Hearing Faith: Music as Theology in the Spanish Empire

Book Proposal for the University of California Press

Andrew A. Cashner

July 27, 2018

Contents

1 Description

Devotional writers of the seventeenth-century Spanish empire frequently cited St. Paul's dictum from Romans 10:17 that "Faith comes through hearing, and hearing by the word of Christ." As Roman Catholics in missions and colonies across the globe, and in educational and evangelical efforts in Europe, sought to make faith audible in persuasive new ways, what was the role of music? In the theological understanding of the time, what kind of power did music have to create or strengthen a link between faith and hearing? How might the participants of Catholic ceremonies with music, from a variety of social stations, have actually listened?

There exists a rich and largely unmined vein of sources that can help us explore these questions, in the thousands of surviving Spanish *villancicos* in archives across the world. Though the term *villancico* in colloquial Spanish today refers to popular Christmas carols, in the seventeenth century the term typically denoted long, complex polyphonic pieces for voices and instruments with vernacular words, often arranged for eight, twelve, or more voices in multiple choirs. Most feature an expansive, motet-like *estribillo* or refrain section for the full ensemble, and strophic *coplas* or verses for soloists or a reduced group. Villancicos originated in the late medieval period as a genre of courtly entertainment and sometimes devotion, with elements drawn from common culture. In the late sixteenth century, Spaniards began performing villancicos as an increasingly integral part of the liturgy, interpolating them among the lessons of Matins or in the Mass, especially at Christmas and Epiphany, Corpus Christi, and other high feasts like the Conception of Mary.

The genre became a meeting place for elements of elite and common, erudite and comic, celestial and mundane elements. In every major church from Madrid to Manila, chapelmasters composed dozens of villancicos each year, most often in sets of eight or more for Matins. Even after considerable loss of sources, there still survive many hundreds of musical settings, and vastly more printed leaflets of villancico poems. Villancicos were ubiquitous in colonial Hispanic culture, and their mixture of vernacular poetry with multiple styles of music seems designed to appeal to listeners from the whole array of social positions.

Many villancicos directly address themes of faith, hearing, and the power of music. Hundreds of pieces explicitly invoke the sense of hearing with opening lines of "Listen!" "Silence!" "Pay attention." The repertoire abounds in representations of angelic choirs at Christmas, dancing shepherds and magi from the far corners of the earth (especially Africa), evocations of instruments, and even elaborate conceptual plays on terms from music theory and philosophy. These pieces constitute "music about music" and as such provide us with an unparalleled historical discourse on the nature of music, through the medium of music itself.

This book argues that by listening closely to villancicos we can learn how seventeenth-century Hispanic Catholics understood music's power in the relationship between faith and hearing. It contributes to current conversations in early modern cultural history and sound studies by drawing primary evidence from close analysis and interpretation of musical performative texts, and it expands our understanding of a fascinating musical and poetic genre that not enough scholarship has taken seriously.

Scholarly Context and Significance of the Study

This book will be the first large-scale study to examine in detail the links between music, poetry, and theology in villancicos. It will be the second major monograph, after Paul Laird's *Toward a History of the Spanish Villancico*, to analyze the music of villancicos.[1] It will be the first to be based on a global selection of sources and to interpret them in light of contemporary theological literature and devotional practices.

While musicologists have increasingly turned their interest to early modern Iberian music, most of the recent studies in English have focused on social functions of music, based on archival documentation and engaging with postcolonial thought and other critical theory. This

1. Paul R. Laird, *Towards a History of the Spanish Villancico* (Warren, MI: Harmonie Park Press, 1997). The otherwise excellent collection of essays, Tess Knighton and Álvaro Torrente, eds., *Devotional Music in the Iberian World, 1450–1800: The Villancico and Related Genres* (Aldershot, UK: Ashgate, 2007), devotes little attention to the actual music. Other than Samuel Rubio, *Forma del villancico polifonico desde el siglo XV hasta el XVIII* (Cuenca: Instituto de Musica Religiosa de la Excma. Diputación Provincial de Cuenca, 1979), which is limited by a focus on too small a repertoire, the only other works addressing musical structure in villancicos have been dissertations: Bernat Cabero Pueyo, *Der Villancico des XVI. und XVII. Jahrhunderts in Spanien* (Berlin: Dissertation.de, 2000); Bernardo Illari, "Polychoral Culture: Cathedral Music in La Plata (Bolivia), 1680–1730" (PhD diss., University of Chicago, 2001).

