A discussion on the morning-star two-step regression technique

The Morningstar technique (with plug-in estimators)

$$\min_{x} E\left[e_{t}^{2}\right]$$
s.t.
$$0 \le x$$

$$1 \ge 1'x$$

$$e_{t} \equiv r_{pt} - a'_{t}x$$

$$0 = \lambda_{k}x_{k}$$

$$0 = \gamma (1 - x'1)$$

The Langrangian:

$$\begin{split} L = & E\left[\left(r_{p} - a_{t}'x\right)'\left(r_{p} - a_{t}'x\right)\right] - x'\lambda + \gamma\left(1 - x'1\right) \\ = & \sigma_{p}^{2} + \mu_{p}^{2} + x'E\left[a_{t}a_{t}'\right]x - E\left[r_{pt}\right]x'E\left[a_{t}\right] + E\left[r_{pt}\right]E\left[a_{t}\right]'x - x'\lambda + +\gamma\left(1 - x'1\right) \\ FOC: \\ & 0 = & 2E\left[a_{t}a_{t}'\right]x - 2E\left[r_{pt}\right]E\left[a_{t}\right] - \lambda + \gamma 1 \end{split}$$

For simplicity, assume that $\lambda_k=0.$ Then the FOC simplifies to:

$$\gamma 1 = 2E [a_t a_t'] x - 2E [r_{pt}] E [a_t]
x = \frac{\gamma}{2} E [a_t a_t']^{-1} 1 + E [a_t a_t']^{-1} E [a_t] E [r_{pt}]
x = \delta + \beta_a
s.t.
\delta \equiv \frac{E [a_t a_t']^{-1}}{2} \frac{1}{2}
\beta_a \equiv E [a_t a_t']^{-1} E [a_t] E [r_p]$$

This implies:

$$r_b = a'_t (\delta + \beta_a)$$

$$E[r_b] = \mu'_a (\delta + \beta_a)$$

$$\sigma_b^2 = x' E[aa'] x - x' \mu_a \mu'_a x$$

$$= x' \Sigma_a x$$

$$= (\delta + \beta_a)' \Sigma_a (\delta + \beta_a)$$

Note that under normality:

$$E[r_{pt}|r_{bt}] = \mu_p + \frac{cov(r_{pt}, r_{bt})}{\sigma_b^2} (r_{bt} - \mu_b)$$

$$cov(r_{pt}, r_{bt}) = cov(r_p, a'_t(\delta + \beta_a))$$

$$= cov(a'_t\beta_a, \gamma a'_t\beta_a + \gamma a_t\delta)$$

$$= \beta'_a \Sigma_a (\beta + \delta)$$

$$\implies [r_{pt}|r_{bt}] = \mu_p + \frac{\beta'_a \Sigma_a (\delta + \beta_a)}{(\delta + \beta_a)' \Sigma_a (\delta + \beta_a)} (a_t - \mu_a)' (\delta + \beta_a)$$

$$= \mu'_a \beta_a + \frac{\beta'_a \Sigma_a (\delta + \beta_a)}{(\delta + \beta_a)' \Sigma_a (\delta + \beta_a)} (a_t - \mu_a)' (\delta + \beta_a)$$

This implies that conditioning on r_{bt} is NOT the same as conditioning on a_t and will lead to an inconsistent estimator of exposure. The exception occurs when both constraints are zero.