evaluating matches between data sets in R

alexis dhembe, lesley university library

the problem

At the Lesley library, we have several projects and recurring tasks that require comparing data between our ILS and other systems, such as student data from the bursar's office, or holdings data from our knowledge base. Because the two information sources were not always perfectly matched, previous workflows involved a lot of manual review in order to account for discrepancies between the two sources.



the goal

I wanted to find a more efficient way to compare data sets, but I knew that we would have outliers that required some individual review. My goal was to find a way to compare the majority of records computationally, so staff only had to manually review records that actually warranted it.

Not all of the data sets had matching key identifiers I could use, so I also needed to account for a little fuzziness.

two use cases

01

For Patron Data

Each semester, we get a list of students who intend to graduate at the next conferral date. We wanted a better way to compare that to our patron data from the ILS to determine which students still had items checked out. We could match these accounts based on an institutional ID number, but I wanted to confirm that we didn't assign an ID number to the wrong patron at registration, or use an in-use ID as a "generic" stand-in. To typo is to be human, after all.

02

For Holdings Data

We had a mystery package in our knowledge base that looked like it was meant to represent our print journal holdings, but details on the titles (such as ISSNs) were sparse. I wanted to compare the package to our current ILS holdings, but I needed to differentiate when something wasn't an exact match because of the difference between "Journal of..." and "Journal for..." or the difference between "i-D" and "Ms."

enter: R's stringdist package

I've been using R (especially the tidyverse) to do a lot of the data wrangling that results from having information spread across several different systems, each with their own quirks. I knew I wanted to be able to compare inexact matches, and I wanted to be able to 'rank' those matches, so I could extract the more questionable ones for review.

R's stringdist package ended up being a perfect fit for my needs. stringdist provides fuzzy string matching capabilities based on various string distance measures. The basic stringdist function calculates the distance between two strings, e.g. the difference between "ABC" and "ACAB."

stringsim takes this distance, divides it by the maximum possible distance, and subtracts it from 1. This produces a value where 1 is perfect similarity, and 0 is completely dissimilar-precisely the kind of 'score' I could use to evaluate and rank matches.

evaluating student data

I wanted to review records where the ID# matched between the bursar's records and ours, but the name differed. I created an additional key by combining last and first name into a single string. I joined the two tables on ID#, then used stringsim to create a new column comparing the name-key from the bursar records with ours. In order to err on the side of caution, given that this was a new workflow, everything with a similarity below 0.9 was flagged for additional review by library staff.

```
> grad_patrons %>% filter(SIMILARITY<0.9)
# A tibble: 79 x 11
       ID NAMEKEY.x
                            LAST.x
                                      FIRST.x
                                                 GRAD_DATE
                                                            NAMEKEY.y
                                                                              LAST.y
                                                                                         FIRST.y
                                                                                                   GROUP
                                                                                                              ITEMS OUT SIMILARITY
                            <chr>>
                                      <chr>>
                                                 <date>
                                                                                         <chr>>
                                                                                                   <chr>>
                                                                                                                              <dbl>
    <dbl> <chr>
                                                             <chr>>
                                                                               <chr>>
                                                                                                              <chr>
1 800371 WARDJOHN
                            WARD
                                      JOHN
                                                 2021-09-12 MARDJOHN
                                                                              MARD
                                                                                         JOHN.
                                                                                                   UNDERGRAD 4
                                                                                                                              0.875
 2 800653 LONGJENNIFER
                            LONG
                                      JENNIFER
                                                2021-09-12 YOUNGJENNIFER
                                                                              YOUNG
                                                                                         JENNIFER
                                                                                                   STAFF
                                                                                                                              0.846
 3 800394 LAWRENCELAURA
                            LAWRENCE
                                      LAURA
                                                 2021-05-16 LAWRENCETARA
                                                                              LAWRENCE
                                                                                         TARA
                                                                                                   PHD
                                                                                                                              0.846
 4 800808 WATKINSMICHAEL
                            WATKINS
                                      MICHAEL
                                                                              MATKINS
                                                                                         MICHELE
                                                                                                   STAFF
                                                 2021-05-16 MATKINSMICHELE
                                                                                                                              0.786
                            CHEN
 5 800958 CHENTARA
                                      TARA
                                                 2021-05-16 CHENDANA
                                                                              CHEN
                                                                                         DANA
                                                                                                   GRAD
                                                                                                                              0.75
                            ROY
                                                                              LEON
                                                                                                   PHD
 6 800978 ROYMELINDA
                                      MELINDA
                                                 2021-09-12 LEONMELINDA
                                                                                         MELINDA
                                                                                                                              0.727
 7 800478 RASMUSSENMONICA
                            RASMUSSEN MONICA
                                                 2021-05-16 RASWUSSENROBIN
                                                                              RASWUSSEN ROBIN
                                                                                                   UNDERGRAD 3
                                                                                                                              0.667
 8 800412 VELASQUEZROBYN
                            VELASQUEZ ROBYN
                                                 2021-05-16 VELASQUEZPATRICK VELASQUEZ PATRICK
                                                                                                   PHD
                                                                                                                              0.562
 9 800733 DEANRANDALL
                            DEAN
                                      RANDALL
                                                 2021-09-12 FORDRANDAL
                                                                              FORD
                                                                                         RANDAL
                                                                                                   UNDERGRAD 3
                                                                                                                              0.545
10 800323 ROBERSONKRISTINA ROBERSON
                                      KRISTINA
                                                 2021-09-12 ROBERSONANDREW
                                                                              ROBERSON
                                                                                         ANDREW
                                                                                                   STAFF
                                                                                                                              0.5
```

