# DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIVISION OF HOUSING POLICY DEVELOPMENT

2020 W. El Camino Avenue, Suite 500 Sacramento, CA 95833 (916) 263-2911 / FAX (916) 263-7453 www.hcd.ca.gov



November 22, 2021

Konrad Bolowich, Director Community Development Department City of Loma Linda 25541 Barton Road Loma Linda, CA 92354

Dear Konrad Bolowich:

# RE: City of Loma Linda's 6th Cycle (2021-2029) Draft Housing Element

Thank you for submitting the City of Loma Linda's (City) draft housing element received for review on September 23, 2021. Pursuant to Government Code section 65585, subdivision (b), the California Department of Housing and Community Development (HCD) is reporting the results of its review. Our review was facilitated by a conversation on November 18, 2021 with Lorena Matarrita, Senior Planner and Laura Stetson, Consultant.

The draft element addresses many statutory requirements; however, revisions will be necessary to comply with State Housing Element Law (Article 10.6 of the Gov. Code. The enclosed Appendix describes revisions needed to comply with State Housing Element Law.

As a reminder, the City's 6th cycle housing element was due October 15, 2021. As of today, the City has not completed the housing element process for the 6th cycle. The City's 5th cycle housing element no longer satisfies statutory requirements. HCD encourages the City to revise the element as described above, adopt, and submit to HCD to regain housing element compliance.

For your information, pursuant to Assembly Bill 1398 (Chapter 358, Statutes of 2021), if a local government fails to adopt a compliant housing element within 120 days of the statutory deadline (October 15, 2021), then any rezoning to accommodate the regional housing needs allocation (RHNA), including for lower-income households, shall be completed no later than one year from the statutory deadline. Otherwise, the local government's housing element will no longer comply with State Housing Element Law, and HCD may revoke its finding of substantial compliance pursuant to Government Code section 65585, subdivision (i).

Public participation in the development, adoption and implementation of the housing element is essential to effective housing planning. Throughout the housing element process, the City should continue to engage the community, including organizations that represent lower-

income and special needs households, by making information regularly available and considering and incorporating comments where appropriate.

Pursuant to Government Code section 65583.3, subdivision (b), the City must utilize standards, forms, and definitions adopted by HCD when preparing the sites inventory. Please see HCD's housing element webpage at <a href="https://www.hcd.ca.gov/community-development/housing-element/index.shtml#element">https://www.hcd.ca.gov/community-development/housing-element/index.shtml#element</a> for a copy of the form and instructions. The City can reach out to HCD at <a href="mailto:sitesinventory@hcd.ca.gov">sitesinventory@hcd.ca.gov</a> for technical assistance. Please note, upon adoption of the housing element, the City must submit an electronic version of the sites inventory with its adopted housing element to <a href="mailto:sitesinventory@hcd.ca.gov">sitesinventory@hcd.ca.gov</a>.

For your information, some general plan element updates are triggered by housing element adoption. HCD reminds the County to consider timing provisions and welcomes the opportunity to provide assistance. For information, please see the Technical Advisories issued by the Governor's Office of Planning and Research at: <a href="http://opr.ca.gov/docs/OPR">http://opr.ca.gov/docs/OPR</a> Appendix C final.pdf and <a href="http://opr.ca.gov/docs/Final-6.26.15.pdf">http://opr.ca.gov/docs/Final-6.26.15.pdf</a>.

Several federal, state, and regional funding programs consider housing element compliance as an eligibility or ranking criteria. For example, the CalTrans Senate Bill (SB) 1 Sustainable Communities grant; the Strategic Growth Council and HCD's Affordable Housing and Sustainable Communities programs; and HCD's Permanent Local Housing Allocation consider housing element compliance and/or annual reporting requirements pursuant to Government Code section 65400. With a compliant housing element, the City meets housing element requirements for these and other funding sources.

HCD appreciates the City's team during the course of our review. We are committed to assist the City in addressing all statutory requirements of State Housing Element Law. If you have any questions or need additional technical assistance, please contact Divya Sen, of our staff, at Divya.Sen@hcd.ca.gov.

Sincerely,

Paul McDougall

RW DAT

Senior Planning Manager

**Enclosure** 

# APPENDIX CITY OF LOMA LINDA

The following changes are necessary to bring the City's housing element into compliance with Article 10.6 of the Government Code. Accompanying each recommended change, we cite the supporting section of the Government Code.