admirable work has greatly advanced our understanding of Hispanic music, but at the same time it has not been sufficiently grounded in study of the actual surviving sources of musical practice—the notated music.[2] It is certainly true that the archival sources of music do not present a full picture of music in Hispanic society, since they include primarily music used in the rituals of urban cathedrals, composed and enjoyed primarily by the elite. But these pieces provide insight into historical ways of experiencing the world that no other source can provide; and this book will demonstrate how much we can still learn from the copious sources we do have.

Villancicos are an important genre of Spanish literature as well as a musical genre, but literary studies have concentrated on the published works of only a few poets like Sor Juana Inés de la Cruz, and have not considered the musical aspects of the genre.[3] Musical settings of villancicos are an important source of previously unstudied villancico texts that are available only scattered through the various performing parts of musical manuscripts. These settings also provide us with contemporary "readings" of seventeenth-century poems, in terms of both declamation and interpretation.

The book's primary goal is to contribute to the development of a historically grounded interpretive framework for early modern religious music. The study connects to a growing literature on sound, sensation, and musical experience in the early modern world; and it advances an ongoing conversation in sound studies regarding the ability of voice, sound, and vibration to shape our understanding of the world and order our social relationships.[4] This book

2. Álvaro Torrente, "The Sacred Villancico in Early Eighteenth-Century Spain: The Repertory of Salamanca Cathedral" (PhD diss., University of Cambridge, 1997); Geoffrey Baker, *Imposing Harmony: Music and Society in Colonial Cuzco* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2008); David Irving, *Colonial Counterpoint: Music in Early Modern Manila* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010); Geoffrey Baker and Tess Knighton, eds., *Music and Urban Society in Colonial Latin America* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2011).

3. Martha Lilia Tenorio, *Los villancicos de Sor Juana* (Mexico City: El Colegio de México, 1999).

4. Notable examples include Richard Cullen Rath, *How Early America Sounded* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2003); Martha Feldman, "Music and the Order of the Passions," in *Representing the Passions: Histories, Bodies, Visions*, ed. Richard Meyer (Los Angeles: Getty Research Institute, 2003), 37–67; Linda Phyllis Austern, "'Tis Nature's Voice': Music, Natural Philosophy and the Hidden World in Seventeenth-Century England," in *Music Theory and Natural Order from the Renaissance to the Early Twentieth Century*, ed. Suzannah Clark and Alexander Rehding (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001), 30–67; Penelope Gouk, *Music, Science, and Natural Magic in Seventeenth-Century England* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1999); Ana María Ochoa Gautier, *Aurality: Listening and Knowledge in Nineteenth-Century Colombia* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2014); Nina Sun Eidsheim, *Sensing Sound: Singing and Listening as Vibrational Practice* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2015)

differs from most of these studies, though, because it places a much greater emphasis on the interpretive act of listening to musical performative texts. In this respect it is similar to Elisabeth LeGuin's studies of Spanish music, Martha Feldman's work on Italian opera, and especially David Yearsley's research on Lutheran music, all of which closely link musical analysis with cultural context.[5]

The book provides a needed complement and counterweight to Andrew Dell'Antonio's study of musical listening in early modern Italy.[6] Dell'Antonio addresses similar questions but draws from a quite distinct body of evidence in that his study focuses primarily on written discourse about music in elite Roman circles. Such accounts of musical listening are rare in the Hispanic world of the seventeenth century, in part because of different social contexts for musical performance; but the large repertoire of villancicos on the subject of musical hearing provides an alternative way of exploring these questions. These pieces allow us to examine not only words about music, but "music about music." This book, then, connects discourse about music with detailed analysis of musical practice in social contexts that involved a wide range of listeners; it also concentrates in more detail on theological and music-theoretical conceptions of how music worked.

