

Applied Radiation and Isotopes 56 (2002) 5-13

Applied Radiation and Isotopes

www.elsevier.com/locate/apradiso

# Standards of radium-226: from Marie Curie to the International Committee for Radionuclide Metrology

B.M. Coursey\*, R. Collé, J.S. Coursey

Ionizing Radiation Division, Physics Laboratory, National Institute of Standards and Technology, Gaithersburg, MD 20899-8460, USA

This article is dedicated to the memory of Wilfrid B. Mann (1908–2001), past president of the ICRM and past Editor-in-Chief of Applied Radiation and Isotopes. His early account of the origins of radionuclide metrology appeared as the first paper in this Journal, The preparation and maintenance of standards of radioactivity, 1956. Appl. Radiat. Isot. 1, 3–23.

#### Abstract

In the early part of the 20th century, the pioneers of radioactivity research, led by Marie Curie, Ernest Rutherford and Stefan Meyer, formed a *Commission internationale des étalons de radium*. The Commission made arrangements for the preparation and intercomparisons of the international standards of radium, which were identified as the Paris standard and the Vienna standard. Otto Hönigschmid from Vienna prepared a first set of international secondary standards in 1912 and a second set in 1934. In both instances, these secondary standards were compared by gamma-ray measurements with the Paris and Vienna standards. The usage of these international standards of radium in the 20th century is described. Published by Elsevier Science Ltd.

# 1. The first radium standards 1902–1912

Much has been written about Maria Sklodowska Curie and her extraordinary accomplishments in physics and chemistry. See, for example, the popular biography Madame Curie authored by her youngest daughter Eve (Curie, 1937). In this account, we will concentrate on the quantitative aspects of her work with radium, and how the early work with radium standards presaged the present system of international radionuclide metrology. Marie Curie's first experiments to establish the existence of radium as a separate element began with 100 g of pitchblende from St. Joachimstal in the present Czech Republic. (Excellent reviews of the early chemistry and the origins of the radium industry are given by Silverman (1950) and Landa (1982).) Marie Curie's next experiments were with 500 g of carnotite from the western US provided by the US Geological Survey. These early investigations suggested that she would need large

E-mail address: bert.coursey@nist.gov (B.M. Coursey).

quantities of raw materials to extract weighable amounts of the element. She then obtained 100 kg of pitchblende, courtesy of the Austrian Academy of Sciences. This was soon exhausted as well. Ultimately, Marie and Pierre Curie obtained 8 metric tons of pitchblende residues (for the cost of shipping) from St. Joachimstal, and by 1902 she had extracted one decigram of the element radium.

As soon as the remarkable properties of radioactivity were known, a large number of chemists initiated programs to separate radium and the longer-lived daughter products from the uranium, actinium and thorium series. Physical measurement standards were then needed to compare purity and yield of products from different laboratories. Clearly, standards of mass—amount of substance—would be useful. Arthur Eve, a collaborator of Rutherford's at McGill University, proposed as a standard 1 kg of thorium nitrate in a thin-walled, cylindrical glass vessel 16 cm in diameter with radiation filtered through 1 cm of lead (Eve, 1906). Note that the standard calls for a unit quantity of a purified compound, in a specified geometry, and with a specified filter to remove lowerenergy radiations.

<sup>\*</sup>Corresponding author. Tel.: +1-301-975-5584; fax: +1-301-869-7682.

A more obvious international standard would be based on the mass of the element radium. This <sup>226</sup>Ra standard would have to be free of "mesothorium" (<sup>228</sup>Ra) and free of barium element contamination from the chemical purification. The chemists from the Curie Institute soon had competition from other "radioactivity laboratories" in Europe and North America (e.g., Soddy, 1911). In the decade following the discovery of radioactivity, Marie and Pierre Curie and Rutherford received Nobel Prizes—in large part for their elucidation of the nature of radioactivity as a result of their careful measurements of <sup>226</sup>Ra and its decay products. A consensus developed that an international radium standard was needed (Boudia, 1997).

The first formal action on establishing an international standard came 12-15 September 1910 at the International Congress of Radiology and Electricity Brussels. A special international committee was appointed to report to the Congress on the best means to be adopted to fix an international radium standard. The members of the committee and their institutions at the time are given in Table 1. Although many on the committee had worked in Rutherford's laboratory at McGill University, Rutherford and the other committee members were keenly aware of Marie Curie's special place in the field. It was agreed that the unit of activity would be named the "Curie", and the quantity of a radioactive substance corresponding to 1 Ci would be that amount equivalent to radon emanations from one gram of <sup>226</sup>Ra. The more successful instruments of the day for comparing different radium sources were gold-leaf electroscopes in which the radium and daughter gamma rays were filtered through 1 cm of lead. The main contribution to air ionization came from the high-energy gamma rays of radium B (214Pb) and radium C (214Bi). Thus, sealed <sup>222</sup>Rn sources could be compared directly with sealed <sup>226</sup>Ra preparations with <sup>222</sup>Rn in equilibrium. The committee reported to the congress on the final day (September 15th) and their suggestions were adopted by the Congress (Rutherford, 1910). Marie Curie was asked to prepare a standard of approximately 20 mg mass radium.