Housing element technical assistance information is available on HCD's website at <a href="http://www.hcd.ca.gov/community-development/housing-element/housing-element-memos.shtml">http://www.hcd.ca.gov/community-development/housing-element/housing-element-memos.shtml</a>. Among other resources, the housing element section contains HCD's latest technical assistance tool, *Building Blocks for Effective Housing Elements (Building Blocks)*, available at <a href="http://www.hcd.ca.gov/community-development/building-blocks/index.shtml">http://www.hcd.ca.gov/community-development/building-blocks/index.shtml</a> and includes the Government Code addressing State Housing Element Law and other resources.

### A. Review and Revision

Review the previous element to evaluate the appropriateness, effectiveness, and progress in implementation, and reflect the results of this review in the revised element. (Gov. Code, § 65588 (a) and (b).)

<u>Special Needs Populations</u>: As part of the review of programs in the past cycle, the element must provide an evaluation of the cumulative effectiveness of goals, policies, and related actions in meeting the housing needs of special needs populations (e.g., elderly, persons with disabilities, large households, female-headed households, farmworkers, and persons experiencing homelessness).

#### B. <u>Housing Needs, Resources, and Constraints</u>

1. Affirmatively further[ing] fair housing in accordance with Chapter 15 (commencing with Section 8899.50) of Division 1 of Title 2...shall include an assessment of fair housing in the jurisdiction. (Gov. Code, § 65583, subd. (c)(10)(A).)

<u>Fair Housing Enforcement and Outreach</u>: The element must include the City's ability to provide enforcement and outreach capacity which can consist of actions such as the City's or contractor's ability to investigate complaints, obtain remedies, or the City's ability to engage in fair housing testing. The element currently states 680 housing discrimination complaints in San Bernardino County, with a majority alleging disability as a basis for discrimination but should be updated to include how many of these were filed in the City. The analysis should also address outreach that can be used to supplement analysis of other components of the assessment of fair housing and site inventory to better inform contributing factors, priorities, and meaningful actions.

<u>Integration and Segregation</u>: The element includes limited regional data on integration and segregation of familial status. The element needs to include complete local and

regional data on integration and segregation for the City and analyze it for both local and regional trends and patterns.

Racial/Ethnic Areas of Concentration of Poverty: The element includes some data on R/ECAP but no regional data or analysis concentrated areas of affluence. The element should also be revised to include local and regional data on areas of affluence and analyze this data for trends and patterns.

<u>Disproportionate Housing Needs</u>: The element includes some data on cost-burdened households and overcrowding at a city level but should also include analysis at a regional level for cost-burdened and overcrowded households. In addition, this analysis should address fair housing issues at a local or regional level for substandard housing and homelessness.

Local Data and Knowledge, and Other Relevant Factors: The element does not address this requirement. The element must include local data, knowledge, and other relevant factors to discuss and analyze any unique attributes about the City related to fair housing issues. The element should complement federal, state, and regional data with local data and knowledge where appropriate to capture emerging trends and issues, including utilizing knowledge from local and regional advocates and service providers. Also, the element must include other relevant factors that contribute to fair housing issues in the jurisdiction. For instance, the element can analyze historical land use and investment practices or other information and demographic trends.

<u>Sites</u>: The element must include an analysis demonstrating whether sites identified to meet the RHNA are distributed throughout the community in a manner that affirmatively furthers fair housing (AFFH). A full analysis should address the income categories of identified sites with respect to location, the number of sites and units by all income groups and how that effects the existing patterns for all components of the assessment of fair housing (e.g., segregation and integration, access to opportunity). The element should also discuss whether the distribution of sites improves or exacerbates conditions. If sites exacerbate conditions, the element should identify further program actions that will be taken to mitigate this (e.g., anti-displacement strategies).

Goals, Priorities, Metrics, and Milestones: Goals and actions must create meaningful impact to overcome contributing factors to fair housing issues. Currently, programs are not sufficient to facilitate meaningful change and address AFFH requirements. Based on the outcomes of a complete analysis, the element must be revised to add or modify goals and actions. Goals and actions must specifically respond to the analysis and to the identified and prioritized contributing factors to fair housing issues and must be significant and meaningful enough to overcome identified patterns and trends. Actions must have metrics and milestones as appropriate and must address housing mobility enhancement, new housing choices and affordability in high opportunity areas, place-based strategies for community preservation and revitalization and displacement protection.