The book argues that if we want to understand what early modern Spanish subjects believed about music, then we must pay close attention to the music they made as an expression of those beliefs. Likewise, if we want to understand how their music worked even on a formal-structural level, we must seek to understand its creators' and hearers' beliefs about music.

This book will be significant for scholarship because it applies a detailed analytical and interpretive approach to an overlooked musical genre in the service of a research question of

5. Elisabeth LeGuin, *The Tonadilla in Performance: Lyric Comedy in Enlightenment Spain* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2014); Elisabeth Le Guin, *Boccherini's Body: An Essay in Carnal Musicology* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2006); Martha Feldman, *Opera and Sovereignty: Transforming Myths in Eighteenth- Century Italy* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2007); David Yearsley, *Bach and the Meanings of Counterpoint* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002).

6. Andrew Dell'Antonio, *Listening as Spiritual Practice in Early Modern Italy* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2011).

great relevance for anyone interested in the history and meaning of religious arts in the early modern world. The book is based on original archival research in nine archives in Mexico and Spain. Analysis is based on my own editions of villancicos that have in most cases never been previously published or performed, drawn from the original partbooks, poetry imprints, and other archival sources. I ground my interpretations as rigorously as possible in specific historical and local contexts, reading the music together with theological literature and visual art that the poets and composers would have known. In some cases these non-musical sources have received little scholarly attention, and few have been applied to the study of music.

The book will be of interest, then, to scholars specializing in early modern music, Ibero-American music, and colonial music, as well as those interested in questions of sensation, faith, and religious experience in other periods and places. Scholars of Spanish literature will find the book helpful for understanding a widespread poetic genre that should not be considered apart from music. Historians of religion and devotional literature, as well as those interested in sound studies and even the history of science will find many points of intersection with their own work. Though the book will include detailed analysis of poetry, music, and theology, it will be written in an engaging, jargon-free style that should make it accessible for graduate students in a variety of fields as well as upper-level undergraduates.

2 Outline of Chapters

Part I: Listening for Faith

The book is organized in two parts. The first, "Listening for Faith," builds a foundation for understanding villancicos as historical sources of theological beliefs about sensation and faith. The case studies of the second part, "Listening for Unhearable Music," interpret specific villancico families on the subject of music, with an emphasis on the links between earthly, heavenly, and divine music. These case studies focus on villancicos composed and performed across the different regions of the empire, from Segovia in Castile to Puebla in New Spain.

Chapter 1: Villancicos as Musical Theology

The first chapter makes the case for understanding villancicos as embodiments of theological beliefs about music—that is, as ways of hearing faith through music. The chapter presents the results of a global survey of villancico poems and music, examining the different ways that villancicos represent or discuss music-making. These include pieces on topics of musical instruments (for example the *clarín* or clarion, drums, castanets), specific songs and dances like *jácaras* and imitations of African and Indian dances, depictions of angelic music and music of the spheres, and learned pieces playing on solmization syllables and terms from music theory to create a double discourse on music and theology.

The chapter also establishes fundamental concepts and analytical methods that will familiarize readers with villancicos as a genre and with the specialized approaches developed for this project. The examples are chosen to represent fairly the global reach of this genre, focusing on composers with wide influence, such as Juan Hidalgo, Cristóbal Galán, and Joan Cererols; and composers whose works are frequently performed today, chiefly Juan Gutiérrez de Padilla. The chapter briefly situates the project in the context of related scholarship in musicology and other fields of cultural studies.

