

Heuristic Analysis

Heuristic Descriptions

I will start by going through the three heuristics I created, and describing how they work from a high level:

- Custom_Score is a copy cat strategy, trying as hard as it can to do what the other player did their previous move
- Custom_Score_2 can be described as an extended AB_improved
- Custom_Score_3 can be described as a modified AB_improved

Custom_Score Description

Custom_Score is a copy cat strategy:

It is incredibly simple: it will try to place pieces as close to where the other player placed their piece last turn.

Custom_Score_2 Description

Custom_Score_2 can be described as an extended AB_improved:

- Custom_Score_2 calculates the difference between it's moves, and its opponents moves the same way that AB_Improved does,
 - If Custom_Score_2 is ahead of the opponent, it will try to place pieces as close to the bottom right corner as possible
 - Otherwise, if Custom_Score_2 is behind, it will play the same AB_Improved
- The thinking behind Custom_Score_2's strategy, is that if placing pieces in the bottom right corner is outperforming AB_Improved, then it will continue to keep placing pieces in the bottom right corner, which should lead to it winning,
 - If placing pieces in the bottom right, isn't working, then it will revert to the same strategy as AB_Improved, which should give it a chance to win a game it is falling behind in

Custom_Score_3 Description

Custom_Score_3 can be described as a modified AB_Improved:

- It uses two parts to calculate utility:
 - Part 1: the difference between players and the opponents moves
 - Part 2: the distance between the player and the opponent, the player is incentivized to try to get away from the other player
- These two parts are added together and returned to drive the agents behaviour

Heuristic Performance

Custom_Score Performance

Each table was created running tournament.py with 500 matches (1000 games total). The Custom_Score heuristic doesn't tend to do very well against the majority of example opponents.

| ***** Playing Matches ***** | | | | | |
|-----------------------------------|-------------|-------------|------|-----------|------|
| Match # | Opponent | AB_Improved | | AB_Custom | |
| | | Won | Lost | Won | Lost |
| 1 | Random | 311 | 689 | 417 | 583 |
| 2 | MM_Open | 341 | 659 | 447 | 553 |
| 3 | MM_Center | 348 | 652 | 449 | 551 |
| 4 | MM_Improved | 514 | 486 | 663 | 337 |
| 5 | AB_Open | 341 | 659 | 423 | 577 |
| 6 | AB_Center | 356 | 644 | 434 | 566 |
| 7 | AB_Improved | 484 | 516 | 683 | 317 |
| ----- | | | | | |
| Win Rate: | | 38.5% | | 50.2% | |

However, Custom_Score does well against AB_Improved, winning roughly 2/3's of the games when it plays 500 matches against AB_Improved. For this reason, **I choose Custom_Score as the best heuristic of the three I created.**

| ***** Playing Matches ***** | | | | | |
|-----------------------------------|-------------|-------------|------|-----------|------|
| Match # | Opponent | AB_Improved | | AB_Custom | |
| | | Won | Lost | Won | Lost |
| 1 | AB_Improved | 523 | 477 | 649 | 351 |
| ----- | | | | | |
| Win Rate: | | 52.3% | | 64.9% | |

| ***** Playing Matches ***** | | | | | |
|-----------------------------------|-------------|-------------|------|-----------|------|
| Match # | Opponent | AB_Improved | | AB_Custom | |
| | | Won | Lost | Won | Lost |
| 1 | AB_Improved | 506 | 494 | 670 | 330 |
| ----- | | | | | |
| Win Rate: | | 50.6% | | 67.0% | |

Why does Custom_Score do so well against AB_Improved:

(I DON'T KNOW)

For these reason I think Custom_Score is the heuristic that should be choosen.

Custom_Score_2 Performance

From all my tests, it looks as though Custom_Score_2 is always close to having a 50%-win rate against the 7 example agents, but never manages to get above 50%.

| ***** Playing Matches ***** | | | | | |
|-----------------------------------|-------------|-------------|------|-------------|------|
| Match # | Opponent | AB_Improved | | AB_Custom_2 | |
| | | Won | Lost | Won | Lost |
| 1 | Random | 307 | 693 | 404 | 596 |
| 2 | MM_Open | 330 | 670 | 436 | 564 |
| 3 | MM_Center | 364 | 636 | 431 | 569 |
| 4 | MM_Improved | 500 | 500 | 655 | 345 |
| 5 | AB_Open | 337 | 663 | 416 | 584 |
| 6 | AB_Center | 357 | 643 | 440 | 560 |
| 7 | AB_Improved | 506 | 494 | 656 | 344 |
| Win Rate: | | 38.6% | | 49.1% | |

Custom_Score_2 performs similarly against AB_Improved, winning roughly 2/3 of games. However it does perform slightly worse than Custom_Score.

| ***** Playing Matches ***** | | | | | |
|-----------------------------------|-------------|-------------|------|-------------|------|
| Match # | Opponent | AB_Improved | | AB_Custom_2 | |
| | | Won | Lost | Won | Lost |
| 1 | AB_Improved | 495 | 505 | 622 | 378 |
| Win Rate: | | 49.5% | | 62.2% | |

| ***** Playing Matches ***** | | | | | |
|-----------------------------------|-------------|-------------|------|-------------|------|
| Match # | Opponent | AB_Improved | | AB_Custom_2 | |
| | | Won | Lost | Won | Lost |
| 1 | AB_Improved | 497 | 503 | 655 | 345 |
| Win Rate: | | 49.7% | | 65.5% | |

Custom_Score_3 Performance

Custom_Score_3 does the worst against the other 7 test agents.

| ***** | | | | | |
|-----------------|-------------|-------------|------|-------------|------|
| Playing Matches | | | | | |
| ***** | | | | | |
| Match # | Opponent | AB_Improved | | AB_Custom_3 | |
| | | Won | Lost | Won | Lost |
| 1 | Random | 294 | 706 | 324 | 676 |
| 2 | MM_Open | 335 | 665 | 338 | 662 |
| 3 | MM_Center | 359 | 641 | 348 | 652 |
| 4 | MM_Improved | 489 | 511 | 577 | 423 |
| 5 | AB_Open | 279 | 721 | 334 | 666 |
| 6 | AB_Center | 338 | 662 | 352 | 648 |
| 7 | AB_Improved | 484 | 516 | 638 | 362 |
| ----- | | | | | |
| Win Rate: | | 36.8% | | 41.6% | |

Custom_Score_3 wins roughly 60% of it's games against AB_Improved, which is a little worse than the roughly 66% that Custom_Score and Custom_Score_2 win.

| ***** | | | | | |
|-----------------|-------------|-------------|------|-------------|------|
| Playing Matches | | | | | |
| ***** | | | | | |
| Match # | Opponent | AB_Improved | | AB_Custom_3 | |
| | | Won | Lost | Won | Lost |
| 1 | AB_Improved | 469 | 531 | 599 | 401 |
| ----- | | | | | |
| Win Rate: | | 46.9% | | 59.9% | |

| ***** | | | | | |
|-----------------|-------------|-------------|------|-------------|------|
| Playing Matches | | | | | |
| ***** | | | | | |
| Match # | Opponent | AB_Improved | | AB_Custom_3 | |
| | | Won | Lost | Won | Lost |
| 1 | AB_Improved | 501 | 499 | 587 | 413 |
| ----- | | | | | |
| Win Rate: | | 50.1% | | 58.7% | |