2. An inventory of land suitable and available for residential development, including vacant sites and sites having realistic and demonstrated potential for redevelopment during the planning period to meet the locality's housing need for a designated income level, and an analysis of the relationship of zoning and public facilities and services to these sites. (Gov. Code, § 65583, subd. (a)(3).)

The City has a RHNA of 2,051 housing units, of which 834 are for lower-income households. To address this need, the element relies on approved and pipeline projects, ADU production, vacant sites, and nonvacant sites. To demonstrate the adequacy of these sites and strategies to accommodate the City's RHNA, the element must include complete analyses:

<u>Sites Inventory</u>: Table C-3 shows a shortfall in sites available for the low-income housing category. While there does seem to be a surplus of sites in the very low-income housing category, the element must either reallocate capacity from this surplus to show that there are sufficient sites to accommodate the RHNA by income group or include a program to rezone capacity to accommodate the shortfall.

In addition, the element should clearly demonstrate whether an application was submitted for 25239 Cottage Street project (p. C-3). The element must clarify if an application has been submitted, what entitlements are necessary, and the number of units based on the project application.

<u>Previously Identified Nonvacant and Vacant Sites</u>: The element indicates sites identified in the inventory were previously identified in past housing elements (p. C-7). If nonvacant sites identified in a prior adopted housing element or vacant sites identified in two or more consecutive planning periods, the sites are inadequate to accommodate housing for lower-income households unless:

- The site's current zoning is appropriate for the development of housing affordable to lower-income households by either including analysis or meeting the appropriate density; and
- The site is subject to a housing element program that requires rezoning within three years of the beginning of the planning period to allow residential use by-right for housing developments in which at least 20 percent of the units are affordable to lower-income households. (Gov. Code, § 65583.2, subd. (c).)

Realistic Capacity: While the element provides assumptions of buildout for sites included in the inventory, it must also provide support for these assumptions. For example, the element should demonstrate what specific trends, factors, and other evidence led to the assumptions. The estimate of the number of units for each site must be adjusted as necessary, based on the land use controls and site improvements, typical densities of existing or approved residential developments at a similar affordability level in that jurisdiction, and on the current or planned availability and accessibility of sufficient water, sewer, and dry utilities. The element also should analyze the likelihood that the identified units will be developed as noted in the

inventory in zones that allow 100 percent nonresidential uses (e.g., mixed-use). This analysis should consider the likelihood of nonresidential development, performance standards, and development trends supporting residential development.

<u>Small Sites</u>: The electronic site inventory and analysis identifies small sites to accommodate the City's lower-income RHNA (p. C-6). Sites smaller than a half-acre in size are deemed inadequate to accommodate housing for lower-income households unless it is demonstrated, with sufficient evidence, that sites are suitable to accommodate housing for lower-income households. The element should provide specific examples with the densities, affordability and, if applicable, circumstances leading to consolidation, such as common ownership. The element should relate these examples to the sites identified to accommodate the RHNA for lower-income households to demonstrate that these sites can adequately accommodate the City's lower-income housing need.

As the element relies on consolidated small sites to accommodate the RHNA for lower-income households, it should include a program(s) to facilitate lot consolidation and development of housing on small sites. For example, the program could commit to (1) granting density bonuses above state density bonus law. (Gov. Code, § 65915.); (2) deferring fees specifically for consolidation; (3) expediting permit processing; (4) identifying and targeting specific financial resources; and (5) modifying development standards.

Large Sites: The electronic site inventory and analysis identifies large sites to accommodate for City's lower-income RHNA. The element should update any internal analysis for consistency (p. C-7). Sites larger than 10 acres in size are deemed inadequate to accommodate housing for lower-income housing unless it is demonstrated that sites of equivalent size were successfully developed during the prior planning period for an equivalent number of lower-income housing units as projected for the site or unless the housing element describes other evidence to HCD that the site is adequate to accommodate lower-income housing. (Gov. Code, § 65583.2, subd. (c)(2)(A).) For example, a site with a proposed and approved housing development that contains units affordable to lower-income households would be an appropriate site to accommodate housing for lower-income households. (Gov. Code, § 65583.2, subd. (c)(2)(C).).

