

# *The origin of West Jutland stød*

*Yet again*

*Pavel Iosad*

*Jutland Prosody Workshop, 15th December 2021*

## *Main claims*

- V-stød comes from Proto-Nordic preaspiration
- V-stød originally occurred on postvocalic stops only and diffused to sonorant codas later
- Evidence comes from
  - Dialect geography
  - æg-words

## *Historia quæstiōnis*

*V-stød: what do we need to explain?*

- Association with PNo \*pp tt kk, parallel with Icelandic preaspiration
- No v-stød before original final consonants: *taʔkke*, *ta(\*)k*
- Apocope not necessary for v-stød: *forskræʔkkelse*
- æg-words with original \*bb (dd) gg:
  - V-stød + stop finally: *byʔg* [k]
  - Lenis continuant as expected medially: *bygmel* [ɣ]
- Dialect geography

## *V-stød from preaspiration*

- V-stød before reflexes of \*pp tt kk || Icelandic preaspiration
- Kock:<sup>1</sup> no stød on sonorants before \*ptk (*mark*, WJ *mælk*) indicates sonorant devoicing
- Pedersen:<sup>2</sup>
  - Postvocalic v-stød comes from preaspiration
  - No stød in *tak* etc. because final degemination preceded preaspiration
  - Postsonorant v-stød: ODa [ɫp] > ‘revoicing’ to [l̥p] > [lʰp] > stød [lʔp]
- Endorsements: Page;<sup>3</sup> Gunnar Ólafur Hansson<sup>4</sup>

## *Criticisms*

- Jespersen:<sup>5</sup>
  - Sonorant revoicing is ‘paper phonetics’
  - PGmc \*p t k were unaspirated > glottal reinforcement
- Similar approach: Ringgaard;<sup>6</sup> Perridon<sup>7</sup>
- V-stød is glottal reinforcement of unaspirated stops

<sup>1</sup> Axel Kock. 1901. *Die alt- und neuschwedische Accentuierung unter Berücksichtigung der andern nordischen Sprachen* (Quellen und Forschungen zur Sprach- und Culturgeschichte der germanischen Völker 87). Strassburg: Karl J. Trübner, et passim.

<sup>2</sup> Anders Pedersen. 1912. Dansk og urnordisk akcentuering. *Arkiv för nordisk filologi* 28. 1–53.

<sup>3</sup> Richard B. Page. 1997. On the origin of preaspiration in Scandinavian. *American Journal of Germanic Linguistics & Literatures* 9(2). 167–190.

<sup>4</sup> Gunnar Ólafur Hansson. 2001. Remains of a submerged continent: Preaspiration in the languages of Northwest Europe. In Laurel J. Brinton (ed.), *Historical linguistics 1999: Selected papers from the 14th International Conference on Historical Linguistics, Vancouver, 9–13 August 1999* (Current Issues in Linguistic Theory 215), 157–173. Amsterdam: John Benjamins.

<sup>5</sup> Otto Jespersen. 1913. Det danske stød og urnordisk synkope. *Arkiv för nordisk filologi* 29. 1–32.

<sup>6</sup> Kristian Ringgaard. 1960b. *Vestjysk stød*. Aarhus: Universitetsforlaget.

<sup>7</sup> Harry Perridon. 2006. On the origin of the vestjysk stød. *Amsterdamer Beiträge zur älteren Germanistik* 62(1). 41–50.

- Final stops were (post)aspirated  $\Rightarrow$  no v-stød

### Alternatives

- Skautrup:<sup>8</sup> ‘geminate fission’ (*geminat spaltning*): apocope requires preceding consonants to lengthen, geminates cannot lengthen to overlong so split into ʔC instead
- Andersen:<sup>9</sup> ‘bifurcation’ by ‘extension of protensity’
  - Glottal spreading  $\Rightarrow$  preaspiration
  - Glottal reinforcement  $\Rightarrow$  v-stød, English preglottalization
- Kortlandt:<sup>10</sup> retention of preglottalization from PGmc
- Liberman:<sup>11</sup> retention of stød as PGmc accent

