Plot Fulfillment is in NP: Given an instance of the problem, and a proposed s-t path P, we can check that P is a valid path in the graph, and that it meets each set  $T_i$ .

Plot Fulfillment also looks like a covering problem; in fact, it looks a lot like the Hitting Set problem from the previous question: we need to "hit" each set  $T_i$ . However, we have the extra feature that the set with which we "hit" things is a path in a graph; and at the same time, there is no explicit constraint on its size. So we use the path structure to impose such a constraint.

Thus, we will show that Hitting Set  $\leq_P$  Plot Fulfillment. Specifically, let us consider an instance of Hitting Set, with a set  $A = \{a_1, \ldots, a_n\}$ , subsets  $S_1, \ldots, S_m$ , and a bound k. We construct the following instance of Plot Fulfillment. The graph G will have nodes s, t, and

$$\{v_{ij}: 1 \le i \le k, \ 1 \le j \le n\}.$$

There is an edge from s to each  $v_{1j}$   $(1 \le j \le n)$ , from each  $v_{kj}$  to t  $(1 \le j \le n)$ , and from  $v_{ij}$  to  $v_{i+1,\ell}$  for each  $1 \le i \le k-1$  and  $1 \le j, \ell \le n$ . In other words, we have a layered graph, where all nodes  $v_{ij}$   $(1 \le j \le n)$  belong to "layer i", and edges go between consecutive layers. Intuitively the nodes  $v_{ij}$ , for fixed j and  $1 \le i \le k$  all represent the element  $a_j \in A$ .

We now need to define the sets  $T_{\ell}$  in the *Plot Fulfillment* instance. Guided by the intuition that  $v_{ij}$  corresponds to  $a_j$ , we define

$$T_{\ell} = \{v_{ij} : a_j \in S_{\ell}, \ 1 \le i \le k\}.$$

Now, we claim that there is a valid solution to this instance of *Plot Fulfillment* if and only if our original instance of *Hitting Set* had a solution. First, suppose there is a valid solution to the *Plot Fulfillment* instance, given by a path P, and let

$$H = \{a_j : v_{ij} \in P \text{ for some } i\}.$$

Notice that H has at most k elements. Also for each  $\ell$ , there is some  $v_{ij} \in P$  that belongs to  $T_{\ell}$ , and the corresponding  $a_i$  belongs to  $S_{\ell}$ ; thus, H is a hitting set.

Conversely, suppose there is a hitting set  $II = \{a_{j_1}, a_{j_2}, \ldots, a_{j_k}\}$ . Define the path  $P = \{s, v_{1,j_1}, v_{2,j_2}, \ldots, v_{k,j_k}, t\}$ . Then for each  $\ell$ , some  $a_{j_q}$  lies in  $S_{\ell}$ , and the corresponding node  $v_{q,j_q}$  meets the set  $T_{\ell}$ . Thus P is a valid solution to the *Plot Fulfillment* instance.

 $<sup>^{1}</sup>$ ex425.710.356