

# End-semester Examination

Course : Topology (KSM1C03)

Instructor : Aritra Bhowmick

6<sup>th</sup> December, 2025

**Time:** 2:00 PM onwards

**Total marks:** 100

---

Attempt any **3** from **Q1 - Q5**, any **3** from **Q6 - Q10**, and **Q11** is mandatory. You can get maximum **70 marks**.

Q1. A topology  $\mathcal{T}$  on  $X$  is said to be *minimally Hausdorff* if  $(X, \mathcal{T})$  is a  $T_2$ -space, and given any strictly coarser topology  $\mathcal{T}' \subsetneq \mathcal{T}$  on  $X$ , we have  $(X, \mathcal{T}')$  is not  $T_2$ . Show that a compact,  $T_2$  space is minimally Hausdorff.

**Solution:** Let  $(X, \mathcal{T})$  be a compact  $T_2$  space. If possible, suppose  $\mathcal{T}' \subsetneq \mathcal{T}$  is a strictly coarser topology, which is again  $T_2$ . Then, there is a (nonempty) set  $U \in \mathcal{T} \setminus \mathcal{T}'$ . Now,  $C = X \setminus U$  is closed in  $(X, \mathcal{T})$ , and hence, compact. But then  $C$  is compact in  $(X, \mathcal{T}')$  as well, since  $\mathcal{T}' \subset \mathcal{T}$ . Now,  $(X, \mathcal{T}')$  is  $T_2$ , and hence,  $C$  is closed in  $(X, \mathcal{T}')$ . This means,  $U = X \setminus C$  is open in  $(X, \mathcal{T}')$ , a contradiction. Hence,  $(X, \mathcal{T})$  is minimally  $T_2$ .

Q2. A space  $X$  is called *hereditarily connected* if every subspace of  $X$  is connected. Show that  $X$  is hereditarily connected if and only if the topology on  $X$  is a totally ordered set with respect to set inclusion (i.e., if and only if for any two open sets  $U, V \subset X$  we have  $U \subset V$  or  $V \subset U$ ).

**Solution:** Suppose  $X$  is hereditarily connected. Let  $U, V \subset X$  be open. Consider the symmetric difference

$$\Delta := (U \setminus V) \cup (V \setminus U),$$

By hypothesis  $\Delta$  is connected. But,  $D \cap U = U \setminus V$  and  $\Delta \cap V = V \setminus U$  are disjoint open sets of  $\Delta$ , whose union is all of  $\Delta$ . Hence, one of them must be empty. In other words, either  $U \setminus V = \emptyset \Rightarrow U \subset V$ , or  $V \setminus U = \emptyset \Rightarrow V \subset U$ . Hence, the topology on  $X$  is totally ordered.

Conversely, suppose the topology on  $X$  is totally ordered. Let  $Y \subset X$  be any subset. If possible, let  $Y$  be disconnected. Then, there are open sets  $U, V \subset X$  such that

$$(Y \cap U) \cap (Y \cap V) = \emptyset, \quad Y \subset U \cup V, \quad \emptyset \neq Y \cap U, Y \cap V \subsetneq Y.$$

Now, without loss of generality, we have  $U \subset V$ . But then,  $Y \cap U \subset Y \cap V \Rightarrow Y \cap U = \emptyset$ , a contradiction. Hence,  $Y$  must be connected. In other words,  $X$  is hereditarily connected.

Q3. Let  $X$  be a locally connected, separable space. Show that any open set  $U \subset X$  can be written as a countable union of disjoint, open, connected sets.

**Solution:** Let  $U \subset X$  be open. Since  $X$  is locally connected, connected components of  $U$  are open. Let us write  $U = \bigsqcup_{\alpha \in \Lambda} U_\alpha$ , where  $U_\alpha \subset U$  are the connected components of  $U$ . Now,  $X$  is separable. Hence, there is a countable dense set, say,  $Q \subset X$ . Since each  $U_\alpha \subset X$  is nonempty open, we can choose some  $q_\alpha \in U_\alpha \cap Q$  for each  $\alpha \in \Lambda$ . Clearly,  $\alpha \neq \beta \Rightarrow U_\alpha \cap U_\beta = \emptyset \Rightarrow q_\alpha \neq q_\beta$ . Thus, we have an injective map  $\Lambda \hookrightarrow Q$  given by  $\alpha \mapsto q_\alpha$ . Hence,  $\Lambda$  must be countable. Thus, any open set  $U$  can be written as a countable union of disjoint, open, connected sets.

Q4. Let  $X$  be a locally compact,  $T_2$  space.

a) Show that  $X$  is  $T_{3\frac{1}{2}}$ .

