests for *everything*
 - Aim: This year

Why Are Policy Institutions So Interested?

Participation: CFPB, OFR, IMF

Interest From: FRB, ECB, BLS

- Policymaking = Applied Theory. Options:

Why Are Policy Institutions So Interested?

Participation: CFPB, OFR, IMF

Interest From: FRB, ECB, BLS

- Policymaking = Applied Theory. Options:
 - ① Informal, intuitive, “wetware” theory

Why Are Policy Institutions So Interested?

Participation: CFPB, OFR, IMF

Interest From: FRB, ECB, BLS

- Policymaking = Applied Theory. Options:
 - ① Informal, intuitive, “wetware” theory
 - ② Formal, structural, “software” theory

The Invention of Science by David Wootton

Wrong explanations for the Scientific Revolution:

The Invention of Science by David Wootton

Wrong explanations for the Scientific Revolution:

- Invention of 'the experiment'

The Invention of Science by David Wootton

Wrong explanations for the Scientific Revolution:

- Invention of 'the experiment'
- Invention of the printing press

The Invention of Science by David Wootton

Wrong explanations for the Scientific Revolution:

- Invention of 'the experiment'
- Invention of the printing press
- Protestant Reformation

The Invention of Science by David Wootton

Wrong explanations for the Scientific Revolution:

- Invention of 'the experiment'
- Invention of the printing press
- Protestant Reformation
- ...

The Invention of Science by David Wootton

Wrong explanations for the Scientific Revolution:

- Invention of 'the experiment'
- Invention of the printing press
- Protestant Reformation
- ...

The Invention of Science by David Wootton

Wrong explanations for the Scientific Revolution:

- Invention of 'the experiment'
- Invention of the printing press
- Protestant Reformation
- ...

Right explanation:

- Creation of community of scholars

The Invention of Science by David Wootton

Wrong explanations for the Scientific Revolution:

- Invention of 'the experiment'
- Invention of the printing press
- Protestant Reformation
- ...

Right explanation:

- Creation of community of scholars
- ... whose methods and results were 'open source'

The Invention of Science by David Wootton

Wrong explanations for the Scientific Revolution:

- Invention of 'the experiment'
- Invention of the printing press
- Protestant Reformation
- ...

Right explanation:

- Creation of community of scholars
- ... whose methods and results were 'open source'
- ... who criticized and improved and debugged each other

The Invention of Science by David Wootton

Wrong explanations for the Scientific Revolution:

- Invention of 'the experiment'
- Invention of the printing press
- Protestant Reformation
- ...

Right explanation:

- Creation of community of scholars
- ... whose methods and results were 'open source'
- ... who criticized and improved and debugged each other

The Invention of Science by David Wootton

Wrong explanations for the Scientific Revolution:

- Invention of 'the experiment'
- Invention of the printing press
- Protestant Reformation
- ...

Right explanation:

- Creation of community of scholars
- ... whose methods and results were 'open source'
- ... who criticized and improved and debugged each other

Alchemy → Chemistry

The Invention of Science by David Wootton

Wrong explanations for the Scientific Revolution:

- Invention of 'the experiment'
- Invention of the printing press
- Protestant Reformation
- ...

Right explanation:

- Creation of community of scholars
- ... whose methods and results were 'open source'
- ... who criticized and improved and debugged each other

Alchemy → Chemistry

17th and 18th century version of github.com!

Economists are People Too ...

Economists are People Too ...

- We are way behind many scientific fields in 'open source' code

Economists are People Too ...

- We are way behind many scientific fields in 'open source' code
- Surveys/Experiments: Economics students are more 'selfish.'

Economists are People Too ...

- We are way behind many scientific fields in 'open source' code
- Surveys/Experiments: Economics students are more 'selfish.'
- Options:

Economists are People Too ...

- We are way behind many scientific fields in 'open source' code
- Surveys/Experiments: Economics students are more 'selfish.'
- Options:

Economists are People Too ...

- We are way behind many scientific fields in 'open source' code
- Surveys/Experiments: Economics students are more 'selfish.'
- Options:
 - ① 'selfish' people study economics

Economists are People Too ...

- We are way behind many scientific fields in 'open source' code
- Surveys/Experiments: Economics students are more 'selfish.'
- Options:
 - 1 'selfish' people study economics
 - 2 Studying economics makes you selfish!

Economists are People Too ...

- We are way behind many scientific fields in 'open source' code
- Surveys/Experiments: Economics students are more 'selfish.'
- Options:
 - 1 'selfish' people study economics
 - 2 Studying economics makes you selfish!
 - 3 Economics students are just more honest

Economists are People Too ...

