DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIVISION OF HOUSING POLICY DEVELOPMENT

2020 W. El Camino Avenue, Suite 500 Sacramento, CA 95833 (916) 263-2911 / FAX (916) 263-7453 www.hcd.ca.gov



October 12, 2021

Kevin H. Snyder, Director Department of Community Development City of Indio 100 Civic Center Mall Indio, CA 92201

Dear Kevin H. Snyder:

RE: City of Indio's 6th Cycle (2021-2029) Draft Housing Element

Thank you for submitting the City of Indio's (City) draft housing element received for review on August 13, 2021. Pursuant to Government Code section 65585, subdivision (b), the California Department of Housing and Community Development (HCD) is reporting the results of its review. Our review was facilitated by a telephone conversation on October 8, 2021 with you and the City's consultants Erika Van Sickel and Elizabeth Dickson. In addition, HCD considered comments from California Rural Legal Assistance, Inc. pursuant to Government Code section 65585, subdivision (c).

The draft element addresses many statutory requirements; however, revisions will be necessary to comply with State Housing Element Law (Article 10.6 of the Gov. Code). The enclosed Appendix describes revisions needed to comply with State Housing Element Law.

The City's statutory deadline to adopt a housing element is October 15, 2021. For your information, pursuant to Assembly Bill 1398 (Chapter 358, Statutes of 2021), if a local government fails to adopt a compliant housing element within 120 days of this statutory deadline, then any rezoning to accommodate the regional housing needs allocation, including for lower-income households, shall be completed no later than one year from the statutory deadline. Otherwise, the local government's housing element will no longer comply with State Housing Element Law, and HCD may revoke its finding of substantial compliance pursuant to Government Code section 65585, subdivision (i).

For your information, some general plan element updates are triggered by housing element adoption. HCD reminds the City to consider timing provisions and welcomes the opportunity to provide assistance. For information, please see the Technical Advisories issued by the Governor's Office of Planning and Research at: http://opr.ca.gov/docs/OPR Appendix C final.pdf and http://opr.ca.gov/docs/Final 6.26.15.pdf.

Public participation in the development, adoption and implementation of the housing element is essential to effective housing planning. Throughout the housing element process, the City should continue to engage the community, including organizations that represent lower-income and special needs households, by making information regularly available and considering and incorporating comments where appropriate.

Pursuant to Government Code section 65583.3, subdivision (b), the City must utilize standards, forms, and definitions adopted by HCD when preparing the sites inventory. Please see HCD's housing element webpage at https://www.hcd.ca.gov/community-development/housing-element/index.shtml#element for a copy of the form and instructions. The City can reach out to HCD at sitesinventory@hcd.ca.gov for technical assistance. Please note, upon adoption of the housing element, the City must submit an electronic version of the sites inventory with its adopted housing element to sitesinventory@hcd.ca.gov.

Several federal, state, and regional funding programs consider housing element compliance as an eligibility or ranking criteria. For example, the CalTrans Senate Bill (SB) 1 Sustainable Communities grant; the Strategic Growth Council and HCD's Affordable Housing and Sustainable Communities programs; and HCD's Permanent Local Housing Allocation consider housing element compliance and/or annual reporting requirements pursuant to Government Code section 65400. With a compliant housing element, the City meets housing element requirements for these and other funding sources.

HCD appreciates the City's staff and its consultants' hard work provided during our review. We are committed to assisting the City in addressing all statutory requirements of State Housing Element Law. If you have any questions or need additional technical assistance, please contact Divya Sen, of our staff, at Divya.Sen@hcd.ca.gov.

Sincerely,

Shannan West

Land Use and Planning Unit Chief

Enclosure

APPENDIX CITY OF INDIO

The following changes are necessary to bring the City's housing element into compliance with Article 10.6 of the Government Code. Accompanying each recommended change, we cite the supporting section of the Government Code.

Housing element technical assistance information is available on HCD's website at http://www.hcd.ca.gov/community-development/housing-element/housing-element-memos.shtml. Among other resources, the housing element section contains HCD's latest technical assistance tool, *Building Blocks for Effective Housing Elements (Building Blocks)*, available at http://www.hcd.ca.gov/community-development/building-blocks/index.shtml and includes the Government Code addressing State Housing Element Law and other resources.

A. Review and Revision

Review the previous element to evaluate the appropriateness, effectiveness, and progress in implementation, and reflect the results of this review in the revised element. (Gov. Code, § 65588 (a) and (b).)

