

Theorem: For $f \in C^1(M, \mathbb{R})$, we have $\frac{1}{2}\Delta\|\nabla f\|^2 = \|Hess(f)\|^2 + \langle \nabla f, \nabla(\Delta f) \rangle + Ric(grad(f), grad(f))$.

Proof: Throughout, ∇ will only be used to denote the covariant derivative, so that $grad(f) = (\nabla f)^\sharp$. Also, recall: \sharp and \flat are isomorphisms and isometries in the sense that $\langle X, Y \rangle = \langle X^\flat, Y^\flat \rangle$ and $\langle \omega, \eta \rangle = \langle \omega^\sharp, \eta^\sharp \rangle$; \sharp and \flat commute with ∇ , as $(\nabla^{T^*M}\omega)^\sharp = \nabla^{TM}(\omega^\sharp)$ and $(\nabla^{TM}X)^\flat = \nabla^{T^*M}(X^\flat)$; and \sharp and \flat allow us to express such quantities: $\langle X, Y \rangle = X^\flat(Y)$, $\langle \omega, \eta \rangle = \omega(\eta^\flat)$, and $\omega(X) = \langle \omega^\sharp, X \rangle_{TM} = \langle \omega, X^\flat \rangle_{T^*M}$.

So, this statement is equivalent to: $\frac{1}{2}\Delta\|(\nabla f)^\sharp\|^2 = \|Hess(f)\|^2 + \langle (\nabla f)^\sharp, (\nabla(\Delta f))^\sharp \rangle + Ric((\nabla f)^\sharp, (\nabla f)^\sharp)$. This is what we'll show instead. Furthermore, we seek to prove a tensor identity, so we can fix a point $p \in M$ and utilize geodesic normal coordinates $\{\partial_i\}$ on M such that $\langle \partial_i, \partial_j \rangle = \delta_{ij}$ and $\nabla_{\partial_i}\partial_j|_p = 0$. We exploit the symmetry of $Hess(f)$ twice in this calculation.

$$\begin{aligned}
\frac{1}{2}\Delta\|(\nabla f)^\sharp\|^2 &= \frac{1}{2}\sum_i \nabla_{\partial_i} \nabla_{\partial_i} \langle (\nabla f)^\sharp, (\nabla f)^\sharp \rangle = \sum_i \nabla_{\partial_i} \langle \nabla_{\partial_i}(\nabla f)^\sharp, (\nabla f)^\sharp \rangle \\
&= \sum_i \nabla_{\partial_i} \left[\langle \nabla_{\partial_i}(\nabla f)^\sharp \rangle^\flat ((\nabla f)^\sharp) \right] = \sum_i \nabla_{\partial_i} \left[\langle \nabla_{\partial_i}(\nabla f) \rangle ((\nabla f)^\sharp) \right] \\
&= \sum_i \nabla_{\partial_i} \left[\langle Hess(f) \rangle (\partial_i, (\nabla f)^\sharp) \right] = \sum_i \nabla_{\partial_i} \left[\langle Hess(f) \rangle ((\nabla f)^\sharp) \partial_i \right] \\
&= \sum_i \nabla_{\partial_i} \left[\langle \nabla_{(\nabla f)^\sharp}(\nabla f) \rangle (\partial_i) \right] = \sum_i \nabla_{\partial_i} \left\langle \nabla_{(\nabla f)^\sharp}(\nabla f)^\sharp, \partial_i \right\rangle \\
&= \sum_i \nabla_{\partial_i} \langle \nabla_{(\nabla f)^\sharp} [(\nabla f)^\sharp], \partial_i \rangle \\
&= \sum_i \langle \nabla_{\partial_i} \nabla_{(\nabla f)^\sharp} [(\nabla f)^\sharp], \partial_i \rangle + \sum_i \cancel{\langle \nabla_{(\nabla f)^\sharp} [(\nabla f)^\sharp], \nabla_{\partial_i} \partial_i \rangle}^0 \\
&= \sum_i \langle R(\partial_i, (\nabla f)^\sharp) [(\nabla f)^\sharp], \partial_i \rangle + \sum_i \langle \nabla_{(\nabla f)^\sharp} \nabla_{\partial_i} [(\nabla f)^\sharp], \partial_i \rangle + \sum_i \langle \nabla_{[\partial_i, (\nabla f)^\sharp]} [(\nabla f)^\sharp], \partial_i \rangle
\end{aligned}$$

