

MODERN LEGAL DRAFTING

A Guide to Using Clearer Language
Third Edition

Modern Legal Drafting provides a comprehensive guide to drafting legal documents in effective, plain English.

This is the third edition of Peter Butt's and Richard Castle's successful text. Peter Butt has fully revised and updated the text for this new edition. It combines a practical focus with the legal principles that underpin the use of plain language in legal drafting. This dual practical and academic approach distinguishes it from other books in the field.

This edition includes expanded material on the techniques for achieving a style that is both clear and legally sound. It also includes new material on the challenges and merits of drafting in plain language, and provides many before-and-after examples to help both practising lawyers and students develop key drafting skills. It takes a genuinely international approach, dealing with the principles for clear, effective legal drafting in all countries where English is the language of law. In doing so, it draws on case law and statutes from countries as diverse as England, Australia, New Zealand, the United States, Canada, Ireland, India, Malaysia, Singapore and Hong Kong.

Written by a leading expert in the field, *Modern Legal Drafting* remains an authority on legal drafting in plain English, and is an essential resource for students and practitioners of law alike.

PETER BUTT is Emeritus Professor of Law at the University of Sydney, Australia.





MODERN LEGAL DRAFTING

A Guide to Using Clearer Language Third Edition

PETER BUTT





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107607675

© Peter Butt 2013

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2001 Second edition 2006 Reprinted 2007, 2008, 2011 Third edition 2013 Reprinted 2014

Cover design by Tanya De Silva-McKay Typeset by Aptara Corp. Printed in China by Print Plus Ltd

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

A Cataloguing-in-Publication entry is available from the catalogue of the National Library of Australia at www.nla.gov.au

ISBN 978-1-107-60767-5 Paperback

Reproduction and communication for educational purposes

The Australian *Copyright Act 1968* (the Act) allows a maximum of one chapter or 10% of the pages of this work, whichever is the greater, to be reproduced and/or communicated by any educational institution for its educational purposes provided that the educational institution (or the body that administers it) has given a remuneration notice to Copyright Agency Limited (CAL) under the Act.

For details of the CAL licence for educational institutions contact:

Copyright Agency Limited Level 15, 233 Castlereagh Street Sydney NSW 2000 Telephone: (02) 9394 7600 Facsimile: (02) 9394 7601 E-mail: info@copyright.com.au

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



To Lin





CONTENTS

L1.	st of panels	page xi	
Table of statutes and subsidiary legislation		xii	
Ta	Table of cases		
Αc	Acknowledgements		
1	Introduction	1	
	Traditional legal language	1	
	Pressures for reform	2	
	What this book tries to do	4	
2	What influences the legal drafter?	5	
	Introduction	5	
	Familiarity and habit	6	
	Conservatism	9	
	Fear of negligence claims	14	
	Means of production	17	
	Professional pressures	21	
	Straining to avoid ambiguity	22	
	The mixture of languages	23	
	Payment by length	32	
	Payment by time	38	
	The litigious environment	39	
	A case study in traditional influences: the United States		
	of America	40	
3	How legal documents are interpreted	46	
-	Overview	46	
	What judges have said about traditional legal drafting	47	
	, 0		

vii



viii	Contents	
	The principles of legal interpretation	53
	Internal factors	55
	External factors	73
	Modern restatement of approach to interpretation	80
	Implied terms	86
	Precedent as an aid to interpretation	88
	Interpreting plain-language documents	91
	What judges have said about plain English in legal	
	drafting	98
4	Some benefits of drafting in plain English	101
	The meaning of 'plain English'	101
	Benefits of plain English in law	104
	Conclusion	127
5	How to draft modern documents – Part 1: Structure	
	and form	129
	Document structure	129
	Form of document: deed or agreement?	135
	Layout and design	145
	Purpose clauses	152
	Tables, plans, graphs and formulas	153
	Notes and examples	161
	Simplified outlines	163
	Numbering systems	165
	Lists	166
	Standard forms	169
	Testing and readability	172
6	How to draft modern documents – Part 2: Particular	
	issues for legal drafters	175
	Wordiness and redundancy	175
	Excessive particularity	178
	Long sentences	179
	Obscure language	184
	Unusual word order	185



Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-60767-5 - Modern Legal Drafting: A Guide to Using Clearer Language: Third Edition

Peter Butt Frontmatter More information

		Contents	ix
	Conditional clauses		187
	Peculiar linguistic conventions		189
	Consistency of terminology		191
	Handling generality and vagueness		193
	Syntactic ambiguity		196
	Inclusive language		198
	Cross-references		202
	Drafting in the present tense		204
	Deeming		205
	Definitions		207
	Overuse of capitals		223
	Provisos		228
	Recitals		231
7	How to draft modern documents – Part 3: Words and		
	phrases		236
	Modern, standard English		236
	Choose the simpler word or phrase		239
	Frequently litigated words and phrases		243
	Foreign words and phrases		247
	Legalese		248
	Jargon		250
	Terms of art		257
	Overuse of 'shall'		262
	Nouns instead of verbs		276
	Overuse of the passive		276
	Pronouns		278
	Issues with 'and' and 'or'		280
	Punctuation and grammar		288
8	Using the modern style		298
	Lease: how to bring it to an end if the property is damage	;ed	300
	Company memorandum of association: subsidiary		
	objects clause		302
	Will: attestation clause		303
	Will: distribution in unequal shares		305



x Contents

New land obligations: buyer's restrictive covenant	307
Building contract: determination by employer	309
Conclusion	316
Further reading	318
Index	320



LIST OF PANELS

1	Handwritten conveyance	page 19
2	Deed of Sale	43
3	Levels of headings	148
4	Use of a table in a contract	154
5	Road traffic regulations	157
6	Flow chart	158
7	Simplified outline	164
8	Numbering systems	165
9	Extract of bank mortgage	180
10	'They' as a singular pronoun	200
11	Historic use of capitals	224
12	Alternative words and phrases	240
13	Before-and-after examples in earlier chapters	299



