Supplementary material to Robustness in Network Intrusion Detection with Adversarial Training and Ouf-of-Distribution

Anonymous Authors

This document presents supplementary material that supports our main paper. It includes tables displaying the results obtained for the metrics discussed in the paper across the relevant datasets. The data presented here pertains to the ensemble trained on unperturbed samples (TabNet) and the adversarial training (TabIDS). The graphs provided primarily correspond to the precision metric, with the exception of the "Out-of-Distribution" section. In this section, the ROC-AUC metric is used for the TabIDS model, which is abbreviated as IDS, and for out-of-distribution (OOD) detection.

The sections in this supplement are organized according to adversarial attacks and out-of-distribution (OOD) scenarios, similar to the experiments section of the main paper. In the tables, blue-shaded cells indicate that the TabIDS model performed equally as well as the TabNet model. In contrast, yellow-shaded cells signify that the TabIDS model outperformed the TabNet model.

I. PROJECTED GRADIENT DESCENT (PGD-100)

A. CIC IDS2017

TABLE I: PGD-100 attack against TabNet and TabIDS for binary classification on the CIC IDS2017 dataset.

							Epsil	on (ϵ)				
Type	Norm	Metric	0.0	008	0.	01	0.	.03	0.	05	0.	08
			Benign	Attacks	Benign	Attacks	Benign	Attacks	Benign	Attacks	Benign	Attacks
		Precision	99.99	98.85	99.99	98.84	99.99	98.78	99.99	98.73	99.99	98.67
	ℓ_1	Recall	99.76	99.95	99.76	99.94	99.75	99.94	99.74	99.94	99.73	99.94
		ROC-AUC	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	99.99	100.00	99.99	100.00
		Precision	99.99	98.77	99.99	98.74	99.99	98.51	99.97	98.05	99.83	96.23
TabNet	ℓ_2	Recall	99.75	99.94	99.74	99.94	99.69	99.93	99.59	99.83	99.21	99.16
		ROC-AUC	100.00	100.00	99.99	100.00	99.99	99.99	99.99	99.99	99.95	99.95
		Precision	99.98	98.34	99.98	98.12	99.37	86.50	92.39	48.56	77.24	1.22
	ℓ_{∞}	Recall	99.66	99.92	99.61	99.89	96.92	96.97	85.90	65.28	67.83	1.95
		ROC-AUC	99.99	99.99	99.99	99.99	99.44	99.47	87.17	87.17	22.53	22.45
		Precision	99.98	99.11	99.98	99.10	99.96	98.83	99.83	98.79	99.83	98.72
	ℓ_1	Recall	99.82	99.89	99.82	99.89	99.76	99.82	99.75	99.17	99.74	99.16
		ROC-AUC	99.98	99.99	99.98	99.99	99.98	99.99	99.98	99.99	99.98	99.98
		Precision	99.98	99.04	99.97	99.01	99.83	98.77	99.82	98.62	99.80	98.11
TabIDS	ℓ_2	Recall	99.80	99.88	99.80	99.87	99.75	99.16	99.72	99.13	99.61	99.04
		ROC-AUC	99.98	99.99	99.98	99.99	99.98	99.98	99.98	99.98	99.97	99.98
		Precision	99.93	98.79	99.88	98.38	99.80	98.04	99.80	98.09	99.79	98.01
	ℓ_{∞}	Recall	99.75	99.65	99.67	99.41	99.60	99.02	99.61	99.00	99.59	98.97
		ROC-AUC	99.98	99.99	99.98	99.98	99.97	99.98	99.97	99.98	99.97	99.97

B. UNSW-NB15

TABLE II: PGD-100 attack against TabNet and TabIDS for multiclass classification on the CIC IDS2017 dataset.

