

THE CALCULUS OF SET CONSTRUCTIONS

by

Andrew Marmaduke

A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment
of the requirements for the Doctor of Philosophy degree
in Computer Science
in the Graduate College
of The University of Iowa

May 2024

Thesis Committee: Aaron Stump, Thesis Supervisor
Cesare Tinelli
J. Garrett Morris
Sriram Pemmaraju
William J. Bowman

Copyright © 2023
Andrew Marmaduke
All Rights Reserved

Lorem ipsum dolor sit amet, consectetur adipiscing elit. Ut purus elit, vestibulum ut, placerat ac, adipiscing vitae, felis. Curabitur dictum gravida mauris. Nam arcu libero, nonummy eget, consectetur id, vulputate a, magna. Donec vehicula augue eu neque. Pellentesque habitant morbi tristique senectus et netus et malesuada fames ac turpis egestas. Mauris ut leo. Cras viverra metus rhoncus sem. Nulla et lectus vestibulum urna fringilla ultrices. Phasellus eu tellus sit amet tortor gravida placerat. Integer sapien est, iaculis in, pretium quis, viverra ac, nunc. Praesent eget sem vel leo ultrices bibendum. Aenean faucibus. Morbi dolor nulla, malesuada eu, pulvinar at, mollis ac, nulla. Curabitur auctor semper nulla. Donec varius orci eget risus. Duis nibh mi, congue eu, accumsan eleifend, sagittis quis, diam. Duis eget orci sit amet orci dignissim rutrum.

– Some wise dude

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Lorem ipsum dolor sit amet, consectetur adipiscing elit. Ut purus elit, vestibulum ut, placerat ac, adipiscing vitae, felis. Curabitur dictum gravida mauris. Nam arcu libero, nonummy eget, consectetur id, vulputate a, magna. Donec vehicula augue eu neque. Pellentesque habitant morbi tristique senectus et netus et malesuada fames ac turpis egestas. Mauris ut leo. Cras viverra metus rhoncus sem. Nulla et lectus vestibulum urna fringilla ultrices. Phasellus eu tellus sit amet tortor gravida placerat. Integer sapien est, iaculis in, pretium quis, viverra ac, nunc. Praesent eget sem vel leo ultrices bibendum. Aenean faucibus. Morbi dolor nulla, malesuada eu, pulvinar at, mollis ac, nulla. Curabitur auctor semper nulla. Donec varius orci eget risus. Duis nibh mi, congue eu, accumsan eleifend, sagittis quis, diam. Duis eget orci sit amet orci dignissim rutrum.

ABSTRACT

Lorem ipsum dolor sit amet, consectetur adipiscing elit. Ut purus elit, vestibulum ut, placerat ac, adipiscing vitae, felis. Curabitur dictum gravida mauris. Nam arcu libero, nonummy eget, consectetur id, vulputate a, magna. Donec vehicula augue eu neque. Pellentesque habitant morbi tristique senectus et netus et malesuada fames ac turpis egestas. Mauris ut leo. Cras viverra metus rhoncus sem. Nulla et lectus vestibulum urna fringilla ultrices. Phasellus eu tellus sit amet tortor gravida placerat. Integer sapien est, iaculis in, pretium quis, viverra ac, nunc. Praesent eget sem vel leo ultrices bibendum. Aenean faucibus. Morbi dolor nulla, malesuada eu, pulvinar at, mollis ac, nulla. Curabitur auctor semper nulla. Donec varius orci eget risus. Duis nibh mi, congue eu, accumsan eleifend, sagittis quis, diam. Duis eget orci sit amet orci dignissim rutrum.

Nam dui ligula, fringilla a, euismod sodales, sollicitudin vel, wisi. Morbi auctor lorem non justo. Nam lacus libero, pretium at, lobortis vitae, ultricies et, tellus. Donec aliquet, tortor sed accumsan bibendum, erat ligula aliquet magna, vitae ornare odio metus a mi. Morbi ac orci et nisl hendrerit mollis. Suspendisse ut massa. Cras nec ante. Pellentesque a nulla. Cum sociis natoque penatibus et magnis dis parturient montes, nascetur ridiculus mus. Aliquam tincidunt urna. Nulla ullamcorper vestibulum turpis. Pellentesque cursus luctus mauris.

