Problem Set 6 February 13, 2025

Solutions by Andrew Lys

Collaborated with Sam Fine andrewlys (at) u.e.

## Gaussian Mixtures

1.

## Modeling Text Documents

## 2. A Simple Model.

(a) We shall denote  $p_{\text{topic}}$  as p, since it is given that this is a single probability. For simplicity, we assume that  $y \in \{0, 1\}$ , and that  $x \in \{0, 1\}^N$ . We denote x[i] to be the ith coordinate of the sample x.

$$S = \{(x_1, y_1), \dots, (x_n, y_n)\}\$$

We define the following sample statistics. For  $x \in \{0,1\}, y \in \{0,1\}$ :

$$n_j(y,x) = |\{i : (x_i, y_i) \in S, x_i[j] = x, y_i = y\}|$$

$$n(y) = |\{i : (x_i, y_i) \in S, y_i = y\}|$$

We want to find estimators for p and for

$$P(x[1] = x_1, \dots, x[N] = x_N | y = y)$$

By the independence of x[i]|y, we can simplify this expression:

$$P(x[1] = x_1, ..., x[N] = x_N | y = y) = \prod_{i=1}^{N} P(x[i] = x_i | y = y)$$

Thus, we can focus on estimators of p and  $P(x[i] = x|y = y) := p_i(x|y)$  (I know that this swaps the arguments of  $n_i(y, x)$ , it's too much to change now). We should expect our MLEs for p and  $p_i(x|y)$  to be the sample means, i.e.

$$\hat{p} = \frac{n(1)}{n}$$

$$\hat{p}_i(x|y) = \frac{n_i(y,x)}{n(y)}$$

We define our log-likelihood function as

$$\ell(\theta|S) = \sum_{i=1}^{n} \log(P(y=y_i, x[1] = x_i[1], \dots, x[N] = x_i[N]))$$

Given that S was drawn i.i.d., we can simplify.

$$\ell(\theta|S) = \sum_{i=1}^{n} \log(P(x[1] = x_i[1], \dots, x[N] = x_i[N]|y = y_i)P(y = y_i))$$

$$= \sum_{i=1}^{n} \log(P(y = y_i) \prod_{j=1}^{N} P(x[j] = x_i[j]|y = y_i))$$

$$= \sum_{i=1}^{n} \log(P(y = y_i)) + \sum_{j=1}^{N} \log(P(x[j] = x_i[j]|y = y_i))$$

$$= \sum_{i=1}^{n} \log(P(y = y_i)) + \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \log(p_j(x_i[j]|y_i))$$

Writing the parameters explicitly, we have:

$$\ell(\theta|S) = \sum_{i=1}^{n} \log(P(y=y_i|p)) + \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \log(P(x[i]=x_j[i]|y_i, p_i(x|y)))$$

To solve for the minimum of  $\ell(\theta|S)$ , we use the method of Lagrange multipliers. First, we can split the problem into two steps. It's clear that that right sum does not depend on p, so we can begin by finding the optimal p.

We note:

$$P(y = y_i|p) = P(y = y_i|y_i = 1, p)P(y_i = 1|p) + P(y = y_i|y_i = 0, p)P(y_i = 0|p)$$

$$= P(y = 1|p)[[y_i = 1]] + P(y = 0|p)[[y_i = 0]]$$

$$= p^{y_i}(1 - p)^{1 - y_i}$$

Plugging this into our log-likelihood, we have:

$$\ell(\theta|S) = \sum_{i=1}^{n} \log(p^{y_i}(1-p)^{1-y_i}) + \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \log(P(x[i] = x_j[i]|y_i, p_i(x|y)))$$

$$= \sum_{i=1}^{n} y_i \log(p) + (1-y_i) \log(1-p) + \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \log(P(x[i] = x_j[i]|y_i, p_i(x|y)))$$