TABLE OF STATUTES AND SUBSIDIARY LEGISLATION

Commonwealth of Australia

```
A New Tax System (Goods and Services Tax) Act 1999
  s 66–5, 7.87 n130
  s 195.1, 6.77 n83
Acts Interpretation Act 1901
  s 15AC, 3.87 n243
Airports Act 1996
  s 33, 7.98 n153
Australian Consumer Law 2010
  pt 2-3, 4.47
  s 9(2), 7.68 n110
  s 21, 4.47
  s 22, 4.47
  s 24(2)(a), 4.47
  s 24(3), 4.47
  s 64A(4), 7.68 n110
Australian Income Tax Assessment Act 1997
  s 2-5, 5.5
Corporations Act 2001, 4.23 n28
  s 127, 5.18 n28
  s 420A, 3.64 n197
  s 715A, 4.45 n82
  s 739, 4.45 n82
```

χij

s 1013C(3), 4.45 n82

Crimes Act 1914 s 16F(1), 4.45 n83 s 16F(2), 4.45 n83



Frontmatter More information

Table of statutes xiii

Fair Work Act 2009

s 134(1)(g), 4.45 n84

s 601, 4.45 n85

Federal Court Rules 2011

sch 3 cl 3, 2.57 n102

First Corporate Law Simplification Act 1995, 3.87 n243

Insurance Contracts Act 1984

s 22(1), 4.45 n80

Members of Parliament (Life Gold Pass) Act 2002

s 3, 5.69

National Consumer Credit Protection Act 2009

s 184, 4.45 n79

Native Title Act 1993, 6.100 n118

Social Security Act 1991, 4.12

Trade Marks Act 1995, 7.98 n153

New South Wales

Building and Construction Industry Security of Payment Act

1999

s 17(2), 7.77 n123

Contracts Review Act 1980

s 7, 4.48

s 9, 4.48

Conveyancing Act 1919, 6.12

s 23B, 5.15 n8

s 36C, 5.26 n54

s 38(3), 5.17 n22

s 53(2)(a), 6.120 n150

s 78, 2.15 n14

s 111A, 3.64 n197

s 134, 5.15 n10

s 181, 6.42 n45

s 186, 7.18 n33

s 187, 7.18 n33

Conveyancing (Sale of Land) Regulation 2010

reg 11, 5.42 n81



xiv Table of statutes

Fisheries Management Act 1994
s 5, 6.77 n82
Gas Supply (Natural Gas Retail Competition) Regulation 2001
sch 1 cl 1, 4.46 n89
Legal Profession Act 2004
s 315(1), 4.46 n88
Local Government Act 1993, 5.37
Real Property Act 1900, 5.83 n129
s 135D, 7.69 n112
Residential Tenancies Act 2010
s 52, 3.64 n195
Retail Leases Act 1994, 3.64 n196
Retirement Villages Act 1999, 5.39 n73, 7.108 n180
s 83, 7.69 n112
Succession Act 2006

s 32, 3.61 n189

Treasury Corporation Act 1983
s 6A, 7.75 n122

Trustee Act 1925 ss 6–8, 5.15 n11

Oueensland

Civil Liability Act 2003 s 2, 2.20 n29 Industrial Relations Act 1999 s 333, 4.46 Property Law Act 1974 s 238(6), 6.120 n150 Succession Act 1981 s 33C, 3.61 n189

Victoria

Crimes Act 1958 s 464, 6.77 n82 Fundraising Act 1998 s 15A, 5.42 n81



More information

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-60767-5 - Modern Legal Drafting: A Guide to Using Clearer Language: Third Edition Peter Butt Frontmatter

Table of statutes xv

Property Law Act 1958 s 45(6), 6.120 n150

Western Australia

Legal Profession Act 2008 s 266(1), 4.46 n88 Wills Act 1997 s 36, 3.61 n189

Canada

Companion Policy to National Instrument 81–101

s 3.1, 4.37

s 3.2(1), 4.37

s 3.2(2), 4.37

s 4.1(1), 4.36

Financial Consumers Act, RSA 2000

s 1, 4.35

s 13, 4.35

Tobacco Tax Act RSO 1990, 6.48 n54

Uniform Interpretation Act 1967–68

s 10, 7.63 n95

s 28, 7.63 n95

Hong Kong

Basic Law

Art 160, 7.52

Conveyancing and Property Ordinance Cap 219

s 13(4), 6.120 n150

South Africa

Consumer Protection Act 2008

s 22(1), 4.7

s 22(2), 4.7

National Credit Act 2005

s 64(2), 4.8



xvi Table of statutes

United Kingdom

Administration of Justice Act 1982

s 17, 8.10

s 21, 3.61

Arbitration Act 1996

s5(2), 6.70

Banking Act 2009

s 93(8), 3.87 n244

Consumer Credit (Advertisements) Regulations 2004

reg 3(a), 4.38 n64

Conveyancing Act 1845, 2.59

Conveyancing Act 1881, 2.62

Crime and Disorder Act 1998

s 28, 6.70

Fire and Rescue Services Act 2004

s 19, 6.65 n69

s 20, 6.65 n69

s 32, 6.65 n69

s 33, 6.65 n69

Health and Social Care Act 2008

s 75(5), 7.68 n110

Human Rights Act 1998, 7.63 n99

Inquiries Act 2005, 6.100 n118

Land Registration Act 2002, 5.83 n129

Landlord and Tenant Act 1985

s 8, 3.64 n195

s 11, 3.64 n195

Law of Property Act 1925, 5.83

s 1(2), 2.7

s 44, 6.120 n150

s 45, 6.120 n150

s 52, 5.15 n8

s 56, 5.26 n54

s 60, 2.8

s 61, 6.42 n45, 6.72 n74

s 78, 7.48 n70, 8.18 n13

s 79, 8.18 n13



Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-60767-5 - Modern Legal Drafting: A Guide to Using Clearer Language: Third Edition

