Understanding and Improving Human Data Relations

Alex Bowyer

Table of Contents

# Frontmatter

### Abstract

Technologies including PCs, smartphones, and cloud computing have transformed the world: In our daily lives we interact with many businesses and public services who (to reduce costs) increasingly seek to rely on data collection and processing rather than face-to-face user interactions to inform their decisions. This creates an *imbalance of power* between those who hold data and the individuals about whom data is stored, who cannot easily see their personal data or how it is used. This *Digital Civics* PhD research explores, from a pragmatic, constructivist perspective, the topic of *Human Data Relations*. Through two qualitative case studies across public and private sectors, it answers the question, *“What relationship do people need with their personal data?”*. Case Study One focuses on *Early Help* social care: Through four workshops with supported families, social workers and staff, a deep understanding of the individual perspective on civic personal data use is established. *Shared data interaction* is explored as a means to shift the balance of power towards the individual while maintaining an effective care relationship. Case Study Two is a three-month study exploring 10 participants’ experience of using *GDPR data access rights* to view their own data, resulting in insights into individual needs and the challenges of data-centric service relationships, and recommendations for improvement of policies and practices. With reference to literature from the fields of *Personal Information Management*, *Human Data Interaction* and *MyData* personal data ecosystems, these case studies contribute to a unified understanding of *six core needs* that people have in Human Data Relations. In the final chapter, the thesis discusses the *practical pursuit* of these goals, drawing on first-hand knowledge acquired from expert participation in industrial research projects at BBC R&D and Hestia.ai/SITRA, mapping out the *landscape for future research and innovation*.

# Acknowledgements

# Lists of Tables and Figures

## Lists of Tables by Chapter

### Tables in Chapter 3

* [**Table 3.1**](#table-3.1) - Context One (Civic Data & Early Help): Participants involved in Research Activities leading into Case Study One.
* [**Table 3.2**](#table-3.2) - Context Two (Digital Life): Participants Involved in Digital Life Research Activities Leading into Case Study Two.

### Tables in Chapter 4

* [**Table 4.1**](#table-4.1) - Example Categories of Family Civic Data
* [**Table 4.2**](#table-4.2) - Case Study One Group Design Workshops
* [**Table 4.3**](#table-4.3) - Theme 1 - Meaningful Data Interaction for Families: Subthemes & Participant Quotes
* [**Table 4.4**](#table-4.4) - Theme 2 - Giving a Voice to the Family: Subthemes & Participant Quotes
* [**Table 4.5**](#table-4.5) - Theme 3 - Earning Families’ Trust Through Transparency: Subthemes & Participant Quotes

### Tables in Chapter 5

* [**Table 5.1**](#table-5.1) - Types of Data Holding Organisation Targeted for GDPR Requests by Study Participants
* [**Table 5.2**](#table-5.2) - Types of Personal Data Potentially Accessible from Data Holders via GDPR Rights
* [**Table 5.3**](#table-5.3) - Presence and Quality Assessments of GDPR Responses by Data Type (as Percentages)
* [**Table 5.4**](#table-5.4) - Best and Worst Data Holders in Different Categories, According to Participants’ Judgements
* [**Table 5.5**](#table-5.5) - Participants’ Hopes, Imagined Data Uses and Goals for GDPR, as well as Resultant Outcomes
* [**Table 5.6**](#table-5.6) - Theme 1 - Insufficient Transparency: Subthemes & Participant Quotes
* [**Table 5.7**](#table-5.7) - Theme 2 - Confusing & Unusable Data: Subthemes & Participant Quotes
* [**Table 5.8**](#table-5.8) - Theme 3 - Fragile Relationships: Subthemes & Participant Quotes

### Tables in Chapter 7

* [**Table 7.1**](#table-7.1) - Eight lenses on Personal Data\*\*

## Lists of Figures by Chapter

### Figures in Chapter 1

* [**Figure 1.1**](#figure-1.1) - Poster Presentation of Case Study One
* [**Figure 1.2**](#figure-1.2) - The Structure of This Thesis

### Figures in Chapter 2

* [**Figure 2.1**](#figure-2.1) - The Wisdom Curve: Making Data into Meaningful Information
* [**Figure 2.2**](#figure-2.2) - Li *et al.*’s Stage-based Model of Personal Informatics Systems

### Figures in Chapter 3

* [**Figure 3.1**](#figure-3.1) - My Action Research Approach
* [**Figure 3.2**](#figure-3.2) - “Family Facts” – What is Data?
* [**Figure 3.3**](#figure-3.3) - Walls of Data – Sensitising Participants to the World of Commercially-held Data and GDPR
* [**Figure 3.4**](#figure-3.4) - Sentence Ranking – Bringing Support Workers and Families to a Shared Problem Space
* [**Figure 3.5**](#figure-3.5) - Family Civic Data Cards – Things to Think With
* [**Figure 3.6**](#figure-3.6) - Personal Data Examples – Making Data Relatable
* [**Figure 3.7**](#figure-3.7) - Home Interviewing: Card Sorting With a Family in Their Living Room
* [**Figure 3.8**](#figure-3.8) - Ideation Decks – Combining Random Design Ingredients to Generate New Ideas
* [**Figure 3.9**](#figure-3.9) - Group Poster Design – A Participant-designed Poster to Advertise Features of Imagined Data Interface Products
* [**Figure 3.10**](#figure-3.10) - Storyboarding Cards – A Collaboratively-constructed Narrative Created through Discussion From a Palette of Possible Parent and Staff Actions
* [**Figure 3.11**](#figure-3.11) - Thematic Analysis of Qualitative Data using Quirkos for Case Study One
* [**Figure 3.12**](#figure-3.12) - Spreadsheet-based Quantitative Analysis of Interview Data for Case Study Two
* [**Figure 3.13**](#figure-3.13) - Pilot Study Recruitment Poster
* [**Figure 3.14**](#figure-3.14) - How the Case Studies and Peripheral Activities Contribute to This Thesis