### The dating of v-stød

#### How old is v-stød?

- PGmc (Kortlandt, Liberman)
- Some time between Proto-Nordic and ODa (Pedersen, Page, Gunnar Ólafur Hansson)
- High Middle Ages (Ringgaard, Perridon)

#### Argument for a late origin

- Perridon:<sup>12</sup> v-stød must postdate coda obstruent lenition to explain *kjovʔd*, *bruwʔd* for *købte*, *brugte*
- If true, this is a real problem for theories deriving v-stød from preaspiration

#### Preaspiration vindicated: dialect geography

- Postvocalic stød only: disconnected, peripheral (Bjerre + northern Himmerland, Thy, Hanherredene)
- Vowels + rhotics & glides: intermediate (Himmerland)
- Stød everywhere: central, coherent
- Stød only on C (Elbo) = stød everywhere minus stød on vowels
- Nordfyn: secondary spread?

#### Preaspiration vindicated: chronology

- This is a classic progression by *rule generalization*<sup>13</sup>
  1. Final degemination<sup>14</sup> in *drekk* > *\_drik\_* (> no v-stød)<sup>15</sup>
  2. Postvocalic preaspiration before *\*pp tt kk* > v-stød in *driʔkke* (Bjerre, Thy)
  3. Coda obstruent lenition: *køftæ* > *køvde* (ODa)
  4. Rule generalization to rhotics and glides (Himmerland)
  5. Rule generalization to all coda sonorants (most WJ, Nordfyn)
  6. Loss of v-stød on vowels (Elbo)

<sup>8</sup> Peter Skautrup. 1928–1929. Klusiler og ‘yngre’ stød i vestjysk. *Acta Philologica Scandinavica* 3. 32–51.

<sup>9</sup> Henning Andersen. 2002. Preglottalization in English and a North Germanic bifurcation. In David Restle & Dietmar Zaefferer (eds.), *Sounds and systems: Studies in structure and change*. A Festschrift for Theo Vennemann (Trends in Linguistics: Studies and Monographs 141), 15–34. Berlin & New York: Mouton de Gruyter.

<sup>10</sup> Frederik Kortlandt. 1985. Proto-Indo-European glottalic stops: The comparative evidence. *Folia Linguistica Historica* 19(2). 183–201, *et passim*.

<sup>11</sup> Anatoly Liberman. 1984. *Germanic accentology*. Vol. 1. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

<sup>12</sup> Perridon, ‘On the origin of the vestjysk stød’.

<sup>13</sup> Theo Vennemann. 1972. Phonetic analogy and conceptual analogy. In Theo Vennemann & Terence H. Wilbur (eds.), *Schuchardt, the Neogrammarians, and the transformational theory of phonological change*, 181–204. Frankfurt: Athenäum Verlag; Ricardo Bermúdez-Otero. 2015. Amphichronic explanation and the life cycle of phonological processes. In Patrick Honeybone & Joseph C. Salmons (eds.), *The Oxford handbook of historical phonology*, 374–399. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

<sup>14</sup> Cf. Old English

<sup>15</sup> Why didn’t *\*pp tt kk* merge with *\*p t k*? Maybe because the lenition of the latter is early enough?



Fig. 13. Oversigtskort over v-stødets udbredelse.

Figure 1: Patterns of v-stød

### *Preaspiration vindicated: chronology redux*

- That v-stød on vowels is earlier than v-stød on consonants is confirmed by patterns like Hundborg:
  - *fløjda* < *fløjte* vs. *løjda* < *lugter*
- Ringgaard<sup>16</sup> is surely correct:
  - *fløjda* lacks v-stød by the general pattern
  - *løjda* is from *luʔttæ* < *luktar* with secondary *j* spread from Western Jutland
  - Cf. just to the north: *lød* (Skjoldborg)
  - NB these dialects aren't even WJ (e.g. postposed article)

<sup>16</sup> Ringgaard, *Vestjysk stød*, pp. 57–59.