<u>Special Needs Populations</u>: As part of the evaluation of programs in the past cycle, the element must provide an explanation of the effectiveness of goals, policies, and related actions in meeting the housing needs of special needs populations (e.g., elderly, persons with disabilities, large households, female-headed households, farmworkers, and persons experiencing homelessness).

B. Housing Needs, Resources, and Constraints

1. Affirmatively further[ing] fair housing in accordance with Chapter 15 (commencing with Section 8899.50) of Division 1 of Title 2...shall include an assessment of fair housing in the jurisdiction. (Gov. Code, § 65583, subd. (c)(10)(A))

<u>Enforcement & Outreach</u>: The element generically describes outreach efforts and fair housing services (Appendix D, pp. 3 to 4). The element must include a description of fair housing enforcement and outreach capacity as it relates to the ability of the City and fair housing entities to disseminate information related to fair housing and provide outreach and education to assure community members are aware of fair housing laws and rights.

Regional Trends and Patterns: For all categories of analysis (e.g., segregation and integration, racially and ethnically concentrated areas of poverty, access to opportunity, and disproportionate housing needs, including displacement), the element addresses some requirements to analyze local patterns and trends. However, the element must also analyze regional patterns and trends for each category and subcategory of analysis. A regional analysis should compare conditions at the local level to the rest of the region. This analysis could compare the locality at a county level or other subregional geography.

<u>Site Inventory</u>: The element includes a general discussion that the proposed sites to meet regional housing needs allocation (RHNA) are geographically distributed which results in these sites AFFH (Appendix D, p. 41). However, the site inventory analysis should address how the sites are identified to improve conditions (or if sites exacerbate conditions, how a program can mitigate the impact), whether the sites are isolated by income group and should be supported by local data and knowledge.

<u>Disproportionate Housing Needs including Displacement Risks</u>: The element includes some local data and analysis (Appendix D, pp. 45 to 46) on cost burden, overcrowding, and displacement, but it does not include local and regional analysis on substandard housing and homelessness. The element should include complete local and regional data for cost burden, overcrowding, substandard housing, homelessness and displacement and analyze the data for trends and patterns.

Goals, Priorities, Metrics, and Milestones: Goals and actions must create meaningful impact to overcome contributing factors to fair housing issues. Currently, programs in the element address fair housing (Appendix D, p. 46) but are not sufficient to facilitate meaningful change. Based on the outcomes of a complete analysis, the element must be revised to add or modify goals and actions. Goals and actions must specifically respond to the analysis and to the identified and prioritized contributing factors to fair housing issues and must be significant and meaningful enough to overcome identified patterns and trends. Actions must have metrics and milestones as appropriate and must address housing mobility enhancement, new housing choices and affordability in high opportunity areas, place-based strategies for community preservation and revitalization and displacement protection.

- 2. Include an analysis of population and employment trends and documentation of projections and a quantification of the locality's existing and projected needs for all income levels, including extremely low-income households. (Gov. Code, § 65583, subd. (a)(1).)
 - <u>Population and Employment Trends</u>: While the element identifies the population and employment trends (Appendix B, pp. 1-2, 4-6), it could include projected population growth data available through the Southern California Association of Government or the Department of Finance and also compare data from available regional resources. As stated by third party commentors, this additional analysis would help the City in future planning and setting appropriate program commitments to provide for the housing needs of all economic segments of the community.
- Include an analysis and documentation of household characteristics, including level of payment compared to ability to pay, housing characteristics, including overcrowding, and housing stock condition. (Gov. Code, § 65583, subd. (a)(2).)
 - Housing Characteristics: While the element identifies the total number of vacancies (Appendix B, p. 14), it should also quantify vacancy by tenure (i.e., units for rent and for sale). For additional information and sample analysis, see the Building Blocks at http://www.hcd.ca.gov/community-development/housing-element/housing-element-memos.shtml.

Housing Conditions: The element identifies the age of the housing stock (Appendix B, p. 13). However, it must include analysis of the condition of the existing housing stock and estimate the number of units in need of rehabilitation and replacement. For example, the analysis could include estimates from a recent windshield survey or sampling, estimates from the code enforcement agency, or information from knowledgeable builders/developers, including non-profit housing developers or organizations. For additional information, see the Building Blocks at http://www.hcd.ca.gov/community-development/building-blocks/housing-needs/housing-stock-characteristics.shtml.