PUBLIC ABSTRACT

Lorem ipsum dolor sit amet, consectetur adipiscing elit. Ut purus elit, vestibulum ut, placerat ac, adipiscing vitae, felis. Curabitur dictum gravida mauris. Nam arcu libero, nonummy eget, consectetur id, vulputate a, magna. Donec vehicula augue eu neque. Pellentesque habitant morbi tristique senectus et netus et malesuada fames ac turpis egestas. Mauris ut leo. Cras viverra metus rhoncus sem. Nulla et lectus vestibulum urna fringilla ultrices. Phasellus eu tellus sit amet tortor gravida placerat. Integer sapien est, iaculis in, pretium quis, viverra ac, nunc. Praesent eget sem vel leo ultrices bibendum. Aenean faucibus. Morbi dolor nulla, malesuada eu, pulvinar at, mollis ac, nulla. Curabitur auctor semper nulla. Donec varius orci eget risus. Duis nibh mi, congue eu, accumsan eleifend, sagittis quis, diam. Duis eget orci sit amet orci dignissim rutrum.

Nam dui ligula, fringilla a, euismod sodales, sollicitudin vel, wisi. Morbi auctor lorem non justo. Nam lacus libero, pretium at, lobortis vitae, ultricies et, tellus. Donec aliquet, tortor sed accumsan bibendum, erat ligula aliquet magna, vitae ornare odio metus a mi. Morbi ac orci et nisl hendrerit mollis. Suspendisse ut massa. Cras nec ante. Pellentesque a nulla. Cum sociis natoque penatibus et magnis dis parturient montes, nascetur ridiculus mus. Aliquam tincidunt urna. Nulla ullamcorper vestibulum turpis. Pellentesque cursus luctus mauris.

CONTENTS

List of Figures	vii
List of Tables	viii
1 Introduction to Type Theory	1
2 Calculus of Set Constructions and Basic Metatheory	2
3 Properties of CoSC	10
4 Cedille 2.0: Implementation of System CoSC	11
5 Derivable Constructs in System CoSC	12
Bibliography	13

LIST OF FIGURES

LIST OF TABLES

PREFACE

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION TO TYPE THEORY

CHAPTER 2

CALCULUS OF SET CONSTRUCTIONS AND BASIC METATHEORY

$$\text{dom}_\Pi(\omega, K) = \star$$

$$\text{dom}_\Pi(\tau, K) = K$$

$$\text{dom}_\Pi(0, K) = K$$

$$\text{codom}_\Pi(\omega) = \star$$

$$\text{codom}_\Pi(\tau) = \square$$

$$\text{codom}_\Pi(0) = \star$$

$$(\lambda_m x:t_1. t_2) \bullet_m t_3 \rightsquigarrow_\beta [x := t_3]t_2$$

$$[t_1, t_2, t_3].1 \rightsquigarrow_\beta t_1$$

$$[t_1, t_2, t_3].2 \rightsquigarrow_\beta t_2$$

$$J \ t_1 \ t_2 \ t_3 \ t_4 \ (\text{refl } t_5) \ t_6 \rightsquigarrow_\beta t_6 \bullet_0 t_5$$