**Solution:** Since  $X$  is locally compact  $T_2$ , the one-point compactification  $\hat{X} = X \cup \{\infty\}$  is compact,  $T_2$ , and hence,  $T_4$ . In particular,  $\hat{X}$  is  $T_{3\frac{1}{2}}$ . As  $X \hookrightarrow \hat{X}$  is a subspace, we have  $X$  is  $T_{3\frac{1}{2}}$ .

b) If  $X$  is second countable, show that  $X$  is paracompact.

**Solution:** Suppose  $X$  is additionally second countable. Now,  $X$  is  $T_{3\frac{1}{2}} \Rightarrow T_3$ . Then, by the Urysohn metrization theorem,  $X$  is metrizable. But then  $X$  is paracompact as every metrizable space is paracompact.

Q5. Show that a perfectly normal,  $T_0$ -space is  $T_6$ .

**Solution:** Let  $X$  be a perfectly normal,  $T_0$ -space. We need to show that  $X$  is  $T_1$ . Let  $x, y \in X$  be such that  $x \neq y$ . Since  $X$  is  $T_0$ , without loss of generality, there is an open set  $U \subset X$  such that  $x \in U$  but  $y \notin U$ . So,  $y \in C := X \setminus U$ , which is a closed set. Since  $X$  is perfectly normal, we have  $X$  is a  $G_\delta$ -space. In particular,  $C = \bigcap_{i=1}^{\infty} V_i$  for some open sets  $V_i \subset X$ . Since  $x \notin C$ , we have  $x \in V_{i_0}$  for some  $i_0$ . Thus, we have two open sets  $U$  and  $V_{i_0}$ , each containing exactly one of  $x, y$ . Since  $x, y$  are arbitrary, we have  $X$  is  $T_1$ . But then  $X$  is  $T_6$  by definition.

Q6. Let  $X$  be a  $T_2$  space.

a) Suppose  $f, g : Z \rightarrow X$  are continuous maps. Show that the set  $E(f, g) := \{z \in Z \mid f(z) = g(z)\}$  is closed in  $Z$ .

**Solution:** Consider the map  $h : Z \rightarrow X \times X$  given by  $h(x) = (f(x), g(x))$ , which is clearly continuous. Since  $X$  is  $T_2$ , we have the diagonal  $\Delta = \{(x, x) \mid x \in X\} \subset X \times X$  is closed. Note that  $E(f, g) = h^{-1}(\Delta)$ . Hence,  $E(f, g)$  is closed in  $Z$ .

- b) Let  $\iota : A \rightarrow X$ , and  $r : X \rightarrow A$  be continuous maps satisfying  $r \circ \iota = \text{Id}_A$ . Show that  $\iota$  is injective, and  $\iota(A)$  is closed in  $X$ .

**Solution:** For any  $a, b \in A$  we have  $i(a) = i(b) \Rightarrow r(\iota(a)) = r(\iota(b)) \Rightarrow a = b$ . Thus,  $\iota$  is injective.

Consider two maps  $f = \iota \circ r : X \rightarrow X$  and  $g = \text{Id}_X : X \rightarrow X$ , which are clearly continuous. Note that for any  $x \in X$ , we have  $f(x) = g(x) \Rightarrow x = \iota(r(x)) \in \iota(A)$ . Also, for any  $\iota(a) \in \iota(A)$  we have  $f(\iota(a)) = \iota r(a) = \iota(a) = g(\iota(a))$ . Thus,  $\iota(A) = E(f, g)$  is closed in  $X$ .

A subspace  $A \subset X$  is called a *retract* of  $X$  if there exists a continuous map  $r : X \rightarrow A$  such that  $r(a) = a$  for any  $a \in A$ . Show that a retract of a  $T_2$ -space is a closed subset.

**Solution:** Consider the inclusion map  $\iota : A \hookrightarrow X$ , which is continuous as  $A$  is a subspace. Then, it follows that  $A = \iota(A)$  is closed in  $X$ .

Q7. On  $\mathbb{R}$ , consider the particular point topology  $\mathcal{T}_0$  with base 0, i.e,

$$\mathcal{T}_0 \coloneqq \{\emptyset\} \cup \{A \subset \mathbb{R} \mid 0 \in A\}.$$

Denote  $X = (\mathbb{R}, \mathcal{T}_0)$ .

- a) Which of the following properties does  $X$  have? Justify.

  - i) Lindelöf
  - ii) Separable
  - iii) Locally compact
  - iv) Path connected.

## Solution:

- i)  $X$  is not Lindelöf.

The set  $A = \mathbb{R} \setminus \{0\}$  is closed and discrete. As  $A$  is uncountable,  $A$  cannot be Lindelöf. Hence,  $X$  is not Lindelöf.

- ii)  $X$  is separable.

Since any nonempty open set contains 0, it follows that the singleton  $\{0\}$  is dense in  $X$ . Thus,  $X$  is separable.

iii)  $X$  is locally compact.