### Figures in Chapter 4

* [**Figure 4.1**](#figure-4.1) - Participants’ Shared Values Deduced from Sentence Rankings Data
* [**Figure 4.2**](#figure-4.2) - Current Model of Data Interaction, and Proposed Model of Shared Data Interaction

### Figures in Chapter 5

* [**Figure 5.1**](#figure-5.1) - A Journey Map of Each Participant’s Study Progression
* [**Figure 5.2**](#figure-5.2) - An Example Life Sketch from Interview 1, with Data Handling Companies in Red, Data Types in Blue, and Feelings in Green
* [**Figure 5.3**](#figure-5.3) - Sankey Overview of Participants’ GDPR Requests
* [**Figure 5.4**](#figure-5.4) - Longitudinal Distribution of Net Changes in Participants’ Perceived Power and Trust Scores
* [**Figure 5.5**](#figure-5.5) - Perceived Power Balance Between Individual and Data Holder at Different Stages of the GDPR/Study Process
* [**Figure 5.6**](#figure-5.6) - Participants’ Perceived Trust in Provider at Different Stages of the GDPR/Study Process

### Figures in Chapter 7

* [**Figure 7.1**](#figure-7.1) - The Two Motivations for HDR: Controlling Your Personal Data Ecosystem and Utilising Your Information About Your Life
* [**Figure 7.2**](#figure-7.2) - Mapping the Six Wants into Objectives for the HDR Opportunity Landscape
* [**Figure 7.3**](#figure-7.3) - Obstacles and Resulting Insights in the HDR Opportunity Landscape
* [**Figure 7.4**](#figure-7.4) - Life Concept Modelling
* [**Figure 7.5**](#figure-7.5) - Mockup of a Unified TV Viewing History Interface
* [**Figure 7.6**](#figure-7.6) - SubsCrab: An Example Application for Ecosystem Detection and Visualisation
* [**Figure 7.7**](#figure-7.7) - Some of the Many Aspects of Metadata that Might Exist About a Datapoint or Dataset
* [**Figure 7.8**](#figure-7.8) - The Panopticon Structure of the Illinois State Penitentiary
* [**Figure 7.9**](#figure-7.9) - Human Values, as Identified in BBC R&D Research Funded by Nesta
* [**Figure 7.10**](#figure-7.10) - A Contact-and-Calendar-centric PDS Approach
* [**Figure 7.11**](#figure-7.11) - The Scattered Data Relating to a Vacation
* [**Figure 7.12**](#figure-7.12) - Mockup of a Unified Interface for a Vacation
* [**Figure 7.13**](#figure-7.13) - Annotating Data with Semantic Context
* [**Figure 7.14**](#figure-7.14) - Theory of Change [ToC]: The Four Dimensions of Change
* [**Figure 7.15**](#figure-7.15) - HDR Approach 1: Discovery-Driven Activism
* [**Figure 7.16**](#figure-7.16) - HDR Approach 2: Building the Human-centric Future
* [**Figure 7.17**](#figure-7.17) - Conceptual Model for a Personal Data Store System
* [**Figure 7.18**](#figure-7.18) - High Level Data Types
* [**Figure 7.19**](#figure-7.19) - Life Information Modelled as Happenings
* [**Figure 7.20**](#figure-7.20) - A Simple PDS Life Information Presentation Model
* [**Figure 7.21**](#figure-7.21) - Mockup of Life Information Presented in a PDS Interface
* [**Figure 7.22**](#figure-7.22) - Life Partitioning Analogy using a Cluedo™ board
* [**Figure 7.23**](#figure-7.23) - Mockup: Browsing By Areas of Life
* [**Figure 7.24**](#figure-7.24) - Identifying Entity Associations in Data
* [**Figure 7.25**](#figure-7.25) - Facebook’s World2vec Model, Semantically Modelling Human Information from Social Media Posts on Facebook
* [**Figure 7.26**](#figure-7.26) - Identifying the Attributes of Data
* [**Figure 7.27**](#figure-7.27) - Determining The Nature of a Piece of Data
* [**Figure 7.28**](#figure-7.28) - Attributes of Data
* [**Figure 7.29**](#figure-7.29) - Actions One Might Perform on Life Information
* [**Figure 7.30**](#figure-7.30) - Questions One Might Ask of Life Information
* [**Figure 7.31**](#figure-7.31) - Example Taxonomies For Life Information Navigation
* [**Figure 7.32**](#figure-7.32) - HDR Approach 3: Defending User Autonomy and Hacking the Information Landscape
* [**Figure 7.33**](#figure-7.33) - The Modern ‘Black Box’ View of Technology
* [**Figure 7.34**](#figure-7.34) - HDR Approach 4: Winning Hearts and Minds: Teaching, Championing and Selling the Vision
* [**Figure 7.35**](#figure-7.35) - SILVER Health Data Viewing Interface
* [**Figure 7.36**](#figure-7.36) - Summary of Generalised Change Strategies for Pursuing Better HDR, Using the ToC Model

### Figures in Appendix C

* [**Figure C.1**](#figure-C.1) - Screenshot From Quirkos During Coding Process
* [**Figure C.2**](#figure-C.2) - Screenshot From Quirkos at End of Coding Process
* [**Figure C.3**](#figure-C.3) - Screenshot From Workflowy During Theme Construction

### Figures in Appendix F

* [**Figure F.1**](#figure-D.1) - Private Data Viewing Monitor with Viewing Glasses

# Bibliography