$$\vartheta \ (\text{refl } t.1) \rightsquigarrow_\beta \text{refl } t$$

$$\varphi \ t_1 \ t_2 \ (\text{refl } t_3) \rightsquigarrow_\beta t_2$$

$$|x| = x$$

$$|\star| = \star$$

$$|\square| = \square$$

$$|\lambda_0 x:A. t| = |t|$$

$$|\lambda_\omega x:A. t| = \lambda_\omega x. |t|$$

$$|\lambda_\tau x:A. t| = \lambda_\tau x:|A|. |t|$$

$$|(x:A) \rightarrow_m B| = (x:|A|) \rightarrow_m |B|$$

$$|(x:A) \cap B| = (x:|A|) \cap |B|$$

$$|f \bullet_0 a| = |f|$$

$$|f \bullet_\omega a| = |f| \bullet_\omega |a|$$

$$|f \bullet_\tau a| = |f| \bullet_\tau |a|$$

$$|[s, t, T]| = |t|$$

$$|t.1| = |t|$$

$$|t.2| = |t|$$

$$|x =_A y| = |x| =_{|A|} |y|$$

$$|\text{refl } t| = \lambda_\omega x. x$$

$$|J \ A \ P \ x \ y \ r \ w| = |r| \ |w|$$

$$|\vartheta \ e| = |e|$$

$$|\delta \ e| = |e|$$

$$|\varphi \ a \ b \ e| = |a|$$

$$\begin{array}{c}
\frac{\vdash \Gamma}{\Gamma \vdash \star \triangleright \square} \text{AXIOM} \\
\\
\frac{\vdash \Gamma \quad (x : A) \in \Gamma}{\Gamma \vdash x \triangleright A} \text{VAR} \\
\\
\frac{\Gamma \vdash A \triangleright \text{dom}_{\Pi}(m, K) \quad \Gamma, x : A \vdash B \triangleright \text{codom}_{\Pi}(m)}{\Gamma \vdash (x : A) \rightarrow_m B \triangleright \text{codom}_{\Pi}(m)} \text{PI} \\
\\
\frac{\Gamma \vdash A \triangleright \text{dom}_{\Pi}(m, K) \quad \Gamma, x : A \vdash t \triangleright B \quad x \notin \text{FV}(|t|) \text{ if } m = 0}{\Gamma \vdash \lambda_m x : A. t : (x : A) \rightarrow_m B} \text{LAMBDA} \\
\\
\frac{\Gamma \vdash f \triangleright (x : A) \rightarrow_m B \quad \Gamma \vdash a \triangleleft A}{\Gamma \vdash f \bullet_m a \triangleright [x := a]B} \text{APP} \\
\\
\frac{\Gamma \vdash A \triangleright \star \quad \Gamma, x : A \vdash B \triangleright \star}{\Gamma \vdash (x : A) \cap B \triangleright \star} \text{INTERSECTION} \\
\\
\frac{\Gamma \vdash T \triangleright (x : A) \rightarrow_{\tau} B \quad \Gamma \vdash t \triangleleft A \quad \Gamma \vdash s \triangleleft [x := t]B \quad t \equiv s}{\Gamma \vdash [t, s; T] \triangleright (x : A) \cup B} \text{PAIR} \\
\\
\frac{\Gamma \vdash t \triangleright (x : A) \cap B}{\Gamma \vdash t.1 \triangleright A} \text{FIRST} \\
\\
\frac{\Gamma \vdash t \triangleright (x : A) \cap B}{\Gamma \vdash t.2 \triangleright [x := t.1]B} \text{SECOND} \\
\\
\frac{\Gamma \vdash A \triangleright \star \quad \Gamma \vdash a \triangleleft A \quad \Gamma \vdash b \triangleleft A}{\Gamma \vdash a =_A b \triangleright \star} \text{EQUALITY} \\
\\
\frac{\Gamma \vdash t \triangleright A}{\Gamma \vdash \text{refl } t \triangleright t =_A t} \text{REFL}
\end{array}$$

$$\frac{\Gamma \vdash A \Vdash \star \quad \Gamma \vdash P \triangleleft (x \ y : A) \rightarrow_\tau (e : x =_A y) \rightarrow_\tau \star \quad \Gamma \vdash x \triangleleft A \quad \Gamma \vdash y \triangleleft A \quad \Gamma \vdash r \triangleleft x =_A y \quad \Gamma \vdash w \triangleleft (a : A) \rightarrow_0 P \bullet_\tau a \bullet_\tau a \bullet_\tau \text{refl } a}{\Gamma \vdash J \ A \ P \ x \ y \ r \ w \triangleright P \bullet_\tau x \bullet_\tau y \bullet_\tau r} \text{EQINDUCT}$$

$$\frac{\Gamma \vdash e \Vdash a.1 =_T b.1 \quad \Gamma \vdash a \Vdash (x : A) \cap B \quad \Gamma \vdash b \triangleleft (x : A) \cap B \quad T \equiv A}{\Gamma \vdash \vartheta \ e \triangleright a =_{(x:A) \cap B} b} \text{PROMOTE}$$