The rest of the chapter situates the musical theology of villancicos in the context of early modern theological and theoretical literature about music to develop a historically grounded concept of musical listening. Villancicos on the subject of music, such as those that will be studied in part II, consistently articulate a conception of music within the tradition of Christian Neoplatonism, as developed by Augustine and Boethius and reinvigorated by early modern theologians like Fray Luis de Granada and music theorists like Athanasius Kircher.[7] These writers understand earthly music to be an imperfect reflection of higher forms of music—beyond the harmony of the spheres to the angelic chorus and the mysterious harmonies of the triune Godhead. The listener's task is to discern those elements of earthly music that

7. Luis de Granada, *Introducción del símbolo de la fe*, Biblioteca de autores españoles 6 (1583; Madrid: M. Rivadeneyra, 1871); Athanasius Kircher, *Mvsvrgia vniversalis, sive Ars magna consoni et dissoni in X. libros digesta* (Rome, 1650).

point upward to these higher harmonies. The created world, they teach, presents people with a "book of nature," and it is humans' task to learn to read this book and thereby come to know and adore its author. In an age in which most books were read aloud, music becomes a way to hear the book of nature read aloud. For people who understood "Man" as a microcosm of all creation, the human voice made audible the very structure of the universe.

In this conception, music is much more than a mere delivery system for doctrinally appropriate words, as a simplistic notion of religious arts in this period might suggest. Rather, it appealed to hearing as a witness of the artifice of creation and the wonders of its creator, and even further, it promised to align hearers in harmony both with God and with each other.

This understanding makes it possible to propose a preliminary taxonomy of how villancicos functioned theologically to connect faith and hearing. I identify three modes of listening to villancicos that emphasize different theological functions: mnemonic, contemplative, and affective. These three functions emphasize, respectively, music's potential to serve as a tool for remembering words and concepts, music's ability to disclose the hidden harmonies of creation, and music's power to move human bodies in sympathetic vibration and unite them with the divine.

Chapter 2: Making Faith Appeal to Hearing

The second chapter interprets villancicos as part of a broader discourse on the relationship between hearing and faith in the Spanish Catholic world. After the Council of Trent, theologians placed a new emphasis on making faith appeal to the sense of hearing, to contribute to the educational, missionary, and colonial goals of the newly global church. Villancicos on themes of sensation and faith include allegorical contests of the senses, representations of sensory confusion, and comic dialogues featuring deaf men.

The Tridentine Catechism begins with Romans 10:17, "Faith comes by hearing, and hearing by the word of Christ."[8] The Roman Church, it says, is the embodiment of Christ, the

8. Catholic Church, *Catechismus ex decreto sacrosancti Concilii Tridentini: iussu Pij V. pontif. max. editus* (London, 1614).

Word of God, in the world. Its teachers must accommodate their teaching to "the sense of hearing and intelligence" of listeners. But the catechism also acknowledges that listeners must be trained to hear properly.

This paradoxical challenge of appealing to the ear even while training it was most clear on the missions and in colonial settings. For example, Duarte de Sande's account of five Japanese youths who toured Europe with the Jesuits in the 1580s demonstrates that both personal subjectivity and cultural conditioning affected people's ability to hear the Church's teaching rightly.[9] People needed to learn to listen properly in order to acquire faith and not be deceived or confused.

Athanasius Kircher wrote in 1650 that the right kind of music fitted to sacred words could move listeners to "experience the truth of what was said."[10] But Kircher takes for granted that listeners know how to hear music rightly, even as he elsewhere acknowledges that individuals and nations perceive music differently. Both individual subjectivity and cultural conditioning, then, posed challenges to the task of making faith appeal to the ear. While in some ways music promised to break through obstacles of perception, music also required individual and communal "ear training" to successfully connect people with the Church.

Spanish literature gives evidence of widespread anxiety about hearing and faith. A striking example is the 1634 Corpus Christi play, *El nuevo palacio del Retiro*, by court poet Pedro Calderón de la Barca.[11] As part of the festivities inaugurating Philip IV's new palace retreat, the Buen Retiro, Calderón staged both a contest of the senses before the allegorical character Faith. Faith crowns Hearing not because of his strengths but because of the sense's "incertitude," because he humbly admits that he is "the sense most easily deceived." If hearing is so easily deceived, how could the church effectively use auditory art forms like sung poetry and drama to propagate faith? This doubt becomes even stronger when Calderón stages an extended

9. Duarte de Sande, *Japanese Travellers in Sixteenth-Century Europe: A Dialogue concerning the Mission of the Japanese Ambassadors to the Roman Curia (1590)*, ed. Derek Massarella, trans. J. F. Moran, annotated translation of *De missione legatorvm Iaponensium* (Macao, 1590) with introduction (London: The Hakluyt Society/Ashgate, 2012).