Peter Butt

Frontmatter More information

Table of statutes xvii

s 81, 6.72 n75

s 101(1), 5.15 n13

s 153, 5.15 n10

s 205, 2.8

Law of Property (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 1989

s 1, 5.17 n21

Law of Property (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 1994, 2.15 n14

Leases Act 1845

s 3, 2.59

Limitation Act 1980

s 5, 5.15 n14

s 8, 5.15 n14

Merchandise Marks Act 1862, 6.103 n121

Official Secrets Act 1920, 7.94

Oil in Navigable Waters Act 1963, 7.95 n150

Perpetuities and Accumulations Act 2009

s 14, 6.51

Powers of Attorney Act 1971

s 1(1), 5.15 n12

Proceedings in Courts of Justice Act 1730, 2.41 n68

Rent Act 1977, 5.60

Settled Land Act 1925

s 4(1), 5.15 n9

sch 1, 5.83

Small Print Bill 2008, 5.42

Solicitors' Remuneration Act 1881, 2.62

Solicitors' Remuneration Order 1883, 2.62 n119

Solicitors' Remuneration Order 1953, 2.62 n121

Solicitors' (Non-Contentious Business) Remuneration Order 1994, 2.64

Solicitors' (Non-Contentious Business) Remuneration Order 2009

cl 3, 2.63

Statute Law (Repeals) Act 1989, 2.59 n109

Statute of Additions 1413, 7.25 n43

Statute of Pleading 1356, 2.39 n62

Statute of Uses 1535, 2.70

Supply of Goods to Consumers Regulations 2002

cl 15(2), 4.38 n63

Timeshare Act 1992, 8.1 n1



```
Trustee Act 1925
s 39, 5.15 n11
Trusts of Land and Appointment of Trustees Act 1996
s 19(4), 5.15 n11
Unfair Terms in Consumer Contracts Regulations 1994, 4.38 n62
Unfair Terms in Consumer Contracts Regulations 1999
reg 5, 4.40
reg 7, 4.38
reg 8, 4.40
Wills Act 1837
s 9, 8.10
```

United States of America

```
Constitution
  Amdt 2, 7,105 n174
  Amdt 25 § 1, 7.33 n55
  Art II § 1, 7.33 n54
Executive Order 12044 1978, 4.29
Executive Order 12174 1979, 4.29 n37
Executive Order 12291 1981, 4.29 n37
Executive Order 12866 1993, 4.32
Executive Order 12988 1996, 4.32
Executive Order 13563 2011, 4.32
Federal Reserve Board Regulation Z, 12 CFR §226,
    4.31 n48
Plain Regulations Act 2012, 4.32 n52
Plain Writing Act of 2010
  s 2, 4.32
 s 3(1), 4.32
 s 3(2), 4.32
  s 4(b), 4.32
Texas Penal Code, 6.108
Truth in Lending Act 1968 15 USC §$1601–1667
  $$1601-1667, 4.31 n48
Uniform Commercial Code §2–316(2), 6.107
```



TABLE OF CASES

Australia

- 400 George Street (Qld) Pty Ltd v BG International Ltd [2010] QCA 245, 5.28 n61
- 400 George Street (Qld) Pty Ltd v BG International Ltd [2010] QSC 66, 5.28 n61, 6.122 n157
- 400 George Street (Qld) Pty Ltd v BG International [2011] HCATrans 122, 5.28 n61
- AAD Nominees Pty Ltd v Resource Management and Planning Appeal Tribunal [2011] TasFC 5, 3.10 n23
- Aboriginal Legal Service Ltd v Minister for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Affairs (1996) 69 FCR 565, 5.50 n99
- Airservices Australia v Canadian Airlines (1999) 202 CLR 133, 3.40 n113
- Alcan (NT) Alumina Pty Ltd v Commissioner of Territory Revenue (2009) 239 CLR 27, 6.89 n109
- Allianz Australia Workers Compensation (NSW) Ltd v PPG Industries Australia Pty Ltd (2004) 13 ANZ Insurance Cases 61–649, 3.36 n95
- Alpine Holdings Pty Ltd v Feinauer [2008] WASCA 85, 2.20 n28
- AMCI Investments Pty Ltd v Rio Doce Australia Pty Ltd [2008] QCA 387, 7.103 n167
- Amcor Ltd v Construction, Mining and Energy Union (2005) 222 CLR 241, 3.49 n148
- AMEC Engineering Pty Ltd v Shanks [2001] SASC 257, 3.44 n132
- Andar Transport Pty Ltd v Brambles Ltd (2004) 217 CLR 242, 3.36 n99
- Ansett Transport Industries (Operations) Pty Ltd v Commonwealth of Australia (1977) 139 CLR 54, 6.120 n151
- Ansett Transport Industries (Operations) Pty Ltd v Comptroller of Stamps (Vic) [1985] VR 70, 5.24 n50