									Eļ	osilon ((ϵ)						
Type	Norm	Metrics		0.008			0.01			0.03			0.05			0.08	
			Benign	DOS	DDOS	Benign	DOS	DDOS	Benign	DOS	DDOS	Benign	DOS	DDOS	Benign	DOS	DDOS
		Precision	99.98	99.30	99.99	99.97	99.30	99.99	99.97	99.26	99.99	99.97	99.24	99.99	99.97	99.21	99.99
	ℓ_1	Recall	99.44	99.75	99.99	99.44	99.75	99.99	99.41	99.75	99.99	99.38	99.75	99.99	99.30	99.75	99.99
		ROC-AUC	99.98	100.00	100.00	99.98	100.00	100.00	99.98	100.00	100.00	99.98	100.00	100.00	99.98	100.00	100.00
		Precision	99.97	99.24	99.99	99.97	99.24	99.99	99.96	99.07	99.99	99.95	98.83	99.99	99.81	98.17	99.99
TabNet	ℓ_2	Recall	99.41	99.75	99.99	99.39	99.75	99.99	99.17	99.72	99.97	98.83	99.64	99.94	98.23	99.40	99.83
		ROC-AUC	99.98	100.00	100.00	99.98	100.00	100.00	99.97	100.00	100.00	99.95	99.99	100.00	99.87	99.94	100.00
		Precision	99.96	98.94	99.99	99.95	98.74	99.99	99.55	90.49	99.96	97.21	63.13	99.80	85.39	15.56	94.45
	ℓ_{∞}	Recall	99.05	99.69	99.94	98.92	99.64	99.93	95.67	96.84	93.84	84.83	80.39	81.14	62.34	21.91	76.96
		ROC-AUC	99.96	99.99	100.00	99.95	99.99	100.00	99.38	99.00	99.99	94.16	96.12	99.37	59.82	63.23	90.39
		Precision	99.99	98.95	99.94	99.99	98.95	99.94	99.99	98.94	99.94	99.99	98.91	99.94	99.99	98.87	99.93
	ℓ_1	Recall	97.81	99.93	100.00	97.79	99.93	100.00	97.56	99.91	100.00	97.30	99.91	99.99	97.06	99.90	99.95
		ROC-AUC	99.97	100.00	100.00	99.97	100.00	100.00	99.96	100.00	100.00	99.95	100.00	100.00	99.92	100.00	100.00
		Precision	99.99	98.94	99.94	99.99	98.93	99.93	99.99	98.75	99.93	99.99	98.57	99.93	99.98	98.29	99.93
TabIDS	ℓ_2	Recall	97.62	99.92	100.00	97.55	99.91	100.00	96.72	99.89	99.96	96.04	99.86	99.98	96.06	99.85	99.99
		ROC-AUC	99.96	100.00	100.00	99.95	100.00	100.00	99.64	99.99	100.00	99.22	99.98	100.00	99.76	99.98	100.00
		Precision	99.99	98.66	99.92	99.99	98.60	99.93	99.97	97.49	99.92	99.94	94.87	99.91	99.73	83.52	99.91
	ℓ_{∞}	Recall	96.49	99.85	99.95	96.25	99.84	99.97	96.20	99.75	100.00	95.53	99.45	99.98	92.63	97.73	99.97
		ROC-AUC	99.75	99.99	100.00	99.47	99.99	100.00	99.68	99.98	100.00	99.59	99.93	100.00	99.03	99.63	100.00

TABLE IV: PGD-100 attack against TabNet and TabIDS for multiclass classification on the UNSW-NB15 dataset.