Let  $U \subset X$  be open, and  $x \in U$  be a point. We clearly have  $0 \in C$ . Consider the set  $C = \{0, x\}$ , which is open. Also,  $C$  being finite, is compact. Thus,  $x \in C \subset U$  is a compact neighborhood of  $x$ . Hence,  $X$  is locally compact.

iv)  $X$  is path connected.

Let  $x, y \in X$  be two points. Consider the map  $f : [0, 1] \rightarrow X$  defined by

$$f(t) = \begin{cases} x, & t = 0, \\ 0, & 0 < t < 1, \\ y, & t = 1. \end{cases}$$

We claim that  $f$  is continuous. For  $t = 0$ , consider  $U = \{0, x\}$ , which is open, and we have  $f^{-1}(U) = [0, 1)$  (or  $f^{-1}(U) = [0, 1]$  if  $y = 0$ ). Thus,  $f$  is continuous at  $t = 0$ . By similar argument,  $f$  is continuous at  $t = 1$ . Now, suppose  $0 < t < 1$ . Consider  $U = \{0\}$ . Then,  $f^{-1}(U) = (0, 1)$  (or,  $[0, 1), (0, 1], [0, 1]$  depending on  $x = 0, y = 0$  or  $x = 0 = y$ ). Thus,  $f$  is continuous.

b) Explicitly describe all the open sets in the Alexandroff compactification  $\hat{X} = X \cup \{\infty\}$ .

**Solution:** By the construction, it follows that any open set in  $X$  is open in  $\hat{X}$ . Thus, all set  $A \subset X$  such that  $0 \in A$  is open in  $\hat{X}$ . Now, the open sets containing  $\infty$  are of the form  $\{\infty\} \cup X \setminus C$ , where  $C$  is closed and compact in  $X$ . Thus, we need to classify all closed compact sets of  $X$ .

Note that the closed sets of  $X$  are precisely those that do not contain 0. But any such set is discrete. Hence, the only closed, compact sets are finite subsets of  $X$  that do not contain 0.

Hence, the topology on  $\hat{X} = X \cup \{\infty\}$  is

$$\{\emptyset, \hat{X}\} \cup \{A \subset \mathbb{R} \mid 0 \in A\} \cup \{\{\infty\} \cup (\mathbb{R} \setminus F) \mid F \subset \mathbb{R} \text{ is finite, } 0 \notin F\}.$$

Q8. On  $\mathbb{R}$ , consider the following topology

$$\mathcal{T} := \{\emptyset, \mathbb{R}\} \cup \{S \mid S \subset \mathbb{R}, 0 \notin S\} \cup \{\mathbb{R} \setminus C \mid C \subset \mathbb{R} \setminus \{0\} \text{ is countable}\}.$$

The space  $X = (\mathbb{R}, \mathcal{T})$  is called the *fortissimo space* on  $\mathbb{R}$ .

a) Show that  $X$  is  $T_5$ .

**Solution:** Let us show that  $X$  is completely normal. Suppose  $A, B \subset X$  are separated subsets, i.e.,  $A \cap \bar{B} = \emptyset = \bar{A} \cap B$ . If  $0 \notin A$ , and  $0 \notin B$ , then clearly  $A, B$  are disjoint

open sets. Thus, we have a separation of  $A, B$  by opens. Now, without loss of generality, suppose  $0 \in A$ . Then,  $0 \notin \bar{B}$ . As  $0 \notin B$ , we have  $B$  is open. We claim that  $B$  is closed as well. Indeed, for any  $x \in \bar{B}$ , we have  $x \neq 0$ . Then, for the open neighborhood  $O = \{x\}$  of  $x$  to intersect  $B$ , we must have  $x \in B$ . Thus,  $\bar{B} = B$ . Then,  $U = X \setminus B$  is an open set containing  $A$ , which is disjoint from the open set  $V = B$ . Thus, any two separated sets of  $X$  is separated by disjoint open sets. Consequently,  $X$  is completely normal.

Clearly,  $\{0\}$  is a closed point, as  $X \setminus \{0\} = \mathbb{R} \setminus \{0\}$  is open. Also, for any  $x \neq 0$ , we have  $X \setminus \{x\} = \mathbb{R} \setminus \{x\}$  is a cocountable set containing 0, which is open. Thus,  $X$  is  $T_1$ . But then  $X$  is  $T_5$ .

b) Show that  $X$  is not  $T_6$ .

**Solution:** We show that the closed set  $A = \{0\} \subset X$  is not  $G_\delta$ . If possible, suppose  $A = \bigcap U_i$  for open sets  $U_i \subset X$ . Since  $0 \in U_i$ , we have  $U_i = \mathbb{R} \setminus C_i$  for countable subsets  $C_i \subset \mathbb{R} \setminus \{0\}$ . Then,

$$A = \bigcap U_i = \bigcap (\mathbb{R} \setminus C_i) = \mathbb{R} \setminus \bigcup C_i.$$

Since the countable union of countable sets is countable, we have  $\bigcup C_i$  is countable. But then  $\mathbb{R} \setminus \bigcup C_i$  is uncountable, which is a contradiction. Thus,  $A$  is not  $G_\delta$ . Hence,  $X$  is not perfectly normal, and in particular, not  $T_6$ .

c) Show that  $X$  is Lindelöf, but not compact.