- We are way behind many scientific fields in 'open source' code
- Surveys/Experiments: Economics students are more 'selfish.'
- Options:
 - ① 'selfish' people study economics
 - ② Studying economics makes you selfish!
 - ③ Economics students are just more honest

Economists are People Too ...

- We are way behind many scientific fields in 'open source' code
- Surveys/Experiments: Economics students are more 'selfish.'
- Options:
 - 1 'selfish' people study economics
 - 2 Studying economics makes you selfish!
 - 3 Economics students are just more honest

I prefer (3)!

Lessons Learned from Other Fields About What Works

- Not taking a dewy-eyed “Build it and they will come” view

Lessons Learned from Other Fields About What Works

- Not taking a dewy-eyed “Build it and they will come” view
- Empirical fact: Many other open source communities have succeeded

Lessons Learned from Other Fields About What Works

- Not taking a dewy-eyed “Build it and they will come” view
- Empirical fact: Many other open source communities have succeeded
- Fairly extensive literature about what makes for success

In Addition to Usual Github Tools

- Czars for specific topics

In Addition to Usual Github Tools

- Czars for specific topics
- Bounties for Best Solution of Specific Problems

In Addition to Usual Github Tools

- Czars for specific topics
- Bounties for Best Solution of Specific Problems
 - Durable Goods (e.g., cars, houses)

In Addition to Usual Github Tools

- Czars for specific topics
- Bounties for Best Solution of Specific Problems
 - Durable Goods (e.g., cars, houses)
 - Search Models of Labor Markets

In Addition to Usual Github Tools

- Czars for specific topics
- Bounties for Best Solution of Specific Problems
 - Durable Goods (e.g., cars, houses)
 - Search Models of Labor Markets
 - ...

In Addition to Usual Github Tools

- Czars for specific topics
- Bounties for Best Solution of Specific Problems
 - Durable Goods (e.g., cars, houses)
 - Search Models of Labor Markets
 - ...
- Time-Stamped Public Mechanism for Staking a Claim to New Idea

In Addition to Usual Github Tools

- Czars for specific topics
- Bounties for Best Solution of Specific Problems
 - Durable Goods (e.g., cars, houses)
 - Search Models of Labor Markets
 - ...
- Time-Stamped Public Mechanism for Staking a Claim to New Idea
- Stack-Exchange-Like Q&A Forum

In Addition to Usual Github Tools

- Czars for specific topics
- Bounties for Best Solution of Specific Problems
 - Durable Goods (e.g., cars, houses)
 - Search Models of Labor Markets
 - ...
- Time-Stamped Public Mechanism for Staking a Claim to New Idea
- Stack-Exchange-Like Q&A Forum
- Mechanisms for Easy Creation of Grad Student Problem Sets

In Addition to Usual Github Tools

- Czars for specific topics
- Bounties for Best Solution of Specific Problems
 - Durable Goods (e.g., cars, houses)
 - Search Models of Labor Markets
 - ...
- Time-Stamped Public Mechanism for Staking a Claim to New Idea
- Stack-Exchange-Like Q&A Forum
- Mechanisms for Easy Creation of Grad Student Problem Sets
- Tool for Grad Student Replication Exercises

In Addition to Usual Github Tools

- Czars for specific topics
- Bounties for Best Solution of Specific Problems
 - Durable Goods (e.g., cars, houses)
 - Search Models of Labor Markets
 - ...
- Time-Stamped Public Mechanism for Staking a Claim to New Idea
- Stack-Exchange-Like Q&A Forum
- Mechanisms for Easy Creation of Grad Student Problem Sets
- Tool for Grad Student Replication Exercises
- Eventually, a Journal modeled on the Journal of Statistical Software

In Addition to Usual Github Tools

- Czars for specific topics
- Bounties for Best Solution of Specific Problems
 - Durable Goods (e.g., cars, houses)
 - Search Models of Labor Markets
 - ...
- Time-Stamped Public Mechanism for Staking a Claim to New Idea
- Stack-Exchange-Like Q&A Forum
- Mechanisms for Easy Creation of Grad Student Problem Sets
- Tool for Grad Student Replication Exercises
- Eventually, a Journal modeled on the Journal of Statistical Software
 - NOT: **J**ournal **O**f **C**omputational **E**conomics **S**oftware

In Addition to Usual Github Tools

- Czars for specific topics
- Bounties for Best Solution of Specific Problems
 - Durable Goods (e.g., cars, houses)
 - Search Models of Labor Markets
 - ...
- Time-Stamped Public Mechanism for Staking a Claim to New Idea
- Stack-Exchange-Like Q&A Forum
- Mechanisms for Easy Creation of Grad Student Problem Sets
- Tool for Grad Student Replication Exercises
- Eventually, a Journal modeled on the Journal of Statistical Software
 - NOT: **J**ournal **O**f **C**omputational **E**conomics **S**oftware
- Regular (annual or biannual conferences with presentations)

