

Whitman 2AC List 3/1

(List Of Negative Arguments For The 2AC)

Alabama	2
Abilene Christian.....	6
Allegheny.....	7
Arkansas State	8
Arizona State	9
Army	10
Augustana IL	11
Bakersfield.....	13
Baylor.....	15
Berkeley	21
Boston College	26
Cal State LA	28
Case Western	29
Catholic University	31
Chicago	38
Chico	39
Concordia.....	41
Cornell.....	44
Dartmouth.....	48
Duquesne.....	57
Emory.....	58
Emporia.....	78
ENMU	80
Florida State.....	81
Fort Hays.....	82
Fullerton.....	84
FSU.....	87
Georgetown.....	88
Georgia.....	92
Georgia State	98
George Mason.....	100
George Washiington.....	105
Gonzaga	106
Harvard.....	109
Idaho State	111
Illinois State	112
Iowa:.....	114
John Carroll	120
Johnson County	124
Kansas:	125
Kansas State.....	133
Kentucky	139
Lewis and Clark.....	145
Liberty	150
Louisville	156
Loyola Marymount.....	160
Macalester.....	161
Mary Washington.....	162
Mercer	163
Methodist	167
Miami ??	169
Mich-Dearborn	170
Michigan:.....	172
Michigan State.....	183
MTSU.....	193
Navy	197
Northern Illinois	199
Northern Iowa.....	200
North Texas	203
Northwestern.....	208
NYU	215
Oregon.....	216
Pace	217
Penn State	221
Pepperdine	222
Pittsburgh.....	224
Redlands.....	226

Richmond.....	227
Rochester.....	228
Samford.....	229
San Diego State	232
San Francisco State	233
Santa Clara.....	235
Seattle.....	236
South Carolina	237
Southeast Louisiana	240
Southern California	241
Southern Illinois	247
Southwest Missouri State.....	249
Texas	253
Trinity.....	265
UMKC.....	266
UPS.....	272
Utah.....	277
UT Dallas.....	278
UT San Antonio.....	281
Vermont	282
Wake Forest	287
Wayne State	289
Weber State.....	293
Western Washington	295
West Georgia	299
West Virginia.....	306
Whitman.....	309
William Jewell.....	311
Wichita State.....	313
Wyoming.....	315

Alabama

WILLIAM JEWELL

ALABAMA GP

Against Wayne State BW (Syria):
-Clinton-NTR
-Case Turns
-TIO's
-Advocate: HAASS 12/99

ALABAMA PJ

Against Baylor BT (Cuba):
-Grand Negotiator
-Investment
-Latin American Democracy
-Case Turns

WAKE

Alabama

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 5
Team: Alabama CL
vs.: Baylor CT
Case: Cuba
Judge: Berube, David-South Carolina
1NC Off-Case Arguments
Coral Reef Destruction
Drug Cooperation
Sustainable Development
Latin American Democracy
--Sanchez Business Economics 7/1/99 "replaced...by increasing transparency"
--Holmes www.heritage.org/library/categories/forpol/cbrief14.html 9/6/99
--democracy good-Yahya Myth of Global Chaos, 98 p. 93

Import Dumping

Juragua
Economic Development = Arms Race-O pluels 97
MNCs decrease biodiversity

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

2NC kicks:
Sustainable development
Drug war coop
Juragua

2NR goes for:

Latin American democracy
Case argument-MNCs repressive

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 7
Team: Alabama CP
vs.: Catholic LP
Aff case (country): Syria
Judge: Slusher
1NC Off-Case Arguments
Inflation-exports puts pressure on wages

Negotiator-diplomatic cred arg
CP-just give desal tech

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Case turns:

PP not inevitable-Barak and Syria won't keep their word on Golan. Terrorist strikes will increase
Succession turns
Palestinian state=war
Etc, etc, etc

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1

Team: Alabama LC

vs.: Boston College LF

Aff case (country): Cuba

Judge: Kerr

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Organic Farming:

Organic farming solving cuban food crisis/lifting the embargo leads to chemical intensive agriculture and food imports
Greenwire Feb 24, 1998 "but the organic shift"

Cuba inevitably evolve into sustainable dev't model solving world hunger, env't, health
Jeff Bump, May 8, 1997, Capital Times "A common perception of Cuba"

Reefs:

Cuban isolation and lack of tourists have preserved Cuban waters and unique species key to solving cancer and other immune system diseases

Sally Swartz, June 6, 1999, Palm Beach Post "Saved by its isolation"

Latin American Democracy:

LA consolidating now

Sanchez, 7/1/99, Business economics, "either by a succession of dictators"

Lifting embargo ensures collapse of LA democracies

Kim Holmes, <http://www.heritage.org/library/categories/forpol/cbrief14.html>

Democracy leads to transparency and wars

Solingen 98

Drug War:

U.S.-Cuba coop limited to case by case information exchange

Farah, International Herald Tribune, May 26, 1999 "From our point of view"

Reconciliation of ideological differences precedes cooperation on drug war

McCaffrey '99

Counternarcotics assistance leads to military overstretch and destroys readiness

Taw and Vicks '97, Strategic Appraisal: Strategy and defense planning for the 21st century, p206

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Case takeouts:

MNCs increase repression

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3

Team: Alabama CL

vs.: Kansas EM

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge:

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Feminism

a.) Gender blind policies reproduce gender domination through silence

Sandra Whitworth, Feminism and International Relations 1994, pg 75

b.) Recognizing Gendered nature of security necessary for reconceptualizing security and generating alternatives
V. Spike Peterson, Gendered States, 1992, pg 32

Androcentrism of IF makes it impossible to understand the world
Peterson and True The Man Question in International Relations '98 p20\

c.) Implications

1. turns case - they don't solve for security but increases insecurities by ignoring gendered nature and androcratic state of foreign policy
2. Undercuts assumptions - If the critique is true, then all of the assumptions of the case are flawed and the plan cannot overcome the barriers to plan solvency based on gendered insecurities
3. Critique solves - Validating the critique through the ballot allows a reconceptualization of security assistance that is superior and avoids perpetuating patriarchy. Vote for the best world view

Additional links read on case:

International economic power excludes women and minorities
Tickner 96, (J Ann, The Return of Culture and Identity to IR Theory, p 159)

Policy solutions rely on faulty texts; misinterpret world
Shapiro 89 (Michael, International/Intertextual Relations p 20)

Masculine power misrepresents security
Peterson '92

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Big Feminism

Answers to No link:

Gender blind IR continues masculine dominance
Peterson and Runyan 93, (V. Spike, Anne Sisson, Global Gender Issues, p41)

Blindness to presence of gendered discourse in national security thinking cripples deliberation about war and peace
Cohn 93 (Carol, Gendering War Talk, p 242)

Excluding gender from International relations perpetuates female invisibility
Halliday '91 (Fred, Gender and International Relations, p 159)

Alabama

School: Alabama
Team(s): Carroll & Lamberth / Pfister & Gordon

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Clinton
Economy Disads

CUBA:
INC Strategy

Drug War Bad
Red Spread
Caribbean Economy
Case Turns

IRAQ:
INC Strategy

Oil Price Disad (usually a Saudi Arabia impact scenario)
Military Modernization
Transition Arguments
Israel Disad

IRAN:

INC Strategy

Oil Price Disad (usually a Saudi Arabia impact scenario)

Military Modernization

Khatami Credibility

Israel Disad

NORTH KOREA:

INC Strategy

Big Case Debate: Appeasement Turns, Status Quo Solves, Consultation Disads

Abilene Christian

BAYLOR

Baylor jr. division

Abilene Christian's responses to the Iraq 1AC

Off case

Globalism DA

Resource depletion and "violent reaction" were the impacts

Russia

Russia would see the plan (DU stuff) as spreading into its sphere of influence

This would cause a nationalist uprising and new Cold/hot War

Topicality: CE = "hands off"

Topicality: our engagement is conditional (on UN approval)

Humanitarian critique

Sympathy with televised suffering is fleeting and desensitizing

Not a voter, just a takeout of the moral imperative

On case

O4F solves

It's Saddam's fault

Death count are flawed

CE takes a long time (to change regimes)

Sanctions are most moral (card from Helms)

Prolif turns

UCO

ACU MP (IRAQ)

OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:

- Russia - Sphere of influence link
- Nationalism impact
- US pursuing economic Hegemony
- Lifting Sanctions allows US business Penetration
- Leads to resource depletion and economic/social deviation
- UN/CP - independent of USFG, UN engages Iraq by lifting all sanctions and introducing a strategic dialogue

Allegheny

KINGS

Allegheny College RS
Against Navy BJ

Disads: multilateral agreement on investment - lift sanctions = passage
Globalization - sanctions cause self-reliance

CP: lift all sanctions but Juragua

Arkansas State

WILLIAM JEWELL

ARKANSAS STATE TW

Against Miami PB (North Korea):

- MNC's: Moral obligation to prevent MNC's human rights abuses.
- Culture: Consumerism kills cultures.
- Threat construction on case.

UCO

ARK-ST LI

OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:

- Vagueness T
- Trade-Law kritik (Frank Garcia '99, Brooklyn Journal of International Law volume 51)
- MAI - Staples '98

BREAKDOWN OF THE BLOCK:

2NC

1NR

NEGATIVE TRICKS

2NR POSITIONS:

ARK/ACU PP

OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:

- Petras kritik (James Petras, The left Strikes Back:the class Conflict in Latin America in the Age of Neoliberalism, 99)
- Rice DA
- Solvency Dump

BREAKDOWN OF THE BLOCK:

2NC

1NR

NEGATIVE TRICKS

2NR POSITIONS:

Arizona State

UCO

ASU AK

OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:

- Russia - Liven '99, LA Times 10/22-99
- China - Washington Times 9/11/99
- The Progressive 11/99
- Russia/China CP
- Clinton UN Dues - International Herald Tribune 11/99
- Case Cards

BREAKDOWN OF THE BLOCK:

2NC

- Russia

- CP

1NR

- Case

- China

NEGATIVE TRICKS

- Card on Russia is not a turn it is a stronger link because plan is rigged outcome, it is a slap in the face

2NR POSITIONS:

- Case cards

HARVARD

Tournament: Harvard

Judge: Alex Speier

Jess/Charles v. ASU MS

Iraq

1NC off case

T

Clinton—UN Dues

Appeasement (Negotiator)--credibility

Gause CP

Economy

1NC case

O4F good

Saddam bad

Prolif

Pesticides bad

Realism good

A Spanos card

2NR

Economy and case turns

SOUTH CAROLINA

ASU AK

-T remove

-T immediate

-cons. = conditional

-C/P lift all sanctions

-famine/SQ solves

Arizona State Univeristy MS

-Case Turns

Army

KINGS

U.S. Military Academy - West Point BH

Against: Catholic OP

T Violations; adopt = textbook.

Disads: labor market.

CP: None.

Other good arguments: Good? - Foucault/Language K (t.c.)

Cites: Hering '98, Foucault, Mead '92.

U.S. Military Academy - West Point BP

Against Catholic LS:

T Viol:

Disads: Clinton : CTBT impacts, economic bubble: demand - push inflation, overreaction.

Appeasement: const. Eng. à appeasement à appeasement = genocide and war

CP: none:

Other good arg's: morality/shunning, should not associate with bad folks, Aff responds Syria no longer terrorists

Cites: Tanter, Rogue Regimes: Terrorism & Prolif. P. 198, Simon, Tapped Out, '98 p47 ; The Times 10.12.98 "early civilization in Mesopotamia"; Toronto Star 7/25/99 "de Villius"; J Post 8/3/99 "Balad"; BBC Worldwide Monitoring 9/6/99/ "Syrian"; Haass W Post 7/27 "jeopardize competition"

U.S. Military Academy - West Point HM

Against Wayne St MJ:

Disads: growth, appeasement

Augustana IL

WILLIAM JEWELL

AUGUSTANA BV

Against Iowa HM (Iraq):

- Israel: Perception of stopping security guarantees.
- Oil: Price collapse leads to Saudi problems.
- Islam Kritik: Specific to just war paradigm conflicts.
- Topicality: Constructive engagement is a 4-fold policy.

WAKE

Augustana (IL)

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1

Team: Augustana BV

vs.: Catholic DuWi

Aff case (country): Syria

Judge: Palczewski, Cate - UNI

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

T - just lifting from terrorism list not lifting all Ec Sancs

Clinton - China WTO, relations impact

USA Today, 11/16/99 "heavily lobbied fight"

Kuttler, Jerusalem Post, 6/21/95 - "likely have a much harder time"

St Louis Post-Dispatch 11/16/99 "extreme oscillation"

Israel DA - aff leads Israel to doubt US, decreases relations, causes war

Inbar, Midstream, Nov/Dec 98

Lipson, US-Israeli relations at the Crossroads, 97

CP - lift import/export

Case takeouts -

Beres, Connecticut Jrnl of Int Law, Summer 99

Barron, Journal of Commerce, 3/31/99

Saffer, Rivers of Fire, 99

Fujiwara, Daily Yomuiiri, 6/13/99 - "succession has already been assured"

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Goes for Clinton and case takeouts

Augustana (IL)

School: Augustana

Team(s): BV

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Fast Globalization

Financial Sanctions CP-Seldon '99

CUBA:

INC Strategy:

Shunning

a. Castro violates freedoms

b. Must Shun

c. Must Reject Evil

Clinton

Vagueness

- a. Must specify which sanctions lift.
- b. Kills ground, --> advocacy shift
- c. Voter

CP - not lift sanctions against Castro, solves case while avoiding shunning

Negative Block

Everything extended.

Strategy in Rebuttals

CP and Shunning

UNI:

Clinton

CTBT good

Shunning

-moral imperative to shun

Topicality

-engagement is hands off policy, not interference in domestic politics

-extra topicality

-constructive engagement = political reform

Financial Sanctions counter-plan

Seldon, 1999

Fast Globalization

Bakersfield

WESTERN WASHINGTON

Tournament: Western Washington University Round:1 Aff: Whitman BC Neg: Bakersfield PW

Offcase:

CP: Lift food and medicine sanctions

Asymmetrical Threat DA (Castro will use bioweapons)

Latin American Democracy (Amazon war impact)

T: Constructive engagement is more than lifting sanctions

Coral Reefs

Case arguments:

Prostitution

Lopez on transition

Castro responsible for economy

2NR:

Prostitution T/

Latin American democracy

CP

LONG BEACH

Long Beach sr. division

Bakersfield's response to the Iraq IAC

Off-case

Radical Coalition DA

Lifting sanctions scares Syria and Iran

Leads to WMD

CP

Fund the Iraqi National Congress

Net benefits: topples Saddam

We have a moral obligation to fund the opposition

Nation State Critique

We legitimize the nation state and don't recognize the coalition

This leads to coercion and state violence (possibly a borders link as well)

Israeli occupation of Lebanon

Somehow we affect the UN's rejection of the Israeli occupation of Lebanon. That leads to civil war. I'm sorry, I don't remember exactly what/which way their story goes

On-case

It's Saddam's fault

Morality is not absolute

It's morally repugnant to help Saddam

Consequentialism is key

We increase Saddam's control/hurt the opposition

Prolif/Lashout turns

Sparks Iran-Iraq war

USC

Negative Positions

Cartography- Kritik of Borders

Negative Positions:

Nation State concept bad

Gender problems w/ heg. Impact

Negative Positions

Dialogue CP
Give up nukes CP
Israel insecurity
Case Press

LEWIS & CLARK

Lewis and Clark
Round 4
Whitman BS (Aff.) v. CSU Bakersfield
Corneiller

INC arguments:

* Backlash --

A. The Plan leads to CANF Backlash, Schaub '99

B. Backlash leads to U.S.-Cuban War, Dominguez '97 (Journal of Interamerican Studies and World Affairs, fall)

* Latin American Fascism --

A. Maintaining embargo demonstrates U.S. commitment to democracy, Gonzalez and Nuccio '99 (RAND Forum on Cuba)

B. Democracy to peace and stability, Moaz '97 (International Security, p. 181)

* Shunning (Standard stuff)

* Counterplan Text: CSU-B will test the opportunity cost of the affirmative with the following dispositional counter-plan: Congress will enforce sections 502B of the Foreign Assistance Act of 1951. Foreign assistance will not be provided to any country who commits gross violations of internationally recognized human rights. Assistance will be conditioned on improvements of the country's human rights record.

(No solvency cards were read. The counter-plan was never leveraged.)

*Case args:

1. No food crisis, Radu, Orbis, Fall '98

2. U.S. not to blame, Newman '97, CNN, 1/n ('direct result' w/15 'discredited Communist economic model')

3. Juragua exaggerated, Robinson, 15 Febuary 1998, <http://www.cdi.org/adm/transcripts> 11/23

4. The plan leads to repression, Juan Lopez, Cuban Studies, 28F1751.c8x

5. T/ Lifting allows Castro delay, Purcell, Foreign Affairs, '96, p. 161

6. T/ solidifies Castro's regime, Gonzalez '96 (Cuba: Clearing Perilous Waters? p.83)

7. Constructive Engagement doesn't change Castro, Burton '98 ('Engagement as not brought about democratic reform in Communist China')

8. Falcott '95 "so called 'kindness' didn't kill communism"

9. Holmes '95 "Because of Castro's hostility"

2NR: Case and Shuning

Whitman CG (Iraq) vs. Bakersfield PW

Blame saddam

prolif

Lebanon/Israel da on case

agriculture double bind

CP- USFG will fund the INC as per the Iraq Liberation Act, w/ \$97 million worth of lethal & non-lethal military aid and training. The US will also provide air cover to secure the revolutionary entrance into Iraq and to secure any subsequent land liberated from saddam's regime. The US will also impose and strictly impose the no fly zone. the us will establish a Radio Free Iraq station. US will consult with all relevant and regional/international actors before implementing the cp.

Russia Relations DA

Baylor

WILLIAM JEWELL

BAYLOR BL

Against Michigan MS (Cuba):

- Topicality: Ability to reimpose sanctions is not "removal" and is not "constructive engagement".
- Agent specificity (vagueness)
- Terror list credibility
- Sanctions credibility/ alternative to military action
- Case: Sustainable Agriculture; MIA.

WAKE

Baylor

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 6

Team: Baylor CT

vs.: Concordia KT

Aff case (country): Syria

Judge: McBride

INC Off-Case Arguments

CP-do all of the plan but don't lift economic sanctions - cross-apply the 1AC Starr and Fred evidence for solvency

Appeasement DA: Henriksen 99

Securitization Kritik: Michael Dillon, Politics of Security, 1996

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 6

Team: Baylor KS

vs.: Cornell

Aff case (country): All of them

INC Off-Case Arguments

Extra T

CP: Lift all sanctions except for those on Iran

Khatami Disad w/ feminism impacts

Development Kritik

Narrative turns and IR Feminism answers on-case

Round: 1

Team: Baylor BM

vs.: Cornell WW

Aff case (country): Cuba

Judge: Tilley, Michael - Liberty

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

CP - same as Aff plan but "except all sanctions that stop the building of Juragua" - net benefit reactor

Rice DA -

C. lifting embargo crowds out SEAsia, who export to Cuba now - USA Rice Fed, 5-7-98 - congressional testimony

D. exports key to SEA econs - LA Times 3-26-99

Pesticides DA -

C. embargo means Cuba not use pesticides, their farming modeled throughout LA - Gannett News 9-15-99

D. Pesticide Flood Bad - water pollution (UCLA journal of Env Law, 94 - vol 13, 167

Development Kritik - Seabrook 93, Victims in Development, pg 8, pg 248

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
Becomes discourse key debate

Baylor

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1

Team: Baylor BM

vs.: Cornell WW

Aff case (country): Cuba

Judge: Tilley, Michael - Liberty

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

CP - same as Aff plan but "except all sanctions that stop the building of Juragua" - net benefit reactor

Rice DA -

A. lifting embargo crowds out SEAsia, who export to Cuba now - USA Rice Fed, 5-7-98 - congressional testimony

B. exports key to SEA econs - LA Times 3-26-99

Pesticides DA -

A. embargo means Cuba not use pesticides, their farming modeled throughout LA - Gannett News 9-15-99

B. Pesticide Flood Bad - water pollution (UCLA journal of Env Law, 94 - vol 13, 167

Development Kritik - Seabrook 93, Victims in Development, pg 8, pg 248

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Becomes discourse key debate

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 2

Team: Baylor BL

vs.: Augustana BV

Aff case (country): North Korea

Judge: Siver

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Presidential Powers Counterplan:

The president, will through all necessary channels implement the mandates of the affirmative plan and the judiciary, if necessary will expediate an resolutional disputes

Obv 2- Now is the key time to take back pres powers

Presidential action in opposition to congress causes an SOP debate forced into the judiciary

Odonnell, Cincinnati Law Review, 1975

Courts uphold presidential power, key to leadership

Rostour, The American Journal of Law, 1989

Strong president key to hedge and nuclear conflict

NPT Credibility

2000 NPT convention - now key time for credibility

M2 Presswire, 10/13/99

NK refuses to coop w/IAEA

M2 Presswire, 11/16/99

Firm enforcement key to credibility

Graham, Nuclear Science Bulletin 2/1/98

Without NPT credibility nuclear anarchy

Sanctions Credibility

Cred of sanctions in increasing

Washington Post 5/1/99

Reciprocity and grad approach = cred

NK negotiations maintain cred
USA engage, 99

Lift Sanctions crushes sanctions credibility

T immediate

Immediate not in text of plan

Case

Prolif adv

1. Solvency based on threat - NK just using brinkmanship
2. Japan
 - a. NK threat remains hostile vs Japan, Japan remils
 - b. Japan remil causes fear destabilization of NEAsia
3. Power Vacuum
 - a. decrease NK threat causes decrease US forward presence
 - b. massive arms race
4. Protectionism
 - a. no NK threat causes trade wars w/Japan --> pism
 - b. pism --> nuke war
5. SK relations
 - a. decreased NK threat decreases US/SK relations
 - b. US/SK relations key to hedge vs China
6. NMD
 - a. visible NK threat key to NMD
 - b. NMD solves Nuclear war throughout the globe
7. Solvency evidence doesn't mention new agreement

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Went for Pres Powers in 2NR

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 2

Team: Baylor KS

vs.: Alabama CL

Aff case (country): Cuba

Judge: Melinda Hightower

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Juragua: same old, same old

Post Humanism:

a.) The gaze of Instrumental Rationality. The case is confined in the modernist nexus - claims of truth are really claims of power used to frame the world in a way that allows the definers of discourse to dominate others.

Jim George Discourses of Global politics a critical (re)introduction to Interational relations, 1994 p 29-30

b.) Implications

1. Humanist foreign policy discourse produces and (re)produces the indissoluble relay of forces comprising the will to power, inexorably striving for colonial domination. Foreign policy "maps" - relying on claims of disinterested inquiry - only produce genocide

Spanos, 93

2. Solvency is a rigged game - the plan is just another moment in history of humanism. The Scientific technological lens shapes and (en)frames the problem and solution reducing the complexity of foreign policy to a chessboard. There is no warrant for the aff claims to solvency, inherency, or harms. Vote on presumption

3. Humanism relies on accommodation or exclusion - Refusing spontaneous consent to humanist hegemony is beginning of opposition - a new theory and practice

Spanos '93

Oil:

a.) The vienna agreement is maintaining a delicate balance
Sajid Rizvi, UPI, 8/31/99 "energy traders are hoping"

b.) Oil is Cuba's ace in the hole - engagement increase development of it
Andrew Zimbalist '94 Cuba and the Future pg 13-14

b.) stable oil revenues are necessary to stop wars throughout the middle east

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 4

Team: Baylor BM

vs.: Kansas State HZ

Aff case (country): Cuba - BIT

Judge: Delaughder

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

C/P -

Lift sanctions on health care & medical research, food and housing. Lift CDA for food/medical supplies, end the medical licensing requirement, lift shipping & port restrictions on those goods, remove restrictions on aid Cuba charity groups, all medical research restrictions waived (including fellowships and information exchanges)

NB:

Reactor

Transition

Baylor

School: Baylor

Team(s): BT

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

Agent Specification

Spanos - Solvency Impact

CUBA:

INC Strategy

- Topicality - Policy

- Sanctions Credibility DA

- Juragua DA

- Clinton-China-WTO DA - political capital - China UN good

- Dillon (Security) Kritik

- Case Takeouts

- Turns on Humanitarian Advantage

- Drug Solvency Answers

- Military Intervention Turns

Negative Block

2NC

- Case Arguments and Turns

- Topicality

1NR

- Dillon

- Sanctions Credibility (kicked)

- Clinton

Strategy in Rebuttals

2NR:

- Clinton

- Juragua

- Case Takeouts

UCO

BAYLOR CN

OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:

- China/WTO DA
- Solvency
- Advantage 1,2,3
- Juragua

BAYLOR TB (CUBA)

OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:

- Sanctions Credibility DA
- Case Takeouts
- Turns on Humanitarian
- Drug Solvency
- Juragua
- Military intervention Turns
- Clinton-China-WTO DA - political capital - China UN good
- Dillon (Security) Kritik
- Topicality - policy

BREAKDOWN OF THE BLOCK:

2NC

- Case Arguments and Turns
- Topicality
- 1NR
- Dillon
- Sanctions Credibility (kicked)
- Clinton

NEGATIVE TRICKS (NA)

2NR POSITIONS:

- Clinton
- Juragua
- Case Takeouts

UNI

Must Specify Agent of action

Kritiking focus on inevitable conflict

China rel d/a

- U.S./ China zero sum^Å cooperation good^Å solves lots of stuff
 - lifting North Korean sanctions = U.S. troop pullout = power vacuum,
- decreasing u.s./sino relations.

Topicality

- South Africa definition of constructive engagement
- lifting sanctions is not constructive engagement

Israel

- cooperation increasing in the status quo, Israel fear Iraq weapons buildup,
- endangering peace process and risking war.

OPEC

- SQ ok, lifting sanctions increases oil supply = OPEC instability^Å
- stable
oil necessary to check war in the Middle East

Japan d/a

Regime Credibility

WTO

Presidential Counter-plan

- President will implement the mandates of the affirmative plan,

through all

necessary actions under his authority

- JFI Report, 10-24-97

- O'Donnell, 1982, University of Cincinnati Law Review

- Rustow, The American Journal of International Law, 1989

- Cronin and Genovese, 1998, The Paradox of the American

Presidency

- Presidential powers good

- SOP

Sanction Credibility

- lifting sanctions decreases credibility of sanctions

Berkeley

USC

Negative Positions:

IMF CP
Shrimp DA
Tourism DA
Case Answers

WAKE

Berkeley

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 5

Team: Berkely HL

vs.: UMKC BC

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: Dan Davis

INC Off-Case Arguments

Agent Specification - good for reasons of process disad and counterplan ground

Feminism - 1AC as a starting point for discussion initiates a strictly masculine reading of IR perpetrating a masculine view of world politics - Zalewski 1994
- State-subject solutions will inevitably fail - Tickner '92

Clinton - WTO Agence France Presse 11/18/99
Journal of Commerce 11/16/99

Environment - IMF causes massive environmental destruction - George, The Debt Boomerang, pg. 1-2, 1992
- Extinction is the impact - Khor, The Case Against the Global Economy, 1996, pg. 59

Social Welfare - Ethical obligation to stop IMF induced genocide - George

Agriculture - IMF export strategy destroys local agriculture and food security- Budhoo, 50 Years is Enough: The Case against the World Bank and the IMF, 1994, pg. 20
- Local production averts massive hunger - Norberg-Hodge-International Forum on Globalization-Europe 1996, The Case against the Global Economy, pg. 402

North-South Tensions - IMF loans cause N/S tensions
N/S tension causes global war

C/P - do all plan, lift all economic sanctions "except section 202E of Iraq Sanctions Act " (prohibits IMF loans)

Advantage 1:

1. can't solve infrastructure/distribution
2. plan can't solve - will use weapons
3. lift sanctions leads to less humanitarian aid
4. Northern Iraq mortality rates dropping quickly
5. Sanctions will hinder Saddam's regime
6. Mortality rates decreasing now

Advantage 2:

1. lift sanctions leads to massive prolif - Cordesman '98
2. buildup turns humanitarian disaster - Cordesman '99
3. conflict with Iraq key to stable US hegemony in the middle east -
4. softline with Iraq kills US credibility
5. lift sanctions triggers offset oil prices

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

2NC goes for: Feminism (reads more Tickner evidence)

Agriculture

Social Welfare - IMF devastates the poor - Danburg '98, loans foster

Militarization, loan-induced debt causes war

North-South

Environment

1NR kicks Clinton

goes for agent specification and the counterplan - reads evidence that says terrorism list blocks IMF support for countries, and that IMF loans are foreign aid/economic sanctions

2NR kicks feminism

goes for counterplan, environment, social welfare, north south, and agriculture

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3

Team: Berkeley KS

vs.: Mercer KW

Case: North Korea

Judge: Stevenson, Ron-Wayne State

1NC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Clinton/WTO

Clinton needs capital to normalize relations with China, removing sanctions decreases his capital, this stops Chinese entry, stops world-wide financial crisis, depression = war

US/SK Relations

Failure to consult SK decreases relations with US, our security alliance w/SK is key to peace

Consult CP: Prior to the enactment of the aff plan, the USFG will engage in a binding consultation with the ROK to amend, alter, or remove any provisions except for those concerning IMF loans. These will not be removed.

--CP Solves Relations-Phillips 97 Heritage Foundation

--IMF=Backlash-O'Driscoll 99 Heritage Foundation

Spatial Exc. Kritik as read in round one

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Went for Spatial Exc. Kritik

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 4

Team: Berkeley HL

vs.: Emory CR

Aff case (country): Cuba

Judge: D. Hung

1NC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Topicality CE - seeks to change behavior of target nation - Whittaker LR - must pressure or make judgement, preserves meaning of CE, key to generic neg strategies

Shrimp (Pink Gold)

- profit motive ensures over-fishing inevitable once sanctions lifted - Joyce March 99, Canadian Geographer March "enter the fishery"

- cornerstone of food chain - causes it to collapse - Sawhill July 91- USA Today

Tourism

- plan causes tenfold increase in tourism - Gilderbloom June 98, Planning "more heavily on tourism"

- causes child prostitution - Lewiston Morning Tribune 6-14-99 "one major drawback"

- wholesale slavery - Caveole 93

Pesticides

- shift back to dangerous pesticides - Collier 2-12-98, San Francisco Chronicle "if the embargo is loosened"

- destroys survival - Michael Milburn Sept 96, Nature Canada "Our Stolen Future"

- other links - Copa 1-18-99, Deutsche Presse-Agentur 1-18-99 "faced with the need to increase" - Gannett News Service 9-15-99

"chemicals largely are unavailable" - M2 Presswire 9-23-98 "imported inputs"

CP

- will grant waivers except for prohibition of pesticide exports

- solves case and prevents pesticide DA

MORALITY

- lifting sanctions causes Juragua, kills millions of Cubans, Americans - Gaffney 98
- causes liberalization - Khalizad 98
- embargo not deny Cubans food or medicine - Gaffney 98
- evaluate consequences - Bok 88
- Western scientific medicine based on "objective" myths, silences voices - Andrews and Cunningham 97, Western Medicine as Contested Knowledge
- medical imperialism causes use of military force - used as justification for military intervention

WTO

- causes security competition and war - Copeland Spring 96, International Security
- globalization and financial assistance causes nationalist extremism and war - Korten 98, Globalizing Civil Society p.19-20
- free trade causes over-consumption and ecocide - 96
- free trade destroys democracy - Korten
- democratic pluralism only way to resolve social, environmental, political crisis - Korten
- causes rich-poor gap distinctions to increase - Korten 98
- rich-poor gap causes global revolution - Goldsmith 96, The Case Against the Global Economy
- free trade causes global food scarcity - food under control of MNCs - Lehman 96, The Case Against...
- causes global disease outbreaks - Mander 96, The Case Against...

TRANSITION

- lifting embargo crushes reform and human rights
- investments prove Castro not reform - Menendez 98
- engagement sets precedent - property rights violations okay
- property rights key to all business everywhere
- guarantees more oppression short-term and IMF loans and terrorism and military crackdown in the long-term - Shaluki 98
- can't stabilize transition - Shaluki 98
- Castro prevents transition to private sector - Shaluki 98

Berkeley

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1

Team: Berkeley KS

vs.: Case Western HM

Aff case (country): Syria

Judge: Bill Shanahan

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Russia:

US sanctions decreasing Russian Arms sales
AFP 7/22/99 "Russia complains the policy has deprived"

Russian-Syrian arms agreements threaten US/Russian relations
Foreign report 7/22/99 "Russia indicated that it might be willing"

US-Russia ties Solves Nationalism, Loose nukes, and Civil Warfare
Virginian Pilot 9/5/99 "Russia also remains a nuclear power"

Feminism:

Focus on Military security and Arab-Israel conflict entrenches gender oppression Sharoni '94

Link: The IAC as a starting point for discussion initiates a strictly masculine reading of IR prepertrating a masculine view of world politics

Zalewski, '94

Exposing the gender implications of foreign policy making brings down an illegitimate and fragile system. Local action is the real world and is the only alternative for constructive change
Enloe, 89

CP-

The USFG will work with Syria to solve water disputes as per the aff. Will clarify

Syria/IRAN-

Syrian/Israel peace agreements freaks out Iran because of Hezbollah ties
Washington Times 8/18/99 "Iran will want syria to know"

US/Syrian ties sever/Iran ties
Satloff, New republic, 8/16/99 "Severing of the Syria-Iran strategic"

Iran goes nuclear
Fawaz Gerges, America and Political Islam, 1999

Case args that were went for in the 2NR
1. Golan will withdrawl causes water wars
2. Plan hurts turkey relations
3. Plan causes troops in Golan
4. Israel withdrawl in Golan
5. They spatially define geopolitics - Dalby
6. Strategic depth turn
7. Regional security turn
8. Cold peace
9. Peace process doesn't solve ecosystem

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Berkeley

School: Berkeley
Team(s): HL

CUBA:
INC Strategy

proactive policy cp, clinton, exclude war on drugs, feminism

IRAQ:
INC Strategy

consult nato, feminism, saudi oil, clinton

IRAN:
INC Strategy

condition cp, khatami, clinton, consult nato, saudi
oil

NORTH KOREA:
INC Strategy

consult sk, clinton, exclude supercomputers, appeasement, japan

UNI:

Standpoint Feminism

Clinton
-CTBT
Spending

War on drugs bad

Topicality
-engagement = pressure

Delay counter-plan until after the CTBT vote, combined with drug
interdiction
Cooperation

South Korea relations

Consult South Korea Counter-plan

Boston College

WAKE

Boston College

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 2

Team: Boston College LF

vs.: Catholic OP

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: Palczewski, Cate - Northern Iowa

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Clinton - China WTO, key to solve NK

Washington Post Nov 16, 1999 - "cautious optimism"

Edwards 99 - Presidential Policymaking, pg 122

Laipson et al, ME Policy, Feb 99, pg 22

Sino-American Relations, Spring 1994 - pg 18

Kibl 97 - Peace and Security in NE Asia pg xiii

AT : food

Berger, Oct 20, 1999 - IHT "undistributed"

AT : prolif -

The Booklist, January 15, 1999 - pg 824 "Iraqi army"

Marty - ME Policy, 1998 - pg 1-24

Woosley 98 - frwebgate.access.gpo.gov/cgibin

S Hrng 1044-444

Greeley, Albany Times Union, 1-9-99

AT : militarism

IHT - 9-22-99

Cordesman, Iraq and the War on Sanctions, 1999

Gause, Foreign Affairs, 1999 - May/June

Byman, Washington Quarterly, Summer 1999

AT : poverty

Water shortage doesn't hurt crops

Washington Post, 6-28-99, pg A13

Clawson, Ethics and International Affairs, 93 - pg 17-37, vol 7

Murkowski, 99 - S Hearing, 106-86

Cordesman 99, Iraq and the War on Sanctions

Parasiliti, Iraqi Strategy Review, 98

Caspian oil DA - AFP 9/27/99 "Russian involvement"

NYT - 9/23/99, "Edgard Habib"

Premmer ,World Policy Journal, Spring, pg 10

Boston College

School: Boston College

Team(s): Lisa Langdon & Jared Fields

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

CLINTON (DEBT RELIEF, WTO, AGOA).

RUSSIA DA W/ A CP TO LIFT SECONDARY SANCTIONS

T - INCLUDING MEANS "AND ALSO"

CUBA:

INC Strategy

Juragua
Sustainable Agriculture
Case Turns

IRAQ:
INC Strategy

Military Modernization
Morality-Based foreign policy is bad
Sanctions are moral
Caspian Oil Trade-Off DA

IRAN:
INC Strategy

Khatami DA
Militarism Bad DA

SYRIA:
INC Strategy

Russia DA
Lots of Peace Process Take-Outs

NORTH KOREA:
INC Strategy

Status Quo Solves
Solvency Turns, Depending on the Solvency Mechanism - Consultation, Concessions, Multilateralism, South Korea, Japan, etc.

KINGS

Boston College BK
Against: Catholic WD

T Violations: None.

Disas: Russian nationalism, Clinton, WTO

Cal State LA

LONG BEACH

Keola Whittaker/Brian Ward

Affirmative Round Report

Aff Case: Iran Neg Team: Cal State LA KS **Tournament** Long Beach **Round 3 Judge** Scott Elliott

INC Off Case Positions:

Globalism K

Bosphorus DA

T CE

INC Case Arguments:

Khatami turns

2NR:

Globalism

USC

USC jr. division

Cal State LA's answers to the Iraq Aff

Off-case

5 components T

Bosporous Straits turn

Plan increases Russian oil production

That oil gets shipped through the Bosporous

An accident in the Bosporous is worse than a Nuclear Bomb

Globalism (on both the critique and the DA level)

CP

Do the plan, but impose the Tobin Tax on all US ventures in Iraq

2NR

Globalism + CP

Cal st LA

Negative Positions

T-5 requirements for CE

CP-plan plus Tobin(Tubin?) tax

Kritik of Globalism

Case Turns

Tobin Tax solves everything in world and brings Christ to earth

Case Western

WAKE

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 2

Team: Case Western HM

vs.: Emory NR

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge:

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Clinton Tawain Security Act

Uniq: 10/3/99

Shunning

Beverly, 89

Russia:

a.) Uniq - Russia markets are recovering from the Asian economic collapse solely on the backs of high oil prices

The Times of London July 17, 1999 "Asia caught a cold and Russia came down"

b.) Empirically as the supply of worldwide oil is increased by the plan, prices will plummet

Energy Economist, June, 1996 "all this means that the impact on prices"

c.) High oil prices are key to all foreign investment in Russia

The Times of London July 17, 1999

CP - Tribunal/ I N C

The negative offers the following dispositional counterplan. The United Nations will indict Saddam Hussein, and others, for war crimes and crimes against humanity via an international tribunal. Additionally, the US will fully fund the Iraqi National Congress and assist them with training and supplies to overthrow Saddam Hussein's regime. Literature will serve to clarify intent.

Mutually exclusive because you can not indict Saddam and engage him, b/c the sanctions are key to the success of the INC and because sanctions are key to stigmatization of Saddam Hussein.

a.) The EYE-NC now has the infrastructure to deal with Saddam, they are being trained

Pickering, Nov 1, 1999

b.) Internal and external sources prove that Iraq will transition to a better regime

Pickering, "The recovery of Iraq" Nov 1, 1999 <http://www.usia.gov/regional/nea/gulfsec/pick1101.htm>

c.) We must have a war crimes tribunal now or the momentum will be lost

Brownback Oct 29, 1999 <http://www.usia.gov/regional/nea/gulfsec/bback101.htm>

d.) Only a war crimes court can stigmatize Hussein's regime for his immoral acts

Scheffer Oct 29, 1999 <http://www.usia.gov/regional/nea/gulfsec/schel101.htm>

Case Args:

WMD Turns

War Debt turns

Both from Cordesman '98

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

2NR went for CP, shunning, war debt turn, and harms takeouts

Case Western

School: Case Western

Team(s): McQuaid and Habig

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

Generic off case strategy

Clinton--- WTO, UN dues, or TSEA-with political capital links

Inflation/economy
Shunning
SOP
Russia relations

Arguments Extended in the Negative Block (New Link Stories, Cites, Time Allocation, etc)
We rarely run CP, and usually go for 2-3 off and case in the block...don't kritik very often

Neg Strategy in Rebuttals (key arguments, tricks, things they kick out of)
Very straight up, usually case turns and a Da in the 2nr

CUBA:
INC Strategy
Generic off case strategy with drugs and transition turns on case

IRAQ:
INC Strategy
Generic strategy plus russian oil and case debate

IRAN:
INC Strategy
Case debate and strategy from above, Caucasus and Afghanistan DA's

SYRIA:
INC Strategy
Lots of case and the same generic off, Caucasus DA (Turkey isolated by the plan leads to an Armenia-AZERBIJAN war

NORTH KOREA:
INC Strategy
Case, China relations and the rest of the generic strategy from above

Catholic University

WAKE

Catholic

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 6

Team: Catholic DuWi

vs.: Southwest Missouri VP

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: Strange

1NC Off-Case Arguments

T-CE: plan not mandate engagement

Appeasement DA: softline hurts sanctions credibility - generic rogues impact

Oil Prices DA: Saudi civil war impact

Clinton-China WTO DA:

Solvency Answers:

-dual use transfer causes WMD

-IMF kills economic reform

-terrorism

-human rights violations (Kurds)

-vaccines cause worse viruses

-prolif

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 4

Team: Catholic LP

vs.: George Mason AH

Aff case (country): North Korea

Judge: Berube

1NC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

T - Implementation specification required for Constructive Engagement

Clinton - NTR

Uniqueness

[Financial Times "done deal" 11/16/99]

Link

[Daily Yomiuri 10/14/99 "rewarding North Korea"]

I/L

[BBC 10/7/99]

Impact

[Janes 8/1/99 "nuclear holocaust"]

Inflation

New Shock

[Newsweek 11/22/99]

Spending = link

[Business Week 7/5/99 p21]

Impact

[Mead]

Japan Freakout

Uniqueness

[Washington Times 10/19/99 "supporting sunshine"]

Link

[AFP 11/2/99 "Japan is the slowest(?)"]

Impact

[Russian Press Digest 10/12/99 "depend on US, Russia, Japan & China"]

Kim Election

[Financial Times 10/20/99]

[www.foreignrelations.org/public/pubs/NkoreaTask.html]

[Korean Herald 10/9/99 "political football"]

C/P - Plan except for unfreezing assets
[Eizenstat, FDCH 10/28/99 "blocking assets sign economic sanctions tool" ??]
[Rothleng, Duke Journal of Comparative Law Fall 97]

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
Went for the C/P
1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 4
Team: Catholic LS
vs.: Cornell WW
Case: Cuba
Judge: Hester-West Georgia
INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)
Juragua on case

Sanctions Softline
Uniqueness: Sanctions are a tool of American diplomacy in SQ-Hendriksen
www-hoover.stanford.edu
Link: Concessions make US look weak and that snowballs-same site
Impact: Diplomatic credibility is key to containing rogue regimes-same site

IMF
1. sanctions block IMF loans-Wpost 98
2. IMF kills internal reforms which hurt economy worse-Bryan Johnson 5-6-97

Petras Kritik
A. Neo-Liberalist ideology seeks economic exploitatoin of Latin America-James Petras The Left Strikes Back 99
B. Plan embraces neo-liberation and exploitation of Cuba-Petras
C. US Trade Policy is the means by which neo-liberalism is exported and enforced-Petras
D. Neo-liberalism leads to authoritarian violence, corruption of civil society-Petras
E. Implications-voting neg disrupts hegemony of neo-liberalism

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3
Team: Catholic OP
vs.: Emporia MS
Aff case (country): Cuba
Judge: Berube
INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

T - vagueness
T - CE - open snaring (kick both in block)

Stop civilian revolution
A. smooth transition now - Calgary Herald, 10/1/99
B. revolt - economist, 1/17/98
C. impact - suarez, 99 - www.fiu.edu/~fcf/embargo - "peaceful transition"

US Heg bad
A. impolarity increasing - Statesman, 7/9/99
B. unil sancs = ally resentment - FNS, 5/27/99 - "resentment among allies", Electronic Industries testimony
C. Cuba decreases US political position - Pisano, Tulane journal int law, spring 98
D. Nuclear war - Gultze, International Security - Spring 97

Juragua
A. insuff capital - Cox News, 5/21/99
B. increasing embargo increasing investment - Amvill Security Policy 99 - www.securitypolicy.org
C. radiation - 50-80 million

Catholic

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1
Team: Catholic OP
vs.: Baylor KS

Aff case (country): Iran

Judge: Jim Brey

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Sanctions Softline:

Concessions, like lifting sanctions, makes the US look weak - this perception snowballs

Henriksen, 1999 <http://www-hoover.stanford.edu/publications/epp/94/94b.html>

Diplomatic credibility is key to containing rogue regimes - their ability and history of WMD prolif makes them a huge int'l threat

Henriksen, 1999

Taiwan:

a.) Uniq/brink - China is poised to attack Taiwan and Washington is failing to recognize the danger

Foreign affairs, oct 11, 1999 "in the eyes of PRC leaders"

b.) US apathy towards China is encouraging aggression and we can't appease china any more

Worldnet Daily, July 21, 1999 Ignoring the Chinese threat , "What should bother Americans however"

c.) China using ties with NK to diminish US heg. We can't empower them by lifting sanctions

Worldnet Daily, July 21, 1999

Oil DA -

ON case:

Khatami answers:

1. uniqueness - Reformers will win

2. T/F - no talks till post election

3. Link turn - no CE kills Khatami Financial Times

4. N/U - Conservatives attack post election - stop elections

Solvency:

1. turn: terrorism

2. no economic reform

3. turn: prolif

4. turn: backlash

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Oil and Khatami turns

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1

Team: Catholic SM

vs.: Baylor BL

Aff case (country): IRAN

Judge: Jake Weiner

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Clinton WTO

Financial Times 11/16/99

St. Louis Dispatch 11/16/99

Conable and Companion '93

Rice:

Asia Today 10/99

Softline:

Hen Riksen '99 <http://www-hoover.stanford.edu/publications/epp/94/94b.html>

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 2

Team: Catholic LP

vs.: Cornell SD

Aff case (country): Cuba

Judge: Krueger, Mike - MTSU

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

T - policy

T - economic and trade sanctions distinct

Clinton - WTO

Sanctions softline bad

Thailand - rice

IMF bad on case

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Kicked Clinton, rice
Went for sanctions softline, IMF
1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 2
Team: Catholic LS
vs.: Cornell KC
Aff case (country): all five countries - feminism
Judge: Fitzmier, Dan - Emory
INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Petras Kritik - Petras 98

IMF - Washington Post, July 12, 1998
Johnson, Heritage Foundation, 5/6/99

CP - do all plan mechanism except sanctions on IMF

Extra T - they change all FP to feminism, not just on 5 countries

T - immediate - they revisualize feminism before they lift sanctions

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Went for CP with IMF DA net benefit and kritik.

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 2
Team: Catholic WiDu
vs.: Concordia KT
Aff case (country): Syria
Judge: Robertson, Steve - Fullerton
INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)
Spanos - Heidegger and Criticism 93

Clinton WTO - Financial Times 11-16-99
St. Louis Dispatch - 11-16-99
Conable and Lampton - Foreign Affairs, Dec/Jan 93

T - Policy - Bulloch 83
Charles - Public Policy in the Eighties, pg 3
Also runs IMF CP
Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
Spanos

Catholic

School: Catholic
Team(s): DuWi, SL, CP, DrWa

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):
Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

Inflation Rates

A. Greenspan will raise rates
B. Plan decreases prices, prevents rate hike
C. Rate hike helps the economy
D. Bad economy --> War

Sanctions Softline
A. We're Hard on rogues now - sanction them now
B. Lifting sanctions makes us look soft on rogues
C. Causes prolif and War

IMF Turn on Case

- A. Plan --> IMF loans
- B. IMF loans hurt the economy
- C. IMF loans = imperialist

CUBA:

INC Strategy

Juragua Turn

Tobacco - plan increases cigar smoking in the US, hurts health

Lifting sanctions helps Castro

IRAQ:

INC Strategy

WMD prolif

Lashout

Oil prices

School: Catholic

Team(s): DuWi, SL, CP, DrWa

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

Inflation Rates

- E. Greenspan will raise rates
- F. Plan decreases prices, prevents rate hike
- G. Rate hike helps the economy
- H. Bad economy --> War

Sanctions Softline

D. We're Hardline on rogues - sanction them now

E. Lifting sanctions makes us look soft on rogues

F. Causes prolif and War

IMF Turn on Case

- D. Plan --> IMF loans
- E. IMF loans hurt the economy
- F. IMF loans = imperialist

Clinton (Debt Relief, UN Dues, Foreign Aid, Columbian Aid)

Hegemony

Globalization

Feminsim

Spanos

Spectacle

South Korea Politics D/A

CUBA:

INC Strategy

Juragua Turn

Tobacco - plan increases cigar smoking in the US, hurts health

Lifting sanctions helps Castro

IRAQ:

INC Strategy

WMD prolif

Lashout

Oil prices

IRAN:
INC Strategy

Khatami

KINGS

Catholic University DW
Against Duquesne BS:
Disads: economy DA, our morality of not supporting communism
Healthcare, Juragua

Catholic University FP
T Viol: Consultation = fiat abuse

Disads: Japan, Hegemony, Shunning

CP : reimpose sanctions and end CE
Nuke prolif good on case

Catholic University DW

Against Pitt CD:
T - V: CE = just lift sanctions hand off

Disads: WTO good (Clinton good), hegemony bad
Against: Army BH

T Violations: Constructive engagement = "hands off"
Trade sanctions not = econ. sanctions

Disads: Clinton - wto/China
U.S. HEG - multipolarity now, Constructive engagement =
increase HEG

CP:

Other good arguments: Castro will be a bad boy. Cuba needs \$ to complete
Juragua power plant. Helma Burton blocks tech and \$ = prevents meltdown.
Lifting sanctions = Neo - liberalism. Petvas, 99; Left strikes back.

Cites: Tanter, 98, Rague Regimes. Statesman, 1999. Goltz press and
Sapolsky, 97.

Catholic University ??
Against Rochester ??:
T - Viol: just removing sanctions not CE

Disads: economy - new market (Cuba) = increased investment = increased int'l
rates = market crash = global war

Other good arg's: nuke reactor: not built, will not be built, H-B Act
prevents any outside \$

Catholic University OP
Against Trinity CW:
Disads: Russia, hegemony, Clinton

Catholic University FW
Against Allegeny PS:
T Violations:

Disads: Inflation à plan increase access to foreign markets, increase
inflation = war, sanctions good damp.

Catholic University WD

Against NYU GG:

T - V: Extra T- dealevt is not CE

Disads: Clinton - WTO/China, Shunning

CP: dealert and put sanctions back on NK

Chicago

UNI:

Topicality

-constructive engagement takes place on 4 fronts^Â Business,
Government, Diplomatic, and _____? _____

Fund the Iraqi National Congress counter-plan

-they will win
-Saddam is bad ? violates human rights and wants weapons of mass
destruction

Claim that Iraq sanctions are not key to poverty

Chico

WILLIAM JEWELL

CHICO/SJSU CR

Against Kentucky BW (Iraq):
Russia/China/India Coalesce DA
NATO DA
CP: Exclude infant formula (Baumslag and Michels 1999).

UCO

CHICO HB (CUBA - 1. FOOD AND GENOCIDE 2. MORALITY 3. WTO COLLAPSE)

OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:

Fem IR:

- Johnson '97 - snowball from one action
- Tinkner '92 - uphold core values of SQ
- Spretnak '89 - each rejection fades patriarchy
- Sisson-Russon and Peterson '93 - must reject selfrepeating system
- Hoagland '88 - separation = alternative. Participation supports the system
- Bender '88 - Failure to kritik patriarchy reconstitutes it
- Sylvester '94 - Debate is the site for change

Solvency

- Plan won't pass
- Uncritical endorsement of the Status Quo
- Debate as policy is bad

BREAKDOWN OF THE BLOCK:

2NC

- Takes 1-14 of the 1AC

1NR

- Takes 15-22 and Solvency

NEGATIVE TRICKS - Only go for Fem IR in the block

2NR POSITIONS:

- Fem IR

CHICO KA (UNKNOWN)

OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:

- India, China, Russia Alliance - Marshall '99
- Inflation - Hagar (Financial Times '99) & Mead impact
- Bio-regionalism - purchase, Chamslay, Boockin, Sale
- Fem IR - Tinkner, Perterson, Sisson Russon, Webber

BREAKDOWN OF THE BLOCK:

2NC

- Bio-regionalism & Alliance

1NR

- Fem IR & Solvency

NEGATIVE TRICKS

- NA

2NR POSITIONS:

- Bio-regionalism usually

CHICO MR (UNKNOWN)

OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:

- T - constructively engage
- T - adopt

- Plan Vagueness
- Three's a crowd D/A
- CP - do plan minus infant formula
- Solvency
- Clinton D/A
 - BREAKDOWN OF THE BLOCK:
 - 2NC
- CP
- Clinton D/A
- Solvency
 - 1NR
- Solvency
- T - constructively engage
- Three's a crowd
 - NEGATIVE TRICKS
 - 2NR POSITIONS:
- Solvency
- Three's a crowd
- CP

LEWIS & CLARK

Whitman CG (iraq) vs. Chico MH

food divert

WTO on case (good we stop)

Saddam diverts

deon. = moral blinders

Russis relations (affirmative hurts)

T- adopt = use somebody else

T- CE= impose new, constructive sanctions

CP- The us will secede it self as appointed international role keeper and enforcer of the law of the father to Japan, and will give up the last word in global affairs. (Consult Japan on the passage of the plan and future policy decisions.)

Japan Relations

Concordia

WAKE

Concordia

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1

Team: Concordia KN

vs.: Alabama GP

Aff case (country): CUBA

Judge: Kelley Skillin

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Spanos

T Constructive Engagement

Constructive engagement must include opening up barriers, encouraging international involvement, and establishing formal links

G. John Ikenberry, July 12 '98, LA times "constructive engagement"

Clinton WTO

a.) Wto likely to pass congress due to Clinton's lobbying, but it will be a tough fight
International Herald Tribune, 11/17/99 "it's going to take an awful lot of work"

b.) Presidential influence finite - pushing plan trades off with WTO
George Edwards and Dan Wood, June 99, American Political Science review p. 328

c.) WTO deal could save US-Sino relations unless congress strikes down
Scripps-Howard News Service, 11/17/99 "Clinton will have to persuade congress"

Case args:

Hegemony Turns

Prolif Turns

Lifting embargo causes repression after transition

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1

Team: Concordia KT

vs.: Cornell MM

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: Tate, Tara - North Texas

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

T - can't lift UN sanctions b/c UN not in topic

Clinton - WTO - Herald Tribune 11/17/97 - congress not pass WTO (99 date maybe?)

President has finite capital - woods and edwards 94

Relations impact

Hegemony

Sanctions key to US power

Decreased power = lashout - NYE 90

Heg ends all life - Chase and Podick 96

Oil- Russian economy running on oil

Lifting sanctions collapses

Collapse of R economy = war

Case turns - plan = prolif

T/o - diversion, enough food now

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Block - Clinton, heg, oil, case

2NR - Heg, case turns on prolif

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3

Team: Concordia KT

vs.: Harvard CR

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: N. Smith

1NC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

- WTO

- Russian Oil

- Hegemony - (Trick) - link is we (US gov't) feel weak after lifting sanctions, so we start up a good ol' hegemonic war or two

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Spend too much time on aff's bad morality claims and undercover DA

Concordia

School: Concordia

Team(s): All

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Topicality

Military sanctions are economic sanctions

All/Nearly all

Mediation

Oil

Shunning

Spanos

Normativity

Clinton

Exports->Inflation

Hegemony Good

Hegemony Bad

US sanctions Make US feel Good

Lifting sanctions Causes War

Hegemonic War Ends All Life

Prolif

Rogue Appeasement-Loss of US Credibility = Proliferation

Conditional Sanction removal CPs

UNI:

Hegemony Bad

-U.S. leadership role is necessary

-sanctions against Iraq makes the United States feel good

-no sanctions = war

-Hegemonic war ends all life

Hegemony Good

-decreasing sanctions = decreasing hegemony ? heg solves war

Normativity

Clinton

- WTO will pass in the Status quo
- Plan is unpopular
- political capital is key
- WTO is key to U.S. Sino relations

Case debate vs. Cuba

- sanctions good
- Castro bad- not the united states
- lifting sanctions = increased immigration to the United States

Shunning

Proliferation Credibility

- engaging a nation which is proliferating decreases U.S. Credibility, causing world wide proliferation

Cornell

WAKE

Cornell

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1

Team: Cornell KC

vs.: Baylor CT

Aff case (country): Cuba

Judge: Krueger

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Development Kritik

A. 1. Plan uses traditional development discourse by defining Cuba in "negative" terms - Carmen, Autonomous Development: Humanizing the Landscape, 1996

2. Defines Cubans as powerless, only used to justify intervention - Carmen, 1996

3. Discourse colonizes the mind, holistic approach only way to solve root causes of problems - Carmen 1996

4. Uses economics of survival, preventing people from being fulfilled - Carmen, 1996

5. Constructive Engagement is premised on superior/inferior - Vidanovich, 1998

[<http://focusweb.org.focus/pd/sec/Altsec2/vidanovich.html>]

B. 1. Development policies threaten our very survival - Carmen, 1996

C. 1. Discourse only real world impact - Hajer, 1995 Politics of Environment Discourse

Free-Logging DA

A. Will negotiate free-logging at WTO meeting - The Statesman, 10-23-99 "pressing for new negotiations"

B. Economic Sanctions disrupt trade agenda - Foreign Affairs, Sept/Oct, 1999 "abuse of economic sanctions to achieve"

C. Free-Logging --> deforestation - Rainforest Action Network, 10-1-99 "elimination of tariffs would increase consumption"

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Went for Kritik

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1

Team: Cornell SD

vs.: Emory HH

Aff case (country): Cuba

Judge: Wiese

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Development kritik

Portray Cuba as victim = no long-term solvency - Carmen 96

Case turns

Sustainable ag good

IMF loans bad

Globalization

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

All args in 2NR

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 2

Team: Cornell MM

vs.: Berkeley HL

Aff case (country): Iran

Judge: Dutcher, Mike - Catholic

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

extragovernmental CP - same text but the US government will promote intergovernmental contacts with Iran - Teeder, Atlanta Journal and Constitution, Jan 13th, 98

Clinton - WTO

Development discourse kritik - Development Humanizing the Landscape : an excursion into Radical Thinking and practice - Rattcom

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Goes for development kritik and globalization discourse bad

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 2

Team: Cornell WW

vs.: Concordia KM

Aff case (country): Syria

Judge: Tate, Tara - North Texas

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Globalization

WTO / Free logging

Development Kritik

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Development discourse

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3

Team: Cornell MM

vs.: Michigan Dearborn HR

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: Beito

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Extra T/plan vagueness

Racism

a. western attitudes toward prolifer based on colonialism and racist domination, Roche 88

b. only way to end prolifer is to embrace political and ethical narrative of demonized rogue states, Perkovich, Nuclear Prolif, 98

CP

Text: USFG adopt policy of CE w/ Iraq including immediate removal of all sanctions and immediately stop bombing. The U.S. will also pursue a policy of managed prolifer toward Iraq

--Dual-use sanctions are oppressive, flounders 11/99

New nuke weapons lack safety--> war, Gizewski, 99

Managed prolifer, not paternalistic non-prolif, is necessary for elimination of prolifer, perkovich 98

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Go for racism and cp

On racism they claim in neg block that we must deconstruct the threat before rushing into action against "rogue states" Mueller 99

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3

Team: Cornell WW

vs.: Liberty AF

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: Von Berg

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Development Kritik - Carmen '96

WTO - free logging

Lifting sanctions gives US leverage to pass free logging clause in WTO. This leads to more logging and destruction of biodiversity - biological extinction

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Development Discourse

Cornell

School: Cornell

Team(s): CK

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

Feminist International Relations Kritik

Development Kritik

Sometimes the following disadvantages as examples of the Kritik:

MAI, Free-logging, Globalization, IMF loans

School: Cornell

Team(s): MM, SD, WW

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

Political Process DA of the week

Globalization

Clinton -

Kritik of "development"

MAI, free-logging, IMF loans

ICC CP - Int'l Criminal Court will bring criminals to justice. US will accept ICC jurisdiction. - causes global peace

- must be a permanent fixture = deterrence

- ICC needed to stop terrorism

cp to lift all sanctions

Shunning

Military Sanctions racist.

K - US Attitudes towards proliferation are colonialist

CUBA:

INC Strategy

Juragua

Sustainable Agriculture

Pesticides

Castro's evil

IRAQ:

INC Strategy

MAI

Clinton

Russia

Caspian Sea Oil

Lifting sanctions increases proliferation

IRAN:

INC Strategy

ICC CP

MAI

Clinton

Colonialism Kritik in 2NC

Racism Kritik of Military Sanctions

Khatami is strong now

Lifting sanctions spurs proliferation

Transition Turns

NORTH KOREA:
INC Strategy

Lift All Sanctions CP
Prolif turns
Racism Kritik

KINGS

Cornell University BW
Against Liberty MN:

Disads: MAI, Russia, Clinton, Caspian Sea oil

Other good arg's: Case turn, lifting sanctions increases proliferation

Cornell University DS
Against Liberty BJ:

Disads: Clinton, Corporate Rule: MAI will not pass now, plan helps US-Eu relations, militarism = war

CP: Int'l Criminal Court will bring criminals to justice = global peace must be a permanent fixture = deterrence, ICC needed to stop terrorism

Other good arg's: Colonialism: critique in 2NC - US attitudes toward proliferation = colonialism, plan doesn't lift military
Sanctions = racism

Cornell University DW
Against Catholic PO:
T Violations:

Disads: 1. Clinton - political capital (WTO)
2. MAI

CP: none

Other good arg's: 1. Oil for food
2. morality aspect à extreme

cites: none

Dartmouth

DARTMOUTH

Iowa Dartmouth Repko

Kritik of using absolute morals (the jist is that we should not have moral systems that declare us not responsible for massive suffering that occurs - see their 1AC in previous round for cites), Inspections bad, Clinton - NTR, case take outs

Michigan Dartmouth Heidt

Dartmouth's negative strategy:

Large topicality / abuse violation that consisted of:

- adopt a policy - the aff must have a definite course of action
- A spec - the affirmative does not specify their agent
- sanctions specification - the affirmative does not specify what "nearly all" sanctions constitutes
- CE can't include other actors

Shomber Sabbas K

Governmental Policy Decisions and Discourses on Security Take Crises as Separate and Distinct, Obscuring the Complex Nature of Reality, Legitimizing the Power of The State, and Ensuring Perpetual Conflict

Edelman 1-11-98 Society

"The various issues with which governments..."