Taking the derivative with respect to p and setting it to zero, we have:

$$\frac{d}{dp}\ell(\theta|S) = \sum_{i=1}^{n} \frac{y_i}{p} - \frac{1 - y_i}{1 - p} = 0$$

$$\sum_{i=1}^{n} \frac{y_i}{p} = \sum_{i=1}^{n} \frac{1 - y_i}{1 - p}$$

$$\frac{1 - p}{p} = \frac{\sum_{i=1}^{n} 1 - y_i}{\sum_{i=1}^{n} y_i}$$

$$p = \frac{\sum_{i=1}^{n} y_i}{p}$$

Thus, we have that  $\hat{p} = \frac{n(1)}{n}$ . Now, we solve for  $\hat{p}_i(x|y)$ , by using the method of Lagrange multipliers. Our objective function is as follows:

$$\sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \log(P(x[j] = x_i[j]|y_i))$$

We can write this in a nicer form.

$$\begin{split} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \log(P(x[j] = x_{i}[j]|y_{i})) &= \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \log(p_{j}(x_{i}[j]|y_{i})) \\ &= \sum_{j=1}^{N} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{x \in \{0,1\}} [[x_{i}[j] = x]] \log(p_{j}(x|y_{i})) \\ &= \sum_{j=1}^{N} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{x \in \{0,1\}} \sum_{y \in \{0,1\}} [[x_{i}[j] = x \land y_{i} = y]] \log(p_{j}(x|y)) \\ &= \sum_{j=1}^{N} \sum_{x \in \{0,1\}} \sum_{y \in \{0,1\}} \log(p_{j}(x|y)) \sum_{i=1}^{n} [[x_{i}[j] = x \land y_{i} = y]] \\ &= \sum_{j=1}^{N} \sum_{y \in \{0,1\}} \sum_{x \in \{0,1\}} \log(p_{j}(x|y)) n_{j}(y,x) \end{split}$$

We now have the following constraints:

$$\sum_{x \in \{0,1\}} p_j(x|y) = 1 \qquad \forall y \in \{0,1\}, j \in [N]$$

This gives us the following Lagrangian:

$$\mathcal{L} = \sum_{j=1}^{N} \sum_{y \in \{0,1\}} \sum_{x \in \{0,1\}} \log(p_j(x|y)) n_j(y,x) + \sum_{j=1}^{N} \sum_{y \in \{0,1\}} \lambda_j(y) \left( \sum_{x \in \{0,1\}} p_j(x|y) - 1 \right)$$

Taking the derivatives with respect to  $p_i(x|y)$ , we have:

$$[p_j(x|y)]: \frac{n_j(y,x)}{p_j(x|y)} = \lambda_j(y)$$
  
 $[\lambda_j(y)]: \sum_{x \in \{0,1\}} p_j(x|y) = 1$ 

Since we have equality, in  $\lambda_j(y)$ , for  $x \in \{0,1\}$  we can solve for  $p_j(x|y)$ :

$$\begin{split} \frac{n_j(y,x)}{p_j(x|y)} &= \frac{n_j(y,1-x)}{p_j(1-x|y)} \\ p_j(1-x|y) &= \frac{n_j(y,1-x)}{n_j(y,x)} p_j(x|y) \\ &\Longrightarrow 1 = p_j(x|y) + \frac{n_j(y,1-x)}{n_j(y,x)} p_j(x|y) \\ n_j(y,x) &= p_j(x|y) n_j(y,x) + n_j(y,1-x) p_j(x|y) \\ &= p_j(x|y) (n_j(y,x) + n_j(y,1-x)) \\ p_j(x|y) &= \frac{n_j(y,x)}{n_j(y,x) + n_j(y,1-x)} \\ \hat{p}_j(x|y) &= \frac{n_j(y,x)}{n(y)} \end{split}$$

(b) Using Baye's Law, and conditional independence we have:

$$\begin{split} P(Y=1|X=x) &= \frac{P(X=x|Y=1)P(Y=1)}{P(X=x)} \\ &= \frac{P(X[1]=x[1],\ldots,X[N]=x[N]|Y=1)P(Y=1)}{P(X[1]=x[1],\ldots,X[N]=x[n])} \\ &= \frac{P(Y=1)\prod_{i=1}^{N}P(X[i]=x[i]|Y=1)}{P(X[1]=x[1],\ldots,X[N]=x[n]|Y=1)P(Y=1) + P(X[1]=x[1],\ldots,X[n]=x[n]|Y=0)P(Y=0)} \\ &= \frac{p\prod_{i=1}^{N}p_i(x[i]|1)}{p\prod_{i=1}^{N}p_i(x[i]|1) + (1-p)\prod_{i=1}^{N}p_i(x[i]|0)} \end{split}$$