4. An inventory of land suitable and available for residential development, including vacant sites and sites having realistic and demonstrated potential for redevelopment during the planning period to meet the locality's housing need for a designated income level, and an analysis of the relationship of zoning and public facilities and services to these sites. (Gov. Code, § 65583, subd. (a)(3).)

The City has a RHNA of 7,812 housing units, of which 2,963 are for lower-income households. To address this need, the element relies on approved and planned projects, vacant sites, and underutilized sites. To demonstrate the adequacy of these sites and strategies to accommodate the City's RHNA, the element must include complete analyses:

Progress in Meeting the RHNA: The element indicates (Appendix E, p. 22) that 320 units affordable to lower-income households are approved but provides no information documenting how affordability of the units was determined. As you know, the City's RHNA may be reduced by the number of new units built since June 30, 2021; however, the element must describe the City's methodology for assigning these units to the various income groups based on actual sales price or rent level of the units and demonstrate their availability in the planning period. (Gov. Code § 65583.1, subd. (d).) For additional information, see the Building Blocks at http://www.hcd.ca.gov/community-development/building-blocks/housingneeds/projected-housing-needs.shtml.

Realistic Capacity: For sites zoned for nonresidential uses (MU zone and commercial sites), the element must describe how the likelihood for residential development in nonresidential zones was accounted for. The element could describe any performance standards mandating a specified portion of residential and any factors increasing the potential for residential development such as incentives for residential use, and residential development trends in the same nonresidential zoning districts. For additional information, see the Building Blocks at http://www.hcd.ca.gov/community-development/building-blocks/site-inventory-analysis/analysis-of-sites-and-zoning.shtml#zoning.

<u>Small Sites</u>: The site inventory identifies small sites to accommodate the City's lower-income RHNA. Sites smaller than a half-acre in size are deemed inadequate to accommodate housing for lower-income households unless it is demonstrated, with sufficient evidence, that sites are suitable to accommodate housing for lower-income households. The element should provide specific examples with the densities, affordability and, if applicable, circumstances leading to consolidation, such as common ownership. The element should relate these examples to the sites

identified to accommodate the RHNA for lower-income households to demonstrate that these sites can adequately accommodate the City's lower-income housing need. Based on a complete analysis, the City should consider adding or revising programs to include incentives for facilitating development on small sites.

Suitability of Nonvacant Sites: The element identifies nonvacant sites to accommodate the regional housing need for lower-income households (Appendix D, pp. 11, 13, 14). The element must describe the methodology used to determine the additional development potential of these sites within the planning period. The methodology shall consider factors including the extent to which existing uses may constitute an impediment to additional residential development, the City's past experience with converting existing uses to higher density residential development, the current market demand for the existing use, an analysis of any existing leases or other contracts that would perpetuate the existing use or prevent redevelopment of the site for additional residential development, development trends, market conditions, and regulatory or other incentives or standards to encourage additional residential development on these sites. For example, the element could consider indicators such as age and condition of the existing structure, presence of expiring leases, expressed developer interest, low improvement to land value ratio, and other factors.

<u>Suitability and Availability of Infrastructure</u>: While the element describes water and sewer infrastructure, it must also demonstrate sites have sufficient existing or planned access to dry utilities (Gov. Code, § 65583.2, subd. (b).

<u>Priority Water and Sewer</u>: Water and sewer service providers must establish specific procedures to grant priority water and sewer service to developments with units affordable to lower-income households. (Gov. Code, § 65589.7.) Local governments are required to immediately deliver the housing element to water and sewer service providers. HCD recommends including a cover memo describing the City housing element, including the City and regional housing needs. The element must demonstrate compliance with these requirements or add or revise programs as appropriate. For additional information and a sample cover memo, see the Building Blocks at http://www.hcd.ca.gov/community-development/building-blocks/other-requirements/priority-for-water-sewer.shtml.