State pronouncements and political decisions become an excuse for political apathy of individuals

Edelman

"A common consequence..."

Failure to redeem our moral capacity eliminates all safeguards against cruelty. No matter how unrealistic, we must try to remoralize human space.

Bauman, '95 Life in Fragments: Essays in Postmodern Morality

Reject the logic of immediacy entailed in their harms claims to create thinking space and the possibility for true change

George '94, Discourses in Global Politics, p. 32-3

E-Prime Argument

English Language Structure Dooms Both the Solvency of the Plan and the Future of the planet for several reasons. The plan text entrenches the worst aspects of this structure

A. The Earth Moves - so should our language. Is-english entrenches false assumptions because it imposes a static map on a dynamic world and encourages the psychological crippling passive voice - E-prime, by contrast, transforms our thinking

Kellog Winter 1991 ET Cetera p.399

B. Thus, Their Approach to problem-solving entrenches stasis - legal language shapes outcomes and cultural interpretations of laws

Eastman, Yale Law Journal, Jan. 1995

"The consequences of thin lawyers speech are twofold..."

E-Prime breaks down the psychological process of identification that enables these classification system and causes people to stop dissassociating themselves, as radically separate subjects, from the world

Kaparo, Risa, Summer 1992. P. 188

C. Implications

1. Vote for us to reject their plan and endorse our counterplan as a first step in the escape from is-english, and vote to endorse our greater rhetorical performance of e - prime.

Each step toward total elimination of "to be" benefits all of us - individuals must act

Kellog p. 315

2. The two-valued aristotellian value system emerges from our language structure and will doom the planet - e-prime provides a vital escape from this totalizing identity system and encourages creative problem solving

Kellog, p. 377

CP - do the CP but don't use the verb "to be"

USC

Negative Positions:

Cuba

CP- all plan except no alternative energy

Warming turns=netbenefits, SO2, CO2

Appeasement

CE Topicality- not all forms

Terrorist List DA

Interest Rates

Dartmouth BG: Berger and Garren

Negative Positions:

Streamline CP

Clinton WTO

Prolif DA

Realism

T lift is not constructive engagement

State Centrism Kritik

Sustainable Agriculture DA

WAKE

Dartmouth

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 5

Team: Dartmouth BG

vs.: Emory HEMA

Aff case (country): Cuba

INC Off-Case Arguments

Shomer Shabas Kritik

Juragua

Clinton WTO

Sustainable Ag

A. Cuba moving to Sustainable Ag - Boston Globe, 11/9/97

B. Worldwide model

C. Mass starvation and survival

CP - lift extraterritorial - solves WTO advantage

AT: morality

1. utility and morality are not mutually exclusive

2. absolutist claims kills other rights, Glenden, Rights Talk, 1991

3. as a policymaker you are responsible for consequences

4. morality = arbitrary - China thinks that we violate human rights and the US thinks that China violates human rights

AT: transition

1. evidence is outdated

2. US citizens can send food and medicine, Chicago Sun Times, 10/8/99 "food, medical supplies and humanitarian"

3. Lifting embargo does not allow cuba to get food and medicine, no cash to buy it with

4. Humanitarian groups send Cuba food and medicine, Portes, May-June 1998, American Prospect

5. Cuba's economy is changing and improving, Pickel, Communist and Post-Communist Studies, 31:1, 1998

6. Social conflict not likely

7. Castro will still hate the US

8. Castro not going away, Wisconsin State J., July, 1999 "Ramirez points out that Cuba has survived the embargo and is beginning to thrive"
 9. Cuba = dealing - too fast = bad, pickel, 1998
 10. T/ lifting embargo --> civil war
 11. Neoliberalism ensures economic contraction and poverty x,x
 12. US inability = chance for reform x,x
 13. T/ gradual key to stop civil war, x,x
 Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
 Block kicks Clinton, sustainable ag
 Spend most of 2NC turning civil war
 More cites on transition than Dartmouth Reads - Monthly Review, April 1996 - Monthly Review 3/97

1NR reads terror talk to answer memories terror turn on Juragua
 Livingston, The Terrorism Spectacle, 1994, p.27 and p. 6
 Dobkin, Tales of Terror, 1992, p.104

Links for shomer shabas (not explicit in the 1NC, but Alex says that they are dropped)
 1. crisis
 2. state
 3. margins of social interaction
 4. immediacy - independent voter - don't vote for immediate plans - should think about it first

2NR goes for transition turns

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 6
 Team: Dartmouth GS
 vs.: George Mason
 Case: North Korea
 Judge: Hayman, Jethro-Cornell
 1NC Off-Case Arguments
 Politics Disad
 A. Kim Dae Jung focusing on economic reform-Koh www.stanford.edu/group/aparc/publications/papers/koh.htm 99
 B. US-DPRK military-military contacts undermine Kim Dae-Jong-Ahn Korea-United States Economic Relationship, Fred Bergsten 97
 C. Economic R/F Scenario
 1. Economic reforms will be a tough political fight-Kim Dae Jung must conserve all his political capital for reform battles-Park, Asian Survey, Jan 98
 2. Continued reform drive is critical to prevent economic downturn-Korea Times 10/24/99
 3. South Korean Economy Drives World Growth-The Straits Times, Sept. 15 99

Solvency
 1. Turn-ROK Civil Military Relations
 a. Plan undermines relations-Cheon, www.cmc.scandia.gov/issues/papers Ap. 99
 b. This spurs military interference in politics, ie a coup-Koh see above
 2. Turn-Momentum and Timing
 a. Military focus causes negotiation deadlock-must avoid sensitive issues-Cheon
 b. Timing is key to inter-Korean peace-the plan locks in non-cooperation-the aff eats the full weight of their economic engagement
 solvency-Heppell Peace and Security in Northeast Asia 97
 3. Turn-Lashout-military focus reinforces North Korean strategic uncertainty which sparks a pre-emptive war-Yang, Korea and World Affairs, Summer 99
 4. Turn-Troop Withdrawal
 a. NK will use military forum to push the US to withdraw its troops-Niksche Korea and World Affairs Spring 95
 b. NK is a tough negotiator-they will get their way-the plan gives them a new forum-Kim, Vantage Point, Sept. 99
 c. Troop withdrawal causes Northeast Asian arms race, power competition, and war!-Ahn 98
 d. Impact-Sino-Japanese War! Roy, East Asian Security, Ed. Brown, 96
 e. Causes Nuclear War-Garrity, <http://carlisle-www.mil/usawc/Parameters/1995/garrity.htm> 95
 5. Empirically military cooperation fails-no advantage to the aff-Vannoni and Man-Kwon, www.cmc.scandia.gov/issues/papers/970583/index.html August 97
 6. Sovereignty blocks North Korean participation-Vannoni and Man-Kwon
 7. Plan proposed and rejected-Kim, Korea and World Affairs, Spring 99

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 6
 Team: Dartmouth RT
 vs.: Emory HH
 Case: Cuba
 Judge: DeLaughder, Ken--Emporia
 1NC Off-Case Arguments

Clinton
Sustainable Development
Juragua

T: Plan doesn't specify immediate
A. Interpretation-plan must specify an immediate and definite action
1. plan must require immediate immediate action
2. plan must be definite course of action
B. Plan violates
C. Affirmative interpretation unreasonable
Failure to specify immediate = moving target
Even our asking is not enough
Core neg ground is destroyed

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
Went for Topicality

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 7
Team: Dartmouth LS
vs.: Georgia PQ
Case: North Korea
Judge: Kahl, Collin-Michigan
INC Off-Case Arguments
CP-remove all sanctions but conditions removal on weapons
Non-Topical: not immediate
Mutually Exclusive
Net Beneficial
Perms would not contain topical action
Any perm would be a severance perm-moving target, time allocation
Deny legitimate negative ground
CP solves-North Korea would agree to full removal even with conditions AFP 99

Clinton
Congress Pass WTO-Hong Kong Standard 99
Republicans oppose softline on NK-99
Chinese entrance into WTO key to US-Sino Relations-Xinhua News 99
US-Sino ties key avoiding war-

Terrorist List
Unique link: Sanctions key to credibility of terrorist list Foley 99
Terrorism threatens democracies-86

Gender
A. Politics is gendered. Removes feminist perspectives. Steanes Gender and International Relations 98
B. We advocate the kritik any perms must be written out
C. Harms don't justify the plan. Only ongoing examination of gender solves.

Appeasement
Ulink-Worldwide signal-Hendriksen 99
Impact-Rogue appeasement causes WMD and conflict world wide-Hendriksen 99

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
Kicked Appeasement in 2NC
Kicked Clinton in 2NC
Gender in 1NR
Kritik kicked in 2NR
Went for:
Counterplan
KEDO
Missile Test
Appeasement
1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 7
Team: Dartmouth BG
vs.: Northwestern PS

Aff case (country): North Korea

Judge: Dan Davis

INC Off-Case Arguments

Kritik INC:

We must move away from focus on the state and focus on power strategies at the margins of social interaction, Hunt, Law and Social Inquiry, 1992

Technological obedience undermines true change, George

Clinton-WTO:

Congress will pass WTO in the status quo - all out effort key

Congress wants strings attached - they won't back the plan

Controversial foreign policy drains political capital, hurts agenda [Pastor 91]

Failure of China WTO causes war [IHT]

ROK Alliance DA:

A) US-South Korea alliance strong now

B) Plan undermines alliance - behind the scenes deal

C) Alliance collapse causes prolif and Asian war

D) Spurs North Korean invasion

Consult South Korea CP:

Dartmouth

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1

Team: Dartmouth LS

vs.: Catholic LS

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: The Green Machine

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Clinton - WTO - plan is unpopular with Congress - they backlash and don't let China into the WTO - destroys relations causing war

Terrorist Credibility - plan lifts sanctions, undermines terrorist credibility and causes war

INC Link - Phillips 98 www.heritage.org/issues

INC Impact - Aaron 86

Block Links - Freeh 2-4-99, FNS

US Dept of State 5-8-95

Carter, Deutch, Zelikov 98, Foreign Affairs

Ganor 98, www.ict.org.il/articles

Block Impacts - Allsion 8-23-95, Y4.F76/2.S.hrg.104-253

Oil for Food Reform CP

Text - The USFG will amend the OFF program to remove caps on export levels, while maintaining the escrow account capture mechanism. The program will streamline the approval process for orders and eliminate any remaining restrictions on money spent for redeveloping Iraq's power generation, water purification and sewage treatment as well as health care sector investment.

Existing oil production will be eliminated. No investment in new production will be allowed. The US will provide necessary access to animal vaccines, with emergency provision as necessary to combat livestock disease. The US will coordinate stepped-up enforcement of anti-smuggling efforts of Iraqi oil. Will clarify intent.

Food Answers

- Lies and calories increasing - AFP 99, Cordesman 99

Morality Answers

- Protect Kurds - Lopez 99

- Turn/ Key to international law - Damrosch 94

Solvency Answers

- Diversion - Cordesman 99

- Miscalculation - Parasilti 98

- Aggression - Cordesman 99

- Sanctions key to inspections - Melby 98

- Prolif - Cordesman 99

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

They went for everything. No tricks.

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 2

Team: Dartmouth BG

vs.: Fort Hays HR

Aff case (country): Cuba

Judge: O'Donnell, Tim - Mary Washington

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

(Note : Dartmouth maintains that they usually don't run this strategy unless you run a narrative)

Topicality - you don't meet any words in the resolution.

A. policy is course of action

policy is both objectives and means of accomplishment

CE is changing behavior through ties

Nation-state = legal and state actor

Resolved means enacted

Including operationally defined as lifting sanctions

B. violation - narrative doesn't support

C. 1. Limits topic

2. plan text key to debate

3. crushes our ground - DA based on nation state

4. opening space proves - fem IR is neg ground, Aff can use to support neg

D. voter

Rereads their narrative

Kritik of Resolution

1. diplomacy uses realist logic - Bergess 92

2. displaces agency by defining self as government - Jordon 94

3. must move away from juridical power - Hunt 92

4. reality unstable construct - IR theory bad - they try to fit narrative within IR theory - George 94

5. res says immediate - that locks us into stable world, assumes we can know without political bias - George 94

6. unsure

7. claims of knowing through common power bad - Ransom 97

8. acts of liberation assume unified view of subject - George 94

9. discourse of community empowerment = oppression - Winter 94

10. opposition to discursive practices fail - misunderstand power - Ransom 97

11. turns labeling - excludes other topic countries, says Cubans most important - Shapiro 97

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Kritik and T in block

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3

Team: Dartmouth LS

vs.: Lewis and Clark HS

Aff case (country): Iran

Judge: Dan Davis

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Clinton - WTO Hongkong Stnd 1/17/99, Gerges '99, Xinhua News Agency 11/19/99

Terrorist List Credibility Foley '98, Phillips '98

Khatami elections NYT 11/4/99, Clausen '98, Nathan '98

Prolif and Oil Takeouts:

NYT 11/19/99

Skolsky '99

Decreased economy = no expansion

Hale '98

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Khatami

Clinton

Takeouts to the Caspian adv.

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 4

Team: Dartmouth BG

vs.: Michigan MD

Aff case (country): North Korea

Judge: Josh Hoe

1NC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Shomber Shabas Shell

A. governmental policy decisions and discourses on security take crises as separate and distinct, obscuring the complex nature of reality, legitimizing the power of the state, and ensuring perpetual conflict

Edelman, Society, 1-11-98, l/n - "The various issues with which governments deal are highly interrelated in the contemporary world,"

B. vote neg

1. We must move away from a focus on juridical, state based models of power and focus instead on power at the margins of social interaction

Hunt, Law and Social Inquiry, 1992

2. Reject the logic of immediacy entailed in their harms claims to create thinking space and the possibility for true change

George, Discourses in Global Politics: A critical (Re)introduction to International Relations, 1994, p.32-33

SK

A. US/SK alliance strong

B. Plan undermines alliance - behind the scenes deal

C. --> prolif

D. --> NK invasion

CP - Consult SK

I. Mutually Exclusive - prior consultation - gives a veto

II. Not topical - not immediate - not topical = legitimate PIC

III. A. consultation key

B. allied miscalculation

Clinton

A. congress will pass WTO

B. 1. Congress wants strings - not bow to Clinton's wishes

2. drains political capital - spills over

C. --> War - Int'l Herald Tribune, 11/99

AT: Inherency

1. fuel shipments on time

2. reactor is being built

3. Asian nations fully funding KEDO

4. Berlin deal = meaningful deal

5. SQ solves brinksmanship

AT: famine

1. collapse --> inward focus

2. fear of collapse = outdated

3. bottom-up = unlikely

4. SQ solves

AT: brinksmanship/war

1. history proves NK will de-escalate the crisis

2. NK prevents escalation

3. History proves that the countries differentiate small from big conflict

4. NK nuclearization not change Balance of Power

5. Missile threat limited

6. Regime survival blocks adventurism

7. Domestic preoccupation blocks

8. No incentive for Japan to rearm

9. Japan will not revert to militarism

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

New 2nc/1nr links

Security rhetoric - ploy to make citizens docile

Language

Deflation of threats is a way to conceal the enemy creation

impacts

Security rhetoric ensures perpetual conflict - can't solve your harm

Kritik is an end in and of itself Jinks, Yale L. R. Nov. 1997 "manifesto describes the nature"

Kritik is tool of resistance - Jinks again

Kick Clinton in 2nc

2nr goes for consult CP and SK DA

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 4

Team: Dartmouth RT

vs.: Kansas State GS

Aff case (country): Cuba

Judge: Giroux

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

T-Constructive Engagement: the plan only "moves toward CE" - must have goal and means - "policy" = objective or means for actual implementation

Clinton-WTO: impact is regional wars, internal link is political capital

Juragua DA

Sustainable agriculture DA

Case: private individuals can send supplies; its immoral to ignore Castro's HR violations - effects of sanctions are his fault; sanctions prevent annihilation + evil - Gordon and Gordon 95; other countries solve; Title III+IV suspension solves; US drug companies cooperate with Cuba on medicines now; plan=political backlash; perpetuates Castro's regime; neo-liberalism turn - guarantees inequality; causes unrest, Cuba backlash

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Block goes for everything but sustainable agriculture. 2NR goes for Clinton, Juragua, Neo-liberalism/gradual reforms good turn, case takeouts

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 4

Team: Dartmouth GS

vs.: Georgia PQ

Case: North Korea

Judge: Smith, Nate-Northwestern

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Realism-one card by George '94

CP to consult SK-do plan but makes conditional on weapons

Brinkmanship Disad

Leverage Disad

Japan Disad

ROK Alliance

Uniqueness: US-SK alliance strong Koh www.stanford.edu/group/aparc/publications/papers/koh.htm 98

Link: Plan undermines alliance-Korea Economic Weekly Sept. 20 99

Impacts: Alliance will collapse causing prolif and Asian war-Ahn 98

www.stanford.edu/group/aparc/publications/papers/ahn.htm

Spurs war! Niksch 95 Korea and World Affairs Spring

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Went for the CP and ROK alliance disad

Also brinkmanship and some case stuff

Dartmouth

School: Dartmouth
Team(s): BG, GS, LS, RT

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):
Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

- Rigged Game Kritik (policy is a rigged game-- george, global politics: a critical (re)introduction to international relations, 94; state based solutions misrepresent power-- hunt, law and social inquiry, 92; realism justifies violence; policy advocacy forecloses thinking space)
- Shunning - with leadership impact
- Clinton (political capital link, in past UN impact, TSEA impact)
- T: CE means not interfering with the internal affairs of the country
- T: CE must be broad, not specific

CUBA:
INC Strategy
-Clinton Good (Link: Inter Press Service, 5-6-99)

- Health Advantage Ans:
- Immediate removal spurs Cuban backlash - Kavulich, 5-7-98 (FNS) "substantial and immediate change"
- Lack of investment spurs economic reform - Aronson, 3-25-99 (FDCH) "enterprise would have to be able to hire and fire"
- Only the free market can solve crisis - Travieso-Diaz, '98 (Berkeley Journal of Int'l Law) "essentially unanimous in predicting"
- Humanitarian aid bill solves - Kavulich (above)
- China sells to Cuba - Fernandez, '93 (Cuba's Ties to a Changing World)

IRAQ:
INC Strategy
-Reform Oil-for-food CP
The USFG will "amend" the oil for food program to remove caps on export levels, while maintaining escrow accounts capture mechanism. The program will streamline the approval process for orders, and eliminate any remaining restrictions on money spent for redeveloping Iraq's power generation, water purification and sewage treatment, as well as health sector investment. Limits on imports of spare parts, and investment in existing oil production will be eliminated. No investments in new production will be allowed. The US will provide necessary access to animal vaccines, with emergency provision as necessary to combat livestock disease. The US will coordinate stepped up enforcement of anti-smuggling efforts of Iraqi oil. Negative speeches will clarify intent.
-Clinton Good DA
-Proliferation/Military Modernization

Duquesne

KINGS

Duquesne University ??

Against Navy ??:

T - Viol: human rights impact, shunning, no problem with embargo

Disads: medical issues, drugs already coming in, Clinton must react, shunning bad

CP: medical issue resolved - \$ help from church, charities ; shunning does want states also, clinton looks weak in other peoples eyes

Other good arg's: not lift sanctions less refugees in US, personal experience seeing what happens

Cites: institute for the Centre for Security Policy , Walker and Gonzalez 1999

Emory

DARTMOUTH

Round 7

Aff neg judge

Mich State Emory Mancuso

MSU added a line to their plan that was something to the effect: The president can and will reimpose sanctions in the event of North Korean aggression / provocation. This was clarified in C-X as encompassing all the sanctions lifted by the plan and Berlin. Agression was clarified as an invasion of the South or the launching of a missile with a warhead...not a missile designed for satellite purposes.

Emory's INC Arguments

CP to signal to NK through high level talks that they must fulfill their obligations under the Agreed Framework. Larry was adamant in C-X that the CP was not a "conditioning" CP. There was an appeasement DA read with the counterplan that had both an NK invasion impact and a China-taiwan impact. Clinton DA w/ Peace Process Impact
SK elections DA w/ a fund KEDO Impact
Topicality "remove" = permanent / can't reimpose sanctions

Dartmouth (Iraq) Emory (neg)

1ac: slight plan change. The new plan reads:

Plan: The USFG will immediately remove nearly all comprehensive economic sanctions on Iraq, including but not limited to Sanctions on dual use products, and reverse its position in the UN to push for their immediate removal. This removal will not preclude the imposition of sanctions based on health safety, and other non-economic considerations. The US will gradually ease war reparations and debt requirements as advocated by Mahdi.
from their solvency contention:

Mahdi advocates "attempts to exchange debt reduction for a measure of domestic political openness a move towards accountable government, and economic and administrative reform."

The 1AC also has a few more war advantage cards in the underview.

1nc: inspections bad, clinton - ntr, oil - price decrease bad, t - must diplomatically recognize iraq

2nr: inspections & case take outs

Michigan (North Korea) Emory (neg)

1nc: appeasement (bides time for north to invade south & china tests us resolve on tiawan), Clinton - NTR, cp - does not lift sanctions, and signals to North Korea that the US will not make further concessions until North Korea cooperates with sunshine policy as per aff (this is not the exact texts, but it's the vibe of the cp), South Korea election da on the case, and standard case take outs

WILLIAM JEWELL

EMORY BG

Against New York BG (North Korea):

-Appeasement DA

-CP: Dealert US missiles but maintain sanctions.

EMORY CW

Against Wake Forest LS (Iran):

-Israel DA: peace process Palestine.

-Clinton: Syria/Israel.

-Hardline Backlash: Khatami vs. Khomeini.

-Gradual Sanctions Relief CP.

Against Weber MW (Iran):

- Israel
- Elections DA
- Clinton
- CP: Gradualism

EMORY GW

Against Texas BD (North Korea):

- South Korean elections
- Clinton: Peace Process
- CP: Just Demine

EMORY JR

Against Alabama PG (Cuba):

- Development: Stating "economy" in the 1AC = you lose.
- Drug cooperation.
- Juragua.
- Case dump.

USC

Emory CH: Chase and Hudak

Negative Positions:

- CP - give special envoy
- Genocide
- Oil
- Gender
- Aggression

Negative Positions:

- Spanos
- Russian Oil
- CP to condition plan on Iraq limiting nuclear program on one reactor.
- Prolif Turns and Moderation Turns

Negative Positions:

- CP - US lift sanctions, EU funds
- NTR DA
- Appeasement DA
- Spanos
- Syrian Succession DA

WAKE

Emory

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 5

Team: Emory HL

vs.: Michigan PS

Aff case (country): North Korea

Judge: Repko, Will - Michigan State

INC Off-Case Arguments

Appeasement DA

Trilateralism DA

Kritik - Campbell and spanos evidence. "Mikey's little brother"

CP - do the Perry plan. Text is in caselist update.

Inherency :

1. Status quo supports sunshine policy
 - A. Berlin deal strongly reinforces - Korea Times, 9/29/99 - "Even the opposition in Korea and its leader Lee"
 - B. Berlin = political victory for Kim Dae Jung - Financial Times, 9/20/99 - "Kim has been promoting a "sunshine" policy of economic co-operation"
 - C. Kim spins SQ US and International policy as boosting his sunshine policy - no need for plan - Korea Herald, 10/26/99 - "My engagement policy toward North Korea is being fully backed by"
2. No solvency for political opposition -
 - A. increased CBW threat decreases sunshine support - Newsweek, 10/25/99 - "The reckoning with the new chemical-weapons report has hardly"
 - B.
3. The Berlin deal kickstarted a gradual, long term process of normalization - Paik, 9-27-99, www.nautilus.org, "trust and confidence may emerge or be built up between enemies from reciprocation"
4. The current round of Berlin talks solves - the US and North Korea committed to high-level talks and liaison offices, the only question is when - Yonhap News agency, 11/18/99 (BBC Monitoring Asia Pacific) - "North Korea and the United States on Wednesday 17th November agreed to hold a higher-level"
5. Status quo talks solve the Aff - they will cover a gradual further lifting of sanctions, proving no solvency deficit to the counterplan - Korea Herald, 10/6/99 - "At their new round of meetings, Kim and Clinton will discuss preparations to open higher-level talks between the two countries"
6. North Korea will always stay at the table - historical review of its negotiating tactics proves carrots and sticks force cooperation - Asian Wall Street Journal, 10/21/99 - Barry Wain, "the mixed approach - carrots and sticks - is really the best way to go. You have to have inducements"

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

CP and case in 2NC

Kicks kritik in 1NR, goes for appeasement and trilateralism

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 5

Team: Emory BG

vs.: Texas SR

Case: Iraq

Judge: O'Donnell, Tim-Mary Washington

1NC Off-Case Arguments

COLLAPSE

- A. Sanctions collapse Iraqi regime
- B. Turns case: outweighs morality
- C. Impact
 1. Kurds-oppressed
 2. Many will die

WTO

- A. Clinton vote WTO-IT 11-17-99
- B. Crush Clinton's capital 99
- C. Winners might win, but punishment on next issue 93
- D. Lack WTO will allow Congress to revoke China's trade status Cohen 99
- E. Crushing US-Sino Relations = WAR!

OIL

- A. OPEC balancing prices-Financial Times 99
 - B. Lifting sanctions = collapse prices-94
 - C. Collapse of prices destroys oil for food which turns case
 - D. High prices key to Saudi Arabia-99
 - E. Economic decline and social collapse = war
- They will say: shocks before not bad but we say shocks are emp bad

RENEWABLE ENERGY

- A. Turn: Iraq moving toward renewables
- B. Renewable energy solves impact
- C. Solves global warming 93
- D. Extinction 98
- E. Causes War

RUSSIA

- A. Crushes Russian coop within UN 99
- B. Resolution of conflicts
- C. Global nuclear conflict 95

CP:

Do plan but condition on inspections

CP solves 99
Iraq key global nonprolif 99
1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 5
Team: Emory CR
vs.: Whitman CO
Aff case (country): Iraq
Judge: Sherry Hall - Harvard
INC Off-Case Arguments
T - CE is action in addition to lifting sanctions
2. Including means part of
3. With does not mean toward

T - Immediate must be in the plan for ground

Israel DA
A. US-Israel ties strong now
B. Making Israel feel insecure undermines concessions
C. Syria will invade the Golan

Clinton (see Emory HeMc for detailed cites, including search terms)
A. Clinton will get China into the WTO now, Int'l Herald Tribune, 11-17-99
B. Lifting sanctions crushes political capital
C. WTO key to global peace, The Record 1999

Oil
A. OPEC is balancing oil prices; maintaining discipline on the March quota is critical to allowing moderate production increases while avoiding a price free-fall, Financial Times, 11-17-99 "Opec's delicate balancing act"
B. Lifting sanctions causes increased Iraqi production, faster than OPEC can adjust, breaking OPEC discipline and collapsing the price structure, Alnasrawi, 1994, The Economy of Iraq, Contributions in Economics and Economic History p. 155-6
C. Low prices turn the case - less money into Oil-for-Food, Taylor, FDCH, 4-6-99 "While our knowledge about Iraq is limited"
D. Increasing production will collapse prices, destroying the Russian economy, The Independent, 7-31-99 "any rise in output would be suicidal"
E. Economic collapse causes civil nuclear war sucking in Europe and China, David, Foreign Affairs, Jan/Feb 1999 "At no time since the civil war of 1918"

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
They go for Oil and case take-outs.

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 6
Team: Emory HeMa
vs.: Kentucky JR
Aff case (country): Iran
Judge: Mike Ducher
INC Off-Case Arguments
Clinton WTO
A. will pass now
B. lift snctns = "political suicide" - J. Int'l Econ. L. 1998
C. blocks isolation and global wars

India/Pakistan
A. support is hardline against India/Pakistan Now
B. plan increases Pakistan aggression
C. most likely possibility for nuclear conflict

Peace Process
A. Palestine happy with SQ peace - Houston Chronicle, September 11, 1999
B. increase relations w/ iran decreases israeli security, ME Review of International Affairs, v2n4, 1998
D. palestine state inevitable - need a peace treaty to prevent it from causing a war -- delay BAD, Near East Report, July 26, 1999

CP - condition energy sanctions in exchange for Iran restricting nukes to just the Buscher project. Remaining sanctions will be lifted in a step-by-step fashion conditioned on Iran easing it's support for terrorism and it's opposition to the peace proces

Solvency Cites
Clawson, Survival, spring 1998, p. 40
Al- Suwaududi, Security Dialogue, vol. 27, 1996
Katz, SAIS Review, 1998

Eland, Peace and Security: the Next Generation, 1997
Cordesman and Hashim, Iran Dilemmas of Dual Containment, 1997, p. 320-22
Chubin and Green, Survival, Autumn 1998, p.156
Kemp, Transatlantic Tensions, 1999

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
1NR spends most time on Peace Process and one minute on India/Pakistan
not much time spent on case by either team
2NC spends most time on CP and a fair amount on Clinton
CP solves all of case and avoids Peace Process DA

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 6
Team: Emory JS
vs.: North Texas FH
Case: Iraq
Judge: Renegar, Val-Kansas
1NC Off-Case Arguments
Oil

Political Ontology

- A. Links: their problem solving approach naturalizes state violence and homogenizes people into manipulable nations and groups-campbell national deconstruction 98
- 2. pointing out threats legitimizes the state-the state must create violence to exist-campbell writing security 98
- B. Just because they're softline doesn't absolve them-their framework justifies and invites military domination-spans 90
- C. We win-this jacks their claims for harms and solvency and their explanation of the world-campbell 98

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 7
Team: Emory BG
vs.: Kansas State HZ
Aff case (country): Cuba
Judge: Danielle Weise
1NC Off-Case Arguments
WTO

- A. WTO will pass, b/c clinton is spending political capital
Int'l Herald Tribune, 11/17/99
- B. Plan will kill capital
Seattle Times, 10/15/98 "political cost" "adamantly opposed" "slight weakening"
- C. Political fallout from plan will require attention
- D. They will punish him on the next issue Mann, Beyond Gridlock, 1993, p.19
- E. Lack of permanent NTR will allow congress to revoke China's trade status
Cohen, lexis (emory did not think that it was important to give you more information, such as where it's from) "China had remarkable economic progress"
- F. --> new cold war
Chicago Tribune, 2/23/96

Red Spread

- A. democracy teetering
- B. resources to stop democracy in Latin America
- C. key stop genocide, mass murder, and war

sustainable ag

- A. shift to sustainable agriculture
Mittal, 10/6/99, www.foodfirst.org
- B. lifting embargo --> chemical use
Chaplowe, 1996, Food First Action Alert
- C. organic farming in cuba key to world
Institute for Food and Policy Development News and Views, Summer 1996, Vol. 18, No. 61
- D. solves global hunger
San Francisco Chronicle, 8/15/99

Juragua

- A. lack of financing blocks completion
- B. lift embargo --> completion and kills 80 million

CP - all plan, except reactor sanction

AT: Prostitution

1. no ev. How much they solve
2. impacts are not cuba specific
3. t/ tourism x,x
4. investment only helps Castro and his cronies x,x
5. investment cannot benefit
6. no ev. That econ. Growth trickles down

AT: food/medicine

1. no embargo on food and medicine
2. cuba has supplies
3. communism is responsible, not the embargo
4. provide drugs now
5. food and medicine will be lifted
6. t/ licenses block torture

AT: Transition

1. baseball diplomacy has resolved the problems
In these Times, May 16, 1999 "baseball game" "Cuban propaganda"
2. military blocks
Toward a New Cuba? Legacies of Revolution, 1997
3. castro's scapegoating is not believed
DeVarona, www.canfnet.org/canf-lib/embg_eng.txt
4. opposition leaders are killed

AT: Solvency

1. Constructive engagement fails
2. Embargo --> peaceful transition
3. Embargo helps hardliners
4. Castro will block investment and tourism from interacting w/ people
5. A. civil society key to transition
Falcoff, independent task force report: US-Cuban Relations in the 21st Century, 1999
www.foreignrelations.org/public/pubs/uscuba2.html
B. lifting embargo --> cash --> crush civil society
deVarona in 96 again
6. Castro will never accept the plan
Suchlicki, Journal of InterAmerican Studies and World Affairs, Summer 1993, p. 112
7. T/ bioweapons

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Block everything, except kick CP and reactor in 2NC

2NR goes for everything

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 7

Team: Emory HeMc

vs.: Michigan PS

Aff case (country): North Korea

Judge: Perkins - Harvard

INC Off-Case Arguments

Clinton - NTR status

- a) Clinton is pushing NTR status with China
- b) Conditional nature of the Berlin Talks shielded Clinton from Congressional opposition
- c) US NTR ratification key to prevent isolationism and war

South Asia

- a) US focusing on deterring Pakistan, they need all leverage
- b) US staked ground on enforcing sanctions on rogue states, the plan is appeasement
- c) Pakistan will perceive the plan as appeasement, causes aggression
- d) Pakistan aggression causes conflict

Trilateralism

- a) Japan, South Korea, and the US agreed to always consult in the status quo
- b) Plan guts the alliance credibility by brokering a deal with North Korea
- c) US-Japan breakdown causes Japan to rearm
- d) Rearm causes massive wars

Counterplan - Implements the Perry proposal instead of immediately lifting sanctions and does the rest of plan.

Inherency Answers:

1. status quo US policy supports the Sunshine policy
 - a) Berlin supported it
 - b) Berlin was a victory for Kim Dae Jung
 - c) Sunshine policy increasing
2. no solvency for political opposition because of threat of CBWs
3. Turn - opposition groups
 - a) Kim Dae Jung is seeking opposition group support to strengthen his power base
 - b) Plan guts his political support

War advantage answers:

1. no internal link to reversion
2. Berlin deal causes normalization
3. Current Berlin talks solve - the question is of when
4. North Korea changing its negotiating stance - wants to reciprocate gradually
5. North Korea always will stay at the table - carrots and sticks solve
6. Perry deal was a huge victory
7. History is on our side - North Korea always backs down - no escalation

Famine advantage answers:

1. North Korean agriculture output increasing
2. Evidence isn't predictive
3. SK aid is key
4. Shortages of food aid lead to new innovations
5. Famine deaths are exaggerated and structural reforms are the problem - they don't solve
6. Current food aid solves
7. New world food program solves

Solvency

1. DPRK rejects the sunshine proposal
2. Hostility between North and South key

Negative Block

2NC kicks Clinton and South Asia, and extends Trilateralism and the advantage answers

new link stories

- Japan wants conditions
- Japan wants gradual lifting

1NR extends the Counterplan and the case arguments

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

"The aff has no chance of winning offense. Never win that South Korea would revert to containment and the counterplan solves 100% of the case. Any risk of either net benefit (missile tests which isn't answered adequately, or trilateralism) is enough to vote neg. They concede that trilateralism turns back the case, so we can win just that and win the debate"

Emory

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1

Team: Emory HeMc

vs.: George Washington BS

Aff case (country): North Korea

Judge: Hung

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Trilateralism

Clinton

Appeasement

CP - implement the Perry report and ban joint military exercises

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

CP, appeasement, trilateralism

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1
Team: Emory JS
vs.: George Mason IT
Aff case (country): Cuba
Judge: Mika
INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)
Juragua
Famayo 99, Gafney 98, Alvarado 98

Rice
Canizaries 99, Canb 99, Bous 98

Red Spread
Gonzales 99, Falcoff 94, Holmes 95, Rummel 94

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
Juragua, Red Spread, case arguments

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1
Team: Emory JK
vs.: Mercer KW
Aff case (country): North Korea
Judge: Todd Lyden
INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)
T - CE - must include some sanctions - either reimpose or keep some - South Africa proves - must be a carrot and stick approach
(NO VOTER READ)

AT: Regime collapse
Oppression does not lead to conflict - Goldstone, Revolutions: A Theoretical Analysis, 1994

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 2
Team: Emory CR
vs.: Dartmouth LS
Aff case (country): Cuba
Judge: Sharp
INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)
Topicality-CE
Oil (Russian oil, renewables) Financial Times, 11/17/99, Taylor, FDCH 4/6/99
Israel, Near East Report, 7/26/99, Christian Century, 12/17/97, Inbar, Meria, 98
Ritter/UNESCOM CP, Ritter, Houston Chronicle, 9/30/99, Butler, FNS, 9/28/99
Emory's Campbell K

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
Topicality and CP theory

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 2
Team: Emory HH
vs.: Georgetown FW
Aff case (country): North Korea
Judge: Wells
INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

T - Adopt
T - Nearly All
T - Economic Sanctions
CP - Fully fund KEDO
Kritik of Realism - Campbell 1998
Israel Disad
Trilateralism - Korea Times, 9-12-99

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

T - Adopt
T - Nearly All

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3

Team: Emory HeMc

vs.: Northwestern PS

Aff case (country): North Korea

Judge: Dave Arnett - Berkeley

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Clinton Good - Chinese WTO

Clinton has capital now

Int'l Herald Tribune, 11-17-99 "an intense campaign to win approval"

B. Conditional nature of Berlin deal saves capital, plan kills capital, NYT, 9-18-99 "lifting sanctions imposed by legislation"

C. US approval of NTR key to solve, The Record, 11-10-99 "economic superpowers"

Japan

US and Japan have consulted over SQ NK policy, Korea Times, 9-12-99 "take measures to improve their relations"

Plan undermines cooperation - doesn't consult, Korean Economic Weekly, 9-20-99, "greatest importance is for well-coordinated"

Hurting alliance causes Japanese proliferate and turns the case, Cossa, 1997 Peace and Security in Northeast Asia

Massive wars, Jane's Intelligence Review, 10-1-99, "near-certainty of war"

2NC:

- SK and Japan want US consultation, Cha, Victor, 1999 [www.csis.org/pacfor/cc/993Qjapan_skorea.html]

- Trilateral consultation key to check NK from driving a wedge between our allies, Japan Times, 10-19-99 "chief sticking point"

- Consulting Japan key to Alliance, Mochizuki, 1997 Toward a True Alliance

- Japan won't support CE without consultations, Mochizuki, FNS, 1999 "constructive engagement with North Korea is at an all-time low"

- Uniqueness: Japan Economic Newswire, 11-9-99 "renewed their determination"; BBC, 11-11-99 "keys to stability and peace there"

Pakistan (Rogue State Appeasement)

US focus on deterring Pakistan, needs all diplomatic leverage, Newsday, 10-15-99 "aggressively bellicose toward India"

Plan is appeasement, Yonhap News Agency, 11-19-99, "precondition for the Clinton administration"

Pakistan and other rogues will perceive appeasement policies, Henriksen, 2-99,

www.hoover.stanford.edu/publications/epp/94/94g.html

Pakistani aggression leads to nuclear conflict, Copley News Service, 10-14-99, "subcontinent's two giants"

CP - don't take NK off of the DOS terrorist list, but allow them access to all international lending institutions.

O1

Elections not stop engagement [Korea herald 11/2/99; "I thin the republicans understand and even actually support the main theme"

BBC 11/5/99 "Republican and Democratic"

Berlin started the long process of normalization Paik 9/27/99; discussion of return

SQ solves-it is only a question of time [Yonhap news agency 11/18/1999; bbc monitoring asia pacific; "agreed to hold a higher level political meeting"]

SQ solves missiles and nukes AFP 11/18/99 "current round of talks"

NK changed its negotiations and will reciprocate gradually [IHT 11/1/99; North korea is expected to reciprocate these signs of interest"

NK not leave the table

A) History proves carrots and sticks force cooperation Napsnet daily report; 10/22/99; www.nautilus.org/napsnet/dr/index/html#item2

B) Paek speech in UN proves Korea herald 9/28/99 "Paek welcomed the easing of trade and investment"

C) Food aid solves Asiaweek 10/8/99 "desperation for food aid"

D) Perry deal was a political victory for NK won ki choi 9/28/99; comments on Nicholas Eberstadts Essay" nautilus "Shinning Triumph"

E) Economy drives negotiation Haksoon Peik 9/28/99; ww.nautilus.org "economic crisis not a security crisis" comments on eberstadts essay

Brinkmanship answers

History disproves [Michishita

Michishita, NIDS research assistant, summer 1997; Korea and world affairs; p. 203

No escalation Snyder www.usip.org/oc/sr/sr_koreaprint.html

Empirical studies disprove miscalc Reiter International security; fall 1995; conclusion page

No nukes; Roy, Survival; 1997; Winter no use-second strike deters

No nuke use Mazarr 1995; Fall; Korea and World Affairs p. 484

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

2NR goes for Clinton and Japan, as well as a few case take-outs.

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3

Team: Emory HL

vs.: Alabama

Aff case (country): North Korea

Judge: Weibel

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

cp: The USFG will adopt the full recommendations of the Perry report, in accordance with our Perry solvency evidence, including providing congressional funding and implementation of the outcome of negotiations initiated by the perry team....The USFG will fully support KEDO. In the event that a compromise on missile development is reached The US will compensate North Korea as per the AFF. In due time, US will also offer North Korea a trade agreement, including duty free exports and guaranteed trade levels.

Consultation and consistent advocacy of Perry is critical to getting north korea deal

David Brown 99 (3rd quarter, comparative connections,)

www.csis.org/pacfor/cc/993Qus_skorea.html

Maintaining a threat of stick is critical to keeping North Korea at the table and avoiding appeasement

Victor Cha, 99 (3rd quarter, comparative connections

www.csis.org/pacfor/cc/993Qjapan_skorea.html

Trilateralism:

A) us, japan, and south korea negotiated on the current round of talks

Japan Economic Newswire, nov 9, 99

B) plan guts our alliance credibility by cutting a deal with north korea to immediately lift all economic sanctions without consulting

Korea economic weekly, 9/20/99

C) US-Japan alliance breaks down causing japan to go nuclear. It turns back the case by prompting korean prolif

Cossa, 97 Peace and Security in Northeast Asia: The Nuclear Issue and the Korean Peninsula ed. Kihl and Hayes

D) Global War

Maaranen, 1992 Nukes in a changing world

Appeasement

A) the conditional nature of the berlin agreement created a powerful check to North Korea's Brinkmanship

Boston Globe 9-22-99

"Nothing would be lost if North Korea did not keep"

2) SQ will end the cycle of Brinkmanship and appeasement

IHT 9/15/99

"this latest outcome gives at least"

B) Appeasement nullifies our deterrent causing wars in korea

Kim, Journal of East Asian Affairs, Spring/Summer 99

Us Conditioning further lifting of sanctions on missile exports and a nuclear deal

Korea Herald 11/19/99

"North Korea demanded Wednesday that the"

Unconditional nature of the plan means that North Korea will always try to circumvent the Deal the Plan cuts

Korea Herald 9-20-99

"The most prominent problem"

Problem Solution Kritik

(same one as before)

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3

Team: Emory JS

vs.: FSU BC

Aff case (country): Iran

Judge: Starr, Sonja - Dartmouth

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Khatami - Phillips

Russian Oil

Some argument with Campbell and Zimmermann as cites

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

T scribble scribble scribble

Went for scribble, khatami, russian oil

(the other team's report clarifies that scribble was probably a position called political ontology)

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3

Team: Emory HaMe

vs.: Baylor BM

Aff case (country): Iran

Judge: Rod Phares

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

CP Text: Do the plan but only lift sanctions on Petroleum. The rest of the sanctions will be conditional on Arms exports.

Kritik of Realism

Israel Relations

Appeasement - Pakistan

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3

Team: Emory HeMc

vs.: Northwestern PS

Aff case (country): North Korea

Judge: Dave Arnett - Berkeley

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Clinton Good - Chinese WTO

Clinton has capital now

Int'l Herald Tribune, 11-17-99 "an intense campaign to win approval"

B. Conditional nature of Berlin deal saves capital, plan kills capital, NYT, 9-18-99 "lifting sanctions imposed by legislation"

C. US approval of NTR key to solve, The Record, 11-10-99 "economic superpowers"

Japan

US and Japan have consulted over SQ NK policy, Korea Times, 9-12-99 "take measures to improve their relations"

Plan undermines cooperation - doesn't consult, Korean Economic Weekly, 9-20-99, "greatest importance is for well-coordinated"

Hurting alliance causes Japanese proliferate and turns the case, Cossa, 1997 Peace and Security in Northeast Asia

Massive wars, Jane's Intelligence Review, 10-1-99, "near-certainty of war"

2NC:

- SK and Japan want US consultation, Cha, Victor, 1999 [www.csis.org/pacfor/cc/993Qjapan_skorea.html]

- Trilateral consultation key to check NK from driving a wedge between our allies, Japan Times, 10-19-99 "chief sticking point"

- Consulting Japan key to Alliance, Mochizuki, 1997 Toward a True Alliance

- Japan won't support CE without consultations, Mochizuki, FNS, 1999 "constructive engagement with North Korea is at an all-time low"

- Uniqueness: Japan Economic Newswire, 11-9-99 "renewed their determination"; BBC, 11-11-99 "keys to stability and peace there"

-

Pakistan (Rogue State Appeasement)

US focus on deterring Pakistan, needs all diplomatic leverage, Newsday, 10-15-99 "aggressively bellicose toward India"

Plan is appeasement, Yonhap News Agency, 11-19-99, "precondition for the Clinton administration"
Pakistan and other rogues will perceive appeasement policies, Henriksen, 2-99,
www.hoover.stanford.edu/publications/epp/94/94g.html
Pakistani aggression leads to nuclear conflict, Copley News Service, 10-14-99, "subcontinent's two giants"

CP - don't take NK off of the DOS terrorist list, but allow them access to all international lending institutions.

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

2NR goes for Clinton and Japan, as well as a few case take-outs.

Emporia

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1

Team: Emporia SM

vs.: Emory CR

Aff case (country): Cuba

Judge: Aaron Klemz

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Jaragua DA

A. Jaragua completion gives Adamov (Minister of Atomic Energy) credibility --> will finish dangerous reactors - The Center for Security Policy, 1998 No. 98-D40 [www.security-policy.org/latinamer.html#cuba]

B. Adamov uses credibility to finish Iran reactor - above

Trade Bill DA

A. Africa/Caribbean Trade Bill will pass and signal decreasing protectionism - Chicago Tribune, 11-5-99

B. Unions hate lifting sanctions - fear cheap imports and will mobilize protectionist sentiments - Lee '98, Senate Task Force on Economic Sanction Forum, FNS, 9-8-98

C. No Trade Bill spurs protectionism - Journal of Commerce, 11-5-99

Narco Mafia DA

A. Increased foreign investment will allow increased narco-mafia influence in Cuba - William Ledwith, FNS, 11-17-99

B. The Cali cartel increases violence and corruption, hurts the economy, and smuggles nuclear materials - Raine and Caluffo Global Organized Crime 1994

IMF DA

A. BIT lets the IMF into Cuba - Stokes Nat'l Journal, 9-17-94

B. IMF = Moral Hazard - Feulner, 1998 [www.heritage.org/heritage/library/backgrounders/bg1175.html]

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1

Team: Emory NR

vs.: Dartmouth BG

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: Bratt, Ron - Catholic

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Topicality - can't reimpose sanctions - remove not same as suspension

CP - do targeted sanctions (lift all except military)

Solvency -

1. Iraq categorically rejects - AFP, 99
2. Iraq rejects inspections - AFP 99
3. Iraq rejects - IHT 99
4. More evidence - Economist 99
5. Slew of dealbreakers - Ritter 99
6. US moves goalpost, Iraq not comply so no inspection solvency - Tetner 98
7. Plan just SQ - Iraq kicked out inspectors and won't let back in - AP 10-1-99
8. Iraq stonewalls inspections - Albright 98
9. Saddam cheats - Hamar 96

Advantage -

1. no tinkering can solve sanctions morality - Gordon 99
2. weak Iraq lashes out w/ WMD's - IBB 98 ??
3. sanctions don't solve - tech = WMD production - Eilen 98
4. turn - oil = modernization - Gates 99
- b. CP solves - Yates 99 ?? same author probably
5. sanctions = extremist Iraq, threatens ME - brown 95
6. sanctions risk global conflict - Halliday 99

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1

Team: Emory HaMe

vs.: Gonzaga M-J,K

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: Rollins

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

T - Constructive Engagement

Kritik - Technological policy of control -> state violence [Campbell & Dillon]

C/P - do plan but leverage for inspections with a prolif Net Benefit

Algerian Stability - Oil investment

[Middle East Economic Digest 10/15/99 "oil price recovery"]

[Middle East Review of Information 7/99 "authorities are committed"]

[Africa News 8/30/99 "The trick is to fix the economy"]

[Daily Telegraph 2/20/95 "spread of instability"]

Israel

PP Alive

[San Diego Union Tribune 11/17/99 "Israel energetically pursuing"]

Sanctions make Israel feel secure

[Christian Century 12/17/97 "Jewish concerns have"]

Palestinian independence declaration causes was

[Breger & Spiegel, Middle East Quarterly, 3/99]

Kritik of using the rhetoric of children is bad

[Erica Burman Disasters Vol 18, No 3 1994]

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

2NR goes for both K's

Emory

School: Emory

Team(s): BG, HL, HM, CR

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

Ontology

1) Problem solving approach naturalizes state violence & homogenizes people into manipulable nations & groups, Campbell in 98, National Deconstruction

2) Pointing out threats legitimizes the state - the state must create violence to exist,

Campbell in 98, Writing Security

3) Even softline policies link - their framework justifies and invites military domination, Spanos 90

4) We win - this takes out case harms and solvency and explanation of the world, Campbell

5) Their side is the side of the worst violence in history, Campbell, 1998, National Deconstruction

Inflation DA:

Trade deficit reduces inflation, Biz Week, April 5 99, p 29, "becoming overextended"

Washington Post, May 21 99, "capacity limits"

Hunger rhetoric critique - numbing effects. Escobar 1995. Also, hunger arg just used to get promote U.S. imperialism

Exclude Tobacco counter-plan

Appeasement

IMF Bad

Arguments Extended in the Negative Block (New Link Stories, Cites, Time Allocation, etc)

Ontology link extensions

Link Extensions:

- 1) Method used to approach the harm area and frameworks are theoretically indistinct from the final solution Spanos, 1993, Heidegger and Criticism: Retrieving the Cultural Politics...
- 2) Their framework reduces the diversity of human beings and experience into mere numbers in their imperialism equations, rationalizing violence, Spanos 93
- 3) All questions are questions of ontology, Cropsey, 1987, History of Political...

CUBA:

INC Strategy

Drug War

T - vagueness

- a. not specify which sanctions -- voter
- b. 1. Ground
2. cx does not check
3. no solvency

RED SPREAD

A: Latin American democracy is fragile - lifting the embargo sends a powerful signal, risks back-sliding (Gonzales, RAND Forum on Cuba, '99)

B: Lifting the embargo provides Castro with the resources to sabotage Latin American democracy (Holmes, 95 www.heritage.org/library/categories/forpol/cbrief14.html)

C: Democracy critical to prevent genocide and mass death (Rummel, Journal of Peace Research, 1994, p.1)

Tobacco

Times-Picayune, 6-13-99 "cigar smokers are talking"

Toronto Star, 7-30-99 "regular cigar smokers face a risk"

Sugar industry

- A. Cuban integration would destroy the economies of the Dominican Republic, Jamaica, and the US sugar industry
Cuban Communism, Jaime Suchlicki, 1995, p 764-5?
- B. Lower sugar prices cause the US to slash sugar imports, causing joblessness in foreign sugar markets
San Francisco Chronicle, 8-22-99, "every time sugar prices threaten to drop too low"
- C. Low prices exacerbate horrific working conditions; sugar plantations abuse workers
Toronto Star, 12-6-98 "poor sugar prices and other economic hardships"

reactor

- a. russia = no money
- b. link - will finish reactor - 80 million at risk

cp - exclude reactor

The US will do the plan, except that section 111 of the Cuban Liberty and Democratic Solidarity (Libertad) Act (Helms-Burton) will remain in place.

A. counterplan is competitive and solves case

B. CP solves Juragua DA - Lucio, "The Cuban liberty and democratic solidarity (libertad) act of 1995: An initial analysis," Miami Inter-American Law Review, Winter 1995-1996, lexis, "Under Section 111(b)(1), the President can withhold assistance to any country which provides assistance to any country which provides assistance to Cuba's nuclear facility at Juragua"

IRAQ:

INC Strategy

Clinton

CP-Condition sanctions on Russian agreement to inspections of Iraq

Russian influence net benefit

Kurdish Genocide

Israel Relations Disad:

Palestinians happy now, Houston Chronicle, 9/11/99, "seemed heartened"

Now key to peace, Near East Report, 7/26/99, "extraordinary opportunity"

Now key - delay, Orlando Sentinel, 9/27/99, "conclude peace agreements quickly" *

Also AFP, 9/24/99, "very ambitious timetable" *

Unilateral declaration from delay = war, Middle East Quarterly, March 99, Breger& Spiegel

Peace process stops nuke war, Aronson, Middle East Journal, 1992, vol 46 no 4, p 628?

Iraq Israel turn - Makovsky, Washington Times, 8/18/99, "more provocative ways" * (AFF)

Russian Oil DA:

A. Russian econ uniq: St Pete Times, 9/10/99 Emerging Market Datafile, "oil-led recovery"

B. Iraq link: IHT, 1/26/96, "troublesome cycle" Guardian, 7/9/98, "official output"

C. Oil key to Russian econ, Williams, Washington Post, March 20 98, "collect sufficient taxes"

D. High prices solve Iraqi suffering, Taylor, FDCH, April 6 99, "increasing production"

E. High oil prices cause renewable shift, Frend, 99, Times London, 8/31/99, "as prices increase"

F. Low oil prices kill renewables, Economist, 10/7/95, "another oil shock"

G. Renewables impact: Dunn and Flavin, State of the World 1999, ed Starke, p 24

Shunning (2 card shell):

Iraq Shunning Link: AP, Mar 24 99, "eliminated all human rights" *

NATO Expansion DA:

A. The US is having difficulty sustaining the anti-Iraq coalition - Russia is looking to end the sanctions, LA Times 8/29/99, "defied every intelligence prediction"

B. The plan prompts an expansion to the Baltics - to maintain status quo containment coalition on Iraq will require concessions to Russia on NATO expansion Pollack, FDCH Congressional Testimony, 5/21/98, "mean making concessions"

C. Baltic expansion causes nuclear exchange, Bandow, NATO ENLARGEMENT, ed Carpenter, 1998, p 1215?

Nearly all topicality:

Ninety percent, all but one

economic sanctions include military and financial controls

Case Arguments vs Iraq:

Famine

- humanitarian exceptions solve

- assumes future deaths

- no starvation

- war caused deaths

- no medical collapse

- hoarding by gov

- sanctions not cause

- lifting sanctions not solve

Credibility

- no impact to UN

- milmod x

- WMD x x

- adventurism x

- global aggression/appeasement x

- collapse good, solves regional stability x x

- Kurds x

Morality

- Saddam responsible x

- states not individuals

- nuclear world

- util best
- disads o/w

Libertarianism

- lib flawed x
- Gewirth flawed x

Negative Block

CP, Russian Influence, Russian Economy

Strategy in Rebuttals

CP - Condition Lifting Sanctions on Russian Agreement to Inspections, Russian Influence NB

IRAN:

INC Strategy

Counterplan - lift ILSA restrictions and investment restrictions, condition the rest on arms reductions and terrorism

South Asia

- Pakistan is holding back from aggression now
- International Herald Tribune, 10-21-1999, "without checks and balances"
- lifting Iranian sanctions is a sign of US weakness, encourages Pakistani aggression
 - even a crisis situation risks preemption and nuclear warfare
- CSM, 10-20-1999, "fall in step"
- Russian Nationalism

Israel

Khatami

Dual Containment Advantage

1. CP solves the advantage
2. Assumes military cooperation - plan doesn't do that
3. E/d - the Gulf war
4. Um, they fought a war
5. Dual containment solves Iraqi aggression
6. Dual containment solves external aggression
7. T - Terrorism checked in the status quo, plan can only reverse that

Caspian Oil Advantage

1. evidence says the pipeline will never be built
2. no equipment for the pipeline
3. regional disputes takes out the pipeline
4. political instability hurts the pipeline
5. multiple pipelines cause conflict
6. no solvency - ideological stance means that the pipeline would still go through Turkey
7. Turn - Turkey
 - a) pipeline essential to Turkish influence
 - b) Turkish prestige essential to Central Asian stability

Encirclement Advantage

1. CP solves the link
2. Multiple reasons for encirclement
3. T - Military Modernization
 - a) lack of economic prowess decreases military modernization
 - b) increased modernization increases regional threats
4. dialogue is appeasement, cause Rogue aggression
5. Iran won't start conflict

NORTH KOREA:

INC Strategy

Trilateralism

-should consult with Japan and South Korea ? failure = collapse of alliance and war.

South Korea DA

Consult South Korea CP

UCO

EMORY JC (EITHER IRAN OR IRAQ?)

OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:

- Appeasement
- Consult Russia CP
- T - constructive engagement
- Algerian Oil
- Isreal

BREAKDOWN OF THE BLOCK:

2NC

- Appeasement
- Isreal
- C/P
- Oil
- 1NR
- T - Constructive Engagement
- Case

NEGATIVE TRICKS

2NR POSITIONS:

- Case
- Oil

EMORY RN

OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:

- Kritik - Mikey
- Juragua
- Red Spread
- Interdiction
- T-Constructive Engagement

BREAKDOWN OF THE BLOCK:

2NC

- Kritik
- Case
- T-CE

1NR

- DA'S

NEGATIVE TRICKS

2NR POSITIONS:

- Kritik and case

EMORY RW (NORTH KOREA)

OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:

- Perry C/P
- Inherency
- Solvency
- Appeasement
- Tri-lateralism
- Advantage (famine)
- T

BREAKDOWN OF THE BLOCK:

2NC

- Perry C/P
- Tri-lateralism
- Famine

1NR

- Inherency
- Appeasement
- T

NEGATIVE TRICKS

2NR POSITIONS

- Perry
- Tri-lateralism
- Appeasement

EMORY TM

OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:

- CP - condition lifting sanctions on United Nations Security Council agreement to do weapons inspection - Ritter
- Oil
- Realism
- Russian Coop in Security Council
- Extra T

BREAKDOWN OF THE BLOCK:

2NC

- Kritik
- CP
- Russia
- 1NR
- Extra T
- Case
- Oil

NEGATIVE TRICKS

2NR POSITIONS:

- Kritik
- Extra T

SOUTH CAROLINA

Emory DG

- Appeasment Bad
- South Korea DA
- T nearly all
- C/P condition diplmoatic normalization on missle exports
- no famine now
- No economic collapse
- IMF bad
- Neg is good?

Empry GR

- Consult SK
- Appeasment Bad
- ME peace process (Clinton)
- Statism in FP Kritik

Emory LM

- Nearly all Topicality
- Isreal DA
- South Korea DA
- Exclude IMF loans CP

Emory JS

- Realism
- Case takeouts

Emory AH

- Isreal DA
- Appeasment DA
- South Korea
- Mikey Kritik
- Prolif take cuts
- Solvency T/O Kedo not solve

Emory CR

- Juragua
- Red Spread

-dispositional CP

Emory BG

-Clinton (Peace Process)

-Collapse

-Aggression

-Iraq Oil

Emory HK

-Trilateral DA

-Food CP

-Solvency

UNI:

>>>Major Emory case args: VS Iraq

>>>

>>>>no medical collapse -- Clawson; 8/93; How Has Saddam Survived?; McNair

>>>>Paper no. 20

>>>

>>>>Doxey '96; International Sanctions in Contemporary Perspective

>>>

>>>>Water wars (development causes ag. to increase) -- Insight on the News

>>>>3/14/92; "low rate of return"

>>>

>>>>Ghattas 8/5/99; "turning away from the region's"

>>>

>>>>Marr 3/27/96; "population from starvation"

>>>

>>>>Turn: plan lifts oil-for-food requirements which are key to getting

>>>>food -- Berger 1/28/99; "under strict supervision"

>>>

>>>>Turn: Saddam will kill more Kurds -- Mylorie 2/23/94; "attack the

>>>>Kurds"

>>>

>>>>=genocide -- Mideast Watch Report '93; Genocide in Iraq

>>>

>>>>NOTE: this was also Bailey and Ghali's case hit yesterday vs.

>>>>Louisville

>>>

>>>>More from Emory (Heftman and McNabb): vs Iraq

>>>

>>>>www.fourthfreedom.org/sanctions/jiaarticle.html

>>>

>>>>Melby '98; Economic Sanctions and American Diplomacy

>>>

>>>>leb.net/IAC/illegal.html

>>>

>>>>Rescher '84, etc. versus the moral advantage, "no moral absolutes,

>>>>etc."

>>>

>>>>T -- must be immediate

>>>>T -- must include overt diplomacy (just lifting sanctions not enough)

>>>>Clinton/WTO

>>>>Oil

>>>

>>>>2NR: Sanctions exist to appease Israel. Lifting freaks them out. Peace

>>>>process is moving fine now. Isreal stalls which causes a unilateral

>>>>Palestinian declaration of statehood. Causes nuke war.