xix



xx Table of cases

- Anstis v Secretary, Department of Social Security (1999) 94 FCR 421, 3.87 n245
- Attorney-General (Commonwealth) v Oates (1999) 198 CLR 162, 7.2 n2, 6.50 n56
- Attorney-General (New South Wales) v Dickson [1904] AC 273, 2.47 n83
- Australia and New Zealand Banking Group Ltd v University of Adelaide (1992) 59 SASR 587, 7.65 n104
- Australia Pacific Airports (Melbourne) Pty Ltd v Nuance Group (Australia) Pty Ltd [2005] VSCA 133, 3.32 n87
- Australian Broadcasting Commission v Australasian Performing Right Association Ltd (1973) 129 CLR 99, 3.19 n48, 3.51 n158
- Australian Competition and Consumer Commission v Henry Kaye [2004] FCA 1363, 5.44 n91
- Australian Guarantee Corporation Ltd v De Jager [1984] VR 483, 5.17 n24
- Australian Securities and Investment Commission v Fortescue Metals Group Ltd [2011] FCAFC 19, 6.120 n153
- Australian Securities and Investment Commission v Rich [2004] NSWSC 836, 4.23 n28
- Australian William E Simon Graduate School of Business Administration v Minister Administering the National Parks and Wildlife Act (NSW) (1994) 51 FCR 243, 6.117 n144
- Australis Media Holdings Pty Ltd v Telstra Corporation Ltd (1998) 43 NSWLR 104, 3.68 n205
- Automobile Fire and General Insurance Co of Australia Ltd v Davey (1936) 54 CLR 534, 6.42 n46
- AWB (International) Ltd v Tradesmen International (PVT) Ltd [2006] VSCA 210, 3.38 n107
- Bachmann Pty Ltd v BHP Power New Zealand Ltd [1999] 1 VR 420, 6.56 n58
- Backstop Nominees Pty Ltd v Goscor Pty Ltd [1990] VR 468, 5.25 n51
- Balani Pty Ltd v Gunns Ltd [2011] FCAFC 153, 3.49 n149
- Bankstown Airport Ltd v Noor Al Houda Islamic College Pty Ltd (2003) NSW ConvR 56–038, 6.28 n28
- Bell Group Ltd (in liq) v Westpac Banking Corp (No 9) [2008] WASC 239, 2.56 n97
- Betella v O'Leary [2001] WASCA 266, 6.89 n109



Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-60767-5 - Modern Legal Drafting: A Guide to Using Clearer Language: Third Edition Peter Butt

Frontmatter

More information

Table of cases xxi

BHP Petroleum (Australia) Pty Ltd v Sagasco South East Inc [2001] WASCA 159, 6.90 n110

Big River Timbers Pty Ltd v Stewart (1999) 9 BPR 16, 605, 7.100 n161

Birch v Australian Mutual Provident Society (1906) 4 CLR 324, 3.40 n113

Birdon Contracting Pty Ltd v Hawkesbury City Council (2009) 167 LGERA 178, 7.82 n125

Blomley v Ryan (1956) 99 CLR 362, 4.49 n93

Blunn v Cleaver (1993) 119 ALR 65, 3.92 n254, 4.12 n17

BP Refinery (Westernport) Pty Ltd v Shire of Hastings (1977) 180 CLR 266, 3.67 n202

Brambles Australia Ltd v Commissioner of Taxes (NT) (1993) 92 NTR 1, 6.85 n101, 6.85 n98

Brantag Pty Ltd v Minister for Mines (1994) 6 BPR 13, 695, 2.47 n83

Brennan v O'Meara [2009] NSWSC 1374, 3.48 n142

Breusch v Watts Development Division Pty Ltd (1987) 10 NSWLR 311, 3.40 n119

Bridge Wholesale Acceptance (Australia) Ltd v GVS Associates Pty Ltd [1991] ASC 56–105, 4.48 n91

Bridgewater v Leahy (1998) 194 CLR 457, 4.49 n93

Brien v Dwyer [1976] 2 NSWLR 420, 3.74 n218

Brien v Dwyer (1978) 141 CLR 378, 7.71 n116

Bropho v Human Rights and Equal Opportunity Commission (2004) 135 FCR 105, 6.115 n137

Bruce v Cole (1998) 45 NSWLR 163, 3.32 n86

Brygel v Stewart-Thornton [1992] 2 VR 387, 7.64 n100

Budget Stationery Supplies Pty Ltd v National Australia Bank Ltd (1996) 7 BPR 14, 891, 3.36 n101

Burnham v Carroll Musgrove Theatres Ltd (1928) 41 CLR 540, 3.40 n118

Burns Philp Hardware Ltd v Howard Chia Pty Ltd (1987) 8 NSWLR 642,

Burwood Project Management Pty Ltd v Polar Technologies International Pty Ltd (1999) 9 BPR 17, 355, 7.99 n158

Butt v McDonald (1896) 7 QLJ 68, 3.68 n203

Byrnes v Kendle [2011] HCA 26, 3.50 n153

Campbells Cash and Carry Pty Ltd v National Union of Workers, New South Wales Branch (No 2) (2001) 53 NSWLR 393, 5.66 n123

Carlton Shire Council v Ruse (1912) 14 CLR 220, 7.114 n191



xxii Table of cases

Chacmol Holdings Pty Ltd v Handberg [2005] FCAFC40, 6.121 n155

Chalmers Leask Underwriting Agencies v Mayne Nickless Ltd (1983) 155 CLR 279, 7.106 n178

Chase Oyster Bar Pty Ltd v Hamo Industries Pty Ltd (2011) 78 NSWLR 393, 7.77 n123

Chew v The Queen (1992) 173 CLR 626, 7.113 n186

Ciampa v NRMA Insurance Ltd (unreported, Bryson J, Supreme Court of NSW, 23 October 1989) \t, 3.58–3.61

Clay v Karlson (No 2) (1998) 19 WAR 287, 2.18 n19

Clemens v Flower [2006] 2 Qd R 510, 4.23 n27

Clerk v Equity Trustees Executors and Agency Co Ltd (1913) 15 CLR 625, 5.40 n74

Codelfa Construction Pty Ltd v State Rail Authority of New South Wales (1982) 149 CLR 337, 3.50 n153, 3.59 n174, 3.67 n202

Colby Corporation Pty Ltd v Commissioner of Taxation (2008) 165 FCR 133, 3.46 n137

Commercial Bank of Australia Ltd v Amadio (1983) 151 CLR 447, 4.49 n92

Commissioner of State Revenue v Pioneer Concrete (Vic) Pty Ltd (2002) 209 CLR 651, 2.47 n83

Committee of Direction of Fruit Marketing v Collins (1925) 36 CLR 410, 7.113 n186

Comptroller of Stamps v Associated Broadcasting Services Ltd [1990] VR 335, 5.25 n51

