SUBMISSION: 6092  
TITLE: Identity Causes Polarization: Advancing the Hegselmann-Krause model focusing on identity groups  
  
  
----------------------- REVIEW 1 ---------------------  
SUBMISSION: 6092  
TITLE: Identity Causes Polarization: Advancing the Hegselmann-Krause model focusing on identity groups  
AUTHORS: František Kalvas, Ashwin Ramaswamy, Ashley Sanders-Jackson and Michael Slater  
  
----------- Overall evaluation -----------  
SCORE: 2 (accept)  
----- TEXT:  
Accept as a poster. It is a short abstract submission only, but has substantial input in form of an extended OD model and its results. Including identity in OD models and evaluating the results for whether polarization occurs is interesting and I am curious to see more details in the poster.  
  
  
  
----------------------- REVIEW 2 ---------------------  
SUBMISSION: 6092  
TITLE: Identity Causes Polarization: Advancing the Hegselmann-Krause model focusing on identity groups  
AUTHORS: František Kalvas, Ashwin Ramaswamy, Ashley Sanders-Jackson and Michael Slater  
  
----------- Overall evaluation -----------  
SCORE: 0 (borderline paper)  
----- TEXT:  
This seems an interesting project, which provides an extension to the Hegselmann-Krause bounded confidence model for taking more opinion dimensions into account and linking to community structure via Louvain algorithm.  
Some aspects would require more clarification, in particular for what concerns the conceptualization of social identity. The authors seem to stem from the assumption that shared identity would relate to similar opinions, considering that opinion distance represents the edges of the network. If so, what would be the effect of SDIRO in this aspect, in particular if opinions are very distant? Is there a risk to impose identity as an external categorization as an artifact of the community detection algorithm? How identity is conceptualized and included in the opinion dynamics could be an added value to the work presented.  
  
  
  
----------------------- REVIEW 3 ---------------------  
SUBMISSION: 6092  
TITLE: Identity Causes Polarization: Advancing the Hegselmann-Krause model focusing on identity groups  
AUTHORS: František Kalvas, Ashwin Ramaswamy, Ashley Sanders-Jackson and Michael Slater  
  
----------- Overall evaluation -----------  
SCORE: 2 (accept)  
----- TEXT:  
This is an interesting extension of the Hegselmann-Krause (HK) model.   
As this is only a short abstract, I could not understand all details. But mostly the description of the model is surprisingly precise, given the very limited space. The extensions are straightforward and clearly comprehensible, with one exception: Due to the lack of space I did not understand why the Louvain algorithm has first been used for implementing identity and the been used again for detecting groups. This seem to be circular.   
A more conceptual question however, is the following: As already varying the boundaries in the HK model can generate polarization what is the added value of the extension i.e., what additional phenomena can be generated with this model that are out of the scope of the HK model?