Sites with Zoning for a Variety of Housing Types:

• Emergency Shelters: The element identifies Emergency Shelter Overlay Zone District where emergency shelters are a permitted use with discretionary process. However, the element must identify a zone(s) where emergency shelters are permitted without a conditional use permit or other discretionary action and with sufficient capacity to accommodate the identified need for shelters. (Gov. Code, § 65583, subd. (a)(4).) If the element cannot demonstrate compliance with the statutory requirements, a program to amend the zoning ordinance to meet the statutory requirements must be completed within one year of the adoption of the housing element. The element must also describe the characteristics and suitability of the zone(s) for emergency shelters. For additional information, see the Building Blocks at <a href="http://www.hcd.ca.gov/community-development/housing-element

- The City must ensure that the zoning adheres to the new parking requirement standards per AB 139 (Chapter 335, Statutes of 2019). AB 139 requires that the zone for emergency shelter allows for sufficient parking for the staff of the emergency shelter. The element must include programs as appropriate based on the outcomes of this analysis.
- 5. An analysis of potential and actual governmental constraints upon the maintenance, improvement, or development of housing for all income levels, including the types of housing identified in paragraph (1) of subdivision (c), and for persons with disabilities as identified in the analysis pursuant to paragraph (7), including land use controls, building codes and their enforcement, site improvements, fees and other exactions required of developers, and local processing and permit procedures. The analysis shall also demonstrate local efforts to remove governmental constraints that hinder the locality from meeting its share of the regional housing need in accordance with Government Code section 65584 and from meeting the need for housing for persons with disabilities, supportive housing, transitional housing, and emergency shelters identified pursuant to paragraph (7). Transitional housing and supportive housing shall be considered a residential use of property and shall be subject only to those restrictions that apply to other residential dwellings of the same type in the same zone. (Gov. Code, § 65583, subd. (a)(5).)

Land-Use Controls: The element must identify and analyze all relevant land-use controls impacts as potential constraints on a variety of housing types (e.g., multifamily rental housing, mobilehomes, transitional housing). For example, the element must describe and analyze the development standards within the MUN and MT zones. The analysis must also evaluate the cumulative impacts of land-use controls on the cost and supply of housing, including the ability to achieve maximum densities and cost and supply of housing. The analysis should also describe past or current efforts to remove identified governmental constraints. The element should include programs to address or remove the identified constraints.

Local Processing and Permit Procedures: The element must describe and analyze the City permit processing and approval procedures by zone (MU, MT, and DT) and housing type for multifamily rental housing and single-family housing. The element should also be revised to include Table 5 as stated (Appendix C, p. 15). In addition, the element states processing and permit procedures for C-E-PD and RM zones but does not include for RH. The element should describe and analyze if RH zone. The analysis must evaluate the processing and permit procedures' impacts as potential constraints on housing supply and affordability. For example, the analysis should consider processing and approval procedures and time for typical single family and multifamily developments, including type of permit, level of review (e.g., design review), approval findings and any discretionary approval procedures.

<u>Design Review</u>: The element must describe and analyze any design review guidelines and processes the City has, including approval procedures and decision-making criteria, for their impact as potential constraints on housing supply and affordability. For example, the analysis could describe required findings and discuss whether objective standards and guidelines improve development certainty and mitigate cost impacts.

The element must demonstrate this process is not a constraint or it must include a program to address this permitting requirement, as appropriate.

Constraints on Housing for Persons with Disabilities: The element (Appendix C, p. 11) currently details that community care facilities serving seven or more are permitted with a conditional use permit (CUP), in RL, RM, RH, CC, RC and OS Districts. The element should analyze the CUP for community care facilities serving seven or more as a potential constraint on housing for persons with disabilities and add or modify programs as appropriate to ensure zoning permits group homes objectively with approval certainty.

6. An analysis of potential and actual nongovernmental constraints upon the maintenance, improvement, or development of housing for all income levels, including the availability of financing, the price of land, the cost of construction, the requests to develop housing at densities below those anticipated in the analysis required by subdivision (c) of Government Code section 65583.2, and the length of time between receiving approval for a housing development and submittal of an application for building permits for that housing development that hinder the construction of a locality's share of the regional housing need in accordance with Government Code section 65584. The analysis shall also demonstrate local efforts to remove nongovernmental constraints that create a gap between the locality's planning for the development of housing for all income levels and the construction of that housing. (Gov. Code, § 65583, subd. (a)(6).)

The element must be revised to include the length of time between receiving approval for a housing development and submittal of an application for building permits that potentially hinder the construction of a locality's share of the regional housing need. The element must also include a description of any program(s) that mitigate nongovernmental constraints that create a gap in the jurisdictions ability to meet RHNA by income category. (Gov. Code, § 65583.2, subd. (c)(3).)