**Solution:** Let  $\mathcal{U} = \{U_\alpha\}$  be an open cover of  $X$ . Then, for some  $\alpha_0$  we have  $0 \in U_{\alpha_0}$ . As  $U_{\alpha_0}$  is an open neighborhood of 0, we have  $U_{\alpha_0} = \mathbb{R} \setminus C$  for some countable set  $C = \{x_i\}_{i \geq 1} \subset \mathbb{R} \setminus \{0\}$ . For each  $i \geq 1$ , we have some  $\alpha_i$  such that  $x_i \in U_{\alpha_i}$ . Then,  $\{U_{\alpha_i}\}_{i \geq 0}$  is a countable sub-cover of  $X$ . As  $\mathcal{U}$  was arbitrary, we have  $X$  is Lindelöf.

On the other hand, consider the open sets

$$V_0 = \mathbb{R} \setminus \{1, 2, 3, \dots\}, \quad V_n = \{n\}, \quad n \geq 1.$$

Clearly,  $\mathcal{V} = \{V_i\}_{i=0}^\infty$  is an open cover of  $X$ , which does not admit any finite sub-cover.

d) Is  $X$  metrizable?

**Solution:** No,  $X$  is not metrizable. In fact,  $X$  is not first countable at 0. If we have a countable neighborhood basis  $\{N_i\}$  at 0, then we have  $\bigcap N_i = \mathbb{R} \setminus C$ , for some countable set  $C \subset \mathbb{R} \setminus \{0\}$ . Choose any  $0 \neq x \in \mathbb{R} \setminus C$ . Then,  $V = \mathbb{R} \setminus (C \cup \{x\})$  is an open neighborhood of 0. Clearly, none of  $N_i$  is contained in  $V$ . Thus,  $X$  is not a first countable space, and hence, not metrizable.

Q9. On  $\mathbb{R}$ , for each irrational  $x$ , fix a sequence  $x_i \in \mathbb{Q}$  such that  $x_i \rightarrow x$  (in the usual sense). Denote the set

$$U_n(x) = \{x\} \cup \{x_i \mid i > n\}, \quad x \in \mathbb{R} \setminus \mathbb{Q}, \quad n \geq 0.$$

Consider the collection of subsets

$$\mathcal{B} := \{\{q\} \mid q \in \mathbb{Q}\} \cup \{U_n(x) \mid x \in \mathbb{R} \setminus \mathbb{Q}, \quad n \geq 0\}.$$

Prove the following.

- a)  $\mathcal{B}$  is a basis for a topology, say,  $\mathcal{T}$  on  $\mathbb{R}$  (called the *rational sequence topology*).

**Solution:** Clearly, for each  $x \in \mathbb{R}$ , there is an element of  $\mathcal{B}$  that contains  $x$ . Let  $B_1, B_2 \in \mathcal{B}$ , and suppose  $x \in B_1 \cap B_2$ . If  $x$  is a rational, then we can take  $B_3 = \{x\}$  so that  $x \in B_3 \subset B_1 \cap B_2$ . If  $x$  is an irrational, then we must have  $B_1 = U_n(x)$  and  $B_2 = U_m(x)$  for some  $m, n \geq 0$ . Let  $k = \max\{m, n\}$ , and set  $B_3 = U_k(x)$ . Clearly,  $x \in B_3 \subset B_1 \cap B_2$ . Thus,  $\mathcal{B}$  is a basis for a topology on  $\mathbb{R}$ .

- b) Each basic open set of  $\mathcal{B}$  is also closed in  $\mathcal{T}$ .

**Solution:** Consider a rational  $q \in \mathbb{Q}$ , and let  $x \neq q$ . If  $x \in \mathbb{Q}$ , then  $\{x\} \subset \mathbb{R} \setminus \{q\}$  is an open neighborhood. Say,  $x \in \mathbb{R} \setminus \mathbb{Q}$ . Since  $x_i \rightarrow x \neq q$ , there is some  $n \geq 1$  such that  $|x - x_i| < \epsilon := \frac{|x - q|}{2}$ . Then, consider  $U_n(x)$ . Clearly,  $U_n(x) \subset \mathbb{R} \setminus \{q\}$ . Thus,  $\{q\}$  is closed.