$$\frac{\Gamma \vdash b \Vdash (x : A) \cap B \quad \Gamma \vdash a \triangleleft A \quad \Gamma \vdash e \triangleleft a =_A b.1 \quad \text{FV}(|e|) \subseteq \text{FV}(|a|)}{\Gamma \vdash \varphi \ a \ b \ e \triangleright (x : A) \cap B} \text{CAST}$$

$$\frac{\begin{array}{l} \text{cBool} := (X : \star) \rightarrow_0 (x : X) \rightarrow_\omega (y : X) \rightarrow_\omega X \\ \text{ctt} := \lambda_0 X : \star. \lambda_\omega x : X. \lambda_\omega y : X. x \\ \text{cff} := \lambda_0 X : \star. \lambda_\omega x : X. \lambda_\omega y : X. y \end{array} \quad \Gamma \vdash e \triangleleft \text{ctt} =_{\text{cBool}} \text{cff}}{\Gamma \vdash \delta \ e \triangleright (X : \star) \rightarrow_0 X} \text{SEPARATION}$$

$$\frac{\Gamma \vdash t \triangleright A \quad A \rightsquigarrow_\beta^* B}{\Gamma \vdash t \Vdash B} \text{HEADINFERENCE}$$

$$\frac{\Gamma \vdash t \triangleright A \quad \Gamma \vdash B \Vdash K \quad A \equiv B}{\Gamma \vdash t \triangleleft B} \text{CHECKING}$$

$$\frac{}{\vdash \cdot} \text{CONTEXTEMPTY}$$

$$\frac{x \notin \text{FV}(\Gamma) \quad \vdash \Gamma \quad \Gamma \vdash A \Vdash K}{\vdash \Gamma, x : A} \text{CONTEXTAPPEND}$$

For the below theorem we assume we know that t is strongly normalizing and that the theory is consistent.

Theorem 1. $\Gamma \vdash t \triangleright A$ implies $|t|$ is strongly normalizing

Proof. By induction on the derivation:

$$\text{Case: } \frac{\frac{\mathcal{D}_1}{\vdash \Gamma}}{\Gamma \vdash \star \triangleright \square} \text{AXIOM}$$

Obvious.

$$\text{Case: } \frac{\frac{\mathcal{D}_1}{\vdash \Gamma} \quad (x : A) \in \Gamma}{\Gamma \vdash x \triangleright A} \text{VAR}$$

Obvious.

$$\text{Case: } \frac{\Gamma \vdash A \Vdash \text{dom}_\Pi(m, K) \quad \Gamma, x : A \vdash B \Vdash \text{codom}_\Pi(m)}{\Gamma \vdash (x : A) \rightarrow_m B \triangleright \text{codom}_\Pi(m)} \text{PI}$$

By the inductive hypothesis we know that $|A|$ and $|B|$ are strongly normalizing. Thus, $|(x : A) \rightarrow_m B| = (x : |A|) \rightarrow_m |B|$ is strongly normalizing.

$$\text{Case: } \frac{\Gamma \vdash A \Vdash \text{dom}_\Pi(m, K) \quad \Gamma, x : A \vdash t \triangleright B \quad x \notin \text{FV}(|t|) \text{ if } m = 0}{\Gamma \vdash \lambda_m x : A. t : (x : A) \rightarrow_m B} \text{LAMBDA}$$

By the inductive hypothesis we know that $|A|$ and $|t|$ are strongly normalizing. Regardless of m the erasure reduces to some combination of these two, thus the erased term is strongly normalizing.

$$\text{Case: } \frac{\Gamma \vdash f \Vdash (x : A) \rightarrow_m B \quad \Gamma \vdash a \triangleleft A}{\Gamma \vdash f \bullet_m a \triangleright [x := a]B} \text{APP}$$

By the inductive hypothesis we have that $|f|$ and $|a|$ are strongly normalizing. Proceed by cases on f :

- $f = x$, then no reduction can be performed and $x \ |a|$ is normal.