10. Kircher, *Musurgia universalis*.

11. Pedro Calderón de la Barca, *El nuevo palacio del Retiro*, ed. Alan K. G. Paterson, Autos sacramentales completos de Calderón 19 (Pamplona: Universidad de Navarra, 1998).

anti-Semitic dialogue in which Judaism confesses his inability to believe what Faith tells him, lamenting, "I have listened to Faith without faith." Recalling the Tridentine Catechism's emphasis on both accommodation and training, how was one supposed to acquire the capacity to hear "the Faith" of the church, *with* faith?

The villancicos studied in this chapter form part of the effort to make faith appeal to hearing, by addressing directly the relationship between the two. Two pieces based on the same poem stage a contest of the senses like that of Calderón; they were composed in the later seventeenth century by successive chapelmasters at Segovia Cathedral Miguel de Irízar and Jerónimo de Carrión. Each sense receives a "hearing" before Faith, who gives first prize to Hearing. Two "villancicos of the deaf" by Matías Ruíz of Madrid and Juan Gutiérrez de Padilla of Puebla demonstrate a prevalent fascination with the problematic role of hearing in acquiring faith. Both pieces present comic catechism lessons between religous teachers and hard-of-hearing men who mishear the teaching in absurd and even impious ways. These pieces mock people with hearing impairments while also poking fun at ineffective and incompetent teachers, and warning against spiritual deafness.

Devotional music about hearing and faith reflects a certain amount of doubt and anxiety about how much hearing could be trusted, who had the proper capacity for faithful hearing, and how the church could overcome these obstacles to promulgate its teaching and devotion. Like the metamusical pieces studied in the first chapter, these villancicos do not assume passive listeners ready to be branded with Christian dogma; rather, they challenge listeners to think about the act of hearing itself.

Part II: Listening for Unhearable Music

The next part of the book presents detailed case studies of particular villancico traditions (related poems and their musical settings) that represent divine and heavenly music. These metamusical pieces encapsulate, through their musical structures, contemporary beliefs about music's sacred power. As the creators of villancicos developed a consistent set of theological,

poetic, and musical tropes, they used this subgenre to prove their mastery and establish themselves within a tradition of metamusical representation.

Chapter 3: Hearing the Christ-Child Sing in the "Voices of the Chapel Choir" (Puebla, 1657)

The next two chapters interprets villancico families that represent Christ as both singer and song. The first is *Voces, las de la capilla*, set by Juan Gutiérrez de Padilla (Puebla, 1657). The second is *Suspended, cielos, vuestro dulce canto*, set by Joan Cererols (Montserrat, ca. 1660). Both pieces invite hearers to listen contemplatively for the voice of Christ echoing in the voices of the chapel choir, and they proclaim that human voices can be a means through which God reorders the created world to be in harmony with the incarnate Christ.

In Padilla's *Voces*, the chorus exhorts itself, "Voices of the chapel choir,/ keep count with what is sung,/ for the King is a musician." In a series of ingenious and cryptic conceits after the manner of the influential Baroque poet Luis de Góngora, the piece celebrates the baby Jesus as the heir of the musician-king David, as chapelmaster, singer, and even as the song that is sung. Christ's life, death, and resurrection as God incarnate represent a "composition" in which the divine chapelmaster could "prove the consonances of Man and God." Padilla projects and dramatizes the poem through musical techniques both literal and figurative, from punning on the numbers and solmization syllables in the poem to evoking the song of angels, men, and beasts in Christ's stable in the style of a double-choir madrigal.