In the autumn of 1911, Rutherford and Marie Curie met at the Solvay Conference in Brussels and agreed to ask Stefan Meyer of the Institut für Radiumforschung

Table 1 Commission internationale des étalons de radium (1912)<sup>a</sup>

| Marie Curie            | Sorbonne University, Paris         |
|------------------------|------------------------------------|
| André Debierne         | Sorbonne University, Paris         |
| Ernest Rutherford      | Manchester University, Manchester  |
| Frederick Soddy        | Glasgow University, Glasgow        |
| Otto Hahn              | Berlin University, Berlin          |
| Hans Geitela           | Gymnasium Wolfenbüttel,            |
|                        | Braunschweig                       |
| Stefan Meyer           | Academy of Sciences, Vienna        |
| Egon R. von Schweidler | University of Innsbruck, Innsbruck |
| Arthur S. Eve          | McGill University, Montreal        |
| Bertram Boltwooda      | Yale University, New Haven         |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>a</sup> For further information on these members of the commission see: Fricke (1992) and Badash (1969).

in Vienna to prepare a second standard. Rutherford assigned his young graduate student, James Chadwick, the task of devising an instrument to compare two different radium preparations (Rutherford and Chadwick, 1912). On 25–28 March 1912, the International Committee met in Paris to compare the two standards. Rutherford's apprehensions about the meeting were expressed in a personal letter to Boltwood on 18 March (Badash, 1969; Brown, 1997)

I have not much doubt but that the two standards will be found in very good agreement, but it will be a devil of a mess if they are not. That is one of the reasons that I must be there to act as arbitrator between the two parties. I have developed a balance method of a gamma ray comparison, with which I think I can compare two nearly equal standards [to] an accuracy of 1 in 1000. I suppose, however, we shall not worry if the agreement of the two standards is within 1 in 300 or 400.

Chadwick's method was used as well as another ionization method designed by Pierre Curie using his piezoelectric quartz crystal (Chavaudra, 1995). The agreement between the Paris and Vienna standards was 2 parts in 1000 (Geiger, 1984). Of course there was general relief that this close agreement was good enough, but Hönigschmid was careful to point out later that he used calibrated weights in his mass measurements while Marie Curie did not! Rutherford's account of the Paris meeting was published in *Nature* in April, 1912 (Rutherford, 1912). Meyer and von Schweidler's account of the meeting in German is given in Meyer and von Schweidler (1916). Geitel, Eve and Boltwood did not attend the meeting. Interesting descriptions of Rutherford's and Curie's preparations for the meeting have been given by Brown (1997) and Boudia (1997), respectively.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>In later years many of those who worked for Rutherford and others who greatly admired his work would propose the unit the Rutherford (rd) for radioactivity (Dorsey, 1921; Curtiss, 1948) but these proposals were never adopted. Under Curtiss' proposal 1 rd would equal 1 MBq.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>Frame (1996) has commented on the deliberations in choosing the name for the unit and the ambiguity in who was being honored.

# 1.1. 1912 series of Hönigschmid standards

Some of the most careful gravimetric measurements at that time were carried out by Otto Hönigschmid in Meyer's laboratory in Vienna as part of his efforts to measure the atomic weight of radium (Hönigschmid, 1911). The International Committee asked Hönigschmid to prepare a set of radium ampoules suitable for use as standards by metrology institutes in different countries. The "primary standards" were a special designation for the Paris standard of Marie Curie and the Vienna standard maintained by Stefan Meyer. The "secondary standards" were prepared as weighed samples of radium chloride from material extracted from St. Joachimstal pitchblende, which was said to be practically free of mesothorium (<sup>228</sup>Ra). These were compared by gammaray measurements with the Paris and Vienna standards and certificates for each standard were signed by Stefan Meyer, Marie Curie and, as president of the commission, Ernest Rutherford (Meyer, 1945a, b, c). In Rutherford's letters in Nature, he refers to an international "committee", but the certificates are titled in French Commission internationale des étalons de radium. Perhaps they made the transition from "committee" to "commission" at the March 1912 meeting. The 1912 standards were of the order of 10-20 mg of RaCl<sub>2</sub>, such that their emission rate would be comparable to the Paris standard of 21.99 mg RaCl<sub>2</sub> and the three standards maintained in Vienna with masses of 10.11, 31.17 and 40.43 mg RaCl<sub>2</sub>. The standard of 31.17 mg was designated "the Vienna standard". The disposition of the original seven secondary standards is given in Table 2 (Meyer and von Schweidler, 1916). Recipient national metrology institutes included the Physikalisch-Technische Reichsanstalt (PTR, Berlin), the National Physical Laboratory (NPL, Teddington), and the National Bureau of Standards (NBS, Washington). The certificate for the NBS Standard No. 6 is shown in