<u>Suitability of Nonvacant Sites</u>: The element must include an analysis demonstrating the potential for redevelopment of nonvacant sites. To address this requirement, the element describes in general the existing use of each nonvacant site for example "commercial". This alone is not adequate to demonstrate the potential for redevelopment in the planning period. The description of existing uses should be sufficiently detailed to facilitate an analysis demonstrating the potential for additional development in the planning period. In addition, the element needs to also analyze the extent that existing uses may impede additional residential development. The element can summarize past experiences converting existing uses to higher density residential development, include current market demand for the existing use, provide analysis of existing leases or contracts that would perpetuate the existing use or prevent additional

residential development and include current information on development trends and market conditions in the City and relate those trends to the sites identified. The element could also consider indicators such as age and condition of the existing structure expressed developer interest, low improvement to land value ratio, and other factors.

In addition, specific analysis and actions are necessary if the housing element relies upon nonvacant sites to accommodate more than 50 percent of the RHNA for lower-income households. For your information, the housing element must demonstrate existing uses are not an impediment to additional residential development and will likely discontinue in the planning period. (Gov. Code, § 65583.2, subd. (g)(2).) Absent findings (e.g., adoption resolution) based on substantial evidence, the existing uses will be presumed to impede additional residential development and will not be utilized toward demonstrating adequate sites to accommodate the RHNA.

Accessory Dwelling Units (ADU): The element assumes an ADU buildout of 20 ADUs per year for a potential buildout of 167 units within the planning period. Given that the City has permitted 3 ADUs in 2018, 4 in 2019, 17 in 2020 (for an average of 6 units per year), it is not clear if a production level of 20 ADUs per year will be achievable over the planning period. As a result, the element should be updated to include supporting analysis for potential ADU production. Depending on the analysis, the element must commit to monitor ADU production throughout the course of the planning period and implement additional actions if not meeting target numbers anticipated in the housing element. In addition to monitoring production, this program should also monitor affordability. Additional actions, if necessary, should be taken in a timely manner (e.g., within 6 months). Finally, if necessary, the degree of additional actions should be in stride with the degree of the gap in production and affordability. For example, if actual production and affordability of ADUs is far from anticipated trends, then rezoning or something similar would be an appropriate action. If actual production and affordability is near anticipated trends, then measures like outreach and marketing might be more appropriate.

Availability of Infrastructure: The element must demonstrate the sites in the inventory have access to existing or planned water, sewer, and other dry utilities. (Gov. Code, § 65583.2, subd. (b).). For example, sites identified in the HR-C & HE-RE zones do not have availability and access to infrastructure as it will be evaluated at development (p. C-13). The element should either discuss any plans that demonstrate future access to infrastructure or add a program to address infrastructure capacity limitations or shortfalls.

<u>Priority Water and Sewer</u>: Water and sewer service providers must establish specific procedures to grant priority water and sewer service to developments with units affordable to lower-income households. (Gov. Code, § 65589.7.) Local governments are required to immediately deliver the housing element to water and sewer service providers. The element must demonstrate compliance with these requirements or add or revise programs as appropriate.

<u>Environmental Constraints</u>: The element must describe any known environmental constraints within the City that could impact housing development in the planning period. (Gov. Code, § 65583.2, subd. (b).)