>>>

>>>>Jerusalem Post 8/17/99; "danger which cannot be ignored"

>>>

>>>>Hajjar '98; Security Implications of Proliferation of Weapons of Mass

>>>>Destruction

>>>

>>>>LA Times 8/20/99; "Barak is working"

>>>

>>>>Ahrens 3/12/99; "aimed at preventing"

>>>

>>>Silver 2/13/98; "the sanctions stay"
>>>
>>>Jane's 8/1/99; "intensely scrutinized"
>>>
>>>public opinion is key -- Jerusalem Post 9/6/99; "public opinion"
>>>
>>>Economist 7/24/99; "like a lengthy interval"

Israel d/a
-relations key to solving war
Clinton
-capital is key to saving WTO

Kritik of state driven international relations
-kritik indicates that state international relations framework on
notions of
ontological instability, humanism/Spanos impacts, and mainly specific
exclusions caused by problematization through the state. Legitimizes
violence.
-aff attempts at problem solving assumes the state s the natural actor

-Imperialism kills solvency

Exclude Tobacco counter-plan

OPEC
-OPEC ok in the status quo^Å lifting embargo _____ the price of oil^Å
world catastrophe

Lots of case turns against Iraq

Inflation
-lifting sanctions increases inflation, which is stable now, resulting
in adepression

Kurdish genocide turn on Iraq

Palestinian Delay
-Palestinians satisfied with the pace of status quo peace initiatives
-dropping sanctions = Israel (not sure) freakout
-war

Topicality
-constructive engagement means you have to impose new sanctions

Red Spread
-Castro uses his new economic resources^Å.

Gradual lifting of sanctions counterplan

Israel
-got paranoid when we are nice to _____ - they opt out of the
peace
process

Trilateralism
-should consult with Japan and South Korea ? failure = collapse of
alliance and war.

Spanos
-Changes in policy are a pretext for nationalism

Emporia

WILLIAM JEWELL

EMPORIA CW

Against Northern Illinois MK (Iran):

- CP: Keep sanctions, but have dialogue as per Dhooge.
- Protectionism: Unions want sanctions; if lifted, they want to be protected; ruins world trade.
- Israel: No consultation with US unilateral action.

WAKE

Emporia

School: Emporia

Team(s): MS

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

Topicality:

- including: only lifting sanctions is not enough
- constructive engagement: contextual evidence standard, FX illegitimate
- vagueness

Counterplans:

- Engage without lifting sanctions CP
- Use congress instead of the president CP: faster solvency, SOP net benefits
- Delegation CP

Disads:

- Clinton (Lifting sanctions kills political capital, Haass, Ec.Sanct. and Am. Dipl., 1998, in the past a WTO impact and African trade bill impact)
- Protectionism DA (Job loss resulting from cheap labor, protectionism causes war)
- Shunning
- Imperialism
- Oil Prices DA (renewables, global warming impacts)
- Russian Nationalism
- Israel with Nuclear Disclosure impact

Neg Strategy in Rebuttals (key arguments, tricks, things they kick out of)

Usually Clinton and case

IRAN:

INC Strategy

Military Modernization with Strait of Hormuz Impact

NORTH KOREA:

INC Strategy

Kim Regime Stability

UCO

EMPORIA BW (IRAN)

OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:

- Isreal DA
- Complexity
- Trade-African/Carribean bill
- Engage but don't lift CP
- Prolif Takeouts

EMPORIA MS (UNKNOWN)

OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:

- Trade Bill - Africa Trade Legislation Key to WTO conference

- Israel - Opacity Kritik - decrease in US/Israeli RX = Disclosure
BREAKDOWN OF THE BLOCK:
2NC
- Kick Israel
- Trade Bill
1NR
 - Case
- Negative Tricks
- 2NR Positions
- Clinton
- Case

UNI:

Topicality

- constructive engagement needs to be limited
- FX
- must provide a limited definition of constructive engagement
- include ? only lifting sanctions is not enough
- must read a card that says you are constructive engagement

Protectionism

- Job loss resulting from cheap labor, protectionism = war (spicer)

Vagueness

Iranian Military Modernization

- Strait of Hormuz Impact

Engage without lifting sanctions counter-plan

Imperialism

Use congress instead of the president counter-plan

- faster solvency
- solves collapse of checks and balances
- prevents tyranny

Reusables d/a

- remove sanctions = decreased oil prices
- = increased oil consumption
- increased global warming
- death and stuff

Clinton

- WTO^Å sanctions kill political capital,
BBC, 9-15-99
- Economic Sanctions and American Diplomacy, 1998
- San Francisco Examiner, 9-9-99

Russian Nationalism

Delegation Counter-plan

Kim Regime Stability

Shunning

ENMU

UNI:

Clinton
-WTO

Feminist kritik of international relations

Topicality
-adopt must be through congress
-"immediate" must be in plan text

Florida State

WAKE

Florida State

School: Florida State

Team(s):

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

Delay CP

Clinton

Shunning

Russian Nationalism

Fort Hays

WAKE

Fort Hays

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1

Team: Fort Hays HR

vs.: Dartmouth GS

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: Sowards

1NC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Secrecy:

McMatters, 1997, www.ansc.org/ideas/rtk/rtkcomment_conspiracy.htm

Isenberg, 1997, www.cdi.org/radio/transcripts/361.html

Ammstrong, 1998, A Culture of Secrecy: the government vs. people's right to know

US-Israel relations:

Haass 99, Elizur 97, Inbar 98, Ostrousky 98

Russia

Orientalism:

Said, 79

"Dancin' About Architecture"?????????

Morality answers on the case

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

"Dancin' About Architecture"

Russia

Morality on case

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1

Team: Fort Hays RS

vs.: Illinois State VB

Aff case (country): Iran

Judge: Sternhagen

1NC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Secrecy - US government maintains a cult of secrecy. The people have a right to know

[Scott Armstrong 1998]

Orientalism - Said Orientalism 1979

Feminist IR

[Anne Tichner Gender in International Relations: Feminist Perspectives in Achieving Global Security 1992]

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

T - Can't specify constructive engagement

Orientalism

UNI:

-Israel Relations

-decrease U.S. / Israel relations = Syrian land grab for Golan

- link is that Israel dislikes pro Arab policies

-Consultation with Israel counter-plan

- "Dancing with the Architecture"

- a kritik of fiat being a "tool of the man"

- we move around pieces on a board

- Secrecy

- public record is secret ? U.S. government classifies material ? hence all

foreign policy evidence is flawed

Clinton

- WTO's plan hurts Clinton, china doesn't get in = war

Kritik of fiat

Fullerton

LONG BEACH

Keola Whittaker/Brian Ward

Affirmative Round Report

Aff Case: Iran **Neg Team:** CSU Fullerton NW **Tournament** Long Beach **Round 8 Judge** Opsata

INC Off Case Positions:

Condition CP (van Berjeck)

Terrorism

Vagueness (normal means)

Clinton NMD

Xtra T on ILSA

T CE (South Africa)

INC Case Arguments:

Human rights turns

Prolif turns

2NR:

CP, HR, terrorism

USC

Keola Whittaker/Brian Ward

Affirmative Round Report

Aff Case: Iran **Neg Team:** Fullerton ZD **Tournament** USC **Round 3 Judge** Lindsay Harrison

INC Off Case Positions:

CE – South Africa empirical example

Conditioned sanctions cp (van Berjack)

INC Case Arguments:

Terrorism turns

Prolif turns

Khatami turns

2NR:

T, case turns

Negative Positions: GOP: Plan upsets bipart effort to get BMD.

CP: Use proportional sanctions

T Violation: Constructive Engagement = use economy to get internal changes in the target government.

Terrorism DA: Plan Encourages Terrorism by ending sanctions

Negative Positions

T-CE by influencing internal policies

Extra-T-plan includes non-rez actors

GOP DA-NMD impact

Terrorism

CP- reimpose all sanctions removed in last two years, condition removal on improvement in human rights and terrorism

Fullerton BN: Bentley and Neesen

Negative Postion:

GOP: NMD scenario
Terrorism DA
T constructive engagement
Conditions CP

WAKE

Cal State Fullerton

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 5
Team: Fullerton NW
vs.: Illinois State VB
Case: Iran
Judge: Skillin, Kelley-Baylor
INC Off-Case Arguments
T: CE
Revise Sanctions CP
Agent Specification

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
Kicked the CP
Went for T-argued that it takes out solvency
Turned threat construction

Cal State Fullerton

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 2
Team: Fullerton
vs.:
Aff case (country): N. Korea
Judge:
INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)
CP-target sanctions
Peter Van Bergeijk, Economic Diplomacy, Trade, and Commercial Policy, 1994
Niksich 99, <http://www.csis.org/pacfor/pac0599.html>

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
HR violations o/w all

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 4
Team: Fullerton BN
vs.: Northwestern GS
Aff case (country): North Korea
Judge: Lawrence, Bill
INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Terrorism - Sanctions are US terrorism fixture -Tucker 97
Must not trade with terrorists - Mack 99
Terrorism = apocalyptic war - Warner 98

CP - Text :

Per the recommendations of Van Bergeijk, the sanctions removed in Berlin Agreement will be reapplied if NK continues to be belligerent or fails to comply with CP. Any further lifting of sanctions will be conditional on meaningful NK reforms, a N/S negotiated settlement, restraint in the sale of ballistic missile tech, non-proliferation, and in improvement in human rights. Sanctions on agriculture will be lifted 1st, then the sanctions are conditioned.

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Grants a T WM to get link off terrorism
Goes for CP w/ shunning on case and solvency takeouts

Case Western

Cal State Fullerton

School: Cal State Fullerton

Team(s): NW, NB

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

On the negative, we run a counterplan that is designed to modify sanctions to make them effective. It has about 8 different solvency mechanisms, the cite is vanBergeijk, 1994, "Economic Diplomacy, Trade, and Commercial Policy." We also run human rights, constructive engagement T, sanctions split the GOP in the next election causing Democratic victory with an NMD good impact, and of course some case arguments.

UNI:

Topicality

-plan doesn't lift nearly all sanctions

Delay Counter-plan

-conditional

-enact plan in 6 months

-Clinton or Russia/China net benefit

Clinton

CTBT good

Shunning

Agent Specification

-not defining normal means kills education and takes out solvency

Elmore, 1980

GOP unity w/ a NMD impact

Feminism kritik

-They act under status quo assumptions which are gendered bias, this blinds us and thwarts solvency (Enloe, 1990)

Executive Order Counter-plan

-avoids NMD

-president solves better than joint action

Calabresi, 1995

Conditioning Aid on Human Rights counter plan

-The Nicholes-Mach (sp?) bill will be passed with the revisions suggested

by Felice Gaer(sp?). As part of the Act, sanctions focused on North Korea will be revised and maintained until human rights conditions are acceptable. We reserve the right to legislative intent. when Human rights conditions are acceptable, the affirmative plan mandates will be implemented (Gaer, 1998 testimony before senate, September 10)

FSU

UCO

FSU CB:

Plan: In consult. With relevant allies we remove non military sanctions on ability to sell Oil. Suspend all Iraqi obligations for Gulf War compensation. Remove dual use restrictions. Lifting conditioned on Iraqi compliance w/ WMD inspections, maintain Northern Watch & Iraqi cooperation w/ share the wealth.

Advantages: Humanitarian Crisis

1AC Cites: Institute of public accuracy^FAO^Zunes^Gordon^International Herald Tribune^Simons^Gauze^Crosette^Sullivan.

2AC Tricks:

FSU CB (IRAQ)

OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:

- Delay CP
- Clinton
- Shunning
- Russian Nationalism

BREAKDOWN OF THE BLOCK:

2NC

- CP
- Clinton
- 1NR
- Shunning
- Case

NEGATIVE TRICKS

2NR POSITIONS

- CP
- Clinton
- Case

Georgetown

WAKE

Georgetown

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 6

Team: Georgetown FW

vs.: Iowa LR

Aff case (country): North Korea

Judge: Gottlieb - Harvard

1NC Off-Case Arguments

Clinton - WTO

- a) Clinton wants WTO entry - the plan hurts his political capital
- b) Gradual action is essential to political capital
- c) Must exert all political capital to get WTO, otherwise causes nuclear war

Russian Nationalism

- a) DPRK is the darling of the nationalists - Bajanov, www.nautilus.org/fora/security/8a_Bajanov.html, 7/30/1997, "as for various groups"
- b) New US action increases nationalism, destroys ABM treaty and causes arms races - Copley News Service, 10/25/1999, "missile radar system"
- c) Collapse of the ABM treaty = collapse of the proliferate regime and nuclear war - M2 Presswire, 10/22/1999, "objective was to guarantee"

Counterplan - exclude World Bank loans

Solvency Answers

- 1. new peace treaty rewards belligerency - causes more aggression
- 2. significant risk of miscalculation during negotiations
- 3. South Korea will backlash against a bilateral treaty
- 4. Slow approach key to solve regional collapse
- 5. North Korea wants a gradual approach
- 6. Pakistan won't stop provocations
- 7. PRC wants a gradual approach - ensures stability
- 8. Once sanctions are lifted, causes new crisis, North Korea won't cooperate
- 9. Congressional transience causes delays, doesn't solve KEDO
- 10. Asian TMD hurts the MTCR
- 11. Russian missile sales
- 12. CP ensures a bargaining chip
- 13. Plan causes regime collapse
- 14. undermining Kim Jong Il destroys any hope for a deal

Negative Block

2NC extends the World Bank CP and the case arguments (kicks the China and South Korea DAs on case)

- reads lots of impact extensions and asserts a deontological rejection of the Aff because the World Bank loans kill people
- argues that the biodiversity cards on the net benefit turn the famine add-on
- argues that World Bank loans aren't essential to the investment their solvency deficit cards are talking about

1NR decides to read a link to their net benefit, then extends Russia and Clinton

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

2NR goes for the counterplan

Georgetown

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1

Team: Georgetown GW

vs.: Emory HL

Aff case (country): North Korea

Judge: Wells

1NC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Kim de Jung credibility DA

Kim needs capital to implement reforms - Plunk 98

Lack of control kills KDJ - Kim Sung-han 10-98
Trade war and WW3 - Lowell 95

Topicality - must specify economic sanctions

Gradualism CP

The USFG should adopt a policy of CE with the DPRK including the normalization of relations and phased incentive-based sanctions for a two year period of good-faith measures to secure the end of North Korean Ballistic Missile testing and ballistic missile exports. The USFG will live up to all of its financial obligations under the 1994 agreed framework.

Clinton - WTO

Clinton will get WTO by using capital - Snyder 99

Further concessions --> congressional backlash - 10-99

WTO key to stop WW3 - Kaplan 99

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 2

Team: georgetown fr

vs.: kansas state nr

Aff case (country): north korea

Judge: bates

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Gradual CP

Kim Jong-Il

Clinton

solvency

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Morality and war impacts

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3

Team: Georgetown FW

vs.: Catholic SM

Aff case (country): Syria

Judge: Strange

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Clinton-WTO

Russia-sphere of influence, breakdown of ABM treaty bad

Case turns on Golan adv:

--sparks Israeli civil war

--cause Israeli Israeli preemption

--sanctions check terrorists

--Israeli nuke disclosure bad

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Case and clinton

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 4

Team: Georgetown GW

vs.: Emory NR

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: Biza Repko

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Clinton-WTO

CP-do plan but don't end bilateral U.S. sanctions on Iraq.

Russia-U.S. investment crowds out Russian oil investment, which is key to the survival of the Russian economy, which is on the brink

Link cites: Schedier Cnn 11/22/97, "return to prominence"; New York Post, 9/13/98, "freely on the world"; Risk Monitor Briefing, 6/3/97, "interest in bringing"

Pakistani Rice

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

CP w/ Russia and Rice N/Bs

Georgetown

School: Georgetown

Team(s): FW

IRAQ:

INC Strategy

-MAI DA

-C/P UN inspectors without interference

-No famine in Iraq

-Oil DA

-Clinton capital/WTO

-T not specify all sanctions

School: Georgetown

Team(s): HFH

NORTH KOREA:

INC Strategy

-Deterrence DA

-Local Sanctioning DA

-KEDO C/P

-Appeasement turns

Georgetown - Negative

School: Georgetown

Team(s): All

CUBA:

sanctions dont Kill

no famine in cuba

sanc key to transition

IRAQ:

sanctions don't kill

media bias

save the Kurds

deontology ans.

IRAN:

sanctions don't kill

who knows

SYRIA:

sanctions don't kill

we have no idea

NORTH KOREA:

sanctions dont kill

no famine

slow good. plan is fast that angers SK, China, Japan, and hurts KJI

SOUTH CAROLINA

Georgetown HF

-Deterrence DA

-Local Sanctioning DA

-KEDO C/P

-Appeasement turns

Georgetown FW

-MAI DA

-C/P UN inspectors without interference

-No famine in Iraq

-Oil DA

- Clinton capital/WTO
- T not specify all sanctions

Georgia

WAKE

Georgia

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 5

Team: Georgia EK

vs.: Dartmouth RL

Case: Iraq

Judge: Cohen, Elisia---Southern Cal

1NC Off-Case Arguments

Counterplan

Text: The USFG will immediately lift all comprehensive economic sanctions on Iraq, including sanctions on dual-use products and will reverse its position in the UN to support the immediate removal of economic sanctions, and will veto any extension of sanctions. The US will immediately release Iraqi assets previously unfrozen by the UN for humanitarian assistance. The US will offer to support the reduction or elimination of Iraqi war reparations, and the renegotiation, restructuring, and reduction of bilateral and multilateral debt. No conditions or targeted sanctions will be allowed and we will end support for the arms embargo.

Ob. 1 Non-Topical: not CE

Ob. 2 Net Benefits-- cplan lifts all sanctions avoiding any risk of military containment or threat construction

Solvency-Iraq won't accept

Spanos-one big card

WTO

A. Congress will accept now-Page, USA Today 11/16/99

B. Link

C. Chinese Entry into WTO key to prevent a new Asian war-Fisch, 99

Israel

A. ME at crossroads-could move toward or away from peace-Klieman World and I 9-1-99

B. Plan slows/stops peace process

1. Plan jeopardizes Israeli security

2. If US jeopardizes Israeli security, Israel won't engage in process. Any sign of US/Israel division lead ARabs to delay-Kohr FNS 3-31-98

C. IMpact-stagnation of peace causes war-Berger MEQ march 99

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

2NR went for the CP, kritik, and solvency Iraq won't accept the plan.

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 6

Team: Georgia PQ

vs.: Emory BG

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: Brett O'Donnell

1NC Off-Case Arguments

Agent Specification

Spanos Kritik

2NC Overview

- vagueness causes subjectivity - contains Iraq

- racist guilt transference

- net benefits - only CP can go farther left

2NC Line-By-Line

- not Vietnam analogy - analyzes Gulf War as well - designed to heal the wounds but fails - attempts to appease left-wing groups but only a behind-the-scenes deal that causes intervention - demonize Saddam - arms embargo turn

- CP solves morality - Spanos impact turns back - sanctions immoral, US culpable, must eliminate all - not have to defend the SQ - must open up space and historicize oppression

- CP turns all aff turns back - solvency t/o more intervention - Congress rolls back sanctions, still famine and death - not stop intervention - not eliminate option for Congress to intervene - vagueness - CP airtight

- Perm bad - not rethink - open up space for dialogue - ev not assume - CP does rethinking as well - Spanos 93 - plan way to forget about Iraq - Gulf War analogy - commanding view - justifies intervention - embracing cultural values of dominance - power relations continue - critical thinking causes effective resistance

CP - Lift all sanctions

2NC (2AC argument - 2NC answers)

- dispositionality okay - moving target not voter, only run one CP, perms check not skew time, lose time not mean win, must prove non-comp checks abuse, perm allowed, plan must still be better than SQ and 1AC proves - theory checks - only one CP, comp checks abuse, could anticipate, non-disp worse
- not link more - vague plan like bill exploited by Congress - rollback of sanctions, still immoral because not take full existential action - CP solves more
- perm - do CP - textual comp best - basing strategy on it, specific debate about plan, wrote plan vaguely - perm severs plan moving target - sever word "nearly" - could sever out of any CP or any link voter
- military embargo needed turn - economic sanctions aren't military sanctions - aff not solve demonization compared to CP - turn constructs threats - discusses "abusive regimes" - good intentions go awry - Edelman 88 (political spectacle)

MNC Invasion

1NR Overview

- turns morality and existentialism - directly responsible for actions
- turns case - people can't work
- justifies intervention
- destroys culture - Petros - turns back existentialism

Links

- push goods onto economy
- do the plan for corporate business interests

Morality

1NC Arguments

- principle of non-combatants lost credibility internationally
- individuals different from government
- not many deaths
- justifies violence
- not solve
- turn/ allows tobacco
- turn/ aff demonizes Saddam
- turn/ rhetoric of rights flawed
- turn/ plan causes intervention and threat construction

2NC Arguments

- principle of non-combatant immunity not exist - Coates - can't distinguish - at some level all are responsible - aff blurs distinctions - still innocent targeting to justify military action after the plan

Solvency

1NC

- Iraq won't comply
- dual use nature destroys solvency - government will manipulate and roll back
- dividing into economic and military categories destroys humanitarian solvency
- containment bad - plan causes air strikes escalation
- causes lashout - US shouldn't
- rhetoric racist - Said ev

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Went for everything in the block

Went for agent specification / vagueness

Georgia

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1

Team: Georgia EK

vs.: Georgetown FW

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: Sonya Starr

1NC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Clinton- Chinese WTO entry

Russia relations

New conflict --> Duma backlash - Copley News Service 99

--> collapse of arms control, results in war

Pakistan

Plan crowds out Pakistan in Iraq

Hardline takeover --> war with India over Kashmir

Case args

Off solves - Clawson 98

Iraqi media distorts - Seldon 98

Discourse reifies - Edelman 87

Catastrophe outweighs deontology - Fried 78

CP

Ban military and economic aggression internationally

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Went for the CP and a Pakistan growth DA w/ Kashmir impact scenario

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1

Team: Georgia PQ

vs.: Cal State Fullerton NW

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: Michelle Choe

1NC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

T - CE

Israel

Pakistan

Clinton - WTO

CP - In order to eliminate the disproportionate effects of sanctions on womyn the USFG will adopt a policy of CE with the government of the nation-state of Iraq including the immediate lifting of all economic sanctions except for UNSC resolution 688, normalizing diplomatic relations, and begin to redirect the funding from the ILA to Iraqi womyn's groups. Rules of engagement for the resolution will be changed to pre-December 1998 levels. Intent.

Case-

Oil, WMD, Kurds, Shunning, Dillon, economic imperialism, UN veto, sanctions solve, OFF solves, rights aren't absolute, essentialism

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

DAs, kicked CP

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1

Team: Georgia PQ

vs.: Fullerton NW

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: Michele Choe

1NC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Topicality-CE

CP-do plan but retain air strikes (kurds turn n/b)

Clinton-WTO

a. congress accept now-pol cap key, "heavily lobbied fight", USA Today 11/16/99

b. low key war checks congressional opposition, "low-key war," Plain Dealer, 10/8/99

c. chinese entry key to prevent a new asian war, fisch 99, "military limited and insecure"

Pakistan---US credibility key to prevent military cooperation and Indo-Pak conflict

a. current clear signal against pakistani military coup is key to restore democracy-plan crushes signal, The Hindu, 11/11/99, "strongly censured Pakistan"

b. the plan cozies up to an anti-democratic regime this undermines US efforts to restore democracy in Pakistan, USA Today, 10/14/99, "the route Pakistan took"

c. pakistani military rule risks nuclear war on the subcontinent, Star Tribune, 10/23/99, ""ride the tide of military"

Israel-plan hurts Israeli security, destroying the peace process

Link cite: Kohr, FNS, 3/31/98, "only an unshakable"

Impact cite: Berger and Spiegel, MEQ, March 99

On the case

Shunning

Kurds air strikes turn

Dillon security argument-rhetoric of "rights" is just an extension of security, it forces calculative though and risks fascism,

Michael Dillon, The Politics of Security, 96, p. 29-30

Must evaluate consequences

Nuclear war outweighs

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Status quo solves the case, Disads outweigh, Dillon turn on the case

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 2

Team: Georgia EK

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: Rollins

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Author Advocacy

Lift ALL Sanctions CP

Israel DA

Britain

MNC's Bad

Pakistan DA

Case Turns: Airstrikes Bad, Iraqi Liberation Act Bad, Hunger Rhetoric

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Counterplan, Air Strikes Bad, ILA Bad, MNC's Bad

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3

Team: Georgia PQ

vs.: Fullerton BN

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: Kelly Dunbar

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

MNC Kritik (Escobar, Parenti)

Heal the Wounds Kritik (Spanos)

CP: Exclude maintaining arms exports and proactive investment promotion

T - CE = conditional

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

CP Solves the case

NB's: IR gender discrimination, MNC domination

Threat construction vs. all turns

Georgia

School: Georgia

Team(s): PQ

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

Agent Specification - failure to specify who does the plan is illegitimate

Process Specification - failure to specify how plan is implemented is illegitimate

Constructive Engagement T - Constructive Engagement is conditional

Executive Order Counterplan

Separation of Powers

Clinton Good

Spanos/Statism
Shunning
Oil
Pakistan
MNC Domination Kritik

CUBA:
INC Strategy

Constructive Engagement Topicality
Counterplan - Lift the same sanctions as the Aff except exclude the sanction that prohibits foreign investment in the Juragua power plant
Juragua Net Benefit
Shunning
Clinton Good
Trade Bad
A) the plan allows free trade with Cuba, allows passage of MAI
B) MAI is bad - causes unemployment and damages economies
C) Plan allows economic colonialism into Cuba
D) Colonialism damages Cuba - must be rejected
Consult NATO counterplan

Negative Block

Extend the Juragua counterplan and the MAI portion of the Trade position, kick Clinton and Shunning

IRAQ:
INC Strategy

Executive Order CP
Keep Airstrikes CP
SOP
Clinton
Israel
Spanos/Statism
Kritik of Poverty/Development
T - Ending bombing isn't Constructive Engagement

IRAN:
INC Strategy
Israel
Executive Order

SYRIA:
INC Strategy
Executive Order

NORTH KOREA:
INC Strategy
Executive Order

School: Georgia
Team(s): RS

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):
Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

Clinton
Pakistan
Intervention
Sanctions Credibility
MNC's
E.O. CP
Israel
Oil

IRAQ:
INC Strategy

Lift All sanctions CP
Spanos
Said
Oil
Israel

NORTH KOREA:
INC Strategy

Consult SK CP
SK Rltns.
Clinton
Pakistan

SOUTH CAROLINA

Georgia RK
-Remove T- Congress
-Agent Specification
-Effects T
^ÖExecutive Order C/P
-Clinton WTO

Georgia ES
-Consult South Korea
-US/ S. Korea Relations
-Intervention trade off
-T-Immediate, can^Öt consult

Georgia PQ
-Agentless illegit
-MNK Domination
-SOP
-CTBT-Clinton
-Shunning
-CP-Executive Orders
-Genocide trivialization

Georgia BB
-Executive Order C/P
-Clitonj CTBT
-fiat abuse/worldwide C/P
-Sargmets
-T constructiev engagement
-T remove
-Author Advocacy

Georgia State

WAKE

Round: 1
Team: Georgia State AP
vs.: Liberty RW
Aff case (country): Cuba
Judge: Robertson
INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)
Reactor
Transition
Latin American Democracies
Fem IR

Slavery - Trading with Castro is akin to dealing with slave traders. That's immoral

Underground Railroad C/P - The US government will lift all restrictions on the citizens of Cuba or refugees arriving from Cuba

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
Fem IR
Transition

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 2
Team: Georgia State HK
vs.: Iowa LR
Aff case (country): Iraq
Judge: Slusher
INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)
Extra T - Negotiations with the UN are extra topical

Ag Inflation - Ag demand key to determining the level of inflation. Plan increases the exports to Iraq

Clinton - Not capital - Clinton's relations with Congress are key to the WTO

Oil - Prices high now; Iraqi exports crush Saudi Economy and kills US influence in the region

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
Extra Topicality

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3
Team: Georgia State HK
vs.: UNT GG
Aff case (country): Iraq
Judge: McBride, Brian - Northwestern
INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)
T - CE is carrots, not sticks
Extra T - plan fiats UN
Clinton - WTO scenario
Inflation
Oil

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Oil, morality turns, prolif/lashout turns, clinton

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3
Team: Georgia State AP
vs.: Fullerton NW
Aff case (country): Cuba

Judge: L. Jordan

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Topicality

CP: Gradual lifting of targeted sanctions, VanBergeijk, 1994 Economic Diplomacy, Trade, and Commercial Policy

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Human rights outweigh the case, which the CP solves. Topicality takes out solvency.

George Mason

LONG BEACH

Long Beach sr. division

George Mason's responses to the Iraq 1AC

Off-case

"UN sanctions aren't US sanctions" Topicality

CP

Do plan, but keep sanctions on IMF/World Bank loans in place

Freedom of Religion

Iraq violates religious freedom

Speaking against this oppression avoids a holocaust

Clinton: NTR good w/protectionism impacts

ILO (International Labor.....)

The US must push for Chinese compliance with labor standards

Unless other countries see our threat of sanctions as credible, they won't be afraid of us

That causes them to violate labor standards

Causing death etc.

War Crimes

On-case

It's Saddam's fault

Gordon doesn't want all sanctions lifted; she just wants them improved

Utility outweighs

USC

Negative Positions:

Topicality includeing

Religious Freedom DA

War Crimes - Saddam is a war criminal

Loopholes CP - targeted sanctions

Just War Doctrine Bad

Negative Positions:

T nearly all/CE

Food aid Diverted

SK economy DA

Religious Freedom DA

ICO DA

Leverage with out Sanctions

WAKE

George Mason

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 5

Team: George Mason AH

vs.: Emory JS

Case: Iraq

Judge: Cornellier, Erik-Gonzaga

1NC Off-Case Arguments

Religious Persecution

Administrative Evil

War Crimes

T: CE

T: Policy
Extra T
Diversion on-case

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
War Crimes
Religious Persecution
Diversion Arguments

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 7
Team: George Mason AH
vs.: Baylor KS
Case: Iran
Judge: Siver
INC Off-Case Arguments
T: CE

Israel
--Barak Restoring Relations
--US Promised Israel No Engagement With Iran Until No More Terrorism
--US/Israeli Relations Solve Many Conflicts and Prevent Prolif WMD

Spanos
--Constructing a Threat
--Acting Within Cycle is a Self-Fulfilling Prophecy
--Must Rethink
--Accept of Perm = Negative Ballot

Turkey
--US/Turkish Relations at a Crossroads-Washington Times 9/24/99
--Turkey believed Iran supported PKK
--Lifting Sanctions Perceived as Soft on Terror
--US/Turkish Relations Unravel Support-Barkey, Turkey's Kurdish Question 98
--Turkey key to ME
--ME instability leads to nuclear war-NY 11/16/99
--M2Presswire 10/22/99
--Links Makovsky 99
www.washingtoninstitute.org/watch/policywatch/policywatch1999/404.htm
--Phillips Roe Backgrounder No. 1135 9-5-97
CWC
--Economic Sanctions Key to Enforcing CWC-Int; Herald Tribune 9/11/96
--Weak Sanctions Wrecks CWS-Segall Summer 98
--Perception of weak enforcement decreases CWC-Dunn Shadows and Substance 93
--Increased CW prolifer and terrorism-The Council for a Livable World 93
--CWC Newsletter March 93

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
Kicked spanos and cwc in block
2NR kicked Israel

Went for Turkey
Engagement kills moderates

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 7
Team: GMU IT
vs.: Texas SR
Aff case (country):Iraq
Judge:Coulter
INC Off-Case Arguments
CP- no constructive engagement
War crimes

Scheffer 10/27/99

Shaikly 99

Us dept. of state 99 "sadam hussein's iraq"

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 6
Team: George Mason IT
vs.: Mercer DT
Aff case (country): Iran
Judge: Kerr
INC Off-Case Arguments
Rice Disad

US/Turkey Relations

CWC

Religious Persecution

Khatami

US/Israel Relations disad on the case

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
Block: kicked rice, went for Caspian Takeouts, and everything else

Claims Khatami disad means that the case is solved inevitably

2NR - case solved inevitably. Khatami turns case.
Goes for Turkey
Kicked Religious Persecution, CWC, and Israel

George Mason

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3
Team: George Mason AH
vs.: Michigan State VW
Aff case (country): Iran
Judge: Gerber - Kansas
INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)
CWC DA - Congress says its support of the CWC is contingent on a hardline policy on Iran, CWC good
- International Herald Tribune, 9/11/96, "contains tough enforcement measure"
- Segall, International Lawyer, Summer vol 32:271
- Lewis Dunn, Shadows and Substance, 1993
- CWC newsletter, March, p. 3-4
- Post and Courier, 2/7/1998, "botulimum toxin kills people"

Khatami DA

Israel - Israel fears Iran, Plan is perceived as US abandonment

T - Policy and Nearly all

Turkey DA - Turkey fears the PKK, They think that Iran supports the PKK, so plan fractures US-Turkey relations
- Washington Times, 9/24/1999, "Turkey implicating its national security"
- www.washingtoninstitute.org/watch/policywatch/policymatch1999/404.htm
- James Phillips, Roe Backgrounder No 1135, 9/5/1997
- Henri Barkey, Turkey's Kurdish Question, 1998
- NYT, 11/16/1999, "Clinton repeatedly mentioned"
- M2 Presswire, 10/22/1999, "most dangerous region and lethal combination"

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
2NR goes for Turkey, CWC and the case arguments

George Mason

School: George Mason University

Team(s): A/H and I/T

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

IMF - Aff causes lending; IMF loans hurt the environment

Clinton

Pakistan

Rice

Religious Persecution

Israel

Russia

China

Middle East D/A

Appeasement

Arguments Extended in the Negative Block (New Link Stories, Cites, Time Allocation, etc)

The 2NC may spend most of the time on Clinton and read a new link scenario.

CUBA:

INC Strategy

Religious Persecution Act - Act has passed; Cuba violates it; RPA good

Food and Transition Advantage Answers:

-Castro doesn't want aid

-Castro wants aid but he diverts it

-Castro doesn't want health care

-EU proves engagement fails

-Lifting the embargo increases suffering and kills reforms. SQ will cause a smooth transition

KINGS

George Mason University VW

Against WVU DE:

Disads: IMF DA, Saddam, plan allows terrorism increase, plan allows Saddam to develop WMD

CP: support anti-Saddam resistance

George Mason University GS

Against Liberty GR

T - Viol: Plan doesn't remove nearly all sanctions - ALL

Plan not enough to be CE - Including [plan just removes sanctions]

Disads: Russia Pipes '97; Russia TV 8-18-99

Impacts : Su '99; Maxnigani '99

IMF: sanctions block ax's to int'l lending institutes

Impacts: Elkins , 91

HIPC: Urakani '99; Brudney '94; AFD, 8.31.1999

Holloway '99 ; African News 9.17.1999

George Mason University LW

Against Catholic FS

T Violations: Policy

Disads: lifting of sanctions are bad, political capital

CP: N/A

Other Good Arg: Argues "Big stick" approach would probably cause harms they want to prevent

Cites: none

George Mason University ??
Against MWC ??

Disads: NASA - plan angers Congress - congress cuts NASA asteroid mapping
budget - asteroid mapping needed to save the world

IMF - plan lifts sanctions opening door to IMF structural
adjustment loans to Cuba - structural adjustment increases poverty and hurts
the environment turning case

UNI

Agenda setting counter-plan

Clinton
-NASA asteroid tracking

Topicality
-adopt vs. create
-all or nearly all
-you must implement an existing policy^A ground implications

Political Spectacle

Clinton counter-plan
-Clinton will not put the affirmative on the agenda until he develops
a
congressional consensus around it.
-solves case and Clinton

large solvency dump against Cuba

Threat construction

George Washington

WAKE

George Washington

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 2

Team: George Washington BS

vs.: Emory JS

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: Overby

1NC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Clinton - Roads

Frampton 99, Lazaoff 99, Sease 97

States tradeoff - Bluestein, Washington Post 5-16-99

- Journal of Commerce 8-7-97

- Spicer 96

Topicality - Commitment isn't action, air strikes isn't constructive engagement

Case

US not to blame - 15 reasons

Simons indict - Taylor 97 (Survival)

WMD, oil takeouts

- NER 9-20-99

- Schofield 98 Commentary

George Washington

School: George Washington

Team(s): BS

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of 1NC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

Clinton - UN dues

CP - keep sanctions on sugar, fruit

KINGS

George Washington University MX

Against Liberty FY

T-Viol: none

Disads: Quadrangle - BOP, US currently in alliance with Japan, collapse à arms race

Clinton - F22 Scenario

CP: Consult Japan CP

Gonzaga

BAYLOR

Keola Whittaker/Brian Ward

Affirmative Round Report

Aff Case: Iran Neg Team: Gonzaga LE Tournament Baylor Round 7 Judge Nixon

INC Off Case Positions:

Vagueness

T CE

Israel

NTR

Financial investment

Rice

INC Case Arguments:

Russia turn

Khatami turns

prolif

no baku-ceyhan pipeline now

2NR:

NTR and Israel

WAKE

Gonzaga

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 2

Team: Gonzaga KM

vs.: Georgia PQ

Aff case (country): North Korea

Judge: Trice - Michigan State

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

T - Constructive Engagement must include both carrots and sticks

Clinton - Chinese WTO

- USA Today 11-16-1999 "heavily lobbied fight"

- Feffer www.foreignpolicy-infocus.org, 7-15-1999

- Financial Times, 9-10-1999, "bolster China's faltering"

ROK Relations

- Korea Herald, 11-19-1999, "Policy makers who pose them tomorrow"

- Asia and Pacific Review World of Information, 10-21-1999, "Korea's restructuring programme"

- National Post, 7-28-1999, "significant economic downturn"

Shunning

Case Arguments

- Brinksmanship

- Aid Diversion

- No Collapse

- Reforms cause collapse

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Went for Clinton as turning back the case and the case arguments

T kicked in the block

shunning kicked in the 2nr

- you are complicit
- you send signal worldwide
- you can't evaluate impact to life

LEWIS & CLARK

Lewis and Clark Rd 3
Affirmative CO (Iran) vs. Gonzaga KM

INC off-case
T—CE is sticks and carrots
Realism (chessboard) kritik (Simon Dalby, Creating the Second Cold War, 1990)
Clinton—WTO
Shunning
That market turn (Business Line, 8-24)

INC Case arguments
Extremism
Just the usual Phillips cards and stuff

Prolif
1. your impact evidence is bad
2. – 4. Phillips cards about sanctions solving
5. hard currency turn < >
6. no impact <Cordsman>
7. Sanctions deter Hormuz war < >
8. Hormuz conflict is bad < >

Solvency
You don't cause business investment (a couple cards)
And a couple analyticals

Caspian
Can't solve ethnic conflict
There is no power vacuum < >
You cause NATO to move into Central Asia < >
Russia won't cause violence < >
Iran pipeline is bad < >

2NR
the K

Aff Team/Case: Iran Neg Team: Gonzaga EH Tournament LC Round 5 Judge MG Devereaux
INC Off Case Positions:
Financial Sanctions CP
Clinton good - Debt Relief
Shunning

INC Case Arguments:
Philips turns
NATO turn - we increase us presence, causes increased NATO presence, causes more clashes and stuff
we prevent caspian economic development
Iranian pipeline causes terrorism
Russian influence good - prevents Iranian aggression
Caspian development is not possible
sanctions block WMD/agression

2NR:
Case turns
Debt Relief

WESTERN SCRIMMAGE

Gonzaga EA (neg) vs. Whitman BS (unconditional Cuba)
INC:

Clinton -- Political Capital -- WTO Impact

Democracy Promotion

IMF

Juragua Counter-plan

Text: [aff plan text] . . . excluding section 111 of Helms-Burton.

Net Benefit:

Sanctions block investment in Juragua, Lucio '96, 27 U. Miami Inter-Am. L. Rev. 325, "President can also withhold."

Impact: 80 million lives, Minter '98, Journal of Commerce, "potentially radioactive cloud"

Case arguments:

No SQ suffering, Lane '98, www.secruity-policy.org/papers/1998/98-c17at.html

Castro liberalizing in SQ to avoid civil war, Baloyra '94, Cuba and the Future

Gradual engagement leads to a peaceful transition, Schulz '94, Cuba and the Future

Lift sanctions leads to tourism, Zamora '97, Pln J. Int'l L. "post embargo scenarios predict"

Tourism leads to the destruction of coral reefs and global extinction, Bradford 5-15-99 (94??) Mother Jones, p. 60, "more than 90 percent of the reefs"

Lifting Sanctions leads to totalitarianism, Suchliki '98, "A piecemeal lifting of the embargo"

2NR: Juragua counter-plan

Aff team: whitman ww (Iran)

neg team: Gonzaga LG

1NC off case: financial sanctions CP (they claimed they keep financial sanctions on all governmental leaders, including

Khatami...when their story was that keeping the sanctions would prevent the hardliners from gaining power...they kicked the CP in the block ☺)

clinton/wto good

1NC on case: turkey disad on the caspian adv (relations scenario), phillips turns on extremism, oil revenues => proliferation and arms buildups, sanctions deter Iran

2NR: just clinton/wto good claiming the impact card turns all aff advantages

UNI

Clinton

-WTO with a political capital link

Oil prices d/a

Shunning

Financial Sanction Counterplan

Harvard

WAKE

Harvard

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1

team: Harvard WC

vs.: Florida State BC

Aff case (country): Iran

Judge: Kennedy

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Clinton - WTO

Israel Disad (US-Israel Relations, Peace Process Scenario)

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Beat the objectivism advantage.

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1

Team: Harvard CR

vs.: Kansas State HZ

Aff case (country): Cuba

Judge: Davis, Don

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Clinton - WTO will pass - San Diego Union Tribune, 11/17/99

Clinton needs pol cap - Bulliten Fronrunner, 11/16/99

No WTO = decreased Sino-US relations, Fisan - Boston Globe 9/11/99

Nuclear Reactor DA

Spanos on case

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Went for case takeouts and Clinton

Harvard

School: Harvard

Team(s): WC, CR

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

Spanos

Clinton - WTO

T - Nearly all and Xtra-T - travel ban restrictions are diplomatic sanctions

Neg Strategy in Rebuttals (key arguments, tricks, things they kick out of)

Goes for Spanos

CUBA:

INC Strategy

Reactor DA

INC Case Arguments and Cites:

Coercion

1. plan only lifts sanctions against Cuba, so can't solve all of coercion

2. Castro won't give property back

3. Sanctions solve compensation

Smagula 95, "in an attempt to negotiate"

4. Helms-Burton solves property claims

The International Lawyer, Vol 32, Spring 1998, p 85, Craig R. Giesze

5. Lifting embargo prevents property resolution

Cuban Liberty and Democratic Solidarity Act of 1995, Committee on Int'l Relations, 7-11-95, p 254

6. Lifting embargo strengthens Castro's control
Revolutionary Cuba and the End of the Cold War, David C. Jordan, 1993, p 231
7. Plan destroys leverage over Castro
United States Economic Measures Against Cuba, Robert S. Gelbard, 1993, p 143
8. Castro sabotages any CE efforts
The Record, 3-19-99, "in only Castro would let him, Clinton"

Suffering

1. US largest donor of humanitarian assistance to Cuba
www.us.net/cip/sdmyths.htm
2. SQ not block humanitarian exports
Congressional Digest, March 1999, p 91, Claudio Benedi
3. Castro diverts food and medicine
www.canfnet.org/canf-lib/ginend_a.txt, A Critical Analysis - Report presented before the UN Human Rights Commission, March-April, 1997, "Another reason behind the discontent is the amount"

IRAN:

INC Strategy

RC-

Clinton UN Funding

Elections DA (on case) - Moderates are going to win now, plan is a rally point for Hardliners, they win the elections, turns case

Negative Block

2NC goes for the Elections DA

1NR goes for Clinton

Strategy in Rebuttals

Kicks Clinton

Idaho State

LEWIS & CLARK

Idaho State TY's neg strategy against Iraq

Off-case:

Clinton – WTO

Econ

Case increases jobs
Rate hikes will hinge on the next unemployment report (sometime this November)
Rate hikes will kill the stock market
Mead's impacts

CP – delay plan until 1/24/00
Avoids WTO and the unemployment report

On-case:

Iraq has biological weapons and the capability to use them
** Non-unique, true in SQ, too
Saddam won't cooperate
The starvation is Saddam's fault

2NR:

CP
Econ
Some case

Aff Team/Case: Iran Neg Team: Idaho CT Tournament Lewis and Clark Round 2 Judge Cornellier

INC Off Case Positions:

Delay CP (delay until February 2000)

T - Constructive Engagement = carrots and sticks

T - Immediate

Econ - rate hikes

WTO good

INC Case Arguments: None

2NR: Delay, econ (won on arg that we claim PICs are bad, which is abusive)

Aff Team/Case: Iran Neg Team: Idaho BD Tournament LC Round 3 Judge Chris Cooper

INC Off Case Positions:

WTO good

T - Constructive engagement must be conditional

Econ rate hikes

Condition CP (based on ending of support for terrorism, WMD, and coup attempts in other countries)

INC Case Arguments:

Philips turns

Iran supports terrorism now

Sanctions block WMD

2NR:

Condition CP + Econ

Illinois State

WAKE

Illinois State

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 6

Team: Illinois State BU

vs.: Samford JB

Aff case (country): Cuba

Judge: Cornellier

INC Off-Case Arguments

T-CE

T-removal

Statism-Ashley 84, Walker 93 Inside/Outside: Intl Relns as Political Theory

Anarchy CP: Wreck 78, Anarchism, Fox 93, American Psychologist

Wolff 76, In Defense of Anarchism, Rothbard 73, For A New Liberty, Coon, Journal American History, Kateb 86 Inner Ocean

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Went for T-CE

Illinois State

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 2

Team: Illinois State BU

vs.: Emory BG

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: Bratt

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Statism - Ashley 84

T - CE

Prolif credibility - NYT, 11-20; Butler and Kerry 9-28-99 FNS

CP - consult the Security Council to implement British/Dutch plan with Iraq

-Butler 9-28-99; NYT 11-20-99; Washington Post 11-20-99; Foreign Report 10-7-99; Butler 10-99

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

CP and prolif credibility

Illinois State

School: Illinois State

Team(s): VB

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

Topicality

-Constructive

-constructive engagement means that you can not lift all sanctions

-nation state - Saddam is not a nation state ? lacks the support of

the

public

-adopt

Economy

-increase in the labor market = an increase in interest rates increase

in interest rates kills the world economy = war

- increase exports after sanction lift = inflation

Statism kritik

Threat Construction

UNI:

Topicality

-Constructive

-constructive engagement means that you can not lift all sanctions

-nation state - Saddam is not a nation state ? lacks the support of the

public

-adopt

Economy

-increase in the labor market = an increase in interest rates increase

in

interest rates kills the world economy = war

-increase exports after sanction lift = inflation

Statism kritik

Threat Construction

China

-PRC/Cuba ties increasing

-sino/us ties increasing

-U.S./Cuba ties increase = us/china ties decrease = which is not good

-we have agreed to consult them on north Korea^Å the plan doesn^Öt^Å

killing relations ? Taiwan war

-plan infringes upon Chinese sphere of influence

Clinton

-CTBT with a political capital link

-argue that CTBT will pass before the affirmative plan

Petros Kritik

-neo-liberalism

Russia

-Hardliners want hegemony in the Middle East ? anti U.S. presence

Iowa:

DARTMOUTH

Kansas Iowa Mancuso

Iac: no changes

Inc: agent specification, ntr, kurds da, cp to change oil for food

Emory (Cuba) vs Iowa (neg)

INC: Clinton - NTR, Agent Specification, Weber Kritik (US hegemonic goals toward Cuba are based in hyper masculine ideals), case answers

2NR: case take outs and transition turns

Some details:

Round One.

West Georgia (Iraq) vs Iowa (neg).

Inc: reform Oil for food CP, International Law (war reparations), Kurdish Genocide, Clinton - NMD, agent specification, extra-t (ending military aggression is not toward government of Iraq), standard case take outs

WILLIAM JEWELL

IOWA HM

Against Michigan State LM (Iraq):

-Israel

-WTO/NTR-Clinton

-WMD

IOWA MP

Against Chicago BS (POMO):

-CP: Remove all economic sanctions towards all topic countries and actively engage in the critical discourse of post-modernism. The USFG will also engage these countries in high-level diplomatic talks. Net Benefits: Burke - Perspective by incongruity; DeCerteau - Practice of everyday life.

-Topicality: Not constructive engagement ("including") - only lift sanctions.

USC

Negative Positions:

KEDO

Grand Negotiator

Codify Perry Plan CP

T Agent Specification

T Must Specify which sanctions you lift

WAKE

Iowa

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 5

Team: Iowa LR

vs.: Kansas EM

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: Deatherage

INC Off-Case Arguments

Topicality Just Lifting Sanctions Not CE

INR Overview

- better for ground
- semantic accuracy - interpretation makes "including" meaningless
- winning topicality proves shouldn't have had to run the CP in first place
- infinite regression - not just in round but must be held responsible for all they justify

1NR Line-By-Line (2AC argument - 1NR answers)

restructure sanctions - plan focus of the debate - no directed fiat of dialogue or engagement - must be in the plan - became conditional, pre-round prep in the debate, neg shouldn't have to run an argument to get back to ground zero, shouldn't have to ask in cross-ex

we meet - restructure

no intent to define - all about interpretations

policy of CE - Wolcott evidence another violation - policy pro-active engagement with another country

end bombing - not pro-active, not engage with gov or Iraq

diplomacy - not in text

no ground loss - couldn't run arguments, ground zero argument, can't run Das toward constructive engagement -

5 topic countries check stagnation - irrelevant to ground and education arguments

grammatically correct, commas - interpretation that does both is better, they kill education

civilian goods - not CE with gov, extra-topical

lifting sanctions are CE - says leads to CE, read the plan text, overthrow not CE

including - must go beyond, interpretation not definitions, many argument can't run

boredom not a voter - destroy education, gateway issue

CP - End airstrikes (plan only suspends)

Not compete - suspend temporary in plan, definition

Not violate non combatant immunity - used to target civilians in every instance, violate morality in every instance because use people as means to an end

No NB - readiness costs 1.4 billion every time we start

Both allow in future - only if aggression, hypothetical, targets civilians

Not re-imposed - New Internationalist ev proves can revive in the future, history makes very likely, NFZ used as an excuse

Specification - allows neg ground, gain advantage by putting suspend in 1AC, plan leaves possibility could resume over NFZs, write future time into plan

Textuality important - ans. Non-competitive above

Perm - suspend and end - bad for ground, severance, sever temporary nature of suspend, ban the plan CP becomes competitive

Suspend = cause to stop or cease - for a period, CP severs for a period

Textuality important - proves neg arguments, not only textuality or could permute things diametrically opposed to the plan, philosophical competition more important

Per - do the CP - severs bad

PICs - no aff ground loss, case = DA to CP, not a voter - literature, competition, aff infinite prep time, inf reg no line, PICs good - aff accountability for plan, realistic debate, increases clash, impact analysis small infringement not enough to vote against, in-rd reciprocity to capture morality, plan has DA itself, search for best policy option, defend entire plan against the DA, should defend that resumption of strikes good in the future, plan not permanent focus for debate because search for best policy option

Dispositionality - CP unconditional

Iowa

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1

Team: Iowa LR

vs.: Georgia RS

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: Dutcher

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

CP - same as caselist

T - must do more sanctions

Clinton - WTO

will be passed but needs bipart - Hong Kong Std 11-17

plan unpopular, CP not - Oxfam (also caselist)

WTO key to relations - Boston Globe, Fisch

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Andy Ryan: "No tricks, not smart enuf." (Is that why he's not at Wake any more?)

CP and Clinton

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3

Team: Iowa LR

vs.: Berkley HL

Aff case (country): Iran

Judge: Falconer

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Agent Specification

Clinton

-Congress grant WTO now

[Hong Kong 99]

-Lift Sanctions = political suicide

[Dunning 99]

-Need support to get WTO on track

[XX]

-Failed WTO kill US-Sino relations

[Boston Globe 99]

-Global War

[Chicago Tribune 96]

INR Link

[Pittsburgh Post 4/18/99 "Iran-Libya Act to be repealed, Congress"]

-Prolif Inev

[Eizenstat Survival Autumn 99]

-Sanctions delay prolif

[Eizenstat 99]

-Sanctions solves WMD exodus

[welch Y 4.F76/2:S.Hrg.105-289 p16-7 1997]

-Sanctions avoid instability

[Eizenstat 99]

-Engage not solve moderation

[Middle East Insight May/June 99 p86]

-Iran not negotiate on WMD

[Masoud Current History 1/98 p40]

Article 4 trashed now Iran not key

Other articles more important

India and Pak t/o NPT credibility

Breaking NPT viable

Iran violate the NPT

[Eizenstat 99]

Not attack unless provoked

[Eizenstat 99]

Embolden indigenous production

[Cordesman 99]

Lifting sanctions -> Iran/Iraq war

[mitchell 1/29/98 www.usaengage.org/lnews/920129wsj.html]

No investment in Iranian oil - trade practices

[Miller 97 Y 4.IN 8/16: IR 1/6, p 71]

No investment

[Clawson 99 www.usia.gov/regional/nea/gulfsec/iran0603.htm]

Succession Crisis Blocks Investment

[Federal News Service, 7/8/98 "that characterization of those barrels"]

[Petroleum Economist 7/29/99 "Every month sees some new"]

Moderates in the SQ softline helps the H/L

[Wash Times 99]

Khomeini blocks US-Iran relations

[Journal of Commerce 11/2/99 "more than three months away"]

Anything other than Baku-Ceyan pipeline kills US - Turkey relations

[CSIS Watch 11/20/98 csis.org "profound impact"]

Turkey-US relations key to regional stability

[Strategic Review Summer 1999 p62]

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Answer to sanctions help the hardliners is that Khatami won when we had sanctions which empirically denies your turns and there is no uniqueness to loss in the SQ

Clinton and Khatami D/A on the case and proliferation turns [Eizenstat]

And a little narration on his strat by Baxter himself...

What the fuck do you want me to do? Admit our case cards suck in front of Russ? "Do your cards actually say that?" Hmmm...well what the <text clipped> do you think? You think Bellus got us cards that say it causes a big fucking nuclear war? Our Mitchell iran/iraq war card licks my <text clipped> ... I am ashamed going for that card. It makes me feel like a mental midget. I don't know what else to do. They dropped it. It's a war. <text - clipped>, why not?

Now now ABR... I'm sure the card isn't that bad. And if they did drop it then don't worry about it so much. Why don't you all get the card and decide for yourself???

Iowa

School: Iowa

Team(s): LR, MP

Most of this information is for Iowa LR and may apply to MP

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

Must Specify your Agent

Topicality-- Must do more than lift sanctions

Must Specify Which Sanctions you Lift

(some other theory args we never go for)

Clinton-- UN Dues (Good), Pressler (Bad)

Grand Negotiator

Arguments Extended in the Negative Block (New Link Stories, Cites, Time Allocation, etc)

Usually extend CP, Clinton, case, and agent specification

Neg Strategy in Rebuttals (key arguments, tricks, things they kick out of)

Nuke war outweighs rights (Gerwirth, Human Rights, 1982) (Aiken, World Hunger and Moral Obligation, 1977, p.95)

CUBA:

INC Strategy

-Clinton Good (Link: Financial Times 9-8-99 "Cuba's long-standing position")

-Feminism (Andy Ryan running this? What a joke!)

Link - Encountering Castro's Cuba initiated a crisis in U.S. hegemonic identity

Cynthia Weber, Faking It, 1999, p 1-3

Implications

1 Case is another extension to pacify L.A. and solidify its position as global hegemon

2 No intervening allows the U.S. to rewrite its story of Cuban relations, and fulfill its desire for a feminized counterpart to its hypermasculine identity. This renarrativation further allows the U.S. to maintain its myth of a straight, masculine hegemony

3 Rejection is the only way to force the U.S. into recognizing its queer identity and unravel its hegemonic stature

-Suffering Advantage Answers

1. --> Castro aggression
www.canfnet.org/canf-lib/embg_eng.txt
2. No humanitarian crisis
Orbis, Fall, 1998, p 550-552, Michael Radu
3. Food/medicine bill opens the door to eliminate sanctions
Journal of Commerce, February 1, 1999 "but the question is what effect each"
4. Castro --> problems, not embargo
www.nocastro.com/embargo/jeffjby.htm, April 2, 1999
5. Soviet aid does not get to Cuban people
Canfnet
6. Genocide trivialization

Negative Block

Went for everything except for a few case args (through the block and in the 2NR)

IRAQ:

INC Strategy

-Generic Theory Arguments

-Clinton Good DA

-Military Modernization/Diversion/Prolif turns on the case

-Reform Oil-for-food CP

TEXT: The United States government, in conjunction with the United Nations, will propose and implement the following changes in the Oil for Food program in Iraq

- (1) Currently frozen Iraqi assets will be made available at the rate of \$10 million a month to be depleted into a UN escrow account to Oil For Food.
 - (2) Priority contracts will be given to supplies that have direct impact on the well being of children
 - (3) The approval process for Oil For Food export laws will be shortened to no more than two days for previously approved items, with food and medical supplies having unconditional acceptance. Requests for dual use items will be processed the same as the status quo.
 - (4) The UN will temporarily borrow from the War Compensation fund in the Oil for Food program to ensure that food targets in Iraq are met.
 - (5) The ceiling on the Oil for Food program will be lifted to increase investment in Iraq's oil structure, including allowing for cross-country trading in the Middle East. All funds gained by this change will be monitored by the United Nations.
- Solvency www.un.org/Depts/oip/panelrep.html

Negative Block

CP, Clinton, case and one of the theory arguments

Strategy in Rebuttals

CP and Clinton

NORTH KOREA:

INC Strategy

-Food Aid CP

-Clinton

-Russia (North Korea within Russia's sphere of influence... the United States steps on their ground = nationalist and a tactical nuclear launch)

-Security Kritik

-Capitalism Kritik (Lifting sanctions is only to increase U.S. capitalist hegemony)

-Inherency

UNI

Clinton:

-WTO

-WTO will pass in the status quo, plan = a backlash, WTO fails, decreases u.s./china relations, war.

-Taiwan invasion impact

-south china morning post 9-14-99

-Boston Globe and Chicago Tribune 2-6-96

-financial times, 9-8-99

-Boston Globe, 9-11-99

-congress hates north korea, ILSA

-KEDO

-washington times 1-27-99

-UPI 9-13-99

-International Herald Tribune 9-14-99

Russia

-North Korea within Russia's sphere of influence vs the United States
steps on their ground = nationalist and a tactical nuclear launch

Capitalism Kritik

-lifting sanctions is only to increase U.S. capitalist hegemony.

Topicality

-nearly all

-economic sanctions are distinct from military sanctions

Presidents export council, 6-97

-constructive engagement

Security kritik

United States give food aid to north korea counterplan

-solves Clinton

-Third World Quarterly, 1999

Proliferation good

Feminist international relations

-politics masculinized, turning case

Kritik of imperialism

Fund KEDO counter-plan

IMF

Change Oil for food counter-plan

-The United States government, with the United Nations, will change oil

for food.

1. Currently frozen Iraq assets will be made available at the rate of ten million dollars a month to be deposited into a United Nations escrow account to support oil for food.

2. Priority Contracts will be given to supplies that have a direct impact on the well being of children.

3. The approval process for oil for food export laws will be shortened to no more than 2 days for previously approved items, with food and medical supplies having unconditional acceptance. Requests for Dual use processed the same as the status quo.

4. The United Nations will temporarily borrow from the war compensation fund in the oil for food program to ensure that food targets in Iraq are met.

5. The ceiling on the oil for food program will be lifted to increase investment including allowing for cross country trading in the Middle East.

-all funds gained by this change will be monitored by the UN

John Carroll

WILLIAM JEWELL

JOHN CARROLL

Against Kansas HZ (Cuba):

- Rice
- Mexico
- Drugs
- Sustainable Agriculture
- Globalization K
- Juragua

WAKE

John Carroll

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 4

Team: John Carroll LS

vs.:

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge:

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Oil Prices DA:

- Thurston, 9/22/99
- AFP: kw: oil prices remain volatile
- Rubin, Jerusalem Post, 2/5/98, "containing Saddam"
- David, Jan-Feb 99, Foreign Affairs
- David Lynch, 3/22/99, USA Today, "Arabia's economic reforms"

Topicality - Constructive Engagement

Voldanovich 94- more than just lifting sanctions

Topicality - All or Nearly All

Disengage CP: The US will disengage from the ME.

- Engagement causes miscalculation (Nordlinger 95 book,
- US must disengage (Conroy 98: www.cato.org CATO handbook for Congress)
- Disengagement inevitable (Conroy 97, www.cato.org, No. 267)

Clinton-WTO DA:

- IPS, 11/19/99, "US-China accord"
- San Diego Union Tribune, 10/21/99, "foreign policy is difficult"
- Jacob Fisch 99, Boston Globe, "China in WTO"

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Went for T CE / T all or nearly all

John Carroll

School: John Carroll

Team(s): LS,BC

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

Topicality

- Policy
- Must do more than lift sanctions
- U.S. congress, office of technical assessment, 1993
- including = enlargement
- words and phrases

- appeasement
- constructive engagement
- strategic engagement = only the removal of economic sanctions
- conditioned

Globalization

- Clinton checking globalization
Scott, FDCH, 1999
- Hawkins, The Weekly Standard, 1-19-99
- Globalization increases violence
Norbury-Hodge (sp?) 1996 The Case v. Global Economy
- Business bad

Russian Elections

- Hardliners want a sphere of influence
Heritage Foundation Reports in 1999
- Hardline control = oil disruption
Ariel Cohen, 8-26-98, Heritage Foundation Reports
- Russian hardliners support separatism
Cohen, 1998

China

- United States / Sino relations on the brink
Buttner, US news and world report, 8-9-99
- China fears U.S. unilateral action
Glaser, 1999, www.csis.org
- Strong U.S. / Sino relations key
Bates, Foreign Affairs, August 1999
- plan encroaches upon China's sphere of influence

Disengagement counter-plan

- The united states will lift all its sanctions/militarily disengage in the

Middle East. Engagement risks miscalc.