Fig. 1. The certificate for the NPL Standard No. 3 is shown in Smith (1975). These standards were put to immediate practical use in support of the new worldwide radium industry. The radium work at the NBS was undertaken by Noah Dorsey who was the first chief of the Radium Section and later published important work on protection measures for radium workers (Dorsey, 1921).

# 2. Commercial pressures for internationally compatible radium measurements

In the two decades following its discovery radium became the most valuable material on earth, its price eventually peaking near \$125,000 (US) per gram of element. Carnotite from Colorado and Utah in the USA was competitive as a raw material with the pitchblende deposits from St. Joachimstal. The US industry led by the Radium Chemical Company became one of the most important suppliers to the growing international market. Some of the richest deposits in the world were found in January 1913 in the Belgian province of Congo in Africa and, after the war, these were developed by the Union Minière du Haut Katanga of Brussels. However, World War I interrupted production, commerce and research. (James Chadwick was in Berlin working with Hans Geiger at the Physikalisch-Technische Reichsanstalt (PTR), and was held prisoner as a foreign national for the duration of the hostilities!).

The high value of radium during this period put great pressures on accurate measurements to assure equity in trade. We give three amusing examples here. WWI began 28 July 1914 and on 1 August, Glenn Donald Kammer from the Pittsburgh radium works of the Radium Chemical Company, set sail for England with a case containing 4 g of radium valued at \$500,000 (Silverman, 1950). The trip was widely covered by

Table 2
Reproduction of a table taken from Meyer and von Schweidler (1916) giving the disposition of the initial seven secondary standards.
As indicated, these standards were sent to France, Germany, England, the United States, Sweden, Japan and Portugal; and each was directly compared against the Paris and Vienna primary standards<sup>a</sup>

| Land                 | ein-geschmolzen am | Wiener Messung RaCl <sub>2</sub> (mg) | Pariser Messung | Gewähltes Mittel |
|----------------------|--------------------|---------------------------------------|-----------------|------------------|
| Frankreich           | 4. Okt. 1912       | 22.47                                 | 22.42           | 22.45            |
| Deutsches Reich      | 4. Okt. 1912       | 19.73                                 | 19.74           | 19.73            |
| England              | 4. Okt. 1912       | 21.10                                 | 21.16           | 21.13            |
| Ver. Staaten Amerika | 1. Juli 1913       | 20.29                                 | 20.28           | 20.28            |
| Schweden             | 1. Juli 1913       | 9.74                                  | 9.71            | 9.73             |
| Japan                | 1. Juli 1913       | 9.80                                  | 9.80            | 9.80             |
| Portugal             | 1. Juli 1913       | 9.07                                  | 9.11            | 9.09             |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>a</sup>As indicated in the table, the agreement in the comparisons against the two primary standards was well within a few tenths of a percent, which is a precision that still rivals contemporary radionuclidic metrology.

# COMMISSION INTERNATIONALE DES ÉTALONS DE RADIUM.

# CERTIFICAT.

Des als Chlorid dargestellte Radiumpräparat Nr. 6 .. entstammt St. Joachimstaler Uranpechblende und ist demnach praktisch frei von

Es eathāte 2 50 Milligramm grammes de sel.

LL mm, an dessen Ende ein feiner soudé à l'extrémité du tube. Platindraht eingeschmoben ist.

methoden unabhängig voncinander damment à Vienne et à Paris.

RuCl, (Die jährliche Abnahme beträgt n 04 Promile)

Unter Zugrundelegung der Atom-

1544 mg Pa-B seel in the. 16:16 mg Raby.

Die Genauigkeit dieser Angabe wird auf A.E. %, für gesichert gehalten.

La Préparation de Chiorure de Radium contenue dans l'ampoule Nr. provient de la pechblende de St. Joachimsthal. Elle est donc pratiquement exempte de Mésothorium.