- $f = \lambda_m x : A. t$, then we have $[x := a]t$, but this infers a type and thus $[[x := a]t]$ is strongly normalizing.
- $f = u \bullet_{m_2} v$
- $f = [t, s; T]$, impossible by inversion on \mathcal{D}_1
- $f = t.1$
- $f = t.2$
- $f = \text{refl } x$, impossible by inversion on \mathcal{D}_1
- $f = J \ A \ P \ x \ y \ r \ w$
- $f = \vartheta \ e$, impossible by inversion on \mathcal{D}_1
- $f = \varphi \ a \ b \ e$, impossible by inversion on \mathcal{D}_1
- $f = \delta \ e$

$$\text{Case: } \frac{\Gamma \vdash A \Vdash^{\mathcal{D}_1} \star \quad \Gamma, x : A \vdash B \Vdash^{\mathcal{D}_1} \star}{\Gamma \vdash (x : A) \cap B \triangleright \star} \text{INTERSECTION}$$

Same as function type case.

$$\text{Case: } \frac{\Gamma \vdash T \Vdash^{\mathcal{D}_1} (x : A) \rightarrow_{\tau} B \quad \Gamma \vdash t \triangleleft^{\mathcal{D}_2} A \quad \Gamma \vdash s \triangleleft^{\mathcal{D}_3} [x := t]B \quad t \equiv^{\mathcal{D}_4} s}{\Gamma \vdash [t, s; T] \triangleright (x : A) \cup B} \text{PAIR}$$

By the inductive hypothesis we know that $|t|$ is strongly normalizing. Thus, $|t, s; T| = |t|$ is strongly normalizing.

$$\text{Case: } \frac{\Gamma \vdash t \Vdash^{\mathcal{D}_1} (x : A) \cap B}{\Gamma \vdash t.1 \triangleright A} \text{FIRST}$$

Same idea as pair case.

$$\text{Case: } \frac{\Gamma \vdash t \Vdash^{\mathcal{D}_1} (x : A) \cap B}{\Gamma \vdash t.2 \triangleright [x := t.1]B} \text{SECOND}$$

Same idea as pair case.

$$\text{Case: } \frac{\Gamma \vdash \overset{\mathcal{D}_1}{A} \triangleright \star \quad \Gamma \vdash \overset{\mathcal{D}_2}{a} \triangleleft A \quad \Gamma \vdash \overset{\mathcal{D}_2}{b} \triangleleft A}{\Gamma \vdash a =_A b \triangleright \star} \text{EQUALITY}$$

Same idea as function type case.

$$\text{Case: } \frac{\Gamma \vdash \overset{\mathcal{D}_1}{t} \triangleright A}{\Gamma \vdash \text{refl } t \triangleright t =_A t} \text{REFL}$$

$|\text{refl } x|$ is a value thus strongly normalizing.

$$\text{Case: } \frac{\Gamma \vdash \overset{\mathcal{D}_1}{A} \triangleright \star \quad \Gamma \vdash P \triangleleft (x : A) \xrightarrow{\tau} (e : x =_A y) \xrightarrow{\tau} \star \quad \Gamma \vdash \overset{\mathcal{D}_3}{x} \triangleleft A \quad \Gamma \vdash \overset{\mathcal{D}_4}{y} \triangleleft A \quad \Gamma \vdash \overset{\mathcal{D}_5}{r} \triangleleft x =_A y \quad \Gamma \vdash w \triangleleft (a : A) \xrightarrow{0} P \bullet_{\tau} a \bullet_{\tau} a \bullet_{\tau} \text{refl } a}{\Gamma \vdash J A P x y r w \triangleright P \bullet_{\tau} x \bullet_{\tau} y \bullet_{\tau} r} \text{EQINDUCT}$$

All of $|A|, |P|, |x|, |y|, |r|, |w|$ are strongly normalizing by the inductive hypothesis. Suppose that $r = \text{refl } z$. Then by one reduction we have $|r| \mid w|$, but $|r|$ is the identity function, thus this reduces to just $|w|$ which is strongly normalizing. Otherwise, no reduction is possible and $|r| \mid w|$ is normal.

$$\text{Case: } \frac{\Gamma \vdash e \triangleright \overset{\mathcal{D}_1}{a.1} =_T b.1 \quad \Gamma \vdash a \triangleright \overset{\mathcal{D}_2}{(x : A) \cap B} \quad \Gamma \vdash b \triangleleft \overset{\mathcal{D}_3}{(x : A) \cap B} \quad T \equiv \overset{\mathcal{D}_4}{A}}{\Gamma \vdash \vartheta e \triangleright a =_{(x:A) \cap B} b} \text{PROMOTE}$$