Now we can reduce this into the form of a logistic function.

$$P(Y = 1|X = x) = \frac{p \prod_{i=1}^{N} p_i(x[i]|1)}{p \prod_{i=1}^{N} p_i(x[i]|1) + (1-p) \prod_{i=1}^{N} p_i(x[i]|0)}$$

$$= \frac{1}{1 + \frac{1-p}{p} \frac{\prod_{i=1}^{N} p_i(x[i]|0)}{\prod_{i=1}^{N} p_i(x[i]|1)}}$$

$$= \frac{1}{1 + e^{-(\log(\frac{p}{1-p}) + \sum_{i=1}^{N} \log(\frac{p_i(x[i]|1)}{p_i(x[i]|0)}))}}$$
3

Therefore, we can get our discriminant as follows:

$$r(x) = \log\left(\frac{p}{1-p}\right) + \sum_{i=1}^{N} \log\left(\frac{p_i(x[i]|1)}{p_i(x[i]|0)}\right)$$

(c) We can simplify the discriminant by noting

$$p_i(x|y) = p_i(1|y)^x p_i(0|y)^{1-x}$$

Giving us

$$\begin{split} r(x) &= \log \left(\frac{p}{1-p}\right) + \sum_{i=1}^{N} \log \left(\frac{p_i(1|1)^{x[i]}p_i(0|1)^{1-x[i]}}{p_i(1|0)^{x[i]}p_i(0|0)^{1-x[i]}}\right) \\ &= \log \left(\frac{p}{1-p}\right) + \sum_{i=1}^{N} \left(x[i] \log \left(\frac{p_i(1|1)}{p_i(1|0)}\right) + (1-x[i]) \log \left(\frac{p_i(0|1)}{p_i(0|0)}\right)\right) \\ &= \log \left(\frac{p}{1-p}\right) + \sum_{i=1}^{N} x[i] \log \left(\frac{p_i(1|1)}{p_i(1|0)}\right) + -x[i] \log \left(\frac{p_i(0|1)}{p_i(0|0)}\right) + \log \left(\frac{p_i(0|1)}{p_i(0|0)}\right) \\ &= \log \left(\frac{p}{1-p}\right) + \sum_{i=1}^{N} x[i] \left(\log \left(\frac{p_i(1|1)}{p_i(1|0)}\right) - \log \left(\frac{p_i(0|1)}{p_i(0|0)}\right)\right) + \log \left(\frac{p_i(0|1)}{p_i(0|0)}\right) \\ &= \log \left(\frac{p}{1-p}\right) + \sum_{i=1}^{N} \log \left(\frac{p_i(0|1)}{p_i(0|0)}\right) + \sum_{i=1}^{N} x[i] \left(\log \left(\frac{p_i(1|1)}{p_i(0|0)}\right)\right) \end{split}$$

The feature map must include a constant 1 to account for the term on the left, and must have N more features for each of x[i]. Thus, our feature map is simply:

$$\phi: x \mapsto (1, x[1], \dots, x[N])$$

Therefore, our vector w, such that  $r(x) = \langle w, \phi(x) \rangle$ , is:

$$w = \left(\log\left(\frac{p}{1-p}\right) + \sum_{i=1}^{N}\log\left(\frac{p_i(0|1)}{p_i(0|0)}\right), \log\left(\frac{p_1(1|1)}{p_1(0|1)}\frac{p_1(0|0)}{p_1(1|0)}\right), \dots, \log\left(\frac{p_N(1|1)}{p_N(0|1)}\frac{p_N(0|0)}{p_N(1|0)}\right)\right)$$

(d) The log odds term in the bias has a simple interpretation.