Elle contient 250 Milli-

Le sel a été enfermé le 1/21/9/3 ns un tube de verre (Verre de schlossen in ein Glasröhrchen (Thürin-Thuringe.) Epaisseurdu verre 0°27 mm; ger Glas) von 0·27 mm Wandstärke, Diamètre extérieur 3·2 mm; Longueur Bullerem Durchmesser 32 mm, Länge ....22...mm. Un fil de platine fin a été

- En qualité d'Étalon son Desselbe wurde als Secondirer derd en den Wiener Etalons und de Vienne et à l'Étalon International de Paris, au moyen de méthodes de an dem internationalen Standard in mesures basées sur le rayonnement 7. Paris nach mehreren T-Strahlungs- La comparaison a été faite indépen-

D'après son reyonnement 7, la Der 7-Strahlung mech ist es im Préparation équivaut en l'année. [213 abre 1913 Equivalent 2023 mg & 2025 mg. RaCl. (La diminution per année est de 04 pour mille.)

> En adoptant les poids atomiques suivents:

Redium . . 226 Chiere . . . 29457 Brens . . . 79-916

Pe 15 17 mg na, soul -

La précision de ces résultats es considérée comme assurapproximation de ...012.1/e.

Specimen No. 6 of Radium is prepared as chloride from pitchblende of St. Joachimstal and is consequently practically free from Mesothorium.

It contains 2/50 Milligrammes of salt.

k was enclosed the 1/17 190 in a glass tube (Thuringian glass) of 0-27 mm thickness, exterior diameter 3.2 mm, length 42 mm, a thin platinum wire being fused into the end of the tube.

It is calibrated as Secondary dard by comparison with the Vienne-Standard and with the International Standard at Paris, several independent 7-raymethods being used.

Measured by the 7-radiation. it is in the year 1412 equivalent to 2.8:2.2 mg. RaCl. (The yearly decay is about 04 per mille.)

Taking the atomic weights

for Radio for Chlorina

LETY my Rodrant

Mest of Bo. 36:36 mg Pally.

These statements are considered correct to AZ%

Francis Wiener Messeng: Form to minner faiter
Flancis:

Flancis:

Flancis:

Ruises Ho Comminion

Fig. 1.

newspapers in Europe and North America. The material was intended for Manchester, Greenwich, Sheffield, Northampton and Hull—all medical centers that would use the radium in therapy. Kammer was dismayed to find that all the purchasers were afraid that that the US radium was contaminated with <sup>228</sup>Ra, and they insisted on a separate analysis by the NPL in Teddington. After months of arguing, Northhampton paid for the mesothorium analysis at NPL who found negligible contamination of the US radium with <sup>228</sup>Ra. NPL then convinced the other centers that the mesothorium tests were unnecessary.

Another dispute arose in 1919 when Marie Curie wrote to the NBS that her institute questioned the accuracy of standard samples prepared by the Radium Chemical Company that had supposedly been certified at NBS. These samples had been shipped to the Banque du Radium in Paris who had then requested analyses at the Curie Institute. The guarded response to Mme Curie from the NBS Director was that the samples for the New York company had been carefully compared in Washington against Standard No. 6, which she herself had certified in 1912. The matter was resolved when one of the NBS scientists visited Paris and contacted the Banque du Radium. He found that this institution was a commercial broker and that the radium samples had been re-packaged by clerks before they were sent to Marie Curie's laboratory. But, the clerks were sure they had done a careful job of transferring the radium!

By 1921, the cost of radium and the demands from medical centers were so high that Marie Curie was dismayed that she could not afford radium for her own research. This came to the attention of some prominent women in the US and Mrs. William Brown Meloney organized the women of America to collect \$100,000 (US) to buy Marie Curie a gram of radium. The money was collected and the Pittsburgh company prepared the materials from carnotite from the US. The radium would normally have been valued at \$120,000, but the company provided it for the \$100,000 that had been subscribed. Ten sealed tubes of 100 mg Ra each were prepared and sent to NBS where they were compared by gold-leaf electroscope with Standard No. 6 from the International Radium Standards Commission. The certificate for the one gram of radium (shown in Fig. 2) was presented to Marie Curie by President Harding in a ceremony at the White House in May 1921. During this visit to America, Marie Curie also visited the Pittsburgh radium factory and the NBS (Curie, 1923) where she doubtless held discussions with Noah Dorsey and others on the techniques in use for measurements of these 10 samples and the one she had questioned two years earlier. A fascinating look at the NBS laboratories she visited in Washington is given in a "public health study of a typical radium laboratory" (Williams, 1924).