Conde v Gilfoyle [2010] QCA 109, 6.91 n114

Con-Stan Industries of Australia Pty Ltd v Norwich Winterhur Insurance (Australia) Ltd (1986) 160 CLR 226, 3.65 n198

Corporate Affairs Commission (SA) v Australian Central Credit Union (1985) 157 CLR 201, 6.87 n105

Craig Williamson Pty Ltd v Barrowcliff [1915] VLR 450, 6.29 n31

Creswell v Potter [1978] 1 WLR 255, 4.49 n92

Crowley v Templeton (1914) 17 CLR 457, 5.83 n131

Cypjayyne Pty Ltd v Babcock and Brown International Pty Ltd [2011] NSWCA 173, 7.15 n21

Dainford Ltd v Tari Nominees Pty Ltd (1985) Q ConvR 54–162, 3.42 n125

Darlington Futures Ltd v Delco Australia Pty Ltd (1986) 161 CLR 500, 3.38 n107

Datt v Law Society of New South Wales (1981) 35 ALR 523, 6.115 n139



More information

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-60767-5 - Modern Legal Drafting: A Guide to Using Clearer Language: Third Edition Peter Butt Frontmatter

Table of cases xxiii

David Securities Pty Ltd v Commonwealth Bank of Australia (1990) 23 FCR 1, 3.81 n234

De Kupyer v Crafter [1942] SASR 238, 7.5 n6

Dean v Lloyd (1991) 3 WAR 235, 5.25 n51, 5.25 n52

Delnorth Pty Ltd v State Bank of New South Wales (1995) 17 ACSR 379, 7.19 n35

Deputy Commissioner of Taxation v Clark (2003) 45 ACSR 332, 3.26 n74 Deputy Federal Commissioner of Taxation v Carpenter [1959] VR 470, 7.102 n166

Director of Housing v Pavletic (2003) V ConvR 54-668, 6.57 n59

Director of Public Prosecutions v George (2008) 102 SASR 246, 7.65 n105

Discount and Finance Ltd v Gehrig's Wines Ltd (1940) 57 WN (NSW) 226, 6.120 n146

D'Orta-Ekenaike v Victoria Legal Aid (2005) 223 CLR 1, 2.20 n28

DPP v Dickfoss (2011) 28 NTLR 71, 7.65 n106

DTR Nominees Pty Ltd v Mona Homes Pty Ltd (1978) 138 CLR 423, 3.49 n145

Duperouzel v Cameron [1973] WAR 181, 6.90 n111

Eccleston v O'Keefe [2007] NSWSC 159, 2.9 n3

Eddy Lau Constructions Pty Ltd v Transdevelopment Enterprise Pty Ltd [2004] NSWSC 754, 7.2 n2

EDWF Holdings 1 Pty Ltd v EDWF Holdings 2 Pty Ltd (2010) 41 WAR 23, 3.20 n51

Ellison v Vukicevic (1986) 7 NSWLR 104, 5.17 n24

Emanuel (Rundle Mall) Pty Ltd v Commissioner of Stamps (1986) 39 SASR 583, 2.47 n83

Emanuel (Rundle Mall) Pty Ltd v Commissioner of Stamps (1986) 41 SASR 122, 2.47 n83

Eureka Funds Management Ltd v Freehills Services Pty Ltd (2008) 19 VR 676, 6.30 n33

F and D Normoyle Pty Ltd v Transfield Pty Ltd (2005) 63 NSWLR 502, 3.36 n99

F J Richards Pty Ltd v Mills Pty Ltd (unreported, Kelly SPJ, Qld SC, 14 September 1990), 5.25 n53

Fadden v Deputy Commissioner of Taxation (1943) 68 CLR 76, 7.99 n156

FAI General Insurance Co Ltd v Parras (2002) 55 NSWLR 498, 8.6 n4

FAI General Insurance Co Ltd v Spannagle [2000] QSC 2, 3.93 n260



xxiv Table of cases

Farrow Mortgage Services Pty Ltd v Hogg (1995) 64 SASR 450, 5.16 n20, 5.25 n51

Federal Commissioner of Taxation v Gallard (1986) 162 CLR 408, 5.24 n50 Federal Commissioner of Taxation v Taylor (1929) 42 CLR 80, 5.22 n43, 5.23 n48, 5.24 n50

Fell v Fell (1922) 31 CLR 268, 3.40 n116

Ferrier v Wilson (1906) 4 CLR 785, 7.5 n5

Fisher v Westpac Banking Corporation (1993) 43 FCR 385, 5.24 n50

Fitzgerald v Masters (1956) 95 CLR 420, 3.62 n192

Forge v Australian Securities and Investment Commission (2006) 228 CLR 45, 5.52 n101

Forrest v Nix [2012] NSWSC 493, 6.49 n55

Foster v Hall [2012] NSWCA 122, 7.15 n20

Franklins Pty Ltd v Metcash Trading Ltd (2009) 76 NSWLR 603, 3.49 n147, 3.51 n159, 3.59 n174, 5.33 n66, 6.83 n94, 6.120 n151, 6.121 n154, 6.121 n156

G M and A M Pearce and Co Pty Ltd v R G M Australia Pty Ltd (1998) 16 ACLC 429, 3.92 n256

Galcif Pty Ltd v Dudley's Corner Pty Ltd (1995) 6 BPR 14, 134, 3.69 n210

Galland v Federal Commissioner of Taxation (1984) 15 ATR 200, 5.24 n50

Gardiner v Agricultural and Rural Finance Pty Ltd [2007] NSWCA 235, 3.36 n99

Gelzinis v T and R (Murray Bridge) Pty Ltd (2009) 103 SASR 194, 3.25 n70

Genders v Ajax Insurance Co Ltd (1950) 81 CLR 470, 6.81 n89

George Hudson Holdings Ltd v Rudder (1973) 128 CLR 387, 7.65 n105

George T Collings (Australia) Pty Ltd v H F Stevenson (1991) ASC 56–051, 5.43 n83