Next, consider an open set  $U_n(x)$  for some  $x \in \mathbb{R} \setminus \mathbb{Q}$  and  $n \geq 0$ . Again, for each rational point  $q \in \mathbb{Q} \cap (\mathbb{R} \setminus U_n(x))$ , we can take  $\{q\}$  as an open neighborhood disjoint from  $U_n(x)$ . Say,  $y \neq x$  is an irrational point. Set  $\epsilon_0 := \frac{|y - x|}{2}$ . Since  $x_i \rightarrow x$ , there is an integer  $p \geq 1$  such that

$$|x - x_i| < \epsilon_0.$$

Set

$$\epsilon_1 := \min \frac{1}{2} \{ |y - x|, |y - x_1|, \dots, |y - x_p| \},$$

which is positive as each  $x_i$  is rational. Since  $y_i \rightarrow y$ , there is an integer  $q \geq 1$  such that for all  $i \geq q$  we have

$$|y - y_i| < \epsilon_1.$$

Then,  $U_n(x) \cap U_q(y) = \emptyset$ . Thus,  $U_n(x)$  is closed.

- c) The space  $X = (\mathbb{R}, \mathcal{T})$  is  $T_{3\frac{1}{2}}$ , but not  $T_4$ .

**Hint:** Use Jones' lemma.

**Solution:** It follows that  $\mathcal{B}$  is basis of clopen sets in  $X$ . Hence,  $X$  is completely regular. We show that  $X$  is  $T_0$ . Let  $x \neq y \in \mathbb{R}$ . If, without loss of generality,  $x \in \mathbb{Q}$ , then  $\{x\}$

is an open neighborhood, that does not contain  $y$ . Suppose,  $x, y \in \mathbb{R} \setminus \mathbb{Q}$ . Then, for any  $n \geq 0$  we have  $U_n(x)$  is an open neighborhood, which does not contain  $y$ . Thus,  $X$  is  $T_0$ , and hence,  $T_{3\frac{1}{2}}$ .

Let us show that  $X$  is not normal (and hence, not  $T_4$ ). Consider  $\mathbb{Q}$ . For any  $x \in \mathbb{R}$ , any basic open set contains some rational. Thus,  $\mathbb{Q}$  is dense in  $X$ . Also,  $\mathbb{Q}$  being union of basic open sets, is open, and hence,  $\mathcal{I} = \mathbb{R} \setminus \mathbb{Q}$  is closed. For each  $x \in \mathbb{I}$ , we have  $\mathbb{I} \cap U_0(x) = \{x\}$ . Thus,  $\mathbb{I}$  is a closed, discrete set. Since  $\mathbb{Q}$  is countable, and  $\mathbb{I}$  is uncountable, it follows by Jones lemma that  $X$  is not normal. Thus,  $X$  is not  $T_4$ .

**Q10.** Show that the product of a compact space and a paracompact space is again paracompact.

**Hint:** Use the tube lemma.

**Solution:** Let  $X$  be a paracompact space, and  $Y$  be a compact space. Consider an arbitrary open cover  $\mathcal{O} = \{O_i\}_{i \in I}$  of  $X \times Y$ . For each  $x \in X$ , we have  $\{x\} \times Y$  is a compact subspace of  $X \times Y$ . Hence, there is a finite set  $I_x \subset I$  such that

$$\{x\} \times Y \subset \bigcup_{i \in I_x} O_i.$$

By the tube lemma, there is some open neighborhood  $x \in U_x \in X$  such that

$$U_x \times Y \subset \bigcup_{i \in I_x} O_i.$$

Now,  $\mathcal{U} = \{U_x\}_{x \in X}$  is an open cover of  $X$ , which is paracompact. Hence, there is a locally finite refinement, say,  $\mathcal{V} = \{V_x\}_{x \in X}$  such that  $V_x \subset U_x$  for all  $x \in X$ . Consider the collection of open sets

$$\mathcal{W} = \{(V_x \times Y) \cap O_i \mid i \in I_x, x \in X\}.$$

Let us show that it is a cover of  $X \times Y$ . Say,  $(x, y) \in X$ . Then, there is some  $x' \in X$  (possibly different from  $x$ ), such that  $x \in V_{x'}$ . Then,  $(x, y) \in V_{x'} \times Y \subset \bigcup_{i \in I_{x'}} O_i$ . Clearly, there is some  $i \in I_{x'}$  so that  $(x, y) \in (V_{x'} \times Y) \cap O_i$ . Thus,  $\mathcal{W}$  is a cover, which is a refinement of  $\mathcal{O}$  by construction. Next, we show that  $\mathcal{W}$  is locally finite. Since  $\mathcal{U}$  is a locally finite cover of  $X$ , there is some open neighborhood  $x \in N \subset X$ , and a finite set  $F \subset X$  such that

$$N \cap V_x = \emptyset, \quad x \in X \setminus F.$$

Suppose  $(u, v) \in (N \times Y) \cap ((V_x \times Y) \cap O_i)$  for some  $i \in I_x$  and  $x \in X$ . Then,  $u \in N \cap V_x \Rightarrow x \in F$ . Thus, it follows that  $N \times Y$  can only intersect the collection

$$\{(V_x \times Y) \cap O_i \mid i \in I_x, x \in F\},$$

which is clearly finite. Hence,  $\mathcal{W}$  is a locally finite open cover, which refines  $\mathcal{O}$ . Thus,  $X \times Y$  is a paracompact space.