At the end of the decade, Marie Curie asked her benefactors to help her once again to obtain one gram of Ra, this time for a Radium Institute in her native Poland (Towpik and Mould, 1998). This time the American women collected \$50,000 (the price had dropped!) and a check was presented to Marie Curie by President Hoover at the White House. She used the money to buy the radium from the Belgian factory who used raw materials from the Congo. More efficient separations chemistry and discoveries of more high-grade ores (in Canada and South America as well as Africa) had combined to reduce the unit price of radium. But the number of applications and the associated metrological needs continued to increase. Gram quantities were needed for radium helmets used in external beam therapy, while milligram quantities were needed for interstitial therapy with both radium needles and radon in sealed glass tubes. The interstitial therapy was initially referred to as "endocurie therapy", while today it is universally known as "brachytherapy". Measurements were also needed to prevent fraudulent sales of materials that contained little or no radioactivity (Frame, 1992). Finally, measurements were increasingly needed for small amounts—that is, microgram quantities of Ra—particularly in solution form. These were used to standardize methods for measuring Ra in water for use in comparing therapeutic spas throughout the world.

## 2.1. 1934 series of Hönigschmid standards

By the early 1930s there were increasing concerns about the long-term integrity of the 1912 Hönigschmid standards. The two points most often discussed were the possible build-up of <sup>4</sup>He gas in the sealed vessels, and the unknown effect of long-term alpha-particle irradiation on the Thuringian glass itself. After almost 90 years there is no evidence that either of these effects has resulted in loss of one of the original standards but, nevertheless, the concerns were real. The International Commission asked Hönigschmid to undertake preparation of a new set of standards, and this time he used material from the Union Minière du Haut Katanga that was also essentially free of mesothorium contamination. Meyer, in an obituary for Professor Hönigschmid in 1945, gave an account of the preparation of the 1934 standards (Meyer, 1945a, b, c). The new standards were compared with the Paris and Vienna standards identified earlier.

From recent correspondence located at NIST, one can see that obtaining the new standards was not an easy, straightforward task. In order to buy the 1934 standard, NBS had to first negotiate a price and delivery schedule with the Radium Chemical Company in New York. They in turn placed an order with the Union Minière in Brussels. The certificates state that the sample was weighed by Hönigschmid on 2 June 1934. However,

# 化自电池设施 美国的工程等 的无 多斑症形的氏虫

Department of Commerce

Bureau of Standards - S.W. Stratton, Director



ADJUACTIVE MATERIAL

Submitted for measurement and certification

By the Radium Chemical Company Pittsburgh, Pa.. Distributers



For the Standard Chemical Company Pittsburgh, Pa. Makers

THE PRESIDENT OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA ON BEHALF OF THE WOMEN OF AMERICA

Madame Marie Sklodowska Curie,
Paris, France.
May 20, 1921.

This certifies that each specimen of the above mentioned radioactive material, as described below, has been comcared with the Radium Standard of the National Bureau of Standards, and that from the data so obtained the equilibrium intensity of the measurable gamma radiation has been computed to be equivalent to that from a quantity of radium whose mass is specified in the right hand column of the following lable of values.

| Designating | numbers         | of to | ube*            |     | F-4 1  | 1:                          |   |                                    |
|-------------|-----------------|-------|-----------------|-----|--------|-----------------------------|---|------------------------------------|
| Assigned by | Assig<br>Bureau |       | by the<br>Stand |     |        | dimensions<br>pillimeters ) | Combined weight of tube and contents (milligrams) | Computed radium element equivalent |
| Makers      | Serial          |       | Test            |     | Length | Diameter                    | (minigrams)                                       | (milligrains)                      |
| 1           | 4082            | Te    | x.3130          | -40 | 41.9   | 3.77                        | 55+.7   | 100.7                              |
| 2           | 4083            | •     |                 | 41  | 35.0   | 3.66                        | 465.3   | 101.3                              |
| 3           | 4084            |       |                 | 42  | 38.5   | 3.91                        | 541.9   | 100.9                              |
| 4           | 4085            |       | ,               | 43  | 40.5   | 3.82                        | 552 6   | 101.0                              |
| 5           | 4086            | , .   | •               | 44  | 38.5   | 3.76                        | 517.7   | 100.9                              |
| 6           | 4087            | **    | . "             | 45  | 37.7   | 3.92                        | 537.5   | 100.5                              |
| 7           | 4088            |       |                 | 46  | 36.0   | 3.62                        | 479.3   | 101.2                              |
| 8           | 4089            |       |                 | 47  | 36.8   | 3.81                        | 505.6   | 100.9                              |
| 9           | 4090            | ++    |                 | 48  | 39.4   | 3.84                        | 546.9   | 101.1                              |
| 10          | 4091            | •     | 1 10            | 49  | 33 6   | 3.72                        | 462.5   | 101.6                              |

The computed radium element equivalent specified in the right-hand column represents a quantity of radium in radioactive equilibrium with its first four derivatives, being hermetically seeled in a tube of Thuringian glass having walls 0.27 millimeters thick,

The residual uncertainty in the namerical value of the radium element equivalent of these several specimens does not exceed 0.7 of one percent.