George v Cluning (1979) 28 ALR 57, 5.32 n63

Gibb v Registrar of Titles (1940) 63 CLR 503, 5.83 n131

Goldsbrough v Ford Credit Australia Ltd (1989) ASC 55–946, 3.8 n15, 4.48 n91, 5.43 n83

GPT RE Ltd v Lend Lease Real Estate Investments Ltd [2005] NSWSC 964, 8.8 n7

Grant v John Grant and Sons Pty Ltd (1954) 91 CLR 112, 3.86 n241, 6.120 n146

Green v The Queen [2000] NTCCA 1, 7.99 n159

Gunns Limited v Balani Pty Ltd [2011] FCA 431, 3.49 n149



Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-60767-5 - Modern Legal Drafting: A Guide to Using Clearer Language: Third Edition

Peter Butt

Frontmatter

More information

Table of cases xxv

Gyarfas v Bray (1990) NSW ConvR 55-519, 8.18 n13

Halford v Price (1960) 105 CLR 23, 3.37 n103

Hall v Jones (1942) 42 SR (NSW) 203, 6.89 n109

Halwood Corporation Ltd v Roads Corporation [1998] 2 VR 439, 3.92 n257, 7.63 n97

Hammer Waste Pty Ltd v QBE Mercantile Mutual Ltd (2002) 12 ANZ Insurance Cases 61–553, 3.36 n95

Hatton v Beaumont (1978) 20 ALR 314, 7.60 n91

Hawkins v Pender Bros Pty Ltd [1990] 1 Qd R 135, 7.12 n17, 7.16 n26

Health Partners Inc v Gonos (1996) 67 SASR 338, 3.70 n212

Hepples v Commissioner of Taxation (1990) 22 FCR 1, 6.83 n95

Herald and Weekly Times Ltd v Vlassakis (2003) SASR 70, 7.94 n143

HEST Australia Ltd v McInerney (1998) 71 SASR 526, 3.36 n95

Hill v Van Erp (1997) 188 CLR 159, 2.20 n27

Home Building Society Ltd v Pourzland [2005] WASCA 242, 7.93 n142

Homeowners Insurance Pty Ltd v Job (1993) 2 ANZ Insurance Cases 60–535, 3.74 n218, 3.77 n224

Hospital Products Ltd v United Surgical Corp (1984) 156 CLR 41, 7.15 n21

Houlahan v Australian and New Zealand Banking Group Ltd (1992) 110 FLR 259, 3.7 n13

House of Peace Pty Ltd v Bankstown City Council (2000) 48 NSWLR 498, 3.18 n43

Howie v Youth Justice Court (2010) 27 NTLR 132, 7.65 n105

Hudson v Minister for Immigration and Citizenship [2010] FCAFC 119, 5.70 n127

Hume Steel Ltd v Attorney-General for Victoria (1927) 39 CLR 455, 3.43 n129

Hume v Perpetual Trustees Executors and Agency Co of Tasmania (1939) 62 CLR 242, 6.113 n135

ING Funds Management Ltd v ANZ Nominees Ltd [2009] NSWSC 243, 5.15 n15

Insight Vacations Pty Ltd v Young (2011) 243 CLR 149, 3.85 n239

Interchase Corporation Ltd v Commissioner of Stamp Duties (Qld) (1993) 27 ATR 154, 5.25 n51, 5.47 n95

International Air Transport Association v Ansett Australia Holdings Ltd (2008) 234 CLR 151, 3.49 n145, 3.59 n174



Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-60767-5 - Modern Legal Drafting: A Guide to Using Clearer Language: Third Edition

Peter Butt Frontmatter More information

xxvi Table of cases

Interstar Wholesale Finance Pty Ltd v Integral Home Loans Pty Ltd [2008] NSWCA 319, 3.81 n232

J Fenwick and Co Pty Ltd v Federal Steam Navigation Co Ltd (1943) 44 SR (NSW) 1, 3.37 n106

Jamieson v Allen (1863) 2 W&W (E) 47, 2.21 n31

Jenkins v Visualeyes Pty Ltd [2005] VSC 218, 7.73 n119

John While and Sons Pty Ltd v Changleng (1985) 2 NSWLR 163, 3.18 n42

Johnson v American Home Assurance Co (1998) 192 CLR 266, 3.37 n103

Jones v Bartlett (2000) 205 CLR 166, 5.26 n55

Joseph Street Pty Ltd v Tan [2012] VCA 113, 7.16 n27

Karam v Australia and New Zealand Banking Group Ltd [2001] NSWSC 709, 3.9 n19

Karfoal Pty Ltd v Lorence [2002] NSWSC 284, 3.47 n141

Kendle v Melsom (1998) 72 ALJR 560, 8.19 n15

Kerr v Meates (1991) ANZ ConvR 110, 5.17 n25

Kevest v Spiteri [2002] NSWSC 22, 3.76 n222

KJRR Pty Ltd v Commissioner of State Revenue (1999) 99 ATC 4335, 7.45 n65

La v Federated Furnishing Trade Society of Australasia (1993) 113 ALR 137, 7.64 n102

Lamont v Commissioner for Railways (1963) 80 WN (NSW) 1242, 6.85 n100

Lavercombe v Auscott Ltd (2006) 58 ACSR 586, 3.87 n243

Leach v The Queen (2007) 230 CLR 1, 7.66 n108

Leahy v Austwin Management Services Pty Ltd [2011] QCA 186, 5.62 n120

Legal and General Insurance Australia Ltd v Eather (1986) 6 NSWLR 390, 3.72 n216

Lend Lease Real Estate Investments Ltd v GPT RE Ltd [2006] NSWCA 207, 3.24 n65

Leonard v Booth (1954) 91 CLR 452, 5.15 n7

Lewis Construction (Engineering) Pty Ltd v Southern Electric Authority of Queensland (1976) 50 ALJR 769, 5.32 n63

