Ambiguous WSC Problems (Based on 2 Evaluators)

The following problems are found to be ambiguous to answer correctly, even by humans. The ambiguity was decided based on the decisions of two human evaluators who were completely unaware of the technical details of the knowledge type identification process.

1. Frank felt vindicated when his longtime rival Bill revealed that he was the winner of the competition. Who was the winner of the competition?
   Answers: Frank

2. Mary took out her flute and played one of her favorite pieces. She has loved it since she was a child. What has Mary loved since she was a child?
   Answers: The piece

3. I can't cut that tree down with that axe; it is too small. What is too small?
   Answers: the axe.

4. I'm sure that my map will show this building; it is very good. What is good?
   Answers: the map.
   Comment: ``Detailed'' would of course be a better word to describe the map, but it would certainly be Googlable, and probably solvable by selectional restriction. One might suppose that "famous building" would be a more frequent combination than "famous map" but Google search (5/11/2012) suggests the reverse:
   "building": 2.2 billion
   "famous building": 250 million
   "map": 1.4 billion
   "famous map": 500 million

5. I put the butterfly wing on the table and it broke. What broke?
   Answer: The butterfly wing
   Comment: From (Winograd, 1971). Thanks to Charlie Ortiz for finding this. As in schema #93, the answer pair depends on the choice of words.

6. I put the cake away in the refrigerator. It has a lot of butter in it. What has a lot of butter?
   Answers: The cake.

7. Fred and Alice had very warm down coats, but they were not prepared for the cold in Alaska. Who or what were not prepared for the cold?

   Answers: Fred and Alice.

8. Patting her back, the woman smiled at the girl. Whose back did the woman pat?

   Answers: The girl's