Observations extending over 25 days indicate that the radiam contained in these socimens is now in radioactive equilibrium.

\* The county twice material herein certified is divided who togloby each suided in a security of my and designated by the cospective members shown in the time three each man of the above time. The Bureau would not be more that the instead of my better material in and et. These is a companies of the above more that the instead of my better material in an expensive of the instead of the first manufacture to the more expensive of the material manufacture to the more expensive of the material manufacture of the material manufacture of the material manufacture of the material materials and the materials of the mater

S.W. Stratton

when NBS ordered the sample in 1936 there were no assurances that it had been measured against the Paris and Vienna standards. Leon Curtiss at NBS wrote to Lord Rutherford, president of the International Commission, asking his assistance in having the sample measured in Paris and Vienna. Curtiss had done a postdoctoral fellowship with Rutherford in the Cavendish Laboratory in 1924-1926. With Rutherford's assistance—and cash payments from NBS to Paris and Vienna—measurements were made, and certificates for the two standards of the US (Nos. 5437 and 5440) were finally received. Marie Curie was involved in the decisions to prepare the second set of standards, but she died on 4 July 1934, just one month after the standards were prepared. Her daughter, Irène Joliot Curie, took her place on the International Commission and the 1934 Hönigschmid standard certificates bear her name.

Table 3 The 20 Hönigschmid Standards of 2 June 1934<sup>a</sup>

| Sample | Mass RaCl2 (mg) | Location                            |
|--------|-----------------|-------------------------------------|
| 5433   | 12.53           | _                                   |
| 5435   | 13.05           | _                                   |
| 5421   | 17.75           | was at AB, but not there now        |
| 5426   | 19.19           | PTB, Braunschweig                   |
| 5432   | 20.50           | NPL, Teddington                     |
| 5430   | 22.23           | France                              |
| 5440   | 26.86           | NBS, Gaithersburg                   |
| 5431   | 27.15           | was at Union Minière, now at AB     |
| 5427   | 27.96           | VNIIM, St. Petersburg               |
| 5428   | 30.75           | IRK, Vienna                         |
| 5425   | 31.73           | NRC, Ottawa                         |
| 5422   | 32.56           | Possibly at one time at Lab. Curie, |
|        |                 | Paris                               |
| 5429   | 33.34           | _                                   |
| 5424   | 37.64           | PTB, Braunschweig                   |
| 5434   | 38.88           | AB, Germany                         |
| 5438   | 50.00           | Possibly at one time at Lab. Curie, |
|        |                 | Paris                               |
| 5437   | 50.22           | NBS, Gaithersburg                   |
| 5436   | 52.72           | _                                   |
| 5442   | 134.93          | at AB, May have been dissolved      |
| 5441   | 137.34          | _                                   |

<sup>a</sup>Summary prepared by David Smith, NPL from a questionnaire distributed by D. Smith, NPL, Teddington and Nikolai Karmalitsyn, VNIIM, St. Petersburg in 1989.

AB denotes a commercial firm in Braunschweig, Germany. (The company is presently organized as AEA Technology.)

The primary standards from 1911 denoted Nos. I, III and IV are maintained at the Institut für Radiumforschung und Kernphysik der Universität Wien (IRK). (The present name of the institute is Institut für Isotopenforschung und Kernphysik (IIK) der Universität Wien and the remaining samples are stored in Seibersdorf, Austria.)

In 1989, David Smith of the NPL distributed a questionnaire on radium standards as an action of Section 2 of the Comité Consultatif pour les Étalons de Mesure des Rayonnements Ionisants (CCEMRI) (Smith, 1989). His table, reproduced here as Table 3, gives notes on the location at that time of the 20 standards prepared in 1934.

## 3. International intercomparisons of radium standards

Bilateral intercomparisons of radium standards must have taken place during the period 1920–1940. We have, for example, correspondence from the Director of the NPL to the Director of NBS 13 June 1921, which begins "In reply to your letter of March 29th, we have conducted an extensive search through our records, in the hope of finding instances where specimens of radium have been measured at both the Bureau of Standards and the NPL.... Unfortunately, although we have handled a good deal of American radium, almost wholly from the Radium Chemical Company, we can find no evidence that the figure...". So, it would appear that metrology institutes did comparisons mainly to resolve disputes on commercial transactions. Other comparisons with university laboratories in Germany, France, the UK and elsewhere were probably more common. In 1928, Curtiss made a comparison of the NBS standard with standards from the Cavendish laboratory. By this time he had built a radium calibration range much better suited for protection of the operator when measuring milligram radium sources (Curtiss, 1928). The main tool for gamma-ray intercomparisons was still the gold-leaf electroscope.