# Sites with Zoning for a Variety of Housing Types:

- Emergency Shelters: While the element indicates shelters could be allowed in the PF zone (p. B-5 & B-10), it must identify a zone(s) where emergency shelters are permitted without a conditional use permit or other discretionary action and with sufficient capacity to accommodate the identified need for shelters. (Gov. Code, § 65583, subd. (a)(4).) The element must also describe the characteristics and suitability of the zone(s) for emergency shelters and meet parking requirements of AB 139. Please be aware, if the element cannot demonstrate compliance with the statutory requirements, HCD cannot find the element in compliance until zoning has been completed.
- Accessory Dwelling Units (ADUs): ADUs do not appear to be permitted consistent with state law. For example, ADUs are not permitted in all zones allowing residential uses (Table B-2). The element should demonstrate consistency with state requirements including programs as appropriate.
- 3. An analysis of potential and actual governmental constraints upon the maintenance, improvement, or development of housing for all income levels, including the types of housing identified in paragraph (1) of subdivision (c), and for persons with disabilities as identified in the analysis pursuant to paragraph (7), including land use controls, building codes and their enforcement, site improvements, fees and other exactions required of developers, and local processing and permit procedures. The analysis shall also demonstrate local efforts to remove governmental constraints that hinder the locality from meeting its share of the regional housing need in accordance with Government Code section 65584 and from meeting the need for housing for persons with disabilities, supportive housing, transitional housing, and emergency shelters identified pursuant to paragraph (7). Transitional housing and supportive housing shall be considered a residential use of property and shall be subject only to those restrictions that apply to other residential dwellings of the same type in the same zone. (Gov. Code, § 65583, subd. (a)(5).)

<u>Land Use Controls</u>: The element must identify and analyze all relevant land use controls impacts as potential constraints on a variety of housing types (e.g., multifamily rental housing, mobilehomes, transitional housing). For example, the element must describe and analyze which uses are allowed and the development standards on the MU/VHD sites, sites from the Grove Specific Plan, and Planning Area B.

<u>Local Processing and Permit Procedures</u>: The element must describe and analyze the multifamily development and new objective design standards for all zones where RHNA sites are identified. The analysis should describe the conditional use permit requirement in I-HC zone, any special findings for project approvals, differences between major and minor precise plans, which zones will allow ministerial process pursuant to Program 3.1 and

overall, how current processes are expected to be modified with the adoption of objective design standards.

Measure V: The element describes Measure V on residential development, specifically minimum lot size at 7,200 sq. ft. (p.B-8 to B-9). The Housing Crisis Act of 2019 (SB 330, 2019) was signed by Governor Newsom on October 9, 2019 and became effective on January 1, 2020. The Housing Crisis Act (Gov. Code, § 66300) generally prohibits a locality from enacting a development policy, standard or condition that reduces intensity, imposes moratoriums, enforces subjective design standards or implements any provision that limits approvals or caps population. These provisions remain in effect until January 1, 2030. Specifically, Government Code section 66300, subdivision (b)(1)(D), with limited exception not applicable here, does not allow affected jurisdictions to adopt new or enforce existing limits on the number of land-use approvals or permits. The City should evaluate Measure V for consistency with these requirements. Additionally, several sites identified in the site inventory are less than 0.17 acre or 7,200 sq. ft. for moderate and above moderate-income levels which, HCD understands, cannot be developed under Measure V. The City should evaluate and add a program to address this constraint.

Zoning, Development Standards and Fees: The element must clarify its compliance with new transparency requirements for posting all zoning, development standards and fees for each parcel on the jurisdiction's website.

Constraints on Housing for Persons with Disabilities: The element currently details that group homes serving six or less are permitted in R1, R3, R3, R4 and all HR zones (p.B-5). However, group homes serving seven or more are permitted with a conditional use permit (CUP) in R3 and R4. The element should analyze the CUP for group home facilities serving seven or more as a potential constraint on housing for persons with disabilities and add or modify programs as appropriate to ensure zoning permits group homes objectively with approval certainty.

4. Analyze any special housing needs such as elderly; persons with disabilities, including a developmental disability; large families; farmworkers; families with female heads of households; and families and persons in need of emergency shelter. (Gov. Code, § 65583, subd. (a)(7).)

While the element quantifies the City's special needs populations, it must also analyze their special housing needs. For a complete analysis of each population group, the element should discuss challenges faced by the population, the existing resources to meet those needs (availability senior housing units, number of large units, number of deed restricted units, etc.,), an assessment of any gaps in resources, and proposed policies, programs, and funding to help address those gaps.

5. Analyze existing assisted housing developments that are eligible to change to nonlow-income housing uses during the next 10 years due to termination of subsidy contracts, mortgage prepayment, or expiration of use restrictions. (Gov. Code, § 65583, subd. (a)(9) through 65583(a)(9)(D).)