- Nordlinger, 1995, Isolationism Reconfigured
- Constructive Engagement requires long term involvement
Ivanica Vodanovich, 1999, www.focusweb.org

Clinton

SYRIA:

INC Strategy

TURKEY DISAD

- A. Syria and Turkey have been on the brink of war. Syria has tentatively backed down.
Makovsky, "Defusing the Turkish-Syrian Crisis: Whose Trump?" Middle East Insight, Jan/Feb 9/5/99 -
www.washingtoninstitute.org/media/makovskv.htm
- B. Syria will use the Peace Process to renew conflict with Turkey
Same Source
- C. Syria-Turkey War would draw in all Middle East Forces and would create regional instability
Winston Foundation Oct. 9, 1998 - www.crosslink.net/~wfwf/syria.htm
- D. Escalates to all of Middle East
St. Louis Dispatch, October 6, 1998

Link:

- Peace Agreement frees Syria to work against Turkey, help Iraq - Stratfor 7/19/99
- Alienates Turkey - Stratfor Intelligence Centers, September 2, 1999
www.stratfor.com/MEAF/commentary/m9909022148.htm
- Financial Times, August 27, 1999 "has concerns about the relationship"

Uniqueness

- USA Today, September 2, 1999
- PolicyWatch #366 Feb. 6. 1999 - www.washingtoninstitute.com/watch/Policywatch/policywatch1999/366.htm
- Washington Quarterly Winter 1999 "Even with a full-blown military alliance," lexis

Impacts:

- Economist oct. 10, 1998
- Center for Security Policy, 1997 www.security-policy.org/papers/1997/97-D199.html
- BBC Summary of World Broadcasts, Oct. 29, 1999

Global Intelligence Update Red Alert, December 14, 1998 - www.nyu.edu/globalbeat/mideast/GIU121498.html
National Review, March 8, 1999 "Israel has over and over"
Beres, Connecticut J. of Int'l Law, Summer 1999

Counterplan: Give desalination technology to Syria. (If there is a water wars advantage)

KINGS

John Carroll University ??
Against PSU ??
T - Viol: CE must carry threat of reprisal

Disads: China relations, Clinton WTO, Globalization bad

Other good arg's: case dump

UNI

Topicality
-Policy
-Must do more than lift sanctions
-U.S. congress, office of technical assessment, 1993
-including = enlargement
words and phrases
-appeasement
-constructive engagement
-strategic engagement = only the removal of economic sanctions
-conditioned

Iran d/a
-Iran lives in a strategically dangerous neighborhood
Kemp, 1997
-Iran's isolationism limits proliferation
Green, 1997
-Globalization increases proliferation
Parker, 1999
Globalization
-Clinton checking globalization
Scott, FDCH, 1999
-Hawkins, The Weekly Standard, 1-19-99
-Globalization increases violence
Norbery-Hodge (sp?) 1996 The Case v. Global Economy
-Business bad

Russian elections
-Hardliners want a sphere of influence
Heritage Foundation Reports in 1999
-Hardline control = oil disruption
Ariel Cohen, 8-26-98, Heritage Foundation Reports
-Russian hardliners support separatism
Cohen, 1998

China
-United States / Sino relations on the brink
Buttler, US news and world report, 8-9-99
-China fears U.S. unilateral action
Glaser, 1999, www.csis.org
-Strong U.S. / Sino relations key
Bates, Foreign Affairs, August 1999
-plan encroaches upon China's sphere of influence

Disengagement counter-plan
-The united states will lift all its sanctions/militarily disengage in
the

Middle East. Engagement risks miscalc.
Nordlinger, 1995, Isolationism Reconfigured
-Constructive Engagement requires long term involvement
Ivanica Vodanovich, 1999, www.focusweb.org

Clinton

Johnson County

UCO

JCCC MR (NORTH KOREA DETERRANCE)

OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:

- Economy - Walker, Weise, Financial Times (to name a few)
- Credibility - Heinrichson
- T - Vandovich '98

BREAKDOWN OF THE BLOCK:

2NC

- Case
- Credibility

1NR

- Economy
- T

NEGATIVE TRICKS

- go for what you're winning

2NR POSITIONS:

- Economy
- Case Turns

UNI

Clinton

- Congress pro-sanctions, political capital key, CTBT stops Pakistan war
- Simons, 1999

Shunning

- Human rights protection solves international order
- North Korea committing flagrant human rights violations
- Both the United States and Individuals have a moral obligation to

shun

evil ? reinforces moral order

- Gordon and Gordon, Beversluis

Israel d/a

WTO sanctions counter plan

- sterling 1996 (north korea specific)

China d/a

- relations

Kansas:

DARTMOUTH

Emory (Cuba) vs. Kansas (neg).

1ac: plan changed the new plan lifted economic sanctions, open dialogue to normalize relations and authorized the negotiation of a compensation agreement advantages were still sanctions are murder, transition and wto
1nc: just war doctrine bad, Jaragua, CP streamline licensing, no natl security exemptions will be used at the WTO, and the U.S. won't invade cuba if there is a civil war; organic ag turns on the case.

2ac: impact turned organic agriculture. a) creates low yeild = starvation, b) causes soil erosion = extinction, c) increases food prices = world wide hunger
2nr: organic ag, transition turns, counterplan

Round 5

Aff neg judge
West Ga Mich State Bellus

Dartmouth Kansas Hester

1AC: new case plan: Plan: the usfg will adopt a policy of constructive engagement with iraq through the immediate elimination of all efforts aimed at inducement, containment or overthrow of the iraqi regime, including, but not limited to, military campaigns, support for iraqi opposition groups, economic, dual-use, and military sanctions. The united states will reverse its position in the united nations to support the lifting of these sanctions. The united states will establish a dialogue with the iraqi government. Aff speeches will clarify our intent.
The 1ac is an indict of modernity. They read a bunch of cards from Zygmunt Bauman Sociology 1995 Life in Fragments: Essays in Postmodern Morality with tags like:

"The source of this ambivalence is under-determination and uncertainty, which constitute the great fear of modern life. Consequently, we try to stabilize the source of our anxiety by locating a concrete and definable source for it so that we can strike out against it and make ourselves think we have done something about it. The US government thus identifies Saddam Hussein's Iraq and its people as the cause of instability in the Persian Gulf."

1NC: Appeasment, Hollow Inspectors, Russia, Counterplan to do most of the plan but not exempt oil sanctions with a net benefit of Russia they also included an intent statement along the lines of: Our intent is not a calculated effort to harm innocents but instead to provide opportunities for others besides the U.S. i.e. Russia.

2NR: went for case takeouts, the counterplan and russia.

WAKE

Kansas

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 6

Team: Kansas EM

vs.: West Georgia EG

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: Brovero

1NC Off-Case Arguments

T Immediately Remove Economic Sanctions

Clinton WTO

Unconditionally lift CP

see Kansas aff round report for cites

Sanctions use Iraqis as a means to an end

U.S. always moves the goalpost of conditions
Gordon, 99, Ethics and International Affairs

Instrumentalize Iraqis

Case arguments:

Iraq won't accept conditions

CNN Nov 6 99 <http://cnn.com/world/meust/9911/06/iraq.un/> "Iraq's deputy prime minister angrily rejected"

Iraq won't accept suspension in exchange for inspector access
AP Nov 4, 1999, "the country cannot accept any move"

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
Reads a whole lot of cards saying Iraq will reject an unconditional lift, here's the cites:

At: Ritter plan

Ritter's suggestions won't work
Stephens, Wall Street Journal, 7-1-99 "Ritter does not even weigh"

Ritter's suggestions are a joke
Jerusalem Post 6-11-99 "Ritter also does not provide"

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 5

Team: Kansas MM

vs.: Lewis and Clark HC

Aff case (country): North Korea

Judge: D. Heidt

INC Off-Case Arguments

clinton-wto

- a. pass now-key to reforms-pittsburgh post gazette
- b. pushing unpop policies hurt political capital
2. unpopular-AP online 99
- c. failure reforms causes econ decline-Walter 99
2. spillover to asian flashpoints-walter 99

south korea

- a. coalition gov't hold on now--? 99
2. us-uk coordination now-Brown 99
- b. opposition demands unconditional lifting of sanctions
2. perry plan help determines outcome of elections
- c. close coordination key to prevent north korean breakout
2. kim's loss crushes economic reforms and kills econ

cp-exec will rally support for food aid

famine ans

sq solves food crisis, US aid not key-china, others fill in

collapse ans

no nk collapse, sq solves--US on gradual path to lifting-solves now, lifting sanctions not solve-ROK not want closer econ ties, no solvency for miscalc,

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
Kicked Clinton, went for CP, South Korea and case takeouts

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 7

Team: Kansas EM

vs.: Michigan BS

Aff case (country): North Korea

Judge: O'Donnell

INC Off-Case Arguments

China-WTO

- a. congress will support now
- b. further sanctions removal will be uphill battle
- 2. new progs devastate support for perry plan
- 3. pushing unpop pol hurts pol cap, Hastert 91
- c. wto key to relations-breakdown chills us-sino rels permanently
- 2. us-china coop key to solve regional probs, brinkmanship and war

Critical Geopolitics

- a. aff participates in linguistic construction of us vs. them
- b. CE as an attempt to "solve" this entrenches problem solution framework, reifies state
- c. Turns case, pragmatic geopolitical thinking accounts for ethnocentric and ineffective foreign policy

CP-plan, but diplomatic engagement (no requirement that further CE is tied to NK cooperation)

- a. diplomatic engagement solves the case impact (Glenn Baek, Washington Times, 11/15/99, "recognition of the DPRK")

No war now (LA Times, 10/27/99, "Asia wants a collapse")

Kansas

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1

Team: Kansas MM

vs.: Liberty CM

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: Parcher

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Topicality - Constructive Engagement - includes more than lifting sanctions

Clinton - WTO - Plan sends capital needed for WTO vote - Impact is cooperation with China needed to solves regional wars

Reparation DA - Sanctions key needed to make Iraq pay reparations - key to credibility of international law - needed for survival

CP - Lift sanctions but maintain targeted sanctions on the government

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Block kicked Clinton and went for everything else

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 2

Team: Kansas RS

vs.: Kentucky JR

Aff case (country): Iran

Judge: Brey

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Clinton - WTO

Grand Negotiator

Khatami

-Khatami will gain leverage

[www.nixoncenter.org/publications/Reality%20Check.7_16Iran.htm]

-Khatami failure causes mass protest

-Lifting sanctions is a hardline victory

[Phillips, www.heritage.org Backgrounder #1152 1998 p1]

-Current Sanctions don't spur nationalism

[Ed. Haas, Economic Sanctions & American Diplomacy 1998 p 95]

Sub Federal Sanctions - States will sanction your country. Turns the case and has external impacts because state sanctions are illigit

CP - Clinton will waive sanctions

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Counterplan solves the case, risk of Clinton

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 2

Team: Kansas EM
vs.: Kentucky HK
Aff case (country): Syria
Judge: Sternhagen
INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)
Turkey

A) Relations High
[NYT 8/30/99]

B) Terrorism List Link
[Makovsky, Reluctant Neighbors, 1996 p156]
[www.mfa.gov.tr/grupa/percept/1/per1-3.htm] - handwriting is bad. May be wrong

C) Impact
Between East & West 1996 p A4

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3
Team: Kansas RS
vs.: Liberty HS
Aff case (country): Iraq
Judge: Sternhagen, Fred - Concordia
INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)
T - can't only lift sanctions

Clinton - WTO scenario

Reparations DA - lifting sanctions guts compensation fund, decreases int law credibility and = war

Grand Negotiator DA - lifting sanctions = unilateral concession, destroys negotiating ability and causes wars

Sub-Federal Agencies DA - states will impose sanctions if plan lifts, impact is confusion

Geopolitics - Aff uses geopolitical discourse, turns case

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
Reparations DA, independent environmental impacts, case t/o's and turns

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 4
Team: Kansas EM
vs.: Emory HL
Aff case (country):
Judge: Rhodes, Clay - UMKC
INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)
CP to pledge not to attack North Korea, fund agreed framework.

Clinton - WTO

A. Congress supports WTO now
B. supports Perry now
ev on inherency proves the link
uphill battle
pushing unpopular policies hurts political capital
C. breakdown of WTO hurts US-China relations
US-China relations key to stop regional wars and prolif

South Korean Elections DA

A. coalition government now - we control uniqueness - Hilfe Country Report, October 28, 1999 - "coalition looks well placed to win if it can stick together"
US-ROK coordination occurs now - Brown, October 1999 - <http://www.csis.org/pacfor/ccejjournal.html>, "The Berlin talks and subsequent developments have eased tensions in Korea"
B. opp demands gradual lifting - Korea Times, 9-15-1999 - "president of the opposition Grand National Party, proposed a conditional engagement"
emp helps Kim politically - Hilfe Country Report, October 28, 1999 - "Another key element in the political mix through into 2000"

C. close coordination key to avoid N Korean breakout - US Institute of Peace 98 - http://www.usip.org/oc/sr/sr_korea.html, "Close consultation and coordination between Washington and Seoul"
 loss of Kim hurts economy - Financial Times, 10-20-99 - "If one believes that a strong economy guarantees electoral success, then the coalition government of Kim"

2NC add-on on South Korea - consultation is key (based on 2nd link in shell)

New US-South Korean coop assures missile breakout - BBC Summary of World Broadcasts, October 5, 1999 - "the US government agreed, in principle, to let South Korea increase the range"

Lack of Consultation = SK perception of behind the scenes deal
 Comling Daily News from Korea, 9-20-99 - "For the South Korean government, what is needed more than anything else at this particular juncture"

Only maintaining tight consultation stops breakout - Korea Herald, 7-6-99 - "What is important at this stage is that Korea, the United States"

Destabilizes entire region - Foreign Report, September 16, 1999 - "administration officials in Washington worry that if South Korea goes it alone, its efforts"

South Korean long range missiles destabilize entire region
 Jane's Intelligence Review, October 1, 1999 - "Such a long-range missile build-up might not only threaten global and regional MTCR"

Inherency answers :

1. SQ = sign of good faith - Paik, 9/27/99 - http://www.nautilus.org/fora/security/9907D_Cha_Discussion.html - "was willing to make the first cooperative move"
2. CTBT and wargames are empirically not scuttling the process. The talks will proceed in november. BBC, October 30, 1999 - "the North agreed on a moratorium on the launch"
3. Status quo solves the case - current policy yielding cooperation. Cossa, October 1999 - Comparative Connections - <http://www.csis.org/pacfor/ccejournal.html>
 "this firm, unified carrot-and-stick approach contributed greatly"
4. their indictment of the perry plan is wrong. It looks at the berlin agreement in isolation and is a bunch of political hype from wackos like Gilman.
 Hilfe Country Report, October 28, 1999 - "pumping up the publicity machine, claims, notably by domestic critics"

2NC extensions - Carrot and stick = only solvency, Asian Wall Street Journal, 10-21-99
 "has recently completed a study of the DPRK's negotiating strategy. Snyder"

North-South relations improving now - Feffer and Lee, 10-19-99, "Change in North Korea",
http://www.nautilus.org/fora/security/9907F_Feffer.html, "North Korea has adjusted its attitudes toward the South"

AT : war advantage

1. war risk low now - LA Times, October 27, 1999 - "Scalapino and others praised the recently released report of former"
2. Threats of North Korean war based on exaggerated Pentagon analysis
 Shorrock, February 1998 - <http://www.foreignpolicy-infocus.org/briefs/vol3/v3n2kor.html>,
 "many analysts doubt that North Korea, which lacks"
3. North Korean nuclear use would be suicide - Park 94, Foreign Policy, 12/22 - "Pyongyang cannot use nuclear weapons in a war against the South"
4. North Korea incapable of war - Eland, 2-8-99, www.cato.org, "Tilting at Windmills: Post Cold War Military Threats to U.S. security", "according to Russell Travers of the usually conservative Defense Intelligence Agency"
5. U.S. would just shift to deescalate crisis - Ken Dark 1996. New Studies in Post-Cold War Security
6. Janes evidence proves already have solved
7. Their MTCR ev old, we postdate - Jane's Intelligence Review, September 1, 1999 - "The Commission suggested that the methods used by the intelligence agencies"
8. All dangerous countries have already acquired missiles - CNN Worldview, September 29, 1999 - "As the development of ballistic missiles has become increasingly advanced"

2NC - Russia and china fill in - National Review, December 7, 1998 - "Russia and China have emerged as major suppliers of technology"

AT : Solvency

1. only makes appeasement worse - guarantees brinkmanship b/c more demands
2. solvency ev terrible
3. lifting sanctions = irrelevant carrot - Eisenstat, 9-21-99

AT : Congress hates perry

1. Perry plan initiated by Congress - Japan Times, October 27, 1999 - "Congress should be credited for its wisdom in demanding a rethinking"
2. SQ policy building bipartisan support - National Journal, 10-23-99, "Republicans have grumbled about the policy ever since they took over Congress"

Cards from somewhere

NK won't negotiate away missiles - Eberstadt, 9-21-99 - http://www.nautilus.org/fora/security/9907B_Eberstadt.html, "not the most parsimonious explanation for DPRK negotiating behaviour at Berlin"

North Korean provocations will not cause conflict - Hilfe Country Report, October 28, 1999 - "US forbearance and the South's increased readiness to allow economic engagement under the sunshine policy"

Kansas

School: Kansas

Team(s): MM, EM, RS

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

Shunning

-must shun human rights abusers to preserve the moral order

NPT Credibility

-sanctions key to credibility, removal kills the NPT = prolif and war

Clinton

WTO, political capital link, WTO key to sino/u.s. relations

Grand negotiator

-giving in to rogue nations crushes U.S. negotiating power, impact is nuclear and biological warfare

Debt Relief - Clinton Good

Grand Negotiator - Generic Appeasement Bad for US Heg

C/P Lift all sanctions except for those that directly target Castro

Shunning

CUBA:

INC Strategy

Taliban Disad-

India-Pak most likely risk of nuclear war

Telegraph Herald 8-17-99

Immediate Removal of Sanctions crushes some deterrence

Jaime Suchlich, Sanctions Revisited, pg. 10-11

A more assertive Taliban will destabilize the MidEast

International Herald Tribune 9-26-99

It's a bad time

Chicago Tribune 10-16-99

Ecotourism-

Plan causes increase in eco-tourism

Martha Honey, Environment, 6-1-99

Ecotourism wreaks havoc on the environment, destroys ecosystems

Interpress Service 2-28-99

Democratization-

On brink of reverse wave of democratization

Larry Diamond, Developing Democracy: Toward Consolidation p. 261 '99

Reverse wave of demo causes WWII

Mark Falcoff, Cuba and the Future, pg. 121, 1994

Clinton link- Engagement w/ Cuba will cost political capital Seattle Times 10-19-98

Counterplan to exclude marinas, parks, places that facilitate ecotourism.

IRAQ:
INC Strategy

Condition sanction removal on UNSCOM inspection counter-plan

IRAN:
INC Strategy

Khatami Credibility

Links

Kemp 7/16/99 www.nixoncenter.org/publications/Reality%20Check/7_16Iran.htm
 Phillips 9/5/97 www.heritage.org Maintain International Pressure and Sanctions on Iran p 10-1 "politically fatal"
 Clawson 98 Economic Sanctions and American Diplomacy, Haas, ed p. 102
 Chubin 98 Survival Autumn, p 156
 Norton 99 Current History Feb p 57
 Phillips 98 Press Khatami to Follow words with deeds Jan 23 www.heritage.org
 Cordesman and Hashim 97 Iran p. 54

U

Foreign Report 9/16/99 patience and calm approach
 Abdo 99 Middle East Report Summer p. 9
 AFP 10/1/99 conservative and reformist factions
 Jerusalem Post 9/15/99 unsigned messages

NORTH KOREA:
INC Strategy

Counterplan to codify current agreement with Korea without new aff
 negotiations/incremental am

UCO

KANSAS RS (N. KOREA)

OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:

- Clinton Links:
- UPI 9/13/99
- CFR Task Force 10/4/99
(<http://foreignrelations.org/public/pubs/nkoreatask.html>)
- National Journal 10/23/99
- AFP 9/16/99
- Food Aid Turn (Duning, 'Over the line', '99, p. 279)

BREAKDOWN OF THE BLOCK:

2NC

1NR

NEGATIVE TRICKS

2NR POSITIONS:

- Clinton
- Food Aid Turns
- War t/o's

KANSAS ST (UNKNOWN)

OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:

- Feminism - Steans '98
- Clinton - UN dues
- Taliban
- IMF PIL
- Sub-Fed Sanctions
- Case

BREAKDOWN OF THE BLOCK:

- 2NC
- IMF
- Advantage Sub-Fed Sanctions
- 1NR
- Clinton
- Feminism
- NEGATIVE TRICKS
- 2NR POSITIONS
- Feminism
- IMS CP

UNI:

Shunning

- must shun human rights abusers to preserve the moral order

NPT Credibility

- sanctions key to credibility, removal kills the NPT = prolif and war

Clinton

- WTO, political capital link, WTO key to sino/u.s. relations

Condition sanction removal on UNSCOM inspection counter-plan

Khatami Credibility

Proliferation turns

Grand negotiator

- giving in to rogue nations crushes U.S. negotiating power, impact is nuclear and biological warfare

Counterplan to codify current agreement with korea without new aff negotiations/incremental am

Kansas State

WILLIAM JEWELL

KANSAS STATE ST

Against Texas BB (North Korea):

-Clinton: NTR

-Trilateral DA

-CP: Do plan, but don't remove troops.

WAKE

Kansas State

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 5

Team: Kansas State GS

vs.: UNI BR

Aff case (country): Cuba

Judge: Katsulas

INC Off-Case Arguments

Rice Disad: lifting the embargo displaces sales from Southeast Asia
SEAsia economic decline leads to war

Clinton: WTO

US Credibility: Sanctions key to US credibility concerning rogue states

Case Turns: Juragua, Drug interdiction bad, Sustainable agriculture, pesticides, tourism bad, tobacco exports immoral, increasing vaccine exports kills, stops democracy promotion in Latin America

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Clinton, Rogue Credibility Disad

Kansas State

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1

Team: Kansas State NR

vs.: Michigan State ML

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: Ron Vonburgh

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Plan Vagueness - no solvency advocate

CP - do all of plan except no. 621 of the antiterrorism act to keep the IMF out...

IMF screws up economies x,x

Marxism K// --

A. free trade is imperialistic -- Free trade excludes all other alternatives (Terry, Economic Insanity!, 1995)

B. Free trade displaces power away from the labor/producers

(Carchedi, Marxism and NonEquilibrium Economics, 1996)

Clinton - WTO

Israel Relations -

A. Relations good - Eisenstadt, 1998

B. Israel gets pissed when engage Iraq - Steinburg, 1998

C. Key to peace - Inbar, 1998

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
Marxism

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3
Team: Kansas State HZ
vs.: Texas DM
Aff case (country): Syria
Judge: Lain
INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)
Natasha (Kritik of Capitalism)
CIA CP
Clinton - Chinese WTO
Topicality - all or nearly all
Feminist kritik on the case

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

The 2nr is five and a half minutes of capitalism bad - some key components:

- a) the negative doesn't have to defend the status quo
- b) fiat is ok, but plan doesn't actually pass
- c) constant criticism is needed to combat capitalism

Links to the kritik:

- 1) American trade causes capitalism
- 2) Aid is capitalistic
- 3) Foreign assistance is used to pressure countries and expand US imperialism

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Team: Kansas State NR
vs.: Gonzaga LG
Aff case (country): Cuba
Judge: DP
INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)
BIT's bad, exclusion CP
Sugar
Rice
Clinton/WTO
Drug interdiction cooperation bad

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Clinton in 2NR.

"Would have tried BIT'S CPLAN, but for a mistake in drafting." - dp

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Team: Kansas State HW
vs.: Lewis and Clark HS
Aff case (country): Iran
Judge: Jabobson - Vermont
INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)
Clinton - UN dues -
A. GOP coop on dues now - lynch 99
B. GOP hates ending sanctions
C. Dues key to US leadership in UN which is key to solving ?? Donnelly 1998

Capitalism Kritik

- a. free trade = capitalist
 - b. justification of fallacy of capitalism destroys hope for future - Shabecoff, A New Name for Peace, 1996
 - c. constant capitalist kritik builds revolution
- ryan, Marxism and deconstruction, 1982

MidEast Kritik

- A. rhetorical use of the word "MidEast" lumps arabs into a category
Khalidi, Compartive Studies of S. Asia and the Middle East, XVIII, 1998
- B. use causes colonization - same source

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
Went for both kritiks

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3
Team: Kansas State HW
vs.: UT Dallas JK
Aff case (country): Iraq
Judge: Gabriele Prisco
1NC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)
Capitalism -

- a. Free trade = capitalism Terry '95
- b. Continuing to solve Capitalism
- c. Constantly kritiking capitalism = disruption of hegemony and revolution - Ryan '82
- d. Implication- 1. Must reject
2. Closes off other possibilities

Human Rights Credibility -
a. Must keep current sanctions to solve human rights abuses Abrams '98
b. Engagement destroys human rights
c. Removing sanctions decreases human rights credibility Abrams '98

Shunning -
a. Sanctions uphold human rights policy Beversluis '89
b. Iraq commits Human rights atrocities Westmoreland '99
d. Obligation to shun such regimes Beversluis '89

Targeted Sanctions Counterplan Minnear '98

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
Went for the counterplan with shunning and human rights credibility as net benefits.

Kansas State

School: Kansas State
Team(s): NW, HZ

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):
Outline of 1NC Strategy (include counterplan texts)
Marxism Kritik
Shunning
Orientalism Kritik

CUBA:
1NC Strategy
- Marxism
- Drugs DA
- "Cerds" C/P
- Dissimulation

Offer sanction removal on condition that Castro steps down counterplan

Lift medical and food restrictions but condition return of Guantanamo Bay on the improvement of human rights conditions

Negative Block
2NC
- CP
- Case
1NR
- Case
- Marxism

Strategy in Rebuttals
Marxism

IRAQ:

1NC Strategy

(Version One)

- Israel
- Ban Exports C/P
- Marxism (Terry '95, Ryan '82)

(Version Two)

T - Just Lifting Sanctions Not Topical - Including

Clinton Good - China WTO DA

Iraq Diplomacy Clinton Link - Telhami, Middle East Policy, vol VI, no 1, June 98, p 18

Russian Oil DA

Oil Uniq: Aberdeen Press and Journal, 8/14/99, "oil prices remained buoyant"

Independent, "help buoy oil prices"

Oil key to Russia: Observer, 8/8/99, "manufacturing mired"

Inter Press Service, 7/22/99, "draft federal budget unveiled"

Sunder, 2/1/99 (good aff NU), "very heavily dependent"

Russian Nationalism Brink, Spectator, June 26 99, p 14

Nationalism Impact, CSM, April 24 95

CP - US will give Iraq food aid

Humanitarian Suffering Ans

AT: Right to food, Aiken, World Hunger and Moral Obligation, 1977

No Humanitarian Impact: Clawson, Survival, Spring 98, p 4

Prolif Link *** National Catholic Reporter, June 18 99, "almost certainly not improve"

Lift sanctions not boost economy, Middle East Executive Reports, March 96, "Iraq's multiple crises"

Iraq human rights abuses, Clinton, 8/2/99, US Newswire, "Severe repression continues"

Kantian morality bad: Blumenthal, Moral Responsibility: Mankind's greatest need, 1975**

Negative Block

(Version One)

2NC

- C/P
- Marxism
- 1NR
- Israel
- Case

(Version Two)

Kicked Clinton in the block. Extended Food aid CP, Oil DA, Topicality, and case.

Strategy in Rebuttals

(Version One)

- CP
- Marxism

(Version Two)

2NR went for T.

UCO

K-STATE HZ (CUBA/BIT)

OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:

- Marxism
- Drugs
- Cerds C/P
- Dissimulation

BREAKDOWN OF THE BLOCK:

2NC

- CP
- Case

- 1NR
- Case
- Marxism
- NEGATIVE TRICKS
- 2NR POSITIONS
- Marxism

- K-State NW
- OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:
- Israel
- Ban Exports C/P
- Marxism (Terry '95, Ryan '82)
- BREAKDOWN OF THE BLOCK:
- 2NC
- C/P
- Marxism
- 1NR
- Israel
- Case
- NEGATIVE TRICKS
- 2NR POSITIONS:
- CP
- Marxism

HARVARD

Tournament: Harvard
Judge: Steve Lehotsky
Jess/Charles v. Kansas State
Iraq
1NC off case
Clinton—UN Dues
Financial sanctions and ICJ CP
Capitalism K

1NC case
Saddam bad
O4F good
Can't solve hunger
Nuclear war outweighs moral obligation
Your mueller and mueller card is bad
Prolif turn

2NR
CP and case turns

UNI

Clinton
-Credibility key to CTBT, Clinton must focus on CTBT, political capital
link, GOP hates Iran/pro-sanctions, CTBT is key to survival
WTO^A plan now = a backlash ? WTO key to U.S. / sino relations

Khatami
-if he appears soft on the United States, conservatives will backlash

Marxism kritik

Shunning

Offer sanction removal on condition that Castro steps down counterplan

Orientalism

Lift medical and food restrictions but condition return of Guantanamo
Bay on the
improvement of human rights conditions

Kentucky

WILLIAM JEWELL

KENTUCKY HK

Against Miami AG (North Korea):

-Clinton WTO

-Russia

-Korean Regime Collapse

-North/South Korea Alliance Collapse

-CP: Remove all sanctions except Export-Import Bank, as it would decrease world economic growth.

-Topicality: Constructive Engagement

WAKE

Kentucky

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 8

Team: Kansas JR

vs.: Dartmouth BG

Aff case (country): Iraq

INC Off-Case Arguments

Israel

A. Clinton/Barak meeting = good relations

B. Undermines relations

C. 1. Syrian/Israel War

2. Nuke exchange

S. Asia

A. leverage = effective deterrent

B. link - plan is appeasement - invites Indian defiance

C. greatest risk of Nuke War

Russia

A. Nationalists moderate

B. 1. Infringe on Russian sphere of influence

2. Russian nationalists see foreign policy as zero-sum

C. global nuke conflict

Rollback

A. no attempts at rollback of Saddam's regime now

Int'l Herald Tribune, 7/3/99, "premature" "military assistance"

B. 1. plan creates support for rollback

Byman, Washington Quarterly, Summer 1999

2. Increases perception of benevolence

Gause, Foreign Affairs, May/June 1999

C. Iraq weapons = terrorism, genocide, and lebanon

Byman again

AT: Iraqi's dying advantage

1. not immoral, not the US' fault

2. can't solve humanitarian impact - money is diverted

3. not reverse causal

AT: Solvency

1. t/ Iranian prolif

2. iran prolif --> pre-emptive strikes against Israel

3. t/ kurds - sanctions solve kurds

4. kills regional stability

5. t/ WMD

6. US will pre-empt Iraqi prolif

7. T/ risks collapsing military containment

AT: nuke war --> superior race, b/c hanover would survive
Nope - the new race would be too ugly, look at them

Extension cites on rollback
Boston Globe, 1/9/99 "Ten suitcases" "strategically placed anthrax"
Washington Times, 11/14/97 "cropduster" "Washington Mall"
Ben-Meir, Middle East Policy, March 1996
Herrman, Powder Keg in the Middle East, 1995, ed. By Kemp and Stein
Byman, Foreign Affairs, Jan/Feb 1999
Byman, Survival, Autumn 1998
Byman, Iraq Strategy Review, 1998
Hillen Iraq Strategy Review, 1998
LA Times, 2/6/98
Kazemzadeh, Middle East Policy, June 1998

Kentucky

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1
Team: Kentucky HK
vs.: Georgetown FR
Aff case (country): North Korea
Judge: Overby
INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)
Russia - McFail 99, Arbaton 93
North Korean leader credibility
Import/Export exclusion CP
Topicality - CE / removal
Appeasement as a turn - hoover.stanford.edu

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
Russia
NK leader
Appeasement turn
KEDO funding increased NK prolif

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: One
Team: Kentucky JR
vs.: K. State
Aff case (country): Cuba
Judge: Hernandez
INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

CP- The US Congress will amend economic sanctions imposed against Cuba to include:
-expanded electronic and tele-communications contacts with Cuba under track II of the CDA
-reduced travel restrictions on US citizens visiting Cuba
-conditioned removal of (Plan (CDA & Libertad) upon a transition towards a democratic government in Cuba, to be interpreted as anyone but Fidel Castro
-Titles III and IV of the Libertad Act will be removed

The US will also:
-suspend TV & Radio Marti
-express the lack of hostile intent by the US towards Cuba & the US desire to improve relations.

Well fund and enforce, and reserve the right to fully clarify & express the intent of the CP text.

Property Rights DA
A) US- engage destroys Int'l property Rights Regime

B) Property rights key to global economy

C) Mead 92

Latin American DA
Plan causes adventurism

Democracy
Plan guts cuban democracy which key solves lines

Shunning

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
No tricks

Solvency turns and the counterplan

Plan causes civil war the cp solves for

Democracy DA is the net benefit

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 2
Team: Kentucky BN
vs.: Lewis and Clark HC
Aff case (country):
Judge: Janas
INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)
OPIC CP - lift all sanctions excluding OPIC
- Downey 9-16-98 FDCH
- Ferrara 2-12-97 FNS

Terrorist DA
- state dept. official 4-30-99 FNS
- Richard Fisher (Heritage reports) 10-96
- John Ellis (Boston Globe) 99

Topicality

Russia
- McFaul (NPR) 4-14-99
- Korea Herald 8-13-99
- Straights Times 3-27-99
- Mearsheimer (Foreign Affairs) 1993 p 55

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
Similar statement from round 1: "get lucky and go for dropped args."

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3
Team: Kentucky BN
vs.: Cornell KC
Aff case (country): all 5
Judge: Brovero, Adrienne - Northwestern
INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)
T - CE isn't feminist IR dialogue

XT - plan does all sanctions

Exclude Iran CP

Russia DA - engaging iran = struggle w/ russia

Heg - scapegoating iran key to forward deployment, heg good

Terrorist list - removing iran from list = terrorism

South Asia - US leverage over pakistan now, rogue appeasement = pakistani aggression, war

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3

Team: Kentucky HK

vs.: Pepperdine MZ

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: Trice - Michigan State

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

T - Constructive engagement - Brewster's Politics, 1995, p. 127

T - Removal - Webster's dictionary, 1991

CP - NATO Consultation - before doing the plan, the USFG will consult NATO

- Wieber, NATO after forty years, 1990, p. 93

- Kennedy, National Security Affairs Monograph, 84-3, p.96

- Duffield, Political Science Quarterly, Vol 109, No 5, 1995, p. 769

Israel - Iraq sanction removal causes Israel-Syria war

- M2 Presswire, 7/21/1999, "unique bilateral relations"

- Washington Times, 11/26/1997, "toward making progress"

- Jane's Intelligence Review, 4/1/1998, "help to nudge"

- JIR, 4/1/1999, "ballistic missiles"

Case arguments:

- rollback

- appeasement/sanctions credibility

- dual use technology turn

- Kurds turn

- Dual Containment bad

- Food advantage takeouts

- No moral obligation to remove sanctions

Kentucky

School: Kentucky

Team(s): JR, HK, AT, BN

Special thanks to Brian Ray for the detailed information.

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

Clinton- impacts have been China WTO, UN Funding,

China- simple sphere of influence link and relations impact

Russia- again, sphere of influence with nationalism as the impact

Economy- plan increases US exports which triggers inflation, impact is increased interest rates kills the global economy

Israel- Israel likes sanctions plan removes them causes israel freakout

Shunning

NATO consultation counter-plan

Topicality -5 components to constructive engagement must do all of them

Disciplinary power kritik / Foucault

CUBA:

INC Strategy

Condition c/p on political/economic reforms

Latin American adventurism D/A - plan incites funding of communist revolution ==> millions of deaths

Clinton good- H/Burton highly popular plan incites congressional b/lash

Economy- cuban agriculture stimulates US inflationary pressures; IR hike

WTO- other factors cause collapse and H/B doesn't violate it

Transition- plan makes transition worse with Castro, and Castro says no to plan because he's against political liberalization

Just War- just war takeouts- not a reason to preclude intervention and action by policymakers

IRAQ:

INC Strategy

Counterplan to condition on UNSCOM

UNSCOM good solves WMD, and int'l credibility

Israel

Clinton good

Russia-

Rollback- plan would cause rollback, which is bad causes Saddam backlash
Oil Disads -- Russia, Saudi Arabia
Economy - specific links include Iraqi had huge investment market potential

vs. Humanitarian Suffering Advantage

Mortality rates exaggerated, Drezner, Fall 98, National Interest
Casualties exaggerated, Clawson, Survival, p 34

vs Famine Advantage

- sanctions not kill
- numbers exxagerated
- dehumanizes Iraqi people
- WMD turn
- Mil mod turn

vs Morality Advantage

- catastrophic impacts outweigh
- disad outweighs
- rollback turns back
- Gewirth flawed x
- cruel not to sacrifice one person for the greater good x
- ethics unacceptable

vs Stability Advantage

- Iranian prolif and first strike turn
- Kurds turn
- WMD turn
- Containment turn

IRAN:

INC Strategy (Kentucky HK)

Condition c/p

Khatami D/A (net benefit to the c/p)

Prolif turns

Terrorism turns

Clinton good

Topicality- plan not constructive engagement

China--china perceives plan as encirclement, crushes relations

Economy

NORTH KOREA:

INC Strategy

Clinton good- plan incites congressional criticism

China- plan tubes relations via chinese paranoia

Shunning

Economy

Russia-

prolif turns on the case

and economy turns

famine/food aid turns ; incites military backlash and confrontation; it's diverted etc.

UNI:

>>>Kentucky vs. Iraq:

>>>

>>>Clawson '98; Survival; 40:1

>>>

>>>Pollack '98; Iraq Strategic Review

>>>

>>>Blanche; 6/1/99; Daily Story; "CIA used the inspections"

>>>

>>>Tucker 5/1/98; LA Times; "offer a fallback"

>>>

>>>Newsday 2/16/98; "programs in Sudan"

>>>

>>>Dunn 3/96; Mideast Policy

>>>
 >>>Platt's Oilgram News 5/5/99; "in the future"
 >>>
 >>>USA Today 3/24/99; "overthrow Hussein"
 >>>
 >>>Silverstien 5/10/99; The Nation; "blame the US"
 >>>
 >>>Drezner Fall '98; National Interest

Russia

- Iraq is in their sphere of influence. Anger with the United States fuels nationalism which wrecks progress on arms control.
- Cuba is in their former sphere of influence, they perceive U.S. lifting of sanctions are interference, they take over Cuban government

NATO consultation counter-plan

- consult prior to inaction

Inflation

- An increase in our export market increases inflation. An October rate hike = depression.

Clinton

- Plan diverts the focus away from appropriations. Taking up "floor space" kills money for foreign appropriations = decreasing U.S. hegemony
- Bipartisanship on the budget in the status quo

Topicality

- 5 components to constructive engagement ? must do all of them
- constructive engagement is not hardline
- immediate

Shunning

- don't reward immoral agents

Disciplinary power kritik

- Foucault

Khatami d/a (against an Iran aff)

Oil Price Stability

Economy

- sanctions check inflation that would result in a rate hike

Negative Cites:

Duffield, Political Science Quarterly, vol. 109, #5, 1995
 Wiebes, NATO After 40 Years, 1990
 Kennedy, National Security Affairs, 1984
 Washington Times, 2-2-99
 State Journal Register, 4-4-95
 International Herald Tribune, 4-30-99
 Miyagawa (sp?), Do Economic Sanctions Work? 1992 or 1997 (can't tell)

Lewis and Clark

WILLIAM JEWELL

LEWIS AND CLARK CZ

Against Samford JB (Cuba):

- Rice
- Clinton: Syria/Israel
- Appeasement
- Latin American Democracy
- CP to end Radio and TV Marti

LEWIS AND CLARK HC

Against USC MB (Iraq):

- Clinton: Syria.
- Pakistan
- Oil
- Israel
- Topicality: Constructive Engagement
- Vagueness
- CP:Exclude Investment Sanctions.

WAKE

Lewis and Clark

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 6

Team: Lewis & Clark HS

vs.: UT Dallas

Aff case (country): Iran

Judge: Berube

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

AT: De-dev

- turns, including isolationism, protectionism, go to space, nanotechnology, state key to solve ethnic conflict, turnball

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 6

Team: Lewis and Clark HC

vs.: Michigan State DM

Aff case (country): North Korea

Judge: Rollins

INC Off-Case Arguments

topicality-consultation not CE or Immediate

geopolitics kritik

Russian elections

- putin taken lead, will win in sq
- nationalists on brink of winning elections
- primakov will increase sino-russian rels, causing asian war and korean peninsular conflict

Clinton-Wto

- china in wto now, but will require lots of pol cap
 - engagement in nk means massive pol cap fight
 - us-sino relations depend on chinese entry into wto
2. coop w/ china k/ solving prolif, incl korea

CP-consult Japan and N.K.

Trilateral consultation key to peace

Kim

a. Kim's popularity on the brink, case undermines south korean engagement, turning the case

Appeasement

a. CE doesn't solve, only appeases rogue states

b. Must maintain hardline stance on rogue states-appeasement causes another nuclear war

Case args

--Gradualism: slow peace now, full consultation with S.K. and Japan, KEDO now, missile accord now

--Regime turn: economic engagement undermines current moderate regime

--Japan co-op turn: lack of Japan co-op cause North Korean hostility

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Kicks CP, goes for status quo solving the case while preserving Kim's credibility, which is key to peace on the Peninsula. Also goes for Clinton.

Lewis and Clark

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1

Team: Lewis & Clark HC

vs.: Kansas EM

Aff case (country): Kansas EM - Iraq

Judge: Kahl

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Appeasement

Russian Elections

Clinton - WTO

Caspian - US investment in Iraq prevents investment in the Caspian. US investment in the Caspian is key to preventing Russian domination in the Caspian.

A) Trade off in investment

[St. Petersburg Times 6/22/99 "emerging consensus"]

[BBC 8/3/99 "transportation of Caspian oil"]

B) That's Bad

[Washington Post 1/5/99 "the United States tries to diversify"]

[www.heritage.org/library/categories/forpol/bg1065.html]

[Janes 5/1/98 "many of the conditions"]

[www.mepc.org/forums/chcs/18.html]

C/P (conditional)

UN security council will remove nearly all economic sanctions on Iraq. The UN will suspend air strikes on Iraq.

Israel - Syrian land grab impact

[The INR argues that peace process impact takeouts don't apply to their scenario]

O1

- US not control UN

- Sanctions not causes crisis

- I/L from 96

- Sanctions not stop food and Medicine [Berger 99]

- Saddam responsible - t/o intervening actor

- Saddam not distribute - plan causes crackdown [Lopez 98]

- Can't solve economic decline

- Not solve infrastructure - diverted [Scott 99]

- Muller & Muller not predictive

O3

- Proves no WMD now

- UN security council not coop

Morality

- Government promote shortages [Hass 98]

- Must evaluate consequences
- Obligation to stop gassing kids [Lopez 98]
- NW o/w [Sagan 90]

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3

Team: Lewis & Clark HC

vs.: Emory HH

Aff case (country): Cuba

Judge: Biza Repko - Michiganm

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

T - CE must be carrots and sticks (Haas)

Geopolitics - plan uses preconceived truths about nations = which is the problem

Appeasement

Rice DA

- US Sanctions cause Cuba to buy Asian rice, Sneary 1999

- Loss of rice revenue crushes Asian economies, causes war

Clinton - WTO

- Stevenson, NYT, 11-16-99

- Fisch, 11-15-99 "most immediate"

- Washington Times, 11-17-99 "status upon"

- AFX, 11-19-99 "grants China"

CP: Delay the plan for a year

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

They go for the CP and Clinton - no tricks.

Lewis and Clark

School: Lewis and Clark

Team(s): HS

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

T - must do political ties

Geopolitics kritik

Clinton - Wye Accord

Clinton will approve Wye aid in SQ and its key to peace process

AP, 10-19-99 "he was confident Congress would change its mind"

Key congressional players still resist sanction lifting, making it an uphill political fight

Journal of Commerce, 10-5-99, "supporters of sanctions say they represent the only"

Peace process key to economic stability and preventing conflict and WMD use

UPI, 10-20-99 "Berger declared the Middle East and its peace process"

More ev:

It's his top priority

LAT, 10-21-99 "President Clinton, resuming his role"

Peace process at a critical threshold - Clinton key to its succes

Washington Times, 10-21-99, "President Clinton will travel to Oslo"

CUBA:

INC Strategy

Rice

CP - Delay the plan for a year

Suffering Advantage

1. No impact - not denied food and medicine now X
2. Suffering not a priori issue

Biodiversity Advantage

1. Morally repugnant to use species as a tool
2. Can't solve Cuban hostility - they won't cooperate
3. Nothing indicates that cooperation will occur over species
4. Evidence indicates that scientific studies occurring now

Coercion

1. oppression turns the case
 2. freedom is not the highest goal
 3. no implication to this in the debate
 4. destruction of life is worse than destroying rights
 5. sanctions solve repression in Cuba X
 6. must look to consequences X
 7. Cuba is on the terrorist list - we'll lift IMF sanctions X
 8. conditions on IMF --> political oppression
- Comparative Political Studies, 10-97, v30 n5 p576 "Conditionality refers to the conditions that"

Solvency

1. Castro will spur any attempts at normalization of relations X
2. lifting embargo won't result in change in Cuba X
3. economic assistance entrenches domination and hegemony X
4. CE doesn't solve X
5. Rogue state appeasement turn X

LEWIS & CLARK

Lewis and Clark Semis
Affirmative CO (Iran) vs. Lewis and Clark CH
Glen Frappier
Erik Corneillier
Aaron Robeland
INC off-case
T—impose sanctions
Delay a year counterplan
Clinton: CTBT bad
Israel encirclement

INC Case arguments
lots of extremism turns
Khatami's elections prove sanctions work
Financial Times evidence not specific to the US
Israel impact empirically denied
Assumes the economy is bad now
Dhooge has no warrant
No timeframe
No govt to govt deal < >
Too quick < >
Sanctions don't hurt the economy < >

Russia won't get involved < >
No Israeli first strike < >
IMF disad on solvency < >

2NR

Extremism turns and Delay (kind of the CTBT)

WESTERN SCRIMMAGE

Aff team: Jess and Charles (Iran)
Neg team: Lewis and Clark CH

INC off case:
Topicality: Constructive Engagement = hands-on
Delay CP
WTO
Israel encirclement

INC case args:
Khatami turn
Sanctions decrease prolif
No Israeli first strike
Pipeline inevitable
Russia isn't strong enough to act

US has no strategic purpose
Engagement leads to proliferate and terrorism

2NR:

Delay

Clinton

Khatami turn and a couple takeouts

Liberty

WAKE

Liberty

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 6
Team: Liberty AF
vs.: Texas at Dallas JK
Aff case (country): Iraq
Judge: Overbey
1NC Off-Case Arguments
Topicality - Extra T

CP - Do aff conditioned on UN acceptance of intrusive inspections

Ritter 99

Jane's Intelligence Review 99 (hey, that information is really useful, since Jane's only comes out once a year these cards should be easy to find!)

Clinton - WTO
Israel Relations

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

No tricks (why won't anyone ever admit they have tricks?). Went for CP, Clinton, case arguments in 2NR.

Liberty

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1
Team: Liberty CM
vs.: Kentucky BN
Aff case (country): Iraq
Judge: Katsulas
1NC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)
Israel Peace Process
Peace now
US pressure key to peace process (stability in the region key)
Collapse of peace process = Mid east war

Clinton - WTO
Clinton campaigning for WTO now (NYT, 11-16-99)
engaging Iraq = death of Clinton (Margolis 98)
Clinton's relationship with the GOP key to China WTO entry (USA Today 11-16)
WTO key to US-Sino relations, failure --> war (Jeff-Lewis 98)

Harms/Inherency

- a. sanctions prevent aid to opposition groups in Iraq (Clauson 99)
- b. aid to opposition groups --> ethnic conflict (Gentry 99)
- sanctions don't cause humanitarian crisis (Cordesman 99)
- enough aid exists to save people (Drezner 98)
- Saddam prevents distribution

AT Morality

- 1. use of sanctions is justified - Neibur 94
- 2. justifies absurdities - Neibur 94
- 3. consequentialism good
- 4. US not morally culpable
- 5. consequences determine morality

AT Oil advantage

- lots of production in the SQ (Milwaukee Journal-Sentinel 10-5-99)
- Iraq maximizing oil production

Solvency

- sanctions won't be lifted in the SQ (Ritter 99)
- WMD - lifting sanctions results in development
- Saddam will acquire weapons to destroy countries in the region
- Lifting sanctions will take decades to solve the humanitarian problem in Iraq

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Clinton, Opposition turn, WMD turn, time frame argument, infrastructure

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1

Team: Liberty AF

vs.: Michigan State VW

Aff case (country): Iran

Judge: Sherry Hall

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Topicality - Constructive Engagement

Topicality - Nearly All

Clinton - WTO

Financial Times 11/16/99

Gilman '98

Washington Post '99

Jaffe and Lewis '99

Israel DA

Jerusalem Post 11/10/99

Kemp '97

Gradual CP

Chubin and Green '98

Abbreviated version - The USFG will lift one sanction in return for a concession
Until all sanctions are removed.

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Topicality Nearly All - 2NR

Clinton

Israel

Gradual CP

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3

Team: Liberty RW

vs.: Catholic LS

Case: Iraq

Judge: Overby, Daniel-West Virginia

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Topicality-CE: violation-carrot and stick not constructive engagement

CP

Text: The US FG will submit a proposal to the UN Security Council that will agree to have the US lift sanctions on Iraq and end support for the UN embargo contingent upon Security Council agreement to tough Iraq inspections. Enforcement guaranteed, we will clarify.

Ob. 1 Non-Topical-no lifting sanctions

Ob. 2 Competition

1. Mutually exclusive-can't immediately and not immediately lift sanctions

2. Only CP captures Net Benefits

Ob. 3 Solvency

US Should condition-Ritter Houston Chronicle Sept. 30 99

Israel

A. Uniqueness: New Wye \$\$ gives the Peace Process renewed stability and demonstrates US commitment-Jerusalem Post Nov. 10 99

B. US Pressure on Mideast Countries is Key to Maintain the Peace Process and the Regional Balance of Power-Kemp Point of No Return 1997

C. Peace Process collapse will result in regional war, involving every Mideast country and WMDs--Kemp

Clinton-WTO

Congress will support China in the WTO now-BBC Nov. 18 99

Unpopular plans cause public backlash decreasing popularity, destroying Clinton's chance of achieving his agenda-Spitzer 93 President and Congress

WTO key to US-Sino Relations-Jaffe and Lewis, Houston Chronicle 7/21/99

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 4

Team: Liberty HS

vs.: Emory HaMe

Aff case (country): North Korea

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

T - "consulting relevant actors" is extra topical

CP: Do all of plan except for funding of KEDO

Clinton Good - WTO

Democracy Promotion - Plan props up the regime (Diamond 1999)

Human Rights Credibility - Plan reverses stance on human rights based sanctions, destroying the possibility for future solvency through an int'l tribunal.

Liberty

School: Liberty

Team(s): All teams

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

Topicality

-nearly all

-remove

-extract (H-B Act partly sanction)

-CE must mandate political reform

-govt to govt - ngos/ const engages not T

-Adpot, encourage

Financial Sanctions counter-plan

-Seldon, 1995

Terrorism Credibility

-Plan decreases sanctions ? decreasing the credibility of terrorist threats ?
increasing terrorism

Autonomy

-using the state is the link... state constricts autonomy... must reject

Clinton

-must consult with Congress link to China/WTO

Clinton- Russian scientists

unpopular plan = credibility and no Clinton agenda, and on Clinton agenda is funding nuke scientists. No \$, they sell knowledge to third world

Nunn-Lugar DA

Human rights

-lifting sanctions decreases United States Human rights credibility

Economic

-imports link with the Bailey impact

-inflation (increase jobs = increase interest rate = depression/war)

Aid tradeoff

-F22's are stopped by plan

- your plan trades off with F-22 - means no new fighter, means we can't solve win wars or prevent wars b/c of fighter capacity

Shunning

-Gibson and Gibson 1995

Bigtime pomo throwdown from Stefano '90 and lots of Fem cards from Huntley '97

CUBA:

INC Strategy:

Bioweapons turn vs cuba - lifting snaction causes investment in bioweapons

Lifting sanctions = passage MAI = planetary disaster

Other good arg's: H-B Act = moral imperative undermine Castro regime

AT Coercion Underview/Morality type argument

1. Plan leaves military sanctions, that's coercive
2. Life is key, not property
3. No compensation for businesses
4. Rights-based discourse is bad
5. Moral imperatives result in genocide X
6. Plan is consequential
7. Consequentialism is good X
8. Deontology destroys morality X Rand 83
9. Plan --> security concerns X
10. No evidence says sanctions are coercive

Suffering Advantage

1. US sending medicine now X
2. Castro's fault, not embargo X
3. Cuban health is good X

Solvency

1. Engagement --> oppression X
2. No time frame for property compensation
3. Turn - immigration
 - a. Mass exodus to the U.S. X
 - b. Influx results in military confrontation X
4. No evidence says Castro will pay us money for compensation

IRAQ:

INC Strategy

Topicality

Immediate Extra-T - UN sanctions increase

IRAN:

INC Strategy

Russian Oil - Russian econ collapse

Sanctions moderate Iran

NORTH KOREA:

INC Strategy

China d/a -China doesn't like increase in United States/DPRK ties = war

Lots of case debate vs. North Korea

Liberty - Negative

School: Liberty

Team(s): All

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

Disads - Clinton, Inflation (both stories are update dependent for the weekend), Terrorism Credibility (Impact WMD terrorism), Human Rights Credibility (Impact HR key to all rights) (Sanctions key to both), plus 2 new DAs not yet disclosed.

Kritiks - Anarchy, Shunning

KINGS

Liberty University AH

Against Syr/Marist MS:

T - V: extract (H-B Act partly sanction)

Disads: inflation (increase jobs = increase interest rate = depression/war)

Clinton, Shunning

Liberty University MN

Against Army FS:

T - V: CE must mandate political reform

Disads: F22 key to deter war CE funding increase t/o

Clinton needs popularity to help Russia stop Brain drain, plan is unpopular

Lifting sanctions = passage MAI = planetary disaster

Other good arg's: H-B Act = moral imperative undermine Castro regime

Against Pitt BS:

T - Viol: govt to govt - ngos/ const engages not T

Disads: Clinton good - WTO/China, Russian Oil - Russian econ collapse

Other good arg's: Sanctions moderate Iran

Against Wayne St AD:

T - V: Adpot, encourage

Disads: Clinton(Russian scientist), Budget trade off(F22), Democracy promotion

Against Wayne St (Angelita/Holly)??:

T - V: Immediate Extra-T - UN sanctions increase

Disads: Clinton DA, Oil DA

Liberty University BJ

Against Army HM:

T - V: T immediate means now

Disads: russian scientists impact - funding to prevent knowledge spread
public popularity ; F22 - DOD budget off - food aid link

Against Cornell KN:

T Viol:

Disads: F-22 your plan trades off with F-22 - means no new fighter, means we can't solve win wars or prevent wars b/c of fighter capacity

Clinton- Russian scientists : unpopular plan = credibility and no Clinton agenda, and on Clinton agenda is funding nuke scientists. No \$, they sell knowledge to third world

Liberty University GR

Against Catholic SL:

Disads: human rights credibility, terrorism credibility, Clinton

CP: keep sanctions in place, provide food aid

Liberty University CE

Against Army BJ:

Disads: Clinton, Russian scientists

Liberty University CS

Against Allegeny RS:

T Violations:

Disads: Clinton, WTO, Inflation (?span backlash)

Counterplans:

Other Good Arguments: Bigtime pomo throwdown from Stefano '90 and lots of
Fem cards from Huntley '97

UNI:

Topicality

-nearly all

-remove

Financial Sanctions counter-plan

-Seldon, 1995

Terrorism Credibility d/a

-Plan decreases sanctions ? decreasing the credibility of terrorist
threats ?

increasing terrorism

China d/a

-China doesn't like increase in United States/DPRK ties = war

Autonomy

-using the state is the link^A state constricts autonomy^A must reject

Clinton

-must consult with Congress link to China/WTO

Human rights d/a

-lifting sanctions decreases United States Human rights credibility

Economic d/a

-imports link with the Bailey impact

Aid tradeoff d/a

-F22's are stopped by plan

Lots of case debate vs. North Korea

Shunning

-Gibson and Gibson 1995

Louisville

LONG BEACH

Keola Whittaker/Brian Ward

Affirmative Round Report

Aff Case: Iran Neg Team: Louisville LW **Tournament** Long Beach **Round 1 Judge** Derby

INC Off Case Positions:

Condition CP on prolif/terrorism

Nearly all T

Vagueness (immediate not in plan text)

Rice

NTR

INC Case Arguments:

Khatami turns

Prolif turns

2NR:

vagueness, CP, case turns

USC

Negative Positions:

Plan Specificity

Nearly All T

CE T: Dialogue and political ties

Clinton NTR

Gender: plan works within gendered framework

Race Exclusion: African Americans excluded from FP

Small Business DA: Lift sanctions increases big business and trades off
with

Small business which are key to black empowerment prevents Genocide.

CP: Remove Syria from Terrorist List but keep sanctions and give waivers to
\ women

North Korea Strat:

South Korea DA

Appeasement

Clinton

Gendertivity-went for this argument b/c aff focus exclude realization of
public/private divide

WAKE

Louisville

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 2

Team: Louisville RW

vs.: UNI BR

Aff case (country): Cuba

Judge: Michele Choe

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

t- nearly all - must say which are lifted

standards = grammar, brightline, advocacy shift, depth of knowledge

CP - Presidential Waivers - Atlanta Journal and Constitution March 18, 1999

Race Kritik

- A. Current FP excludes African Americans Morris, 1992, lexis, "African Americans and the New World Order"
- B. Working w/in the framework crushes US ability to engage abroad and ensures a racial holocaust, Moss, 1970, Reprinted in "Race and US Foreign Policy from the Colonial Period to the Present: The African American Voice since WWII," 1998

Gender exclusion

- A. World politics embedded in system of male dominance, failure to recognize feminist importance reinforces subordination - Pettman, 1994 " Women, Gender, and World Politics."
- B. Global war against womyn - Peterson, 1992 "Gendered States: Feminist (Re)vision of Int'l Relations Theory"

Import Substitution

- A. Imposing Sanctions creates import substitution in country - Selden, 1999 "Economic Sanctions as an Instrument of Foreign Policy,"
- B. Import Substitution has occurred in Cuba - Kapolqitz, 1998, Anatomy of a Failed Embargo
- C. Aff evidence ignores the effects of sanctions - Crawford and Klotz, 1999 "How Sanctions Work"
- D. Political influence will reimpose - selden 1999
- E. Lift snctns creates perception of econ. Covers fuels political movements
- F. --> conflict and war

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Racism and import substitution

Louisville

School: Louisville

Team(s): LH

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

T - Must adopt a policy and specify a course of action

T - CE = must impose sanctions (South Africa proves)

AD HOC (reform bill going to pass now, plan destroys that movement)

Bipartisan support ensures sanctions reform bill will pass now

USA Engage, 4-28-99, "Lugar introduced in March the sanctions Policy Reform Act"

Haphazard sanctions policies destroy the current movement in Congress

FDCH, 7-21-99, "I'm not arguing, Mr. Chairman, that certain sanctions"

SPRA is key to stopping proliferation

FDCH, 7-21-99, "unilateral economic sanctions should and must remain a tool"

Grand Negotiator (A form of rogue state appeasement)

U.S. has negotiating ability now

Concessions destroy US ability to use sanctions as a negotiating tool

Other nations will proliferate

Drives arms race, results in instability

All one cite: "Using power and Diplomacy to deal with Rogue States," Thomas H. Henrickson,

1999, www-hoover.stanford.edu/publications/epp/94

United Nations Counter-plan

-The UN will distribute medicine and food

-UN key to national security

-need independent UN action

Minority Owned Businesses CP

Only lift the sanctions needed to allow goods from minority-owned businesses to be exported to the country - boosts the movement worldwide and solves discrimination and economic status domestically and abroad

GIRL (Gendered International Relations)

The INC I saw had 8-off plus a little case dump

The GIRL shell was A) Men dominate now, B) the alternative is to deal with it. They also put one card on case that said nation states subordinate women and reproduce gender hierarchies.