$$\frac{\hat{p}}{1-\hat{p}} = \frac{n(1)/n}{n(0)/n} = \frac{n(1)}{n(0)}$$
$$\log\left(\frac{\hat{p}}{1-\hat{p}}\right) = \log\left(\frac{n(1)}{n(0)}\right)$$

Similarly,

$$\frac{\hat{p}_i(x|y)}{\hat{p}_i(x'|y')} = \frac{n_i(y,x)/n(y)}{n_i(y',x')/n(y')}$$

So,

$$\begin{split} \frac{\hat{p}_i(0|1)}{\hat{p}_i(0|0)} &= \frac{n_i(1,0)}{n_i(0,0)} \frac{n(0)}{n(1)} \\ \frac{\hat{p}_i(1|1)\hat{p}_i(0|0)}{\hat{p}_i(0|1)\hat{p}_i(1|0)} &= \frac{n_i(1,1)/n(1)n_i(0,0)/n(0)}{n_i(1,0)/n(1)n_i(0,1)/n(0)} \end{split}$$

$$= \frac{n_i(1,1)n_i(0,0)}{n_i(1,0)n_i(0,1)}$$

So we have the following simplification for w:

$$w = \left( (N-1)\log\frac{n(0)}{n(1)} + \sum_{i=1}^{N}\log\frac{n_i(1,0)}{n_i(0,0)}, \log\frac{n_1(1,1)n_1(0,0)}{n_1(1,0)n_1(0,1)}, \dots, \log\frac{n_N(1,1)n_N(0,0)}{n_N(1,0)n_N(0,1)} \right)$$

## 3. Adding a Prior.

(a) The MAP estimate is defined as follows:

$$\hat{\theta} = \arg\max_{\theta} p(\theta|S)$$

In our case,

$$\theta = (p, \{p_y\})$$

Where we define:

$$\begin{aligned} p &= P(y=1) \\ p_y[i] &= P(x[i]=1|y) \end{aligned}$$

and  $p_y$  is a vector of N elements. Let S be a sample of n i.i.d. points.

$$S = ((x_1, y_1), \dots, (x_n, y_n))$$

our posterior distribution,  $p(\theta|S)$  is given by:

$$p(p, \{p_y\}|S) = \frac{p(S|p, \{p_y\})p(p, \{p_y\})}{p(S)}$$

$$= \frac{p(X|Y, p, \{p_y\})p(Y|p, \{p_y\})p(p, \{p_y\})}{p(S)}$$

$$= \frac{p(X|Y, \{p_y\})p(Y|p)p(p, \{p, p_y\})}{p(X|Y)p(Y)}$$

where X is the vector of  $x_i$ 's and Y is the vector of  $y_i$ 's.

Note that, we are not conditioning the denominator with respect to the parameters we are optimizing over. The denominator is the distribution over the distributions of p and  $\{p_y\}$ . Therefore, we can ignore it in the optimization problem.

$$\hat{\theta} = \arg \max_{p, \{p_y\}} p(X|Y, \{p_y\}) p(Y|p) p(p, \{p_y\})$$

We break this expression down, term by term, first focusing on the last term.

$$\begin{split} p(p,\{p_y\}) &= p(p)p(\{p_y\}) = f_{Dir(1)}(p)p(p_1)p(p_0) \\ &= f_{Dir(\alpha)}(p_1)f_{Dir(\alpha)}(p_0) \\ &= \frac{1}{Z(\alpha)^2} \prod_{i=1}^N p_1[i]^{\alpha-1} p_0[i]^{\alpha-1} \end{split}$$

Since  $Z(\alpha)^2$  is fixed, we can ignore it in the expression for  $\hat{\theta}$ . Now we focus on the second term.

$$p(Y|p) = P(Y_1 = y_1, \dots, Y_n = y_n|p) = \prod_{i=1}^n P(Y_i = y_i|p)$$
$$= \prod_{i=1}^n p^{y_i} (1-p)^{1-y_i}$$

Now we focus on the first term.