### *What's the deal with Nordfyn?*

- Your guess is as good as mine, but...
- Ringgaard:<sup>17</sup> Nordfyn has v-stød across the board in borrowings from the standard like *munter*, *lækker*, unlike WJ, where the distribution is complex/lexicalized
- Nordfyn shows *simplification*
- Could it be a sign of adult/L2/dialect contact and hence secondary spreading? See Labov;<sup>18</sup> Trudgill<sup>19</sup>

<sup>17</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>18</sup> William Labov. 2007. Transmission and diffusion. *Language* 83(2). 344–387.

<sup>19</sup> Peter Trudgill. 2011. *Sociolinguistic typology: Social determinants of linguistic complexity*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

### *The æg problem*

#### *The problem*

- Words like *æg*, *byg*<sup>20</sup>
  - V-stød and stop reflex in final position
  - No v-stød and fricative reflex non-finally
- As if
  - *\*pp tt kk* when final (except why v-stød?)
  - *\*p t k* when non-final

<sup>20</sup> Hans Veirup. 1958. Bemærkninger om forkortelsen af lange klusiler og vestjysk stød i ord af typen *æ'k* 'æg'. *Sprog og kultur* 20. 107–110; Kristian Ringgaard. 1976. *bb dd gg*: Et forsøg på at forklare de gammeldanske mediæes udviklingsforhold ud fra begrebet functional load. In Kristian Hald, Christian Lisse & John Kousgård Sørensen (eds.), *Studier i dansk dialektologi og sproghistorie tilegnede Poul Andersen*, 305–311. København: Akademisk forlag; Inger Ejkskjær. 1997. Some irregularities of the so-called West Jutland stød (glottal stop), with special reference to some words descended from Old Danish forms ending in *-bb* or *-gg*. In Heinrich Ramisch & Kenneth Wynne (eds.), *Language in time and space: Studies in honour of Wolfgang Viereck on occasion of his 60th birthday* (Beihefte zur Zeitschrift für Dialektologie und Linguistik 97), 336–349. Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag.

<sup>21</sup> Veirup, 'Bemærkninger om forkortelsen af lange klusiler og vestjysk stød i ord af typen *æ'k* 'æg'.

<sup>22</sup> Ejkskjær, 'Some irregularities of the so-called West Jutland stød (glottal stop), with special reference to some words descended from Old Danish forms ending in *-bb* or *-gg*'.

<sup>23</sup> Perridon, 'On the origin of the vestjysk stød'.

#### *Previous solutions*

- Veirup:<sup>21</sup> expected outcome [ɛ:ʔk] is out of line with Jutlandic, so we get either vowel shortening or spirantization
  - Poorly motivated
  - Incompatible with synchronic and apparent time variation<sup>22</sup>
- Perridon:<sup>23</sup> allophony of *\*bb dd gg*
  - Stops [bb dd gg] word-finally ⇒ v-stød because unaspirated
  - Fricatives [ββ ðð γγ] word-medially
  - Highly suspect typologically
    - \* Lenition before degemination?
    - \* Glottal reinforcement of voiced stops?

- Ringgaard:<sup>24</sup> *æg* words lack the dynamic circumflex, so ended in voiceless stops
  - *egg* > *ekk* ~ *ek*-
  - Best fit to the data, even if mysterious

<sup>24</sup> Kristian Ringgaard. 1960a. The apocope of disyllables. *Phonetica* 10(3–4). 222–230.

### *Preaspiration vindicated*

- If *æg* words reflect secondary *p(p) t(t) k(k)*, then
  - Word-medial reflexes follow
  - Word-final reflexes show preaspiration introduced *after* the early degemination that bled *v*-stød in *drekk*
- There is nothing special about the exclusion of *v*-stød from historical final position, just like there is nothing special about *v*-stød before non-deleted vowels

