

*Plot Fulfillment* is in NP: Given an instance of the problem, and a proposed  $s$ - $t$  path  $P$ , we can check that  $P$  is a valid path in the graph, and that it meets each set  $T_i$ .

*Plot Fulfillment* also looks like a covering problem; in fact, it looks a lot like the *Hitting Set* problem from the previous question: we need to “hit” each set  $T_i$ . However, we have the extra feature that the set with which we “hit” things is a path in a graph; and at the same time, there is no explicit constraint on its size. So we use the path structure to impose such a constraint.

Thus, we will show that  $Hitting Set \leq_P Plot Fulfillment$ . Specifically, let us consider an instance of *Hitting Set*, with a set  $A = \{a_1, \dots, a_n\}$ , subsets  $S_1, \dots, S_m$ , and a bound  $k$ . We construct the following instance of *Plot Fulfillment*. The graph  $G$  will have nodes  $s$ ,  $t$ , and

$$\{v_{ij} : 1 \leq i \leq k, 1 \leq j \leq n\}.$$

There is an edge from  $s$  to each  $v_{1j}$  ( $1 \leq j \leq n$ ), from each  $v_{kj}$  to  $t$  ( $1 \leq j \leq n$ ), and from  $v_{ij}$  to  $v_{i+1,\ell}$  for each  $1 \leq i \leq k-1$  and  $1 \leq j, \ell \leq n$ . In other words, we have a *layered graph*, where all nodes  $v_{ij}$  ( $1 \leq j \leq n$ ) belong to “layer  $i$ ”, and edges go between consecutive layers. Intuitively the nodes  $v_{ij}$ , for fixed  $j$  and  $1 \leq i \leq k$  all represent the element  $a_j \in A$ .

We now need to define the sets  $T_\ell$  in the *Plot Fulfillment* instance. Guided by the intuition that  $v_{ij}$  corresponds to  $a_j$ , we define

$$T_\ell = \{v_{ij} : a_j \in S_\ell, 1 \leq i \leq k\}.$$

Now, we claim that there is a valid solution to this instance of *Plot Fulfillment* if and only if our original instance of *Hitting Set* had a solution. First, suppose there is a valid solution to the *Plot Fulfillment* instance, given by a path  $P$ , and let

$$H = \{a_j : v_{ij} \in P \text{ for some } i\}.$$

Notice that  $H$  has at most  $k$  elements. Also for each  $\ell$ , there is some  $v_{ij} \in P$  that belongs to  $T_\ell$ , and the corresponding  $a_j$  belongs to  $S_\ell$ ; thus,  $H$  is a hitting set.

Conversely, suppose there is a hitting set  $H = \{a_{j_1}, a_{j_2}, \dots, a_{j_k}\}$ . Define the path  $P = \{s, v_{1,j_1}, v_{2,j_2}, \dots, v_{k,j_k}, t\}$ . Then for each  $\ell$ , some  $a_{j_\ell}$  lies in  $S_\ell$ , and the corresponding node  $v_{\ell,j_\ell}$  meets the set  $T_\ell$ . Thus  $P$  is a valid solution to the *Plot Fulfillment* instance.

---

<sup>1</sup>ex425.710.356