Q11. A function  $f : \mathbb{R} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  is called a *smooth function* if  $f$  is (continuously) differentiable infinitely many times. Polynomials are smooth, and so are the trigonometric functions  $\sin(x)$ ,  $\cos(x)$  etc.

The function  $\rho(x) = \begin{cases} e^{-\frac{1}{x}}, & x \geq 0 \\ 0, & x \leq 0 \end{cases}$  is also smooth; note that  $\rho$  is a (constant) polynomial on  $(-\infty, 0)$  but not on all of  $\mathbb{R}$ .

Denote the  $n^{\text{th}}$ -derivative of a smooth function  $f$  as  $f^{(n)} : \mathbb{R} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ ; for convenience, set  $f^{(0)} = f$ . Recall that if for some  $n \geq 1$  we have  $f^{(n)}$  is identically 0 on an interval  $(a, b)$  (possibly unbounded), then  $f$  is a polynomial of degree  $\leq n - 1$  on  $(a, b)$ . And conversely, if  $f$  is a (nonzero) polynomial of degree  $d$  on  $(a, b)$ , then  $f^{(d)}|_{(a,b)}$  is a nonzero constant.

Let  $f : \mathbb{R} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  be a smooth function. Suppose, for each  $x \in \mathbb{R}$ , there is some  $n = n_x \geq 0$  such that  $f^{(n)}(x) = 0$ . The goal is to prove that  $f$  must be a polynomial. If you wish, you can try to give some direct proof! Otherwise, for the sake of contradiction, let us assume that  $f$  is not a polynomial.

a) Denote

$$\Omega = \bigcup \{U \subset \mathbb{R} \mid U \text{ is open, and } f|_U \text{ is a polynomial}\}.$$

By our assumption,  $\Omega \neq \mathbb{R}$ .

- i) If  $\Omega \neq \emptyset$ , then justify that one can write  $\Omega = \bigcup I_j$ , for countably many open intervals (possibly unbounded), which are pairwise disjoint.

**Solution:** As  $\mathbb{R}$  is a separable and locally connected space, any open set can be written as countable union of disjoint open connected components. Since the open connected sets are necessarily intervals, the claim follows.

- ii) For any bounded interval  $[u, v] \subset \Omega$  with  $u < v$ , show that  $f|_{(u,v)}$  is a polynomial.

**Solution:** Suppose  $[u, v] \subset \Omega$  for some  $u < v$ . For each  $x \in [u, v]$  there is some  $(a_x, b_x) \subset \mathbb{R}$  such that  $f|_{(a_x, b_x)}$  is a polynomial. Since  $[a, b]$  is compact, there are finitely many such intervals, say,  $\{(a_{x_i}, b_{x_i})\}_{i=1}^k$  that covers  $[a, b]$ . Suppose  $f|_{(a_{x_i}, b_{x_i})}$  is a polynomial of degree  $d_i$ . Set  $d = \max_{1 \leq i \leq k} \{d_i\}$ . Then,

$$f^{(d_i)}|_{(a_{x_i}, b_{x_i})=0} \Rightarrow f^{(d)}|_{(a_{x_i}, b_{x_i})} = 0, \quad 1 \leq i \leq k.$$

Thus,  $f^{(d)} = 0$  on the union  $\bigcup_{i=1}^k (a_{x_i}, b_{x_i}) \supset (a, b)$ . Hence,  $f|_{(a,b)}$  is a polynomial of degree  $\leq d - 1$ .

- iii) Show that  $f|_{I_j}$  is a polynomial for any open interval  $I_j$  appearing in the expression of  $\Omega$ .

**Hint:** Note that any open interval (bounded or unbounded) can be written as an increasing union of countably many bounded closed intervals.

**Solution:** For any  $a, b$  with  $a < b$  we have  $(a, b) = \bigcup_{n \geq n_0} [a + \frac{1}{n}, b - \frac{1}{n}]$  for some  $n_0$  large, and also  $(a, \infty) = \bigcup [a + \frac{1}{n}, a + n]$ ,  $(-\infty, b) = \bigcup [b - n, b - \frac{1}{n}]$ . Thus, any open interval can be written as a countable collection of increasing closed intervals. Without loss of generality, let us write  $I = \bigcup_i [a_i, b_i]$ , where  $a_i < b_i$  and  $[a_i, b_i] \subset (a_{i+1}, b_{i+1})$  for all  $i$ .