### *The big picture*

#### *Typology: Germanic*

- Long-standing comparandum: English preglottalization
  - Of unclear age, definitely present in the south of England by the 19th century<sup>25</sup>
  - Not characteristic of colonial English, possibly only just spreading in places like North America<sup>26</sup>
  - Well established in Scots,<sup>27</sup> including Ulster Scots,<sup>28</sup> so at least 17th century?
- In English, preglottalization coexists with preaspiration
- Preaspiration is robustly attested across North Germanic<sup>29</sup>

<sup>25</sup> Bjørn Stålhanne Andréén. 1968. *Preglottalization in English standard pronunciation* (Norwegian Studies in English 13). Oslo: Norwegian Universities Press; Beverley Collins & Inger M. Mees. 1996. Spreading everywhere?: How recent a phenomenon is glottalization in Received Pronunciation? *English World-Wide* 17(2). 175–187.

<sup>26</sup> David Eddington & Caitlin Channer. 2010. American English has go? a lo? of glottal stops: Social diffusion and linguistic motivation. *American Speech* 85(3). 338–351.

<sup>27</sup> Paul Johnston. 1997. Regional variation. In Charles Jones (ed.), *The Edinburgh history of the Scots language*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.

<sup>28</sup> Warren Maguire. 2020. *Language and dialect contact in Ireland: The phonological origins of Mid-Ulster English*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.

<sup>29</sup> Gunnar Ólafur Hansson, 'Remains of a submerged continent'; Pétur Helgason. 2002. *Preaspiration in the Nordic languages*. Stockholm: Stockholm University dissertation.

<sup>30</sup> Pedersen, 'Dansk og urnordisk akcentuer-ing'.

<sup>31</sup> Paul Kiparsky. 2018. Livonian stød. In Wolfgang Kehrein et al. (eds.), *Segmental structure and tone*. Berlin: Mouton.

<sup>32</sup> Una Canger. 2011. El nauatl urbano de Tlatelolco/Tenochtitlan, resultado de convergencia entre dialectos: Con un esbozo brevísimo de la historia de los dialectos. *Estudios de cultura náuatl* 42. 243–258.

<sup>33</sup> Liberman, *Germanic accentology*.

<sup>34</sup> Frederik Kortlandt. 1988. Vestjysk stød, Icelandic preaspiration, and Proto-Indo-European glottalic stops. In Muhammad Ali Jazayery & Werner Winter (eds.), *Languages and cultures: Studies in honor of Edgar C. Polomé* (Trends in Linguistics: Studies and Monographs 36), 353–358. Berlin & New

#### *Typology: comparanda*

- Pedersen<sup>30</sup> offers a Livonian parallel: [roʔ], Fi *raha* 'money'
  - Does not work: Livonian stød is a marker of secondary long vowels,<sup>31</sup> the loss of [h] is incidental
- Better: Nahuatl *saltillo*
  - Present-day Nahuatl: [h] or [ʔ]
  - Classical Nahuatl: unclear, usually reconstructed as [ʔ]
  - Canger:<sup>32</sup> reconstruct [h] with later *h* > ʔ, like preaspiration > *v*-stød

#### *The Germanic context*

- Liberman:<sup>33</sup> stød is original; problematic (ask me!)
- Kortlandt:<sup>34</sup> PGmc preglottalization (with or without IE glottalic theory) is maintained in *v*-stød
  - Typologically problematic (ask me!)
  - See Perridon<sup>35</sup> for further critiques

- Jespersen;<sup>36</sup> Ringgaard;<sup>37</sup> Andersen;<sup>38</sup> Goblirsch:<sup>39</sup> PGmc unaspirated stops
  - Glottal reinforcement of plain stops?
  - Evidence for GW / ‘spread glottis’ in the \**p t k* series across Germanic<sup>40</sup>
- Martin Kümmel (p. c.): aspiration of stops is a late innovation, peripheral ‘voicing’ systems<sup>41</sup> could be archaic
  - Possible, but robust evidence of (pre)aspiration certainly across North Germanic

### *V-stød and coda sonorants, once again*

- Under my reconstruction, v-stød on sonorants is a late development<sup>42</sup>
  - In particular, the discussion around ‘revoicing’<sup>43</sup> is a red herring
  - In any case, Jutlandic stød loss on sonorants is not specific to v-stød (Goldshtein in prep.), likely irrelevant
- Could it be that the spread of v-stød to sonorants was enabled by the rise of common Danish stød, which thrives in high-sonority environments?
- If so, does this support a ca. High Medieval date for common Danish stød?
  - And so possibly the North Germanic accents in general?

