

Avital Sternin Comprehensive Exam

First Draft Evaluation

Please complete this form along with feedback to the student by **April 3, 2017**.

Evaluation completed by:

OVERALL EVALUATION OF FIRST DRAFT:

☐ Pass ☐ Conditional Pass ☐ Fail

A **pass** indicates:

- (1) the paper makes a *substantive and original contribution to knowledge* in the content area covered; and
- (2) the overall quality of the paper is at a level that the paper would be seriously considered for publication; that is, revise and resubmit.

A **conditional pass** meets one, but not both, of the requirements stated above necessary for a "Pass".

A **fail** reflects a paper that would receive an outright rejection, if it were submitted to a journal for publication.

COMPONENTS: Please provide comments on the paper with respect to the following:

Presentation issues

- Organization of paper
- Clarity of writing
- Length of paper

Content issues

- Clear and balanced coverage of relevant literature(s)
- Well-articulated and persuasive presentation
- Demonstration of critical and scientific thinking throughout the paper

Overall theoretical and scientific contribution of paper