Now, suppose  $f|_{(a_1, b_1)}$  is a polynomial of degree, say,  $d$ . In particular,  $f^{(d)}|_{(a_1, b_1)}$  is a nonzero constant. We show that  $f^{(d+1)}|_I = 0$  identically. If not, then for some  $x \in I$  we have  $f^{(d+1)}(x) \neq 0$ . By continuity of  $f^{(d+1)}$ , we have some  $x \in (a, b) \subset I$  such that  $f^{(d+1)}|_{(a,b)}$  is nonvanishing. Now, from the above increasing union, we can assume that  $[a, b] \subset (a_N, b_N)$  for some  $N \geq 1$ . By previous part, we have  $f|_{(a_N, b_N)}$  is a polynomial of degree, say,  $m$ . As  $f^{(m+1)}|_{(a_N, b_N)} = 0$ , we must have  $m+1 \not\leq d+1 \Rightarrow d+1 \leq m+1 \Rightarrow d \leq m$ . Also,  $f^{(m+1)}|_{(a_1, b_1)} = 0$  as  $(a_1, b_1) \subset (a_N, b_N)$ . Thus,  $f|_{(a_1, b_1)}$  is a polynomial of degree  $\leq m$ , which forces,  $m \leq d$ . Hence, we have  $f|_{(a_N, b_N)}$  is a polynomial of degree  $d$ . This contradicts  $f^{(d+1)}(x) \neq 0$ . We conclude that  $f^{(d+1)}|_I$  is zero, and hence,  $f$  is a polynomial of degree  $\leq d$ . In fact,  $f$  is a polynomial of degree exactly  $d$ , as  $f^{(d)}|_{(a_1, b_1)}$  is nonzero.

- b) Consider the closed sets  $S_n := \{x \mid f^{(n)}(x) = 0\} = (f^{(n)})^{-1}(0)$ .
- For any  $[a, b]$  with  $a < b$ , prove that  $[a, b] \cap S_{n_0}$  has nonempty interior (in the subspace topology of  $[a, b]$ ) for some  $n_0$ .

**Solution:** We are given that for every  $x \in \mathbb{R}$ , there is some  $n$  such that  $f^{(n)}(x) = 0 \Rightarrow x \in S_n$ . Thus,  $\mathbb{R} = \bigcup S_n$ . Then,  $[a, b] = \bigcup ([a, b] \cap S_n)$ . Now,  $[a, b]$  is a compact  $T_2$  space, and hence, a Baire space. As  $[a, b] \cap S_n$  is closed, all of them cannot be nowhere dense. Consequently, for some  $n_0$ , we must have  $[a, b] \cap S_{n_0}$  has nonempty interior (in the subspace topology of  $[a, b]$ ).

- Conclude that  $\overline{\Omega} = \mathbb{R}$ , i.e.,  $\Omega$  is dense in  $\mathbb{R}$ .

**Solution:** Fix some  $[a, b]$  with  $a < b$ . Then, for some  $n_0$ , we have  $[a, b] \cap S_{n_0}$  has nonempty intersection. In particular, we can have some  $c < d$  such that  $(c, d) \subset [a, b] \cap S_{n_0}$ . But then  $f^{(n_0)}|_{(c,d)} = 0$  which implies,  $f|_{(c,d)}$  is a polynomial of degree  $\leq n_0 - 1$ . Thus,  $(c, d) \subset \Omega$ . Hence,  $(a, b) \cap \Omega \neq \emptyset$ . Thus,  $\overline{\Omega} = \mathbb{R}$ .

- c) Denote  $X = \mathbb{R} \setminus \Omega$ . Note that  $X \neq \emptyset$ , and the (finite) endpoints of each  $I_j$  appearing in  $\Omega$  belongs to  $X$ .
- Show that any  $x \in X$  is *not* an isolated point of  $X$ , and hence, there are  $x_i \in X$  with  $x_i \neq x$ , such that  $x_i \rightarrow x$ .

**Solution:** If possible, suppose  $x \in X$  is an isolated point. Then, there are  $a < x < b$  such that  $(a, b) \cap X = \{x\}$ . Consequently,  $(a, x) \cup (x, b) \subset \Omega$ . Then, there are two open intervals, say,  $I_j$  and  $I_k$ , such that  $(a, x) \subset I_j$  and  $(x, b) \subset I_k$ . Now,  $f|_{I_j}$  and  $f|_{I_k}$  are both polynomials, of degree, say,  $n_1$  and  $n_2$ . Fix some  $n > \max\{n_1, n_2\}$ . Then,

$$f^{(n)}|_{(a,x)} = 0 = f^{(n)}|_{(x,b)}.$$

Continuity of  $f^{(n)}$  forces that  $f^{(n)}(x) = 0$ . But then  $f^{(n)}|_{(a,b)} = 0$ , which implies,  $f|_{(a,b)}$  is a polynomial of degree  $\leq n - 1$ . Then,  $x \in (a, b) \subset \Omega$ , a contradiction. Thus, for any  $x \in X$  we have  $x_i \in X$ , with  $x_i \neq x$ , such that  $x_i \rightarrow x$ .