### *Summary*

- A regular change of Proto-Nordic preaspiration of \**pp tt kk* > v-stød remains the best theory
  - Internal evidence from dialect geography
  - Germanic historical phonology
  - Phonological typology
- V-stød originally occurred only on postvocalic stops, spreading to other contexts later
- Later developments are best understood in terms of the life cycle of phonological processes and rule generalization

### *References*

- Andersen, Henning. 2002. Preglottalization in English and a North Germanic bifurcation. In David Restle & Dietmar Zaefferer (eds.), *Sounds and systems: Studies in structure and change*. A Festschrift for Theo Vennemann (Trends in Linguistics: Studies and Monographs 141), 15–34. Berlin & New York: Mouton de Gruyter.
- Andrésen, Bjørn Stålhane. 1968. *Preglottalization in English standard pronunciation* (Norwegian Studies in English 13). Oslo: Norwegian Universities Press.

<sup>36</sup> Jespersen, ‘Det danske stød og urnordisk synkope’.

<sup>37</sup> Ringgaard, *Vestjysk stød*.

<sup>38</sup> Andersen, ‘Preglottalization in English and a North Germanic bifurcation’.

<sup>39</sup> Kurt Gustav Goblirsch. 2005. *Lautverschiebungen in den germanischen Sprachen*. Heidelberg: Universitätsverlag Winter.

<sup>40</sup> Joseph C. Salmons. 2020. Germanic laryngeal phonetics and phonology. In Richard B. Page & Michael T. Putnam (eds.), *The Cambridge handbook of Germanic linguistics*, 119–142. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

<sup>41</sup> Like Scots, Yiddish, Dutch, southern Low German

<sup>42</sup> It post-dates coda lenition, so is of something like a High Medieval date.

<sup>43</sup> Pedersen, ‘Dansk og urnordisk akcentuering’; Jespersen, ‘Det danske stød og urnordisk synkope’.

- Bermúdez-Otero, Ricardo. 2015. Amphichronic explanation and the life cycle of phonological processes. In Patrick Honeybone & Joseph C. Salmons (eds.), *The Oxford handbook of historical phonology*, 374–399. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Canger, Una. 2011. El nauatl urbano de Tlatelolco/Tenochtitlan, resultado de convergencia entre dialectos: Con un esbozo brevísimo de la historia de los dialectos. *Estudios de cultura náuatl* 42. 243–258.
- Collins, Beverley & Inger M. Mees. 1996. Spreading everywhere?: How recent a phenomenon is glottalization in Received Pronunciation? *English World-Wide* 17(2). 175–187.
- Eddington, David & Caitlin Channer. 2010. American English has go? a lo? of glottal stops: Social diffusion and linguistic motivation. *American Speech* 85(3). 338–351.
- Ejkskjær, Inger. 1997. Some irregularities of the so-called West Jutland stød (glottal stop), with special reference to some words descended from Old Danish forms ending in *-bb* or *-gg*. In Heinrich Ramisch & Kenneth Wynne (eds.), *Language in time and space: Studies in honour of Wolfgang Viereck on occasion of his 60th birthday* (Beihefte zur Zeitschrift für Dialektologie und Linguistik 97), 336–349. Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag.
- Goblirsch, Kurt Gustav. 2005. *Lautverschiebungen in den germanischen Sprachen*. Heidelberg: Universitätsverlag Winter.
- Gunnar Ólafur Hansson. 2001. Remains of a submerged continent: Preaspiration in the languages of Northwest Europe. In Laurel J. Brinton (ed.), *Historical linguistics 1999: Selected papers from the 14th International Conference on Historical Linguistics, Vancouver, 9–13 August 1999* (Current Issues in Linguistic Theory 215), 157–173. Amsterdam: John Benjamins.
- Jespersen, Otto. 1913. Det danske stød og urnordisk synkope. *Arkiv för nordisk filologi* 29. 1–32.
- Johnston, Paul. 1997. Regional variation. In Charles Jones (ed.), *The Edinburgh history of the Scots language*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.
- Kiparsky, Paul. 2018. Livonian stød. In Wolfgang Kehrein, Björn Köhnlein, Paul Boersma & Marc van Oostendorp (eds.), *Segmental structure and tone*. Berlin: Mouton.
- Kock, Axel. 1901. *Die alt- und neuschwedische Accentuierung unter Berücksichtigung der andern nordischen Sprachen* (Quellen und Forschungen zur Sprach- und Culturgeschichte der germanischen Völker 87). Strassburg: Karl J. Trübner.
- Kortlandt, Frederik. 1985. Proto-Indo-European glottalic stops: The comparative evidence. *Folia Linguistica Historica* 19(2). 183–201.
- Kortlandt, Frederik. 1988. Vestjysk stød, Icelandic preaspiration, and Proto-Indo-European glottalic stops. In Muhammad Ali Jazayery & Werner Winter (eds.), *Languages and cultures: Studies in honor of Edgar C. Polomé* (Trends in Linguistics: Studies and Monographs 36), 353–358. Berlin & New York: Mouton de Gruyter.