Arguments Extended in the Negative Block (New Link Stories, Cites, Time Allocation, etc)

GIRL 2NC Overview:

OVERVIEW of 2NC:

- * Your ballot should be a personal act of resistance instead of voting for an aff plan that never really happens
- * The future depends on the elimination of dualisms (therefore forward action doesn't get you anywhere)

GENDER HIERARCHY LINKS:

- * objective reasoning and the authority of knowing (Peterson '92)
- * plan text and card tagging masks (ev. says "the very concept . . . talk in shorthand")
- * gender hierarchy is fundamental to understanding how violence is produced and reproduced, it legitimates institutionalized slavery via the notion of women's work
- * attempts to "solve" (it's doubtful that peace and justice can increase while gender hierarchy exists)
- * the notion of "advantages" (you don't accurately understand the world)
- * Discursive resistance is key (and comes before all else in the debate)

Diplomacy links: " . . . features males almost exclusively . . . institutions are mostly male . . . "

Quiescence Link: adopting through the state system means you cannot solve

Essentializing bad

The aff allows for the state and hegemony to continue, therefore neg is better

Permutation "turn": premature closure and you cannot resist and endorse (call bullshit on this! You can vote aff as a MEANS of resistance)

Neg Strategy in Rebuttals (key arguments, tricks, things they kick out of)

GIRL 2NR Overview:

Action by people is on balance better than state action. Best way to do it is by discursive resistance. The judge can adopt their own style of feminism. If you really believe the plan can solve, then go for it!!!!!!

CUBA:

INC Strategy

MAI DA -Plan stops European Union coop... passage of MAI bad

SYRIA:

INC Strategy

Syrian Succession DA

Syrian succession is uncertain now

Middle East Journal, Winter 1998, p 69 (Sorenson)

Decreasing tension opens up a succession battle

The Political Economy of Syria Under Assad, 1995, Volker Perthes, p 267

Results in another Eastern European conflict

Sorenson 98, p 78

2NC evidence:

Internal political upheaval upsets international relations

Why Syria Goes to War, Thirty Years of Confrontation, 1996, Fred H. Lawson, p 12

Assad will abandon policies if leadership is at stake

A Political Economy of the Middle East, Alan Richards and John Waterbury, 1996

Assad popularity high now

Middle East Review, July 1999, p 16

Solvency

1. Import substitution

a. sanctions --> import substitution

Economic Sanctions as an Instrument of US Foreign Policy, Zachary Seldon, 1999, p 4-5

b. results in economic growth and self-reliance X Seldon 99

2. Must consider alternative to sanctions - must be sensitive to other things X Haass 98, p 4-5

Water Wars

1. Simons evidence takes out their advantage - 44 countries have reached agreement

2. Syria war e/d - not on brink anymore, won't escalate

3. Syria-Turkey war is ethnic in nature, not based on water

4. Syria won't go to war with Turkey, they fear them

Rivers of Fire, Aron Soffer, 1999 p 249

5. Water impact is e/d

Middle East Policy, September 1995

6. Water shortages don't result in conflict

Core and Periphery: A Comprehensive Approach to Middle Eastern Water, 1997, Asit K. Biswas

7. No solvency - US can't solve water shortages
Covenant Over Middle Eastern Waters: Key to Survival, Joyce Shira Starr, 1995, p 161
(Inter-Agency Task Force on the Economic Consequences of a Middle East Peace Settlement)
8. 20 years before pipeline can solve X
9. Turn - water distribution centers will be target of terrorist attacks X

HARVARD

Tournament: Harvard
Judge: D. Heidt
Jess/Charles v. Louisville CC
Iraq
INC off case
T
WTO Good
Minority-owned businesses CP
Minority-owned businesses disad
Gender K
Tobacco

INC case
sanctions could be good
sanctions solve the domestic economy in Iraq
Saddam steals
MNCs (trade bad and MNC bad)
Environment turn (trade = bad environmental stuff)

2NR
CP and the MOB disad and case turns

UNI

-Lots of Topicality
-policy must be a specific course of action ? not just constructive engagement.
-constructive engagement
Clinton good
-WTO, plan kills capital, killing Chinese admission which is key to growth = economic crash

GCC d/a

Feminism in international relations kritik
-Ralph Pettman, Women, Gender, and World Politics, 1994
-Peterson, Gendered States, 1992
-Weedon, Fem. Practice and Post-Structuralist Theory, 1987
-the alternative is discursive resistance

United Nations Counter-plan
-The UN will distribute medicine and food
-UN key to national security
-need independent UN action

MAI
-Plan stops European Union coop^Å passage of MAI bad

Greenspan
-Fed not raising now (Feldman, 1999)
-sanctions decrease economic growth by 20 billion dollars
-decreased unemployment increases growth = rate hike
-recession = mead
-Quinn, 1997
-Wassen, 1999

Loyola Marymount

USC

Loyal Maramount BS: Brock and Shepard

Negative Positions:

- Interest Rates DA
- Russian Arms Sales DA
- Saudi oil DA
- Pakistan DA
- Inflation
- NPT DA
- KEDO DA

Macalester

UCO

MAC KW (UNKNOWN)

OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:

- CRT
- Reverse Inherency
- Mexico
- Clinton - Chechnya Scenerio
- Case

BREAKDOWN OF THE BLOCK:

2NC

- Clinton

- CRT

1NR

- Mexico

- Case

NEGATIVE TRICKS

2NR POSITIONS

- CRT

UNI

Topicality

- all or nearly all

- immediate = you cannot condition

Conditioning sanction removal key to solving

China

- United States Action viewed as attempt at containment

- Russia / China bad impacts

Caribbean d/a

Mexico d/a

Spanos

Mary Washington

KINGS

Mary Washington College HR

Against: Binghamton MS

T Violations:

Disads: AGOA, human rights.

Mary Washington College GT

T - Viol:

Disads: Clinton good - African Growth Opportunity Act

Other good arg's: sanctions protect Human Rights - Shunning

Mercer

WAKE

Mercer

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 5

Team: Mercer KW

vs.: Georgia State AP

Aff case (country): Cuba

Judge: Krueger

INC Off-Case Arguments

Inflation

-increased exports help US economy

-high US economy risks inflation, inflation hurts US economy

Structural Adjustment

-Sanctions limit structural reforms

-Structural reforms kill solvency and cause ethnic conflicts

[Ghai Market forces and World Development 1994]

Pesticides

Venezuela

C/P

Don't allow exports

Case

-MNC's

-Organic Farming

-Breast Feeding

-Castro is evil

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Went for just about everything

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 8

Team: Mercer KW

vs.: Samford BJ

Aff case: Cuba

Judge: Hoe, Josh-North Texas

INC Off-Case Arguments

Inflation

--UPOI 11/18/99

--Wieser 98

--Financial Times 11/17/99

--Mead 92

Venezuela

--World Finance Markets 10/15/99

--Washington Investmentment Review 10/15/99

--UPI 9/1/99

Pesticides

--Reynolds 97 Journal of Land Use and Environmental Law

--NPR 4/28/99 "All things considered"

--Irish Times 5/19/99

Structural Adjustment

--Snow 7/14/99

--Chicago Sun Times 1/14/99

--West LB Country Prolif-6/10/99

--GHAI 94

CP-Exclude sugar on export and loans for international monetary institutions

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Inflation

Pesticides

Case Turns

Mercer

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1

Team: Mercer DT

vs.: Northwestern

Aff case: North Korea

Judge: Hightower, Melissa--Cornell

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts):

Topicality Constructive Engagement

Solvency Turns

Structural Adjustment

Spending

Farming Turn

NGO Disad

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Structural Adjustment

Solvency

Spending

Answers to Pragmatism

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 2

Team: Mercer DH

vs.: Kansas State HW

Aff case (country): Cuba

Judge: Kelley Skillin

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Abortion Rider - Star tribune June 23, 1999, Denver Post, Oct. 10, 1999

NTR Clinton Story - Christian Science Monitor 11/19/99, AFP 11/19/99, AP Online 11/18/99

Pesticides - Reynolds, Jefferson J. of Land Use and Environmental Law, Fall 1997

Gender Kritik (Sound of Silence) -

Tickner, Gender in International Relations, 1992

French, Beyond Power: On Women, Men, and Morals, 1985

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Pesticides and kritik

AT: performative contradiction

Schlag 1991 (--> truth)

Read hegemony rhetoric bad add-on

2NR went for pesticides to t/o Watson and the Kritik

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 2

Team: Mercer KW

vs.: SMS CN

Aff case (country): Cuba

Judge: Mahoney

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Counterplan Engage cuba on Juragua

Abortion rider

Struct. Adj. Lifting sanctions = massive foreign investment = domestic ethnic conflicts
Venezuels

Rice - cuba will export rice kills asian rice market = southeast asian depression and war

Clinton - NTR/Chinese relations key to global staility

On the case

No inherency giving food and med now

Traditional medicine better turn

Organic famine turn

Biotech = bioweapons

Food = baby formula = more diseases for kids and increased breast cancer in women

Juragua threatens 80 million people

Plan props up castro he is a murderer

MNC domination

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Block went for Structural adjustment, NTR, Biotech, Organic farming, MNC domination, Traditional medicine, Castro Bad, Rice and the Counterplan.

2NR went for Rice, NTR, Structrual adjustment, Castro Bad, Biotech

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 4

Team: Mercer KW

vs.: Iowa LR

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: Achten

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Abortion Rider

Pesticides

Clinton NTR

Structural Adjustment

Asian Rice

CP: The USFG will immediately lift all unilateral sanctions against Iraq not associated with US exports or IMF and World Bank loans.

Air strikes against Iraq will be ended. The USFG will encourage other members of the UN to approve UN action with Iraq.

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

1AR spent six minutes on CP theory so neg went for CP theory.

Mercer

School: Mercer

Team(s): DH

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

Spanos Kritik

Orientalism Kritik

Existentialism Kritik

Abortion Rider DA

MNC, Structural Adjustment case turns

CUBA:

INC Strategy

-De-development turn

-MNC turn

-Castro Backlash turn

-Structural Adjustment turn

IRAQ:

INC Strategy

- Iraq won't cooperate
- Iraq circumvents embargo now
- Lifting Sanctions help Saddam

SOUTH CAROLINA

Mercer DW

- Iraq won't cooperate
- Iraq circumvents embargo now
- Lifting Sanctions help Saddam
- Existentialism

Mercer KW

- Dev turn
- MNC turn
- Castro Backlash turn
- Structural Adjustment
- Clinton
- Abortion Rider

Mercer DD

- Abortion Rider
- GEF
- AGO D/A
- Topicality
- Solvency

Mercer AW

- Spanos
- Orientalism
- Structural Adjustment
- MNC's case turns

Methodist

WAKE

Methodist College

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: One

Team: Methodist BG

vs.: USC MS

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: Janas

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

CP: Keep sanctions and fund the Iraqi National Congress. Gets rid of Saddam and solves for WMD and Mideast war.

Iraq DA- He wants WMD- you fund him.....its bad

Topicality- not Nearly All- Basically Specification and Air Strikes are Extra Topical

Case Arguments: "Its not so bad in Iraq"

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 4

Team: Methodist BG

vs.: Cornell

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: Zompetti

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

US Hegemony

Topple Saddam

Appeasement/WMD Development

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Solvency & Morality Turns [of course they didn't bother to include those on the report]

Methodist College

School: Methodist College

Team(s): BG

IRAQ:

INC Strategy

"a really, really long T violation - nearly all more than 50%"

"WMD case turn as off-case"

"overthrow Saddam CP - find IQ opposition groups"

Miami (FL)

School: Miami

Team(s): PB, AG

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

-Asstmetry

-Localities/ State Turn

-T-Nearly all=all

KINGS

Methodist College BR

Against GMU VW:

T - V: CE, "nearly all"

Miami ??

LEWIS & CLARK

Whitman CG (iraq) vs. Miami

Saddam diverts

IMF da

increase sanctions equals reimpose Unscm and Unscm is evil

CP- The US will adopt a policy of CE, lifting trade sanctions, with the intent of alleviating the humanitarian crisis in Iraq, after consulting the opposition in Iraq. (targeted sanctions)

T- including lifting sanctions implies that the CE policy has to contain more then lifting sanctions-

Miami (Neg.) v. Whitman BS

Lewis and Clark Round 6

Kerwein

INC Arguments

T - Constructive engagement is more than stopping sanctions

Counter plan: [insert Plan text] all economic sanctions excluding tampons, feminine products, . . .

SOUTH CAROLINA

Miami AA

-Khatami Creditability

-Clinton-North Korea

Miami PB

-Asstmetry

-Localities/ State Turn

-T-Nearly all=all

UNI

Topicality

-constructive engagement

Taliban d/a

Hormuz d/a

Mich-Dearborn

WAKE

Michigan Dearborn

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 5

Team: Michigan-Dearborn HR

vs.: Navy BJ

Aff case (country): Cuba

Judge: Shanahan

INC Off-Case Arguments

Globalization

-Constructive Engagement is economic hegemony

-Reversal of sanctions causes globalization

-Moral Depletion/Domestic Decay

Feminism

-Plan works within a masculine framework

-US foreign policy excludes women

-Turns case; hurts women; obligation to reject the mindset

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Went for both, mostly globalization

Michigan Dearborn

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 2

Team: Michigan Dearborn HR

vs.: MTSU GW

Aff case (country): cuba

Judge: Gabrielle Prisco

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Globalization

A. US pursues hegemony, Pfaff, 98

B. Sanctions check, Hawkins 1998// BBC, 1998

C. Globalization = resource decay (Petras, 1997)

Feminist Kritik of International Relations

A. plan tradesoff w/ feminist concept of IR (Peterson and Runyan)

B. US Foreign Policy is dismissive of womyn

C. Implications

1. Self-fulfilling prophecy (Peterson and Runyan, 1993)

2. Entrenches the bias

Juragua

Must strictly enforce of embargo (Journal of Commerce, 6/8/98)

Juragua not funded (Atlanta Journal and Constitution, May, 1998)

Removal of H-B --> completion (Tampa Tribune Feb. 22. 1998)

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

They for for Feminist K// of IR

They make a distinction b/t womyn and development approach and gender and development approach and claim that aff turns assume womyn find dev., not gender find dev.

1999 Dixie Caselist-Affirmative Report

Round: 3

Team: Michigan Dearborn HR

vs.: Cornell MM

Case (country): Iraq

Judge: Beito

2AC Answers to Negative Arguments (please include as many cites as possible)

Extra T

1. Gender in development is constructive engagement

Racism

1. Solving gender division breakdown hierarchies

Affirmative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments, etc.)

Goes for some discursive implication to gender based upon 2ac analysis

Note plan doesn't explicitly state that they promote gender in development. It is only explained after reading solvency cards by Goetz.

Michigan Dearborn

School: Michigan Dearborn

Team(s): HR

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

T-Nearly All Means All but One

Feminist IR-With solvency implication as well

Clinton -WTO

Shunning

Cultural Imperialism

Case arguments

Morality Claims Bad

UNI

Clinton

-Political capital necessary to pass CTBT, aff uses it up, it doesn't
pass,
CTBT good

Feminism Kritik of Foreign Policy

-aff works in a masculine framework

-provides for a self fulfilling prophecy

Topicality

-post plan more than one sanction remains

-aff doesn't constructively engage

Michigan:

DARTMOUTH

Iowa(Iraq) Michigan Harris
1NC: Terrorism, Rollback, Clinton - WTO, aggression, standard case arguments
2AC: answered aggression (in part) with "sanctions kill nato"
2NR: Aggression & Nato impact turns & case take outs

Michigan Stage (North Korea) vs Michigan neg.
1nc: ROK (US-North Korea dialog harms North-South Relations), Clinton - NTR,
Topicality - consulting is not topical, Russia - sphere of influence with a
nationalism impact, standard case take outs
2nr: ROK, Clinton, case take outs

WILLIAM JEWELL

MICHIGAN BS
Against Kansas State NR (North Korea):
-Democracy Consolidation
-Clinton WTO
-Russian Geopolitics
-South Korean Exclusion
-Collapse

USC

Michigan PS: Pudelski and Scannapieco

Negative Positions:
Jaragua
Democracy Good
Clinton WTO
Plan Leads to NATO expansion
Terrorist Credibility
Rice DA
Democracy DA
Appeasement DA
Terrorism DA
WMD DA
Iraq Aggression DA
Oil For Food CP

WAKE

Michigan

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 6
Team: Michigan PD
vs.: Berkley HL
Aff case (country): Iran
Judge: Jenkins
1NC Off-Case Arguments
T - Nearly All means all but one sanction and economic sanctions include sanctions on arms

WTO
Uniqueness ["work with Congress" 11/16/99 Straits Times]
Legislation hurts capital - Generic Simon 94 card
Key to US - China relations
US - China relations solve war [Connable 93] - nah that's not too old

Democracy Consolidation [see earlier list]

Russian Geopolitics

C/P -

The US will condition the removal of sanctions against Iran as per the plan on good faith Iranian commitments to abandon WMD development, support for international terrorism and continued commitments to liberalizing the domestic economic and political system. Sanctions will be gradually lifted as a reciprocal response to Iranian cooperation. The US will pursue high level dialogue and diplomatic engagement in an effort to advance US-Iran cooperation on the above issue areas. [The US will withdraw support for the Baku-Ceyhan pipeline, ceasing its role in construction.] The US shall initiate a gradual policy of economic exchanges with Iran, specifically regarding our investment in Caspian. Neg gets intent.

Solves [Cordesman & Hashim 97]

A) WMD

- sanctions for years = denied
- sanctions solve WMD [Eizenstat]
- sanctions help moderates [Clawson]
- nuclearized Iran inevitable
- Iran will never risk entanglement [Eizenstat]
- Khatami cant get too close to US
- Bad transition causes armed clonflict [XX]

B) Global Prolif

- India kills prolif
- C3 kills credibility
- North Korean WMD = global prolif
- North Korea kills MTCR
- North Korean -> Iranian prolif [Perry 99]
- No preemption [Ritter 95]

Oil

- Russia not take over Caucus [Cohen FDCH 3/17/99 "Russia was thought to be"]
- [Hale, SAIS Review, Winter-Spring 99]
- No Aggressive Iran in Central Asia [Cohen 99]
- US intervention in Caucus causes instability [Manning Survival Winter 98-9]
- Russia not control all because people have reserves
- Not solve because Russia always has interest
- Russia not pullout Iran
- Governments check
- Developing in Iran

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 8

Team: Michigan BS

vs.: North Texas GG

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: Dan Davis

INC Off-Case Arguments

Terrorism-plan hurts US credibility against state-sponsored terrorism

Renewable Energy-lifting santions cause low oil prices which prevent renewable energy

Democracy Consolidation-plan crushes emerging democratic enclaves in Iraq-WMD impact

Reform OFF CP

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Block reads war reparation add-on on the CP

2nr goes for everything

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 8

Team: Michigan PS

vs.: Emory BG

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: Lacy

INC Off-Case Arguments

NATO Expansion:

- Transatlantic trade tensions block NATO expansion now [IHT, 10/6/99, "unanimous praise"]
- Removing sanctions facilitates NATO expansion [Clemens, NATO and the Quest for Cold War Security, p. 196, 202, 205]
- Further NATO expansion triggers war [Jane's Intelligence Review, 11/1/99, ""confirm Russian suspicions"]

Democratic Consolidation:

- Democratic consolidation prevents backsliding now; Lifting sanctions causes reverse wave; Global democratic consolidation key to prevent conflict: <http://www.carnegie.org/deadly/dia95>

Clinton-WTO:

- WTO will pass early next year because of Clinton's political capital [Straits Times 99]
- Passing legislation requires president to expend political capital [Seidenfeld]
- Failure of WTO deal destroys US-Sino relations [Fisch]
- Impact is Asian conflicts [Conable 93]

Oppression:

- Lifting sanctions causes Saddam to exploit appeasement [Cordesman&Hashim, Iraq: Sanctions and Beyond, 1997, p.209]
- Lifting sanctions increases Iraqi government legitimacy, turns case

Counterplan - Reform Oil for Food:

The US government, in coordination with the UN Security Council, will reform the Oil for Food by setting the export ceiling to a level suitable to meet the basic food, medical, sanitation, transportation, and other infrastructural needs of the Iraqi people and to provide sufficient investment in the Iraqi oil industry to support increased production. Additional reforms will be made as per our Amorim evidence. Priority contracts will be given to humanitarian supplies with a direct impact on the well-being of children. Non-strategic dual-use imports necessary to address humanitarian needs will be allowed.

Humanitarian Suffering Ans:

- Saddam responsible - has money now, doesn't spend [x]
- US sanctions allow food and medicine
- Food imports at pre-war levels - distribution is the problem
- Plan never solves - no incentive
- OFF proves lifting sanctions fail
- Turn - lifting sanctions decreases food to Iraq [Berger]
- UNICEF study proves OFF works where Saddam doesn't control [x]
- Saddam not spending on women and children [x]
- Their studies are flawed - exaggerate death [x]
- Rejection to OFF empirically denied

Lashout Ans:

- Don't solve intent
- Saddam not get funds causes lashout
- Lashout inevitable [x]
- State sponsored terrorism declining now, Iraq on the list
- Softening sanctions kills terrorism credibility [Phillips]
- List key to international cooperation [x]

Genocide Ans:

- OFF support proves intent not to kill Iraq [Clinton]
- case impact - number dead determines
- intent changes over time
- must stop Saddam's exploitation
- US support for ILA proves no intent harm
- morality is a means to an end
- deontological absolutism dangerous [Macintyre]
- sanctions preferable to war [CSM]
- sanctions moral [Lopez 99]
- morality indeterminate - lifting sanctions uses as means to an ends [x]
- just war doctrine not apply - assumes war and not apply to sanctions [x]
- sanctions morally justified under just war doctrine [CSM]

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Oppression 2NC:

- concede internal link that perceived decrease in resolve increases oppression
- without credible deterrent, harms increase [USIP]
- US backdown only guarantees more bloody conflict [x]
- perception of a victory - CP avoids blank check [x]
- lifting sanctions is a major victory [cordesman, clawson, Middle East News Items, 7/19/99, "feeling of power"]

- concede impact
- lashout empirically denied - 10 yrs
- internal vs external repression impact distinction
- trend of iraqi lashout decreasing
- link to increased military linear - armed saddam will lashout [xx]
- india-pakistan irrelevant
- disad crushes your case and increases oppression
- perceived legitimacy causes invasion of kuwait [clawson, survival, spring 98]

OFF Counterplan 2NC:

- concede we boost support for oil industry
- we change current structure for how negotiated - boosts economy
- counterplan mutually exclusive - OFF controls iraqi export revenue - sever permutation maintains part of sanctions
- permutation links to disads - gives iraq control of revenue to aggress
- we streamline sanitation and transport
- alleviating suffering of iraq solves arab nationalism [x]
- hoarding not specific to technology
- saddam will capitulate and give in to US demands [x, x]
- cp solves need - guarantees oil investment [x]
- cp most moral - targets regime without removing the sanctions
- cp guarantees not endorse genocide
- solves intervening action
- preferable to diversion/free rein/give directly to people
- inherency evidence concedes SQ aid

Clinton-WTO 2NC:

- enough political capital now, plan legislation hurts capital, causes global prolif, causes Taiwan conflict and global nuclear war [xx]
- bad US relations cause global proliferation [x]
- causes global disaster [Ross 99]
- Asian recession - China key [x]
- impact: second Korean war [x]
- Clinton pushes plan - sign legislation means getting involved
- Least restrictive means - best for real world political environment - Clinton drafts legislation [Ottawa Statesman]
- spillover occurs
- business lobby wins now, but huge controversial fight [x]
- our uniqueness evidence says business beats labor
- wto pass now [x, x, x]
- business lobby has enough capital now
- internal link says decrease hurts fight business lobby
- concede internal link - WTO key and in short-term
- WTO solidifies alliance and solves relations [Commercial Appeal, Xinhua News, solidifies integration including Taiwan]
- political capital not in the Congress now, legislation is a drain
- Iraq policy uniquely controversial [Boston globe, "greater hawks"]

Clinton-WTO 1NR (the bottom):

- Plan delay dooms WTO passage [x]
- President must approve sanctions removal [Hamilton, 7/20/98, www.nixoncenter.org/publications/Perspectives/hamilton.html]
- Media will favor Clinton as doing plan removal [x]
- Have to take off terrorist list=testify

Democracy 1NR:

- Iraq key
- they keep dual-use
- no sanctions spillover
- credibility shot but no turn

NATO Expansion 1NR:

- can never speed up expansion
- senate never approve - only regional instability

Humanitarian Suffering 1NR:

- even if lift only divert, not solve infrastructure
- lift sanctions reduces amount - disband oil-for-food - short-term turn
- saddam always channels funds
- studies exaggerated - best are UN studies

Morality 1NR:

- can never determine morality
- CP solves the intent
- saddam always uses as means to an end

- tinkering on the CP
- oil-for-food the only way to guarantee it gets to them
- statecraft not include individual morality [x]
- iraqis are the beneficiary of us sanctions, so they are the ends [x]
- moral absolutism dangerous - never value or act against oppression - no moral consciousness to solve lashout
- sanctions morally preferable to war - conflict worse - direct targeting
- morality indeterminate - their evidence doesn't apply to foreign policy

Lashout 1NR:

- lopez says need to solve intent and feed - only the CP does that
- no rapid growth in the economy - no evidence investment outside of oil
- Iraqi military too weak [x]
- nothing can be done to change Iraqi intentions - only sanctions can prevent lashout [x]
- no terrorism in the country - 1nc evidence
- no international terrorism
- iraqi state-sponsored terrorism limited
- iraq has no terrorism [cartman]
- people released not terrorists - just journalists [x]
- no instances of mideast terrorism and empirically denied [x]
- plan only makes terrorism worse [x]
- extend credibility with other countries - international terrorism impact

OFF CP:

- We increase investment in non-oil sector and risk of oppression - short-term appeasement - unique capability boost - flips morality
- Amorim solvency evidence sanitation facilities
- plan gives UN direct control - the plan is a sever permutation
- just lift UN sanctions is a brand new argument and voting issue
- we make people happy by increasing economic growth in same areas
- Cordesman 2NC says he'll accept it under pressure with international security council action
- we solve arab nationalism

Clinton-WTO 2NR:

- not going for - extend collapse
- extend impact proliferation in ME inevitable
- Taiwan inevitably destroys
- President not push

Oppression 2NR:

- Plan emboldens Saddam
- Lashout empirically denied
- US never a credible deterrent
- Cordesman feeling of power and military diversion is a 100% takeout
- impact to WMD is New Republic lashout - no risk of a turn
- Kuwaiti invasion impact
- no fly zone unevicted and new

Democracy in Iraq 1AR:

- can't prove consolidation internationally - only strong on sanctions

NATO Expansion 2NR:

- wrong internal link to add-on - Russian, not European perception

Lashout 2NR:

- no WMD in status quo - won't lashout in SQ - only low-level internal conflicts
- perception of instability
- unique turn - no capability now
- don't take off terrorist list guts solvency - keeps sanctions and he concedes lift all [Stetson LR, Spring 98, 27:1211, "identifying terrorist organizations"]
- concede state-sponsored terrorism decreasing now and turn

Morality 2NR:

- counterplan treats as ends
- Kantian ethics not apply to states
- can't prove us intent based on consequences
- counterplan solves human life
- use to prevent intervention to check Hitler

Michigan

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1

Team: Michigan PS

vs.: North Texas GG

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: Deatherage

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Democracy Consolidation DA - Hardline stance against oppressive regimes to stabilize fledgling democracies worldwide

Clinton - China WTO - Political capital, delay, agenda focus links

Renewable Energy - Iraq floods the market with oil, price drops to \$5 a barrel, stops shift to renewables, needed to provide electricity to billions in underdeveloped countries

Terrorist List Credibility - Either you remove them from the list destroying credibility, or you don't meaning that list-based economic sanctions kill economy

Reform OFF CP

Iraq Bad - WMD, appeasement bad, Kurds

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1

Team: Michigan BS

vs.: Louisville RW

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: David Chesier

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Democracy Consolidation -

A. key time for consolidation -

Diamond, Developing Democracy Toward Consolidation, 1999, p. 62

B. the world sees the US as willing to kick ass when they backslide - plan

reverses this - same source

C. democracy prevents war (democracies don't fight) - same source

NATO Expansion - won't happen now b/c of US-EU tensions - plan reverses this - expansion bad --> Russia freaks out

A. uniqueness - Int'l Herald Tribune, 10/6/99 - "Solana won almost"

B. link - Clemens, NATO and the quest for cold war security, 1997, p.202, 205

C. Jane's intelligence review, 11/1/99 "eastward spread"

Terrorism List - lifting iraq sanctions destroys credibility of the terrorist list - terrorism bad

Link card = Philips, Heritage, 1999 - www.heritage.org/issues/chap19

FIX OFF CP -

1. increasing export limit sufficient to solve humanitarian crisis

2. provides investment capital

NB solvency card = www.un.org/Depts/oip/panelrep.html ??

CASE DA/Turns

1. Iraq will exploit weakness --> regional havoc -

Anthony Cordesman and Ahmed Hashim, "Iraq: Sanctions and Beyond," 1997

2. Iraq will invade Kuwait - Cordesman, "Saudi Arabia: The US and the Structure of the Gulf Alliance" www.csis.org/mideast

3. Iraq will crush Kurds = genocide

University Wire, May 14, 1999, "If the Security Council"

4. Reignite WMD

National Catholic Reporter, June 18, 1999 "Iraq is close"

5. Moral obligation to sanction (reason is Kurdish kids)

Lopez, "The Structure of Sanctions," 1998

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 2

Team: Michigan PS

vs.: Catholic DuWi

Aff case (country): Syria

Judge: D. Heidt

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

T Immediate without delay BLD 79 - conditions not topical, cross-ex not check, indeterminacy destroys neg ground, hurts CP

Terrorism DA

Uniqueness - State-sponsored terrorism decreasing now, Syria on the list

Bulletin's Frontrunner 99 "list of international terrorism"

Link - Plan undermines integrity of terrorist list

Phillips 99

Integrity of terrorism list key to solving international terrorism

Ganor 98 "organized international struggle"

Failure to enforce leads to conflicts, kills millions

WTO DA

WTO will pass now, fight will be difficult

Straits Times 11-16 "prospects are excellent," "persuade Congress," "issues arise in the next few months"

Political capital key

Wash Times 99 "not everybody is convinced"

Enacting legislation requires presidential PC

Failure to pass WTO devastates relations

Relations key to global stability

Conable 93 "cut at the 1995 MNDI and still going strong"

CP - Upon completion of Israel-Palestine PP track, the US will condition US support as per the plan and/or cooperation with Assad on his attempts to create a warm peace with Israel, withdraw from Lebanon, end support for terrorism, end drug trafficking. Any congressional or executive waivers that allow American financial operations in Syria or support for Syria. This policy will be in accordance with the recommendations of Daniel Pipes, as per our solvency evidence

Pipes The Washington Institute Policy Papers, Syria Before the Peace Process, no. 40 1996 "influence Syrian behavior"

Barak NB

A. Israel and Palestinians will agree on land-for-peace deal soon

Atlanta Journal 11-18-99 "newest land-for-peace"

B. Barak PC limited

Jer Post 99 "simply does not have the PC," "public opinion polls"

C. Turns case - Pal peace key PP

Mena BBC 2-27-98 "may cause a conflict"

Water Wars

- lack of historical methodology proves no water wars -

- long tf to solve - bastion 98

- no th to coop - on brink for years

Peace Process

- Iran-sponsored terrorism derails PP - Wash Post 11-10 "failure of the PP"

- Iran sponsoring attacks - Wash Times 11-17-99 "during a recent visit"

- Syria can't control Hezbollah - Wash Times 11-17-99 "willful militants"

- Israel wants to wait until Assad is gone - Jane's 11-10-99 "right-wing parties"

- Egypt will thwart PP - Jerusalem Post 10-15-99 "pragmatic optimism"

- Assad wants total return of G Heights before talks begin - LAT 11-5-99 "strategic Golan Heights"

- Israel rejects talks - Xinhua News Agency 10-18-99 "where they broke off"

- Israel not see Syria as key to Palestinian track - Telhami 7-13-99 FNS "there is a link"

- Syria will never attack - Stratfor 7-19-99 "fundamental reversal of geopolitics in the region"

- No Syrian military power - BBC 7-6-99 "overestimating Syria's military power"

- No lashout or preemption - aff doesn't read ev from Israeli government sources

Succession

- Assad will never liberalize economy - Plaut 9-99 ME Quarterly "the dustbin of history"

- Massive foreign debt overshadows recovery - Plaut

- Either no opposition or no conflict over transition - Jane's 6-1-99 "latest shake-up"

- Transition will be smooth - Zisser 2-6-99 "new blood into the army"

- Peace deal leads to backlash - Clawson 7-25-96 "opposition threat"

- Weak economy prevents WMD development - Plaut 99 "serious trouble abroad"

- Turns PP advantage, leads to Syrian nukes - Plaut

- Green light for WMD development - Lesser & Tellis 96 Strategic Exposure "sponsoring international terrorism"

- Green light impact - Mann 10-14-98 www.washingtoninstitute.org/watch/Policywatch/policywatch1997/277.htm

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

2NC Clinton links

- Delay destroys agenda
- Foreign policy moves (ME PP) drains political capital
- President must authorize plan - causes fights with Congress - Helms 99

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 4

Team: Michigan BS

vs.: Boston University FL

Aff case (country): Cuba

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Terrorism DA

A. Bulletin's Frontrunner, 8/5/99

B. James Phillips, www.heritage.org/issues/Chp19

C. Livingstone, Newsday, 2/3/99

Clinton DA

A. "Straight Times", 11/16/99 (I'm guessing this is supposed to be the Straits Times)

B. Watson, Asia News, 11/15/99

C. Fische, New Agency, 11/15/99

Rice DA

AFP, 9/30/99

Houston Chronicle, 9/25/99

Counterplan - the executive branch will waive Titles III and IV of Helms-Burton

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Went for Terrorism, Rice, case takeouts, and the CP

Michigan

School: Michigan

Team(s): PS, MS, BS

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

T - Nearly all means all but one

Sanctions on Cuba - www.usaengage.org/studies/crs/index/html

Democracy Consolidation

Democratic consolidation efforts are holding back a reverse wave of regime backsliding now

Larry Diamond, *Developing Democracy Toward Consolidation*, 1999, p 22

Perceived US resolve to impose sanctions protects fledgling democracies from regressing to auth.

Diamond 99, p 62

Global democratic consolidation is necessary to prevent eight scenarios for conflict

www.carnegie.org/deadly/dia95, 1996, "a hostile, expansionist Russia"

Terrorism

State sponsored terrorism is declining - Cuba is on the list

Bulletin's frontrunner, 8-5-99, "statistics indicate terrorism in general"

Softening terrorism sanctions kills US anti-terrorism credibility

www.heritage.org/issues/chap19, James Philips, 1999

Terrorism list solves terrorism

FDCH Transcripts, 4-30-99, "the impacts of the counterterrorism designation"

Terrorist incidents kills millions

Newsday, 2-3-99, "could see the marriage of a conventional explosive"

Global war

www.ict.org.il/articles, April 25, Boaz Ganor, Inst. for the Control of Terrorism

Clinton - Taiwan Security Enhancement

Taiwan Security Enhancement Act won't pass Senate now due to Clinton lobbying

Washington Post, 10-3-99, "The Clinton administration decided in recent days"

Overtures by the US toward Taiwan guarantee conflict

Central News Agency, 10-13-99, "stop implying that it would help defend Taiwan"

Regional Armageddon

AAP Newsfeed, 9-5-99 "Tension in the Taiwan Strait has heightened"

Clinton can win future legislative battles

NYT, 10-15-99 "he certainly has learned how to use the powers"

Clinton- political capital stories, most recently: UN Dues, Taiwan Security act, Wye, WTO, Debt relief.

Oil DA Potpourri- your plan lowers the oil price which kills the Saudi econ = civil war and Mead and/or the Russian economy = nuclear civil war. High oil prices needed for the transition to renewables, renewables key to stop climate which will kill us all, including all of the critters in the forest.

Russia- Number 1- plan is a geopolitical loss for Russia to the US which causes the nationalist forces in Russia to win the Duma and/or Presidential elections, nationalism causes war. Number 2- Plan improves US-Russian ties and/or draws Russia away from China, this undermines Russia-China ties. Russia-China relations key to Asian stability.

Misperception- unconditional removal of sanctions causes other nations to question US resolve, they act aggressively and start conflicts worldwide.

Interest Rates- plan lowers the trade deficit which overheats the economy and causes a rate hike which makes the global economy stagnate, even shrink.

War Norms- removal of sanctions causes US bombing as an alternative to sanctions.

CUBA:

INC Strategy

Suffering advantage

1. Castro's fault X
2. Can't afford it
3. Exemptions now X
4. US grants all aid and food now X
5. Plan can't solve - doesn't give foreign aid
6. Plan prevents transition to democracy X
7. Helping economy makes Castro look good X Schwab 99

Coercion advantage

1. Cuba took property - US is solving the problem now
2. US solving property rights now X
3. Liberty is not absolute X
4. Property acquired through force X
5. Plan hurts liberty X
6. Individual rights risks authoritarianism X
7. Property rights aren't absolute X
8. No one has property rights now - impact isn't occurring
9. Property rights restrict freedom X
10. Right to freedom is not absolute X
11. Moral obligation to keep embargo X Washington Times 99

Underview

1. Threat of nuke war trumps all X Nye 96
2. Moral obligation to avoid nuke war X Schell 82
3. Property of impact must be considered
4. Not real-world?
5. Big link justifies no action X Rescher 83
6. Castro is intervening actor - his fault
7. Should hold intermediaries responsible
8. Plan props up Castro
9. Plan uses people as a means to an end X

Strategy in Rebuttals

Went for all but T in block.

Went for terrorism and democratic consolidation in 2NR.

IRAQ:

INC Strategy

Democracy Consolidation

Israeli Threat Perception - Launch on Warning Impact

Reform Oil For Food CP - Amorim UN Solvency

Negative Block

All extended

Emphasis on Israel, OFF CP, case turns

Strategy in Rebuttals

Went for all in 2NR, but terrorism only as a take-out to the case and democracy consolidation only for 20 seconds

IRAN:

INC Strategy

Off-case

Gradualism CP

Plan Hurts Moderates and/or Kills Khatami's credibility

On-case

There are no moderates

Oil shock/supply takeouts

Prolif inevitable

SYRIA:

INC Strategy

Off-case

CP- pressure Assad with sanctions and other punitive measures to end support for terrorism, make a peace deal with Israel, end support for the PKK. Solvency from Daniel Pipes.

On-case

Peace process advancing now or pp = Turkey/Syrian war

Sanctions check hostile foreign policy, Hezbollah terrorism, Lebanese/Syrian war

Pressure on Assad needed for transition and economic reform

Water scarcity doesn't cause conflict

NORTH KOREA:

INC Strategy

Off-case

KEDO CP

On-case

Collapse Turn- DPRK liberalization weakens the regime, causes a civil war

ROK Turn- bilateral US-NK ties undermines NK/SK ties, turns the case

Appeasement

Berlin solves

No war type takeouts

Food aid now, crisis exaggerated

UNI

>>>Michigan's case hit vs. Kentucky Freshmen (Iraq)

>>>

>>>sanctions key to pressure Saddam -- Byman Autumn '98; Survival

>>>

>>>can't solve UN sanctions

>>>

>>>no incentive for Saddam to comply

>>>

>>>sanctions stop Iraqi aggression -- Cordesman '97; Iraq: Sanctions and

>>>Beyond

>>>

>>>lifting sanctions kills UN credibility and causes Mideast War --

>>>Sarasota Herald Tribune 1/17/99; "defiant and non-compliant"

>>>

>>>supports Saddam -- Gause '99 (full cite below...I think...it's a

>>>Foreign Affairs article).

>>>

>>>attacks Israel -- Cordesman '99; Iraq and the War of Sanctions

>

Russian Geo-Politics (elections)

- Nationalists view foreign policy as zero sum
- Decrease influence = increase nationalism
- plan gives hardliners an issue against Yeltsin
- Hardliners win the election
- Increase nationalism = war

Clinton

WTO, china, political capital internal link

Trade-Off / Child immunization (ran against a North Korea Aff)

Drug Credibility

- Cuba uses drugs, trade hurts credibility, ethnic wars

Oil Prices

Democracy Promotion Good

- sanctions a key tool of democracy, hurt credibility = global war
- aff stops a world wide mvmt to democracy

Misperception

- weak on one rogue nation = weak on another

Russia

Saudi Arabia

Michigan State

DARTMOUTH

Round four:

Kansas (Iraq) vs Mich State (neg).

1AC: plan changed: the usfg will push for the immediate lifting of un sanctions restricting import and export of civilian goods under UN resolution 661 and immediately lift us sanctions which function pursuant to UN resolution 661. The US will ensure cessation of all military and nonmilitary aggression against the government of Iraq and we will initiate dialogue and information sharing on reduction of damage from US military actions.

1NC: cp was a pic to cease aggression per the plan but not lift sanctions; ntr, trade deficit da, appeasement, hollow inspections, kritik of ontological violence,

2nr: aggression turns, hollow inspections, trade deficit da,

Iowa (iraq) vs Michigan State (neg).

Inc: Rice DA, Pesticides, Agent specification, Dillon Ontological violence
Kritik, Tobacco DA, T- constructive engagement must include dialog with the government

WILLIAM JEWELL

MICHIGAN STATE CM

Against Texas EG (Cuba):

-Rice: Vietnam

-Southeast Asian Investment Trade-Off.

-CP: Plan, But Don't Lift Export Sanctions.

USC

Michigan State BC: Blair and Carson

Negative Positions:

Clinton NTR

Oil DA

CP to Do plan but leave export sancitons in place

Net benefit export death from pesticides and tobacco

Cuba Strat:

Exports CP

Export Death

Rice DA

WAKE

Michigan State

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 5

Team: Michigan State DM

vs.: Pace KP

Aff case (country): North Korea

Judge: Kerr - Catholic

1NC Off-Case Arguments

Obuchi

A) New session of the Japanese Parliament has just begun and debate is focused on economic reforms - Japan Times, 10-22-1999, "Obuchi launched his new"

- B) The Berlin Agreement was not enough to force Japan to follow the US policy of engagement, but a new more solid agreement would force Japan to follow suit, despite domestic opposition - Bernama, Malaysian National News Agency, 9-13-1999, "a Japanese government source"
- C) Hardliners in Japan will oppose lifting sanctions, distracting the Diet - Washington Times, 8-22-1999, "There is growing opinion"
- D) New Policies divert attention from focusing on the economy - only focused reforms can save the Japanese economy and lead a regional recovery - the Hindu, 10-13-1999, "At a time when East Asian recovery"
- E) Japan key to world economy - US News and World Report, 11-4-1999, "a bleaker outlook"
- F) Economic decline causes Nuclear war - Mead 1992

ROK Relations

- A) Perry proposal has been conducted in close consultation with the ROK, resulting in a carefully coordinated approach - the plan derails SQ integration - BBC, 9-20-1999, "South Korean television"
 - B) An overly soft-line approach to US/DPRK relations hurts US/ROK relations and the alliance - Kotch, Harvard International Review, Spring 1999, p. 19, "the crucial test"
 - C) US-ROK alliance deters nuclear war - Halperin, ftp.nautilus.org, 1997, p. 23, "the continuation of the security"
- Peace Treaty link:
 - Bedeski, ftp.nautilus.org/napsnet/special_reports/PF7A_bedeski_on_Korean_peace.txt, , 7-23-1997, "South Korea remains suspicious"

Clinton - Taiwan Security Act

- A) Taiwan Security act won't pass now
- B) Concessions destroy Clinton's political capital
- C) Clinton needs political capital to block TSA
- D) The impact is nuclear war

Kritik of Ontological violence - shell is in the day one caselist

Counterplan

The USFG should adopt a policy of Constructive Engagement, including the immediate removal of all non-military economic sanctions with North Korea as per Harrison. To achieve a missile deal and end the state of war with North Korea, the US should increase diplomatic relations with North Korea. The US will not accept NK's proposal for a trilateral peace mechanism until NK agrees to a prior peace mechanism acceptable to South Korea. Said peace mechanism will replace the armistice of the Korean War

Observation 1: we compete

- the Counterplan is textually competitive - "will accept" competes with "will not accept"
- the CP is a precondition

Observation 2: Solvency

- the normalization and lifting sanctions portions of the counterplan overcome North Korean objections and the requirement of troop withdrawal and a bilateral North-South peace treaty would avoid South Korean and Congressional opposition - Moon, ftp.nautilus.org/napsnet/special_reports/PF5A_Moon_on_Korean_Peace.txt, 6-24-1997, "this alternative assumes"

Open conflict advantage answers

1. maritime border evidence is speculative
2. Conditional CP - US will exempt support
3. Evidence is rhetorical
4. Brinksmanship won't cause war, North Korea empirically backs down
5. No war would escalate
6. Economic contact with South Korea won't stop brinksmanship
7. Gradual peace treaty will inevitably solve the case - collapse of the Agreed Framework inevitable

Proliferation advantage answers

1. no incentive to proliferate
2. empirically denied: Agreed Framework for 5 years
3. North Korea won't proliferate
4. Deterrence checks proliferate
5. T - plan is appeasement, invites further aggression
6. That swamping causes Taiwan war

Negative Block

Donald extends the Kritik of Ontological violence and the Counterplan

- conditions solve - Japan Times, 9-20-1999, "if North Korea is the irrational state"
- Conditionality Solves - Brookes, Strategic Review, Winter 1999, p.73, "any new North Korea policy"
- Conditions solve - their need for assistance and desire to engage the US overwhelm opposition - Niksch, North Korean Relations in the Post-Cold War Era, Congressional Research Service, 1998, p. 67, "North Korea's reaction"

Monick finishes the Counterplan for Donald, extends Clinton, South Korea, and case arguments, and kicks Obuchi

New ROK link cards

- Plan causes domestic ROK political backlash and undermines deterrent, increasing the risk of war - Moon, Korea after Kim Il Sung, 1997, p.94, "South Korea now seems obsessed"

- Despite deep seated goodwill toward the US, anti americanism is festering below the surface - Scalapino, US and the Two Koreas, 1999, p.32, "a rise of nationalism"
- Plan triggers dormant nationalism, fracturing the alliance - PF.Ahn, Origins and Evolution of the Korean-American Alliance: A Korean Perspective, 1998, p.6, "South Koreans have supported"

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Donald goes for the Counterplan with Clinton and ROK relations as net benefits

- argues that the impact to Clinton turns the case because US-Sino relations are necessary to solve Korean war.

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 7

Team: Michigan State VW

vs.: Emory CR

Aff case (country): Cuba

Judge: Kerr

INC Off-Case Arguments

Pesticides and Rice combined into one argument

Counterplan: Lift sanctions, do Bilateral Investment Treaty, but do not lift export sanctions

Hazardous Waste Exports - Exports go to Cuba post-plan, that's bad

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Block goes for CP, Rice, Toxic waste...but kicks pesticides

Claim Rice disad turns back the case impacts.

Michigan State

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1

Team: Michigan State MD

vs.:Mercer DH

Aff case (country): North Korea

Judge: Lisa Jordan

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Clinton - TSEA

A. won't pass - BBC nov. 6

B. political capital key - Business Day 11/10/99

C. TSEA --> US/China was - Int'l Herald Tribune

Tobacco -

A. snctns now block tobacco - Congressional Daily, July 27, 1999

B. moral obligation to stop tobacco - US Newswire, July 16, 1998

Pesticides -

A. cannot export now - Colopy, UCLA J. of Env. L. 1994

B. export immoral - Gammie, Seton Hall L. R., 1994

Toxic Waste -

A. US companies cannot export to developing countries - Mealey's Litigation Report, June 30, 1998

B. --> death - East-West Center, Nov. 1, 1997

Rice

A. NK key market - FDCH, June 10, 1999

B. Loss of exports crushes SEAsia LA Times, 3/26/99

C. --> famine Business Day, 9/24/98

AT: Terror Talk Advantage

1. terrorist list also because of harboring terrorists
2. can't solve discourse - senator's still use language
3. no ev. That lifting sanctions are critical
4. self-fulfilling prophecy is inevitable
5. empirically false - hitler, pol pot
6. t/ some threat construction is good x,x
7. self-fulfilling prophecy is wrong

8. realism is not immoral x,x
9. history disproves x,x
10. t/ elite opposition - NK elites oppose plan
11. threats in foreign policy = inevitable part of discourse

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 2

Team: Michigan State ML

vs.: North Texas HS

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: Jared Ellis

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Russia Relations

A. Russia-China-India relations strong - triangle is zero-sum

Washington Times, 12/27/98

B. Plan increases US/Russia Relations

Moscow Times, 10/13/99

C. Russia-China Relations key to solve North Korea

Saudi Oil

A. uniqueness - Oil prices high - Middle East News Items, Nov. 8, 1999

B. link - plan decreases prices - Jerusalem Post, Feb. 5, 1998

C. key to Saudi Economy - David, Foreign Affairs, Feb. 1999

D. civil war - USA today 3/22/99

Topicality - CE - can't reimpose or condition

CP: reform OFF - USFG will push, through all available channels, modifications to the current UN resolution 486 Oil-for-Food Program towards Iraq in the following manner: Caps on oil sales will be removed in \$ amounts, but import quotas will remain that the production in barrel per day units according to market value for maximized reforms as per Taylor. The Escrow account that garners funding for war reparations will be suspended, pre-approved humanitarian supplies will be provided w/o review, import licenses will be streamlined by a cash component for the south and through other efficient means. O.F.F. resources should be procured to support local subsistence farming when possible. Bilateral production sharing agreements will be authorized, allowing importation of spare parts for infrastructure recovery on oil and transportation. NGO operation will be expanded in all areas possible.

Solvency -

UN Panel Report March 30, 1999 (<http://www.un.org/Depts/oip/panelrep.html>)

Taylor, FDCH Transcripts, March 26, 1999

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3

Team: Michigan State DM

vs.: Michigan MS

Aff case (country): Cuba

Judge: Russell - Dartmouth

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Clinton - Taiwan Security Act

a) Taiwan Security Act will pass in the status quo

b) Plan causes political capital loss

c) Political capital key to passing Taiwan Security Act

d) Impact is US-Sino war and Arms races

Rice

a) US sanctions causing Cuba to import Asian Rice - plan causes Cuba to shift back to US rice

b) Loss of rice revenue hurts Southeast Asian economy and causes poverty

c) Depression in Southeast Asia causes war

Organic Farming

a) organic farming increasing in the status quo - essential to solving famine

b) embargo key to the environment - the plan increases reliance on chemical agriculture which hurts the environment

c) US exports of banned pesticides cause massive death and turns back their morality claims

Toxic Waste

- a) US waste exporters seek out cash-strapped countries to purchase damaging chemicals - Mealey's Litigation Reports, 6-30-1998
- b) Export of waste to Caribbean countries has historically caused serious disease, birth defects, and dysfunction - Mealey's Litigation Reports

Kritik of Ontological Violence

A) Programs for action in international politics take security and its cognates as their goal. This enframing of the political and its accompanying discourses of danger shape us as individuals. Rejection of this framing and the related question of "what is to be done" is necessary to understand the nature of violence - Dillon, Politics of Security, 1996

B) The question of where we are has to be answered prior to the question of where we are headed - otherwise there is no framework from which to judge which way we need to go - our criticism is this assessment - Dillon

Counterplan - The US will adopt a policy of constructive engagement with the Cuban government including the immediate removal of economic sanctions including the repeal of US code that prohibits US financial investment, travel, or imports from Cuba. All secondary sanctions will be lifted. A Bilateral Investment Treaty will be created with Cuba. The US will not cite national security as an excuse and will not object to challenges in the WTO. The provisions of this policy will not apply to any foreign or domestic investment in any current or future nuclear energy projects. We reserve the right to clarify intent. The remaining sanctions will not have a punitive intent, but function to prevent harmful exports

Marxism Shell Cites --

A. Link -- foreign Policy/Order == decreased socialism baby...
 Ryan (not andy) 1984 -- Marxism and Deconstruction: A Critical Articulation, michael, p.220

B. Capitalism=inevitable extinction -- try/die
 Harmon (not Aaron) Economics of Madhouse - p. 99

C. Rejection of Capitalist Ontology crucial to social change
 Harstock 1979 (not Ross) Capitalist patriarchy and the Case for Socialist Feminism -- Nancy -- p.57-58

D. Geppert smells awful... Pre-Fiat...

Transatlantic Relations answers:

1. impact's empirically denied - Helms-Burton's been on paper for years
2. no incentive for breaking relations
3. no risk of a US pullout
4. compromise prevents fighting
5. clash inevitable on genetics and agriculture
6. EU not pushing their complaint in the status quo
7. Alternate causality: ILSA

Famine/Morality/Transition answers:

1. Last card on the case turns the advantage back in the short term
2. sanctions create civil society
3. Catholic church will moderate transition
4. Engagement hurts internal dialogue key for successful transition
5. Plan increases income inequality
6. Wages fine in the status quo - only risk of a turn
7. Political constraints hurt solvency
8. embargo not the key scapegoat - Castro will find others
9. morality doesn't come first
10. their means of lifting sanctions is undesirable
11. government obligation to look at consequences

Negative Block

2NC goes for the kritik, the counterplan, and toxic waste

- four links to the kritik

- 1) objectivity - concepts of the way the state operates founded in flawed notions of objectivity, can order people into a civil society
- 2) security - concepts of security necessitate insecurity elsewhere
- 3) constitutes intervention - stopping Anti-US sentiment is an excuse for expansion - Spanos, Heidegger and Criticism, 1993
- 4) the notion of reason and moral principles holds us hostage

Performative contradiction answers:

1. disads are a manifestation of the security mentality
2. kritik is an if-then statement
3. we don't advocate security and the counterplan is a test of the desirability of the plan
4. frame the debate as a forced choice
5. not a voting issue

Aff solves violence answers:

1. the program of lifting sanctions is flawed
2. state of security cannot be achieved
3. don't evaluate the plan in a vacuum
4. trade advantage proves the link

We don't have to defend the status quo:

1. the kritik is an antiquated argument
 2. status quo constantly shifts
 3. educationally destructive argument
 4. evidence supports our alternative
 5. rejection is better
 6. question of where we are has to be answered prior to the question of where we are headed - otherwise there is no framework from which to judge which way we need to go - our criticism is this assessment
 7. vote on presumption
- they can never escape the cycle of violence
 - can't assign a value to human life

1NR kicks Clinton and Organic Farming, extends Rice and the case arguments

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

The 2NR goes for the Counterplan, Rice and Toxic Waste, along with case arguments

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3

Team: Michigan State ML

vs.: Texas GE

Aff case (country): Syria, Iraq, Iran

1NC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Topicality - must advocate a plan - key to ground and education - voter for ground

Russia - as in earlier reports w/ bombing link

Rice

A. lifting snctns on Iraq opens up iraqi market for our rice exports Snedry, 8/10/99

B. loss of rice kills SEAsian Economies --> mass poverty Lamb, 1999

C. --> War, Baucus 1998

CP - do all of plan except don't lift us exports to Iraq

Pesticides - as before in earlier reports

Clinton -

A. TSEA will not pass now

B. Plan kills political capital

C. Key to block TSEA - Business Day 11/10/99

D. War

Case

1. Ontological Hegemony
2. Said's critical analysis overemphasizes power of have's and have-not's - need to reject Said's black and white nature
3. Endorsing Said's kritik is bad
4. Aff's kritik is an excuse for inaction
5. Said = no alternative and Said also rejects Saddam

Solvency cites

Culture and Criticism, 1996 (editor not listed)

Varadharajan, Exotic Parodies: Subjectivity in Adoring, Said, and Spivak, 1995

Dirlik, Dangerous Liaisons: Gender, Nation, and Postcolonial Perspectives, ed. By Anne McClintock, 1997

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

2NC famine impact - Business Day 9/24/98

go for rice and pesticides and CP and case

Michigan State

School: Michigan State

Team(s): OS, PB, DM, LM

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of 1NC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

The Kritik of Ontological Violence - Plan uses notions of security and problem/solution format. It fails to answer the fundamental question of being so it causes whatever it tries to solve. They used our military intervention arguments as links saying we securitized the status quo. The 2NC reads a long listing of links and argues that fiat is utopian.

2NC Ans to Must advocate a policy:

- Neg can't predict 1AC so their job is to negate
- SQ is not defensible
- Must question IR theory [Dylan ev]
- Neg advocates rejection
- Rethinking is a policy -Plan is worse than status quo
- Forces us into the system we attack

2NC Ans to Permutation:

- Assumes a ready-made solution = new link
- Severs the plan, that's bad moving target
- IR theory is hollow
- Must have a text
- Can't permute because there is no text to the alternative
- Extend our links
- Focus on individuals atomizes the world

Exports CP - Do plan but don't export specific products

Rice D/A - US rice exports trade off with SEA rice exports

- A. US sanctions on Cuba drive them to purchase Asian rice - post plan they will eagerly shift back to US suppliers - Sneary, FDCH congressional testimony, 6/10/99 - "Cuba became a top quality market for over half of our total rice exports at that time."
- B. Loss of rice revenues crushes Southeast Asian economies, causing poverty, LA Times, 3/26 "That Vietnam has become the world's second leading rice exporter"
- C. Southeast Asian depression causes war - Washington Times, January 18, 1998 "a depression in Southeast Asia can mean 'political instability' - a wonk's term which in everyday English means coups, riots, and worse."

* Houston Chronicle, 9/25/99 "rice farmers are hoping the House will adopt a Senate amendment to lift trade sanctions that prevent food and medicine from going to Cuba"

* Matthew Massaua, FDCH, October 23, 1997 - "share of world rice trade has ranged from 12 percent to 28 percent"

* Peterson, FDCH, 8/17/99 - "Vietnam is heavily dependent on agricultural exports such as rice"

* Vietnam investment review 3/8/99 - "Domestic production of most agriculture products has shot ahead of domestic demand"

* Deutch Presse Agentur 7/2/99 - "rice exports would pick up in the second half of 1999 due to higher demand and more competitive pricing and because deliveries are planned under contract to buyers including Iran, Iraq, Indonesia and some African countries."

* Bell, Federal News Service, 5/11/99 - "some people say that access to trade with these three countries - Cuba, Iran, and Iraq - cannot be all that important to US rice exports"

Tobacco D/A - US Tobacco exports kill

* Sanctions block tobacco sales, National Jnl Congress Daily, 6/27/99, "not issued regulations"

* Moral obligation to prevent export death, US Newswire, 6/16/98, "sell more cigarettes overseas"

* Also, Washington Times, 11/8/98, "knowingly export"

Pesticides -

* US will export, Colopy 94, UCLA Jnl of Env Law & Policy, "600 million pounds"

* Impact turns moral obligation, Gammie, 25 Seton Hall L. Rev. 558, "destroy necessary requirement"

Marxism Kritik

Opposition movements counterplan

Shunning

Arguments Extended in the Negative Block (New Link Stories, Cites, Time Allocation, etc)

2NC:

Case Turns

Marxism

1NR:

CP

Pesticides DA

Neg Strategy in Rebuttals (key arguments, tricks, things they kick out of)
Big Marxism

CUBA:
INC Strategy
Toxic Waste

Proactive CP-Excludes Investment, encourages CBM, NGO's
Gonzalez, RAND's National Defense Institute, '96 (Edward, Summary of Cuba: Clearing Perilous Waters?, www.rand.org)

Reactor
Defense news 9/27/99
"U.S. officials say Cuban construction practices and the Soviet-era design of the reactors are not up to American or international nuclear standards. But western companies have appeared reluctant to participate, partly because of opposition to it from the United States."
Helen Caldicott, Nuclear Madness, 1994

BW turn
Gaffney, director for the center for security policy, 98 (Frank, Washington Times, March 31) "the use of giant eavesdropping facilities near Lourdes, Cuba, by both Cuban and Russian Intelligence"

Sustainable Development - Cuba's doing it now. Lifting embargo kill development. Hurts the environment and causes famine

Negative Block
C/P
Toxic Waste
Pests

Strategy in Rebuttals
C/P
Toxic Waste
Pesticides

IRAQ:
INC Strategy
Oil prices - Saudis impact
A. Oil prices high, Fin Times, Aug 16 99, "rapid oil price recovery"
B. Lifting sanctions crushes prices, Jerusalem Post, 2/5/98, "send oil prices tumbling" ***
C. Loss of oil revenues causes Saudi regime collapse, "alienate large portions" ****
D. Saudi economic decline causes civil war, kills global economy, "financial outlook worsens" ***
-Link extensions: Iraqi oil hurts prices
Financial Times, August 16 99, "put severe pressure" ****
Middle East Executive Reports, Chalabi, February 99, "very rapid expansion" *****
-Russia impact add on to Iraq oil - Azerbaijan scenario
www.security-policy.org/papers/1997/97-C180.html
-AT: OPEC solves price decrease, Bridge News, 4/13/99, "oil price soaring"

Israel Relations - Peace Process Impact
A. Strong US - Israel relations allow risks for peace, LA Times, 7/20/99, "enhanced U.S.-Israeli strategic cooperation" ***
B. Israel believes containing Iran/Iraq is the key commitment to the relationship, Inbar 96, Between War and Peace: Dilemmas of Israeli Security, p 71
C. Israeli confidence in US ties key to peace process, Reich 94 Confidence Building Measures in the Middle East, Ed: Ben-Dor and Dewitt, p 236-67, p 233
D. Failure of Palestine peace process stops nuclear war, Slater 98, Political Science Quarterly, v 112, p 675-89

Topicality - CE is end all coercion, including more than just lift sanctions

CP - allow Iraq to import but not export
TEXT: The Neg will lift all sanctions the aff does except import sanctions currently on the target nation. (doesn't allow Iraq to export, just allows them to import)

Others will invest in Iraq (non-US)
Boston Globe, 6/29/99, "among many Western companies" *
WHAT THE PAPERS SAY, 6/9/99, "countries immediately made"
Jerusalem Post, 9/6/99, "gradual easing"

Advantage Answers
Mortality studies exaggerated, www.bullatonsci.org/issues/1998/mj98/mj98lopez.html
Saddam is the cause - North-South mortality differential proves

US aiding Iraqi hospitals, AFP, Aug 13 99, "donate one million dollars"
Iraq not distribute, NYT, 1/13/99, "inexplicable delays"
Sanctions key to protect Iraqi lives, Commonweal, Sept 11 98, v125 n 15, p 10(3)***

Solvency Answers

Lifting sanctions hurts UN credibility, Sarasota Herald-Tribune, 1/17/99, "credible enforcer"
Also Survival Autumn 98, p 127, Byman, Pollack, Waxman
Nuclear prolif link, Jessica Stern, The Ultimate Terrorists, p 124, 1999 ****
CE Fails, IHT, 12/29/98, "purely diplomatic solution" ****
Lifting sanctions increases military attacks

Negative Block

Donald kicked the CP and Shunning in the 2NC, answered theory args for a while, kicked shunning, went for oil prices and israel.
Monick went for T and the case turns and defense.