- ii) Show that  $X \cap S_{n_0}$  has nonempty interior (in the subspace topology of  $X$ ) for some  $n_0$ . Suppose,  $X \cap (a_0, b_0) \subset X \cap S_{n_0}$  for some  $a_0 < b_0$ .

**Solution:** As  $X = \mathbb{R} \setminus \Omega$  is closed in the complete space  $\mathbb{R}$ , we have  $X$  is complete, and hence, a Baire space. As  $S_n$  is a cover, again we have some  $n_0$  so that  $X \cap S_{n_0}$  has nonempty interior (in the subspace topology of  $X$ ). That is, we have some  $a_0 < b_0$  so that  $X \cap (a_0, b_0) \subset X \cap S_{n_0}$ .

- iii) Show that  $f^{(m)}(x) = 0$  for all  $m \geq n_0$  and for all  $x \in (a_0, b_0) \cap X$ .

**Hint:** By assumption, the limit  $f^{(n+1)}(x) = \lim_{h \rightarrow 0} \frac{f^{(n)}(x+h) - f^{(n)}(x)}{h}$  exists. For  $x_i \rightarrow x$  with  $x_i \neq x$ , one can then consider  $h_i := x_i - x \rightarrow 0$  in the limit.

**Solution:** Let  $x \in X \cap (a_0, b_0)$ . Then, there are  $x_i \in X \cap (a_0, b_0)$  with  $x_i \neq x$  such that  $x_i \rightarrow x$ . Now,  $f^{(n_0)}(x_i) = 0 = f^{(n_0)}(x)$ , as  $X \cap (a_0, b_0) \subset X \cap S_{n_0}$ . Since  $f^{(n_0)}$  is differentiable, we have

$$f^{(n_0+1)}(x) = \lim_i \frac{f^{(n_0)}(x_i) - f^{(n_0)}(x)}{x_i - x} = 0.$$

Thus, for all  $x \in X \cap (a_0, b_0)$  we have  $f^{(n_0+1)}(x) = 0$ . In other words,  $X \cap (a_0, b_0) \subset X \cap S_{n_0+1}$ . Inductively, it follows that for any  $m \geq n_0$  we have  $X \cap (a_0, b_0) \subset X \cap S_m$ , i.e.,  $f^{(m)}(x) = 0$  for all  $x \in X \cap (a_0, b_0)$  and  $m \geq n_0$ .

- iv) Show that for any  $I_j$  appearing in  $\Omega$ , with  $I_j \cap (a_0, b_0) \neq \emptyset$ , we have  $f|_{I_j}$  is a polynomial of degree  $\leq n_0$ .

**Hint:**  $(a_0, b_0)$  must contain some end-point of  $I_j$ .

**Solution:** As  $\bar{\Omega} = \mathbb{R}$ , we must have  $(a_0, b_0) \cap \Omega \neq \emptyset$ . Now, suppose for some  $I_j$  we have  $I_j \cap (a_0, b_0) \neq \emptyset$ . Clearly,  $(a_0, b_0) \subset I_j$  is not possible, as  $(a_0, b_0)$  also intersects  $X = \mathbb{R} \setminus \Omega$ . Then, we must have that some endpoint (left or right) of  $I_j$  belongs to  $(a_0, b_0)$ . Suppose, the endpoint is some  $x$ . Then,  $x \in X$  as the interval

$I_j$  is maximal (being connected components of  $\Omega$ ). Suppose  $f|_{I_j}$  is a polynomial of degree  $d$ . Then,  $f^{(d)}$  is a nonzero constant, say,  $c$  on  $I_j$ . By continuity, we must have  $f^{(d)}(x) = c$ . But we have seen  $f^{(m)}(x) = 0$  for all  $m \geq n_0$ . Hence, we must have  $d < n_0$ . Thus, whenever  $(a_0, b_0)$  intersects some  $I_j \subset \Omega$ , we have  $f|_{I_j}$  is a polynomial of degree  $\leq n_0 - 1$ .

- v) Conclude that  $f$  is a polynomial.

**Solution:** For  $x \in X \cap (a_0, b_0)$  we have proved  $f^{(n_0)}(x) = 0$ . Also, for any  $x \in \Omega \cap (a_0, b_0)$ , we have  $x \in I_j \cap (a_0, b_0)$  for some  $j$ , and hence,  $f^{(n_0)}(x) = 0$ . Thus,  $f^{(n_0)}|_{(a_0, b_0)} = 0$ . This means  $f$  is a polynomial of degree  $\leq n_0 - 1$ , and so,  $(a_0, b_0) \subset \Omega$ . This contradicts  $x \in X \cap (a_0, b_0)$ . Hence, we must have  $f$  is a polynomial.