The element identifies one affordable housing project at risk of converting to market-rate units in the planning period (Program 4.2 p.13). If multifamily units are identified as at-risk within a ten-year period (2021–2031), the analysis of "at-risk" units must include the following (Gov. Code, § 65583, subd. (a)(9).):

- Listing of each development by project name and address
- Type of governmental assistance received
- Earliest date of change from low-income use; and
- Total number of elderly and nonelderly units.
- Estimated total cost for producing, replacing, and preserving the units at-risk.
- Identification of public and private nonprofit corporations known to the City to have the legal and managerial capacity to acquire and manage at-risk units.
- Identification and consideration of use of federal, state and local financing and subsidy programs.

For additional information and sample analysis, see the *Building Blocks* at <a href="http://www.hcd.ca.gov/community-development/building-blocks/housing-needs/assisted-housing-developments.shtml">http://www.hcd.ca.gov/community-development/building-blocks/housing-needs/assisted-housing-developments.shtml</a> and for more information on identifying units at-risk, see the California Housing Partnership Corporation at <a href="http://www.chpc.net">http://www.chpc.net</a>.

### C. Housing Programs

1. Include a program which sets forth a schedule of actions during the planning period, each with a timeline for implementation, which may recognize that certain programs are ongoing, such that there will be beneficial impacts of the programs within the planning period, that the local government is undertaking or intends to undertake to implement the policies and achieve the goals and objectives of the housing element through the administration of land use and development controls, the provision of regulatory concessions and incentives, and the utilization of appropriate federal and state financing and subsidy programs when available. The program shall include an identification of the agencies and officials responsible for the implementation of the various actions. (Gov. Code, § 65583, subd. (c).)

To address the program requirements of Gov. Code section 65583, subd. (c)(1-6), and to facilitate implementation, programs should include: (1) a description of the City's specific role in implementation; (2) definitive implementation timelines; (3) objectives, quantified where appropriate; and (4) identification of responsible agencies and officials. Programs to be revised include the following:

#### General:

- All programs must be evaluated to provide discrete timing (e.g., month, year) to account for how often the action will occur as well as to ensure a beneficial impact throughout the planning period and quantify objectives where feasible.
- All programs must be evaluated to ensure that meaningful actions are taken. Programs
  containing unclear commitment (e.g., "Continue to facilitate"; "Explore"; "Consider";
  "Encourage"; etc.) should be amended to include more specific and measurable actions.

Program 2.1 Housing Opportunities for Special Needs Groups: The program states that projects will be granted "priority" but should describe what qualified projects will have priority for and how projects will access it.

*Program 2.3 Affordable Housing Development:* Provide specific timeframes for the City to implement each action.

Program 2.5 Transitional / Supportive Housing and Support Services: Provide clarification on what exactly the City will revise in the definition of family.

2. Identify actions that will be taken to make sites available during the planning period with appropriate zoning and development standards and with services and facilities to accommodate that portion of the city's or county's share of the regional housing need for each income level that could not be accommodated on sites identified in the inventory completed pursuant to paragraph (3) of subdivision (a) without rezoning, and to comply with the requirements of Government Code section 65584.09. Sites shall be identified as needed to facilitate and encourage the development of a variety of types of housing for all income levels, including multifamily rental housing, factory-built housing, mobilehomes, housing for agricultural employees, supportive housing, single-room occupancy units, emergency shelters, and transitional housing. (Gov. Code, § 65583, subd. (c)(1).)

As noted in Finding B2, the element does not include a complete site analysis, therefore, the adequacy of sites and zoning were not established. Based on the results of a complete sites inventory and analysis, the City may need to add or revise programs to address a shortfall of sites or zoning available to encourage a variety of housing types. In addition, the element should be revised as follows:

*Program 1.1 (Adequate Sites):* The element relies on annexation of a large site to accommodate a portion of its RHNA for above moderate income. The element must include specific actions and dates for completion of the annexation.

Program 1.2 Accessory Dwelling Units: The element must include specific commitments and actions to incentivize the production of ADU and include specific dates and actions for monitoring the development of ADU per the ADU projection assumptions in the sites inventory.

3. The housing element shall contain programs which assist in the development of adequate housing to meet the needs of extremely low-, very low-, low- and moderate-income households. (Gov. Code, § 65583, subd. (c)(2).)