Padilla's piece distills the central elements of Christmas devotion in his time. The chapter unlocks its rich meanings by reading it in the context of liturgy, preaching, and Biblical interpretation. The sources for interpretation are based on materials that were available to Padilla himself, from the evidence of Puebla's seminary and convent libraries; with particular emphasis on the exegetical writings of Cornelius à Lapide and a contemporary model sermon of Fray Luis de Granada.

A central part of the trope of voice at Christmas is the patristic concept of the

Christ-child as *Verbum infans*, found in Christmas sermons by St. Augustine and St. Bernard of Clairvaux. The trope reveres Christ as the Word made flesh (Jn. 1) who as an infant (Latin *in-fans*) is unable to speak any words, but who is, in his body, the Word itself. This villancico extends the trope by interpreting Christ's inarticulate cries as musical performance.

The relationship of Padilla's *Voces, las de la capilla* to similar pieces suggests that Padilla used this metamusical piece to establish his compositional pedigree and demonstrate his mastery of the craft. The chapter compares Padilla's text to a similar one set ten years earlier by the chapelmaster of Seville Cathedral, Luis Bernardo Jalón; there is also evidence for an earlier lost setting by Francisco de Santiago, Jalón's predecessor at Seville and possibly a personal acquaintance of Padilla's.

Chapter 4: Heavenly Dissonance (Montserrat, 1660s)

The next chapter focuses on another treatment of the same *Verbum infans* trope, with greater emphasis on the relationship between heavenly music and earthly music, which includes the music of the spheres. The villancico *Suspended, cielos* by Joan Cererols, represents a family of villancico poems set to music in various versions at least eight times between 1651 and the end of the seventeenth century. "Suspend, O heavens, your sweet chant," Cererols's chorus begins: the harmony of the spheres is out of tune, and must give way to "the newest consonance"—the voice of the Christ-child. Here again, Christ is *Verbum infans*, and his cries are the "plainchant" on which the music of a new creation will be based.

The musical setting projects the musical concepts of the poem through a masterful musical-rhetorical discourse. Cererols structures the piece with two primary motivic subjects and two contrasting styles, which map onto a contrast between worldly music (including the spheres) and divine and angelic music. At one point the motive associated with divine music becomes the subject of an eight-voice fugue for the full double chorus, with fugal answers in inversion. At the end of the piece, setting the words "bears the plainchant to the angels," it becomes the literal cantus firmus of a section in the style of a cantus-firmus motet.

In keeping with a contemplative listening practice, Cererols draws listeners' attention to the musical structure itself as the bearer of meaning. Cererols highlights the artificiality, indeed the imperfection, of his own music, when he sets the phrase "listen to the newest consonance" with the last word on a prominent unprepared dissonance. This dissonance becomes an ironic symbol that prompts the hearer to listen for a higher music, audible only with the ears of faith.

As with *Voces*, the chapter traces the genealogy of the *Suspended, cielos* family through multiple poetic versions, which also provide evidence for lost musical settings. The imprints demonstrate that from a 1651 Royal Chapel performance in Madrid, the text traveled quickly through a network of affiliated composers across Iberia and into the New World, including a fragmentary musical setting from a convent in Ecuador. The chapter delineates three main textual families, one of which is based on the influential villancico poet Manuel de León Marchante's elaborated version of the poem. The different versions reflect changing attitudes toward heavenly music.

This villancico connects Christ's voice, and the choir's voices, to the music of the planetary spheres, prompting an interpretation rooted in contemporary astronomical beliefs. This also allows for a reappraisal of John Hollander's study of themes of heavenly music in English poetry of this period.[12] In an age of new astronomical discoveries, it may be that this emphasis on the untunefulness of the heavens, bears witness to a growing anxiety about the old cosmology. But rather than providing evidence for a "disenchantment" and secularization process, villancicos on heavenly music continue to manifest genuine belief in the old cosmology; though they do show an increasing preference for human affective experience over abstract astronomical speculation.