									E	psilon ((ϵ)						
Type	Norm	Metrics		0.008			0.01			0.03			0.05			0.08	
			Normal	Recon.	Generic	Normal	Recon.	Generic	Normal	Recon.	Generic	Normal	Recon.	Generic	Normal	Recon.	Generic
		Precision	100.00	80.10	100.00	100.00	80.41	100.00	100.00	78.12	100.00	100.00	75.71	100.00	100.00	58.23	99.85
	ℓ_1	Recall	99.52	90.34	91.56	99.52	89.77	91.56	99.52	85.23	91.56	99.52	75.28	91.49	99.52	41.19	90.89
		ROC-AUC	99.96	99.98	99.97	99.96	99.98	99.97	99.95	99.97	99.97	99.95	99.95	99.97	99.95	99.88	99.96
		Precision	100.00	79.74	100.00	100.00	78.41	100.00	100.00	53.02	99.93	100.00	24.85	99.71	100.00	9.15	94.98
TabNet	ℓ_2	Recall	99.52	88.35	91.56	99.52	86.65	91.56	99.52	32.39	91.36	99.52	11.93	90.56	99.52	3.98	90.62
		ROC-AUC	99.95	99.98	99.97	99.95	99.98	99.97	99.94	99.84	99.96	99.93	99.67	99.95	99.90	99.44	99.93
		Precision	100.00	72.73	100.00	100.00	53.55	100.00	100.00	23.49	99.63	100.00	19.20	93.22	99.99	14.94	70.27
	ℓ_{∞}	Recall	99.52	70.45	91.49	99.52	32.10	91.42	99.52	11.08	89.89	99.52	6.82	87.77	99.53	6.53	24.20
		ROC-AUC	99.94	99.94	99.96	99.94	99.85	99.96	99.91	99.36	99.94	99.87	99.18	99.90	99.72	98.97	99.15
		Precision	100.00	50.97	97.86	100.00	48.08	97.65	100.00	40.00	97.55	100.00	34.03	94.11	100.00	30.10	87.41
	ℓ_1	Recall	99.61	59.94	91.16	99.61	56.82	91.16	99.61	52.84	87.43	99.61	51.14	88.23	99.61	51.14	86.30
		ROC-AUC	99.93	99.88	99.95	99.93	99.87	99.95	99.93	99.85	99.94	99.92	99.80	99.93	99.92	99.78	99.93
		Precision	100.00	43.55	96.52	100.00	38.48	95.76	100.00	28.24	85.59	100.00	22.96	77.08	100.00	18.70	75.20
TabIDS	ℓ_2	Recall	99.61	50.85	86.64	99.61	46.02	85.57	99.61	42.05	81.78	99.61	40.06	72.67	99.61	33.52	55.25
		ROC-AUC	99.93	99.86	99.94	99.93	99.84	99.93	99.91	99.74	99.90	99.89	99.71	99.87	99.88	99.65	99.83
		Precision	100.00	30.00	78.73	100.00	29.53	84.57	100.00	18.37	70.42	100.00	16.54	68.05	100.00	16.87	62.34
	ℓ_{∞}	Recall	99.61	39.20	69.15	99.61	38.92	63.03	99.61	30.68	45.28	99.61	30.11	41.36	99.61	31.82	42.15
		ROC-AUC	99.88	99.77	99.85	99.86	99.75	99.84	99.87	99.63	99.81	99.88	99.61	99.77	99.88	99.59	99.78

TABLE III: PGD-100 attack against TabNet and TabIDS for binary classification on the UNSW-NB15 dataset.

							Epsil	on (ϵ)				
Type	Norm	Metric	0.0	008	0.	01	0.	.03	0.	05	0.	08
			Benign	Attacks	Benign	Attacks	Benign	Attacks	Benign	Attacks	Benign	Attacks
		Precision	100.00	85.99	100.00	85.99	100.00	85.94	100.00	85.92	100.00	85.90
	ℓ_1	Recall	99.66	100.00	99.66	100.00	99.66	100.00	99.66	100.00	99.66	99.98
		ROC-AUC	99.98	99.98	99.98	99.98	99.98	99.98	99.98	99.98	99.97	99.97
		Precision	100.00	85.94	100.00	85.92	100.00	85.90	100.00	85.85	99.99	85.77
TabNet	ℓ_2	Recall	99.66	100.00	99.66	100.00	99.66	99.98	99.66	99.98	99.65	99.71
		ROC-AUC	99.98	99.98	99.98	99.98	99.97	99.97	99.95	99.95	99.93	99.93
		Precision	100.00	85.90	100.00	85.89	99.98	85.66	99.93	84.82	99.73	78.78
	ℓ_{∞}	Recall	99.66	99.98	99.66	99.98	99.65	99.05	99.64	96.49	99.51	87.24
		ROC-AUC	99.97	99.97	99.96	99.96	99.90	99.90	99.76	99.76	99.49	99.59
		Precision	99.94	60.59	99.94	60.47	99.93	59.71	99.92	59.45	99.91	59.24
	ℓ_1	Recall	98.68	97.12	98.68	97.10	98.64	96.53	98.63	96.35	98.62	95.97
		ROC-AUC	99.87	99.87	99.87	99.87	99.85	99.84	99.83	99.83	99.79	99.79
		Precision	99.94	60.34	99.93	60.27	99.92	59.23	99.91	59.12	99.92	58.91
TabIDS	ℓ_2	Recall	98.67	96.96	98.67	96.89	98.62	96.02	98.62	95.79	98.60	96.02
		ROC-AUC	99.86	99.86	99.85	99.85	99.82	99.82	99.78	99.78	99.73	99.73
		Precision	99.92	56.82	99.92	56.97	99.91	58.58	99.90	47.59	99.88	51.82
	ℓ_{∞}	Recall	98.47	96.24	98.49	96.04	98.59	95.66	97.81	95.41	98.17	94.42
		ROC-AUC	99.79	99.79	99.72	99.72	99.67	99.66	99.59	99.59	99.58	99.58

II. CARLINI-WAGNER (CW-2)

TABLE V: CW-2 attack against TabNet and TabIDS for binary classification on the CIC IDS2017 dataset.

