

## Solutions to Logic Tutorial 4

Q1a.

- |                 |                  |
|-----------------|------------------|
| 1. $A \wedge B$ | Given            |
| 2. $A$          | 1, $\wedge E$    |
| 3. $B$          | 1, $\wedge E$    |
| 4. $B \wedge A$ | 2, 3, $\wedge I$ |

Q1b.

- |                 |               |
|-----------------|---------------|
| 1. $A \wedge B$ | Given         |
| 2. $A$          | 1, $\wedge E$ |
| 3. $A \vee B$   | 2, $\vee I$   |

Q1c.

- |                      |                       |
|----------------------|-----------------------|
| 1. $P \wedge Q$      | Given                 |
| 2. $P \rightarrow R$ | Given                 |
| 3. $Q \rightarrow S$ | Given                 |
| 4. $P$               | 1, $\wedge E$         |
| 5. $Q$               | 1, $\wedge E$         |
| 6. $R$               | 2, 4, $\rightarrow E$ |
| 7. $S$               | 3, 5, $\rightarrow E$ |
| 8. $R \wedge S$      | 6, 7, $\wedge I$      |

Q1d.

- |                                      |                       |
|--------------------------------------|-----------------------|
| 1. $P \rightarrow (Q \rightarrow R)$ | Given                 |
| 2. $P \wedge Q$                      | Assume                |
| 3. $P$                               | 2, $\wedge E$         |
| 4. $Q$                               | 2, $\wedge E$         |
| 5. $Q \rightarrow R$                 | 1, 3, $\rightarrow E$ |
| 6. $R$                               | 4, 5, $\rightarrow E$ |
| 7. $P \wedge Q \rightarrow R$        | 2, 6, $\rightarrow I$ |

Q1e.

You have to show

$(P \rightarrow Q) \rightarrow (\neg Q \rightarrow \neg P)$  and

$(\neg Q \rightarrow \neg P) \rightarrow (P \rightarrow Q)$ .

I will just do the first here. The second is similar.

- |                                                                |                        |
|----------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------|
| 1. $(P \rightarrow Q)$                                         | assume                 |
| 2. $\neg Q$                                                    | assume                 |
| 3. $P$                                                         | assume                 |
| 4. $Q$                                                         | 1, 3, $\rightarrow E$  |
| 5. $\neg P$                                                    | RAA, 3, 4, 2           |
| 6. $\neg Q \rightarrow \neg P$                                 | $\rightarrow I$ , 2, 5 |
| 7. $(P \rightarrow Q) \rightarrow (\neg Q \rightarrow \neg P)$ | $\rightarrow I$ , 1, 6 |

-----

Q2. Using L for "PM loses next vote", C for "PM's leadership is challenged", E for "PM will call a general election":

- |     |                                        |
|-----|----------------------------------------|
| i)  | $L \rightarrow (\neg C \rightarrow E)$ |
| ii) | $(L \wedge \neg C) \rightarrow E$      |

Showing i |- ii:

- |                                           |                       |
|-------------------------------------------|-----------------------|
| 1. $L \rightarrow (\neg C \rightarrow E)$ | Given                 |
| 2. $L \wedge \neg C$                      | assume                |
| 3. $L$                                    | 2, $\wedge E$         |
| 4. $\neg C \rightarrow E$                 | 1, 3, $\rightarrow E$ |
| 5. $\neg C$                               | 2, $\wedge E$         |
| 6. $E$                                    | 4, 5, $\rightarrow E$ |
| 7. $(L \wedge \neg C) \rightarrow E$      | 2, 6, $\rightarrow I$ |

Showing ii |- i:

- |                                           |                       |
|-------------------------------------------|-----------------------|
| 1. $(L \wedge \neg C) \rightarrow E$      | Given                 |
| 2. $L$                                    | assume                |
| 3. $\neg C$                               | assume                |
| 4. $L \wedge \neg C$                      | 2, 3, $\wedge I$      |
| 5. $E$                                    | 1, 4, $\rightarrow E$ |
| 6. $\neg C \rightarrow E$                 | 3, 5, $\rightarrow I$ |
| 7. $L \rightarrow (\neg C \rightarrow E)$ | 2, 6, $\rightarrow I$ |

-----

Q3.

- a. Murderer
- b. Formalising the information:
  1.  $\text{Murderer} \vee \text{Blackmailer}$
  2.  $\text{Murderer} \rightarrow \text{Violent}$
  3.  $\text{Blackmailer} \rightarrow \text{Rich}$
  4.  $\text{Rich} \rightarrow \text{Spends} \vee \text{Account}$
  5.  $\neg \text{Account}$
  6.  $\neg \text{Spends}$

Abbreviate to:

- |                             |       |
|-----------------------------|-------|
| 1. $M \vee B$               | Given |
| 2. $M \rightarrow V$        | Given |
| 3. $B \rightarrow R$        | Given |
| 4. $R \rightarrow S \vee A$ | Given |
| 5. $\neg A$                 | Given |
| 6. $\neg S$                 | Given |

Deriving M:

- |               |                       |
|---------------|-----------------------|
| 7. $B$        | assume                |
| 8. $R$        | 3, 7, $\rightarrow E$ |
| 9. $S \vee A$ | 4, 8, $\rightarrow E$ |
| 10. $S$       | 9, 5, $\vee E$        |
| 11. $\neg B$  | 7, 10, 6, RAA         |
| 12. $M$       | 1, 11, $\vee E$       |
-

Q4

a) Showing  $\neg(p \rightarrow q) \equiv p \wedge \neg q$

$$\neg(p \rightarrow q) \equiv \neg(\neg p \vee q) \equiv \neg\neg p \wedge \neg q \equiv p \wedge \neg q$$

b)

I will use (a) and also

lemma 1 (I leave the proof of lemma 1 to you.):

$A, A \wedge \neg B \rightarrow C \vdash \neg B \rightarrow C$

1. $A \wedge \neg B \rightarrow C$	Given
2. $B \rightarrow C$	Given
3. $C \rightarrow \neg(B \rightarrow A)$	Given
4. $A \vee B \vee C$	Given
5. $A$	Assume
6. $\neg B \rightarrow C$	1, 5, lemma1
7. $C$	2, 6, dilemma
8. $\neg(B \rightarrow A)$	3, 7, $\rightarrow E$
9. $B \wedge \neg A$	8, (a)
10. $\neg A$	9, $\wedge E$
11. $\neg A$	5, 10, RAA
12. $B \vee C$	4, 11, $\vee E$
13. $B$	assume
14. $C$	2, 13, $\rightarrow E$
15. $B \wedge C$	13, 14, $\wedge I$
16. $B \rightarrow B \wedge C$	13, 15, $\rightarrow I$
17. $C$	assume
18. $\neg(B \rightarrow A)$	17, 3, $\rightarrow E$
19. $B$	18, (a), $\wedge E$
20. $B \wedge C$	17, 19, $\wedge I$
21. $C \rightarrow B \wedge C$	17, 20, $\rightarrow I$
22. $B \wedge C$	12, 16, 21, proof by cases