Chapter 5: The Earthly Side of Celestial Music (Segovia, 1680s)

The first piece of the cycle composed for Christmas 1678 at Segovia Cathedral by its chapelmaster Miguel de Irízar is a metamusical piece about celestial music coming down to

12. John Hollander, *The Untuning of the Sky: Ideas of Music in English Poetry 1500–1700* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1961).

earth: *Qué música celestial*. This chapter traces the tropes of heavenly music as they continue to develop in the later seventeenth-century. By focusing on the composition of this Christmas cycle, the chapter provides the first detailed study of how a complete set of villancicos was composed, from assembling the poetic texts to drafting the musical setting and having it copied and performed. This study shows the earthly side of creating heavenly music by bringing readers into Irízar's workshop as he provides for the specific needs of his local community.

Segovia Cathedral's remarkable archive is one of the only places to preserve a large number of draft scores by seventeenth-century Spanish composers, rather than just performing parts. These sources are even more precious because Miguel de Irízar wrote them in makeshift notebooks assembled from his received letters, fitting music on the backsides and margins of the letters. The dates on the letters, then, allow for an unprecedented amount of detail in tracking Irízar's compositional process. Moreover, the letters are largely correspondence from other musicians regarding the exchange of villancico poetry. Thus, focusing on the cycle of pieces for Christmas 1678, it is possible to determine exactly how Irízar obtained all of the poems for his cycle through his network of colleagues, and how he reworked these sources into a coherent cycle of his own.

The first piece in the set, *Qué música celestial*, continues the traditions of metamusical villancicos using simple but ingenious means to create contrasts between earthly and heavenly music. Irízar was an economical composer in every sense of the word. His output was designed to meet local devotional needs, including a special local cult of St. Blaise (San Blas), for which Irízar wrote numerous villancicos. In the difficult economic environment of late seventeenth-century Spain, Irízar found ways to use his scarce resources to meet local demand and support the community both spiritually and practically.

Chapter 6: Offering and Imitation (Zaragoza and Puebla, 1670–1700)

The first section of this chapter compares two villancicos in which one composer is clearly modeling a metamusical villancico on the poetry and musical setting of a more senior composer.

As Pedro Calahorra discovered, a villancico poem beginning *Suban las voces al cielo* was set first by Pablo Bruna, the blind organist of Daroca in the region of Zaragoza, and then in a variant text by Miguel Ambiela, who had studied in Daroca just after Bruna's death and who would later go on to prestigious positions in Lérida, Zaragoza, and Toledo.[13] The similarities between the pieces make it clear that Ambiela's work is a conscious homage to Bruna's, even as the differences also demonstrate how Ambiela differentiated himself from the older generation's aesthetic.

Ambiela's piece is a kind of offering, then, putting forth his best effort in homage to an admired older master. This is fitting since both villancico poems represent music as a form of offering. The chapter examines the Bruna villancico in light of Spanish mystical theology, particular the concepts of fire in the *Flame of Living Love* by St. John of the Cross. Iconography and epigrammatic poetry by Sebastián de Covarrubias deepen the understanding of music's relation to fire and air, explaining how music could serve as a fitting means of self-offering.

Ambiela's version keeps the specific musical references from Bruna's text, but resituates them as an act of devotion to the Blessed Virgin. His villancico shows how some of the same musical tropes that we have seen associated with Christ's Incarnation and Eucharistic presence could be adapted to suit sanctoral devotion.

A piece by another composer in the region of Zaragoza, José de Cáseda (*Qué música divina*, ca. 1700), further develops the concepts of music as an act of offering, as it meditates on Christ's passion through the conceit of Christ as a *vihuela*. The piece identifies Christ with both a *vihuela* and a *cítara*, comparing the stretching of strings over the bridge to Christ's being stretched out on the cross, the placement of tuning pins to the nails in Christ's hands, the bow to the lance that pierced his side. It specifies that this is a seven-course vihuela, because of the seven sacraments flowing from the spear wound. This music, it says, "is not for the ears," for even if anyone could hear it, "as many notes as they would hear, they would perceive as false"—that is, as out of tune.

Taking the conceit literally provides insights into odd features of the musical structures:

13. Pedro Calahorra Martínez, "'Suban las vozes al Cielo' Villancico polifónico de Miguel Ambiela prodia del homónimo de su maestro Pablo Bruna," *Nassarre: Revista Aragonesa de Musicología* 2, no. 1 (1986): 9–42.

