

# Peer Critique Instructions for Design Projects

Marguerite Butler

2023-09-21

## Reference materials

- [\[Review assignments\]](#)
- [\[Design 1 google drive folder\]](#).
- [\[Design 1 assignment\]](#)

**Print out the manuscript so that you can write comments directly on the report.**

1. Read through the *[content guidelines]*.
2. Read your assigned manuscript. Be a good colleague.
  - As you go, mark it with brief comments or corrections. *Please do not correct each instance of the same type of error. Just point it out the first time.*
  - **Focus on improvements** that would provide the **biggest payoff**. Be explicit (of course, don't be mean – just state the point).
  - When you receive your critique you must have a thick skin – the point of the exercise is to help you do better on the final draft.
3. Prepare your ~2 page **written critique** for the authors.
  - **Begin your review with a positive statement** before going into problems. A critique is mostly negative – that's just the nature of the beast. As scientists, we are most interested in knowing exactly what is wrong, poorly stated, or unconvincing *so that we can correct it*. But it makes the medicine a little easier to swallow if you start with something nice.
  - Write **Major (overall) comments** (about one paragraph). What were the major problems? The most significant shortcomings? Was it well-written and clearly organized?
  - Write **Specific comments**. For ideas on what to include for these sections, see Peer Critique guidelines:

- Content (specific comments on each section)
  - Organization and Structure
  - Style and Grammar
  - Cited References
- In general, pick the most significant comments to write up first. *You are not obligated to provide more than two pages* (i.e., don't correct every little thing, just point out on the first instance, and let the authors learn from finding the rest).
  - Evaluate **Effectiveness of Collaboration**. Did each partner contribute significantly and more or less equally? (can be as short as one sentence, but please elaborate if you need to).
  - Focus on **specific comments related to content**. However, if there are problems in other areas, please tell them clearly.
4. *Assign a numeric grade based on a 100% maximum scale.* It should be weighted (approximately) 60% Content, 20% Organization & Structure, 10% Style and Grammar, and 10% Cited References.

**The grade you give will not affect their grade at all. But will help clarify for everyone how papers are evaluated.** Help them get a better grade by being clear so that the final version can be as strong as possible.

**Your peer-review grade (10 pts)** will be based on the **quality of your critique**, including the reasonableness of the grade you assign.

- 5. Bring **three copies of your written review** with you to lab (one for me and one for each author), and the marked up manuscript for the authors.

Ask any questions on Discord.