$$p(X|Y, \{p_y\}) = P(X_1 = x_1, \dots, X_n = x_n | Y_1 = y_1, \dots, Y_n = y_n, \{p_y\})$$

$$= \prod_{i=1}^{n} P(X_i = x_i | Y_1 = y_1, \dots, Y_n = y_n, \{p_y\})$$

$$= \prod_{i=1}^{n} P(X_i = x_i | Y_i = y_i, \{p_y\})$$

$$= \prod_{i=1}^{n} P(X_i[1] = x_i[1], \dots, X_i[N] = x_i[N] | Y_i = y_i, \{p_y\})$$

$$= \prod_{i=1}^{n} \prod_{j=1}^{N} P(X_i[j] = x_i[j] | Y_i = y_i, \{p_y\})$$

Since log is monotone, we can take the log of our expression to get the arg max.

$$\hat{\theta} = \arg\max_{p, \{p_y\}} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \log P(X_i[j] = x_i[j] | Y_i = y_i, \{p_y\})$$

$$+ \sum_{i=1}^{n} y_i \log(p) + (1 - y_i) \log(1 - p)$$

$$+ \sum_{i=1}^{N} \sum_{y \in \{0,1\}} (\alpha - 1) \log(p_y[i])$$

First, we get  $\hat{p}$  by differentiating with respect to p and setting it to zero.

$$\frac{d}{dp}\hat{\theta} = \sum_{i=1}^{n} \frac{y_i}{p} - \frac{1 - y_i}{1 - p} = 0$$

$$\sum_{i=1}^{n} \frac{y_i}{p} = \sum_{i=1}^{n} \frac{1 - y_i}{1 - p}$$

$$\frac{1 - p}{p} = \frac{\sum_{i=1}^{n} 1 - y_i}{\sum_{i=1}^{n} y_i}$$

$$p = \frac{\sum_{i=1}^{n} y_i}{p} = \frac{n(1)}{p}$$

Where n(y) is the number of  $y_i$ 's that are equal to y. Before we try and solve for  $p_y[i]$ , we can do a better job at simplifying the first term.

$$\log P(X_{i}[j] = x_{i}[j]|Y_{i} = y_{i}, \{p_{y}\}) = [[x_{i}[j] = 1]] \log(p_{y_{i}}[j]) + [[x_{i}[j] = 0]] \log(1 - p_{y_{i}}[j])$$

$$= \log(p_{y_{i}}[j]^{x_{i}[j]}(1 - p_{y_{i}}[j])^{1 - x_{i}[j]})$$

$$= \sum_{y \in \{0,1\}} [[y_{i} = y]] \log(p_{y}[j]^{x_{i}[j]}(1 - p_{y}[j])^{1 - x_{i}[j]})$$

$$\implies \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \log P(X_{i}[j] = x_{i}[j]|Y_{i} = y_{i}, \{p_{y}\})$$

$$= \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \sum_{y \in \{0,1\}} [[y_{i} = y]] \log(p_{y}[j]^{x_{i}[j]}(1 - p_{y}[j])^{1 - x_{i}[j]})$$

$$= \sum_{j=1}^{N} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{y \in \{0,1\}} \sum_{x \in \{0,1\}} [[y_{i} = y \wedge x_{i}[j] = x]] \log(p_{y}[j]^{x}(1 - p_{y}[j])^{1 - x})$$

$$\begin{split} &= \sum_{j=1}^{N} \sum_{y \in \{0,1\}} \sum_{x \in \{0,1\}} \log(p_y[j]^x (1 - p_y[j])^{1-x}) \sum_{i=1}^{n} [[y_i = y \land x_i[j] = x]] \\ &= \sum_{j=1}^{N} \sum_{y \in \{0,1\}} \sum_{x \in \{0,1\}} \log(p_y[j]^x (1 - p_y[j])^{1-x}) n_j(x,y) \\ &= \sum_{j=1}^{N} \sum_{y \in \{0,1\}} \sum_{x \in \{0,1\}} n_j(x,y) (x \log(p_y[j]) + (1-x) \log(1 - p_y[j])) \end{split}$$