In Addition to Usual Github Tools

- Czars for specific topics
- Bounties for Best Solution of Specific Problems
 - Durable Goods (e.g., cars, houses)
 - Search Models of Labor Markets
 - ...
- Time-Stamped Public Mechanism for Staking a Claim to New Idea
- Stack-Exchange-Like Q&A Forum
- Mechanisms for Easy Creation of Grad Student Problem Sets
- Tool for Grad Student Replication Exercises
- Eventually, a Journal modeled on the Journal of Statistical Software
 - NOT: **J**ournal **O**f **C**omputational **E**conmics **S**oftware
- Regular (annual or biannual conferences with presentations)
- ... Your Ideas? ideas@econ-ark.org

Specific Incentives for Government Agencies

Need to make it easy to include contributions in performance plans

- Measures of progress

Specific Incentives for Government Agencies

Need to make it easy to include contributions in performance plans

- Measures of progress
- Measures of usefulness

Specific Incentives for Government Agencies

Need to make it easy to include contributions in performance plans

- Measures of progress
- Measures of usefulness
- Measures of organizational contributions

Specific Incentives for Government Agencies

Need to make it easy to include contributions in performance plans

- Measures of progress
- Measures of usefulness
- Measures of organizational contributions
- Measures of the use of the tools in papers

Specific Incentives for Government Agencies

Need to make it easy to include contributions in performance plans

- Measures of progress
- Measures of usefulness
- Measures of organizational contributions
- Measures of the use of the tools in papers

Specific Incentives for Government Agencies

Need to make it easy to include contributions in performance plans

- Measures of progress
- Measures of usefulness
- Measures of organizational contributions
- Measures of the use of the tools in papers

Persuade institutions to contribute noneconomist resources:

- RA's

Specific Incentives for Government Agencies

Need to make it easy to include contributions in performance plans

- Measures of progress
- Measures of usefulness
- Measures of organizational contributions
- Measures of the use of the tools in papers

Persuade institutions to contribute noneconomist resources:

- RA's
- ARC should work on the ARK!

Specific Incentives for Government Agencies

Need to make it easy to include contributions in performance plans

- Measures of progress
- Measures of usefulness
- Measures of organizational contributions
- Measures of the use of the tools in papers

Persuade institutions to contribute noneconomist resources:

- RA's
- ARC should work on the ARK!
- Hired outside programmers for specific desired functions

Join our (Scientific) Revolution!

Options:

- subscribe@econ-ark.org

Join our (Scientific) Revolution!

Options:

- subscribe@econ-ark.org
 - Add me to the newsletter/ mailing list

Join our (Scientific) Revolution!

Options:

- subscribe@econ-ark.org
 - Add me to the newsletter/ mailing list
- *Read the docs and slides* and absorb what exists now. Options:

Join our (Scientific) Revolution!

Options:

- subscribe@econ-ark.org
 - Add me to the newsletter/ mailing list
- *Read the docs and slides* and absorb what exists now. Options:
 - ① Add an 'issue' that you want to tackle on econ-ark.org

Join our (Scientific) Revolution!

Options:

- subscribe@econ-ark.org
 - Add me to the newsletter/ mailing list
- *Read the docs and slides* and absorb what exists now. Options:
 - 1 Add an 'issue' that you want to tackle on econ-ark.org
 - 2 letmehelpwith@econ-ark.org

Join our (Scientific) Revolution!

Options:

- subscribe@econ-ark.org
 - Add me to the newsletter/ mailing list
- *Read the docs and slides* and absorb what exists now. Options:
 - 1 Add an 'issue' that you want to tackle on econ-ark.org
 - 2 letmehelpwith@econ-ark.org
 - 1 Define some area that you'd like to contribute to

Join our (Scientific) Revolution!

Options:

- subscribe@econ-ark.org
 - Add me to the newsletter/ mailing list
- *Read the docs and slides* and absorb what exists now. Options:
 - 1 Add an 'issue' that you want to tackle on econ-ark.org
 - 2 letmehelpwith@econ-ark.org
 - 1 Define some area that you'd like to contribute to
 - 2 email us at this address outlining what you propose to do

Join our (Scientific) Revolution!

Options:

- subscribe@econ-ark.org
 - Add me to the newsletter/ mailing list
- *Read the docs and slides* and absorb what exists now. Options:
 - 1 Add an 'issue' that you want to tackle on econ-ark.org
 - 2 letmehelpwith@econ-ark.org
 - 1 Define some area that you'd like to contribute to
 - 2 email us at this address outlining what you propose to do
 - 3 We'll reply with some suggestions