Each of these three summands can be computed as follows:

$$\sum_i \langle R(\partial_i, (\nabla f)^\sharp) [(\nabla f)^\sharp], \partial_i \rangle = Ric((\nabla f)^\sharp, (\nabla f)^\sharp) \text{ by definition of the Ricci tensor.}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
\sum_i \langle \nabla_{(\nabla f)^\sharp} \nabla_{\partial_i} [(\nabla f)^\sharp], \partial_i \rangle &= \sum_i \nabla_{(\nabla f)^\sharp} \langle \nabla_{\partial_i} [(\nabla f)^\sharp], \partial_i \rangle - \sum_i \cancel{\langle \nabla_{\partial_i} [(\nabla f)^\sharp], \nabla_{(\nabla f)^\sharp} \partial_i \rangle}^0 \\
&= \sum_i (\nabla f)^\sharp \langle \nabla_{\partial_i} [(\nabla f)^\sharp], \partial_i \rangle = \sum_i (\nabla f)^\sharp \left[\langle \nabla_{\partial_i} ((\nabla f)^\sharp)^\flat \rangle (\partial_i) \right] \\
&= \sum_i (\nabla f)^\sharp \left[\langle \nabla_{\partial_i}(\nabla f) \rangle (\partial_i) \right] = \nabla f^\sharp \left[\sum_i \langle \nabla_{\partial_i}(\nabla f) \rangle (\partial_i) \right] \\
&= (\nabla f)^\sharp(\Delta f) = \nabla(\Delta f)^\sharp((\nabla f)^\sharp) \\
&= \langle \nabla(\Delta f)^\sharp, (\nabla f)^\sharp \rangle
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
\sum_i \langle \nabla_{[\partial_i, (\nabla f)^\sharp]} [(\nabla f)^\sharp], \partial_i \rangle &= \sum_i [\nabla_{[\partial_i, (\nabla f)^\sharp]} [(\nabla f)^\sharp]]^b (\partial_i) = \sum_i [\nabla_{[\partial_i, (\nabla f)^\sharp]} (\nabla f)] (\partial_i) \\
&= \sum_i [Hess(f)] ([\partial_i, (\nabla f)^\sharp], \partial_i) \\
&= \sum_i [Hess(f)] \left(\nabla_{\partial_i} [(\nabla f)^\sharp] - \cancel{\nabla_{(\nabla f)^\sharp} \partial_i}, \partial_i \right) \\
&= \sum_i [Hess(f)] (\partial_i, \nabla_{\partial_i} [(\nabla f)^\sharp]) = \sum_i [\nabla_{\partial_i} (\nabla f)] (\nabla_{\partial_i} [(\nabla f)^\sharp]) \\
&= \sum_i \left\langle \nabla_{\partial_i} (\nabla f), (\nabla_{\partial_i} [(\nabla f)^\sharp])^b \right\rangle = \sum_i \langle \nabla_{\partial_i} (\nabla f), \nabla_{\partial_i} (\nabla f) \rangle \\
&= \sum_i \frac{1}{\langle dx^i, dx^i \rangle} \langle dx^i \otimes \nabla_{\partial_i} (\nabla f), dx^i \otimes \nabla_{\partial_i} (\nabla f) \rangle \\
&= \sum_i \langle dx^i \otimes \nabla_{\partial_i} (\nabla f), dx^i \otimes \nabla_{\partial_i} (\nabla f) \rangle \\
&= \sum_{i,j} \langle dx^i \otimes \nabla_{\partial_i} (\nabla f), dx^j \otimes \nabla_{\partial_j} (\nabla f) \rangle \text{ by orthogonality of } \{dx^i\} \\
&= \sum_j \left\langle \sum_i (dx^i \otimes \nabla_{\partial_i} (\nabla f)), dx^j \otimes \nabla_{\partial_j} (\nabla f) \right\rangle \\
&= \left\langle \nabla^2 f, \sum_j (dx^j \otimes \nabla_{\partial_j} (\nabla f)) \right\rangle \\
&= \langle \nabla^2 f, \nabla^2 f \rangle = \|Hess(f)\|^2
\end{aligned}$$

Summing these three quantities yields the desired result.

□