Where  $n_j(x,y)$  is the number of  $(x_i,y_i)$ 's such that  $x_i[j]=x$  and  $y_i=y$ . We differentiate with respect to  $p_y[j]$  and set equal to zero.

$$\begin{split} \frac{d}{dp_y[j]} \hat{\theta} &= \sum_{x \in \{0,1\}} n_j(x,y) \left( \frac{x}{p_y[j]} - \frac{1-x}{1-p_y[j]} \right) + (\alpha-1) \frac{1}{p_y[j]} \\ &= n_j(1,y) \frac{1}{p_y[j]} - n_j(0,y) \frac{1}{1-p_y[j]} + (\alpha-1) \frac{1}{p_y[j]} = 0 \\ \Longrightarrow \frac{1}{1-p_y[j]} n_j(0,y) &= \frac{1}{p_y[j]} (n_j(1,y) + (\alpha-1)) \\ &\Longrightarrow \frac{1-p_y[j]}{p_y[j]} &= \frac{n_j(0,y)}{n_j(1,y) + (\alpha-1)} \\ \Longrightarrow p_y[j] &= \frac{n_j(1,y) + (\alpha-1)}{n_j(0,y) + n_j(1,y) + (\alpha-1)} \\ \Longrightarrow \hat{p}_y[j] &= \frac{n_j(1,y) + (\alpha-1)}{n(y) + (\alpha-1)} \end{split}$$

(b) Recall that the discriminant is given by

$$r(x) = \log \frac{p}{1-p} + \sum_{i=1}^{N} \log \frac{p_1[i]^{x[i]} (1 - p_1[i])^{x[i]}}{p_0[i]^{x[i]} (1 - p_0[i]^{1-x[i]})}$$

We can simplify this

$$r(x) = \log \frac{p}{1-p} + \sum_{i=1}^{N} \sum_{x \in \{0,1\}} [[x[i] = x]] \left( x \log \frac{p_1[i]}{p_0[i]} + (1-x) \log \frac{1-p_1[i]}{1-p_0[i]} \right)$$

$$= \log \frac{p}{1-p} + \sum_{i=1}^{N} [[x[i] = 1]] \log \frac{p_1[i]}{p_0[i]} + [[x[i] = 0]] \log \frac{1-p_1[i]}{1-p_0[i]}$$

Taking a slightly modified feature map from before, i.e.

$$\phi: x \mapsto (x[1], \dots, x[N])$$

We have the following  $w \in \mathbb{R}^N$  and b in  $\mathbb{R}$  such that  $r(x) = \langle w, \phi(x) \rangle + b$ :

$$w[i] = \log \frac{p_1[i]}{p_0[i]} - \log \frac{1 - p_1[i]}{1 - p_0[i]}$$
$$b = \log \frac{p}{1 - p} + \sum_{i=1}^{N} \log \frac{1 - p_1[i]}{1 - p_0[i]}$$

Now we can easily plug in our MAP estimators.

$$w[i] = \log \frac{n_i(1,1) + (\alpha - 1)}{n(1) + (\alpha - 1)} \frac{n(0) + (\alpha - 1)}{n_i(1,0) + (\alpha - 1)} - \log \frac{n_i(0,1)}{n(1) + (\alpha - 1)} \frac{n(0) + (\alpha - 1)}{n_i(0,0)}$$

$$= \log \frac{n_i(1,1) + (\alpha - 1)}{n_i(1,0) + (\alpha - 1)} - \log \frac{n_i(0,1)}{n_i(0,0)}$$

$$b = \log \frac{n(1)/n}{n(0)/n} + \sum_{i=1}^{N} \log \frac{n_i(0,1)}{n(1) + (\alpha - 1)} \frac{n(0) + (\alpha - 1)}{n_i(0,0)}$$

$$= \log \frac{n(1)}{n(0)} + \sum_{i=1}^{N} \log \frac{n_i(0,1)}{n(1) + (\alpha - 1)} \frac{n(0) + (\alpha - 1)}{n_i(0,0)}$$

- 4. Multiple Classes.
- 5. Adding Dependencies: A Markov Model.