Note: this example uses 100% fake data created with Python's Faker package, not our real patron data!



student data (cont'd.)

Our previous workflow for graduating patrons involved having staff and student workers look up graduates by name and review their accounts. By adding the additional step of evaluating account names, I was able to create a process that was much faster, but still had a safety mechanism for discrepancies (which was also reassuring to our stakeholders). We're able to identify ~93% of graduating patrons automatically, saving significant staff time.

comparing holdings data

This method of evaluating string matches has also been useful for analyzing holdings data, particularly when one set is missing information or incomplete. In this particular case, we had a package in our knowledge base that seemed meant to represent our print holdings, for inclusion on our journals list. I wanted to compare it to our current print holdings (retrieved from our ILS) to see if it was still accurate and update coverage information. I first tried comparing titles by ISSN, and found matches in print holdings for 204 of the 469 titles from the Knowledge Base Mystery Package. This left 265 mystery titles remaining, which far exceeded my personal pain threshold for dragging spreadsheet cells around.

holdings data (cont'd.)

```
# A tibble: 182 x 5
   title.x
                                                title.y
   <chr>>
                                                <chr>>
1 action in teacher education
                                                action in teacher education
 2 adta newsletter
                                                adta newsletter
3 adult learning
                                                adult learning
 4 advances in mind body medicine
                                                advances in mindbody medicine
5 afterimage
                                                afterimage
                                                american art
 6 american art
 7 american art therapy association newsletter american art therapy association newsletter
8 american arts quarterly
                                                american arts quarterly
9 american journal of dance therapy
                                                american journal of dance therapy
10 american scientist
                                                american scientist
11 americas
                                                americas
12 archives of pediatrics adolescent medicine
                                               archives of pediatrics adolescent medicine
13 art bulletin
                                                art bulletin
14 art calendar
                                                art calendar
15 art journal
                                                art journal
```

I decided to try fuzzy matching based on title, as I had little other data from the KB package to work with. I knew the fuzzyjoin package would be my best bet, using stringdist_inner_join to join the KB package to our catalog holdings on title. I cleaned extra punctuation and spaces and converted to lowercase to ease things along. This was fairly successful at first glance.

So far, so good, right? (Unlike the patron data shown earlier, this is our real holdings data; no use faking what's in the OPAC already)

holdings data (cont'd.)

I knew we had some very short titles, like the previously mentioned "i-D" and "Ms," where two edits could mean the difference between two totally different titles. I used stringsim to compare the matched titles from the KB and the print catalog, which allowed me to filter out those more tenuous matches. This isn't a huge dataset, but I've been able to apply this to other collection-management projects already.

```
# A tibble: 182 x 3
                                   title.y
   title.x
                                                                      sim
   <chr>>
                                                                    <dbl>
                                   <chr>>
                                   id
 1 ms
                                                                    0
                                                                    0.333
 2 ms
                                   man
                                                                    0.5
 3 mome
                                   bomb
                                   world
                                                                    0.6
 4 wired
 5 i d
                                   id
                                                                    0.667
                                   print
                                                                    0.667
 6 spring
 7 change
                                   exchange
                                                                    0.75
 8 ilwc journal
                                   iawm journal
                                                                    0.833
 9 photographis
                                   photograph
                                                                    0.833
10 viewcamera
                                   view camera
                                                                    0.909
11 lürzers intl archive
                                   lurzers intl archive
                                                                    0.95
12 brain mind common sense
                                   brainmind common sense
                                                                    0.957
13 advances in mind body medicine advances in mindbody medicine
                                                                    0.967
14 poliéster pintura y no pintura poliester pintura y no pintura 0.967
15 action in teacher education
                                   action in teacher education
```

fin!

That's about it! This is a pretty simple presentation on a pretty simple function, but it's helped me tackle a lot of long-standing data management projects by filtering out what actually needs a more thorough review. It's also been helpful in demonstrating to library stakeholders that we can strike a balance between computational matching and manual review, which has saved a lot of staff-time and tedious clicking. It's been very useful for me, so I hope this can be useful to someone else as well!

let's talk!

github: https://github.com/alxsdhm/c4l2021_poster

tweets: @alxsdhm

discord: alxs#4443