Lewis v Bell (1985) 1 NSWLR 731, 7.45 n65

Lewis v Nortex Pty Ltd [2001] NSWSC 511, 6.122 n158

Lezam Pty Ltd v Seabridge Australia Pty Ltd (1992) 35 FCR 535, 5.43 n88

Lift Capital Partners Pty Ltd v Merrill Lynch International [2009] NSWSC 7, 5.15 n16, 5.19 n35



Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-60767-5 - Modern Legal Drafting: A Guide to Using Clearer Language: Third Edition

Peter Butt Frontmatter More information

Table of cases xxvii

LMI Australasia Pty Ltd v Baulderstone Hornibrook Pty Ltd [2003] NSWCA 74, 3.58 n173

Lockrey v Historic Houses Trust of New South Wales [2012] NSWCA 249, 3.22 n56

Mandalidis v Artline Contractors Pty Ltd (1999) 47 NSWLR 568, 3.32 n86

Manton v Parabolic Pty Ltd (1985) 2 NSWLR 361, 5.14 n5, 5.25 n51

Manufacturers' Mutual Insurance Ltd v Withers (1988) 5 ANZ Insurance Cases 60–853, 3.60 n182, 7.104 n169

Maye v Colonial Mutual Life Assurance Society Ltd (1924) 35 CLR 14, 3.20 n53

MBF Investments Pty Ltd v Nolan [2011] VSCA 114, 3.49 n146, 3.59 n174

McCann v Switzerland Insurance Australia Ltd (2000) 203 CLR 579,

3.23 n59, 3.31 n83, 3.38 n107, 3.70 n211

McCourt v Cranston [2012] WASCA 60, 3.59 n174

McDermott v Black (1940) 63 CLR 161, 5.15 n17

McGowan v Commissioner of Stamp Duties [2002] 2 Qd R 499, 3.44 n132

McHugh Holdings Pty Ltd v Newtown Colonial Hotels Pty Ltd (2008) 73 NSWLR 53, 3.62 n193

McKinlay v Dodds (1984) NSW ConvR 55-188, 5.25 n51

McMahons Tavern Pty Ltd v Suncorp Metway Insurance Ltd (2004) 89 SASR 125, 3.38 n107

Mikhman v Royal Victorian Aero Club [2012] VSC 42, 7.64 n102

Millen v Grove [1945] VLR 259, 7.99 n157

Minister for Immigration and Ethnic Affairs v Sciascia (1991) 31 FCR 364, 3.87 n245

Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs v Savvin (2000) 61 ALD 107, 7.109 n184, 7.114 n190

Minister for Immigration v Hughes (1999) 86 FCR 567, 6.115 n137

Minister for Mineral Resources v Brantag Pty Ltd (1997) 8 BPR 15, 815, 2.47 n83, 3.36 n100

Minister for Urban Affairs and Planning v Rosemount Estates Pty Ltd (1996) 91 LGERA 31, 5.49 n98

Minister of State for the Army v Dalziel (1944) 68 CLR 261, 6.114 n136, 6.115 n139

Mirzikinian v Waterhouse Pty Ltd [2009] NSWCA 296, 5.22 n43, 5.23 n48

Missing Link Network Integration Pty Ltd v Olamte Pty Ltd [2005] NSWSC 430, 3.44 n131



xxviii Table of cases

Miwa Pty Ltd v Siantan Properties Pty Ltd [2011] NSWCA 297, 3.6 n9

MLC Ltd v O'Neill [2001] NSWCA 161, 3.38 n107

Monarch Petroleum NL v Citco Australia Petroleum Ltd [1986] WAR 310, 5.22 n43, 5.23 n48, 5.24 n49

Nada Shah v Sleeman (1917) 19 WALR 119, 6.78 n85

National Australia Bank Ltd v Hall (1993) ASC 56-234, 4.48 n91

National Australia Bank Ltd v Nobile (1988) ATPR 40-855, 4.48 n91

National Outdoor Advertising Pty Ltd v Wavon (1988) 4 BPR 973, 7.44 n63

Neumann Dredging Co Ltd v Collector of Customs (1987) 79 ALR 588, 6.87 n105

New South Wales Aboriginal Land Council v Minister Administering the Crown Lands Act (1988) 14 NSWLR 685, 7.66 n108

New South Wales Rugby League Ltd v Australian Rugby Football League Ltd (1999) 30 ASCR 354, 3.10 n21

Nicholls v Public Trustee (South Australia) (1945) 72 CLR 86, 6.113 n134

Noarlunga District Council v Coventry [1967] SASR 71, 6.86 n103

North v Marina (2003) 11 BPR 21, 359, 3.38 n107

NRMA Insurance Ltd v Collier (1996) 9 ANZ Insurance Cases 76, 717, 3.92 n258

NRMA Insurance Ltd v McCarney (1992) 7 ANZ Insurance Cases 61–146, 4.23 n27

NSW Rifle Association v Commonwealth of Australia (unreported, Powell JA, New South Wales Court of Appeal, 15 August 1997), 3.9 n20

NZI Capital Corporation Pty Ltd v Child (1991) 23 NSWLR 481, 3.13 n27

O'Brien v Heathcote (1982) 7 A Crim R 104, 6.85 n98

O'Loughlin v Mount (1998) 71 SASR 206, 6.121 n155

One. Tel Ltd v Rich (2005) 190 FLR 443, 5.68 n124

Orleans Investments Pty Ltd v Mindshare Communications Ltd [2009] NSWCA 40, 5.33 n66

Owners SP 46528 v Hall [2009] NSWSC 278, 7.64 n102

Pacific Carriers Ltd v BNP Paribas (2004) 218 CLR 451, 3.13 n25, 3.14 n29, 3.59 n174