After World War II, many nations recognized the need for radioactivity standards of fission-product nuclides which could be used in industrial applications. Cyclotrons also became more widely available for production of nuclides, many of which had commercial applications. The expanding metrology groups around the world moved quickly to perfect the traditional methods and to develop new coincidence methods that could take advantage of scintillation detectors with improved resolution and faster electronics. But it was perhaps natural for those conducting international comparisons to look first to radium standards as the 1600 year half-life would obviate the problems associated with shipments by sea of shorter-lived nuclides.

Wilfrid Basil Mann, a young Englishman, was one of the first of this generation after WWII to take on the challenge of comparing the Hönigschmid standards from several countries. Mann developed a radiation balance after the design of Callendar (1910). It was described as a twin-cup Peltier-effect microcalorimeter. It was used in comparison of the Hönigschmid standards of the US (5437 and 5440), United Kingdom (No. 5432), Canada (No. 5425) and Germany (No. 5426). Gamma-ray measurements were also made with an electroscope (Loftus et al., 1957; Geiger, 1984). It is interesting to comment on the calorimetric approach. Rutherford and his colleagues had recognized the utility of using calorimeters to measure the power from radioactive substances (Rutherford et al., 1930). In their 1930 book, Rutherford summarizes available data on power measurements and lists the calculated power corresponding to radium plus daughters as "140.1 g calories per hour". This corresponds to 162.8 µW mg<sup>-1</sup> of Ra plus daughters. Mann reported a value of 164.58 μW mg<sup>-1</sup> "uncorrected for growth of polonium or of radium E" (Davenport et al., 1954). Using currently available nuclear-decay data, Collé (Collé and Zimmerman, 2002) calculated a value of  $158.7 \,\mu\text{W mg}^{-1}$ . The main value of Mann's calorimeter was not as an absolute detector, but that it could be used to compare two standards without the source-geometry uncertainty introduced in gammaray comparisons at a distance from the electroscope. The most careful calorimetric measurements of radium standards were those of Yudin and coworkers in St. Petersburg (Christmas et al., 1988) who paid special attention to the energy loss from gamma rays that escaped the calorimeter and energy gains from build-up of <sup>210</sup>Pb plus daughters. The measured power per unit mass for any given radium sample will depend on the dimensions of the heat sink and on the time elapsed since encapsulation of the radium, but should be of the order of  $160 \,\mu\mathrm{W}\,\mathrm{mg}^{-1}$  with no contribution from the <sup>210</sup>Pb sub-series. In radioactive equilibrium, the <sup>210</sup>Pb sub-series will add an additional  $34.2 \,\mu \text{W mg}^{-1}$ .

Comparative measurements with the calorimeter and various electroscopes were made in a number of laboratories including NBS, NPL, PTB, NRC, IRK and the Union Minière, Brussels. In every instance, the measurements served to confirm the ratio between any two standards as equal to the mass ratio from Hönigschmid. As a result, in 1959 an ad hoc study group of the CCEMRI of the Comité International des Poids et Mesures recommended that the whole system of international Hönigschmid standards be considered as the international standard.

At the International Summer School on Radionuclide Metrology held at Hercig Novi in 1972, Wilfrid Mann gave a summary of the many international measurements of the 1934 Hönigschmid standards (Cavallo et al., 1973). In the absence of an International Radium Standards Commission, the responsibilities for international radium and radon metrology have been assumed by Section 2 of the CCRI and by members of the International Committee for Radionuclide Metrology (ICRM) and their several working groups.

### Acknowledgements

The authors gratefully acknowledge their colleagues in the international community who have recommended literature for research on the early radium work. These include Drs. Klaus Debertin, Herbert Janszen, Klaus Thieme in Braunschweig, Dr. Edward Landa in Reston, and Drs. Brigitt Strohmaier and Gerhard Winkler in Vienna.