Strategy in Rebuttals

2NR kicked oil, went for israel, and mil-mod, prolif turns on the case

UCO

MSU OS (IRAQ)

OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:

- Clinton - Wye Accords
- Exports PC - Do plan but don't export specific products to Iraq
- Rice D/A - US rice exports trade off with SEA rice exports
- Tobacco D/A - US Tobacco exports kill
- Pesticides D/A - US pesticides exports kill
- Marxism Kritik

BREAKDOWN OF THE BLOCK:

2NC

- Case Turns
- Marxism
- 1NR
- CP

- Pesticides DA

NEGATIVE TRICKS

2NR POSITIONS:

- Marxism

MSU PB (CUBA)

OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:

- Tobacco
- Pesticides
- Rice
- Toxic Waste
- Export C/P

BREAKDOWN OF THE BLOCK:

2NC

- Everything except what the 1N goes for
- 1NR
- Food Advantage
- Tobacco
- Rice

NEGATIVE TRICKS

2NR POSITIONS

- CP
- Toxic Waste
- Pesticides

UNI

>>>MORE of Michigan States' hit versus Kentucky (Iraq)
 >>>
 >>>CASE:
 >>>
 >>>Health info exaggerated -- Lopez and Cortright May/June '98;
 >>>www.bullatomsci.org/issues/1998/mj98/mj98lopez.html
 >>>
 >>>Saddam is the cause -- Agence France Presse 8/13/99; "deaths among
 >>>children under five declined"
 >>>
 >>>Iraq has medicine and won't distribute -- NYT 1/13/99; "Iraqis have
 >>>refused"
 >>>
 >>>lifting sanctions causes slaughter of Kurds -- Lopez 9/11/98;
 >>>Commonweal; "moral obligation to ensure"
 >>>
 >>>OFF CASE:
 >>>
 >>>T -- must remove all sanctions
 >>>Shunning -- Saddam is evil; we are moral agents
 >>>Clinton/WTO
 >>>CP -- "USFG shall devote the funds for set aside in the Iraqi National
 >>>Congress Bill to the oppositional forces against Saddam in north and
 >>>south Iraq. The money will be used as advocated by Perle (Perle '99;
 >>>"serious western policy toward Iraq would).
 >>>

Economy d/a
 -economy ok now, plan = perception of export increase ? overheating
 the
 economy.
 -Increase in interest rates = economic crash ? crash is bad

Topicality
 -constructive engagement
 -aff doesn't adopt a new policy

Allow medical, health and food sales counterplan
 -Gonzalez is advocate, 1996

Clinton
 -WTO vote on China will be close, plan spends political capital, key to
 u.s./sino relations, which are key to preventing war
 -Sino/Japanese relations impact

Nuclear power
 -decrease sanctions = build nuclear power plants ? 50-80 million die

Khatami
 -Khatami must consolidate his support, engagement results in a
 hardline
 backlash, turning an Iran aff.

Russia
 -Russia hates plan, US/Russia relations key to stopping war

Waive sanctions for U.S. companies that want to invest in the Caspian
 counter-
 Plan

Opposition movements counterplan

Shunning

MTSU

WAKE

MTSU/McNeese

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 7

Team: MTSU/McNeese BH

vs.: Michigan State BC

Aff case (country): Iran

Judge: Mahoney

INC Off-Case Arguments

Russia

CP per Ben Meir

IMF bad

T-CE

Khatami

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Block went for T, Russia, CP, case turns

2nr went for Russia, rapid prolif, case turns

MTSU

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1

Team: MTSU GW

vs.: Michigan MS

Aff case (country): cuba

Judge: Christi Siver

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

CP -

US will lift the extraterritorial application of the US embargo, ease NGO restrictions, license telecommunication, pledge non-aggression, do CBM's with the Cuban military, lift remittances ban, do public diplomacy and offer a grand bargain as per Gonzalez.

I. ME - can't lift all sanctions and leave some on

II. Solves Case better than they can - Gonzalez, Cuba's Course Heading, 1996

Inflation -

A. market does not want another fed hike - Boston Globe 11/17/99

B. lifting exports --> inflation - Toronto Star 11/8/99

C. any jump will slow down the US economy - Financial Times 11/17/99

D. Mead 92

Drug War

A. increasing relations --> drug war cooperation - Washington Post, May 25, 1999

B. Drug war --> HR violations and decreases security - Zirnuk, Current History, April 1998

AT: WTO ADV.

1. no threshold

2. evidence from 1998 - not-unique

3. empirically denied

4. impact evidence does not assume Cuba

5. T/ WTO decreases environmental protection and increases MNC's

6. WTO not key for trade

AT: Civil War

1. embargo helps softliners --> smooth transition - Lopez, 1999

2. Decreased Economy leads to peaceful transition - Lopez, 1999

3. Increase business --> collapse of Castro

4. Lifting embargo destroys civil society and softliners, maintaining embargo key to transition

AT: Solvency

1. lifting embargo decreases HR
2. Lifting Embargo decreases conditions for softliners, killing political transition
3. Cuba will not negotiate with the US, Castro will have to be gone
4. Castro tries and fails to use scapegoat rhetoric
5. Market and economic reforms key to transition
6. Castro will divert all aid
7. US investment --> neoliberalism, decreases jobs and health care
8. Castro will get IMF loans
9. Lifting embargo threatens Latin American democracy
10. Lifting embargo threatens democracy in Latin America
11. Lifting embargo allows aid diversion, repression
12. Castro will not allow trade, decreases HR
13. Engagement won't solve, increases terrorism, blocks reform

Lopez, "The US Economic embargo and transition in Cuba," Cuban Studies 28 (1998) copyright 1999

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3

Team: MTSU GW

vs.: Wayne St BW

Aff case (country): Syria

Judge: Mahoney

1NC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Cp text

Positive sanctions

Per Lawson in '96

Counterplan is mutually exclusive
no perms

Solvency

Positive sanctions solve X Lawson '96

Gore DA

Many issues stop peace XMeir '96

Gore as president will likely pass Kyoto X

They didn't read an impact to Kyoto in the 1NC and kicked it in the block

Econ DA

Don't want another increase X

Increase exports = inflation X

Any sign inflation = global slowdown X Abrams

= nuke war x Mead

Neoliberalism

No economic reform now X Robinson

No econ pressure to reform syria X Robinson '98

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

They don't read an impact to Gore in the 1NC and Neoliberalism sounds like it doesn't have an impact in the 1NC.

Block went for the cplan, big case debate with mostly solvency takeouts on the peace process, and Neoliberalism.

2nr went for the case and neoliberalism

MTSU/McNeese

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 2

Team: MTSU/McNeese BH

vs.: Navy BJ

Aff case (country): Cuba

Judge: Kelly Young

1NC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Topicality - Constructive Engagement is a continuation of political and economic ties

IMF - The Globalization of Poverty, 1998

WTO - Sierra Club '98, Solis, Loyola Comparative Law Journal, April, 1997

Neoliberalism

Security Discourse Kritik - Dillon (Politics of Security '90)
Critical Security Studies, 1997

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Security Discourse

Neo Liberalism

Case cards

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3

Team: McNeese/MTSU

vs.: Harvard CW

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: Jenkins

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Clinton WTO (focus links)

Condition AID CP

Deontology bad

Russian elections (nationalism)

WMD turns

Kurds

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Clinton, CP, Kurds

MTSU

School: MTSU

Team(s): BH, GW

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

Economy-interest rates

Clinton-Don't know the impact yet--has been WTO and UN Dues.

Abortion Rider.

CUBA:

INC Strategy

transition turns

Drug Wars

Juragua

IMF

Neo-liberalism

counterplans vary.

IRAQ:

INC Strategy

Counterplan per Gause in 1999.

Net benefits - airstrikes/US invasion, Kurds, and WMDs.

IRAN:

INC Strategy

WMDs

Khatami

SYRIA:

INC Strategy

Peace process turns
solvency defense.

NORTH KOREA:
INC Strategy

NGOs
Shunning
absorption turns
WMDs

Navy

WAKE

Navy

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3

Team: Navy BJ

vs.: SMS WH

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: Bauschard

1NC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Counterplan: UN lift sanctions

US Confidence - plan makes us more confident - heg bad

Clinton - Clinton focused on Kashmir now. Plan shifts focus

Russia/China - They don't like U.S. actions - will join together and cause nuclear war

Topicality - policy is a specific course of action - plan should be specific

Vietnam Rice

KEDO Focus Disad - North Korea will nuke us to get our attention

Navy

School: Navy

Team(s): BJ

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of 1NC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

Clinton/WTO

Rice (Iran, Iraq, Cuba)

Hegemony Bad - aid is bad, enforces US hegemony

Clinton w/ foreign policy focus links

China, Russia, India alliance bad DA

Japan consultation CP

UN CP

KINGS

U.S. Naval Academy RS

Against Columbia HH:

T - V: CE

Disads: Clinton, Hegemony

U.S. Naval Academy RS

Against Liberty CE:

T - Viol: none

Disads: MAI, China WTO membership

CP: none

U.S. Naval Academy FM

Against Army HM:

T Violations: only repeal one act - <<nearly all>>, not fulfill immediate telecom costs

Disads: China's involvement in the WTO and Clinton's loss of political capital for Cuba
Russia's jockeying position with US trading partner status with Cuba

Other Good Arguments: DA are not supposed to be topical or else on Aff ground

U.S. Naval Academy HM
Against Cornell KN:
T Viol: not const. Eng.

Disads: China in WTO , multilateral agreement in investment

CP: Baseball diplomacy for 1 year , then lift sanctions

U.S. Naval Academy SS
Against Duquesne BS:

T Viol: C.E. : plan only removes sanctions, doesn't do CE = business and cultural contacts

Other good Arg's: Case Turns: 1. Refugees overflow, revolts 2. Increased drug trafficking 3. Human rights violations

U.S. Naval Academy BG
Against Allegheny CR:

Disads: Clinton/China WTO impact, appeasement bad

Cites: Myers 7.21.99 Houston Chronicle, Kissinger 9.7.99 Wash Post, BBC Sun World Broadcast 8.5.99, Gill 99 Foreign Affairs J/A 99, Agence France Press 7/27/99

Northern Illinois

WILLIAM JEWELL

NORTHERN ILLINOIS DP

Against Cornell MM (Iraq):

-Golan Heights DA

-Proliferation DA

-Hegemony DA

-Case: Oil for food solves better, Saddam bad, Statistics overstated.

Northern Iowa

WILLIAM JEWELL

UNIVERSITY OF NORTHERN IOWA BR

Against Emory HH (Cuba):
-Kritik of Globalization; Kwa, Foreign Policy in Focus, November 1998;
Greenfield, www.labournet.org; www.IFG.org, April 1999.
-EcoTourism and IMF Turns on Case.

WAKE

Northern Iowa

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 6
Team: UNI BR
vs.: Michigan State LM
Aff case (country): Iraq
Judge: Eric Morris
INC Off-Case Arguments
topicality - constructive engagement - can't just remove sanctions, must model CE after
original policy with South Africa
plan vagueness - need to specify sanctions

Israel - Israel like US sanctions on Iraq in the status quo
Decreased US-Israeli ties risk Egyptian-Syrian-Israeli regional war
Inbar, Midstream, Nov/Dec. 1998, pg. 2
Israeli nuclear escalation inevitably results
Beres, UCLA Journal of International Law and Foreign Affairs, Spring,
1996, Lexis

Saudi Arabia stability
a. unique link - removing Iraqi sanctions undermines constructive US-Saudi
relationship - Clawson, Middle East Policy Council Policy forum,
<http://www.mepc.org/forums/chcs/17.html>, 1999

b. internal link - strong US-Saudi ties are key to the stability of Saudi Arabia
Pollack, Policywatch, February 13, <http://www.washingtoninstitute.org/watch/Policywatch/policywatch1997/236.htm>, 1997

c. 1. Saudi instability threatens economic security of industrial countries -
Mordechair, Jerusalem Letters, <http://www.jcpa.org/hit03.html>, 1997

2. Saudi insecurity risks proliferation
Middle East Intelligence Bulletin, August 1999, www.freelebanon.org/intelligence/meib_9908

Case arguments:

SQ programs solve food shortage
Lifting sanctions worse Cordesman '99
Hunger not result of sanctions
Plan can't solve/ overcome Saddam's regime
Consequentialist notions are true
Absolutism is authoritarian, kills autonomy

Solvency:
Constructive engagement not solve- no fly zone
No solvency - Saddam won't comply
Turn/ sanctions key to change Saddam's regime
Saddam uses aid to facilitate WMD

Journalists caught up in Iraqi spin
Sanctions against Saddam key to his removal/ ending genocide
Any risk of nuclear war means must act ' Schell '92

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
2NC goes for Topicality but not the vagueness portion of the argument, Israel
1NR goes for case arguments

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1
Team: Northern Iowa BR
vs.: Northwestern PS
Aff case Northwestern:
Judge: Stevens, Monte-Kansas State
1NC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts):
Topicality-policy must be broad base
Topicality-CE-conditions are the only topical option
No CP/No DA
Reunification disad read on-case
Hegemony turns

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
2NC-topicality and solvency turns which included reunification
1NR-went for hege turns
2NR-hege turns and reunification

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3
Team: Northern Iowa BR
vs.: Georgetown GW
Aff case (country): North Korea
Judge: Leeper
1NC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)
Topicality-Immediate
Topicality-Consultation extra-topical
Topicality-Adopt (vagueness)

On the case:
--slow better: Sq solves the case while consulting South Korea and Japan (Washington Post, 9/25/99, "comprehensive and came"; BBC, 9/25/99, "coordinator party"; USA Today, 9/20/99, "decision to remove"; AP, 9/21/99, "were eased on")
--"good faith" turn (FNS, 9/14/99, "the Perry visit has presented";
--agreed framework turn (plan kills) (FNS, 9/10/99, "North Korean performance"
--no lashout (Eland, 99, "Tilting at Windmills," www.cato.org
--japan econ ans

Northern Iowa

School: UNI
Team(s): all

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):
Outline of 1NC Strategy (include counterplan texts)
executive order counterplan with a separation of powers and mead net benefit.

israeli insecurity

a)israeli security high now -low risk of conflict - inbar, Midstream,
nov/dec 1998, pg2

b)plan is perceived as pro-arab, scaring israel - elizur, US-Israeli
relations at the cross roads, 1997, pg 219

c)decreased us-israeli ties = syrian/egyption/israeli war - inbar, cited
above

d)israel will use nukes, beres, UCLA journal of int'l and foreign affairs,

spring 1996

Saudi stability d/a

a)removing iraqi sanctions undermines constructive saudi-us relations -
clawson, www.mepc.org, 1999

b)strong us/saudi ties key to stability of saudi arabia - pollack,
www.washingtoninstitute.org, 1997

c)saudi instability = prolifer - middle east intelligence bulletin, august
1999

arab coalition

a)lifting iraqi sanctions scares a syria/iran alliance - hussein, syria and
iran: rivalry and cooperation, 1995, pg 98

b)risks war and prolifer - romero, jane's intelligence review, march 1999

democracy promotion bad

a)engagement through trade = democracy promotion - ikenberry, wilson quarterly,
spring 1999

b)democracy transition / experimentation = war - mansfield and snyder,
international security, summer 1995

North Texas

WILLIAM JEWELL

UNIVERSITY OF NORTH TEXAS FG

Against Michigan CO (North Korea):

- TCOG
- Japan
- Clinton
- CP: Plan Minus South Korean Negotiations

UNIVERSITY OF NORTH TEXAS HM

Against Michigan BS (North Korea):

- Disciplinary Power
- Topicality: "Immediate" not in plan
- Clinton: China WTO
- Japan: Japan wants go-slow on normalization of relations; plan too fast; causes break-down of TCOG
- CP: Fund KEDO and consult.

NORTH TEXAS FG

Against Chico CR (Cuba):

- NTR
- Russia
- Sustainable Agriculture
- Democracy
- CP: Gradual Lift
- Advocate: Gonzalez

WAKE

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 4

Team: North Texas HS

vs.: Vermont MS

Aff case (country): Cuba

Judge: Krueger - MTSU

INC Off-Case Arguments

Clinton - Chinese WTO

Tourism

CP - The USFG will maintain economic sanctions on Cuba and allow for gradual lifting as per the recommendations of Edward Gonzalez

- Gonzalez, Storm Warnings for Cuba, 1994

Disciplinary Power

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Disciplinary Power

North Texas

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 8

Team: North Texas GG

vs.: Kentucky HK

Aff case: Syria

Judge: Smith, Nate-Northwestern

INC Off-Case Arguments

Terrorism

Asad Legitimacy

Clinton

EU Counterplan-LaGeorge 99

Txt: The EU will provide economic incentives to Syria as per the aff plan.

North Texas

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1

Team: UNT HS

vs.: MTSU/McNeese BH

Aff case (country): Cuba

Judge: Berube

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

T- Constructive Engagement - must include promotion of democracy

Statism - link: how political question is framed/ impact is solvency takeout

Clinton - WTO

U- Financial Times 11/16/99 "all-out effort...deal pushed through"

L - South China MP 11/16/99 "battle just starting"

Kaplowitz, Anatomy of a Failed Embargo, '98

Impact - Straits Times 9/16/99 "potential conflicts...opportunities for Conflicts"

Salameh '97 (Star 6/5/97)

Counterplan - Maintain CDA except medical and health supplies and exchange of information materials (fax, computer hardware and software)

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Clinton

CP

Biotech turns on the case

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 2

Team: North Texas FH

vs.: Samford RR

Aff case (country): Cuba

Judge: Barrois

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Topicality - Constructive Engagement - must be democracy promotion

Topicality - Constructive Engagement - only lift sanctions - can't go beyond

Gendered States

Orientalism with Said evidence

Clinton - China WTO

Counterplan: Eliminate Marti (radio and tv) and do a gradual lifting of the embargo - Gonzales

Case: solvency takeouts, Biotech turns, Tourism turns, Juragua turn

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

2NC - Kicks the counterplan, goes for independent voter on Precision

Standard - "The Affirmative must define every word", Orientalism

1NR - solvency turns, Gendered states

2NR - Precision Standard, Gendered States, Orientalism

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3

Team: North Texas FH

vs.: Georgia RS

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: Wiese

1NC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

CP - restructure oil for food and relieve debt

WTO

passing now, you cost capital, WTO key to relations

Israel

Watching US, shift = Israeli freak out = war?

Oil

T CE = policy of democratic promotion

Iraqi lashout

Kurds case turns

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Kick WTO and Oil and CP

Go for Israel and SDM lashout = Kurdish genocide case turn

School: North Texas

Team: SH

Outline of 1NC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

UNT SH (against SYRIA)

OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:

- T-Gov to Gov
- T-Constructively engage only lift sanctions
- T-Immediate
- C/P just do engagement
- Debt Relief
- Israel D.A. - Steinsberg '98, Sher '95, Steinsberg '98
- Mediteranianism D/A - Lesch '99, Moody '97, Rissler & Mellon '96
- Dynamic Compassion - Altman '88

Arguments Extended in the Negative Block (New Link Stories, Cites, Time Allocation, etc)

BREAKDOWN OF THE BLOCK:

2NC (against Syria)

- Case
- Israel
- Mediteranianism
- 1NR
- CP
- Clinton

Neg Strategy in Rebuttals (key arguments, tricks, things they kick out of)

2NR POSITIONS (against Syria)

- CP
- Case Turns
- CP solvency
- Clinton
- Mediteranianism

School: North Texas

Team: FH

Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

UNT FH (against IRAQ)

OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:

T-Just remove sanctions

- Orientalism

- Israel

- Debt Relief

- Gendered States

>Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

topicality, clinton WTO, isreal, oil, orientalism, gendered states,

counterplans change a lot. this is jsut general things we run agreat deal.

Arguments Extended in the Negative Block (New Link Stories, Cites, Time Allocation, etc)

2NC (against Iraq)

- T

- Orientalism

- Debt Relief

- Israel

1NR

- Case

- Gendered States

>Arguments Extended in the Negative Block (New Link Stories, Cites, Time

2NC- clinton, counter plan, orientalism, isreal, sometimes t.

1NR- solvency, advantages, gendered states, oil, sometimes t.

Neg Strategy in Rebuttals (key arguments, tricks, things they kick out of)

NEGATIVE TRICK

- Precision Standard - must define all words!

2NR POSITIONS

- T

- Orientalism

UCO

UNT FH (IRAQ)

OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:

- T-Just remove sanctions

- Orientalism

- Israel

- Debt Relief

- Gendered States

BREAKDOWN OF THE BLOCK:

2NC

- T

- Orientalism

- Debt Relief

- Israel

1NR

- Case

- Gendered States

NEGATIVE TRICKS

- Precision Standard - must define all words!

2NR POSITIONS

- T

- Orientalism

UNT SC

OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:

- T-can only lift sanctions
- Israel - threat perception
- Genocide Trivialization
- Solvency - check & Retreat, oil for food

BREAKDOWN OF THE BLOCK:

2NC

- T
- Genocide

1NR

- Case

NEGATIVE TRICKS

- We're Trickless

2NR POSITIONS

- T

UNT SH (SYRIA)

OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:

- T-Gov to Gov
- T-Constructively engage only lift sanctions
- T-Immediate
- C/P just do engagement
- Debt Relief
- Israel D.A. - Steinsberg '98, Sher '95, Steinsberg '98
- Mediteranianism D/A - Lesch '99, Moody '97, Rissler & Mellon '96
- Dynamic Compassion - Altman '88

BREAKDOWN OF THE BLOCK:

2NC

- Case
- Israel
- Mediteranianism

1NR

- CP

- Clinton

NEGATIVE TRICKS

2NR POSITIONS

- CP
- Case Turns
- CP solvency
- Clinton
- Mediteranianism

Northwestern

USC

Negative Positions:

Topicality- CE requires Iraqi participation, bombing not topical
Agent Specification
Clinton - NTR
Case Turns
CP: Give Syria aid and lift sanctions after a peace deal
Israel DA
Terrorism Credibility DA

WAKE

Northwestern

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 6

Team: Northwestern PS

vs.: Texas DN

Aff case (country):

Judge: Dan Fitzmier - Emory

INC Off-Case Arguments

Clinton

A. Congress will approve permanent Chinese NTR, which is necessary to solve Chinese aggression and prop up US hegemony, WP 11-17-99

B. More concessions hurt Clinton, LA Times, 10-20-99

C. New partisan fights derail NTR, Journal of Commerce, 11-16-99

D. Khalilzad 1995

CP

Text: Quiet diplomacy to do the entire plan. Lift sanctions as per the 1AC, do CE as per the 1AC. Do China's proposal.

NB:

A. US China Relations will collapse absent actions to revive them, Financial Times, 10-1-99

B. NK is key to China, Chang 1999

C. CP solves by boosting US-Sino ties, Roy 1996

D. US-Sino collapse --> Massive nuclear war, Hadar 1996

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 8

Team: Northwestern PS

vs.: West Ga HS

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: Lundy

INC Off-Case Arguments

T - Constructive Engagement is what we did in South Africa

Agent Specification

Shun Saddam because he promotes the rape of women

Counterplan - do plan but not the constructive engagement

Sparkos - Constructive engagement includes technostrategic discourse and deterrence mindset. Even if the plan doesn't mandate this, the engagement will inevitably be coopted follow the traditional ideals of constructive engagement. The impact is that deterrence is the legitimization of violence and death and must always be rejected. Big overview in the 2NC that includes impact extensions, elaboration on the links, including a blowup of the cooption argument.

No case arguments

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Agent Specification and T with a jurisdiction impact

Northwestern

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1

Team: Northwestern FK

vs.: Pepperdine MZ

Aff case (Iraq):

Judge: Zompetti, Joe-Mercer

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts):

Plan text plus condition on weapons inspections-LATimes 3-25-99

Clinton

Uniqueness and Impact: Congress will approve permanent NTR for China which is key to prevent WW3-washington post 11-17-99

"But if you believe...

Link: plan crushes cooperation

1. Congress opposes engagement with Iraq

2. New foreign policy fights with Congress will derail NTR deal-Clinton must cater to GOP to ensure passage-Journal of Commerce 11-16-99

Israel

Uniqueness: Relations strong--AFP 10-26-99

Peace moving forward--Baltimore Sun 11-11-99

Plan kills it-Independent 9-5-96

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Clinton

CP

Case

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 2

Team: Northwestern GS

vs.: Samford BJ

Aff case: Cuba

Judge: Glaser, Sarah-Kansas State

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts):

Clinton

A. SQ = Approval of NTR Wpost 11-17-99

B. Plan crushes cooperation with Congress

C. New foreign policy fight kills NTR-Clinton must secure Congress-Jrnl of Commerce 11-16-99

Iran

A. US persuading EU to sanction Iran-BBC 1-22-98

B. Without EU support, sanctions fail-Dhoge Fall 1998 Denver Jrnl. International Law and Policy

C. No Cuban embargo = EU coop-McCordy American University Intl LR 1997

D. Sanctions on Iran Kill Khatami and Causes Aggression in the ME-Moravehili News and Record 8-12-96

Some case

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Kicked Iran

Went for Clinton

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 2

Team: Northwestern PS

vs.: South Carolina BM

Aff case: Iraq

Judge: Greene, Rebecca-Mary Washington

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts):

Clinton Good-China WTO

US/Israel

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Clinton Good

Case Arguments

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3

Team: Northwestern FG
vs.: Catholic LP
Aff case (country): Syria
Judge: Stables - Georgia
INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Clinton - Chinese NTR status
Collective Security
A) Iran working to develop it now (4/6/1999)
B) US security policy hurts solidarity
C) Collapse of collective security causes war

Binding Consultation with Egypt CP
- formal dialogue necessary - Satlott, 1997

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3
Team: Northwestern GS
vs.: South Carolina BM
Case: Iraq
Judge: Fritch, John-SMS
INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)
Clinton
A. Uniqueness and Impact: Congress will approve permanent NTR for China-key to preventing WW 3 Wpost 11-17-99
B. Links
1. Convincing Congress to lift sancitons will take lots of political capital-Petroleum Economist 7-28-98
2. Impacts-New foreign policy fights with Congress derail NTR deal-Clinton must cater to
GOP to ensure passage-Journal of Commerce 11-16-99

Israel

Counterplan
Text: The US will condition removal of economic sanctions on intrusive on-the-ground inspections. Any and all products excluded from the plan will grow from direct negotiations w/the government of Iraq and restricted, when necessary, through import and export restrictions against the US firm under the Ex-Im Act. Congress will adopt a policy of CE by setting aside Eisenhower Fellowship Exp Program and other like programs. The selection procedure will be negotiated. We get intent.

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
Kicked Israel

Went for Clinton and the Couterplan

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 4
Team: Northwestern PS
vs.: MTSU GW
Aff case (country): Cuba
Judge: Sean Harris - UMKC
INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)
- Agent Specificity, the usual argument with a hidden T violation - Policy is a 'definite course of action', which they will say means that because different branches would implement the plan in different ways, the plan is not definite. There is also a presumption standard - They will argue that there is no such thing as the "US Government", and that you vote negative on presumption.

- Clinton - WTO
A. Congress will approve permanent NTR for China - solves WW3, Washington Post, 11-17-99 "win the political argument"
B. Lifting Cuban sanctions devastates political capital, destroys any agenda influence, Seattle Times, 10-15-98 "adamantly opposed to even a slight weakening"
C. New foreign policy fights with Congress derail the NTR deal - Clinton must cater to the GOP to ensure passage, Journal of Commerce, 11-16-99 "rough ride in the US Congress"
- Clinton is impacted in the 2NC in a few ways . . . 1. It collapses the WTO and turns the case, 2. It collapses US-Sino relations and causes nulcear war (Clutterbuck evidence), 3. It collapses global trade, turns the case, and 4. It destabilizes the Taiwan-China situation and causes another nuclear war.

- Iranian Sanctions Bad

- A. The US is trying to convince Europe to accept sanctions against Iran, BBC, 1-22-98 "called on European partners"
- B. Without European support, sanctions against Iran will have little impact, McCurdy, American U Int'l Law Journal, 1997 "garner the cooperation"
- C. Ending sanctions on Cuba make it easier to convince Europe to sanction Iran, Muravchik, News & Record, 8-12-96 "secondary boycotts to Cuba"
- D. Tougher sanctions radicalize Iran, Dhooge, Denver Journal of Int'l Law and Policy, Fall 1998 "following the Islamic revolution"

- CP: Supreme Court (Both Disad's are NB's)

Text:

Solvency: Complex lawmaking from the Court is common, they can order detailed legislative plans, Wolfe, 1997 Judicial Activism

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

They go for Clinton and the Court CP.

Pace

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1

Team: Pace KP

vs.: Northwestern FG

Aff case (country): North Korea

Judge: Bill Newman

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Counterplan Text:

The US in full cooperation with South Korea, Japan and China will implement a step-by-step engagement policy based on reciprocity. The Benefits will be granted to North Korea when it will make parallel concessions. The US and above mentioned allies will retaliate against any North Korean provocations or backsliding.

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Went for Counterplan,

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Northwestern

School: Northwestern

Team(s): Sparacino & Paul / Gordon & Swiatek / Flaig & Garen / Foster & Kay-Oliphant

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

Clinton Good- UN Dues

Clinton Bad- China WTO

Israel / U.S. Relations DA

-relations good now

-plan destroys relations = Arab/Israel war

Bipartisan Commission Counterplan

-Boston Herald, 1-6-99

-International Herald tribune, 1-7-99

-Clinton appoints a bipartisan commission to make new policy, policy will be implemented

China DA

Russian Nationalism DA

Turkey DA

Supreme Court CP

Agent Specificity

Condition CP

Shunning

-Gordon and Gordon

-ties with evil destroys human existence, define ourselves as the "other"

United Nations DA

CUBA:

INC Strategy

Clinton Good
 Courts CP- Helms/Burton specific
 Consult a Bipartisan Commission on Cuba policy
 NB: Clinton Good
 Conditions CP
 NB: Clinton Good, Reforms turns
 Case Turns: Plan Stops Reforms

IRAQ:
 INC Strategy

Clinton Good
 US/Israel
 Iraqi Aggression (re-arm/diversion, etc)
 UN Credibility - Peacekeeping generic impact.
 CP: Lift Sanctions without Constructive Engagement
 NB - Shunning/ Clinton
 CP: Provide direct NGO assistance to people of IRAQ:
 NB - Shunning/ Clinton
 Escrow CP: lift sanctions if profits go to a UN escrow account.
 NB - Diversion/ Kurds/Re-arm/Prolif. Turns
 Consult Russia CP - NB: Russian Prestige Good
 -give Russia a veto
 -cooperation key to relations, Israelyan, 1998, washington quarterly, winter
 -will say yes, Hollis, 1993
 Oil shocks
 -Saudi's holding down prices now...plan = oil glut = economic decline and war
 Condition sanction relief to Iraq upon return of arms inspectors CP
 Succession Turns
 Stravation Take-Outs

IRAN:
 INC Strategy

Courts CP- ILSA specific
 Clinton Good
 U.S./Israel
 Khatami Credibility
 Evil Iran
 Incrementalism CP
 - Khatami Cred.
 - Clinton good
 - U.S. /Israel
 Counterplan to eliminate _ of ILSA and condition the rest
 -tests Iran's resolve
 -avoids hardliners
 -small and slow solves best

SYRIA:
 INC Strategy

Feminism kritik
 -Syria violates the rights of women (Gordon and Gordon)
 Consult Russia CP - NB: Russian Prestige Good
 -give Russia a veto
 -cooperation key to relations, Israelyan, 1998, washington quarterly, winter
 -will say yes, Hollis, 1993

NORTH KOREA:
 INC Strategy

South Korea Alliance
 -United States engagement with North Korea alienates the South guts the military alliance.
 -now is key time.
 Consultation with South Korea Counter-plan
 -East Asian Review, 1999
 -Korea focus, 1999
 -Korea and World Affairs, spring 1999
 Clinton
 Consult China

Appeasement Bad
Kim Jong Il DA
US/Sino relations good/ Sphere of influence DA
Consult Russia CP - NB: Russian Prestige Good
-give Russia a veto
-cooperation key to relations, Israelyan, 1998, washington quarterly, winter
-will say yes, Hollis, 1993

UNI:

Clinton

- a North Korea impact story (famine)
- Clinton will win passage of CTBT now^Å removal of sanctions on North Korea drains his political capital - all foreign policy requires expenditure of political capital and CTBT good ? prolif/war mpx
- China/WTO impacts

Israel / U.S. relations d/a

- relations good now
- plan destroys relations = Arab/Israel war

Bipartisan commission counterplan

- Boston Herald, 1-6-99
- International Herald tribune, 1-7-99
- Clinton appoints a bipartisan commission to make new policy, policy will be implemented

China

Russian Nationalism d/a

Turkey d/a

Counterplan to eliminate _ of ILSA and condition the rest

- tests Iran^Ös resolve
- avoids hardliners
- small and slow solves best

Supreme Court Counter plan

South Korea Alliance

- United States engagement with North Korea alienates the South ? guts the military alliance. Ruining U.S. hegemony in Asia and flips the case ? South Korea will sabotage the affirmative plan.
- now is key time

Consultation with South Korea Counter-plan

- East Asian Review, 1999
- Korea focus, 1999
- Korea and World Affairs, spring 1999

Must specify agent

United Nations d/a

Conditional removal of sanctions counter-plan

Shunning

- Gordon and Gordon
- ties with evil destroys human existence, define ourselves as the "other," s
- a passive human receptacle, a serial existence.

Oil shocks

- Saudi^Ös holding down prices now^Åplan = oil glut = economic decline and war

Condition sanction relief to Iraq upon return of arms inspectors

Proliferation Turns

Feminism kritik

-Syria violates the rights of women (Gordon and Gordon)

Consult Russia counter plan

-giving Russia a veto power

-cooperation key to relations

Israelyan, 1998 washington quarterly, winter

-will say yes

Hollis, 1993

Succession turns (against Iraq)

Starvation take-outs (against Iraq)

NYU

UCO

NYU GG (UNKNOWN)

OFF (ON) CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:

- Development - Trainer
- Statism - Carter
- T-Vagueness
- T-Constructive Engagement
- Counterplan

BREAKDOWN OF THE BLOCK:

2NC

- Development
- Statism
- Vagueness

1NR

- CP
- T-Constructive Engagement
- Solvency

NEGATIVE TRICKS

- Be right and pick the good answers

2NR POSITIONS

- Development
- Vagueness
- Prolif
- T-Constructive engagement
- CP
- Statism

Oregon

OREGON

University of Oregon Rd. 3
Whitman BS (Aff) vs. U of O TK
Topicality-government
Topicality-Constructive engagement
MAI
US-Russian relations
Transition DA (Schulz cards)

Iraq Aff vs. UO FH

Off-cases

T – CE means cooperation for shared security interests
CP – the US will adopt a policy of non-interference in Iraq (claim a double-bind with T)

On-case

Russia Turn – increased US involvement in Iraq (see T) tubes US/Russian relations, causing
accidental nuke launch come Y2K.
Prolif Turns
Heg stuff – US leadership not wanted
Can't solve humanitarian disaster through Heg
US leadership leads to terrorist attacks
Moral imperative to not intervene

2NR

CP
Russia Turn
Moral imperative to not intervene

Pace

WAKE

Pace

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3

Team: Pace KP

vs.: MSU BC

Aff case (country): Iran

Judge: Morris

INC Off-Case Arguments

Synoptic Delsion

Milovanic and Schehr, Social Justice, v26 n1 p208-212

Track 2 Diplomacy

The US gov't shall end its policy of economic containment towards Iran, including exempting Iran from ILSA and removing nearly all economic sanctions as per the affirmative. The US should not initially adopt a policy of "constructive engagement" as defined by our T violation, instead the US should establish Track II diplomacy with Iran

Kemp 99 Transatlantic Tensions (ed Haass) p59-60

Hamilton 98 http://www.foreignrelations.org/public/pubs/hamilton_54.html

Jones 98 www.cc.columbia.edu/sec/dlc/ciao/srchfrm.htm

Khatami

Befriend = more harm than good

AFP 11/14/99 "right for western interests"

Rein w/US kills Khatami credibility

Japan Times 11/4/99 "bright red line"

Uniq

BBC 11/10/99 "pivotal axes"

2NC killer evidence

Scripps Howard 11/7/99 "Khatmi to make a misstep"

Power Diplomacy (Negotiator)

Constructive Engagement T

INC - More than lift

www.m-w.com

Carrot and Sticks

Cordesman 97 Iran: Dilemmas of DC p321

CE = 3 comp's

1. increase trade - investment

2. Int'l orgs

3. Inst link - Neighboring c's

Ikenberry 7/15/98 Gazette "sophisticated reading of history"

CE doesn't solve

Bray 96 World Today aug/sept p208

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

T if you have nasty perms or dispute the plan's use of Track I diplomacy, those are the abuse claims. If you meet, they compete.

Track I diplomacy --> Khatami

Track II and End Sanctions = solves case

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 7

Team: Pace KP

vs.: Northwestern GP

Aff case (country): North Korea

Judge: MacIntosh

INC Off-Case Arguments

consult japan and south korea counterplan- full coordination between south korea japan and north korea will do a step by step

engagement policy process based on recipient

the benefits will be granted to North Korea when it will more parallel concessions

The us and allies will retaliate against north korea provocation of backslide

John bolton " US must stand up to north korea" LA times 9/22/99

Brookes CSIS PacNet Newsletter "high time to reevaluate NK policy" #38 10/2/98

Optic delusion

Cites- other cites

Asia week 10/1/99 "lowering tempature" p. 32

Food aid now- ap online 10/27/99

Kim will feed the koreans Paik 9/28/99 www.nautilus.org/fora/security/9907e_Eberstadt_Discussion.html

Food aid solves- business times 9/9/99 "international food aid alleviate hunger"

Food aid diverted- NYT 10/12/99 "UN world food program is not able to monitor food aid"

Asia week 10/8/99 "dealing with pyonayang"

Round: 3

Team: Pace KP

vs.: Michigan State BC

Aff case (country): Iran

Judge:

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Topicality - including means part of a larger whole - 3 parts

- constructive engagement must include carrots and sticks - Cordesman

also say that the aff must specify what constructive engagement in the plan text

CP - exempt from ILSA , lift all sanctions plan does but do not do any Constructive Engagement , instead do track 2 dialogue with Iran (no government to government diplomacy)

Khatami - Howard 11/7/99, AFE 11/14/99

Power Diplomacy - sanctioning Iran sends a dangerous signal to the rest of the world
failure to take strong action against rogues risks weapons of mass destruction

Synoptic Delusion - cites in the pre-tournament caselist book

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

2NC goes for Khatami and the Counterplan

1NR goes for Topicality, especially the specificity standard

2NR goes for topicality

Pace

School: Pace

Team(s): KP, BL

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

"Geopower": a hodgepodge of spanos, dillon, and said cards they argue objectivity ignores those marginalized, assumptions determine outcomes, identification and naming misleads (homogenizes the distinct and fluctuating), which they have an alternative based on a card from walker quoting one person's naming the same place differently depending on the political climate, a lot of this debate was determined by their rorty answers (cornell in 93, transformations p 177), good cards saying rorty is ethnocentric, exclusionary and never questions [this argument is all over the place, even reading heidegger "truth enframes humans"] they went for geopwr in all of the block with new alternatives, link questions and a claim to win on presumption

Synoptic Delusion

A. Synoptic Delusion

Knowledge is fragmented - we are necessarily and irremediable ignorant about
the particular facts that determine the course and structure of society

Hayek '58 (Noble prize for Economics in 1974)

We try to solve the "problem" of our ignorance by appointing "experts" to gather all relevant knowledge - we become consumers of institutionally certified representations of danger
[Shapiro '89]

Reliance on experts is bad in itself because it excludes the voices of people with lived experiences thereby missing the root cause of conflict
[Milovanovic & Schehr '99]

Furthermore, experts, can't solve the fundamental problem, the fragmentation of knowledge - their efforts only result in a synoptic delusion. The beauty and simplicity of their plans is owed only to their disregard of all the facts they don't know
[Hayek '73]

the affirmative relies on many problematic synoptic tools:

most fundamental is their Scenario Writing: the assumption that most factors are knowable and hence predictable establishes the legitimacy of using political and military intervention to manage international politics
[Dalby '97]

Geography is another example - our maps are presented as accurate representations of the world, they clash with those who live on the margins which creates cultural conflict, war, and ethnic cleansing
[Toal '96]

State Sovereignty is also a synoptic delusion - the assumption of state sovereignty constrains and marginalizes new explorations of identities whether in the name of classes, races, cultures or genders
[Walker]

Additionally, Naming of places is another synoptic device - to use the designated name of a place is to license a forgetting of its history and helps reproduce institutionalized forms of dominance
[Shapiro '89 "The foreign policies"]

B. Our alternative

Recognizing our ignorance allows for thoughtful consideration of alternatives:

For ourselves, we accept that our identity can not be grounded in ontological truth - we can accept the indispensability of identities while refusing to live our own identity as the truth
[Connolly '89]

Because spontaneous order utilizes the knowledge of countless individuals it will always out think even the most qualified experts - peaceful coexistence doesn't depend on or result from monopolizing truth
[Hayek '58]

DA:

Power Diplomacy/Grand Negotiator

Clinton (WTO, Wye Funding)

Allied Coordination (Jpn, S.K.)

Sex Tourism

Latin American Democracy

Tobacco, Pesticides, Infant Formula, Pharmaceuticals exports bad

WMD buildup

Shunning

Khatami Cred

CP:

exclude infant formula

North Korea - step by step - parallel concession

Iraq - condition lifting on inspections and arms embargo

Cuba - exclude lords listening facility

Cuba - lift extraterritorial sanctions
Iran - track 2 dialog

UNI

Solvency Advocacy

Clinton

-WTO, political capital key, lifting sanctions kills capital, china
entry key
to stopping war

Kritik of the fragmentation of knowledge

-Hayek (sp?), 1958 essay on individuality and Law, legislation and
liberty
1973

Cuba counterplan that does the affirmative except for under the
Helm-Burton that
penalizes the funding of the Lourdes Listening Facility

Pittsburgh

Topicality

-constructive engagement = Critical dialogue
-decreasing economic sanctions is not constructive engagement

Ban Constructive engagement, lift sanctions counterplan

-U.S. should adopt a policy of non-interference

Clinton:

CTBT

Only lift sanctions counter plan

Constructive engagement stops social movements from solving

Kritik of Geopolitics

-ignore cultural significance
-all political discourse is geo-political discourse
-rendering solvency indeterminate ? making things worse

McWorld

-sanctions prevent corporate investment which causes corporate
dictatorship that violates human rights

Lots of case stuff vs. Cuba

-Cuba gets plenty of food and medicine now
-T/: constructive engagement makes a violent transition more likely
(due to rising expectations)
-Castro will block any attempt to remove sanctions
-T/: A. Multilateral agreement on investment is stopped by the
present
sanctions

B. Multilateral agreement destroys the environment and = war

-T/: A. Food exports blocked by current sanctions

B. Allowing them kills Cuba's domestic agriculture = starvation

-T/: Sanctions ensure that the nuclear power plant never gets built^Å meltdown and nuclear nightmare

Penn State

KINGS

Penn State University MR

Against WVU NP:

T - V: CE = more than just lifting sanctions

Disads: CE -> Iraqi oil glut à less renewable

Clinton story with political capital, CTBT

CP: Just lift sanctions on Iraq after the special conference on CTBT

Penn State University RM

Against Rochester NW:

CP: Just lift sanctions, don't do constructive engagement

Other good arg's: K - fem INR

Cites: Tickner, Reardon (as per WDI)

Penn State University CL

Against GMU AH:

T Viol: CE = "hands off"

Disads: Clinton/CTBT, Globalization

Pepperdine

USC

Keola Whittaker/Brian Ward

Affirmative Round Report

Aff Case: Iran Neg Team: Pepperdine RK **Tournament USC Round Semis Judge** Harrison, Guevara, Alimahomed

INC Off Case Positions:

Shunning, NPT, Immediate T, Rice

INC Case Arguments:

Caspian turns, prolif turns, khatami turns

2NR:

Shunning

Negative Positions:

T CE = non-interference

SK Relations DA

SK Politics DA

Consult Japan and SK CP

WAKE

Pepperdine

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 2

Team: Pepperdine MZ

vs.: Methodist BG

Aff case: Syria

Judge: Berube, David-South Carolina

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts):

Topicality-Constructive Engagement-brightline=no interference

Shunning as a Disad

--Asad tortures prisoners

link: aid to oppressive regimes tomasevski, development and human rights 1989

--shunning is moral beversluis

--complicity-gordon quicksand 1995 p.4-5

Power Diplomacy

Link: Sanctions are a vital part of US power diplomacy-removal of sanctions will encourage aggressive action by our rivals,

breakdown alliances, and destroy US leadership--Hendriksen using power and diplomacy to deal with rogue states 99

Impact: Now is a key time for US leadership-failure to assume a leadership role risks major conflict--Kupchan World Policy Journal

Fall 99 p.20

Clinton--WTO

Uniqueness: Jrn. Commerce 11/16/99

Link: Congress Critical-Savir The process: 1,100 days that changed the middle east 98

Internal Link: Sino/US relations Platt CSM 11/16/99

Impact: Survival of the planet-Ratcliff Washington Times 7/31/95

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Didn't go for T

Kicked Shunning

2NR went for power diplomacy and Clinton

Pittsburgh

WAKE

Pittsburgh

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 7
Team: Pittsburgh CT
vs.: Kentucky JR
Case: Iran
Judge: Smith, Nate-Northwestern
INC Off-Case Arguments
Peace Process
Clinton
--Financial Times 7-17-99
--Post and Courier 7-23-99
--Reuters 9-16-99
Vagueness
FIAT Bad
MNCs Bad
--Chatterjee Multinational Monitor 9-98
--The Guardian 7-22-99
--Shalom Made in the USA FQPA 93
--Ganesan Dollars and Sense 99
Trangenics
--Yost 99 FDCH Testimony
--USA Today 7-24-99

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

--MNCs Bad
--FIAT Bad
--Peace Process BAd

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 8
Team: Pitt DC
vs.: George Mason Univ IT
Aff case (country): Cuba
Judge: Hernandez
INC Off-Case Arguments
Vagueness - can't say all or nearly all in plan
Killer Weed - trasgenic crop exports bad
McWorld - CE-->HR violations
Econ - plan increases inflation by decreasing unemployment and increases wages
Southern California

Pittsburgh

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3
Team: Pittsburgh CD
vs.: Ft. Hayes HR
Aff case (country): Narrative of a Cuban
Judge: Cornellier
INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)
Action CP: Send case to congress, have judge help
Topicality: Should, Policy, Resolved, Federal Government, Sanctions (remove)

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

On T- aff only promotes one voice....excludes other voices

KINGS

University of Pittsburgh HL
Against Rochester NW:
Disads: already completed

University of Pittsburgh SW
Against Army KS:
T - V: CE = agreement

Disads: Clinton, inflation, social movements, evidence indicts

Other good arg's: Jaragua turn, agriculture, globalization

University of Pittsburgh ??
Against Marist ??

Disads: McWorld - MNC's flood economy when sanctions are lifted and lead to real bad stuff

MAI/Corporate rule - EU will not enter into MAI now b/c of sanctions and MAI is bad

Redlands

USC

Redlands Negative versus Iran

NTR

CE = A Policy, Not Dialogue without pre-defined objectives

ILSA is extratopical

A Critique: something about identity and nation states, the impact is that the aff is a claim without a warrant

Supreme Court CP (Sharney? 89)

Negative Positions:

T CE not = just lifting sanctions and no diplomacy.

NTR DA

CP: Executive increase sanctions and have S.C. strike down and orders the plan be enacted instead.

European Union Security force: sanctions provide EU security, solves war

Richmond

SOUTH CAROLINA

Richmond AM
-Inherency Procedural
-KEDO Donor CP
-Feminism IR
-Case cards

Rochester

KINGS

University of Rochester MT

Against Pitt EK:

T - Viol: CE, immediate

Disads: threat constructions, feminist K

U.S. Military Academy - West Point FS

Against: Pitt GM

Disads: Appeasement DA - Aff appeases Mideast countries and it fails, but it gives rogue dictators free reign and leads to genocide ; Rogue states
Kritik - concept of rogue states is a part of created by Wash - impacts hegemony

CP: Anarchy CP - US fed gov will be abolished ; stops all wars other countries will follow b/c its good idea

Against Liberty CM:

Disads: Clinton, appeasement

Samford

WAKE

Samford

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1

Team: Samford BJ

vs.: Southern Cal HV

Aff case (country): Cuba

Judge: Stroube

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

T - must go beyond lifting sanctions - "including" --> not exclusive

Neo-colonialism - 3 E San Juan cards - one of which calls for ballot as revolutionary force

Gender argument - Weber 96, Tichtner 92

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

E San Juan warrant that inevitability of globalization/neo-colonialism evades responsibility. 2NR kicked out of case and gender argument going for neo-colonialism and takeouts on morality underview.

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1

Team: Samford RR

vs.: Southern Cal HH

Aff case (country): North Korea

Judge: Reid

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Vagueness

Globalism

OPIC CP: do plan but exclude OPIC

TSEA DA

Case args:

Won't reform

Increases aggression

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Vagueness

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3

Team: Samford BJ

vs.: West Georgia HS

Case: Iraq

Judge: Bruschke, Jon-Fullerton

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Topicality-CE

A. Plan can only do CE

B. Violation-Ending military actions isn't CE, CE = political and economic ties

Dictionary of 20th Century American Politics

C. Neg Intent

1. limits

2. guts neg ground

3. predictable

D. Xtra T illegit

CP: all of plan except retains bombings above 36th parallel to protect the Kurds that Saddam threatens-Lt. Commander Knowles and Whitley 93 Genocide in Iraq

Ob. 1 Theoretically OK

a. not topical

b. topical cps ok anyway

Ob. 2 Solvency

- a. we solve case
- b. we prevent genocide of the =Kurds
- c. bombings deter Iraqi attacks on Kurds

Globalism-San Juan Journal 1998

- A. Today's new markets represent new chances for colonialism. Lifting sanctions on Iraq links them to global capitalism
- B. Transnational corporations will take over new markets-Barber 96
- C. Globalization kills the environment, culture, and increases poverty
- D. Use your voice to challenge this!
- E. Saying globalization is inevitable denies responsibility and the ability to formulate new solutions

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Kicked Neo-Colonialism

Went for the Kurds CPlan

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3

Team: Samford RR

vs.: Dartmouth

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: O'Donnell

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Globalism: Barber '96, Escobar, Alvarez - MNCs control trade, they hurt the environment and culture

WTO

- a. WTO going to pass w/ China - San Francisco Chronicle 11/16/99
- b. Iraq spends capital - Kaplowitz '99
- c. No China in WTO causes Taiwan strike - Sacramento Bee 11/16/99

Topicality - immediately

Samford

School: Samford

Team(s): DM

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

CTBT bad, winners win

-CTBT good, plan unpopular

Women and economy kritik

-Plan does not account for the economic position of Women = inevitable

patriarchy and no solvency

-transnational patriarchy

Shunning

Topicality

-constructive engagement

Overheat

Inflation

-decrease sanctions = trade ? perceptually signaling inflationary growth

Shunning

Kritik of International relations

Arguments Extended in the Negative Block (New Link Stories, Cites, Time Allocation, etc)
Kritik of International Relations and Women in the Economy kritik

CUBA:

INC Strategy

Counterplan to bomb the power station in Cuba

-solves better

-hegemony

NORTH KOREA:

INC Strategy

Counterplan to reinstate sanctions on North Korea and suspend
scheduling of
team spirit.

UNI

Clinton

-CTBT bad, winners win

-CTBT good, plan unpopular

Women and economy kritik

-Plan does not account for the economic position of Women = inevitable

patriarchy and no solvency

-transnational patriarchy

Shunning

Topicality

-constructive engagement

Overheat

Inflation

-decrease sanctions = trade ? perceptually signaling inflationary
growth

Shunning

Counterplan to bomb the power station in Cuba

-solves better

-hegemony

Counterplan to reinstate sanctions on North Korea and suspend
scheduling of
team spirit.

San Diego State

USC

Negative Positions:

Socialism Kritik

CP - Constructive engagement and removal of all sanctions BUT on PVC supplies and tobacco with trilateral cooperation

DA's all net benefits to the CP: tobacco, baby formula, PVC supplies

San Francisco State

LONG BEACH

Keola Whittaker/Brian Ward

Affirmative Round Report

Aff Case: Iran Neg Team: SFSU ML Tournament Long Beach Round 5

INC Off Case Positions:

Feminism IR

FP = racism

INC Case Arguments:

2NR:

Feminism

USC

USC jr. division

San Francisco's answers to the Iraq 1AC

Off-case

CP

Waive sanctions, but only for women and minority owned businesses

Net Benefits: Racism and econ w/MEAD impact ("women and minority owned businesses are key to the US economy")

Import Substitution

Sanctions force Iraq to develop its domestic agriculture

Lifting sanctions addicts Iraq to food imports

+ Iraqi farmers want sanctions so bad they will do anything to get them reimposed

Also, lifting sanctions leads to conflict/war (see the on-case arg. I think it's the same story)

On-case

Lifting the sanctions promotes nationalist outrage because we will be painting Iraqis as economic losers

Keola Whittaker/Brian Ward

Affirmative Round Report

Neg Team: SanFranState RK Aff case: Iran Tournament USC Round 2 Judge Jordan Mills

INC Off Case Positions:

Import Substitution

Gender in business kritik

Minority business counterplan

T – Nearly All

2NR:

Everything but T

Negative Positions:

CP: Targeted Sanctions

Hege Good DA

Clinton: Taiwan Security Enhancement Act

Prez waiver CP- net benefits are: 1)not business as usual 2)imprt substitution

Negative Positions:

Minority owned businesses DA and CP - must be specific about nearly all
Import substitution DA

Negative Positions

Women and Minority Owned Businesses CP
Race and gender kritik
The Not business as usual DA
Plan Specification
T- Immediate: must be in plan
CP- only allow minority biz to set up in Syria
Race Gender exclusion kritik
Minority owned businesses DA

Santa Clara

LEWIS & CLARK

Santa Clara's neg strategy against Iraq

Off-case:

Bipart

- A – plan uses fiat, not bipartisanship (analytic)
- B – There will be a disaster without bipartisanship
(Daschle '96 “To work successfully...”)
- C – No foreign policy would succeed without bipartisanship
(Berger '97 “But in the end, particularly...”)
- D – Peace/Democracy are at stake
(Albright '97)
- E – The plan ignores necessary bipartisanship
(Brzezinski '96)

Economic Hegemony

- A – The US pursues economic hegemony
(Pfaff '98)
- B – Link: Reversing sanctions increases globalization

Sanctions are key to preventing US business entry into world markets
(Hawkins '99)

Sanctions force economic independence
(BBC '98)

Lifting Sanctions leads to globalization

C – Impacts

Globalism leads to domestic decay and resource depletion
(Petras '99)

Globalization risks conflict
(Pfaff '98)

** This card talks about CULTURAL hegemony, not economic hegemony

UN Counter Plan

On-case:

Moral imperative to do sanctions/stop conflict

Death toll cards are vague

The genocide is Saddam's fault

The plan does not get immediate solvency

2NR

Economic hegemony

Moral imperative to do sanctions

Seattle

WESTERN

Tournament: Western Washington University Round: 6 Aff: Whitman BC Negative: Seattle JS

INC Offcase positions:

T: Constructive engagement

Spanos

China-WTO: Impact: WTO breakdown good:

Case Arguments:

Neoliberalism bad

Helms-Burton Dedev position: Short term economic collapse coming now, is good. We lift Helms-Burton, shore up WTO, prevent collapse

Juragua turn

Transition T/s

2NR:

Juragua turns

Neoliberalism

Helms-Burton DA on case

LEWIS & CLARK

Keola Whittaker/Brian Ward

Affirmative Round Report

Aff Team/Case: Iran Neg Team: Seattle JS Tournament LC Round 1/4s Judge Glen Kuper, Jaich, Houston

INC Off Case Positions:

Spanos

T - Constructive engagement is more than lifting sanctions

Clinton bad/CTBT/winners win scenario

INC Case Arguments:

Yemen turn - we allow Iranian aggression in Yemen

Hormuz turn - Iran will take over the strait of hormuz b/c of plan, causing wars
sanctions block WMD

2NR:

Spanos

South Carolina

WAKE

South Carolina

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1

Team: USC MB

vs.: North Texas FH

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: Haymond

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

1. Genocide Trivialization Reff96

2. Kurd DA

3. 688 Counterplan - keep 688 and do aff. Plan

4. Fiat Abuse

5. T - All or Nearly all

Extra T

FX

Constructive Engagement

6. Solvency Turns / WMD - Cordesman '99

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Topicality and Fiat Abuse in the 2NR

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1

Team: South Carolina PB

vs.: SMS VP

Aff case: Iraq

Judge: Cornellier, Erik-Gonzaga

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts):

Kuwait-Yetiv 99, Kuwait in Iraq's Shadow

Kurd-Cordesman 99 Iraq and War Against Sanctions

Israel-Xinhua News Agency Oct. 11 99

Pakistan-Hindu June 11 99

SPRA CP-Regarding Iraq the SPRA will be adopted-Auclair 99 Feeling Good Doing With Sanctions

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3

Team: South Carolina PB

vs.: Dartmouth GS

Case: Iraq

Judge: DeLaughder, Ken--Emporia

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

T=CE

T=Policy

T=All or Nearly All

Circumvention

Pakistan

G88 CP

Kurd DA

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

688 CP

Pakistan

Kurd DA

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 4

Team: South Carolina BM

vs.: Southern Illinois MS

Case: North Korea

Judge: Sullivan, John-Michigan State

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Russia Nationalism

A. Nationalism is on the brink of taking over-Stone June 26 99 The Spectator

B. Plan takes Russian sphere of influence

C. US policies that don't include Russia will anger nationalists and Russian public-Ferry and Kanet 97 The Foreign Policy of the Russian Federation

D. Nationalism = WAR!-Arbator 97 The Search for Stability in Russia

Slavery

New slavery produces expendable people-Bales, Disposable People: New Slavery in the Global Economy99

Globalization = Slaver Bales p.9-10

Slavery must be rejected, there is no debate-Bales 99 p.7-8

Discussion of slavery solves-Bales 99 p.32

Slavery must be stopped at any cost-Patterson Slavery and Social Death 82 p.95

Slavery is dehumanizing which makes it worse than war-Montagu and Knattson The Dehumanization of Man 83 p. xi

Pakistan

1. Pakistan has suffered from US imposed sanctions in the past-Shimbun, Asahi News Service Oct. 14 99

2. They are likely to suffer from them in the future-The Hindu June 11 99 "The co-chairman..."

3. Pakistan demands equal treatment on sanctions AFP Nov. 8 99

4. Regional conflagration must be avoided-Khan, Montreal Gazette, Oct. 13 99

CP: Conditional Engagement

Text: Regarding DPRK economic sanctions will not be removed immediately. Instead, the sanction policy reform act (S757) as amended below will be adopted and a policy of conditional engagement will be executed. All elements of CE unrelated to the immediate removal of economic sanctions will be adopted. The SPRA includes time frame and termination conditions, assessment and revision provisions, and will be amended to include full waiver authority for the president. Congressional sanctions must include assessment or be ruled out of order and "notwithstanding any other legislation" exemptions will not be allowed. The amendments will exclude the publishing requirement, contract sanctity and national interest waivers per se, and a specific sunset deadline. Hence, the president through a policy of conditional engagement will engage positive incentives and target and refocus the sanctions regime with the aim to maximize compliance as the sanctions are reduced.

Ob. 1 Non-Topical

A. NOT CE

B. Sanctions are not immediately removed

C. Topical CPs are OK

Ob. 2 Competitive

A. Can't have Constructive and Conditional Engagement

B. Can't remove and not remove

C. Net Benefits-We maximize sanction regime

D. Net Benefits-We avoid playing favorites

E. Net Benefits-We empower Clinton with capital

F. SPRA Maximizes Flexible Response-Auclair Feeling Good or Doing Good With Sanctions 99

G. President must have ability to lift sanctions step by step-Hufbauer Economic Casualties 99, editor: Solveig Singleton and Daniel T. Griswold

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Slavery

War Games

South Carolina

School: South Carolina

Team(s): BM, BP

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

Conditional Engagement CP

Net Benefits - US hegemony and shunning

Exclude financial sanctions CP

DAs

Clinton - WTO

Russian nationalism
Slavery

K
Fem IR
Threat Construction

SOUTH CAROLINA

South Carolina PB
-Threat Construction
- Post-Colonialism baby!
-T all or nearly all
-Russia

Southeast Louisiana

USC

USC jr. division

Southeast Louisiana's answers to the Iraq 1AC

Off-case

CP

Suspend sanctions (remove now, reimpose if Saddam proliferates)

Iraqi proliferation DA

Iran

Lifting sanctions kills oil prices, that's a blow to Iran

Iran launches WMDs

On-case

Saddam steals the money

Iraqi prolif turns

Morality can be suspended in policy-making circumstances

It's immoral to fail to consider Prolif

Lifting sanctions leads to a fall in oil prices; high oil prices are key to case solvency

Keola Whittaker/Brian Ward

Affirmative Round Report

Aff Case: Iran Neg Team: SouthEast Louisiana GS **Tournament USC Round 6 Judge** Diane Waryas

INC Off Case Positions:

Socialism CP

T policy and CE

INC Case Arguments:

Capitalism turns case

2NR:

CP

Negative Positions:

CP: Do all case but suspend sanctions, not lift them, and leave option to reimpose.