Cáseda imitates the structure and style of the vihuela through the vocal texture, such that the choir itself embodies the vihuela, and by extension, Christ's own body. Allegorical traditions connect plucked chordophones—originally the cithara and lyre—to the body of Christ and by extension to the bodies of virgins and martyrs, as Craig Monson has shown.[14] The villancico extends this patristic tradition by applying it to a contemporary Spanish instrument.

To embody the poetic concept of the "music" of Christ's passion as sounding "false," Cáseda plays with various types of musical falsehood. These range from blatant solecisms like parallel fifths, to an enigmatic passage that appears to intentionally defy *musica ficta* conventions, creating a kind of impossible music. As the piece goes to rather extreme lengths to depict musical "falsehood," it also demonstrates the limits of imitation within the metamusical villancico tradition, since it shows the pressure to outdo previous composers in highlighting musical artifice. The piece only survives in a copy from a convent in Puebla, and thus it also gives insight into the unique functions of villancicos within cloistered communities and in a colonial context.

3 Plans

The book follows the general plan and content of my 2015 dissertation, but this will be a new work.[15] The chapters are reorganized and many of the ideas are reconceived in light of a longer and deeper engagement with the primary sources and continued dialogue with current secondary literature. I am rewriting the chapters completely in a more concise, argument-driven manner for a broader audience. The chapters should be able to stand somewhat independently so that they can be assigned as course reading assignments.

Though the book largely focuses on close textual analysis, I am taking care to avoid technical language wherever possible, and to frame the analysis within broader discourses of

14. Craig Monson, *Divas in the Convent: Nuns, Music, and Defiance in Seventeenth-Century Italy* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2012).

15. Andrew A. Cashner, "Faith, Hearing, and the Power of Music in Hispanic Villancicos, 1600–1700" (PhD diss., University of Chicago, 2015).

wide interest. The analysis is also leavened by biographical sketches and historical vignettes, aiming to help readers imagine the full cultural context of this music as ritual and performance, as a human activity in a particular place and time. A preface, glossary, and other supplemental material will provide explanation of the more difficult concepts in music theory, literary theory, theology, and the Spanish colonial system. Scholars from different disciplines will be able to follow the central arguments even without every detail of the musical, poetic, and theological analyses.

Each chapter will be about 20,000 words in manuscript, for a total of around 120,000 words. I estimate that I will need three to four months to complete each chapter. Chapters two and three are already finished; four chapters remain plus conclusions and polishing the whole. (The introduction and conclusion chapters will be shorter than the others.) I am planning to complete the manuscript by December 1, 2019. I intend to apply for an internal fellowship with the University of Rochester Humanities Center for the fall semester of 2019, which would allow me a leave from teaching to finish the book.

There will be two or three figures in each chapter of black-and-white photographs of paintings and manuscript sources or scans of printed iconography. All of the chapters include several tables, and several feature my own line diagrams; the book should also include a map of the cities discussed in Spain and New Spain. There will be about five or six full-page musical examples in each chapter, which I will prepare myself. I intend to secure funding to make recordings of all the music examples in the book, which will make the book more accessible to all readers. I am also capable of designing and maintaining an accompanying website with videos, images, links to related scholarship, and other supplementary materials.

To accompany the monograph I am separately publishing full musical editions for the scores discussed in the book through the peer-reviewed Web Library of Seventeenth Century Music.[16] These editions will be available freely online. The first volume of these editions was published last year.

16. Andrew A. Cashner, ed., *Villancicos about Music from Seventeenth-Century Spain and New Spain*, Web Library of Seventeenth-Century Music 32 (Society for Seventeenth-Century Music, 2017), http://www.sscm-wlscm.org/.

For reviewers, I would recommend Geoffrey Baker, Bernardo Illari, David Irving, Tess Knighton, Paul Laird, Elisabeth LeGuin, Álvaro Torrente, and David Yearsley.