By the inductive hypothesis $|e|$ is strongly normalizing, thus $|\vartheta e| = |e|$ is strongly normalizing.

$$\text{Case: } \frac{\Gamma \vdash b \triangleright \overset{\mathcal{D}_1}{(x : A) \cap B} \quad \Gamma \vdash \overset{\mathcal{D}_2}{a} \triangleleft A \quad \Gamma \vdash \overset{\mathcal{D}_3}{e} \triangleleft a =_A b.1 \quad \text{FV}(|e|) \subseteq \text{FV}(|a|)}{\Gamma \vdash \varphi a b e \triangleright (x : A) \cap B} \text{CAST}$$

By the inductive hypothesis $|a|$ is strongly normalizing, thus $|\varphi a b e| = |a|$ is strongly normalizing.

$$\begin{array}{c}
\text{cBool} := (X : \star) \rightarrow_0 (x : X) \rightarrow_\omega (y : X) \rightarrow_\omega X \\
\text{ctt} := \lambda_0 X : \star. \lambda_\omega x : X. \lambda_\omega y : X. x \\
\text{Case: } \frac{\text{cff} := \lambda_0 X : \star. \lambda_\omega x : X. \lambda_\omega y : X. y \quad \Gamma \vdash e \triangleleft \text{ctt} =_{\text{cBool}} \text{cff}}{\Gamma \vdash \delta e \triangleright (X : \star) \rightarrow_0 X} \text{SEPARATION}
\end{array}$$

By the inductive hypothesis $|e|$ is strongly normalizing, thus $|\delta e| = |e|$ is strongly normalizing.

□

Lemma 1. *For $\Gamma \vdash t : A$, where t_w is the whnf of t then $t \rightsquigarrow_\beta^* t_w$ iff $|t| \rightsquigarrow_\beta^* |t_w|$*

CHAPTER 3

PROPERTIES OF COSC

CHAPTER 4

CEDILLE 2.0: IMPLEMENTATION OF SYSTEM COSC

CHAPTER 5

DERIVABLE CONSTRUCTS IN SYSTEM COSC

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- [1] Kenneth J. Arrow. “A Difficulty in the Concept of Social Welfare”. In: *J Polit Econ* 58.4 (Aug. 1950), pp. 328–346. DOI: 10.1086/256963. URL: <https://doi.org/10.1086%2F256963>.
- [2] Jon Kleinberg. “An Impossibility Theorem for Clustering”. In: *Proceedings of the 15th International Conference on Neural Information Processing Systems*. NIPS’02. Cambridge, MA, USA: MIT Press, 2002, pp. 463–470.
- [3] Daniel Müllner. *Modern hierarchical, agglomerative clustering algorithms*. 2011. arXiv: 1109.2378 [stat.ML].
- [4] R. Sibson. “SLINK: An optimally efficient algorithm for the single-link cluster method”. In: *Comput. J.* 16.1 (Jan. 1973), pp. 30–34. DOI: 10.1093/comjnl/16.1.30. URL: <https://doi.org/10.1093%2Fcomjnl%2F16.1.30>.
- [5] Gurjeet Singh, Facundo Memoli, and Gunnar Carlsson. “Topological Methods for the Analysis of High Dimensional Data Sets and 3D Object Recognition”. In: *Eurographics Symposium on Point-Based Graphics*. Ed. by M. Botsch et al. The Eurographics Association, 2007. ISBN: 978-3-905673-51-7. DOI: 10.2312/SPBG/SPBG07/091–100.
- [6] Guillaume Tautzin et al. *giotto-tda: A Topological Data Analysis Toolkit for Machine Learning and Data Exploration*. 2020. arXiv: 2004.02551 [cs.LG].
- [7] Hendrik van Veen et al. “Kepler Mapper: A flexible Python implementation of the Mapper algorithm.” In: *J. Open Source Softw.* 4.42 (Oct. 2019), p. 1315. DOI: 10.21105/joss.01315. URL: <https://doi.org/10.21105%2Fjoss.01315>.
- [8] Youjia Zhou et al. *Mapper Interactive: A Scalable, Extendable, and Interactive Toolbox for the Visual Exploration of High-Dimensional Data*. 2021. arXiv: 2011.03209 [cs.CG].