- Labov, William. 2007. Transmission and diffusion. *Language* 83(2). 344–387.
- Liberman, Anatoly. 1984. *Germanic accentology*. Vol. 1. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Maguire, Warren. 2020. *Language and dialect contact in Ireland: The phonological origins of Mid-Ulster English*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.
- Page, Richard B. 1997. On the origin of preaspiration in Scandinavian. *American Journal of Germanic Linguistics & Literatures* 9(2). 167–190.
- Pedersen, Anders. 1912. Dansk og urnordisk akcentuering. *Arkiv för nordisk filologi* 28. 1–53.
- Perridon, Harry. 2006. On the origin of the vestjysk stød. *Amsterdamer Beiträge zur älteren Germanistik* 62(1). 41–50.
- Perridon, Harry. 2009. How old is the vestjysk stød? *Amsterdamer Beiträge zur älteren Germanistik* 65(1). 5–10.
- Pétur Helgason. 2002. *Preaspiration in the Nordic languages*. Stockholm: Stockholm University dissertation.
- Ringgaard, Kristian. 1960a. The apocope of disyllables. *Phonetica* 10(3–4). 222–230.
- Ringgaard, Kristian. 1960b. *Vestjysk stød*. Aarhus: Universitetsforlaget.
- Ringgaard, Kristian. 1976. *bb dd gg*: Et forsøg på at forklare de gammeldanske mediæes udviklingsforhold ud fra begrebet functional load. In Kristian Hald, Christian Lisse & John Kousgård Sørensen (eds.), *Studier i dansk dialektologi og sproghistorie tilegnede Poul Andersen*, 305–311. København: Akademisk forlag.
- Salmons, Joseph C. 2020. Germanic laryngeal phonetics and phonology. In Richard B. Page & Michael T. Putnam (eds.), *The Cambridge handbook of Germanic linguistics*, 119–142. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Skautrup, Peter. 1928–1929. Klusiler og ‘yngre’ stød i vestjysk. *Acta Philologica Scandinavica* 3. 32–51.
- Trudgill, Peter. 2011. *Sociolinguistic typology: Social determinants of linguistic complexity*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Veirup, Hans. 1958. Bemærkninger om forkortelsen af lange klusiler og vestjysk stød i ord af typen æ’k ‘æg’. *Sprog og kultur* 20. 107–110.
- Vennemann, Theo. 1972. Phonetic analogy and conceptual analogy. In Theo Vennemann & Terence H. Wilbur (eds.), *Schuchardt, the Neogrammarians, and the transformational theory of phonological change*, 181–204. Frankfurt: Athenäum Verlag.