The element must include a program(s) to assist in the development of housing affordable to low-, very low- and ELI households. Programs must be revised or added to the element to assist in the development of housing for ELI households. Program actions could include prioritizing some funding for housing developments affordable to ELI households and offering financial incentives or regulatory concessions to

encourage the development of housing types, such as multifamily, SRO units, to address the identified housing needs for ELI households.

For additional information, see the Building Blocks at <a href="http://www.hcd.ca.gov/community-development/building-blocks/housing-needs/extremely-low-income-housing-needs.shtml">http://www.hcd.ca.gov/community-development/building-blocks/housing-needs/extremely-low-income-housing-needs.shtml</a>.

4. Address and, where appropriate and legally possible, remove governmental and nongovernmental constraints to the maintenance, improvement, and development of housing, including housing for all income levels and housing for persons with disabilities. The program shall remove constraints to, and provide reasonable accommodations for housing designed for, intended for occupancy by, or with supportive services for, persons with disabilities. (Gov. Code, § 65583, subd. (c)(3).)

As noted in Finding(s) B3, the element requires a complete analysis of potential governmental constraints. Depending upon the results of that analysis, the City may need to revise or add programs and address and remove or mitigate any identified constraints.

*Program 3.1 Target Code Updates:* The element should clarify which zones will be subject to the objective design standards and ministerial processing for multifamily development.

In addition, Program 3.1 commits to allow emergency shelter "by-right" in the Commercial Manufacturing zone up to the capacity needed to address the City's unsheltered needed. Please be aware Government Code section 65583, subd. (a)(4) states "the identified zone or zones shall include sufficient capacity to accommodate the need for emergency shelter identified in paragraph (7), except that each local government shall identify a zone or zones that can accommodate at least one year-round emergency shelter." Since the City's identified emergency shelter need is 27, it is unclear that this limitation will allow at least one year-round emergency shelter to be feasibly built. If the city includes this limitation, it must demonstrate that it would not pose a constraint on the development of at least one emergency shelter.

6. Promote and affirmatively further fair housingopportunities and promote housing throughout the community or communities for all persons regardless of race, religion, sex, marital status, ancestry, national origin, color, familial status, or disability, and other characteristics protected by the California Fair Employment and Housing Act (Part 2.8 (commencing with Section 12900) of Division 3 of Title 2), Section 65008, and any other state and federal fair housing and planning law. (Gov. Code, § 65583, subd. (c)(5).)

As noted in Finding B1, the element must include a complete analysis of affirmatively further fair housing AFFH. Based on the outcomes of that analysis, the element must add or modify programs. In addition, Program 5.1 Affirmatively Furthering Fair Housing, should include specific commitments to administer its programs and activities relating to housing and community development in a manner to AFFH and take no action that

is materially inconsistent with its obligation to AFFH pursuant to Government Code section 8899.50.

### D. Quantified Objectives

While the element includes program 4.1 on rental inspection, the quantified objectives do not reflect any rehabilitation need. The element must evaluate and include objectives for rehabilitation units.

## E. Public Participation

Local governments shall make a diligent effort to achieve public participation of all economic segments of the community in the development of the housing element, and the element shall describe this effort. (Gov. Code, § 65583, subd.(c)(8).)

While the element includes a general summary of the public participation process (p. 4), it must also demonstrate diligent efforts were made to involve all economic segments of the community in the development of the housing element, specifically lower-income households. The element could describe the efforts to provide translation services and to circulate the housing element among low- and moderate-income households and organizations that represent their interest and to involve such groups and persons in the element throughout the process. In addition, the element should also summarize the public comments and describe how they were considered and incorporated into the element. For additional information, see the Building Blocks at <a href="http://www.hcd.ca.gov/community-development/building-blocks/getting-started/public-participation.shtml">http://www.hcd.ca.gov/community-development/building-blocks/getting-started/public-participation.shtml</a>.

In addition, HCD understands the City made the element available to the public prior to HCD's review but recently made it available on website. The availability of the document to the public and opportunity for public comment prior to submittal to HCD is essential to the public process and HCD's review. The City must proactively make future revisions available to the public, including any commenters, prior to submitting any revisions to HCD and diligently consider and address comments, including making revisions to the document where appropriate. HCD's future review will consider the extent to which the revised element documents how the City solicited, considered, and addressed public comments in the element. The City's consideration of public comments must not be limited by HCD's findings in this review letter