						Confi	dence				
Type	Metric	0	.0	0	.2	0	.5	0	.8	1	.0
Турс	Wietric	Benign	Attacks								
	Precision	99.99	98.69	99.99	98.70	99.99	98.71	99.99	98.74	99.99	98.74
TabNet	Recall	99.73	99.95	99.73	99.95	99.73	99.95	99.74	99.95	99.74	99.95
	ROC-AUC	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
	Precision	99.98	99.07	99.98	99.09	99.98	99.11	99.98	99.11	99.98	99.11
TabIDS	Recall	99.81	99.89	99.81	99.89	99.82	99.89	99.82	99.89	99.82	99.89
	ROC-AUC	99.98	99.99	99.98	99.99	99.98	99.99	99.98	99.99	99.98	99.99

TABLE VI: CW-2 attack against TabNet and TabIDS for multiclass classification on the CIC IDS2017 dataset.

								Co	nfiden	ce						
Type	Metric		0.0			0.2			0.5			0.8			1.0	
Турс	MICHIC	Benign	DoS	DDoS												
	Precision	99.99	99.23	99.99	99.99	99.25	99.99	99.99	99.26	99.99	99.99	99.28	99.99	99.99	99.29	99.99
TabNet	Recall	99.36	99.75	99.99	99.38	99.75	99.99	99.39	99.75	99.99	99.41	99.75	99.99	99.42	99.76	99.99
	ROC-AUC	99.98	100.00	100.00	99.98	100.00	100.00	99.98	100.00	100.00	99.98	100.00	100.00	99.98	100.00	100.00
	Precision	99.99	98.92	99.94	99.99	98.93	99.94	99.99	98.95	99.94	99.99	98.96	99.94	99.99	98.97	99.94
TabIDS	Recall	97.79	99.93	100.00	97.85	99.93	100.00	97.86	99.93	100.00	97.87	99.93	100.00	97.88	99.93	100.00
	ROC-AUC	99.97	100.00	100.00	99.97	100.00	100.00	99.97	100.00	100.00	99.97	100.00	100.00	99.97	100.00	100.00

TABLE VII: CW-2 attack against TabNet and TabIDS for binary classification on the UNSW-NB15 dataset.

						Confi	dence				
Type	Metric	0	.0	0.	.2	0.	.5	0.	.8	1	.0
Type	MICHIC	Normal	Attacks								
	Precision	100.00	84.07	100.00	84.15	100.00	84.31	100.00	84.40	100.00	84.51
TabNet	Recall	99.61	99.86	99.61	99.86	99.61	99.86	99.62	99.89	99.62	99.93
	ROC-AUC	99.98	99.98	99.98	99.98	99.98	99.98	99.98	99.98	99.98	99.98
	Precision	99.87	4.99	99.88	5.12	99.89	5.33	99.90	5.57	99.90	5.73
TabIDS	Recall	61.85	96.11	62.81	96.26	64.20	96.71	65.79	96.69	66.82	96.76
	ROC-AUC	98.41	98.41	98.49	98.49	98.68	98.68	98.70	98.70	98.75	98.75

TABLE VIII: CW-2 attack against TabNet and TabIDS for multiclass classification on the UNSW-NB15 dataset.

								C	onfiden	ce						
Type	Metric		0.0			0.2			0.5			0.8			1.0	
Турс	MICHIC	Normal	Recon.	Generic	Normal	Recon.	Generic	Normal	Recon.	Generic	Normal	Recon.	Generic	Normal	Recon.	Generic
	Precision	100.00	32.34	100.00	100.00	33.53	100.00	100.00	34.13	100.00	100.00	34.13	100.00	100.00	34.32	100.00
TabNet	Recall	70.09	15.34	84.77	70.12	16.19	85.44	70.20	16.19	86.44	70.30	16.19	87.50	70.36	16.48	87.90
	ROC-AUC	98.92	98.34	99.03	98.91	98.26	99.02	98.91	98.22	99.01	98.90	98.20	99.00	98.89	98.16	99.00
	Precision	100.00	13.78	97.46	100.00	14.74	97.82	100.00	18.81	97.75	100.00	21.23	97.75	100.00	24.63	98.03
TabIDS	Recall	99.59	12.22	89.43	99.59	13.07	89.43	99.59	17.05	89.56	99.59	19.60	89.56	99.59	23.58	89.56
	ROC-AUC	99.92	99.82	99.94	99.92	99.81	99.94	99.92	99.80	99.94	99.92	99.80	99.94	99.92	99.80	99.94