7. Analyze any special housing needs such as elderly; persons with disabilities, including a developmental disability; large families; farmworkers; families with female-heads of households; and families and persons in need of emergency shelter. (Gov. Code, § 65583, subd. (a)(7).)

While the element quantifies the City's special needs populations, it must also analyze their special housing needs. For a complete analysis of each population group, the element should discuss challenges faced by the population, the existing resources to meet those needs (e.g., availability senior housing units, number of large units, number of deed restricted units, etc.), an assessment of any gaps in resources, and proposed policies, programs, and funding to help address those gaps.

The element includes farmworker analysis (Appendix B, p. 25) and should also incorporate local knowledge. Local officials, special needs service providers, or City social and health service providers may be able to assist with information to complete the analysis. For additional information and a sample analysis, see the Building Blocks at http://www.hcd.ca.gov/community-development/building-blocks/housing-needs/large-families-female-head-household.shtml.

8. Analyze existing assisted housing developments that are eligible to change to non-low-income housing uses during the next tenjb years due to termination of subsidy contracts, mortgage prepayment, or expiration of use restrictions. (Gov. Code, § 65583, subd. (a)(9) through 65583(a)(9)(D).)

The element identifies Desert Gardens Apartment is an USDA property expected to expire in 2030. If units are identified as at-risk within a ten-year period (2021–2031), the analysis of "at-risk" units must include the following (Gov. Code, § 65583, subd. (a)(9).):

- Listing of each development by project name and address
- Type of governmental assistance received
- Estimated total cost for producing, replacing, and preserving the units at-risk
- Identification of public and private non-profit corporations known to the City to have the legal and managerial capacity to acquire and manage at-risk units
- Identification and consideration of use of federal, state and local financing and subsidy programs.

For additional information and sample analysis, see the *Building Blocks* at http://www.hcd.ca.gov/community-development/building-blocks/housing-needs/assisted-housing-developments.shtml and for more information on identifying units at-risk, see the California Housing Partnership Corporation at http://www.chpc.net.

C. <u>Housing Programs</u>

1. Include a program which sets forth a schedule of actions during the planning period, each with a timeline for implementation, which may recognize that certain programs are ongoing, such that there will be beneficial impacts of the programs within the planning period, that the local government is undertaking or intends to undertake to implement the policies and achieve the goals and objectives of the housing element through the administration of land use and development controls, the provision of regulatory concessions and incentives, and the utilization of appropriate federal and state financing and subsidy programs when available. The program shall include an identification of the agencies and officials responsible for the implementation of the various actions. (Gov. Code, § 65583, subd. (c).)

To address the program requirements of Government Code section 65583, subdivision (c)(1-6), and to facilitate implementation, programs should include: (1) a description of the City's specific role in implementation; (2) definitive implementation timelines; (3) objectives, quantified where appropriate; and (4) identification of responsible agencies and officials. Programs to be revised include the following:

General: The element must provide discrete timing for all programs (e.g., month, year) to account for how often the action will occur as well as to ensure a beneficial impact throughout the planning period and quantify objectives where feasible.

Program 3 (ADU Permitting): The program should be revised to commit to update the City's ADU Ordinance based on HCD's review which was provided under a separate cover. Specifically, the ordinance should address the City's ADU definition, permit and building permit process procedures, and ADU development standards.

Program 19 (Housing Rehabilitation): Quantify the number of homeowners expected to receive assistance.

Program 27 (Place-Based Strategies): Provide specific timeframes for implementation.

Program 28 (Reasonable Accommodation Procedures): Provide findings of approval for the reasonable accommodation process.

2. Identify actions that will be taken to make sites available during the planning period with appropriate zoning and development standards and with services and facilities to accommodate that portion of the city's or county's share of the regional housing need for each income level that could not be accommodated on sites identified in the inventory completed pursuant to paragraph (3) of subdivision (a) without rezoning, and to comply with the requirements of Government Code section 65584.09. Sites shall be identified as needed to facilitate and encourage the development of a variety of types of housing for all income levels, including multifamily rental housing, factory-built housing, mobilehomes, housing for agricultural employees, supportive housing, single-room occupancy units, emergency shelters, and transitional housing. (Gov. Code, § 65583, subd. (c)(1).)