Iraq Prolif DA

Chemical Weapons Prolif DA

Iran DA

Negative Positons:

T Policy: Specific Steps

CP: Suspend not Lift

Iran DA

Iraqi Prolif DA

Iraqi CBW DA

Southern California

LONG BEACH

Long Beach sr. division

USC's responses to the Iraq 1AC

Off-case

Clinton: NTR good w/protectionism impacts

T: immediate (not in plan text)

CP

US + UN will change O4F (do the report of the second panel)

Oil: Algeria

On-case

Genocide/Holocaust Trivialization

Must have intent to be genocide

Mueller and Mueller don't assume Clinton

Lifting snx. undermines O4F. O4F key to solvency

Saddam exports extremism

Only lifting economic sanctions isn't enough

Prolif turns

War turns

Saddam is evil

Another USC team responding to the Iraq 1AC

Off-case

CP

Cortright and Lopez

Solve prolif/aggression

Clinton: NTR good with protectionism impacts

Topicality: Remove vs. non-enforcement

Topicality: Immediate wasn't in the plan text

On-case

Sanctions contain Iraq (Terrorism turns, prolif turns, etc.)

Genocide trivialization

Deontology bad

WAKE

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 6

Team: USC HH

vs.: Michigan State BC

Aff case (country): Iran

Judge: Starr

1NC Off-Case Arguments

CP

Conditional on terrorism and proliferation

Vagueness

T - Unconditional

Clinton WTO good

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Clinton

Case turns

--Hardliner backlash

--Sanctions Solve terrorism, prolif

Southern California

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 2

Team: Southern Cal HH

vs.: Michigan BS

Aff case (country): North Korea

Judge: Mika

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Nato consultation cp

Nato DA

Clinton-WTO Good

Vagueness

Immediate topicality

South korea DA

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 2

Team: Southern Cal MS

vs.: michigan state DM

Aff case (country): North Korea

Judge: Stevens

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Clinton- WTO

Consult South Korea CP: Consult South Korea on the plan and do the outcome of consultations.
korea and world affairs, spring 1997

Spanos

Shunning

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Clinton

Cp

Case turns

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3

Team: Southern California HH

vs.: Gonzaga KM

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: Sharp, Jon - West Georgia

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Clinton -

A. must make strong effort to secure permanent MFN

B. link - plan = DA (yes that's what the INC said verbatim)

2. CP avoids congressional backlash - Korea Economic Weekly, 8-30-99

C. Impact

1. stopping PRC entry emp = war

2. tensions rising - Financial Times - Sep 14, 99

3. US Sino relations key to region

Agent Specificity -

Destroys policymaking - Omar 80

T - including implies subset, can't just lift sanctions - words and phrases 59

CP - UN will lift OFF ceiling, streamline approval process, and have an exemption in sanctions allowed for NGO's, FE normal means

Avoids case turns - Pickering 99

Solvency -

1. ev assumes WWII bombings, not modern nuclear weapons
- 2.
3. no solvency - prostitution or poverty always exist
4. CP solves - not means to an end
5. Gewirth not apply to public policy, assumes individuals
6. No impact to uranium
7. CP solves guilt transference
8. Impact flawed - aff not save dead people
9. Based on Iraqi data - Cordesman 99
10. No international support for NGO's - Lopez
11. Can't solve 8 years of malnutrition
12. Allows diversion
13. Can reach oil ceilings - AFP 99
14. OFF solves hum harms
15. Long timeframe -not immediate
16. No solvency

Harms

1. no reverse causality
2. no solvency - lifting only economic sanctions don't solve
3. CE not solve - Cordesman and Hashim 99
4. Sanctions kill Iraqi export of violence - Cordesman 99
5. Lifting sanctions = WMD prolif
6. Turn - = military buildup - Cordesman 99
7. Causes invasion of Kuwait

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
Kicks OFF CP, goes for clinton, agent specificity

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3
Team: Southern Cal HH
vs.: Gonzaga KM
Aff case (country): Iraq
Judge: Sharp - West Georgia
INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)
Vagueness
Clinton - Chinese WTO
CP - Lift Oil for Food ceiling and exempt NGOs from sanctions
T - Constructive engagement

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
Clinton and Case Turnsh

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3
Team: Southern Cal HV
vs.: Dartmouth GS
Case: Syria
Judge: Helwich, Dave-Pittsburgh
INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)
Extra T

T-immediate

Spanos-all Spanos 93

Consult Congress CP
Text: plan but passage contingent on Congressional approval

Clinton-WTO Good

Israel-US Relations Disad

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Went for counterplan and Clinton

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 4

Team: USC MS

vs.: North Texas FH

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: McIntosh

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Agent Specificity

T - Removal = Abolish

Diplomatic Trade-Off

Clinton Good - Chinese WTO

CP: Expand Oil-for-Food, give oil field equipment, streamline human assistance

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Case turns.

CP is kicked in the block.

Southern California

School: Southern California

Team(s): All

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

CUBA:

INC Strategy

plan => castro power turns,

shunning

nato counterplan

democracy promotion bad

clinton with wto

Spanos

Female Genital mutilation (out of omnibus act) Act Prohibits countries from performing Usaengage.org/Studies/Apendll.html, and

seeds- Extension of commerce foster genetic engineering of new organisms

This carries risk of monocultures accelerating species closer to extinction

Vandana Shiva, Biopolitics, 1995, pg. 280, 275

IRAQ:

INC Strategy

general case stuff (wmd turn, aggression turn, saddam diverts args)

shunning

seeds

nato counterplan

china shift disad

clinton wto or un

IRAN:

INC Strategy

clinton wto,

shunning

seeds

general case turns - prolif, terrorism, aggression

SYRIA:

INC Strategy

peace process turns

shunning

seeds,

clinton wto

democracy disad

NORTH KOREA:

INC Strategy

shunning

seeds

case turns (leverage, prolif)

clinton (wto)

SOUTH CAROLINA

University of Southern California HH

-Concult Nato CP/ Nato DA Net Benefit

-Genetic Manipulation

-Orientalism

-T-extra, nearly all

-case turns

UNI

Topicality

-Including means more than just the lifting of sanctions

-Agent Specification

-Immediate ? plan can not be conditional

-Constructive engagement

-Consultation is not immediate

Burden of Proof

-aff must prove three kinds of inherency, have a solvency author, and a

voting issue.

SOP

-Congress acting on foreign policy violates SOP ? must reject each violation ? it makes plan unconstitutional

Clinton

-CTBT Good, Congressional Backlash story, arms race impact

Kritik of terrorist discourse

-vague notions of terrorism in 1AC = bad

-facilitate threat construction and counter terrorism

Vagueness

-must specify what constructive engagement is

Oil

-lifting sanctions kills the price of oil = killing the south Asia

econ = war

-cheap oil in Middle East = U.S. regional dependency = War

-Increase oil revenue allows for Korean proliferation = war

NATO consultation counter-plan

-if they like plan, they can do it or they can veto it

-consultation key to relations, and relations are key to avoiding war

Reductionism Kritik

-Feminism good, patriarchal U.S. foreign policy bad

-Reductionist mindset = extinction

Consult with Japan and/or South Korea Counter-plan

-give veto power over the affirmative

-U.S. / Japan alliance net benefit ? key to solving nuclear war

Seeds

-Constructive engagement with North Korea allows genetic manipulation, creation of monoculture. This kills biodiversity which = extinction.

Shunning

Southern Illinois

WAKE

Southern Illinois

9 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 6
Team: SIU MS
vs.: USC
Aff case (country): Cuba
Judge: Reid
INC Off-Case Arguments
Clinton - WTO

Venezuela
-Lifting embargo thwarts democracy in Venezuela
[Gonzalez, The Rand (??) Forum on Cuba, 1999]
-Democratic Changes Key to Latin American Democracy
[New Republic 1/11/99 "democracy develops"]
-Democracy solves ethnic conflicts
[Larry Diamond Social Science 3/97 "respective ethnic groups"]

Rice
-Vietnam sells rice to Cuba to solve economic collapse
[Asia Pulse 9/16/98]
-Lift embargo = Vietnam crowdout
[Houston Chronicle 9/25/99]
-Vietnamese growth key to regional stability
[Washington Times 9/4/99]

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
Venezuela

Southern Illinois

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1
Team: Southern Illinois MS
vs.: Pittsburgh CT
Aff case: Iran
Judge: Glaser, Sarah-Kansas State
INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts):
Topicality-Immediate
A. Interpretation-immediate must be in plan to prevent conditionality
B. Violation-plan conditions and is not immediate
C. Vote negative-cp ground lost and fairness/jurisdiction

CP:
TXT: The US FG should adopt a policy of CE with Iran. This policy should feature reciprocal diplomatic measures responding to President Khatami's proposal for a dialogue of civilizations and should be accompanied by a gradual and conditional removal of nearly all economic sanctions on Iran including targeted visa restrictions, restrictions on oil trade and frozen Iranian assets, based in Iranian denunciation of terrorism, WMD development and opposition to the peace process. As per our Tanter evidence.

Ob. 2 Competitiveness
CP avoids peace process and turns

Ob. 3 Solvency
1. Only way to solve is to condition removal and end terrorism-completely solves case-Tanter '99
2. Iranian concessions required for normalization-Dr. Jerrod Green FDCH Transcripts, July 22 99
3. We bolster Khatami-Phillips www.heritage.org/library/categories/forpol/bg/152.html '98

Clinton
A. China will get into WTO-BBC World Broadcasts 11/19/99

- B. Plan kills US capital-Clawson Survival Spring 98
- C. Political Capital required to get China into WTO-Gill, Bates Foreign Affairs July/Aug '98
- D. No WTO = Bad Relations-Bglobe Oct. 27 97
- E. Loss of Relations = War-Meisner LATimes Dec. 15 '96

Peace Process

Uniqueness: delays ended-Israel and Palestine have signed the Wye Accords

New York Post 9-5-99

Links: US Role key to success-AFP 9-3-99

Israel = Key US Ally to Counteract Iran-BBC 8-14-99

US Must be Honest Broker-News Tribune of Tacoma, July 26 '99

Impact: Kills US Leadership-NW Jan. 3 98

Spanos

Massive Discursive Campaign to Recuperate American Humanism-Avoiding Vietnam is the Ultimate Example of the Violence of Humanism-Spanos H&C '93 p. 176

Reject the calculative thinking of the affirmative-it reduces being to docile bodies which is critical to the humanist project-Spanos p. 176

Only this project of rethinking modernity can result in an emancipatory project to overthrow global repression-Spanos p.186

Case

Iraqi encirclement turn, prolif turn, dialogue fails, plan increases hardliners and that crushes khatami

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Kicked T, CP, and WTO in the block

Extended double turn on peace process

Extended Spanos

Case arguments-Iraqi encirclement turn, prolif turn, dialogue fails, khatami

2NR

Kicked Spanos

Kicked Dual Containment turn by granting solvency takeouts

Went for solvency turns

Southern Illinois

School: Southern Illinois

Team(s): MS

CUBA:

INC Strategy

Spanos

Juragua

Clinton Good

IRAQ:

INC Strategy

Condition CP

Israel Relations

Clinton

Southwest Missouri State

WAKE

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 5
Team: SMS PV
vs.: Northwestern PS
Case: North Korea
Judge: Dunbar, Kelly-Baylor
INC Off-Case Arguments
Clinton TSEA
Mediocre Diplomat-Hendriksen
T: CE= only lift sanctions
Same case turns as in round 2 vs. Northwestern

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
Went for case turns and takeouts

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 7
Team: SMS VP
vs.: Pace BL
Aff case (country): North Korea
Judge: Sean Harris
INC Off-Case Arguments
Appeasement: Hendriksen Evid. Same ol thing

Clinton- WTO, Political Capital Int'l Link
Financial times 11/16/99

CP: codify perry proposal

Case: concessions=brinkmanship, step by step solvency, plan=allied prolif

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
Went for CP and case turns. SQ perry solves case=normalization. Plan = japan rearm

Southwest Missouri State

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 2
Team: SMS WH
vs.: Pittsburgh DC
Aff case: Iran
Judge: Hayman, Jethro--Cornell
INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts):
CP-Gradual Lifting
Text: The US will begin a policy of gradual engagement and sanctions reduction per the recommendations of Wright for the 4 phase process
--Wright and Bakash 97, Foreign Policy 9-22-97 p.124

China WTO
--Financial Times Nov. 16 99
--Houston Chronicle July 21 99
--Jaffe and Lewis

Mediocre Diplomacy/Hege
--Hendriksen 94
<http://www-hoover.stanford.edu/publications/eppl/94/94e.html>

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
CP
Khatami will remain in power
Clash of Civilizations

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 2
Team: SMS VP
vs.: Northwestern FK
Aff case: North Korea
Judge: Falconer, Russ--Emory
INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts):
WTO Bad

Mediocre Diplomacy-Hendriksen 99 that website

Case Answers
--Won't escalate
Daily Yomouri 10-6-99
Ritter Int'l Security 95
--Perry Solves
Paik 9-28-99 www.nautilus.org/for a/security/9907E_Eberstadt.Discussion.htm
Lawkin 10-8-99
--Brinksmanship
AFP 10-12-99
Mann 99
AFP 10-12-99
Winiamson 10-6-94

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
Went for straight up case turns and take outs

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1
Team: Southwest Missouri State CH
vs.: Whitman CO
Aff case (country): Iraq
Judge: Slusher
INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)
C/P Maintain Financial Sanctions [Cortwright & Lopez]

Clinton WTO - political capital

Interstate Violence (from C/P authors) financial sanctions solve interstate violence

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Negotiations credibility; lifting sanctions kills credibility. Sanctions stop WMD development

C/P

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 4
Team: SMS VP
vs.: Berkeley KS
Case: Iran
Judge: Lundberg, Chris-Emory
INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)
WTO Good
Turkey
Hendriksen-US Credibility
T: CE = must do more than lift sanctions
Khatami turns on case

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
2NR went for all but Clinton

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 4
Team: Southwest Missouri State HW

Aff case (country): Syria
INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)
US - Israel alliance
[Samuel Lewis Middle East Journal Summer 99 p374]

WTO Bad
[Washington Times 11/10/99]

Turkey-US Good
[Stephen Kinzer New York Times 8/30/99]

Counterplan - USFG will establish a policy of CE with the government of the (??) NS of the Syrian Arabic Republic including insurance and mediation of Euphrates water disputes as well as economic intercession foreign aid and tech transfers to prop up the Syrian economy

They went for C/P WTO and Turkey

UCO

SMS NP

OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:

- Clinton winners win, WTO bad
- Sanctions Credibility - Henrickson '99
- Iraq rearm
- Iraq stats flawed
- CP modify O.F.F. so Iraq can purchase water purification technology

BREAKDOWN OF THE BLOCK:

2NC

- Clinton
- Plan Flawed
- CP
- Iran Advantage

1NR

- Iraq rearm
- Humanitarian Aid
- O.F.F. Good

NEGATIVE TRICKS

- Argue that WTO leads to internal reform in 2NC as new MPX to Clinton

2NR POSITIONS:

- Planflaw
- Clinton
- Rearm
- Stats Flawed
- "Jan I want my drinks"

UNI

Saudi Oil d/a

- big oil investment in Saudi Arabia vs. Iraq

Oil for Food Counter-plan

- Henry Assam (sp?) 1999
- U.S. should take all necessary steps to remove ceiling from oil for food program
- Clinton
 - plan kills bipartisanship which stops tax cuts from being passed
 - depression and war impacts
 - WTO, credibility key to political capital, WTO good for China

Consult with Japan and South Korea counter-plan

Shunning

Hegemony

- sanctions necessary for leadership
- flip-flop link

South Korea

Standard Sharing

Bipartisanship
-tax cut impact

Consequentialism vs. moral issues

Consult with other countries and give unconditional food aid
counterplan

Texas

BAYLOR

Baylor Texas EG

This is taken from my flows. Some of it doesn't make any sense.

Critique of Fantasy

Their plan presupposes they are the USFG, it says the USFG "will" change "our" policy

Adventure Playground Card, Baudrillard 94 (they explain it to mean the aff reproduces catastrophe with a spectacle of terror)

Mitchell evidence: Alienation disassociates us from the world

Human suffering becomes uniqueness to our disads

Counterplan: We demand that the US government end its policy of containment and military aggression

Net Benefit: Heidegger 66 war and peace are cycles, dependent on one another for definition (?)

The Perfect Drug

Texas Baudrillard Critique:

Debate is not backgammon.

Media descriptions of violence become melodramas.

New spectacles of catastrophe

The third world, the middle east, hundreds of thousands of deaths, allow us to gloss over our own problems at home such as domestic violence and O.J. Simpson.

We call the rest of the world a wasteland, our adventure playground

Baudrillard 94

B. Links

1. Catastrophic Cannibalism: Their Boston Globe evidence (a card Redlands read describing humanitarian harms of sanctions) creates a symbolic crisis

Baudrillard 94

Humanitarian Aid is Bad

It trades catastrophes like coffee

Halucinogen of misery

2. Pity

Voyuerism of international catastrophe is a titillating cocktail pill

Campbell 99

Horrors confirm our superiority

Pitiers maintain distance to downplay horror, preventing our capacity to respond

Victims portrayed as weak

(CX explanation: We don't care about bombing because we pity them. It makes us feel better)

3. Cycle of Catastrophe

We break them down to build them back up, the problems eventually re-emerge

Campbell 97

Secondary Effects

Fire Raisers are Fire Fighters (there have got to be fires for them to have jobs)

Humanitarian efforts work the same way

C. Impacts

1. No spectacle is better than a good war. The aff feeds the cycle

Baudrillard 95

(They preserve the spectre)

Debaters can't fiat utopias, the aff discourse prevents rupture.

Colesomething 97

Criticism = Flushing out to show things aren't self evident

Important for a disciplinary society

Performance

Norm of resistance

Meaningful citizenship

Illusion of Democratic Control

Fundamental for debate to change attention from the government to activism.

CX:

The link is your impact evidence.

The more bodies pushed to the screen, the less we want to do anything about it.

But our argument is not numbing, it's that the more violence we see, the more we want violence
Our alternative: Mock and Perform, Stand in Opposition

2NC Overview:

Discourse Economic Borders

Context of American Culture

Humanitarian Discourse of the Boston Globe Evidence allows them to feel good about themselves.

They use people in a pernicious cycle

Two implications:

1. Carnivorous Appetite for violence only increases problems in a cycle
2. Critique Solves (Some evidence that starts with a C or a K)

Answer To: Permutation

1. Perms Blunt Criticism: If you always combine things and subsume criticism into existing doctrines, nothing ever happens.
2. Perms Are Only A Test: Nothing Happens if You Vote For Them
3. If The Aff Advocates the Perm, They Are Shifting, making them ultimately unpredictable, that's not fair
4. The 1AC is always there, it's like flatulence (?)
5. The perm tries to draw you back into the same bad system
6. The perm doesn't solve
 - A. It's a cycle
 - B. It just criticizes
 - C. Regress, certainty of affirmation
7. The permutation is not all of the 1AC and all of the 2AC. They sever. Reject them, it skews ground.
8. Not Theoretically Justified
 - A. No link arguments and turns are sufficient to test competition
 - B. We don't advocate a utopian world as an alternative, they've got nothing to perm
 - C. It's intrinsic, that's a voting issue. They kill negative ground, decrease education, and shift
9. The perm is a link, attempting to include our criticism replicates violence, Dillon 96

New 2NC Links:

Security Discourse: Dillon 96

E. San Juan 94

Ingram Discourse Impact

A2: No Alternative

Don't imagine yourself to be the state.

The fiat game is bad

Change the state and subject

They can't fiat the Plan

Their discourse is domination

Vote negative

Reform doesn't happen

Foucault

(Transformation is difficult_

A2: The K Kills Compassion

No, you can advocate narratives like our silly 1AC

Campbell says real compassion requires breaking down the cultural logic of otherization

A2: Assess Fiat

Plan Focus debate is bad

Future Policy making focus leads to alienation, stops change, Mitchell 98

Deprives us of a civic voice

They uncritically accept the current vision of debate

Justifies flippant usage of racist/sexist language

Assumes debate is apolitical, but their think tank cards effect us

Ross Smith on Critiques of Speech Acts:

Debate shouldn't be about competing speech acts. It destroys CLASH and results in debaters competing to outdo one another's performances. It's not fair to the aff. The neg can always up the ante and find a new reason the aff speech act is tainted. Grove's reciprocity arguments are bad. He says we can always argue "Baudrillard bad." But that's not sufficient ground for the affirmative. It is merely a truism that every argument creates ground against itself. The affirmative burden is a particular type of speech act that creates a certain imperative. The resolution forces policy argument. When you abandon "fiat" how do you determine who won the debate? Texas' "fiat-plus" relies on a promise of sincerity. But they don't believe it. They still think that if they fuck up in the 2NR, they should lose. Performances should not be attached to the ballot.

Keola Whittaker/Brian Ward
Affirmative Round Report

Aff Case: Iran Neg Team: Texas CS **Tournament** Baylor **Round 2 Judge** Goins
INC Off Case Positions:
Russia consult CP, T constructive engagement

INC Case Arguments:
Prolif turns, Caspian turns

2NR:
T

WILLIAM JEWELL
TEXAS BB

Against Lewis and Clark CH (North Korea):
-Proliferation turns
-Religious persecution (Sanctions key to solving)

Against Michigan State OS (North Korea):
-Proliferation credibility
-CP: Do Perry plan and support unification (Perry and Harrison)
-Topicality: Constructive engagement must be broad based.

TEXAS BD

Against Arkansas State TW (Iraq):
-Security
-Oil, Caspian
-Development Kritik
-Case: IMF, Tobacco, Pesticides
-Topicality: Constructive Engagement Reverse Containment.

TEXAS BL

Against Kansas State ST (Cuba):
-Kritik: White Voices - The plan silences and/or excludes black Caribbean philosophy with its moral imperative.
-Kritik: Development
-CP: Allow black philosophy to guide our policy toward Cuba.
-Case: Tourism Turns.

Against SMS NP (Cuba):
-Topicality
-Development Kritik
-Socialism DA
-Cp: Delay - Do plan in 2 years; Smaldone 1996.
-Case: Tourism and TV among other turns.

TEXAS GK

Against Emory GM (Cuba):
-Development Kritik
-CP: Smaldone 1996; Delay the plan for 5 years
-Case: Tourism, Cultural Imperialism.

TEXAS RS

Against UMKC CG (Iraq):
-Post-colonialism Kritik
-Topicality: Constructive Engagment means economic and diplomatic ties.
-CP: Lift all sanctions, stop NFZs (Simons).
-Case: Inspectors Bad = Coups an Reimposition; NFZs Bad (Decrease Aid); Rollback; Dual-Use Bad.

WAKE

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 5
Team: Texas DM
vs.: SMS CN
Case: Cuba
Judge: Panetta, Ed-Georgia
INC Off-Case Arguments
Clinton-Cyprus
--Atlanta Journal 11/15/99
--War will spillover-Pipes 90

T: CE= Economic Ties-Ardnt 98
Kritik-Development!
--Campbell 98
--San Juan 95
--Scater 98
--Banutzl 93
--Sadar 99

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
Development kritik and some case
1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 6
Team: Texas DM
vs.: Catholic DuW
Aff case (country): Syria
Judge: Slusher
INC Off-Case Arguments
T Constructive Engage
"Diplomatic pressure" - the plan just lift sanctions and gives aid but doesn't engage in diplomacy

WTO
Impact is nationalist backlash in China and Nuke civil war

Critical Geopolitics
Security discourse Link (Dalby)
Objective world view = conflict
Water advantage link - ecology problem "securitized"
Case turn - attempts to create order = more disorder
US domination racist and colonist
Challenges = new discourse (Dalby)

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
Critical Geopolitics - No tricks
Environmental securitization link (treating this env't problem...water shortage...as a security issue links and diplomacy is a US leverage tool to get what we want, israel bias screws all other parties) Exposes more disorder - case turn

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 6
Team: Texas EG
vs.: Emory HL
Aff case (country): North Korea
Judge: Leeper
INC Off-Case Arguments
Kritik of Realism
A.) Debate is not about advocating policy - we should abandon notions of fiat which places US in the position of the gov't and move to personal advocacy
B.) The IAC talks about the region in realist ways - reentrenching western self interest
C.) Death and lots of horrific suffering
1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 7

Team: Texas GE

vs.: West Georgia BS

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: D. Heidt

INC Off-Case Arguments

"The Perfect Drug" Jean Baudrillard, 1994. The Illusion of the End.

The aff depictions of violence is a drug; the culture of the west uses depictions of violence in the third world to justify humanitarian intervention, and to satisfy our subconscious desire to avoid self-loathing. We solve the case and congratulate ourselves on our own righteousness and superiority. The impact is that we will always recreate violence to satisfy our subconscious.

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 8

Team: Texas SR

vs.: Gonzaga KM

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: Klemz - Southern Illinois

INC Off-Case Arguments

T - lifting sanctions and ending bombing isn't a policy with Iraq, and the vote in the Security Council interacts with other countries

Clinton Good - WTO

Post Colonialism

The United States is involved in a larger project to link together imperialism, an efficient form of global capitalism, and a homogenization of nation-states into potential markets. The Affirmative participates in capital accumulation by removing a thorn from the side of free enterprise.

A. The Struggle Begins! Now is the time to step back from their 1ac construction of danger, exposing the real risk of corporate manipulation - E. San Juan, Beyond Postcolonialism, 1998

B. Smoothing Capitalism Consolidates a Colonial project

1. their scenarios prove that the plan is a symptom of exploitation. Constructive engagement offers a mask of expanding markets that hides a growing reality of economic ethnocentrism - E. San Juan

2. Bringing individual nations into the fold blocks all avenues of resistance. Subjectivity after the plan is a myth - E. San Juan

C. An endorsement of alternatives to Capitalism is our only hope, both before and after fiat

1. The advantages and solvency are turned. The cult of the Gross National Product will intensify unemployment, poverty, repression and genocide - E. San Juan

2. Any attempt at permuting the rejection of capitalist ideologies is doomed. When they say "permute" they magnify the link. The logic of capital reproduces itself and our rethinking provides the only escape - E. San Juan, Beyond Postcolonialism, 1998

3. practical and utopian emancipation come together in the struggle against postcolonial capitalism. Only an endorsement of the negative project, both in this debate and in policy discussions, will allow survival into the next millennium - E. San Juan

CP - the USFG should adopt a policy of constructive engagement including the immediate lifting of all sanctions on Iraq and the reversal of the US vote in the UN security council regarding such sanctions on Iraq. The US government will also continually bomb the dikes as advocated by Peterson. All other bombing will be ended. Funding and enforcement guaranteed.

- should bomb the dikes that drain the marshes in Southern Iraq - this saves indigenous groups from mass murder - Peterson, Christian Science Monitor, 2-16-1999, "what we need"

Case arguments:

1. they don't meet their own deontological imperative so they lose - they keep military sanctions on Iraq

2. plan doesn't specify that they lift dual-use sanctions

3. delinking uses people as a means to an end of arms control

4. plan is vetoed - doesn't consult Iraq in the UN

5. vetoed by Russia in order to gain concessions on Chechnya

6. Russia wants that kind of tradeoff

7. They legitimize sanctions as a tool of statecraft - that's immoral

8. Plan causes rollback

Negative Block

2NC extends the Post Colonialism kritik

- argues that the Gewirth evidence is a link because it's responsibility shirking that justifies the expansion of Capitalism

- argues that the sanctions turns are irrelevant because you should just evaluate what the plan does. Just because the status quo sucks doesn't mean you vote affirmative. Also argues that these arguments are justifications for capitalist expansion

- Argues that moral imperative is blind activism which is worse, and justifies ethnic cleansing through identity politics

- Even if they win the discourse debate, plan causes ecocide and extinction through expanding capitalism, outweighs the case

- They don't have to defend a policy alternative, all they have to do is prove the plan is a bad idea.

1NR kicks Clinton, extends the counterplan and the case turns

- permutation is illegitimate because it severs out of the word "nearly" in the plan

- the permutation also links to the net benefit because it only removes all economic sanctions, whereas the counterplan lifts all sanctions.
- argues that the violation of the moral obligation on case comes first in the round because they established the ethical framework for the debate
- Counterplan solves the case better, lifting nearly all sanctions still has a risk of causing the case impacts. Counterplan solvency is guaranteed

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
2NR goes for the counterplan and the case arguments

Any lifting of dual use sanctions Is a military sanction, they can't lift those, so they don't lift those sanctions, which violates their ethical obligation, biggest impact in the round since it's their ethical framework. Counterplan absolutely avoids the case impacts. Only need to mitigate the airstrikes turns to win the debate. And they don't solve the dike bombing net benefit.

Texas

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 2
Team: Texas DM
vs.: West Georgia HS
Aff case (country): Iraq
Judge: Ayotte
INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)
T - CE = concrete policy, not discrete actions; = trade, aid

Counter-advocacy -
Debate should be a forum for social activism, policy emphasis on illusory fiat kills educational value - Gordon Mitchell 98

Kritik -
Aff supports geopolitical framework of nation-state actors - Campbell 98
Politics = violent tool of international relations - Heidegger
Aff use of statistics dehumanizes
Aff masks US responsibility - Bandrillard
Discourse of international relations --> individual complacency

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 4
Team: Texas EG
vs.: Whitman CO
Aff case (country): Iraq
Judge: Hayman
INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)
CX of the 1AC: what is the reason for the judge to vote affirmative?
what are the standards for who does the better debating?

Deconstructive Engagement

A.
Debate can be about the real world, not about fiat. We should conceive of debate as social activism. We oppose the idea of sanctions, but the way the 1AC frames the harms and the reliance on the US government for solvency is flawed and demobilizes. The activity becomes "hermetically sealed" and loses its value
[Gordon Mitchell, Argumentation & Advocacy, Fall 1998]

B.

1. Complacency allows death of millions - poses morality in terms of the individual, rather than society [Derrida, The Gift of Death, trans. David Willis, 1992, p. 84-87]
2. Crisis rhetoric frames the US as the only solution [Hammock, From Massacres to Genocide: The Media, Public Policy, and Humanitarian Crises, 96, p 117-118]
3. Reduction of Iraq to statistics and death counts destroys knowledge of live [Rose, Governing the Soul, 1989, p 5-7]
4. Aff rhetoric of humanitarian crisis reduces Iraqis to objects, undermining activism [Campbell, Sovereignty and Subjectivity, ed. Jenny Edkins, 1999, p. 21-23]
5. Aff promotes trade and transnational capitalism which results in devastation for millions [San Juan, Beyond Postcolonialism, 1998]

C.

1. US global domination is racist - we need to disavow this project and avoid complacency [San Juan, Hegemony and Strategies of Transgression, 1995]

2. Affirmative moral imperative is used to justify intervention across the globe [McKinley, Alternatives, 1996, v. 21, p. 52, "American Intelligence..."]

3. Reduction of humans allows government control - we must reject this conception [Bernauer, Force of Flight: Towards the ethic of thought, p 141-2]

CX of INC: They argue that they agree with the plan as written but think debate should be a strategy session to take to other forums to achieve concrete change.

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

2NC: We advocate the entirety of the affirmative plan - but the aff condemns us to a harmful closed game - debate impacts are an endless cycle - we solve the entire affirmative case - any net benefit means vote negative

Plan-focused debate is bad - fiat breeds alienation and denies agency [Mitchell 98]

B. They should be able to defend 1AC discourse - as important as a counterplan

C. Counteradvocacy effective

D. Status quo indefensible - hurts social advocacy and morally repugnant

E. Aff argument takes out link turns and permutation - if sincere advocacy not try to force us to defend the status quo

AT: Performative contradiction - neg wants to capture ballot

1. Mitchell evidence says don't have to abandon

2. We will cause change - they will stop statistics in 1AC

AT: No link

1. They accept our framework, takes out permutation or why we have to defend the SQ. Permutation allows them to shift out of discourse - destroys ability to run

2. Derrida criticizes their lines of responsibility for the US government - aff is a paradox - promote irresponsibility - guarantees millions of deaths from capitalism which is no ones fault

3. Moral activist thinking allows state-sanctioned murder - Native Americans, protect the Kurds flips back on the

4. Their Halliday evidence depicts a way to solve as lack of supplies and influx of American technology - reduces Iraqis to goods - ignores deeper problems of the crises - Western loans problems, characterizes the Iraqi government as a passive victim - "we possess" reinforces hegemony

5. Constructive engagement through an influx of trade and investment

6. Halliday and Mueller evidence accumulates body counts to justify - requires and intensifies techniques of normalization -reinforces government institutions who can always produce larger body counts - detracts from other narrative techniques

Narratives link: Cornell Law Review, September 92, White, "two perverse results"

AT: Ad hominem attack

1. Discursive analysis important

2. Everything is activist in a sense - just a question of effective activism

AT: No alternative

1. Here's one: Simons narrative of an Iraqi girl

AT: Poetry

1. Rage against the machine evidence counter-poetry

AT: Perspective taking good

Lose round teaches Jessica not to use statistics - allows her to find new strategies of change - the community agrees Iraqi sanctions bad - need to stop discussing the harms and strategize how to alleviate those harms

Judge votes for entirety of speech act means that the neg is better

We need to reject their discourse of strategic action [x]

Permutation Ans

1. Intrinsic - no kritik text to perm - voting issue for skew - stops social discourse

2. 1AC is a speech act - we straight turn it

3. Kick hurts all links, time allocation, = reject perm, voter, destroys debate to rhetorically interpret the debate

4. 1AC is strategic choice - why wait until 2AC

5. Sincerity turns back the permutation - they don't really care

AT: Empathy

1. Campbell evidence proves used to dominate
2. We agree with harms - just find better strategies - assumed government action poor
3. Should endorse our strategy - we need to show solidarity - should restore the voice to avoid silencing
4. Our alternative actually solves - Bernhard and San Juan

AT: Sanctions imperialist

1. We advocate actual way to end, not magical way
2. Humanitarianism never solve - just increase famine and destruction

AT: Chomsky

1. We advocate ending sanctions - it doesn't apply

AT: Must advocate the status quo

1. That's a link
2. We have a fiat-plus interpretation

AT: Poetry

1. Narrative we read answers it

AT: We restore agency

1. The way they restore agency is flawed

2nr:

1. Even though language has no inherent meaning - it can structure power relations - our Ingram evidence - racial epithets example.
2. We criticize their absolute morality - can be redeployed to justify sanctions - Kurds moral obligation example.
3. They ignore problems of structural violence - only directly responsible excludes other positions - we are all implicated in a transnational capitalism
4. If you let them kick out of discourse it marginalizes discourse - the ballot is key.
5. Not an offensive argument - the risk of being stuck to advocacy means you should vote negative to ask questions as producers of knowledge.
6. Mitchell evidence doesn't say we have to abandon competition - just that we have to think about strategic relevance.
7. 1AC is a speech act. Their arguments about fiat key proves not sincere about social activism
8. Our Iraqi narrative is agency - they don't need the US government
9. We have poetry too.
10. We embrace their beneficial advocacy - we just criticize other forms of bad advocacy
11. Like a counterplan - our counter-advocacy is better

Texas

School: Texas

Team(s): All

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of 1NC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

Topicality

- Constructive engagement must be broad based or the other way around
- cannot support opposition groups, must be government
- extra topicality on consultation
- vagueness

SIGS

- Interest groups will block plan solvency

Ban sanctions, bombing, diplomacy, and all future constructive engagement to
Iraq counterplan

Development kritik

- Tuatail (sp?) "Emerging markets and other____?_____"

Globalization kritik

- Lummis, 1991, "Alternatives"

Executive Order Counter-plan

- Clinton as the net benefit

Clinton

- strategic ambiguity

-CTBT

Disengage from the world counter-plan

-engagement = war

-off-shore balancing (the Layne article)

Must specify agent of action

Normativity

other negative cites:

-Guase, Foreign Affairs, may/june 1999

-Gallagher, New Approaches to Theory and Policy 1998

-Campbell, "why fight: Humanitarian action, principles, and post-structuralism," 1999

-Ashley (sp?) International Studies Quarterly, 1990

IRAQ:

INC Strategy

Counter-plan Leave Oil for Food (with modifications)

-Taylor, 1999

Oil d/a

-decreasing oil prices is bad for Caspian development

-decrease in Caspian oil revenue = Russian expansionism

School: NegTexasDN

Team(s):

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

Clinton - WTO good

Development - lifting sanctions -> development/ development destroys

culture, -> genocide. cites: Kothari '90, Tucker

T: constructive enagement (violation varies from round to round)

Kritik of geopolitics -Tauthail '98, E. an Juan '96

Security Kritik -Dalby '90/'92

CP to just lift economic sanctions

School: NegTexasSR

Team(s):

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

Inflation DA

A. now key time for inflation

B. biz wants slow lifting of sanctions

C. rate hike --> recession

2. mead 92

Clinton DA

a. clinton pushing CTBT now

b. plan = unpop. Recent rejection of attempts to lift sanctions (food and medicine) proves clinton link

c. ctbt key to stop nuclearism

Arguments Extended in the Negative Block (New Link Stories, Cites, Time Allocation, etc)

All of it extended in the block

On clinton - bipart support for plan = greater loss

CANF is a powerful lobby

CUBA:

INC Strategy

solvency

1. can't solve: current deaths. Can't save those sick or dying
2. turn: nationalism - investment --> backlash - Suchlicki, The Future of Cuba, ed. By Francisco Fiallos, 1996
3. can't solve - relations are cyclical - NPR: Talk of the Nation 8/17/99
4. can't solve - Cubans can't buy products
5. turn: instability - lift sanctions crushes politics - Salazar ed. By Archibald Ritter, Cuba in the Int'l system, p.101-102
6. instability --> death - Zimbalist, Cuba in the Int'l system,
7. no medical crisis - NPR again
8. TV T/ - a. local control now - World of Information Country Report, August 1999, "Cuba: Economy," p.1/n
- b. plan imports violence - Baptiste, US-Caribbean Relations, ed. Ransford Palmer, 1998, p.34-36
9. Kills environment - Orlando Sentinel 4/19/98
10. West Indies t/ - Cuba becomes the new West Indies - Schwab 1999. P.36-6m
11. development is ideology - plan is mask -- Tucker, Critical Theory Towards a New Paradigm, 99, p.1-2

UCO

TEXAS-AUSTIN BB (UNKNOWN)

OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:

- CP-Exclude nearly from plan
- Caspian oil - you lower prices this is bad for Caspian Development leads to reduction in economy leads to war
- Postcolonialism (East San Juan) - you allow Iraq back into capitalist system leads to capitalist takeover and crushes Iraq culture
- Geopolitics - geopolitical lenses can't solve
- T-must be a broad based constructive engagement policy, lifting sanctions alone doesn't mean it's constructive engagement

BREAKDOWN OF THE BLOCK:

2NC

- CP
- Caspian
- Postcolonialism
- geopolitics
- 1NR
- All Case
- Solvency
- Morality
- Terrorism

NEGATIVE TRICKS

2NR POSITIONS

- CP
- Caspian
- Case Arguments

UT-AUSTIN DM (CUBA?)

OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:

- T-Constructive Engage
- Clinton-WTO
- Development Kritik: Campbell '98, Welles '96, San Juan '95
- Counter Advocacy: Mitchell '98

Turns

- Tourism: Belleville '98, Independent 10/13/98
- Nationalism: Suchlicki '96
- Regime collapse: Salazar '95
- Human Rights: Schwab '99

BREAKDOWN OF THE BLOCK:

2NC

- Development
- Counter Advocacy
- 1NR
- Clinton

- Case Turns
- NEGATIVE TRICKS
- 2NR POSITIONS
- Case
- Development
- Counter Advocacy

UT-AUSTIN LB (UNKNOWN)

OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:

- Pity Retic Kritik: Bouillriard '83 - Pegging policies on hunger rhetoric is bad = opposition & imperialism
- T-constructive engagement is not lifting sanctions
- Vagueicality - must specify what you lift
- Geopolitics kritik - US uses threats to built itself up leading to globalization domination and imperialism
- Counter Advocacy - do the plan with no pity rhetoric and lift all sanctions unconditionally
- Nuclearism kritik on case using nukes in a game simulation leads to bad thought

BREAKDOWN OF THE BLOCK:

- 2NC
- Counter Advocacy
- Solvency
- Pity Kritik
- 1NR
- T (4 and a half minutes)
- Securitization kritik (Geopolitics)
- NEGATIVE TRICKS
- 2NR POSITIONS
- NA

TEXAS DN (IRAN)

OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:

- Development - Tucker
- Khatami Credibility
- T-constructive engagement
- T-all or nearly all
- Case

BREAKDOWN OF THE BLOCK:

- 2NC
- Khatami Credibility
- Case (solvency)
- 1NR
- Development
- Oil Advantages
- NEGATIVE TRICKS
- 2NR POSITIONS
- Development
- Case

UT-AUSTIN PG

OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:

- T-adopt = broad policy
- T-consult not topical
- Development Kritik
- Clinton - winners win TSEA bad
- Russia Consultation CP

BREAKDOWN OF THE BLOCK:

- 2NC
- T-Constructive Engagement
- CP
- 1NR
- T-consult
- Solvency
- NEGATIVE TRICKS

- Keep plan text until the middle of the 1AC
- 2NR POSITIONS:
- Both T's

UNI

Topicality

- Constructive engagement must be broad based or the other way around
- cannot support opposition groups, must be government
- extra topicality on consultation
- vagueness

Counter-plan Leave Oil for Food (with modifications)
-Taylor, 1999

Oil d/a

- decreasing oil prices is bad for Caspian development
- decrease in Caspian oil revenue = Russian expansionism

SIGS

- Interest groups will block plan solvency

Ban sanctions, bombing, diplomacy, and all future constructive engagement to
Iraq counterplan

Development kritik

- Tuatail (sp?) "Emerging markets and other ____? ____"

Globalization kritik

- Lummis, 1991, "Alternatives"

Executive Order Counter-plan

- Clinton as the net benefit

Clinton

- strategic ambiguity
- CTBT

Disengage from the world counter-plan

- engagement = war
- off-shore balancing (the Layne article)

Must specify agent of action

Normativity

other negative cites:

- Guase, Foreign Affairs, may/june 1999
- Gallagher, New Approaches to Theory and Policy 1998
- Campbell, "why fight: Humanitarian action, principles, and post-structuralism," 1999
- Ashley (sp?) International Studies Quarterly, 1990

Lots of solvency turns against Cuba

- investment = nationalist empowerment
- increase television access = violent culture
- aff as a foreign policy actor = genocidal identity formation
- regime collapse
- Plan increases U.S. Hegemony
- plan = increased tourists = destroyed environment
- plan = capitalist takeover in the name of development

Trinity

BAYLOR

Baylor jr. division

Trinity's answers to the Iraq Aff

Off-case

CP

Share DU decontamination info

Clinton: NTR good w/help the Chinese + avoid war impacts

On-case

Long time-frame for solvency

Saddam buys weapons

Saddam's actions justify sanctions

O4F solves

NGOs solve

Dual use sanctions stop prolif

Deontology bad

KINGS

Trinity University LP

Against: Catholic DW

T Violations: None.

Disads: 1. Clinton capital (W.T.O./U.S.-Sino impact).

2. Israeli disclosure and first use (link is Israel giving up territory).

3. Spanos critique

Trinity University CW

Against USMA FJ:

T Violations:

Disads: China/WTO: Plan broadly unpopular in Congress, political capital needed WTO; WTO failure tanks since US globalization, no sanctions increase globalization (Cuba - specific links) → domestic decay.

CP:

Other Good Arguments: no sanctions strengthens Castro, abandons Cubans, can't solve Cuba from without nuclear reactor turn

Trinity University LP

Against Liberty AH:

T-Viol: CE(Reagan-Era definition)

Disads: Globalization

CP: Isolationism (The US will prohibit trade with Iran)

UMKC

BAYLOR

Keola Whittaker/Brian Ward

Affirmative Round Report

Aff Case: Iran Neg Team: UMKC MM Tournament Baylor Round 6 Judge Jordan

INC Off Case Positions:

Delay CP

Terrorist talk

INC Case Arguments:

Khatami

Keola Whittaker/Brian Ward

Affirmative Round Report

Aff Case: Iran Neg Team: UMKC SW Tournament Baylor Round 4 Judge Campes-Wallace

INC Off Case Positions:

Delay CP

Khatami turn

NTR

Terrorism discourse

INC Case Arguments:

Prolif turns

2NR:

CP

WILLIAM JEWELL

UMKC CG

Against Georgia EK (Iraq):

-Oil/Caspian Sea: Iraq floods the market, decreases oil prices, leads to wars

-Peace Process: Hardline on Iraq key to peace process.

-Clinton: Needs his capital for NTR, leads to Sino-US War.

-Condition CP: End the use of US military force on Iraq and condition the lifting of all sanctions on Iraq on allowing in inspectors.

UMKC WL

Against John Carroll:

-Grand Negotiator

-Clinton NTR

-CP: Condition lift on Wolfstahl proposal.

WAKE

UMKC

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 8

Team: UMKC BC

vs.: Catholic SM

Case: Syria

Judge: McBride, Brian-Northwestern

INC Off-Case Arguments

Barak

- A. Barak pushing for peace now but has limited capital-Nov. 99
- B. Barak can't push PLO and Syria-July 26 99
- C. Failure to create Palestinian state=nuclear war

CP

TXT: the plan minus desalination

Desalination increases war 99

--another read on case=desal destroys conservation-

--desal fails to provide

--desal = terrorism

--Berman, Strategic Review Summer 99

--Desal targeted for Terrorism, Sherman The Politics of Water in the Middle East 99

--Turn: Focus on desal distracts from better solutions-Roberts Water in the Arab World: Perspectives and Prognosis 94

--US doesn't have influence to solve agreement-Soffer Rivers of Fire: The Conflict over Water in the Middle East 99

--US Can't Impose cooperation-Soffer

--Desal can't provide enough to satisfy Syria's agriculture-Soffer

Double Bind

- a. Golan prerequisite for peace
- b. Giving Syrian the Golan destroys Israeli security and causes WAR-

Clinton-same as before

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Everything extended thru block

2NR goes for desal turns on-case and counter-plan

UMKC

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 4

Team: UMKC BC

vs.: Kentucky JR

Aff case (country): Iran

Judge: Kimbrell - Case Western

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Clinton - Chinese WTO

A) Clinton must use political capital for China to get into the WTO - Mainichi Daily News, 11/18/1999, "the US president brushed aside"

B) Repealing ILSA would take enormous political capital - Israel lobbyists are more powerful and passing the law would be complicated - Fassihi, Pittsburgh Post Gazette, 4/18/1999, "for the Iran-Libya act"

C) WTO agreement key to US-Sino relations - BBC Summary of World Broadcasts, 11/19/1999, "agreement on China's accession"

D) Relations key to solving a Korean conflict, a Taiwan conflict, and proliferation - Peterson and Sonshine, Boston Globe, 10-23-1997, "we need to cooperate"

Khatami

A) Hardliners and moderates are continually battling for control - Khatami has support from the public but hardliners still have a strong power base - Los Angeles Times, 7/22/1999, "the contest for power"

B) Quick engagement like the plan would increase hardliners crushing Khatami - Sick, <http://stanleyfdn.org/conf/rpts/USFP/SPC98/iraniraq98/report.html>, 10-31-1998, "one participant cautioned"

C) causes islamic wars and war with Pakistan

Peace Process

A) Israel and Palestine committed to the Peace Process - Rubin, San Diego Union-Tribune, 11/17/1999, "with Israel energetically pursuing"

B) US softline stance on Iran makes Israel less willing to comply with the Peace Process - Steinberg, Middle East Review of International Affairs, Vol 2, No 3, 1998, "US policymakers should also understand"

C) Failure of the Palestine Peace Process causes nuclear war - Slater, Tikkun, Vol 14, No 2, 3/1/1999, "consequences of a breakdown"

Oil Advantage answers

1. Turkish pipeline will be built in the status quo - non unique the advantage - Gismatullin, Moscow Times, 11/19/1999, "the presidents of Turkey"

2. No chance for alternative Iranian investment - Boston Globe, 11/18/1999, "the 1240-mile pipeline"

3. No scenario or war implication

4. No Central Asian energy crisis - Johnson, Washington Times, 8/13/1999, "the good news"

5. US-Iranian ties can't stop the pipeline - investors will always choose Turkey - Petroleum Limited, 7/29/1999, "industry analysts have noted"

Proliferation advantage answers

1. sanctions check Iranian buildup potential - Eisenstadt, Survival, Autumn 1999, p.140-141
2. T - backing down to Iran destroys US credibility with Rogue Nations
3. Security assurance aren't sufficient to stop Iranian WMD prolifer - Eisenstadt, p. 129
4. Miscalculation scenario wrong - Arab states rational - Geers, Does Israel Need a Nuclear Bomb, 1997, p. 39-40
5. Israel won't preemptively launch - Beres, Between War and Peace Dilemmas of Israeli Security, 1996,
6. Limited risk of preemptive strikes
7. Iran won't seek weapons - their arguments are propaganda - Zunes, Middle East Policy, Vol V, No 2, 1997, p. 157

Bilateral Relations advantage answers

1. no impact read in the 1ac
2. absent pressure on Iran, increase terrorism and human rights abuses
3. no US-Iranian engagement: Khatami will always block it
4. engagement with Iran premature - lifting sanctions causes worldwide signal which increases terrorism
5. Iran support for terrorism decreasing

Negative Block

2NC extends Khatami and the case debate

- All their Khatami turns are solvency based, we'll win several different links to the disad
- 1) lifting sanctions cause commercial dealings
- 2) low key dialogue prompts hardliner backlash
- also argue that lifting sanctions are seen as US weakness which would embolden the hardliners
- argues that moderates control of Iran is key to avert a conflict in Afghanistan
- Hess, Boston Globe, 10/4/1998, "the escalating events"
- Hess, BG, 10/4/1998, "American diplomats and politicians"

lots of emphasis on sanctions curbing terrorism and military buildup

1NR extends the peace process disad and Clinton

- all their turns are long term and the impact swamps the case
- argues that their turns that say that Israel follows Iran assume the status quo which provides uniqueness to the disad
- reads a focus link to Clinton

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

2NR goes for the proliferation case turns and peace process

- uses the link arguments on Khatami to take out the relations advantage, conservatives will never cooperate.

UMKC

School: UMKC

Team(s): Baisley and Coffman

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of 1NC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

Clinton - WTO

Shunning

CUBA:

1NC Strategy

Exclude Title III Counterplan

International Law -

US Unwavering in support for Int'l Law now

-David Shamberger, 21 Boston College Int'l and Comp. Law Review 497, Summer, Lexis

Title III critical to int'l law - plan removal of it undermines revitalization

- Brice Claggett, 30 George Washington Journal of Int'l Law and Economics 271, 1996/7 L/N

Failure to React against Rogues causes global Instability

- Henriksen, www.hoover.stanford.edu/publications/epp/94/94a.html, '99 F-22 Disad -

Program in Jeopardy now - plan trades off with F-22s

- John Smagula, 21 North Carolina Journal of Int'l Law and Commercial Regulation 66, Fall, Lexis

- Mitch McConnell, FNS, March 20, Lexis
- LA Times, 10-1-91
- Dan Quayle, Heritage Lectures 630, Jan 21, 1999, www.heritage.org/library/lecture/h1630.html

Human Rights-

- Title III key to protect property rights which undergird all human rights
- Brice Claggett, 30 George Washington Journal of Int'l Law and Economics 271, 1996/7 L/N

IRAQ:

1NC Strategy

CP - Lift sanctions but don't do any CE with Iraq through US - instead, UN will CE

Oil

Peace Process:

- Barry Rubin, 9/16/99, "neither side wishes to pullout of" Proves Peace Process won't collapse
- Robert Zoellick, 97, www.bergen.com/morenews/iraqop149711201.htm
- Gerald Steinberg, 1998, "Israel & The United States..." Middle East Review of International Affairs, vol 2, no 3 (maybe 4?)
- Kenneth Geers, 1997, Does Israel need a nuclear bomb? ***
- Slater, March 1 99, Tikkun, "What's left of the peace process" no 2, vol 14
- Reich, Securing the Covenant, 1995, p ? & 112
- Phillips 98, Strategy for A Middle East Peace,
- Noyes, Foreign Policy, "Does Washington Really Support..." no 106, March 22 97
- Spigel & Breger, March 29 99, LA Times, "vital brick" **

Shunning

Clinton WTO

Famine Adv Ans

- sanctions not cause
- no internal link
- OFF solves
- Numbers exxagerated
- Iraq responsible
- Util best
- NW outweighs
- Evaluate consequences
- Nuclear use causes extinction

Credibility Adv Ans

- no social collapse
- no civil war
- no threat
- UN credibility e/d
- Rearth turn
- Appeasement - Iraq is a test case for prolif

UCO

UMKC CB

OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:

- US Iraq CP to lift sanctions without any conditions "Sanctions will be lifted" w/in 20 Assurance First LN 10/28/98
- T-Constructive Engagement is not re-imposition of sanctions "Directory of American Foreign Affairs '93
- International Law DA - plan removes Iraqi War Debts (Brower '92, Middle east Executive Reports LN)

BREAKDOWN OF THE BLOCK:

2NC

- CP
- Case

- 1NR
- Topicality
- International Law
- NEGATIVE TRICKS
- 2NR POSITIONS:
- CP SOLVES BETTER

- UMKC CW (IRAQ)
- OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:
- Condition CP on weapons inspector
- Grand Negotiator
- Oil
- Vagueness - Nearly All
- BREAKDOWN OF THE BLOCK:
- 2NC
- CP
- Rearm Turn
- 1NR
- Oil
- Grand Negotiator
- Case Answers
- NEGATIVE TRICKS
- 2NR POSITIONS
- CP
- Rearm T

- UMKC RL (UNKNOWN)
- OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:
- TSEA (?) - Financial times (10-28-99), Kim '99, Chicago Tribune '96
- Obuchi
- Conditions CP
- BREAKDOWN OF THE BLOCK:
- 2NC
- CP
- Case Debate
- 1NR
- Obuchi
- TSEA
- NEGATIVE TRICKS
- 2NR POSITIONS
- TSEA
- CP
- Case

- UMKC OS
- OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:
- Shunning
- Tourism
- Castro Sucks
- Embargo Solves
- Property Rights
- Military Turn

- UMKC RG
- OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:
- Exclude T3 CP
- Negotiator DA
- International Law DA
- Human rights DA - links off T3 is key to property rights shinning alternative
- F-22 DA - US liable for damages not compensated by Castro - IL spending tradesoff with f-22

- UMKC/SMS PR
- OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:
- Smart SX CP

- WTO Bad Winners Win
- Intrastate conflict
- Otherization

UNI

Japan counter-plan

- have them give aid instead of affirmative actor

Israel/Middle East peace process

Japan

Russia

- Russia wants a middle east peace role
Agence France Presse, July 1999
- Asian relationships fostered by plan encroach upon Russian Sphere of influence ? nationalists rise to power, proliferation and war
- Anarchy counter plan
- statism
- technology bad
- state = militarism
- obligation to reject

Oil Pipeline d/a

- pipeline could save Russian economy
- plan (Iran) = Russian encirclement = arms race and war

Clinton

WTO, political capital key to China, Focus is key, Helms opposes plan,

hardline approach is popular in congress, and the Israel lobby is powerful.

Topicality

- constructive engagement and sanctions exclusive
- constructive engagement is more than just lift sanctions
- Israel is not a topic country
- constructive engagement requires interference in internal affairs

European Union Counter-plan

- have the appropriate European actor do the affirmative

U.S. Israel Relations

- increased u.s. relations with Iran alienates Israel
- perception of abandonment = lashout

Shunning

- Beversluis, 1989, Public Affairs Quarterly, april, vol.3 #2
- Maxwell, July 17, 1999

UPS

WHITMAN

Whitman SW (Aff) vs. UPS GH (neg)

Round 5 Whitman

Case: Iran

Inc -

Gradualism CP: Offer Iran a package of gradual and reciprocal engagement linked to Iranian actions

Clinton/Peace Process: Syrian track coming now but needs Clinton focus capital to push funding

Case args: Solvency - 1. It's a bad time to act

2. Iran won't accept gestures

3. Moderates don't have any control

A2 Prolif adv - 1. US sanctioning Russia for Iran prolif now;

2. US-Iran normalization => Turkey/Russia/China alliance and war in the Caspian

A2 relations - 1. Reform only reflects domestic issues

2. Iran won't make concessions to the US

3. No way to solve hardline control

4. The hardliners won't go along with reformer plans

5. All empirically denied - no war yet

UPS TZ's answers to the Iraq 1AC

On case:

Schell card

Britain will veto

Prolif turns

IMF (their link is to getting them off the terrorist list)

Off case:

CP - fix oil for food and then offer Saddam a "lift sanctions for inspectors" deal

NATO - plan unites the coalition; restarts expansion; expansion leads to war with Russia. (Their uniqueness card says Europeans already want to keep an "open door" on expansion)

Clinton - Peace Process Funding scenario

2NR

CP

Case (but mostly CP)

UPS AE answers to Iraq Aff

Same as TZ except:

CP doesn't fix oil for food

They also run a Kurdish genocide turn on-case

They also run a Gordon card saying "Gordon wants to improve sanctions, not end them"

They run NTR Clinton

2NR

CP

NTR

Case

Tournament: Whitman Round: 6 Affirmative: Whitman BC Negative: University of Puget Sound AE

Offcase:

Lift food and medical sanctions Counterplan

Latin American Democracy

NTR

2NR:
Counterplan
NTR

Tournament: Whitman Round: 4 Affirmative: Whitman BC Negative: University of Puget Sound TZ

Negative Offcase:
NTR
Lift Food and Medical Sanctions and Ban Intervention Counterplan
Latin American democracy promotion DA

Case arguments:
System shock arguments
Rice
Cigars
Organic agriculture
IMF

WESTERN WASHINGTON

Tournament Western Washington Round: Finals Aff: Whitman BC Negative: UPS BL
INC Offcase Positions:
Pakistan: Rogue Credibility
NATO expansion
Clinton-Peace Process
Latin American Democracy Promotion: Gaffney is the impact
Just lift food and medicine sanctions

Oncase Positions
IMF
Rice
A few transition cards

2NR: Latin American Democracy Promotion
Clinton
Counterplan
Transition

Tournament: Western Washington Round: Quarterfinals Aff: Whitman BC Negative: UPS GR
INC Offcase Positions:
Clinton-NTR
Latin American Democracy Promotion

On Case:
Sustainable Agriculture DA
Castro at fault
Castro won't cooperate
System shock turn

2NR: Transition turns
Juragua impact

Tournament: Western Washington University Round 3 Aff: Whitman BC Neg: UPS TZ
INC Offcase args:
Counterplan: Lift food and medical sanctions and donate food and don't intervene in Cuba
Clinton: NTR
NATO Expansion
Latin American Democracy

Oncase:
IMF bad
Nanotech will solve
Cigars
Organic farming
Reefs
A few transition cards
Castro diverts

2NR:
Counterplan
Case turns
Latin American democracy

OREGON

University of Oregon (Rd. II)
Whitman BS (aff) vs. UPS CTR
Negative positions;
-Inflation
-Clinton (TSA bad)
-Topicality- policy-is strategy for action, not implementation
Case
-Cuban cigars turn

Iraq Aff vs. UPS EH

Off-cases

T – must do more than lift sanctions
CP – condition sanctions (Gause) Note: CP text says “revise” sanctions. Ev says Saddam accepts
“lifting of sanctions”
Debt Relief (Bipart, not Clinton)
A) Debt relief will pass now (note: says Republicans SPONSORED Debt Relief package too)
B) Congress wants hard-line on Iraq
C) Millions die without debt relief

On-case

It’s Saddam’s fault
Saddam would steal the money
Saddam has a moral obligation, too
Lifting Sanction leads to WMD attacks on Israel
Gause CP lifts our culpability
O4F solves
We can have moral sanctions

2NR

CP
Case

Iraq Aff vs. UPS AH

Off-cases

T – must do more than lift sanctions
Clinton – TSEA bad
Russia DA
A) Russia sees international relations as a zero-sum game
B) Humiliating the nationalists (by buddying-up with Iran) provokes a backlash
C) Nationalist backlash leads to World War
CP – Condition (Gause) Note: CP text says “revise” sanctions. Ev says Saddam accepts
“lifting of sanctions”

On-case

It’s Saddam’s fault
Lifting the sanctions leads to Iraqi WMD/launch on Israel
We have a moral obligation to stop WMD
Schell-type cards

2NR

Clinton
CP
Case

LEWIS & CLARK

UPS TY's neg strategy against Iraq

Off-case:

Gause CP (inspections for lifting sanctions deal)

Clinton – Taiwan tilt

Impact cite: Tucker '96 Washington Quarterly, Winter

Oil – Saudi Arabian economy

On-case:

We don't solve WMD (CP does)

Nuke war = greater moral imperative (the Schell card)

Saddam starves his people

2NR:

CP

Clinton

Schell card

WESTERN SCRIMMAGE

UPS GF (neg) vs. Whitman BS (unconditional Cuba) [VanHorn]

INC:

Inflation DA -- key cites: Internal-link . . . an increase in demand leads to inflation Austin-American Statesman, 7-1-99, "increased demand for U.S. products", Internal Link, Gannet News Service, 7-23-99, "inflation usually ends an economic expansion"

Clinton -- Political Capital -- Taiwan Impact

Military conflict could erupt, Kissinger, Houston Chronicle, "Taiwan's sudden and unilateral challenge to existing political"

Link

Impacts

Clinton could block the bill IBD 9-20-99, "bill is a clear statement that Taiwan's security"

The bill would cause World War III, Lampton 9-16-99 [congressional testimony] "were the proposed legislation to become law" w/50 "one of three or four flash-points in the world"

Shunning

Counter-plan: Text: The US government will amend its embargo to allow unrestricted sale of food and medicine to the people of Cuba as per the Dodd amendment, while reaffirming the embargo against the Castro regime. We will also cease to enforce the extra-territoriality of the Liberty and Democratic Solidarity Act. Solvency: St. Petersburg Times, 7-28-99 "Recognizing that sanctions should be used to influence"

Case arguments

2NC/1NR: kick inflation

2NR: go for Shunning and the counter-plan

UPS TZ (neg) vs. Whitman BS (unconditional Cuba) [Ellis]

INC:

Shunning

Counter-plan (similar to UPS GF's counter-plan round 4)

Inflation DA

Clinton -- political capital -- Taiwan (for cites: gzieger@hotmail.com)

Case arg -- Jaragua

Florida Times-Union 7-28-98, "two Soviet-style reactors at Jaragua"

Journal of Commerce 6-8-98, "Jaragua reactors are a case study in how not to build a power plant"

Neg team: UPS EH

Aff team/case: Whitman WW - Iran

INC off case: Shunnin', Clinton w/ Taiwan tilt scen (Clinton cred key to preventing congressional taiwan support, causes world war), Oil (Iranian pipeline allows russian control over the caspian, which is bad for some reason)

INC Case args: engaging won't decrease their military, case pimps about how the prolif scen is empirically denied, khatami scenario (philips turns but not philips cards, if I recall correctly)

2NR: Shunnin' shunnin', and more shunnin

Neg team: UPS TZ

Aff team: ran Cuba

INC off cases:

Economy – inflation

Clinton – one China

AFP 9/11/99 – GOP Taiwan Security Enhancement Act
Pastor '91 Washington Quarterly – Political Capital and Clinton
Seattle Times 10/15/98 – Anti-Castro leaders, Helms-Burton
Kissinger 9/5/99 – One-China policy would provoke war

CP – gives food, remove extra territorial

*Economy could apply

Perm CP

Run DA on CP

Answer Republican don't favor Cuba

1NC case args:

Solvency – nuke power plant – News Star February 22, '98 – Russia and Cuba Juragua Power Plant

Diaz – Balart '96 – Embargo provisions to halt investment in Juragua have cut investment

Neg: UPS Chris and Ron

Aff Team: ran Iraq

1NC off cases:

Clinton

Existentialism and State (“Exist. and State”)

Economy

CP w/is case w/ no moral obligation

To begin with it didn't have one (moral obligation?)