III. DEEPFOOL (DF-2)

TABLE IX: DF-2 attack against TabNet and TabIDS for binary classification on the CIC IDS2017 dataset.

						Conf	idence				
Туре	Metric	0.0)01	0.0	002	0.0	005	0.0	008	0.0)09
Туре	METIC	Benign	Attacks								
	Precision	77.28	0.75	77.26	0.74	77.19	0.74	77.12	0.73	77.09	0.72
TabNet	Recall	68.51	1.16	68.45	1.16	68.17	1.16	67.89	1.15	67.78	1.15
	ROC-AUC	1.74	1.72	1.73	1.72	1.72	1.70	1.70	1.68	1.69	1.68
	Precision	94.48	60.21	94.47	60.16	94.44	60.02	94.41	59.89	94.40	59.84
TabIDS	Recall	90.00	74.21	89.99	74.17	89.95	73.99	89.92	73.86	89.91	73.81
	ROC-AUC	92.98	92.98	92.96	92.96	92.89	92.89	92.82	92.82	92.80	92.80

TABLE X: DF-2 attack against TabNet and TabIDS for multiclass classification on the CIC IDS2017 dataset.

								Ep	silon ((ϵ)						
Type	Metric		0.001			0.002			0.005			0.008		l	0.009	
Турс	MICHIC	Benign	DoS	DDoS	Benign	DoS	DDoS	Benign	DoS	DDoS	Benign	DoS	DDoS	Benign	DoS	DDoS
	Precision	66.67	0.18	1.95	66.52	0.17	1.90	66.11	0.17	1.70	65.66	0.17	1.54	65.49	0.16	1.48
TabNet	Recall	25.43	0.41	1.12	25.28	0.41	1.10	24.83	0.40	1.00	24.35	0.39	0.92	24.17	0.38	0.89
	ROC-AUC	27.69	7.11	93.96	27.63	7.08	93.92	27.44	7.00	93.80	27.27	6.92	93.68	27.21	6.90	93.64
	Precision	96.87	69.88	95.19	96.87	69.86	95.18	96.86	69.79	95.14	96.86	69.72	95.12	96.85	69.68	95.11
TabIDS	Recall	92.12	69.46	92.51	92.11	69.44	92.48	92.09	69.38	92.46	92.05	69.32	92.41	92.04	69.28	92.38
	ROC-AUC	95.73	95.62	99.36	95.72	95.61	99.35	95.71	95.60	99.35	95.71	95.58	99.34	95.70	95.57	99.34

TABLE XI: DF-2 attack against TabNet and TabIDS for binary classification on the UNSW-NB15 dataset.

						Confi	dence				
Type	Metric		001	0.0			005	0.0			009
Type	Wietric	Normal	Attacks								
	Precision	99.42	2.76	99.41	2.75	99.41	2.74	99.40	2.73	99.40	2.73
TabNet	Recall	33.34	90.61	33.24	90.61	32.95	90.55	32.69	90.50	32.61	90.57
	ROC-AUC	78.03	78.03	77.99	77.99	77.90	77.90	77.79	77.79	77.76	77.76
	Precision	99.49	3.44	99.48	3.42	99.47	3.35	99.45	3.29	99.45	3.27
TabIDS	Recall	48.52	88.03	48.17	87.96	47.14	87.94	46.09	87.87	45.74	87.85
	ROC-AUC	60.38	60.37	60.06	60.06	59.11	59.11	58.18	58.17	57.87	57.86

TABLE XII: DF-2 attack against TabNet and TabIDS for multiclass classification on the UNSW-NB15 dataset.