As noted in Finding B4, the element does not include a complete site analysis; therefore, the adequacy of sites and zoning were not established. Based on the results of a complete sites inventory and analysis, the City may need to add or revise programs to address a shortfall of sites or zoning available to encourage a variety of housing types. HCD understands while the general plan designations for sites within the MUN, MT, DT land use designations are in place, the implementing zoning amendments have yet to be adopted. Please be aware, if the zoning is not in place by beginning of the planning period (October 15, 2021), the element must include a program to commit to adopting the zoning changes. For sites that are expected to accommodate the RHNA for lower-income households, the program must commit to housing element rezone requirements pursuant to Government Code section 65583.2 (h) and (i).

- 3. The housing element shall contain programs which assist in the development of adequate housing to meet the needs of extremely low-, very low-, low- and moderate-income households. (Gov. Code, § 65583, subd. (c)(2).)
 - The element must include a program(s) to assist in the development of housing affordable to low-, very low- and ELI households. Programs must be revised or added to the element to assist in the development of housing for ELI households. Program actions could include prioritizing some funding for housing developments affordable to ELI households and offering financial incentives or regulatory concessions to encourage the development of housing types, such as multifamily, SRO units, to address the identified housing needs for ELI households. For additional information, see the Building Blocks at http://www.hcd.ca.gov/community-development/building-blocks/housing-needs/extremely-low-income-housing-needs.shtml.
- 4. Address and, where appropriate and legally possible, remove governmental and nongovernmental constraints to the maintenance, improvement, and development of housing, including housing for all income levels and housing for persons with

disabilities. The program shall remove constraints to, and provide reasonable accommodations for housing designed for, intended for occupancy by, or with supportive services for, persons with disabilities. (Gov. Code, § 65583, subd. (c)(3).)

As noted in Findings B4 and B5, the element requires a complete analysis of potential governmental and nongovernmental constraints. Depending upon the results of that analysis, the City may need to revise or add programs and address and remove or mitigate any identified constraints.

6. Promote AFFH opportunities and promote housing throughout the community or communities for all persons regardless of race, religion, sex, marital status, ancestry, national origin, color, familial status, or disability, and other characteristics protected by the California Fair Employment and Housing Act (Part 2.8 (commencing with Section 12900) of Division 3 of Title 2), Section 65008, and any other state and federal fair housing and planning law. (Gov. Code, § 65583, subd. (c)(5).)

As noted in Finding B1, the element must include a complete analysis of AFFH. Based on the outcomes of that analysis, the element must add or modify programs.

D. Quantified Objectives

Establish the number of housing units, by income level, that can be constructed, rehabilitated, and conserved over a five-year time frame. (Gov. Code, § 65583, subd. (b)(1 & 2).)

Include quantified objectives estimating the number of housing units <u>by income category</u> that can be constructed, rehabilitated, and conserved over a five-year time period. This requirement could be addressed by utilizing a matrix like the one illustrated below:

Income	New Construction	Rehabilitation	Conservation/ Preservation
Extremely Low-			
Very Low-			
Low-			
Moderate-			
Above Moderate-			
TOTAL			

E. Public Participation

Local governments shall make a diligent effort to achieve public participation of all economic segments of the community in the development of the housing element, and the element shall describe this effort. (Gov. Code, § 65583, subd.(c)(8).)

While the element includes a general summary of the public participation process (p. 4 and Appendix F), it must also demonstrate diligent efforts were made to involve all economic segments of the community in the development of the housing element, specifically lower-income households, and special needs group. The element could describe the efforts to provide translation services and to circulate the housing element among low- and moderate-income households and organizations that represent them and to involve such groups and persons in the element throughout the process. In addition, the element should also summarize the public comments and describe how they were considered and incorporated into the element. For additional information, see the Building Blocks at http://www.hcd.ca.gov/community-development/building-blocks/getting-started/public-participation.shtml.

In addition, HCD understands the City made the element available to the public concurrent with its submittal to HCD. By not providing an opportunity for the public to review and comment on a draft of the element in advance of submission, the City has not yet complied with statutory mandates to make a diligent effort to encourage the public participation in the development of the element and it reduces HCD's ability to consider public comments in the course of its review. The availability of the document to the public and opportunity for public comment prior to submittal to HCD is essential to the public process and HCD's review. The City must proactively make future revisions available to the public, including any commenters, prior to submitting any revisions to HCD and diligently consider and address comments, including making revisions to the document where appropriate. HCD's future review will consider the extent to which the revised element documents how the City solicited, considered, and addressed public comments in the element. The City's consideration of public comments must not be limited by HCD's findings in this review letter.