

Critique 1

AMANDA INNIS

My first impression of SagmeisterWalsh is “Cool, but what do they do?” So I googled them and got more answers: they design web identities in the form of apps, commercials, websites, etc. (And now I feel a sort of hipster-shame for not already knowing who they are.)

- My desktop assessment of this site: overwhelming.
- My mobile assessment of the site: amazing.

The layout of the page (I’m first looking at on my laptop) puts their work up front and center which is what they want. I’m guessing they don’t want to predigest and contextualize the content for the audience, they want an exploratory experience for their viewers. I will now assume the majority of the people visiting the site are lured there by reputation.

I think this site was designed mobile-first and desktop last. It is a smashing success on mobile. All the little pictures scroll (chevron style) horizontally for the quick-viewing pleasure of mobile users. However, I think when the images scale to desktop size and remain that small, it is an awkward experience. Their importance is diminished by the sheer number of other pictures. I suggest a simple solution and that is make those images scale up also and take up at least 50% of the browser’s width so they can be seen. I also think categorizing them in some way would help prevent viewers feel more organized and less overwhelmed.

The header section is problematic for me. The facebook, etc buttons belong in the footer. The navigation bar (on desktop) hides because it looks like a search bar. Although, on mobile, it looks perfectly fine. And the harsh black outline around the page is, well, harsh.

The answers page is just as overwhelming as the front page. Jesus! Do they want people to actually read? The typography could work with space. I can’t even evaluate it right now, it is too close together.

I think Sagmeister and Walsh are fantastic designers who could make a few simple changes to their desktop site. A better user experience would showcase how awesome their work is.