								E	psilon ((ϵ)						
Type	Metric		0.001			0.002			0.005			0.008			0.009	
Турс	Metric	Normal	Recon.	Generic	Normal	Recon.	Generic	Normal	Recon.	Generic	Normal	Recon.	Generic	Normal	Recon.	Generic
	Precision	100.00	60.98	95.42	100.00	60.73	95.40	100.00	60.98	95.36	100.00	60.98	95.32	100.00	60.98	95.30
TabNet	Recall	99.42	42.61	63.70	99.40	42.61	63.43	99.33	42.61	62.90	99.24	42.61	62.23	99.20	42.61	62.03
	ROC-AUC	99.93	99.78	99.90	99.93	99.78	99.90	99.93	99.77	99.89	99.91	99.77	99.89	99.91	99.77	99.89
	Precision	100.00	17.92	66.02	100.00	17.95	66.02	100.00	17.95	65.73	100.00	17.90	66.89	100.00	17.87	66.89
TabIDS	Recall	86.21	32.39	20.28	86.20	32.39	20.28	86.13	32.39	20.15	86.07	32.39	20.28	86.05	32.39	20.28
	ROC-AUC	98.14	99.47	99.34	98.13	99.47	99.34	98.11	99.46	99.33	98.09	99.46	99.33	98.08	99.46	99.33

IV. BOUNDARY, HOPSKIPJUMP, SIGNOPT

TABLE XIII: Black-Box attacks against TabNet and TabIDS for binary classification on the CIC IDS2017 dataset.

Туре	Attacks	Metrics	Label		
Type	Attacks	Wietrics	Benign	Attacks	
		Precision	83.02	16.83	
	Boundary	Recall	67.71	32.07	
		ROC-AUC	52.23	58.04	
		Precision	83.02	16.82	
TabNet	HopSkipJump	Recall	67.81	31.93	
		ROC-AUC	73.71	73.92	
	SignOPT	Precision	85.73	22.51	
		Recall	69.88	42.93	
		ROC-AUC	80.60	81.02	
	Boundary	Precision	83.10	17.09	
		Recall	83.88	16.30	
		ROC-AUC	82.08	83.52	
	HopSkipJump	Precision	83.10	17.07	
TabIDS		Recall	83.80	16.36	
		ROC-AUC	86.37	86.38	
	SignOPT	Precision	86.98	40.52	
		Recall	89.82	34.01	
		ROC-AUC	93.21	93.22	

TABLE XIV: Black-Box attacks against TabNet and TabIDS for multiclass classification on the CIC IDS2017 dataset.

Type Attacks		Metrics	Label		
Type	Attacks	MICHICS	Benign	DoS	DDoS
		Precision	83.10	10.44	10.28
	Boundary	Recall	57.43	4.47	0.06
		ROC-AUC	49.91	45.61	46.71
		Precision	79.79	13.37	4.71
TabNet	HopSkipJump	Recall	57.59	4.67	0.02
		ROC-AUC	63.25	95.63	99.87
	SignOPT	Precision	81.84	18.73	21.05
		Recall	60.70	11.31	1.16
		ROC-AUC	70.63	93.96	99.22
	Boundary	Precision	83.07	10.01	5.73
		Recall	72.21	11.07	3.86
		ROC-AUC	75.44	77.64	76.64
	HopSkipJump	Precision	83.17	10.56	8.27
TabIDS		Recall	72.13	11.66	3.82
		ROC-AUC	82.96	94.62	98.68
	SignOPT	Precision	86.65	23.13	34.06
		Recall	74.11	19.78	17.69
		ROC-AUC	88.30	96.33	98.83

TABLE XV: Black-Box Attacks against TabNet and TabIDS for binary classification on the UNSW-NB15 Dataset.

Туре	Attacks	Metrics	Label		
Type		Wietrics	Normal	Attacks	
		Precision	97.95	2.01	
	Boundary	Recall	89.46	10.38	
		ROC-AUC	51.94	64.94	
		Precision	97.95	1.95	
TabNet	HopSkipJump	Recall	89.45	10.06	
		ROC-AUC	90.36	90.37	
	SignOPT	Precision	98.50	6.71	
		Recall	90.01	34.46	
		ROC-AUC	93.33	93.36	
	Boundary	Precision	97.96	2.07	
		Recall	82.97	17.29	
		ROC-AUC	56.65	73.07	
	HopSkipJump	Precision	97.97	2.10	
TabIDS		Recall	83.08	17.38	
		ROC-AUC	85.89	85.89	
	SignOPT	Precision	98.72	6.85	
		Recall	87.00	45.78	
		ROC-AUC	92.90	92.90	

TABLE XVI: Black-Box attacks against TabNet and TabIDS for multiclass classification on the UNSW-NB15 dataset.