#### References

- Badash, L., 1969. Rutherford and Boltwood; Letters on Radioactivity. Yale University Press, New Haven, p. 254.
- Boudia, S., 1997. The Curie Laboratory: radioactivity and metrology. History Technol. 13, 249.
- Brown, A., 1997. The Neutron and the Bomb: A Biography of Sir James Chadwick. Oxford University Press, Oxford.
- Callendar, H.L., 1910. The radio-balance. Proc. Phys. Soc. 23, 1.
- Cavallo, L.M., Coursey, B.M., Garfinkel, S.B., Hutchinson, J.M.R., Mann, W.B., 1973. Needs for radioactivity standards and measurements in different fields. Nucl. Instrum. Meth. 112, 5.
- Chavaudra, J., 1995. Pierre and Marie Curie-Sklodowska. Med. Phys. 22, 1877.
- Christmas, P., Cross, P., Gubkin, E.S., Holnova, E.A., Yudin, M.F., 1988. Intercomparison of the radium mass standards of the UK and the USSR. Metrologia 25, 239.
- Collé, R., Zimmerman, B.E., 2002. A dual-compensated cryogenic microcalorimeter for radioactivity standardizations. Appl. Radiat. Isot. 56, 223–230.
- Curie, M., 1923. Pierre Curie; With Autobiographical Notes by Marie Curie, Translated by Charlotte and Vernon Kellogg, with introduction by Mrs. William Brown Meloney, Dover, New York.
- Curie, E., 1937. Madame Curie, translated by Vincent Sheean, Doubleday, Doran and Co., Garden City.
- Curtiss, L.F., 1928. A projection electroscope for standardizing radium preparations. J. Opt. Soc. Am. 16, 363.
- Curtiss, L.F., 1948. Measurement of radioactive isotopes, Circular 473, National Bureau of Standards, US Government Printing Office, Washington.
- Davenport, T.I., Mann, W.B., McCraven, C.C., Smith, C.C., Connor, W.S., Youden, W.J., 1954. Comparison of four national radium standards. J. Res. Natl. Bur. Stds. 53, 267.
- Dorsey, N.E., 1921. Physics of Radioactivity. Williams and Wilkins, Baltimore.
- Eve, A.S., 1906. The absorption of the rays of radioactive substances. Philos. Mag. Ser. 6, 11, 586, Phys. Z. 8, 183.
- Frame, P.W., 1992. Curative devices that contain natural radioactivity. Health Phys. 62, S72.
- Frame, P.W., 1996. Tales from the atomic age: how the Curie came to be. Part 1, October; Part 2, November, Health Physics Society Newsletter.
- Fricke, R.G.A., 1992. J. Elster und H. Geitel: Jugendfreunde Gymnasiallehrer Wissenschaftler aus Passion, Döring Druck, Druckerei und Verlag, Braunschweig.

- Geiger, K.W., 1984. The history of radium measurement at the National Research Council of Canada, Pub. No. 23372, National Research Council Ottawa, 10 May.
- Hönigschmid, O., 1911. Revision des Atomgewichtes des Radiums und Herstellung von Radium-standardpräparaten, Mitteilungen aus dem Institut für Radiumforschung, Aus den Sitzungsberichten der kaiserl. Akademie der Wissenschaften in Wien, Mathematisch-Naturwissenschaftliche Klasse; Bd. CXX Abt. IIa, 1617, November.
- Landa, E., 1982. The first nuclear industry. Sci. Am. 247, 182. Loftus, T.P., Mann, W.B., Paolella, L.F., Stockmann, L.L.,
- Youden, W.J., 1957. Comparison of national radium standards. J. Res. Natl. Bur. Stds. 58, 169.
- Meyer, S., 1945a. Anzeiger der Akademie der Wissenschaften in Wien, Mathematisch-Naturwissenschaftliche Klasse, Jahrgang 1945, Nr. 8 und 9.
- Meyer, S., 1945b. Mitteilungen des Instituts fr Radiumforschung Nr. 452a., 25, Uber die Radium-Standard-Präparate.
- Meyer, S., 1945c. Mitteilungen des Instituts für Radiumforschung Nr. 453a, 30, Geschichte und Herstellung der primären Radium-Standards, von Otto Hönigschmid.
- Meyer, S., von Schweidler, E.R., 1916. Radioaktivität, Verlag und Druck von B.G. Teubner, Berlin.
- Rutherford, E., 1910. Radium standards and nomenclature. Nature 84, 430.

- Rutherford, E., 1912. The international radium standard. Nature 89, 115.
- Rutherford, E., Chadwick, J., 1912. A balance method for comparison of quantities of radium and some of its applications. Proc. Phys. Soc. 24, 141.
- Rutherford, E., Chadwick, J., Ellis, C.D., 1930. Radiations from Radioactive Substances. Macmillan, London, p. 158f.
- Silverman, A., 1950. Pittsburgh's contribution to radium recovery. J. Chem. Educ. 27, 303.
- Smith, E.E., 1975. Radiation Science at the National Physical Laboratory 1912–1955. The National Physical Laboratory, Teddington, UK.
- Smith, D., 1989. The 1934 Hönigschmid Standards, CCEMRI (II)/89–12, BIPM, Sèvres.
- Soddy, F., 1911. The Chemistry of the Radio-Elements. Longmans-Green, London.
- Towpik, E., Mould, R., 1998. Marie Skłodowska-Curie memorial issue, Nowotwory. Polish Oncol. J. Warsaw.
- Williams, R.C., 1924. Preliminary note on observations made on physical condition of persons engaged in measuring radium preparations. Reprint No. 889 from the Public Health Records, December 21, 1923, US Public Health Service. Washington.