1NC case args:

oil for food

UPS GL v Iraq

1NC: Tiawan, Econ, Counterplan to offer Iraq a deal to remove sanctions in exchange for inspections

Notes: they let us takeout their solvency on the counterplan by arguing that Saddam would reject the deal; the point of the counterplan is not to have greater solvency but to take out our genocide impacts claiming that we are at fault by offering the deal to Saddam, when he rejects it, the judge no longer feels the responsibility to vote affirmative against the counterplan (they don't kick it, but win tiawan tilt as the net benefit)

Case args: black market turn, lifting sanctions allows WMD development, Iraq close to WMD

Round 3: Iraq Aff vs. UPS BM

Judge: Siver

1NC: Shunning and Tilt

Case args: lifting sanctions causes black market selling of supplies that leads to WMD and takes out genocide solvency, Iraq is close to nukes, Engagement leads to Iraqi development of WMD, US must overthrow Saddam

Notes: we turned “overthrow Saddam” and claimed keeping him in power was key to avoiding ME war;

Aff team: Iran case

Neg team: UPS IH

1NC off cases:

Clinton w/Taiwan appeasement act (plan decreases Clinton's ability to block support of Taiwan)

Oil (building Iranian pipeline leads to Caspian instability)

Shunning

1NC case args:

Khatami doesn't have power now

Engagement doesn't solve prolif

Khatami doesn't want engagement

2NR:

Shunning

Utah

WHITMAN

AFF

Whitman Tournament Rd # 3

Whitman CO vs. Utah

North Korea

OFF CASE

T-CE is more than diplomacy

T- consult proves resolution insufficient

Spanos

UT Dallas

WAKE

Texas - Dallas

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 5

Team: Texas at Dallas JK

vs.: George Washington BS

Aff case (country): North Korea

Judge: Lynch

INC Off-Case Arguments

Japan CP - Japan will send food aid to North Korea

Deep ecology -

Alan S. Miller, Gaia Connections, 91

Michael Zimmerman, Contesting Earth's Future, 94

Weigel, Earth Cancer, 95

Shunning

Inflation - cards outdated by next weekend

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

"Deep ecology is real good" (our claim)

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 6

Team: Texas at Dallas FS

vs.: Lewis and Clark HS

Aff case (country): Iran

Judge: Berube

INC Off-Case Arguments

Topicality - CE demands economic assistance - requires both carrots and sticks plus - reject old model (RSA) for a new model "active interventionist policy"

Russian Nationalism DA

- Coming elections uncertain - Stratfor 11/10/99 www.stratfor.com/cis/countries

- Plan decreases domestic support, which is key - Stratfor 10/3/99 Global Intelligence Update

- War impact - Ponarin, Security Implication of the Russian Identity Crisis (PONARS) Memo 64

Deddevelopment Kritik

- Rethinking essential - Muri and Venendall 96, Earthtalk 96 p.131-2

- CE causes economic development - Vondanovich 98, CE and Constructive Intervention

- Impact - Kothari, Rethinking Development p.183-4

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

2NC kicks deddevelopment and goes for Russia

- only fascists will launch nukes - Shaposhnikov 5-16-97 Kremlin International News Broadcast

- kills 400 million - Wojcik Fall 96, Western Folklore p.297

- focus on Middle East - Heritage Foundation 4-16-98, L/N Report "the state of Russian foreign policy"

- post-NATO expansion fears of sphere of influence - Ferry 97, The Foreign Policy of the Russian Federation p.197

- Iran link - Ferry 97

- foreign policy key - Shearman 97, The FP of the Russian Fed, p. 21 "four important reasons"

Texas - Dallas

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1

Team: Texas-Dallas FS

vs.: West Georgia EG

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: Ellis

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Topicality

CE must be interventionist and give economic aid

Russia

A) elections put Russia on the brink of a nationalist takeover

B) Russia sees Iraq as a way to show its independence from the West (Blank 97)

C) nationalist takeover causes ethnic conflict and war (Potter 99)

Dedevlopment

A) Fiat is utopian, we must rethink technological development (Muir & Vadall, Earthtalker, 1996)

B) CE used to further economic development (Vodanovich 98)

C) Must reject the development mindset ; it leads to arms races, militarism and conflict

Israel

We must consult them to have good relations and prevent a Syrian land grab

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

They go big for dedevlopment and the topicality argument to lock them into it

Texas - Dallas

School: U. Texas - Dallas

Team(s): JK, SF

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

Russian Nationalism:

Russian elections will be canceled if "Yeltsin Family" feels they'll lose too much power resulting in a right-wing extremist take-over, which we all die from. Plan makes Yeltsin look bad b/c he is pinning his hopes on strong non-encircled Russian foreign presence.

Shunning

We all have a fundamental moral obligation to shun the hate. Plan fails to do that they are immoral.

Israel

A host of scenarios as long as my arm, but two major ones -

1. Barak Credibility - If Barak gives up Golan he loses domestic support and Palestinian Peace Process Tanks.

2. Relations - CE to Iran pisses off Israel and a reduction in relations leads to Israeli insecurity and Syrian land grab. War ensues.

Economy

Goldilocks economy exists now. The plan makes the economy too hot or too cold and it collapses taking the world down with it.

MAI

Sanctions against Iran/Cuba are the only thing keeping the multi-lateral agreement on investment from passing in this month's WTO Forum. Lifting them will allow for vast globalization, economic collapse, loss of human rights, and environmental destruction.

De-development

The world's development model stinks and oppresses the world's populations.

Somehow (case-by-case basis) the affirmative entrenches this development model (claims tech good, capitalism good, we can teach them the better way etc.) and therefore should be rejected.

Targeted Sanctions C/P

Text varies. Basic premise is counter-plan lifts all trade sanctions on target nation, but keeps financial sanctions, travel bans, and arms embargoes targeted at the country's elites. Provides the optimum mix of shunning and avoiding human rights concerns.

Japan C/P

Text varies. Japan does whatever form of CE the plan does. Example: Sends Syria desal tech, or sends the boy scouts to feed North Koreans. This avoids the disads and increase Japanese soft power in Asia which provides better security.

School: U.Texas - Dallas
Team(s): SF

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):
Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

- Shunning
- DeDevelopment
- Russia
- Hardline T
- Vagueness

CUBA:
INC Strategy
Juragua
MAI

UCO

UT-DALLAS VL
OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:
- Shunning (Belurusus)
- Economy (Mead '98)
- MAI (Moberg)

UT San Antonio

UCO

UTSA QM

OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:

- Solvency
- Globalization
- Russian Nationalism
- Case Neg

Vermont

WILLIAM JEWELL

VERMONT FS

Against Emporia CW (Cuba):

- Juragua
- Readiness
- Sustainable Agriculture DA

WAKE

Vermont

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 2

Team: Vermont SM

vs.: Texas SR

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: Lynch - John Carroll

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Topicality -

A. Interpretation

1. USFG - this would be the government of the United States who has actors that passes laws that put economic sanctions on Iraq and other countries
2. Adopt - adopt has some meaning - Wordsmyths Educational Dictionary, 1999 "to accept by voting for" synonyms: pass, enact, approve, vote for, sanction, ratify, endorse, back

B. Violations

1. Affirmative must support that the USFG should adopt the lifting of sanctions against Iraq and have constructive engagement with Iraq
2. Affirmative must support the adoption of this action by the Federal Government by proving a policy should be passed, enacted, or approved

C. Topicality is a voting issue - the topic serves the purpose of dividing ground and provides fair warning for the negative team which allows for critical in depth analysis of affirmative discourse and arguments as opposed to breadth on many issues that shifts focus constantly to prevent critical evaluations.

Kritik - the Gulf War Did not Take Place

A. the liberatory and consciousness raising used by the affirmative to respond to the violence of the system uses us as subjects to their speech act, which only serves to strengthen the system, which means that their efforts will always fail and only be coopted into the violence - Baudrillard, *Simulacra and Simulation*, 1994, p.85-6

B. The impulse to action forces us into passing the plan "in vitro" accepting the reality fed to us through the spectacle of images, which only creates new spectacles. We have all now become hostages to the Iac simulation of the people's suffering, but we are only distanced and complicitous to it because it of the hyperreality that has been multiplied and deployed as a strategy to pass a policy - Baudrillard, *The Gulf War Did Not Take Place*, 1995, p. 28-9

C. The affirmative recreates the same kind of hyperrealism that existed during the Gulf non-war through their speech act. This dooms our interactions with Iraq to fail because we don't recognize its hyperreality, but rather act as if it is real and we become video-zombies, i.e. subjects, to the events displayed before us. Resistance to the probability of any image or information through the kritik is key to recognizing and subverting the system of simulation - Patton, *The Gulf War Did Not Take Place*, 1995

D. We might like to flatter ourselves by saying that the system who annihilated Iraq can now revive the population, but this only reveals our entrenched hyperreality and its inability to deal with or understand real events. The plan uses their simulated deaths to strengthen the system, which only furthers the Iraqi extermination - Baudrillard, *Simulacra and Simulation*, 1994, p. 11

E. 1. The D subpoint explains that accepting the reality of the Iac without questioning reifies the strength of the system. And, even if the affirmative believes that they are resisting the truths that the system has created, their use of the system to deploy their own strategy ensures that their dissidence is and will be coopted by the indifference of the system - Baudrillard, *Simulacra*, p.163-4

2. Resistance to the real through criticism is key to challenge complicity - Patton, *Gulf War Did Not Take Place*, 1995

On the case:

- 1) the aff performance of the narration of the experiences of Iraqi children removes the experience from the situational tragedy - few implications

- a) the experience of the children afraid, dreaming of corpses is recorded by western journalists. The text therefore automatically assumes their lense
- b) the transference of this experience into a text trough the lips of the Iac and onto our flows transforms the experience from the tragedy to a tool not only to pass a policy, but to win a debate
- c) this transference changes the meaning of the suffering. This distances u from the suffering, turns back the psychic distancing argument
- d) the recreation of these experiences is an attempt to evoke an emotion in you, however, you and I cannot understand
- 2) globalization bad
 - Economic sanctions force the creations of Import Substitution Industries and Self-sufficiency - Selden, Economic Sanctions as Instruments of American Foreign Policy, 1999
 - ISI is a major obstacle to extreme planetary globalization - Khan, Globalization, Growth, and Marginalization, 1998
 - Economic growth and globalization threatens billions and environment destruction - Deleage, Is Capitalism Sustainable, 1994
- 3) Identity/Difference
 - Engaging in foreign policy creates self/other dualisms and forces conversion and annihilation of the other - Campbell, Writing Security: United States Foreign Policy and the Politics of Identity, revised edition, 1998
 - As the state works to convert the other, it also seeks to solidify its own identity through containing contingency, which means that any criticisms against it are coopted and used to maintain the power of the state - Campbell

Negative Block

2NC extended the kritik -

- 7 links:

- 1) subjectivity - the use of graphic images to evoke an emotional response forces us to move towards the plan
- 2) liberation - moral claims coopt criticism - satisfies the need for emptiness, but emptiness is everywhere
- 3) problem/solution mindset - treating Iraqis as problems to be solved otherizes them and prevents criticism.
- 4) Distancing - using Iraqis distances us from them
- 5) Deterrence - moral strategies are used as a deterrent against critical resistance
- 6) Judge ballot - the idea of the ballot reifies the state
- 7) Plan is an assimilating procedure of the Iraqis

A2: We solve the doubling

- 1. feeds the subjectivity link
- 2. doesn't answer the other links
- 3. makes the state look good, causes reification

A2: No alternative

- 1. alternative is the wrong assumption - forces us into an alternative before considering what actually is happening
- 2. can resist complicity
- 3. our alternative is nihilism(continuously engaging in criticizing), the aff forces intellectual terrorism

A2: kritik trivializes suffering

- 1. not our advocacy - we just advocate that your solution is flawed
- 2. on the globalization debate

The 1NR extends topicality and the turns on case, with emphasis on the globalization debate

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

The 2NR goes for the kritik and the globalization debate

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 2

Team: Vermont MS

vs.: George Washington BS

Aff case (country): North Korea

Judge: Reid

1NC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Plan vagueness

Japanese TMD

- A) Decreasing threat perceptions stop Japanese TMD development
[Stratfor 99]
- B) TMD solves multiple scenarios for conflict
[Jane's 10/1/99]

Regime Collapse

- A) Lack of US influence leaves wavering regime in control
- B) Causes war

NMD

Congress perceives threats from North Korea, spurs NMD killing the ABM and sparking Asian instability

IMF - plan causes it; its bad

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

TMD

Case Turns

Development [see 1st case list section]

Vermont

School: Vermont

Team(s): MS

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

Topicality

must be all because nearly all is ambiguous

Ecofeminism kritik

Capitalism bad

NMD

Lifting Sanction---New threat-Pressure for NMD--- Asian Destabilizes

CP - Do plan not lift sanctions

Development Kritik

Discourse and characterization of IAC is one of "underdeveloped"

Solvency Advocate

Middle East Peace Agreement

Proliferation

lifting sanctions key to nuclear terrorism

Weapons of Mass Destruction

Dependency Bad turns

-sanctions good ? increase self sufficiency

-self sufficiency superior

Vermont - Negative

School: Vermont

Team(s): MS

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

1. Development Discourse

Development economics places a negative stigmatization of 3/5ths of the global population and is dehumanizing

Raff Carmen 1996, Autonomous Development

Development terminology must be abandoned to have hope for change

Carmen 1996

2. NMD

Clinton will wait till June to pass NMD

Walsh 1999, The Times-Picayune

Clinton is collaborating with Yeltsin to save the ABM

Hackett 1999, Insight on the News

Perception of increased threat will lead to Clinton passing NMD

Broder 1999, NYT

Early NMD will break the ABM and destabilize Asia
Financial Times 1999, "Missile Shield"

CUBA:
INC Strategy
3. Juragua

Helms Burton prevents Juragua from being built
Minitner 1998, Journal of Commerce

Cuba needs investment to finish the plant
Nuclear Engineering International, June 2 1999

Juragua threatens 80 million lives
Minitner 1998

NORTH KOREA:
INC Strategy
4. North Korean Collapse

Sanctions prevent regime collapse
Rudd 1999, War & Peace on the Korean Peninsula

Regime collapse leads to bloody war
Natsios 1999, Northeast Asia Peace and Security Network Special Report

5. Nuclear Weapons Free Zone

SOUTH CAROLINA

Vermont FS
-Globalism
-National Missile Defence
-Realism
-Accidental War
-T- adopt and extra

Vermont
-NMD Lifting Sanction---New threat^xPressure for NMD--- Asian
Destabilizes
-C/P: Do plan not lift sanctions
-Development Kritik: Discourse and characterization of 1AC is one of
^O^Ounderdeveloped^O
-Solency Advocate
-T not remove of ^Onearly all^O
-Case^xN/K will not accept

UNI

Middle East Peace Agreement

Proliferation
-lifting sanctions key to nuclear terrorism

Weapons of Mass Destruction

Dependency Bad turns
-sanctions good ? increase self sufficiency
-self sufficiency superior

Wake Forest
IMF / World Bank Counter-plan
-United States government will lift sanctions against [] but will
keep the
prohibition on loans from the IMF and the World Bank
Clinton
-must avoid risky behavior ? now is key to China^Os admittance into the
WTO, and reform within China

Modernization

-Sanctions cripple military production, lifting them risks nuclear war

Appeasement

-Hardline sends a signal ? weakness = proliferation and war

Oil

-Sanctions collapse the oil market when lifted ? over-saturation

Exclude lifting "IMF support" sanctions counter-plan

-IMF creates economic collapses / liquidity crisis

-www.cato.org and heritage foundation websites

Japan 6 party talks counter plan

Wake Forest

WILLIAM JEWELL

WAKE FOREST AS

Against Kansas RS (Cuba):

- Venezuela position: Democracy in Venezuela on brink; plan = bad signal; democracy reversal = war (Diamond 1999).
- Columbia position: Economy key to opposition forces; lifting sanction gives Castro money for Colombian guerillas; = civil war, which will spread.
- Counterplan: Remove all extra-territorial applications of Helms-Burton. No advantages.

WAKE FOREST LS

Against Concordia SK (Syria):

- Oil
- Russia Relations
- Israel Relations
- Terrorism
- CP: Exclude IMF

USC

Wake Forest AF: Atchison and Filstrup

Negative Positions:

- T CE is more than lifting sanctions
- Reparations DA: Sanction Lift guts Gulf War reparations which is key to International Law. International Law Good
- Appeasement DA
- CP Fix oil for food infrastructure monitoring, but don't lift sanctions.

North Korea Neg:

- T - adopt a policy of CE
- Vagueness
- Kim Jae Dung Credibility - consultation is key, impact is alliance and tension
- CP - Feminist engagement
- Feminist IR critique - Tichner
- Case Turns - ROK civ mil relations - coup impact, momentum/timing - plan locks in tension, military focus = preemptive war, fast liberalization kills ag reform - starvation impact

Negative Positions:

- Topicality- government
- US-ally relations - plan upsets Russia-China
- MidEast relations - causes Iran prolif
- Plan kills Iraqi containment regime - causes prolif and war
- Realism critique
- Case turns

HARVARD

Tournament: Harvard

Judge: Dave Hingstman

Jess/Charles v. Wake FL

INC off case

T

Clinton—Debt Relief

Appeasement (Iraq prolif, terrorism, rogue credibility, and perception based wars)

Expand O4F CP
Israel

INC case
deaths over-stated
economy is okay now
dual-use solvency takeout (they'll classify anything useful as dual-use)
O4F good (berger)
Trade increases inflation
Saddam diverts
We don't demonize Arabs
Evaluate nuclear war first
Kurds turn

Wayne State

WILLIAM JEWELL

WAYNE STATE GH

Against Texas DM (Iraq):

- Topicality: UN not Iraq; End to bombing not constructive engagement.
- Pakistan: Generic sanctions credibility to Pakistan; Proliferation, Terrorism, etc...
- Military Modernization: Threaten peace/Cause Israeli preempt.
- Kurdish Genocide
- CP: OFF expansion, food aid, stop bombing.
- Case: Food crisis over; Rollback; Shunning; UN refusal.

WAKE

Wayne State

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1

Team: Wayne State GL

vs.: UMKC BC

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: Renegar - Kansas

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

T - Pushing for UN lifting of sanctions constructively engages with other countries. Guts our ability to run agent counterplans

Clinton

- a) WTO faces congressional opposition, but will pass now - Agence France Press 11-16-1999 "difficult and tough struggle"
- b) Lifting sanctions guts Clinton's political capital - Eland, Economic Sanctions, 1995, p.33 "future easing of sanctions"
- c) Clinton's political capital is key to a successful WTO deal - Newsday, 11-16-1999, "a country can't be a WTO member"
- d) A WTO deal is critical to maintaining strong US-Sino relations - CSM, 11-16-1999, "after the two sides"
- e) Strong relations key to avert war - Conable and Lampton, Foreign Affairs, Winter 1993, p. 143 "that expand to suck"

Oil Prices

- a) OPEC is holding to production quotas - prices for oil will only increase in the future - Economist, 9-18-1999, "discipline demonstrated by the cartel"
- b) Lifting Iraq sanctions will allow Iraq to flood the oil market, which will harm the Saudi economy - Rubin, Jerusalem Post, 2-5-1998, "once sanctions are lifted"
- c) A decline in the Saudi Arabian economy would lead to civil war and send the world into recession - Lynch, USA Today, 3-22-1999, "if the financial outlook worsens"

Kurds

- a) Oil for Food controls oil revenues to assure they are used to meet humanitarian needs - American Friends Service Committee, www.afsc.org/iraq/docsfull.htm, 1-22-1999, "a thorough system of monitoring"
- b) Lifting sanctions gives Saddam the freedom and resources to destroy his own troubling minorities - Lopez, Common Wealth, 9-11-1998, "what sanctions protestors fail to acknowledge"
- c) The genocide of the Kurds will be renewed - Toronto Star, 12-20-1998, "who can forget"

CP - Reform Oil for food

The oil for food program will be modified to end the diversion of funds to the Gulf War Compensation Fund. All monies will go directly to the purchase of food, medicine, and infrastructure essential to health

Observation 1: Solvency

- The Counterplan supplies the funds needed to meet the basic needs of the Iraqi people - Zunes, Foreign Service Journal, February 1999, p. 3, "Iraq's primary source"
- Oil for food as currently structured supplies 3/4 if the needed amount - Houston Chronicle, 1-15-1999, "Iraq now is allowed"
- Suspending the Gulf War Compensation diversion will provide the additional \$1 billion - Gause, Foreign Affairs, 5/6-1999, "suspending payments to the Gulf War"

Observation two: topicality - the counterplan doesn't remove any sanctions

Observation three: Competitiveness

- the CP is net beneficial. It has the advantage of directed spending and thus avoids any risk of the Das - Mideast Mirror, Vol 13, No 108, 6-9-1999, "our response has been"

Israeli Preemption

- a) Uniqueness/Link - lifting sanctions will allow Saddam to quickly rebuild his nuclear weapons program - Cordesman, Revolution in Military Affairs and Development in the Persian Gulf, September 1, 1999, p.36-7, "previous contingencies assume"
- b) Impact - Iraqi threat will cause Israel to preemptively strike leading to nuclear war - St Petersburg Times, 7-26-1998, "Israel has a strategic capability"

Army rearm

- a) Iraq's present military forces are a threat to no one - Ritter, Endgame, 1999
- b) Lifting sanctions provides Iraq with the economic resource to rebuild its military - Zinni, Federal News Service, 4-13-1999, "UN-imposed sanctions have helped"
- c) Iraq will dominate the region and threaten the world - Kemp, Survival, Winter 1998-9, p.135 "Iraq would have become"

On case

UN Credibility

Terrorism

- lifting sanctions towards nations who resist international norms invites aggression and international anarchy - henrickson, 1999 www.hoover.stanford.edu/publications/epp/94/94a.html
- Terrorist threats increase with increase US involvement in the Middle East - Eland, Policy Analysis, May 5, 1998, www.cato.org/pubs/pas/pa-306.pdf

Overthrow

- The removal of sanctions will cause the US to revert to a disastrous policy of overthrow - Ritter, Endgame, 1999
- An attempted overthrow would lead to another bay of pigs - Time, 11-8-1999, p. 48 "loyalty of many divisions"

Negative Block

Everything extended

2NC extends Disads on case, the Oil for Food Counterplan, the Kurdish abuse DA, the Israeli preemption DA,

- extends heavily that UN won't comply unless Iraq agrees to weapons inspections, argues as a 100% solvency takeout
- argues that the permutation to the counterplan is a sever permutation because the Oil for food program is an exception to the sanctions, the sanctions have to be in place for the program to apply
- reads democracy promotion bad against the democracy turns on the Kurds DA

INR goes for the Saudi Oil DA, the morality advantage, and the Clinton Disadvantage

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

2NR goes for the disads on case, the morality answers, the Oil for Food counterplan, and the democracy turns on the Kurdish genocide disad

- Plan is reverse causal, Iraqi concessions for weapons inspections necessary for UN compliance but the aff relies on lifting sanctions to get inspectors in, means the UN wouldn't comply, takes out 100% solvency and the turns on the disads because sanctions never actually get lifted. If Saddam agrees to inspections, then sanctions are inevitably lifted in the status quo, vote negative on presumption.
- The permutation is a sever permutation, wouldn't lift all economic sanctions, is an automatic voting issue.

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1

Team: Wayne State BW

vs.: Texas EG

Aff case (country): Iran, Iraq, Syria

Judge: Helwich

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Overhaul DA

O'Quinn, <http://usaengage.org/studies/users.html>, 1997

Sen. Lugar, FDCH, 7/21/99

Henriksen, <http://www.hoover.stanford.edu/publications/epp/94/94a.html>

Phoenix

Tanter, Rogue Regimes, 98, p. 87

Cordesman, The Revolution in Military Affairs and Development in the Persian Gulf, 9/1/99

Jerusalem Post, 2/5/98

Foreign Affairs, Jan/Feb 99

USA Today 2/22/99

Kurds

<http://www.afsc.org/iraq/docsfull.htm>

Commonwealth, 9/11/98

Toronto Star, 12/20/98

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Can't escape orientalism. Ahhhhhh! Let me out!

Case entrenches Western hegemony.

Wayne State

School: Wayne State

Team(s): All

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

(Against Cuba)

Topicality: Can't just lift sanctions.

Topicality: Nearly all must be specified.

Clinton: CTBT Good, political capital internal link, uniqueness that says CTBT is on the brink from 9-13-99

- 2NC uniqueness evidence is from 9-14 and says CTBT will pass if it gets out of committee

Overhaul Disad:

- A: Sanctions are applied ad hoc and haphazardly - O'Quinn, '97 (www.usaengage.org/studies/users.html)
- B: A reform movement is building now and has bipartisan support - Lugar, 7-21-99 (FDCH "parenthetically")
- C: Reform efforts are driven by costs of existing policies - lifting sanctions eliminates that pressure - Henriksen, '99 (www-hoover.stanford.edu/publications/epp/94/94a.html)
- D: Impact of US sanctions policies outweigh case - Mueller and Mueller, May/June '99 (Foreign Affairs "most part still merely theoretical")

Solvency:

- Consequentialism is good for defining morality
- Can't have rights without life
- Canada proves CE fails - Menendez, Congressional Digest, March '99, p. 79
- Castro won't cooperate - The Economist, 1-17-98 "Mr. Castro's worst nightmare"
- Lifting the Embargo increases the likelihood of a post-Castro civil war - Abrams, '98 (www.foreignrelations.rog/public/pubs/cuba_61.html)
- Economic engagement will push Cubans to the worst form of capitalism - Newsweek, 1-18-99, "part of young Cubans frustration"
- Lifting the embargo strengthens Castro - money flows into the regime without any hope of change - Abrams, above
- Castro will use aid to undermine Latin American democracy - Holmes, 95 (cite in round one report)
- Shunning is also read on the case - Beversluis evidence
- Rogue State Appeasement - Lifting sanctions hurts deterrence, encourages adventurism, risking global anarchy - Henriksen, 99 (www-hoover.stanford.edu/publications/epp/94/94a.html)

Coercion: only analytical arguments

- Your evidence assumes that trade is key to solve.
- Turn: You steal property from Cuba
- Travel is limited now domestically
- No evidence that Castro will negotiate on property
- Turn: You coerce Cubans
- Rescher doesn't assume Cuba
- Gewirth is not specific to Cuba

Health: only analytical arguments

- Other nations give stuff to Cuba
- Your evidence assumes the US is key
- No evidence that the US is key
- Normand doesn't apply if we win a nuclear war
- No evidence that plan spurs investment
- No evidence that plan gives aid

Arguments Extended in the Negative Block (New Link Stories, Cites, Time Allocation, etc)

Everything except for T extended in the block.

2N spends a lot of time on Overhaul and Clinton

Neg Strategy in Rebuttals (key arguments, tricks, things they kick out of)

They try to kick Clinton despite a 1AR straight turn by extending 2AC arguments that were not in the 1AR.

They go for overhaul, and they argue that the impact is that in the SQ, sanctions will be reformed to solve the case.

KINGS

Wayne State University JM

Against Allegheny PS:

Disads: sanctions are haphazard, CTBT jeopardized

Other good arg's: turns: reunification bad, trade war with Japan, TMD jeopardized, power vacuum in asia

Wayne State University EW

Against GWU MS:

T Viol: Nearly all_close approx all

Disads: Clinton(CTBT), Sanctions reform movement(Lugat '99, Hendrickson '99)
Sanctions Leg too piecemeal, Aff ; Shunning(Kritik)

CP: none

Other good Arg's: AFF - DMZ = Wildlife sanctuaries, uniques to species copt kills species

Wayne State University AD

Plan: CE in Cuba

Adv: Cuban society, Civil rights

UNI

Clinton

-CTBT good, political capital link, removal of sanctions takes capital,
Clinton needs all he can get to get it past Helms

Topicality

-nearly all

Shunning

Overhaul

-lifting sanctions stops support for the Sanctions Reform Act, which is critical to reigning in all sanctions

No aid counterplan

-do the affirmative but do not allow the government to give aid except to

NGO^Øs

Objectivism

-using tax money to fund other countries is bad

lift sanctions counter-plan but ban government aid

-solvency from trade liberalization

-objectivism net benefit

The Box

-affirmative constructs harms and solvency from a mainstream,international relations perspective, excluding alternative voices.Rejecting the affirmative creates space for others.

Weber State

WILLIAM JEWELL

WEBER STATE MW

Against Northern Illinois DP (North Korea):

- Globalization Kritik
- Topicality: Constructive Engagement and Extra/Effects
- Clinton - NTR
- CP: NGO; Brecher and Costello in 1994

WAKE

Weber State

School: Weber State

Team(s): ZH

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

Generic Negative Strategy:

NGO Consultation C/P

Russian Nationalism

MAI D/A

Clinton

Marxism/Neoliberalism Critique

Including T

Country Specific Negative Strategy:

Cuba-

MAI D/A

Sustainable agriculture turns

Transition turns

Tourism turns

Snowball arguments

Iran-

Khatami Credibility

Gradual/Conditional C/P

Hormuz/Bosphorus Straits

Oil Shock/Nigerian Economy

Israel

Saudi Arabia Relations D/A

Iraq-

Iran relations

prolif turns

Hunger/Rights turns

Extra T/Fiat Abuse

North Korea-

Case/Solvency turns

China D/A

Syria-

Assad turns

Water war turns

Peace Process turns

Israel

Oil Shock

LEWIS & CLARK

Lewis and Clark Rd 6

Affirmative CO (Iran) vs. Weber HZ

Paul Veillon

INC off-case

T—CE is more than lifting sanctions

CP: consult all relevant NGOs

K—International Marxism (imperialism)

MAI

Hormuz (an extremism turn off-case)

INC Case arguments

Extremism

1. Khatami has no power
2. on the brink of a revolution
3. Engagement hurts Khatami

Prolif

1. inevitable
2. you increase terrorism
3. hard currency
4. hardliners in control now

Caspian

Russia disad

1. Russia and the US fight now
2. Nationalists rally around a loss of their sphere
3. big-ass impact

Solvency

1. NGOs can solve
2. more extremism args

2NR

Kritik, Counterplan, Hormuz, Caspian

Western Washington

WHITMAN

WWU FP (neg) v. Whitman SW (aff)

Round 3: NFC-Whitman Tournament

Case: Iran

INC:

Policy T:

Policy means definite course of action

Plan is vague – no indication of how or where dialogue occurs

Neg interpretation best – it is only way to avoid vague skewing of the debate by the aff, aff must prove a better interpretation, not just an alternate one

VI – fair and predicatable ground

Globalization:

Movements stop free trade

The plan causes free trade

Globalization causes the ultimate Impact

Democracy promotion (off-case case turn):

The aff promotes democracy

Empirically, democracy promotion fails

Geopolitics:

Geopolitics lets the state decide who's a threat

The plan entrenches realism with its link to national security

Discourse shapes political action

The plan is based upon flawed assumptions – reject it

Case:

1. No evidence of WMD

Iran peaceful

Iran is decreasing military spending

Iran doesn't want war

Threat exaggerated

Neg Block: 2NC spends 9 minutes on Geopolitics, 1NR extends other arguments

2NR: Geopolitics (concedes 1AR vagueness VI)

AFF

Whitman Tournament Rd # 6

Whitman CO vs. WWU NV

North Korea

OFF CASE

T-consult

T-definite course of axn (consult)

Author Advocacy

Democracy Promotion (regime collapse)

Realism K

CASE

1. No threat of invasion

2. No weapons program

3. Survival not key

4. Can't invade

AFF

Whitman Tournament Rd # 2

Whitman CO vs. WWU FP

North Korea

OFF CASE

T-you use the UN

T-consult

Globalization (trade bad)

Democracy Promotion (regime collapse)

Realism K/Critical Geopolitics

CASE

1. no collapse <>
2. aid doesn't help <>
3. aid isn't divered <>
4. no danger from rogues <>
5. no threat of invasion <>
6. bad economy stop military <>
7. no lashout from bad economy <>
8. won't revive weapons program <>

WWU PF's answers to the Iraq Aff

On case

O4F solves – (oil caps lifted; infrastructure repairs will start next year; they can still get food; 1284 solves)

Bombings are what's killing them

Britain vetoes

US is waging war on Iraq (never got developed; don't know what they're trying to get here)

Iraqi economy can never solve

Off case

T – hands off (we have to end the bombing)

Democracy promotion – lifting sanctions increases democracy promotion; democracy promotion bad

Globalization – (use the Norton-Taylor card in 1AC as a link; they have nothing to say this will overwhelm their uniqueness story about movements which are beating back globalization in the SQ)

Geo-Politics – They have some pretty good links saying that, in the past, advocates of lifting economic sanctions have excluded military sanctions, thus justifying military sanctions and bombing.

Tournament: Whitman Round: 1 Aff: Whitman BC vs. Western Washington VN

Negative Offcase:

Juragua

Shrimp (Canadian Geographer, "Socialism and the Fishery: A Case Study of the Cuban Shrimp Fishery," spring 19990

Organic Agriculture

Rice

Author Advocacy

On Case: A few transition cards

2NR: Juragua, case, shrimp

OREGON

University of Oregon

Whitman BS (Aff) vs. WWU NW

Negative Positions

Rice

Gore-2000 w/ Kyoto impact

-Case

Iraq Aff vs. WWU

Off-cases

- T – CE = hands-off
- CP – exclude dual-use tech
- Israel DA
 - A) Israel wants sanctions on Iraq (Silver '98)
 - B) Saddam would use his WMD against Israel

On-case

- Prolif Turns
- O4F solves better
- Britain blocks solvency
- It's Saddam's fault
- We don't meet the moral imperative because we keep bombing them

2NR

- CP
- Case
- Israel (?)

LEWIS & CLARK

Affirmative CO (Iran) vs. WWU GV

1NC off-case

- T—engagement like marriage
- Consult Israel CP
- Israel encirclement
- Author Advocacy (solvency problem)

1NC Case arguments

- Barak wants the US out of the Peace Process
- Khatami will reject engagement
- Free trade props up bad regimes

2NC reads a kritik of saying “Islamic fundamentalism”

2NR

CP, Israel, and the new kritik

Aff Team: Whitman BS

Neg Team: Western Washington WW

Tournament: Lewis and Clark

Round: 2

Judge: Paul Veillon

1NC Off Case Arguments:

- Counterplan: Maintain sanctions and offer biomass in exchange for cancellation of Juragua
- Constructive engagement T: constructive engagement keeps hands off internal affairs
- MAI
- Shunning on case

2NR: Counterplan

WESTERN SCRIMMAGE

Round 2: Aff (Iraq) vs. WWU GV

Judge: Harris

- 1NC: MAI, CE topicality, Counterplan to not lift arms control and condition re-imposing sanctions
- Case args: sanctions stop WMD, Britain wants hardline, oil DA as a case turn, solvency deficit with Goss who wants to condition lifting sanctions, negotiations stalled

Aff team: (Iran) Jess and Charles

Neg Team: WWU NP

1NC off case:

Topicality: Constructive engagement is imposing some sanctions
MAI
Israel encirclement
Consult Israel

INC case args:
Khatami card
Prolif card
Solvency card

2NR:
some case cards
consult
encirclement

Aff team/case: whitman ww - Iran

neg team: Western PN

INC off case: Israeli encirclement
consult israel CP
MAI

INC on case: philips turns
sanctions prevent military buildup

2NR: consult CP and encirclement

West Georgia

DARTMOUTH

Round 6

Aff neg judge

Emory West Georgia Harris

1AC: slightly different plan: The USFG should adopt a policy of constructive engagement with the government of Cuba including the immediate Congressional removal of all economic sanctions, the opening of dialogue with the government of Cuba to peruse normalization of relations, and authorization of the negotiation of compensation agreement.

Advantages claimed: Social Implosion & Health/Hunger

1NC: Statism, Gendertivity, CP lift embargo but don't engage with diplomacy/compensation agreement, Agent Specification bad (ie its abusive to specify your agent), case cards

2NR: CP, Gendertivity

Michigan (North Korea) West Georgia (neg)

1ac: the plan was adjusted, presumably to link less to West Georgia's Kritik.

The plan gave food aid, lifted sanctions, and we are not sure if they still backed the sunshine policy. There was only one advantage, famine. There were about 5 mins of Kritik pre-empts.

1nc: Gendertivity, T- "Constructive Engagement" / "with" - must establish political ties with the government of another nation. NGOs - plan trades off with ngo's, one schlag on the casee - spun as a role confusion argument in the 1nr.

2nr: Gendertivity

Round Two:

Dartmouth (iraq) vs. West Georgia (neg).

1ac: no significant plan changes. They did read a couple of statism preempts at the bottom of the 1ac.

1nc: must specify your agent, T immediate, T "constructive engagement with", ntr, counterplan econ sanctions altered to alleviate human suffering and monitor revenues, imports, and exports per Eisenstadt and Pollack.

2nr: counterplan and the case

USC

West Georgia SH: Saloom and Holbrook

Negative Positions:

Clinton WTO

WMD Prolif

Democracy Consolidation

Lift the Caps CP

T must change goals to change policy

Negative Positions:

Plan Flaw

Racism Discourse

Genderitivity

WAKE

West Georgia

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 5

Team: West Georgia HS

vs.: Alabama GP

Aff case (country): Cuba

Judge: Congdon

INC Off-Case Arguments

Topicality - CE:

must be proactive government to government policy [Dictionary of 20th Century World Politics, 1993, p. 173]; CE must be bilateral [Coker, The US and South Africa, 1968-1985: Constructive Engagement and Its Critics, p 229-30]; with is a preposition - indicates association, not direction [Webster's New World Dictionary, 1987, p. 687]; must replace status quo policy, not just reject it

Gendertivity Kritik:

Vaccines DA:

Impact - threaten billions, Chaitow, Vaccination and Immunization, 1997, p. 74-5

Plan Busting & Just Vote Neg:

Plan will be circumvented through loopholes- inherency proves motive

Neo-liberalism Kritik:

Plan embraces neo-liberal exploitation of Cuba, causes economic enslavement of Latin America [Petrus, The Left Strikes Back: The Class Conflict in Latin America in the Age of Neoliberalism, 1999, p. 183]

Solvency:

1. Aff not effect change in the law - no reason for ballot [Schlag, Stanford LR, November 1990, "worldly questions"]
2. Plan solvency assumes market solutions is a fallacy, just because sanctions gendered doesn't mean the plan isn't also
3. Rhode evidence speaks to feminism that doesn't indict state power
4. Cuban health good [Acosta, IPS, 10/1/99, "medical brigades"]
5. Castro enforces health apartheid [Radu, Orbis, Fall 98, p 551-2]
6. Statewide transition to sustainable agriculture [Gopher://gopher.igc.org:2998/OPESTIS/r.939582576.14054.2]
7. Lifting the embargo causes chemical agriculture [www.cityfarmer.org/cuba.html, also www.fb.com/views/focus/fo98/fo0427.html]
8. Sustainable agriculture is the only way to solve hunger [http://rain.org/~sals/press5.html]
9. Aff attempts to include women are a recipe for disaster

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

The 2NR went for topicality-constructive engagement means government-to-government ties and kicked gendertivity.

2NC:

1. Aff only focused on state questions, not who wears the boots [Lesser]
2. Aff advocacy not consistent - sanctions bad is just lip service that undermines radical restructuring [x]
3. IAC state centric approach marginalizes equal relations [Said]
4. Peterson evidence - they just replicate errors of the status quo and just whitewash government action - vote neg - don't align yourself with that system
5. Can't ever use the master's tool to tear down the master's house
6. International relations misses gender issues [x]
7. Smith evidence proves you just replicate violence [x]
8. We can't actually change policies - we need broader negative perspective [x]

AT: Permute

1. Severance permits illegitimate - they can always get out of everything
2. Severance amendment fails - just a footnote for gender [x]
3. Lip service is silencing [Smith]
4. Permutation makes the link worse - masks and risks cooptation
5. Like plagiarism
6. Permutation inherently unstable moving target

AT: Can act within system

1. Using the master's tools will never tear down the system [x]

AT: We help women

1. Two-dimensional portrayal victimizes and always fails
2. Use gender as strategic deployment is knee-jerk reaction that fails

AT: Radical feminism fails

1. We don't have to defend one framework of feminism
2. Plan does category analysis worse - portray women as victims - we turn it back
3. Using the gender lens problematizes the category - we break down essentialism [x]
4. Neg advocacy decreases gender dichotomies [x]

5. They try to put our criticism in a box - it's a new link

AT: Accept criticism and vote affirmative

1. No unique benefit
2. Infinite regression - repeats the problem
3. Don't reward aff for linking to criticism

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 7

Team: West Georgia HS

vs.: Whitman CO

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: S. Starr

1NC Off-Case Arguments

1AC cross-ex: - how does plan occur in Security Council?

1NC arguments:

Topicality - all or nearly all - almost all - plan only lifts one set of sanctions

Topicality - CE - proactive government-to-government, must work together to transform behavior, lifting sanctions necessary but not sufficient - must replace SQ policy

CP -

- USFG will negotiate within S.C. to maintain controls and remove sanctions
- CP not do CE with Iraq - maintains control over Saddam
- Solvency - Eisenstadt 98
- CP contains Saddam - Eisenstadt 98
- plan gives Saddam a victory - St. Paul "strength and political will" "should not negotiate with Saddam"

Prolif Fatigue

- sanctions strong now, preventing prolif - removing monitoring causes WMD modernization -Iran, Israel, ME arms races - Cordesman 99

Clinton

- asserting PC to pass WTO Stevenson 11-16-99 "trade pact would be bad" "more supportive"
- appeasing Saddam causes major criticism - Clamasetti 98
- looking for FP failures to criticize Clinton on - Asiaweek 11-16-99 "failed to produce an accord"
- relations and regional cooperation - Yan 11-16-99 "historical importance"

Rollback/Sanctions Busting

- plan leaves the door open - Congress will exploit - Simons 99 "rules can be ignored"

Normativity - not effect change in law - not make a difference - Schlag 90

Case

- using children to promote cause neo-imperialism and exploits them, denying differences - Berman 94

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Normativity kicked - narratives answered by child exploitation, no impact to performative contradiction, better for debating

Clinton WTO kicked - not unique turn, WTO will pass now X, no spillover, link overwhelms, no impact

Topicality Nearly All kicked - not cross-apply aff arguments to CE

Topicality CE

2NC Overview

- neutral - takes out of reverse, must put it in drive
- repealing negative sanctions not enough - must be positive
- with - government-to-government bilateral ties conceded in 2AC
- plan on-face not with government of Iraq

Line By Line

- only brightline

- political ties "working with government rather than against" Crocker 86
- destroys all predictability and ground - never CP because should be able to CP with sanctions only - crucial to ground
- Crocker 86 - diplomatic recognition
- St Dept 87 - S. Africa policy amended CE not end it by passing sanctions - not a proactive stance
- ending UN sanctions not meet - not bilateral
- immediate is only contain as a whole - Webster's
- grammatically incorrect

- CE is bilateral cooperation - X

CP kicked - dispositionality reciprocal, CP goes away because of permutation, multiple tests good, not different from other arguments, no abuse in this round, clearest abuse on T look their first, will give permutation but can't advocate, both go away

Sanctions Busting/Rollback

- not change motives of US policymakers - happens in SQ and under plan
- will be circumvented
- only lift one resolution, Simons identifies motives
- IMF, WB will circumvent
- turns morality

Child Prostitution

- plan busting turns morality
- reject colonial, paternalistic way of advocating policy
- evidence rests on suffering of children - homogenize all people of Iraq as children
- uniquely reifies power relations - perceptions of children used to increase dominance by capitalizing on them - Berman 94
- can discuss genocide without homogenization - without policy proposal - shouldn't use to advocate
- abstraction of children disempowers and disenfranchises them - Berman 94
- voting issue - real harm in advocating policy, takes out solvency, use as means to an end because capitalize on children's suffering and causes colonial paternalism

Proliferation

- causes WMD modernization and upgrade - Cordesman 99
 - working now
 - not demonize Saddam - use money for remilitarization
 - sanctions cause modernization - can't restructure - Cordesman 99
- Went for T CE in 2NR

West Georgia

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1

Team: West Georgia BS

vs.: Texas-Dallas JK

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: Greene, R

1NC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Gendertivity

Exclude vaccines and terminator gene CP

Disaster Porn

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1

Team: West Georgia HS

vs.: SMS WH

Aff case: Iraq

Judge: Mahoney, Tim-Pace

1NC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts):

Extra Topicality-plan uses UN

Vaccines

Gendertivity

Schlag on the case

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

2NC: Just gendertivity

1NR: kicked out of vaccines but went for extra t, schlag, and other case arguments

2NR: one case arg, schlag, and gendertivity

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3

Team: West Georgia EG

vs.: Emory BG

Aff case (country): Iraq

Judge: Gottlieb

1NC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Normativity

Loopholes - "nearly all" means Congress will exploit loopholes to keep most sanctions

WMD buildup/diversion

Clinton - WTO

CP: US will negotiate w/UN security council to implement a modification of economic sanctions on Iraq. US will advocate and assist in carrying out and alteration of economic sanctions to alleviate humanitarian concerns and maintain controls and monitoring of revenues, imports, and exports.

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
Normativity

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 4

Team: West Georgia HS

vs.: Emory HeMc

Case: Cuba

Judge: Slusher, Eric-Southern Illinois

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

GIRL

A.

1. Aff operates within gendered political framework

2. IAC marginalizes and makes womyn invisible

B. 1. Turns case, focusing on gender essential combating structural violence

3. Vote negative, opens up space for transformation, we must understand our role in fighting this-Smith 98

PB and J

US Congress people believe sanctions on Cuba are only policy tool

Circumvention-Explore any loopholes to avoid plan

--Simons Imposing Economic Sanctions 99

CE

A. Link-casual link between world view and

B. CE = racist 97

C. Racism must be rejected, we must speak out against evil-Gordon and Gordon 97

Normative Legal Thought Schlag on case--90

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Went for GIRL

West Georgia

School: West Georgia

Team(s): EG

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

-Shunning

-Normativity

-Development rhetoric bad

-Focus on children suffering bad rhetoric

School: West Georgia

Team(s): SB, EK

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

disaster porn

shooting an elephant: orwell went to the east and even though he didn't want to shoot an elephant he does because the yellow people want him to, he thereby understands imperialism

[their 'link' argument is literary criticism which sets the actors in the story alongside factors within the debate - no korea as the elephant, the plan as imperialism.... simply do another reading of the story, for example, the plan as the elephant, the neg as the yellow person, the judge as orwell, the gun as the ballot: don't shoot! pass the plan]

- Neoliberalism
- Capitalism/Patriarchy
- Exclude Vaccines C/P

See other West Georgia Teams for case specific arguments

School: West Georgia
Team(s): SH

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):
Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

consult china CP

T-both ways cant' just lift sanctions or can only lift sanctions

Some exclude X product CP
Pests, vaccines

Vagueness: must specify which sanctions you lift.

Gender-tivity: IR marginalizes women's views, reductionist policies reify state power, turns case, dooms policies to fail

INC:

Gendertivity Shell:

A. Links

- 1) International Relations theory excludes/marginalizes women
- 2) State centered approach excludes women and reifies

B. Impacts

- 1) IAC as a performance doesn't incorporate perspectives of women
- 2) Vote negative to "open space" - Smith 1998: focus of the future should be on gender . . . only when we ask these questions can we deal with hierarchies . . .

CUBA:

INC Strategy

Health arguments:

- Lifting sanctions spurs vaccines - Economic Intelligence Unit, 1-8-99
- Vaccines Bad - Chaitow, '97 (Vaccination and Immunization) and Cournoyer, '95 (What About Immunizations?)
- Unequal distribution of wealth causes poverty and malnutrition in poor countries - Karliner, '97 (The Corporate Planet, p.23-4)
- Petras Kritik:
- Neo-liberalist ideology seeks economic exploitation in Latin America - Petras, '99 (The Left Strikes Back)
- Neo-liberalism causes authoritarian oppression - Petras '99
- Lacanian Economics Kritik:
- Policy recommendations used to justify economic action are flawed. It tries to bring us one step closer to the erotic fantasy of a perfect market. It is bound to fail and bring us closer to thanatos - Schroder, Cardoza Law Review, 12-98

The failure of economists to consider that their goal is impossible causes incorrect conclusions and complacency, Schroder '98

Negative Block

Everything except for vagueness extended. New links to the kritik (gender-tivity): IR evidence, liberalism, state-centrism,

Strategy in Rebuttals

Gendertivity

SOUTH CAROLINA

WestGA EB

- Shunning
- Normativity
- Development rhetoric bad
- Focus on children suffering bad rhetoric
- some case ev.

West GA SB
-Neoliberalism
-Capitalism/Patriarchy
-Exclude Vaccines C/P
-Juragua

West Virginia

WAKE

West Virginia

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 6
Team: WVU MW
vs.: Kentucky BN
Aff case (country): Iraq
INC Off-Case Arguments
IR Feminism - Tickner
T - Extra
T - Nearly All

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
Feminism, Extra T

West Virginia

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 1
Team: West Va BB
vs.: Vermont SM
Aff case (country): Cuba
Judge: Prisco
INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)
T - Policy

Globalization - US capitalism causes economic dependency and domestic decay

Neo-liberalism K - plan embraces neo-liberal domination of cuba
In round discourse is an opportunity to reject neo-liberalism

Cigar D/A on case - Cigar exports to US cause death

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
Globalization
Neo-liberalism
Solvency arguments

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3
Team: West Virginia MW
vs.: Mercer WW
Aff case (country): Iran
Judge:
INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)
Khatami Credibility DA
Hormuz DA
Saddam backlash
Globalization DA

Solvency arguments
Constructive engagement causes proliferation

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)
- Khatami turns back the case harms
- Globalization increases conservative backlash
- Saddam will proliferate

West Virginia

School: West Virginia
Team(s): WM, BB

CUBA:
INC Strategy

Solvency Turns (Castro backlashes causes civil war)
Globalization DA
1. US strong hegemon
2. After sanctions are lifted investors go into Cuba
3. Western capitalism/ globalization causes dependency
4. Violent backlash against
Health care Adv takeouts

IRAQ:
INC Strategy

Prolif Solvency Turns
Israel DA
1. US Israel relations key
2. US angers Israel with plan
3. Weak US Israel relations crush peace process
4. W/out peace process we have Nuke war
Islam DA
1. Islamic world divided
2. Western ideas promoted by US investors after plan
3. Islamic elements backlash against plan causing chaos and civil war

IRAN:
INC Strategy

Israel DA (story above)
Prolif Solvency Turns
Harms takeouts
Saddam backlash DA
1. Iran-Iraq relations bad
2. Plan appeases Iran makes Saddam mad
3. Saddam is paranoid and will strike out causing ME war
Islam/Globalization DA (story above)

SYRIA:
INC Strategy

SYRIA
Russia Arms Sales DA
1. Russia wants to sale Syria more arms
2. Lifting sanctions allows Syria more revenue able to purchase more from Russia

NORTH KOREA:

INC Strategy

JAPAN CP
let Japan Give the food aid
Japan DA
1. Japan rebuilding military
2. plan decreases US forces
3. Arms race between Korea and Japan
4. Prolif leads to war

KINGS

West Virginia University NP
Disads: Clinton, Barak, Containment DA

West Virginia University DE
Against Pitt SW:
Disads: Khatemi credibility, Clinton - China engagement scenario, Straights
of Hormuz

West Virginia University MW
Against Catholic WD:

T Viol: none

Disads: Russia elections: if US & Syria work Russia to nationalist extreme
Globalization: Remove sanctions Global Econ problems

CP: UN executes same plan instead

Whitman

USC

Negative Positions:

- Nearly all T
- Clinton - NTR passage
- Case T/O

North Korea Strat:

- Clinton WTO/NTR
- Japan DA-impact=rearm
- Calculative thinking kritik-problem-solution thinking(spanos)

Cuba Strat:

- Latin American Democracy
- CP-keep sanctions
- Clinton WTO/NTR
- Case Turns: 1)Eco-tourism 2)sustainable ag 3)prostitution

Whitman CB: Cordo and Blank

Negative Positions:

- Terrorism Credibility
- UN Security CP
- UNCC DA
- Clinton WTO

WAKE

Whitman

1999 Dixie Caselist-Negative Report

Round: 3

Team: Whitman CO

vs.: SMS VP

Case: Iraq

Judge: Heidt, Stephen-Emory

INC Off-Case Arguments (please include cites and counterplan texts)

Topicality-CE: carrots and sticks

Oil-price stability is key to Mexican economy which is key to global economy-Meade

Clinton WTO-will pass now, political capital is key, lifting Iraqi sanctions tubes his political capital, WTO key to relations and lack of relations causes nuclear war

CP-Solicit security council approval first w/UN credibility (prolif impact) as the Net Benefit

Negative Strategy in Rebuttals (tricks, key arguments they go for, etc.)

Went for the CP w/UN Net Benefit and case takeouts

Whitman

School: Whitman

Team(s): CO

GENERIC (generic off-case positions, etc.):

Outline of INC Strategy (include counterplan texts)

T - CE is carrots and sticks (Vodanovich 98)

Calculative Thinking Kritik

Affirmative rush to action repeats the thought deployment of the Western managerial problem-solution model. This approach is trap, destroying meaning and threatening annihilation

Heidegger and the earth, Ladelle McWhorter, 1992, p vii

Lifting sanctions is a Western attempt to manage subject people
Orientalism, Edward Said, 1978, p 108-110

Clinton - WTO

China won't be admitted now

Plan builds momentum for the business agenda, allows WTO entry

Chinese entry destroys the WTO

Weekly Standard, 3-8-99, Greg Mastel, "there are real risks to going forward"

Protectionism results in nuclear conflict

CUBA:

INC Strategy

Solvency

Lifting embargo allows environmental degradation in Cuba

Washington Times, 3-17-98, Frank J. Gaffney, p A19

Increasing trade only helps Castro and builds conditions that created first revolution

New Statesman, 6-7-99, George Lucas "Castro's dash for cash"

Only sanctions can allow solvency to occur

Boston Herald, 7-11-99 "new overtures to Cuba"

US pursuing slow engagement now

NPR: Talk of the Nation, Richard Nuccio, 8-17-99 "a constituency has to be"

Slow is better - plan turns Cuba into a chaotic political vacuum

Ottawa Sun, 5-9-99, "Raul, Castro, commands no respect"

Dollarization --> prostitution

Baltimore Sun, 1-10-99 "Some say merely "perfecting" the socialist"

Engagement guarantees repression

Gaffney 98

Embargo necessary to ensure democratic transition in Castro

Results in political instability

NotiCen: Central American & Caribbean Political & Economic Affairs, 9-30-99, Latin American Institute "if the US embargo were lifted"

Reforms fosters political instability

Latin American Law & Business Report, 5-31-99, Mauro Leos, "Further deepening of economic"

Coercion

Turn-feminism: the critique maintains private rights to exclude, obscuring and distorting the human experience-please reject me

Philosophy in a Feminist Voice, Virginia Held, 1998, p 107-8

Libertarian rights are racist

Critical Race Theory, Cheryl Harris, 1995, p 280-1

Suffering

Status quo exemptions solve the impact

Castro's fault - he steals from Cubans

Economy flaws are reasons for suffering

Castro is responsible

Embargo resulted in religious freedom - Schwab

Lifting embargo --> inequality

Herald Sun, 8-24-99 "If Cuban children"

CE has empirically failed

Economist 7-24-99 "How can outsiders persuade"

Strategy in Rebuttals

Kritik only in 2NR.

William Jewell

UCO

WJC BP (IRAQ)

OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:

- Lopez and Cortwright '98
- Grand Negotiator (Henrickson '98)
- Clinton - Everyone knows the cites and do you really want Jewell's Clinton Cards anyway?

- T-Constructive Engagement

BREAKDOWN OF THE BLOCK:

2NC

- CP
- Clinton
- Proliferation

1NR

- T
- Credibility

NEGATIVE TRICKS

2NR POSITIONS

- CP
- Clinton
- Prolif
- Dehumanization

WJC HL

OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:

- Clinton
- China
- Asean
- T
- Food Ans
- Deontology
- War Ans

BREAKDOWN OF THE BLOCK:

2NC

- War Answers
- China
- Asean

1NR

- Food
- Clinton

NEGATIVE TRICKS

- We are not smart enough for tricky

2NR POSITIONS:

- Clinton
- Asean
- Case Evidence

UNI

Topicality

- constructive engagement

Clinton

- CTBT

Keep Helms-Burton and maintain sanctions on pesticides counter-plan

- Plan encourages industrial agriculture = pesticides kill species / biodiversity

MAI (multilateral agreement on investment)

- decrease sanctions (helms-burton) leads to adoption of MAI
- MAI = proliferation and other bad stuff from capital flows
- hurts both the environment and women

Wichita State

UCO

WSU HM (CUBA)

OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:

- Incrementalism CP
- Juragua
- Clinton
- T-Economic

BREAKDOWN OF THE BLOCK:

2NC

- Incrementalism CP
- Juragua
- 1NR

- T-Economic
- Clinton WTO

NEGATIVE TRICKS

- We make them think we're not good and then^Å..

2NR POSITIONS

- CP
- Juragua

WSU HO (N. KOREA)

OFF CASE POSITIONS AND CITES:

- Consultation CP - US will consult Japan and S. Korea in addition to plan
- Japan DA: US and Japan coordinate NK policies now (Montagnon 10/20/99), US/Japan coop key to alliance (Ellings and Simon '96), Alliancebreak = War (Manning '94)
- Jong Credibility - Jong regime unstable (7/10/99 Economist), Engagement with US lowers Jong's Credibility (Efron '99), Strong key to NK stability (Subin '98), Instability = war (Foreign Affairs, Ahn '94)
- S. Korea DA - US/SK relations strong, coopa dn hardline policies key to relations, decrease in relations = war
- T-CE must be carrot and stick

BREAKDOWN OF THE BLOCK:

2NC

- CP
- Japan
- SK
- 1NR

- T
- Jong
- Case

NEGATIVE TRICKS

2NR POSITIONS

- CP
- SK
- Case

WSU GF

- Turkey
- Jordan
- Saudi Arabia oil
- INC - Wermser '99
- Shunning - Beverslu
- Military Modernization

UNI

Shunning

Kim Credibility

South Korea / United States relations

Topicality

- engagement a contract, so can not be unconditional

Wyoming

UNI

Informed decision making

-policy sources prevent alternative points of view decreased access =
decreased ability for good decision making, decreasing negative
ground ? voter.

Threat Construction

-Security = speech act = a self fulfilling prophecy decreasing the
range
of policy options, killing solvency, turning case

Clinton

-He needs capital to pass gun reform.. sanctions kill clinton's capital,
gun
reform good.