Palm Beach Lands Pty Ltd v Marshall (1988) NSW ConvR 55-411, 7.48 n70

Parland Pty Ltd v Mariposa Pty Ltd (1995) Tas R 121, 7.12 n17

Parmalat Australia Ltd v Norco Co-operative Ltd [2006] QCA 129, 3.78 n228



Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-60767-5 - Modern Legal Drafting: A Guide to Using Clearer Language: Third Edition

Peter Butt

Frontmatter More information

Table of cases xxix

Perpetual Executors and Trustees Association of Australia Ltd v Hosken (1912) 14 CLR 286, 5.83 n131

Phoenix Commercial Enterprises Pty Ltd v City of Canada Bay Council [2010] NSWCA 64, 3.17 n37, 3.49 n148

Piccolo v National Australia Bank Ltd [2000] FCA 187, 3.20 n51, 3.91 n253

Prime Constructions Pty Ltd v Westbridge Investments Pty Ltd [2004] NSWSC 861, 5.23 n48

Provincial Insurance Australia Pty Ltd v Consolidated Wood Products Pty Ltd (1991) 25 NSWLR 541, 3.18 n41, 3.18 n42, 3.18 n47

PSAL Ltd v Kellas-Sharpe [2012] QSC 31, 3.81 n234

Public Trustee of Queensland v Fortress Credit Corporation (Australia) 11 Pty Ltd (2010) 241 CLR 286, 6.68 n73

R A and K Becker Pty Ltd v Cariste Pty Ltd (2001) 11 BPR 20, 111, 6.95 n116

R v Australian Teachers' Union [1993] FCA 209, 7.106 n177

R v Central Cane Prices Board; Ex parte Colonial Sugar Refining Co Ltd [1917] St R Qd 1, 6.31 n36

R v Cooke [2003] SASC 403, 7.70 n115

R v Jasper (2003) 139 A Crim R 329, 7.5 n4, 7.100 n161

R v Lavender (2005) 79 ALJR 1337, 3.38 n108

R v McN [1963] SR (NSW) 186, 6.75 n78

R v N, RC (2012) 112 SASR 399, 7.74 n121

R v Regos (1947) 74 CLR 613, 3.26 n71

Radaich v Smith (1959) 101 CLR 209, 7.45 n65

Rava v Logan Wines [2007] NSWCA 62, 3.38 n108

Re A and K Holdings Pty Ltd [1964] VR 257, 5.26 n58

Re Award Simplification Decision (1997) 75 IR 272, 4.45 n86

Re BHP Billiton Pty Ltd and Chief Executive Officer of Customs [2002] AATA 705, 6.87 n104

Re Carile [1920] VLR 427, 5.19 n32

Re Davis (1947) 75 CLR 409, 7.65 n104

Re Griffiths [1926] VLR 212, 6.40 n42

Re Halliday [1925] SASR 104, 7.56 n79

Re McPherson [1968] VR 368, 7.56 n76

Re Moage Ltd (1998) 153 ALR 711, 7.102 n162

Re Peat Resources of Australia Pty Ltd (2004) 181 FLR 454, 7.94 n145

Re Phillip Andrew Balyl (1994) 75 A Crim R 575, 7.64 n100

Re Rowlands [1973] VR 225, 7.56 n76



xxx Table of cases

Re Sewell [1929] SASR 226, 7.56 n79

Reed Construction Services Pty Ltd v Kheng Seng (Australia) Pty Ltd (1998) 15 BCL 158, 6.56 n58, 7.54 n73

Rich v CGU Insurance Ltd (2005) 79 ALJR 856, 3.38 n111

Riltang Pty Ltd v L Pty Ltd (2002) 11 BPR 20, 281, 7.27 n49

Roberts v Gilgandra Shire Council [2008] NSWSC 1244, 2.47 n83

Robina Syndicate Pty Ltd v RPA Properties Pty Ltd [2011] QCA 151, 6.40 n43

Rogers v Whitaker (1992) 175 CLR 479, 2.20 n30

Rose and Burgess and Topex Nominees v Commissioner of Stamps (SA) (1979) 22 SASR 84, 5.25 n52

Rose v Rose (1986) 7 NSWLR 679, 5.22 n43

Ross v NRMA Life Ltd (1993) 7 ANZ Insurance Cases 61–170, 4.23 n27

Ruapehu Alpine Lifts Ltd v State Insurance Ltd (1998) 10 ANZ Insurance Cases 61–404, 3.26 n72, 3.36 n95

Russo v Aiello (2003) 215 CLR 643, 5.50 n100

Ryland Brothers (Australia) Ltd v Morgan (1926) 27 SR (NSW) 161, 3.32 n86

Ryledar Pty Ltd v Euphoric Pty Ltd (2007) 69 NSWLR 603, 3.59 n174 Saloma Pty Ltd v Big Country Developments Pty Ltd (1997) 8 BPR 15, 935, 2 27 p43

Samad v District Court of New South Wales (2000) 50 NSWLR 270, 7.66 n108

Sandra Investments Pty Ltd v Booth (1983) 153 CLR 153, 3.31 n84 Sanko Steamship Co Ltd v Sumitomo Australia Ltd (No 2) (1996) 63 FCR 227, 3.13 n27

Scaffidi v Perpetual Trustees Victoria Ltd [2011] WASCA 159, 5.15 n17 Schellenberg v Tunnell Holdings Pty Ltd (2000) 74 ALJR 743, 7.19 n35

SCN Pty Ltd v Smith [2006] QCA 360, 3.30 n82

Scook v Premier Building Solutions Pty Ltd (2003) 28 WAR 124, 5.19 n31, 5.22 n44, 5.23 n48

Secured Income Real Estate (Australia) Ltd v St Martins Investments Pty Ltd (1979) 144 CLR 596, 3.68 n203

Segboer v A J Richardson Properties Pty Ltd [2012] NSWCA 253, 5.20 n41 Seven Network Limited v News Limited [2007] FCA 1062, 2.56 n96

Shop Distributive and Allied Employees' Association v Woolworths Ltd (2006) 151 FCR 513, 6.32 n37