Туре	Attacks	Metrics	Label		
Type	Attacks	Metrics	Normal	Recon.	Generic
	Boundary	Precision	97.96	0.00	0.00
		Recall	93.37	0.00	0.00
		ROC-AUC	50.94	50.16	50.85
		Precision	99.33	6.12	1.47
TabNet	HopSkipJump	Recall	93.26	1.70	0.07
		ROC-AUC	96.19	99.46	99.27
	SignOPT	Precision	99.60	1.80	1.14
		Recall	93.64	1.42	0.07
		ROC-AUC	98.17	99.46	99.09
	Boundary	Precision	97.94	0.00	0.39
		Recall	51.97	0.00	0.20
		ROC-AUC	64.09	63.20	62.57
	HopSkipJump	Precision	99.50	6.27	5.07
TabIDS		Recall	51.87	23.01	0.47
		ROC-AUC	96.08	97.73	97.13
	SignOPT	Precision	99.73	2.01	15.26
		Recall	68.50	16.19	10.24
		ROC-AUC	98.12	97.95	97.69

V. Out-of-Distribution Detection (OOD)

TABLE XVIII: ROC-AUC metrics for TabIDS and OOD in multiclass classification and CIC IDS2017 dataset.

Attack	Parameter	TabIDS	OOD
	0.008	99.99	48.8
	0.01	99.95	48.9
PGD-100 ℓ_2	0.03	99.77	52.1
	0.05	99.79	58.6
	0.08	99.80	67.2
	0.008	99.99	48.9
	0.01	99.79	49.9
PGD-100 ℓ_{∞}	0.03	99.62	66.5
	0.05	99.55	77.5
	0.08	99.58	88.2
	0.001	95.73	90.1
	0.002	97.77	90.1
DF-2	0.005	97.79	90.1
	0.008	98.10	90.1
	0.009	98.37	90.1
	0	99.97	48.7
	0.2	99.99	48.7
CW-2	0.5	99.99	48.7
	0.8	99.99	48.7
	1.0	99.94	48.7
Boundary		75.44	98.5
HopSkipJump		82.95	98.5
SignOPT		88.30	98.4

TABLE XIX: ROC-AUC metrics for TabIDS and OOD in binary classification and UNSW-NB15 dataset.

Attack	Parameter	TabIDS	OOD
	0.008	99.86	49.5
	0.01	99.85	49.8
PGD-100 ℓ_2	0.03	99.82	53.9
	0.05	99.78	57.8
	0.08	99.73	64.5
	0.008	99.79	60.6
	0.01	99.72	62.2
PGD-100 ℓ_{∞}	0.03	99.66	86.9
	0.05	99.59	87.8
	0.08	99.58	87.7
	0.001	78.03	73.7
	0.002	77.99	73.8
DF-2	0.005	77.90	73.9
	0.008	77.79	74.1
	0.009	77.76	74.2
	0.0	98.41	45.5
	0.2	98.49	45.4
CW-2	0.5	98.68	45.2
	0.8	98.70	45.2
	1.0	98.75	45.2
Boundary		73.07	100
_			
Hopskipjump		85.89	100
Signopt		92.90	100

TABLE XX: ROC-AUC metrics for TabIDS and OOD in binary classification and UNSW-NB15 dataset.

Attack	Parameter	TabIDS	OOD
	0.008	99.77	49.7
	0.01	99.80	50
PGD-100 ℓ_2	0.03	99.79	53
	0.05	99.76	55.9
	0.08	99.71	59.2
	0.008	99.68	58.4
	0.01	99.71	63
PGD-100 ℓ_{∞}	0.03	99.69	85.6
	0.05	99.66	88
	0.08	99.62	89.5
	0.001	98.14	91.1
	0.002	93.98	91.1
DF-2	0.005	94.00	91.1
	0.008	95.07	91.1
	0.009	95.79	91.1
	0.0	99.92	49
	0.2	99.84	49
CW	0.5	99.77	49
	0.8	99.81	49
	1.0	99.79	49
Boundary		64.09	98.9
Hopskipjump		96.08	98.9
Signopt		98.12	98.9